

Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015

1

-----X  
PROCUREMENT POLICY BOARD  
PUBLIC MEETING  
-----X

July 21, 2015

10:13 a.m.

253 Broadway  
9th Floor, Rockaway Conference Room  
New York, New York

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE: WAYNE H. HO

Reported By:  
Jennifer Cassella

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.  
139 MAMARONECK AVENUE  
MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543  
212.95.DEPOS (953.3767)\* 914.381.2061  
FACSIMILE: 914.722.0816  
E-MAIL: Stenokath@verizon.net

**Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015**

2

1

2     A P P E A R A N C E S:

3     Wayne H. Ho, Chair and Member, PPB Board; Chief  
4     Program Policy Officer, Federation of Protestant  
5     Welfare Agencies

6     Lisa M. Flores, Member, PPB Board; Deputy Comptroller  
7     for Contracts and Procurement, Bureau of Contract  
8     Administration, Office of the New York City  
9     Comptroller

7

8     Arva Rice, Member, PPB Board; President, New York  
9     Urban League

10     Matthew M. Wambua, Member, PPB Board; President RHR  
11     Funding, LLC

10

11     Maya Wiley, Member, PPB Board; Counsel to the Mayor;  
12     Founder and former President, Center for Social  
13     Inclusion

12

13     Caitlin Caporale Benson, Chief of Staff/Deputy  
14     Director, Mayor's Office of Contract Services

14     Lisette Camilo, City Chief Procurement Officer and  
15     Director of Contract Services, Mayor's Office of  
16     Contract Services

16     Howard Friedman, Deputy Chief of Contracts and Real  
17     Estate, New York City Law Department

17

18     Richard Friedman, Deputy General Counsel/Agency Chief  
19     Contracting Officer, Office of the New York City  
20     Comptroller

19

20     Nicole Hudak, Associate General Counsel, Office of  
21     the New York City Comptroller

21     Tim McKernan, Assistant Corporation Counsel,  
22     Contracts and Real Estate, New York City Law  
23     Department

