1	
2	X
3	CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD
4	PUBLIC MEETING
5	JULY 12, 2023
6	6:30 P.M.
7	X
8	
9	HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE
10	AND
11	ROBERT ROSS FAMILY LIFE CENTER
12	172-17 LINDEN BOULEVARD
13	QUEENS, NEW YORK 11434
14	
15	
16	B E F O R E:
17	ARVA RICE, INTERIM CHAIR
18	JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	Transcribed by:
24	Julia M. Speros
25	

1		
2	PUBL	IC MEETING AGENDA
3	====	=======================================
4	1.	Call to Order
5	2.	Adoption of the Minutes
6	3.	Remarks from the Chair
7	4.	Remarks from the Executive Director
8	5.	Presentation from the Director of
9		Outreach on the CCRB
10	6.	Comment from Community Groups
11	7.	Public Comment
12	8.	Old Business
13	9.	New Business
14	10.	Adjourn to Executive Session
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1			
2	BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT		
3	=======================================		
4	1. Arva Rice, Interim Board Chair		
5	2. Joseph A. Puma, Board Member		
6	3. Esmeralda Simmons, Esq., Board Member		
7	4. Herman Merritt, Board Member		
8	5. AU Hogan, Board Member		
9	6. Michael Rivadeneyra, Esq., Board Member		
LO	7. Charlane Brown-Wyands, Esq., Board Member		
11	8. June Northern, Board Member		
L2	9. Kevin Jemmott, Board Member		
13	10. John Siegal, Esq., Board Member		
L4	11. Frank Dwyer, Board Member		
L5			
16			
L7			
18			
L9			
20	Presenters:		
21	Jahi Rose - Director of Outreach		
22	New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board		
23			
24			
25			

```
4
```

```
SPEAKERS
1
 2
    1. Assembly Member Khaleel Anderson - Assembly
 3
    District 31
 4
    2. Reverend Carlene O. Thorbs - Chairperson -Queens
5
    Community Board 12
6
    3. Joshua Kelly - Hospital Responder - LIFE Camp Inc.
7
    4. Amira Ismail - Youth Participant - Malikah
8
    5. Anna Mays - Community Member
9
    6. Aaron Battle - Owner of Urbane Barbershop
10
    6. Venus Ketchum - Community Member
11
    7. Mr. Meyers Community Member
12
    8. Debra Y. Walrond - Community Member
13
    9. Trina Mitchell - Community Member
14
   10. Michelle Mosley - Community Member
15
   11. Garfield Towler - President - 113 Precinct
16
    Community Council
17
   12. Carolyn Dixon - Founder - Where Do We Go From Here
18
   13. Steve Leland - Community Member
19
   14. Bilal Karriem - Community Member
2.0
   15. Garth Marchant - Community Member
21
   16. Angel Vassel- Community Member
22
   17. Amir Abbady - Chief of Staff - Office of Council
23
    Member Nantasha Williams
24
   18. Michelle Keller - Community Member
25
   19. Ms. Lawrence - Community Member
```

## 1 **PROCEEDINGS** 2 MS. ALVAREZ: Good evening, 3 everyone. Thank you so much for joining 4 us. 5 For those utilizing ASL interpretation, our two ASL interpreters 6 7 are Felice Shays and Liz Palladino. 8 Their display names are "ASL 9 Interpreter/", their names. There will 10 be instructions on how to pin our video in the chat and you utilize closed 11 12 captioning services with the link in the chat as well. Thank you. 13 14 CHAIR RICE: Good evening, everyone, and welcome. My name is Arva Rice. 15 16 use she/her pronouns and I am the 17 Interim Chair of the Civilian Complaint 18 Review Board. 19 I would like to call the CCRB's July 2.0 Public Board Meeting to order. Would the rest of the Board please 21 22 introduce themselves, starting with Mr. 23 Siegal. 24 MR. SIEGAL: Good evening. My name 25 is John Siegal. I'm one of the Mayoral

1	Designees on the Board.
2	MR. RIVADENEYRA: Good evening. My
3	name is Michael Rivadeneyra. I am one
4	of the City Council Designees,
5	specifically the Bronx Designee, to the
6	Board.
7	MR. MERRITT: Good evening. My name
8	is Herman Merritt, City Council Designee
9	from Brooklyn.
10	MS. SIMMONS: Good evening. My name
11	is Esmeralda Simmons. I'm the Public
12	Advocate's Designee to the Board. I'm
13	from Bed-Stuy.
14	MR. HOGAN: Good evening. AU Hogan,
15	City Council Designee right here in
16	Southeast Queens.
17	MR. DARCHE: My name is Jon Darche. I
18	use he/him pronouns and I'm the Executive
19	Director of the agency.
20	MS. NORTHERN: I'm June Northern.
21	I'm a Mayoral Appointee from Brooklyn.
22	MR. JEMMOTT: Good evening. I'm
23	Kevin Jemmott. I'm a Mayoral Appointee
24	from Queens.
25	MR. DWYER: Good evening. I'm Frank

```
1
             Dwyer. I'm a Police Commissioner
 2
             Designee.
 3
                 MR. PUMA: Good evening, everyone.
 4
             My name is Joseph Puma. I go by he/him
 5
             pronouns.
                 I'm the City Council Designee on the
 6
 7
             Board from Manhattan and it's great to
 8
             be here in Queens and thank you for
 9
             coming out here on a hot July evening.
10
                 CHAIR RICE: Do we have anyone on
             the line?
11
12
                 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: I'm Charlane
13
             Brown, Police Commissioner Designee and
14
             I am from the Borough of Queens.
15
                 CHAIR RICE: Terrific. Thank you,
             Charlane.
16
17
                 I would like to ask for a motion to
18
             approve the May Board Meeting minutes --
19
             I'm sorry.
2.0
                 Are there any changes or corrections
21
             to the minutes in May before I --
22
                 (No response.)
23
                 CHAIR RICE: All right.
24
                 So moved?
25
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: (Indicating.)
```

```
1
                 CHAIR RICE: All those in favor --
 2
             oh, sorry. Can I get a second?
 3
                 MR. HOGAN:
                             I second.
                 CHAIR RICE: Okay. All those in
 4
             favor?
 5
 6
                 (Chorus of "Ayes".)
 7
                 CHAIR RICE: All right. Thank you.
 8
                 I'd also ask -- like to ask for a
 9
             motion to approve the June minutes, but
             are there any changes or corrections to
10
             the minutes for June?
11
12
                 (No response.)
13
                 CHAIR RICE: Any changes or
             corrections to the June minutes?
14
15
                 (No response.)
16
                 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Can I have a
17
             motion?
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: So moved.
18
19
                 CHAIR RICE: A second?
2.0
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: (Indicating.)
21
                 CHAIR RICE: All those in favor?
22
                 (Chorus of "Ayes".)
23
                 CHAIR RICE: Okay. The minutes are
24
             approved as presented.
25
                 I wanted to start this meeting by
```

2.0

remembering Eric Garner and Delrawn Small.

Eric Garner was killed on July 17th, nine years ago. The tragedy of Mr.

Garner's death and the failure to hold

Officer Daniel Pantaleo accountable shook New Yorkers. It also highlighted the great importance of the CCRB.

After Pantaleo was cleared by the Staten Island DA and NYPD, it was the CCRB that found misconduct and took Pantaleo to trial that resulted in his firing.

Delrawn Small was killed on July 4, 2016 by Officer Wayne Isaacs. Officer Isaacs was similarly cleared in criminal court and by the NYPD, and has continued working on the force for the last seven years.

The CCRB received the case in May
2018 and in October 2020, this Board
found Officer Isaac's had committed
misconduct, however, this trial has been
held up for two years because the CCRB
cannot access the sealed evidence from

Officer Isaacs' criminal trial.

2.0

2.2

Sealing statutes currently prevent the CCRB from obtaining sealed records. We filed a motion to access these records in October 2021 and in March of this year, the judge granted our motion. Unfortunately, Officer Isaacs appealed this decision and we once again are at a standstill.

Barring the CCRB from access to evidence is preventing accountability. There are two bills in Albany right now that would exempt CCRB from sealing statutes and allow us to access key evidence without delays. We hope legislators will support these bills.

Mr. Small's family has been seeking justice for over seven years now and has the right to have this case move forward swiftly.

I want to remind people that this is why we are here. The CCRB is a resource for New Yorkers who feel that they have been mistreated by the NYPD. We are fully independent and even if other

2.0

2.2

entities did not take action, we review each case in a fair and objective manner.

We are here to make New York City safer for everyone by addressing individual cases and patterns of misconduct within the NYPD.

I would like to thank the

Administration and the City Council for recognizing the importance of the CCRB by retracting the proposed cuts to our budget and giving us additional funding.

We have now received the resources and the data needed to investigate racial profiling and bias-based policing, yet we don't hold our work to hold officers accountable unless you, the people of New York, file complaints when you have experienced misconduct. It is so important to keep a record of officer misconduct and accountability -- will work towards preventing future misconduct.

Part of the reason we are here in Queens today is to come to your

2.0

2.2

community and make it easier for you to share your experiences and file complaints. Every other month we hold our Board Meetings in a different borough.

I want to thank the Robert Ross

Johnson Family Life Center for

partnering with us and being our host
this evening.

Special thanks to the Center's

Director, Monica Fisher, and the Saint

Albans Congregational Church's Senior

Pastor, Eli Watson.

I would also like to take a moment to thank Board Member Michael Rivadeneyra for serving on this Board for the past five-and-a-half years.

As the Bronx representative appointed by the City Council, Michael has served all New Yorkers and been a diligent and hardworking member of this Board. He was instrumental in reviewing the 2020 protest cases, which included the largest number and some of the most complicated cases to come through this

Agency.

2.0

2.2

Thank you for all of your time, your effort, and your service to the City.

We wish you well in your next chapter.

I will now pass it off to Executive Director Jonathan Darche, who will give you more details on our current budget and how to file a complaint.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Chair Rice.

As the Chair mentioned, the Administration and City Council restored the proposed cuts to our budget and actually added \$970,000 to our personnel services budget.

This will enable us to continue the new work that we were assigned of investigating complaints of racial profiling, but also the work that the City had previously entrusted us with -- doing investigations into force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, and offensive language -- and also administratively prosecuting substantiated cases in those -- of those allegations.

Before we get started this

afternoon, some quick updates on Agency operations.

2.0

2.2

Our office is open to walk-in complaints, but it is also possible to file complaints online at nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint. You can call us by telephone at 1-800-341-2272.

If you call 311 and tell the operator that you wish to make a complaint against a member of the NYPD, they will make sure that we get that complaint and if anyone wishes to file a complaint right now, we have investigators on here -- we have investigators here and ready to take your complaints now.

Emma and Daniel, can you stand up?

They may have already started taking your complaint, but they are definitely here today and we also have someone from our Civilian Assistance Unit, Shania Gopaul here as well.

Just some ground rules:

We're going to keep comments to four minutes per person speaking, whether you

```
1
             are here or joining us online.
 2
                 If you're joining us online and wish
 3
             to speak, please use the raise your hand
             function.
 4
                 I want to thank the staff for their
 5
             hard work in setting this up here today
 6
 7
             and I want to thank my neighbors because
             I am a North Queen's resident, but I was
 8
 9
             telling Mr. Jemmott, It was fun to drive
10
             here from my house through my old
             neighborhood on the way here, and it's
11
12
             good to be in Queens.
                 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Thank you so
13
             much, Jon.
14
                 Does anyone have any questions of
15
16
             our Executive Director?
17
                 (No response.)
18
                 CHAIR RICE: Any questions?
19
                 (No response.)
2.0
                 CHAIR RICE: Okay. So, at this
21
             time, we will have a report from our
22
             Director of Outreach, Jahi Rose.
23
                 MR. ROSE: Hello, everyone. My name
24
             is Jahi Rose. I go by he/him pronouns.
             I'm the Director of Outreach for the
25
```

2.0

2.2

Civilian Complaint Review -- for the Civilian Complaint Review Board.

So, the Civilian Complaint Review
Board is a City Agency. We are the
largest independent oversight entity
over the largest police force in the
country. The CCRB investigates,
mediates, and in some cases
administratively prosecutes allegations
of police misconduct.

The Agency is governed by a

15-Member Board, many of which you've
met here today. Five are appointed by
the New York City Mayor, five are
appointed by the New York City Council,
three are designated by the Police
Commissioner, one is appointed by the
Public Advocate, and the Chair is
jointly appointed by the City Council
and the Mayor.

The CCRB investigates allegations of police misconduct. A helpful way to remember our jurisdiction is FADO.

That's force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, and offensive language.

2.0

2.2

Just a few facts about the Right to Know Act:

The Right to Know Act went into effect in October of 2018. The Right to Know Act includes four different components, one, including under certain circumstances, officers should be identifying themselves by providing their name and such information, like their badge number, rank, command, and/or shield number.

With some exceptions, officers should be explaining the reason for the encounter or the interaction. Officers should inform you of your -- under certain circumstances, officers should inform you of your right to say "no" when requesting consent to search your person, property, and/or vehicle or home.

Officers, under certain circumstances, should also offer business cards. The business cards inform an individual about the identity of the officer and how to file a comment

2.0

2.2

and/or complaint about the interaction between you and that officer. You can request these business cards in any encounter.

This is a copy of what the business card looks like.

If you see misconduct, you can feel free to report that misconduct online, as mentioned by our Executive Director, Jon Darche, at nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint, or you can call the CCRB's hotline at 1-800-341-CCRB or 1-800-341-2272.

If you see footage of misconduct, either on social media or on the news, you can feel free to file a complaint and -- even if you were not there in person. Typical handle for the CCRB is ccrb\_nyc.

Ways to file a complaint with the Civilian Complaint Review Board include calling 311, the City's favorite number. You can also visit the CCRB at our lower Manhattan office at our headquarters at 100 Church Street -- and that's 100 Church Street on the 10th floor.

2.0

2.2

You can also direct message or DM
the CCRB at our social media platforms,
which include Facebook, Twitter and
Instagram. As mentioned, typical
handle, ccrb\_nyc. You could also send a
letter to the CCRB via mail at 100
Church Street, New York, New York, 10th
Floor, zip code 10007.

You can file a complaint about police misconduct with a local police precinct. It does not have to be the precinct where the interaction took place. Officers are required to accept those complaints at the precinct.

They could also offer you -- or provide you with a complaint form and a self-addressed envelope.