23     Stephanie Ruiz, Clerk, Franchise & Concession Review  
24     Board

24

25

**Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015**

<p style="text-align: right;">3</p> <p>1 Proceedings</p> <p>2 MR. HO: Good morning. Thank you,</p> <p>3 everyone, for coming. I'm Wayne Ho, the</p> <p>4 Chair of the Procurement Policy Board. So</p> <p>5 I'm going to call this meeting to order.</p> <p>6 To start off, it would be good if we can go</p> <p>7 around and do a check-in. So I will ask</p> <p>8 the Board Members to introduce themselves</p> <p>9 first and then we'll go around and have</p> <p>10 everybody else introduce themselves.</p> <p>11 MS. RICE: Good morning. Arva Rice.</p> <p>12 MS. WILEY: Mya Wiley.</p> <p>13 MR. WAMBUA: Matthew Wambua.</p> <p>14 MS. FLORES: Lisa Flores.</p> <p>15 MR. HO: Great. And then if all our</p> <p>16 guests could introduce themselves.</p> <p>17 MS. CAMILO: Lisette Camilo.</p> <p>18 MS. BROWN: Elizabeth Brown.</p> <p>19 MS. HUDAK: Nikki Hudak from</p> <p>20 Comptroller's Office.</p> <p>21 MR. R. FRIEDMAN: Rich Friedman.</p> <p>22 MS. BENSON: Caitlin Benson.</p> <p>23 MS. RUIZ: Stephanie Ruiz.</p> <p>24 MR. H. FRIEDMAN: Howard Friedman.</p> <p>25 MR. MCKERNAN: Tim McKernan.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">5</p> <p>1 Proceedings</p> <p>2 item.</p> <p>3 (No response.)</p> <p>4 MR. HO: Seeing none, I will</p> <p>5 entertain a motion.</p> <p>6 MS. RICE: So moved.</p> <p>7 MR. HO: Second?</p> <p>8 MS. FLORES: Second that motion.</p> <p>9 MR. HO: All in favor?</p> <p>10 (Chorus of Ayes.)</p> <p>11 MR. HO: Opposed?</p> <p>12 (No response.)</p> <p>13 MR. HO: Abstained?</p> <p>14 (No response.)</p> <p>15 MR. HO: So this passes for the</p> <p>16 proposed rule of the CAPA.</p> <p>17 The second item for us to vote under</p> <p>18 CAPA relates to the name change and the</p> <p>19 change of address for the Bureau of</p> <p>20 Contract Administration. I'll recognize</p> <p>21 Lisette again to introduce this one.</p> <p>22 MS. CAMILO: PPB proposed to amend</p> <p>23 the rules to update the name and address</p> <p>24 for the Bureau of Contract Administration</p> <p>25 within the Office of the New York City</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">4</p> <p>1 Proceedings</p> <p>2 MR. HO: Great. So thank you again,</p> <p>3 everyone, for coming. We have quorum so</p> <p>4 the purpose of the meeting today is we have</p> <p>5 two agenda items in order to vote for the</p> <p>6 proposed rules into CAPA. The first agenda</p> <p>7 item refers to the definition of minority</p> <p>8 and women-owned business enterprise, WMBE,</p> <p>9 and to start off I will recognize</p> <p>10 Lisette Camilo, the Director of MOCS to</p> <p>11 introduce the first item.</p> <p>12 MS. CAMILO: Thank you, Wayne.</p> <p>13 The PPB proposes to amend the rules</p> <p>14 of the City of New York to clarify the</p> <p>15 definition of a minority and women-owned</p> <p>16 business enterprise as per New York City</p> <p>17 Local Law of 2003. This clarification will</p> <p>18 avoid any confusion about other similar</p> <p>19 certification for minority and women-owned</p> <p>20 business enterprise firms.</p> <p>21 MR. HO: I think you said 2003.</p> <p>22 MR. WAMBUA: 2013.</p> <p>23 MR. HO: So I just want to open it</p> <p>24 up for anybody who wants to make a</p> <p>25 statement or comments or questions on this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">6</p> <p>1 Proceedings</p> <p>2 Comptroller. This change will ensure the</p> <p>3 submissions required to be made by these</p> <p>4 rules are sent to the correct address.</p> <p>5 MR. HO: Thank you.</p> <p>6 Anybody have questions or comments</p> <p>7 about a name and an address?</p> <p>8 MS. FLORES: I don't think it's</p> <p>9 controversial.</p> <p>10 MS. WILEY: We assume the address is</p> <p>11 correct.</p> <p>12 MS. FLORES: You made me nervous</p> <p>13 now.</p> <p>14 (Laughter.)</p> <p>15 MR. HO: Seeing none, I will ask for</p> <p>16 a motion on this item.</p> <p>17 MS. FLORES: Motion to approve.</p> <p>18 MR. HO: Second?</p> <p>19 MS. WILEY: Second.</p> <p>20 MR. HO: All those in favor?</p> <p>21 (Chorus of Ayes.)</p> <p>22 MR. HO: Opposed?</p> <p>23 (No response.)</p> <p>24 MR. HO: Abstained?</p> <p>25 (No response.)</p>

**Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015**

1		7	
2	Proceedings		
3	MR. HO: This passes also. I do not		
4	see any other items on the agenda so I want		
5	to thank everyone for coming and this		
6	adjourns our meeting. Thank you.		
7	(Time noted: 10:16 a.m.)		
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK )  
COUNTY OF RICHMOND ) ss:

I, JENNIFER CASSELLA, a Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the within-entitled matter, and that the within transcript is a true record of such proceedings to the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage; and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 27th day of July, 2015.