If you'd like a presentation for your neighborhood, for your family, for a community organization -- really anyone -- any group -- feel free to contact the CCRB's Outreach Unit. Email us at outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov, and you can also feel free to follow us on our social media platforms, Instagram,

1 Twitter, and Facebook. 2 Thank you, Chair Rice. CHAIR RICE: Do the Board Members 3 have any questions of Mr. Rose? 4 5 MR. DARCHE: So, first, I would just like to tell the folks here today that 6 7 you have an additional way of filing a complaint because your Assembly Member 8 9 has a link to our complaint form on his website. 10 11 So, thank you very much -- Assembly 12 Member for having that link there -- and then can you tell us a little about the 13 14 CourtSide Program? MR. ROSE: So, the CCRB does what's 15 16 called "unconventional outreach". 17 we go to local basketball courts, handball courts, football fields -- any 18 19 real recreational space -- and we 2.0 conduct outreach to young people on 21 basketball courts. 22 I, myself, sometimes may even get 23 into the game just to get connected with 24 the people that are playing, but, 25 nonetheless, we want to connect with

1 your young people. We want to connect 2 with people, period. 3 So, we will do CCRB CourtSide at any basketball tournament -- any event --4 5 and we also speak directly to basketball teams, sports, and/or sports clubs. 6 7 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much for that. 8 9 Any other questions? 10 (No response.) CHAIR RICE: All right. 11 Thank you 12 so much, Jahi. I appreciate you. All right. We're going to hear from 13 14 some members of the community, but before we do that, we did already 15 16 mention Assembly Member Anderson. 17 So, Assembly Member Khaleel 18 Anderson, if you would join and please 19 provide some remarks for the group. 2.0 Thank you. 21 MR. ANDERSON: Thank you so much. 22 All right. Good afternoon to the 23 Board. Let me just take a moment to thank you all for your public service as 24 members of the CCRB. 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

My name is Khaleel Anderson, for those who don't know who I am, and I represent the 31st Assembly District in Southeast Queens, which includes the neighborhoods of Rosedale, Springfield Gardens, South Ozone Park, the Rockaways, and South Richmond Hill. So grateful to be here this evening.

Just to bring some brief remarks:

As the Chair already mentioned, it's important that you all know if you head on over to my Assembly website, there's a number of different resources that you can obtain, one of which is being able to go right to our website and file a CCRB complaint right on my Assembly website, which is great.

It's its own little dedicated button. You can't miss it. I was really excited about that. We rolled that out last year.

We are in the midst of our summer mobile office hours. That's why I'm dressed down today because I've been out in the streets, connecting with the

2.0

residents of the District and just updating them on what we've been working on in Albany as it relates to everything from housing to police accountability, and more.

So, we're really excited to be back in the District and I also want to mention one other thing on the subject matter of police accountability.

I want the folks -- the residents who are here today to know that we do not have to sacrifice or -- you know, or have a false dichotomy between community safety, making sure that we hold our police officers accountable.

In my role as a member of the Assembly, I've interviewed and had conversations with all of my police captains and had conversations about their CCRB records, and just reports, and things of that nature -- with all my captains, including the new parts of my Districts and I'm getting ready to inherit, having conversations with those captains as well.

2.0

It's very important that we have an open dialogue with our police. We have open dialogue with them, everyone from the top all the way down to the beat officer, which is really important.

It's also important that statistically crime increases in the summer. It's important to acknowledge that, but citywide right now, crime is down, including in one of my highest crime precincts, which is in the 101st -- and that doesn't happen by just police, but it's really making sure that we have community involved in what's called "Community Safety".

It's not just a police responsibility. We have our Cure Violence folks, some of which I see here. LIFE camp, you guys do an incredible job. We also have folks in our District, Rock Safe Streets.

Other entities that do really good work are the Kings of Kings Foundation, just to name some of the few that do incredible work to help keep our streets and our

families safe.

2.0

So, I just wanted to just bring those brief remarks and I will see you all in the streets at one of my mobile summer office hours every Wednesday from 3:30 to 5. We're either knocking on your door or we're right on the main thoroughfare.

Next week, I think we're going to be on Guy Brewer and Farmers in the District. So, looking forward to the work that you guys continue to do and let's continue to work in collaboration for true community safety.

Thank you so much.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much for that, Assemblyman.

We are now going to hear from some other local community leaders.

Thank you so much for joining us, and as a reminder, we're going -- we ask you to please keep your comments to four minutes.

So, Yojaira, who would you please -- would you please call on the first

1 speaker? 2 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Madam Chair. 3 First, we'll be hearing from 4 Reverend Thorb's, Chairperson from 5 Queens Community Board 12. 6 7 MS. THORBS: This is very quick. 8 I am the Chairperson for Community 9 Board 12, 400,000 people, 36 different 10 languages -- I'm sure we have more languages than that now -- and a retired 11 New York City Police Officer. 12 13 So, CCRB is very important -- not 14 just -- it's very important for 15 civilians to give them coverage and 16 security because there's nothing more 17 telling than when you feel, as a 18 citizen, you have no -- no recourse, no 19 person to go to, especially when the 2.0 police are policing themselves. 21 I was looking -- I was given three 22 topics to stay on course and so I took 23 the last one, which was what can the 24 City do to improve police community 25 relations in your neighborhood.

2.0

Let me just start by saying this -I know I only have four minutes -- who
you are in any job is based on your
character. So, if you're hiring someone
that shows no character, their activity
and their behavior is going to reflect
that.

That's something that's taught from home -- and once we are seeing signs of that, it needs to be -- they need to be corrected, brought back in, put back through training -- and if you still see no changes, then they need to be removed. They do not need to stay in a community where they feel that they can be abusive.

Ego plays a big part when you're carrying a shield and a gun. Ego is everything, but you have to have -- again, it goes back to character.

When I first came out on the street, my mother said to me as I walked out the door for my first night to go in Brooklyn -- and I trained right here in this community under CPOP with Michelle

2.0

Keller in the 113th Precinct. As a college kid, I was a cadet wearing a uniform standing on the corners of Sutphin Boulevard and being on Farmers Boulevard with her.

The one thing my mother said to me when I walked out the door is,

"Remember, you're a Christian first".

So, that means -- what she was saying to me is, you treat everyone correctly, no matter what. You have family; you have cousins and this is the way we need to come to work. We're here to help, not to throw our weight around.

There's two sides to every story.

Things do happen. Situations do get hot and they do escalate, but we have to always remember, we have to take a step back and still remember that we're dealing with people always in a time of crisis. You're in a crisis. That's why we're here.

We show up because you're going through things and we are to bring peace to the situation or bring clarity, or if

necessary, then it's time to lock somebody up. Somebody's got to go.

2.0

But we also -- doing that training, you're a psychiatrist because you have to read between the lines and see everything that's going on -- but you do not have the right to throw your weight around incorrectly and so we need the CCRB to have more power to be able to investigate, to open up records that need to be opened up because you're going to see something that -- there you go.

You're going to see a path. You're going to see something that has been going on all along.

I can recall the names of officers that have been taken out of the Police Department because of their behavior, but had they looked back at what was going on in the first place, they would've seen it.

What can we do better? The only thing that came to mind was mediation.

Let's try something different. Let's

2.0

have a mediation where now when an officer is charged about something -- or there's -- someone is saying that there is an allegation that this is going on or the officer talked disrespectfully -- let's have mediation.

It should be mandatory that they have to now face that person face to face, and now you tell your story and you listen to them tell their story, and let's see where we're at because I guarantee you, that story will change or the understanding will change.

I had a situation myself in February and I had to stay calm and do what I knew that I had to do to protect myself because I felt I was being threatened.

I knew I was being threatened and how it could have escalated.

Again, I think mediation is where we should go. That's something that should be on the table as a consideration because when a person has to now face the person they abuse, it changes the whole character. Nobody -- no one is

2.0

2.2

going to want to continue to do what they're doing and now they have to sit with -- sit in front of that person in front of CCRB and now explain yourself.

Thank you.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you very much for your -- your powerful words and thank you for your service as both Chair of Community Board 12 and as a police officer.

I wanted to talk a little bit about the Agency's mediation program. We've restarted it and rebooted it since the pandemic, and while I appreciate what the speaker just said about having mandatory mediation, we don't have mandatory mediation.

We think the only way mediation is successful is if all the parties volunteer for the mediation, and so first we -- when the civilian calls us and makes a complaint, we explain to them the different options and we explain to them what our mediation option is.

2.0

And if they choose to have the case mediated, we then go to the Department and see if they feel that the officer is an appropriate candidate for mediation, and then finally we go to the officer themselves to see if they would like to mediate the case because we don't want to put a civilian in a situation where they're going to waste their time and come down and talk to an officer who is not interested in mediation.

And so by having the mediation program be voluntary, we believe it is more effective.

One of the things that we do now that we -- that is different from cases in the past is we now take the civilian's statement about what happened before we attempt to mediate the case and that means if the civilian is unhappy with the mediation process, the case can be fully investigated, and that way --

A lot of times what would happen is people would try and go to mediate a

1 The mediation would be case. unsuccessful and because it had taken so 2 3 long, there was no way to then turn around and do a successful 4 5 investigation. And by setting strict time limits, 6 7 and making sure that everyone understands what is involved in the 8 9 mediation process upfront, we think we've created a better and more 10 effective version of mediation, and I'm 11 12 eager to see the results of these changes to our mediation process. 13 14 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Jon -- Thank you, 15 Jon. Appreciate that. 16 Yojaira, who is next on our list of 17 speakers? MS. ALVAREZ: Next, we'll be hearing 18 19 from Amira Ismail, a youth participant 2.0 from the organization Malikah and she'll 21 be joining us virtually. 2.2 MS. ISMAIL: Hello, everyone. 23 name is Amira Ismail. I'm a 17-year-old

organizer in Queens, New York. I am an

organizer -- obviously a fellow with

24

25

Malikah.

2.0

Malikah is a small, but mighty, local organization and we do a bunch of deescalation trainings across the City along with worldwide. So, that's just a little bit about Malikah.

We are based in Astoria, Queens on Steinway street, so we often see a lot of situations where it could be deescalated really quickly.

And all of our trainers are trauma-informed and me personally, being a 17-year-old -- but also being trauma-informed -- has really taught me how a lot of our City Officials should be trauma-informed because then it just makes deescalating a situation so much easier.

So, in terms of the NYPD and other City Agencies, I believe that they should go through a clear set of trainings in order to deal with our community members in a way that's respectful to both parties, So at the end of the day, things get solved

2.0

quickly because we work a lot with the community.

We work with domestic violence survivors and a bunch of other folks, and often day in and day out, there's just a lot of untrust (sic) in the community, which is unfortunate.

But it just happens with generational trauma and, honestly, a way to work through that is to not only create better relations, but also see how the NYPD can make themselves better to the community and make the community appeal to them, rather than stay away from them.

On Steinway on April -- beginning of April, there was a shooting, unfortunately, and the street was flooded with police officers and a lot of community members were not -- - were not comfortable, again, which is unfortunate. So, we had a lot of folks coming to our offices asking us how it is, what happened, etcetera.

So, it's just building those

2.0

2.2

community relations, along with when
we're talking about deescalation, as
someone just said beforehand, we
definitely need to make sure that these
folks are trauma-informed and instead of
just seeing a situation and walking
away, or going on their phones, to
actually approach the situation and
approach the situation not violently.

And -- yeah, thank you so much,

CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much,

CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much,
Amira, for your comments. We appreciate
them.

Jon, did you have a comment?

MR. DARCHE: I just wanted to thank

Amira for the hard work she's doing in

my neighborhood and also say that I -- I

agree with her about the need to use

trauma-informed interview techniques.

It's something that we've worked very hard to integrate into the CCRB.

We send a lot of our folks to special training in trauma-informed interview techniques, but we've taken what we've learned from the people who've gone to

1 that training and then come back to the 2 Agency, and we've integrated many of 3 those lessons -- without violating any 4 copyright rules. 5 We've integrated them into our trainings so that all of our 6 7 investigators are learning how to actively listen, how to engage with 8 folks who have been traumatized. 9 Like Amira said, sometimes it's 10 generational trauma. Sometimes it's the 11 12 trauma from the incident that led them 13 to the encounter that brought them to 14 the CCRB and sometimes it's just trauma that has happened to them that we have 15 16 to get through in order to find out what 17 happened in the incident that brought 18 them to the CCRB. 19 So, thank you for bringing up that 2.0 point, Amira. I think it helped us get 21 to something to explain to our partners 22 here in the community. 23 CHAIR RICE: Any other comments from 24 the Board?

(No response.)

25

1 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Yojaira, can we 2 hear from our next speaker? 3 MS. ALVAREZ: Next, we'll be hearing 4 from Joshua Kelly, a hospital responder 5 with LIFE Camp. MR. KELLY: All right. Peace, 6 7 everyone. My name is Joshua Kelly. a hospital responder employed with LIFE 8 9 Camp Inc. 10 I'm a little nervous -- not going to 11 lie to you. It's my first time speaking 12 in front of a crowd of -- first time speaking in front of a crowd of this 13 14 manner, you know. I've been in this work for about a 15 16 year-and-a-half now, you know. I'm from 17 the community. I grew up in Baisley 18 Housing -- and I have to emphasize 19 "Baisley Housing" because a lot of 2.0 people say "projects" and I don't feel 21 like it's a project. 22 I feel like that's a negative stigma 23 that people put on a community and I 24 don't think anybody grows up in any kind

of project area -- you know what I'm

25

2.0

saying -- despite whatever stigma is set around that area, you know.

There are a couple questions that were asked, that I should focus on -- right.

So, with my experience on -- with boots on the ground and in the community, what are some things that I consider that are issues with the police and community relations, right.

So, first, I feel like the youth do not have enough information in regards to the CCRB in terms of how to contact people -- any -- regards to information around this in general. Like, there are a few young people that I see in the crowd at the moment. I feel like I'm among the young people. I'm 28-years-old.

I was unaware of anything in regards to the CCRB when it came to -- when I was in high school and college. This is all new information to me, you know.

So, I feel like that's something that should be presented to the youth at

2.0

an early age, so they can get their grievances off, whether it be something minor -- you know. It can be a traffic infraction or just getting stopped walking in the street -- anything in regards to that, you know.

And I also feel that -- I don't know if anybody in this room has any idea in terms of how the hiring processes for police in our community -- I don't know if anybody doesn't.

Okay. So, I feel like there should be more police of our color -- you know, of our race. I don't want this to be a race thing, but I still feel like there should be a relatable amount of information going on with the youth, the adults, the police. It should be something that I can relate to, in terms of policing our community.

I don't want to make this a whole long-winded statement or anything like that. I wanted this to be pretty short.

But, yeah, that's pretty much all I got at the moment.

1 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much. 2 MR. DARCHE: Josh -- Joshua, can --3 Joshua, can you tell us what a hospital 4 responder is? 5 MR. KELLY: Yes -- oh, what is a hospital responder? 6 7 Okay. So, as a hospital responder, I respond to shootings within my 8 9 catchment, even though I'm gonna put quotes around it because I don't have a 10 set area that I cover. 11 12 We typically cover anything within Southeast Queens, you know, whether it 13 14 be a minor shooting, a major shooting. We just had a shooting the other 15 16 day -- the scooter shooter if anybody is 17 aware of that. We had four shootings within that day, within four different 18 19 areas. 2.0 I respond to the hospital. I speak with anybody in the area. I speak with 21 22 family members. I try to provide them 23 with any proper services or in the right 24 direction of getting the proper need 25 that they can get for that family

1 member, whether it be -- like I said, 2 just being care in the hospital or 3 setting up funeral arrangements. Unfortunately, that's something that we 4 5 have to deal with on a daily basis. That's not the brightest part of my 6 day, but, you know, it's something we 7 all got to deal with, unfortunately. 8 9 But, you know, just pointing people 10 in the right direction and providing them with any kind of care that we 11 12 possibly can, whether it be something that's in my power or within another 13 organization's power, I will point 14 people in the right direction wherever I 15 16 possibly can, you know, to get the 17 property needs that they need. MR. DARCHE: So, I hope now that 18 19 you've been to one of our Board 2.0 Meetings, you will consider the CCRB in 21 your -- your toolkit that you can point 22 people to --23 MR. KELLY: Absolutely. 24 MR. DARCHE: -- if you think they 25 need them -- and we have a relatively

small Outreach Team.