JENNIFER CASSELLA

**Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015**

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>A</b></p> <p>a.m (2) 1:7 7:6 ability (1) 8:13 Abstained (2) 5:13 6:24 action (1) 8:15 address (5) 5:19,23 6:4,7,10 adjourns (1) 7:5 Administration (3) 2:6 5:20,24 Agencies (1) 2:4 agenda (3) 4:5,6 7:3 amend (2) 4:13 5:22 anybody (2) 4:24 6:6 approve (1) 6:17 Arva (2) 2:7 3:11 Assistant (1) 2:21 Associate (1) 2:19 assume (1) 6:10 AVENUE (1) 1:21 avoid (1) 4:18 Ayes (2) 5:10 6:21</p>	<p>Concession (1) 2:23 Conference (1) 1:9 confusion (1) 4:18 Contract (6) 2:5,13,14,15 5:20,24 Contracting (1) 2:18 Contracts (3) 2:5,16,21 controversial (1) 6:9 Corporation (1) 2:21 correct (2) 6:4,11 Counsel (3) 2:10,19,21 Counsel/Agency (1) 2:17 COUNTY (1) 8:5</p>	<p>H (3) 1:12 2:3 3:24 hand (1) 8:19 hereunto (1) 8:18 Ho (21) 1:12 2:3 3:2,3,15 4:2,21,23 5:4,7,9,11,13,15 6:5,15,18,20,22 6:24 7:2 Howard (2) 2:16 3:24 Hudak (3) 2:19 3:19,19</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>B</b></p> <p>Benson (3) 2:12 3:22,22 best (1) 8:13 blood (1) 8:15 Board (9) 1:3 2:3,5,7,9,10,23 3:4,8 Broadway (1) 1:9 Brown (2) 3:18,18 Bureau (3) 2:5 5:19,24 business (3) 4:8,16,20</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>D</b></p> <p>day (1) 8:19 definition (2) 4:7,15 Department (2) 2:16,22 Deputy (3) 2:5,16,17 Director (3) 2:13,14 4:10</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>I</b></p> <p>Inclusion (1) 2:11 interested (1) 8:16 introduce (5) 3:8,10,16 4:11 5:21 item (5) 4:7,11 5:2,17 6:16 items (2) 4:5 7:3</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>C</b></p> <p>C (3) 2:2 8:2,2 Caitlin (2) 2:12 3:22 call (1) 3:5 Camilo (6) 2:14 3:17,17 4:10,12 5:22 CAPA (3) 4:6 5:16,18 Caporale (1) 2:12 Cassella (3) 1:17 8:7,22 Center (1) 2:11 certification (1) 4:19 certify (2) 8:9,14 Chair (2) 2:3 3:4 change (3) 5:18,19 6:2 check-in (1) 3:7 Chief (5) 2:3,12,14,16,17 Chorus (2) 5:10 6:21 City (9) 2:6,14,16,18,20,21 4:14,16 5:25 clarification (1) 4:17 clarify (1) 4:14 Clerk (1) 2:23 coming (3) 3:3 4:3 7:4 comments (2) 4:25 6:6 Comptroller (5) 2:5,6,18,20 6:2 Comptroller's (1) 3:20</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>E</b></p> <p>E (4) 2:2,2 8:2,2 E-MAIL (1) 1:23 Elizabeth (1) 3:18 ensure (1) 6:2 enterprise (3) 4:8,16,20 entertain (1) 5:5 Estate (2) 2:16,21 everybody (1) 3:10</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>J</b></p> <p>Jennifer (3) 1:17 8:7,22 July (2) 1:6 8:19</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>F</b></p> <p>F (1) 8:2 FACSIMILE (1) 1:23 favor (2) 5:9 6:20 Federation (1) 2:3 firms (1) 4:20 first (3) 3:9 4:6,11 Floor (1) 1:9 Flores (7) 2:5 3:14,14 5:8 6:8,12 6:17 former (1) 2:11 Founder (1) 2:11 Franchise (1) 2:23 Friedman (6) 2:16,17 3:21,21,24 3:24 Funding (1) 2:9 further (1) 8:14</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>G</b></p> <p>General (2) 2:17,19 go (2) 3:6,9 going (1) 3:5 good (3) 3:2,6,11 Great (2) 3:15 4:2 guests (1) 3:16</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>K</b></p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>H</b></p> <p>Hand (1) 8:19 hereunto (1) 8:18 Ho (21) 1:12 2:3 3:2,3,15 4:2,21,23 5:4,7,9,11,13,15 6:5,15,18,20,22 6:24 7:2 Howard (2) 2:16 3:24 Hudak (3) 2:19 3:19,19</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>D</b></p> <p>day (1) 8:19 definition (2) 4:7,15 Department (2) 2:16,22 Deputy (3) 2:5,16,17 Director (3) 2:13,14 4:10</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>L</b></p> <p>Laughter (1) 6:14 Law (3) 2:16,21 4:17 League (1) 2:8 Lisa (2) 2:5 3:14 Lisette (4) 2:14 3:17 4:10 5:21 LLC (1) 2:9 Local (1) 4:17</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>A</b></p> <p>a.m (2) 1:7 7:6 ability (1) 8:13 Abstained (2) 5:13 6:24 action (1) 8:15 address (5) 5:19,23 6:4,7,10 adjourns (1) 7:5 Administration (3) 2:6 5:20,24 Agencies (1) 2:4 agenda (3) 4:5,6 7:3 amend (2) 4:13 5:22 anybody (2) 4:24 6:6 approve (1) 6:17 Arva (2) 2:7 3:11 Assistant (1) 2:21 Associate (1) 2:19 assume (1) 6:10 AVENUE (1) 1:21 avoid (1) 4:18 Ayes (2) 5:10 6:21</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>E</b></p> <p>E (4) 2:2,2 8:2,2 E-MAIL (1) 1:23 Elizabeth (1) 3:18 ensure (1) 6:2 enterprise (3) 4:8,16,20 entertain (1) 5:5 Estate (2) 2:16,21 everybody (1) 3:10</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>M</b></p> <p>M (2) 2:5,9 MAMARONECK (2) 1:21,22 marriage (1) 8:16 matter (2) 8:11,17 Matthew (2) 2:9 3:13 Maya (1) 2:10 Mayor (1) 2:10 Mayor's (2) 2:13,14 McKernan (3) 2:21 3:25,25 meeting (4) 1:4 3:5 4:4 7:5 Member (5) 2:3,5,7,9,10 Members (1) 3:8 minority (3) 4:7,15,19 MOCS (1) 4:10 morning (2) 3:2,11 motion (4) 5:5,8 6:16,17 moved (1) 5:6 Mya (1) 3:12</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>B</b></p> <p>Benson (3) 2:12 3:22,22 best (1) 8:13 blood (1) 8:15 Board (9) 1:3 2:3,5,7,9,10,23 3:4,8 Broadway (1) 1:9 Brown (2) 3:18,18 Bureau (3) 2:5 5:19,24 business (3) 4:8,16,20</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>F</b></p> <p>F (1) 8:2 FACSIMILE (1) 1:23 favor (2) 5:9 6:20 Federation (1) 2:3 firms (1) 4:20 first (3) 3:9 4:6,11 Floor (1) 1:9 Flores (7) 2:5 3:14,14 5:8 6:8,12 6:17 former (1) 2:11 Founder (1) 2:11 Franchise (1) 2:23 Friedman (6) 2:16,17 3:21,21,24 3:24 Funding (1) 2:9 further (1) 8:14</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>N</b></p> <p>N (1) 2:2 name (3) 5:18,23 6:7 nervous (1) 6:12 New (14) 1:10,10,22 2:6,7,16,18,20 2:21 4:14,16 5:25 8:4,8</p>