We have an Outreach Team of five people -- you add Jahi. We need your help and we need all of your help to let people know that we're here and a resource for them, because as the Chair of Community Board 12 said, people need to know that there is someone they can go to, to voice their concerns, to say, "Hey, I wasn't treated the right way", and that's why we're here, and if people don't know about us, and we can do the job.

MR. KELLY: Thank you. Appreciate you for your time.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you -- thank you for the incredible work that you do, and thank you, Jon, for that question.

Yeah, it's amazing work that you do.

We will now enter the public comment portion of the meeting. If you are interested in making a public comment, if you could please line up behind the podium -- and people are -- have already used the join -- raise your hand

2.0

2.0

feature, but just keep in mind that we want you to keep your comments to four minutes or less.

So, the public portion comment -Yes, sister, if you can let us know
who you are.

MS. MAYS: Anna Mays (phonetic). I have a complaint against the 103rd Precinct.

Recently, we had an altercation with a menacing tenant in our building and -- she came up at 6:50 in the morning with a hammer -- or what you could say a blunt object -- and banged on our door. She put dents on our door.

We called the police. The police came, took my statement, when and took her statement, and, basically, they said it was harassment.

The problem with the situation is she admitted what she did. We didn't understand why she wasn't arrested for anything because now we don't have a way to protect ourselves because -- since she didn't get arrested, we can't get an

Order of Protection.

2.0

My parents are elderly. My mother has a heart condition. I have three small children that live with me. I have fibromyalgia. Stress is a trigger for me. So, literally all day this morning, I've been calling and trying to find ways of protecting my family from this menacing tenant.

Mind you, these are the same tenants that attacked the super in January where he was sent to the hospital with a fractured skull. We don't understand why this man has never been arrested. Even if the person may not have pressed charges, why they stopped looking for him.

These are the same tenants that are now harassing my family. They're also harassing another tenant in the building. The same man that attacked the super approached her son.

We don't understand why the precinct is not doing their job to help us in this situation.

1 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Ms. Mays for 2 that comment. 3 I have a follow-up question on what the police's response has been to it. 4 This is a little bit outside of our 5 jurisdiction, but, Jon, I wanted to see 6 7 if you had any comment. MR. DARCHE: So, Ms. Mays, I'm going 8 9 to ask that you give your information to 10 one of our investigators and -- and I don't know --11 As the Chair said, this doesn't fall 12 in our jurisdiction in a neat way, but 13 14 we will make some calls and try and get an answer for you, and at least have 15 16 someone from the Department call you 17 back and explain what next steps are. 18 MS. MAYS: Thank you so much. 19 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. 2.0 MR. BATTLE: Good evening, everyone. 21 My name is Aaron Battle. I operate a 22 barber shop, Urbane Barbershop and 23 Beauty Spa located on 122-11 Guy R 24 Brewer Boulevard. I've been open for 14 25 months. My first business and -- thank

you.

2.0

And so my good friend, Mr. Steve here, just informed me about this -- this meeting, CCRB. I wasn't aware of it either and he invited me to come out.

One of the -- a complaint that I have been expressing for some months now pertains to the smoke shop -- okay. So, when I was a teenager, I used to smoke. I quit, maybe 20 years ago, and I get it. However, the smoke shop, I take it that it's not licensed to sell marijuana, but marijuana is sold there.

A lot of underage smokers purchase or are sold marijuana there. I observe it every day and I can foresee an unfortunate circumstance transpiring, and -- I'll try to be concise about it, but I'm not sure who I should address about it, in particular, in an effort to get it -- get some type of result because inevitably, there's going to be some sort of tragedy, or it takes it -- because of what it attracts and how it's operated.

2.0

One, you know, young fellow come with a blue flag, the other one's got a red flag, and it's a conflict. It shouldn't take a candlelight vigil for it to be shut down, just to be frank. It's too late then, you know, to come up there and protest -- body slain -- when I've been going to people's different organizations. I don't know where else to turn.

So, I'm hoping that voicing it here
-- and this is the first time I've done
something like this -- maybe someone can
point me in a direction as to where I -who I can speak with to get this
operation shutdown, you see, because it
has been several months and I'm not sure
what to do.

So, the barbershop says that I have, my aim is to not only provide quality service, but when youngsters come in, I had sparked conversations about activities that lead to incarceration or the cemetery -- okay -- the impact of gang affiliation and activity. That's

1 my duty because I want to be 2 instrumental in breaking the cycle. 3 So, if there's anyone who could point me in a direction or even assist 4 5 me, feel free to speak with me. I have a number and I'm willing to do what it 6 7 takes to intervene in the matter. 8 Thank you. 9 CHAIR RICE: Thank you -- Thank you, 10 Mr. Bell (sic) for your comments and congratulations on -- Mr. Battle -- Mr. 11 12 Battle --MR. DARCHE: Mr. Battle. 13 MS. SIMMONS: Battle. 14 MR. BATTLE: B-A-T-T-L-E. 15 16 CHAIR RICE: Mr. Battle, on your --17 on your small business and on your 18 entrepreneurship venture. 19 I'm going to have Jon speak a little 2.0 bit about who we can refer you to, but I 21 know this has recently become an issue 22 among City Council. Particularly, City 23 Councilwoman Gale Brewer has taken a lot 24 of effort around -- around this area and 25 so I'm sure that Jon can provide more

1 concrete direction for you on next 2 steps. 3 MR. DARCHE: So -- so, this is --4 this is an area that as marijuana was 5 legalized and the state's -- the state's policy for setting up licenses lagged 6 7 behind the demand for marijuana, you saw this growth of unlicensed marijuana 8 9 shops. In the City, the City seems to have 10 put the Sheriff's Office in charge of 11 12 enforcement, which is not in our jurisdiction. But, Mr. Battle, we'll --13 14 someone is going to get your information and we will reach out to the Sheriff's 15 16 Office and make sure to connect you with 17 them. 18 MR. BATTLE: (Indiscernible.) 19 MR. DARCHE: I don't think your --2.0 your barbershop is the only business 21 that is unfortunately near an unlicensed 22 marijuana dispensary in the City. 23 I think it's very, very common and

24

25

1 forward. 2 So, we'll at least be able to put 3 you together with the right people. CHAIR RICE: Yes, please. 4 5 MS. KETCHUM: Can you hear me -- is 6 that good? Okay. Good. 7 Good evening. My name is Venus Ketchum (phonetic). I'm a community 8 leader in education. I'm so excited for 9 four minutes because usually with School 10 Board Meetings, you have two minutes. 11 12 So, I just wanted to -- I just 13 wanted to introduce myself as a community leader in education -- a 14 15 community education activist. My son 16 David is here with me. He's 17 16-years-old. We live two blocks away. 18 He plays several sports, three 19 sports at the varsity level. He's going 2.0 to be a senior and he plays basketball 21 and is constantly looking for areas to 22 play basketball in the community. 23 I don't have any complaints. I want 24 to follow-up with what the young man 25 said about not knowing about this

meeting.

2.0

I first heard about CCRB at a School Board Meeting. I think this year there was a woman that was a guest, but before that, I'd never heard of this. So, there is an issue with communication in our community, specifically, that can't be put back on the community to communicate, right, because most of them don't know about these meetings.

Part of the role as an officer policing our communities can be to communicate the offerings and the services that your precinct and agencies provide.

I often see police officers over by the Papa John's or Merrick Boulevard close to the laundromat and I see officers throughout the City, throughout Queens, patrolling or standing, but not engaging with our people and not engaging with our community.

And like the young man said, there are not enough officers of color in communities of color, so there's a

2.0

stigma, with the youth specifically, around who police -- police officers are and what they do. So, there's a hesitation to communicate, so I would encourage the adult, which is the officer, to shake hands with our teens.

My son is a shake-hands type of kid, so he will shake people's hands, but all of the officers he has come in contact with were Caucasian. The only person that I saw of African American descent was the Queens South Deputy guy at a NAACP meeting or a Democratic Club meeting.

But other than that, on the streets, I don't see black officers. I don't see that many female officers. I do see some over by 40 Houses -- South Jamaica Houses -- but, really, creating an initiative to increase and improve communication, tone, race relations -- so that officers know that it is your job to say, "Hello".

It is your job to ask, "Can I help you" -- right. In patrolling the parks,

2.0

it is -- "Hey, what are you all doing over there", versus looking to arrest and criminalize our youth.

So, again, I didn't intend to speak,
I just wanted to introduce myself. I'm
passionate about education. Somebody
has to come to every single high school.
Somebody has to come to every single PTA
meeting.

Somebody has to come to the School
Board Meetings, CEC consistently and
regularly talking about this
organization, because it's not happening
and our youth are uninformed, which
leads them to go to other places -- to
seek comfort, and belonging, and a sense
of empowerment at a smoke shop versus at
a meeting like this.

So, I hope that we all tell our youth, there's something happening here that's important. We want to hear your voice first and foremost. So, thank you. I love having four minutes.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much for introducing yourself and using your four

minutes very well.

2.0

Yes, we can have our next speaker.

MR. MEYERS: I am Mr. Meyers of the Pink Houses in Brooklyn. Housing Cop, NYC, me. Been retired for 35 years -- 20 on, 35 off still doing the job.

My question is very simple and it hasn't been addressed. Why don't police officers wear their hats? That is a sign of authority. When you step out, you got your shield. Your king doesn't need to go nowhere without his crown.

He needs to put his crown on because everybody looks up at you. They don't look at your chest or your arm. That is what I see and I'm a police officer -- I still am. I see something, I say something. I'll step to it. I'm not afraid.

We've come too far, and as you see the color of my skin. I knew about Booker T. Washington, Frederick Douglas, and so forth, and so on -- all of them, but the police right now give me a bad name and make me look bad.

1 I really didn't want to be up here 2 talking to you. I planned something 3 else, but you don't scare me. You are me, so how can I be scared -- afraid of 4 5 me -- scared of me too also. Now, if police officers wore their hat, 6 7 authority -- they stand tall. Pink Houses, Brooklyn, mention Mr. 8 9 Meyers to a few people over there and 10 see what they start talking about. 11 (Indiscernible) -- no. Always tell the truth -- educate, educate, educate. 12 Frederick Douglas said that. 13 14 Think I've said enough. I don't want to take up no more of your time --15 16 two, three, four minutes -- I'm out. 17 Peace. 18 I started to think I said -- I said, 19 I'm busy. I'm busy with children, 2.0 adults. They all want to look like me. 21 Have a good night, all. 22 MS. WALROND: Thank you to the Board 23 and to everyone that's assembled here. 24 I have nothing on him. I only 25 retired -- I'm retiring now six years

1 after working 42 years for the city of 2 New York. 3 So, I know about the CCRB, DCAS, 4 Department of Finance, and DOB was my 5 last hurrah -- okay. Now, I come before you because there 6 7 -- I come before you as -- not only as a public person, but on behalf of my 8 9 church -- okay -- and the neighborhood. 10 We have some issues that are going on and the noise with the dirt bikes 11 12 that come through the neighborhood. They're doing wheelies -- or whatever 13 14 you call it -- and it's dangerous. The children out there. Come on. 15 16 God forbid a child runs, you cannot see 17 a child with a car so high that weighs I 18 don't know how many pounds. 19 Okay. The other thing is the noise. 2.0

Okay. The other thing is the noise.

I have -- I hate to say, which is

true -- I have a party place on the

block -- party from Monday to Sunday -
okay. I like music. I love it. I love

to dance, but not every day. People

have to work. The noise is ridiculous.

21

22

23

24

25

2.0

People leave their bottles, etcetera, etcetera.

Okay. The other thing is, we need for the church on Sutphin Boulevard -- Rush Temple AME Zion Church, who I'm trying to speak on behalf of right now -- we have other things going on, but the main thing, we need a stoplight at that corner of 120th Avenue and Sutphin Boulevard because there's like four-way traffic coming.

I'm afraid that one day one of our parishioners, or the children, or maybe any of you who are walking over there to Food World or wherever you're going -- or to the apartment buildings that are across the street -- because it's crazy. It's horrible. So, there needs to be a light there, hopefully.

On my block, there can't be a light. There can't even be a speed bump because when the Van Wyck Expressway is backed up, they use 144th Street to come zooming down. I do not leave my house until 10 o'clock, because at 6:30 I'm

2.0

awoke by the noise of the traffic coming through, coming through.

The last thing is the double-parking. It's ridiculous. Cars are double and triple-parked. Now, I don't know. Any of these things that I have mentioned, who -- is it 311?

I've dialed 311 and I did get a quick response, which I was really surprised because usually it says, it'll be four or five hours before the police officers arrive, which I understand because it's not a necessity -- I don't want to say necessity, but it's not something that's high priority -- thank you for that -- as they always say.

But, when I call 311, next thing, I heard a voice on the phone. "Miss -- miss, you complained". I said, "Yes", and, "We'll be there in a few minutes". Okay. That's great, but we need to keep this activity of things that are in the neighborhood going because I said after retiring -- okay -- I was here -- I'm here to work with whomever it is, by any

means necessary.

2.0

And that gentleman over there that owns the barbershop, I'm one of his customers. I'm not trying to big-up his business. He does good. I do need a -- I do need a haircut. You all looking now -- I know. But the thing is, his word is his bond and so is mine.

We are here. We want to do something -- this is our community -- because we may not be here to see what's going to happen to our children. It's about the children. So, let's give them something. It's generational wealth we got to deal with and making sure that they provided with to get what they have to do.

So, we want to keep you all to the books and the grind of what you all got to do, just like it's your responsibility to keep us to it. So.