**Procurement Policy Board - Public Meeting  
July 21, 2015**

<p><b>Nicole (1)</b> 2:19  <b>Nikki (1)</b> 3:19  <b>Notary (1)</b> 8:7  <b>noted (1)</b> 7:6</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>O</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Office (7)</b> 2:6,13,14,18,19 3:20  5:25  <b>Officer (3)</b> 2:3,14,18  <b>open (1)</b> 4:23  <b>Opposed (2)</b> 5:11 6:22  <b>order (2)</b> 3:5 4:5  <b>outcome (1)</b> 8:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>P</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>P (2)</b> 2:2,2  <b>parties (1)</b> 8:15  <b>passes (2)</b> 5:15 7:2  <b>Policy (3)</b> 1:3 2:3 3:4  <b>PPB (7)</b> 2:3,5,7,9,10 4:13 5:22  <b>President (3)</b> 2:7,9,11  <b>proceedings (8)</b> 1:11 3:1 4:1 5:1  6:1 7:1 8:10,12  <b>Procurement (4)</b> 1:3 2:5,14 3:4  <b>Program (1)</b> 2:3  <b>proposed (3)</b> 4:6 5:16,22  <b>proposes (1)</b> 4:13  <b>Protestant (1)</b> 2:3  <b>Public (2)</b> 1:4 8:7  <b>purpose (1)</b> 4:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Q</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>questions (2)</b> 4:25 6:6  <b>quorum (1)</b> 4:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>R</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>R (3)</b> 2:2 3:21 8:2  <b>Real (2)</b> 2:16,21  <b>recognize (2)</b> 4:9 5:20  <b>record (1)</b> 8:12  <b>refers (1)</b> 4:7  <b>related (1)</b> 8:14  <b>relates (1)</b> 5:18  <b>reported (2)</b> 1:16 8:10  <b>REPORTING (1)</b> 1:21  <b>required (1)</b> 6:3  <b>response (5)</b> 5:3,12,14 6:23,25  <b>Review (1)</b> 2:23  <b>RHR (1)</b> 2:9  <b>Rice (4)</b> 2:7 3:11,11 5:6  <b>Rich (1)</b> 3:21  <b>Richard (1)</b> 2:17  <b>RICHMOND (1)</b> 8:5  <b>Rockaway (1)</b> 1:9  <b>Room (1)</b> 1:9  <b>Ruiz (3)</b> 2:23 3:23,23  <b>rule (1)</b> 5:16</p>	<p><b>rules (4)</b> 4:6,13 5:23 6:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>S</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>S (1)</b> 2:2  <b>second (5)</b> 5:7,8,17 6:18,19  <b>see (1)</b> 7:3  <b>Seeing (2)</b> 5:4 6:15  <b>sent (1)</b> 6:4  <b>Services (4)</b> 1:21 2:13,14,15  <b>set (1)</b> 8:18  <b>similar (1)</b> 4:18  <b>Social (1)</b> 2:11  <b>ss (1)</b> 8:5  <b>Staff/Deputy (1)</b> 2:12  <b>start (2)</b> 3:6 4:9  <b>State (2)</b> 8:4,8  <b>statement (1)</b> 4:25  <b>STENO-KATH (1)</b> 1:21  <b>Stenokath@verizon.net (1)</b> 1:23  <b>Stephanie (2)</b> 2:23 3:23  <b>submissions (1)</b> 6:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>T</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>T (2)</b> 8:2,2  <b>thank (6)</b> 3:2 4:2,12 6:5 7:4,5  <b>think (2)</b> 4:21 6:8  <b>Tim (2)</b> 2:21 3:25  <b>Time (1)</b> 7:6  <b>today (1)</b> 4:4  <b>transcript (2)</b> 1:11 8:12  <b>true (1)</b> 8:12  <b>two (1)</b> 4:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>U</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>update (1)</b> 5:23  <b>Urban (1)</b> 2:8</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>V</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>vote (2)</b> 4:5 5:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>W</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Wambua (4)</b> 2:9 3:13,13 4:22  <b>want (2)</b> 4:23 7:3  <b>wants (1)</b> 4:24  <b>way (1)</b> 8:16  <b>Wayne (4)</b> 1:12 2:3 3:3 4:12  <b>we'll (1)</b> 3:9  <b>Welfare (1)</b> 2:4  <b>WHEREOF (1)</b> 8:18  <b>Wiley (5)</b> 2:10 3:12,12 6:10,19  <b>within-entitled (1)</b> 8:11  <b>WITNESS (1)</b> 8:18  <b>WMBE (1)</b> 4:8  <b>women-owned (3)</b> 4:8,15,19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>X</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>X (2)</b> 1:2,5</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Y</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>York (14)</b> 1:10,10,22 2:6,7,16,18  2:20,21 4:14,16 5:25 8:4,8</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Z</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>0</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>1</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>10:13 (1)</b> 1:7  <b>10:16 (1)</b> 7:6  <b>10543 (1)</b> 1:22  <b>139 (1)</b> 1:21</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>2</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>2003 (2)</b> 4:17,21  <b>2013 (1)</b> 4:22  <b>2015 (2)</b> 1:6 8:19  <b>21 (1)</b> 1:6  <b>212.95.DEPOS (1)</b> 1:22  <b>253 (1)</b> 1:9  <b>27th (1)</b> 8:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>3</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>4</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>5</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>6</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>7</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>8</b></p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>9</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>914.381.2061 (1)</b> 1:22  <b>914.722.0816 (1)</b> 1:23  <b>953.3767 (1)</b> 1:22  <b>9th (1)</b> 1:9</p>
---	---	--