I'm hoping and praying, by God's almighty grace, that something that is said here today will change or start the process of change because we need to

```
1
             change.
 2
                 Oh, I'm sorry. My name is Deborah
 3
             Y. Walrond, W-A-L-R-O-N-D. Thank you
 4
             for your time.
 5
                 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Ms. Walrond
             -- thank you, Ms. Walrond.
 6
 7
                 You mentioned a couple of different
             issues, including the noise in the -- in
 8
 9
             the neighborhood and the double-parking,
10
             and -- so, there's a wide range of
11
             issues that you mentioned and so we'll
12
             see if we can direct -- help to direct
             them to where --
13
14
                 (Indiscernible.)
                 MS. WALROND: It is -- well, I just
15
16
             want to make it -- direct it to the
17
             appropriate party because things are
18
             subject to change.
19
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: It's not going to
2.0
             change.
21
                 MS. WALROND: It's not going to
22
             change -- okay. Well, I'll be there.
23
                 (Indiscernible.)
24
                 MS. WALROND: Right -- right. But I
25
             know we can't get one -- not to cut you
```

```
1
             off -- yes.
 2
                 (Indiscernible.)
 3
                 MS. WALROND: Oh, really -- oh,
             because I know the Fire Department has
 4
 5
             to come through. So, we're thinking
             that maybe that's the reason why they
 6
 7
             won't put a speed bump there because
             it's horrible.
 8
 9
                 (Indiscernible.)
10
                 MS. WALDRON: Right. So, you know,
11
             we need help with that because you don't
12
             know -- you really don't know. You
             know, seniors coming out --
13
14
                 But, really, on that corner of 120th
             Avenue -- on Sutphin Boulevard and 120th
15
16
             Avenue, 119th Avenue -- Dr. Eldris
17
             Gittens Way -- we need --
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: There's a --
18
19
                 (Indiscernible.)
2.0
                 MS. WALROND: -- the speaker --
21
             okay.
22
                 (Indiscernible.)
23
                 CHAIR RICE: Look at that -- look at
24
             that. Make sure you remember where you
25
             got your answers at, right here at the
```

1 CCRB Meeting, you all. You witnessed it. 2 Can we hear from our next sister? 3 MS. MITCHELL: Hi. Good evening. 4 5 My name is Trina Mitchell and I am proud to be standing here as a CCRB mom. 6 7 My son, Christopher Mitchell, served 8 on the -- he was a founding member of 9 the Youth Advisory Council to the CCRB 10 and so for the young leader in the building, and the young people in the 11 12 room and those listening, the CCRB does have active youth. They are very 13 active. 14 If you go on -- if you search in the 15 16 -- if you just type in the search 17 engine, "Civilian Complaint Review Board Youth Advisory Council", you'll see. 18 CHAIR RICE: If we can ask those 19 2.0 folks who are having the conversation in the back of the room, if you all can 21 22 step out for a second. 23 We don't -- sorry -- okay. No 24 problem -- no problem. 25 MS. MITCHELL: Thank you.

1 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much, Ms. 2 Mitchell. You were giving a powerful 3 testimony. We wanted to make sure that we had -- you had our utmost attention. 4 5 MS. MITCHELL: Thank you. I appreciate it. 6 7 So, if you Google "Civilian Complaint Review Board Youth Advisory 8 9 Council", that big, bright, beautiful face that you'll see in the middle is 10 Chris Mitchell. That's my son, Barack 11 12 Obama reloaded, and that -- the Youth 13 Advisory Council is something that I 14 would encourage any powerful -- any young person looking to make a 15 16 difference, looking to have your voice 17 heard, to stand out, to be seen, 18 supported, and recognized -- and to be a 19 representative for your community -- to 2.0 reach out to the CCRB and join the Youth 21 Advisory Council. It's powerful. 22 I attended because he was the 23 youngest member of the CCRB Youth 24 Advisory Council. I was there at their 25 inaugural youth conference that they

2.0

hosted at NYU where youth were speaking out and they were phenomenal, and they were fearless, and I felt that from you up here as a young leader -- and your voice is needed.

And so I love the fact that the CCRB is taking it on the road. I didn't know that they -- you know, that you come to different boroughs to have this tour and I think that there should -- I love this idea and I love that it will continue, and I hope that the youth that can hear me now will type it in your search engine -- will go out and be a part of this and connect because we need you.

One thing that I want -- what you said, what can we do better, one thing I noticed -- just pivoting a little -- when I get off the subway and I get to Jamaica Avenue, and I see the young police officers -- because usually they're fresh out of the academy -- put on foot-posts -- what I see in my community -- cause I know they're supposed to be community policing -- is

fear.

2.0

When I look in their faces, they're so young. They're babies and they're put out and they're usually policing a community that they don't frequent, they don't shop in, they don't live in, they don't know anybody here, they don't visit.

And so what I would offer -- what I would hope there would be is that there will be more engagement with that before you throw them in an undesirable because somebody with seniority doesn't want to do foot-posts. What I would hope is that you take those same young people and put them in positions where they are in the Youth Police Academy Camp -- cause there is one in every borough.

I have two boys and my youngest son is there every day during the summer, Monday through Friday. They're hosted in a local public school and you have your local police, men and women, as counselors in a camp training these young people in all five boroughs to --

just, like, in self-defense.

2.0

A lot of them have been bullied. A few in school were bullies and they -- an incredible sergeant came and spoke at the school to start a mediation program and bring those kids in and -- instead of demonizing the bully, he stood up and was like, let's make you a leader cause you use it in a negative way.

So, those are ways that we -- the kids are seeing -- rather than seeing the officer and being angry -- because we can turn on a TV and see people dying that look like me or look like them at the hands of police officers -- and now trust is being built.

So, if those same scared police officers that we see fresh out of the academy on those undesirable foot-posts are now put in the Youth Police Academy training the young people in the community, now trust is being built, and if you put them in the school programs to mediate during the school year, and then if you put them in front of adults

2.0

in self-defense classes hosted at a
local "Y" or -- I don't know -- where do
we go for --

Our Mayor is hosting a self-defense class or whatever -- it's those -- if you take those same scared faces, then all of a sudden, a relationship is built. Then trust is built, and then that fear would go away, so then all of a sudden, if you see a scuffle with kids not using their time wisely, or hanging out, or being ridiculous, you don't automatically go to your gun and we don't automatically have another mourning of another life loss stupidly because of fear.

So -- - and I just wanted -- this
one last thing cause I don't know if I'm
over my four minutes -- but it's awesome
to know this, my son -- that Barack
Obama reloaded -- remember that name,
Christopher Mitchell. He's going to be
your president one day -- but he was put
on the -- he came to the Civilian
Complaint Review Board's Youth Advisory

2.0

2.2

Council because a phenomenal police detective, my sister, Detective Shante Neal Baker, known as Ms. Sunshine throughout all five boroughs, told him about it.

She said, We need somebody like you helping to police us", because you can see -- you can see someone in uniform loves you, yet, I got into uniform because I'm growing up in Brooklyn and I'm profiled, and it was just an ugly exchange between me and an officer, and I decided to become an officer so that when people who see me can see I'm building relationship.

I'm building trust again and I'm healing myself in the process because I was hurt by the uniform.

So, she -- she is the one who introduced them to the CCRB and so when he began to serve, he served as someone who loves an officer, but someone who wants to hold the officers accountable.

Thank you.

MR. DARCHE: I remember Chris and

1 his performance -- and where is he in school now? 2 3 MS. MITCHELL: Connecticut. He is going to be -- (indiscernible) -- with 4 -- (indiscernible) -- and he has a full 5 scholarship now to study abroad. He's 6 7 going to be in D.C. on Supreme Court floor doing oral arguments. 8 9 So, he's on his way -- I'm sorry. I'm so excited, but -- well, he's in New 10 York going -- he's gonna be reconnecting 11 12 with the Board and hopefully back at the next leadership gathering. 13 14 But -- and I'm excited for the young leaders in the room that are going to be 15 16 coming forward and joining this Board 17 too. I can feel it. 18 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much. 19 appreciate you. 2.0 Yes. 21 MS. MOSLEY: Hi. My name is 22 Michelle Mosley (phonetic). I am a 23 member of UNCA, one of the oldest civic 24 associations in Southeast Queens, 1954 25 -- tell you how long it has been.

2.0

I just have a question and I have a response.

The question is, if somebody wants to make a complaint, is there a timeframe -- cause I had a neighbor of mine that got into a situation and the police -- it just got escalated and she wound up being arrested. They never fed her and she wound up having to go to the hospital because she's a diabetic.

It just really snowballed into something that didn't really need to happen. So, is there a timeframe that she can make a complaint?

MR. DARCHE: There's a statute of limitations for discipline matters against members of the NYPD and all civil servants that's set by State Law at 18 months -- a year-and-a-half from the date of the incident.

When we get complaints that are more than a year since the date of the incident, we look at them very hard to make sure that we can actually get them investigated in time, and if it is going

```
1
             to go over, we might then look to see if
 2
             there's an exception to the statute of
             limitations.
 3
                 So, if it's -- if it's between a
 4
 5
             year and 18 months, there is a
             possibility that we might not
 6
 7
             investigate it. We do it on a
 8
             case-by-case basis.
 9
                 (Indiscernible.)
                                     Then he should
10
                 MR. DARCHE: Okay.
             file a complaint and we would
11
12
             investigate that.
13
                 MS. MOSLEY: Okay. And then my
14
             second statement is that, how many
             people know what their precinct is --
15
16
             103rd or the 113th -- or the one -- you
17
             know, how many of you ever attended
18
             their Community Precinct Council
19
             Meeting?
2.0
                        The 113th meets on the third
21
             Monday of every month between the
22
             winter's hours. The summers, they don't
23
             meet -- and then I believe the 103rd
24
             meets -- those are where you can get
25
             your questions about things happening in
```

2.0

your community and get some answers from
this -- the Precinct Commanders or the
Sergeants on there.

So, you might want to look into when
those meetings are and probably want to
attend them.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you -- thank you
for that comment.

MR. TOWLER: All right. Good evening, everyone. I guess she does speak for me there. I'm the President of the 113th Precinct Community Council.

My name is Garfield Towler and the reason I got up is because I heard people talk about police engagement and I could speak on police engagement and also this young man with that situation.

Like, she just said, our meeting is every third Monday. Right now we out for the summer break and we back in session for September meeting.

I'm saying that we talk about police engagement, apparently that the community is not getting engaged with the police because it will look like -- tomorrow we

2.0

have camp in the park. Next two weeks, we have National Night Out. In August we have a Unity march and we're coming down the boulevard. So, there are a lot of engagement.

Also, you all may not know there's a -- we have a plaque coming off inside the 113th. They know. We have allocated numbers now, but we have the majority of black officers at the 113th. The whole complete Community Affairs is all black.

So, that means that you need to get engaged with the precinct. It's an open-door policy that he has there and anyone could come and talk with the Precinct Commander.

Also, like she said, the meeting is every third Monday. You can all reach out to me. If you go on the 113th Precinct Community Facebook, you will see also who to make contact to. You can leave your complaint there. You can leave -- you also have a form. You can leave your email.

2.0

We have a form that we fill out called "Complaint", but -- we will use the right as saying it's -- I don't want to say "complaint". I don't want to say -- the "Issue Form", I should say -- that you could respond to the Community Affairs and they will address your issue that you're dealing with.

So, I just want to say that because I know that we talked about the police engagement and I could tell you right now, I spent one year at the precinct, four hours a day, four days a week just to see what goes on. I will tell you, it is getting better, the engagement with the police officer.

If you look at it, we have something called the Greeter Program, that the greeter -- they'll have a seat. They get to the greeter before they even get to the officer.

So, things are getting better.

That's the most I can say right now,
based on the engagement of the police
and the community. Thank you.

1 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much for 2 your comments and for reminding us when 3 you're -- when the Police Community Council meets. 4 5 MR. TOWLER: Every third Monday of the month. You can reach out to me. I 6 7 will give you the information and you will get the email coming to you with 8 9 the location because we are moving around to different location. So, it 10 will not be one location every month. 11 12 We're back in session on September. 13 So, my -- you want -- my email is 14 qfield128@aol.com. Also, my cellphone 15 number is 347 --16 MS. DIXON: Love and blessings, 17 everyone. My name is Carolyn Dixon. 18 I'm a survivor. The name of my 19 organization is called Where Do We Go 2.0 From Here. 21 I work closely with LIFE Camp and 2.2 for the last couple of days I've been 23 working closely with AU. 24 My question to the CCRB is mainly to touch bases on survivors -- victims of 25

2.0

gun violence. Once we hit the hospital, there is complication, heated situations, and most families, especially parents, are treated as not the victims, but the perpetrators themselves and I wanted to know if we're going through this as victims and survivors of gun violence, where do CCRB step in?

And then my second question is that right now AU and I are working with a client who had got shot a week ago, I believe, on Sutphin and South Road.

This man came out of the hospital with an open wound. He got shot in his chest. He got shot in his stomach. His stomach is open.

The -- I don't know the correct name of the squad, but it's the drug squad -- jumped out on him. There is a video where this man was sitting in his car and about 10 or 12 police officers jumped on this man, busted open -- open stitches, and now he's on Rikers Island, and I wanted to know where can we use

CCRB in this situation.

2.0

CHAIR RICE: Jon can respond to the two of them first of all, and I also wanted to say thank you for your incredible work. The fact that you're there for the communities, and particularly for the parents, we just really appreciate you.

MR. DARCHE: So, I'm going to answer your second question first.

With regard to the particular individual, you can file a complaint with the Agency on his behalf, and so once you filed a complaint -- and we have our investigators here, you can do that tonight -- we will begin contact attempts to reach him.

If he is facing criminal charges, his attorney might not let him speak to us yet and so we might not be able to conduct the investigation until after the criminal charges he's facing are determined.

But the sooner you contact us, the sooner we can get the process started.

2.0

The second issue with survivor -family members of people who have been
shot by the police -- who have been
shot, period -- victims of gun violence,
if they are treated disrespectfully by
the police, that is within our
jurisdiction, and if you file a
complaint -- if they file a complaint,
or if you become aware of it and you
wish to file a complaint on their
behalf, we will investigate it and look
and determine whether in fact there was
misconduct, and if there was misconduct,
recommend discipline for the member of
service.

CHAIR RICE: AU, you had a comment as well.

MR. HOGAN: Yeah, I just want everyone to know, Ms. Dixon, when she said she's a "survivor", on May 5th, a few years ago, her son was shot and killed right off of Sutphin Boulevard, and from that moment, Ms. Carolyn Dixon has been an advocate for gun violence and also gun violence awareness.

2.0

And I just think, you know, we've been -- her and I have been working on this particular case the last four days cause there's a pattern when someone is shot in our community, the police come to individuals and treat the individuals as he or she is the one that shot themselves.

And -- you know, and I'm glad the meeting is very inspirational today, but there's a lot of real stuff that's going on in 113th, 103rd, and 105th Precinct -- 102nd Precinct -- that we need to be aware of in order for us to stop because --

Garfield, that's my dude right there, and Garfield is four days, four hours down at the precinct, but the engagement that we are looking for is for young people so they can identify the possibilities of how real policing is.

Police officers come with a particularly implicit bias where for no reason, not even -- them not even

2.0

knowing why -- they are prejudiced when they come into our communities.

So, when young Josh who works for LIFE Camp Inc. -- and believe me, for one year him, being a hospital responder -- we should clap it up cause him articulating his first time and the work that he has done being caught up in that trauma, let's give him a clap, please, for us in just two more seconds.

And I want us to know that this is

-- young people, when I was Josh's age,
at 28, I was not forced that my best
friend could be shot and killed on a
daily basis and when he termed "public
housing" as "public housing" and not as
a "public project", it's that our young
people really have the intellect to
articulate their positions, but they
don't have the support from us as a
community at large and the resources
that they need to be sufficient and
productive.

So, let's just help the young people out more and let's be more realistic

2.0

about what's happening. We're not here to beat up cops -- you know, or to say -- point fingers at cops, but we're here to be accountable -- to make them -- my job at LIFE Camp, I'm the Chief of Streets and most of my interactions are with inspectors and chiefs of the borough's.

But -- and I say to them, you know, yes, we need to be held accountable because I'm not going to -- if I drive down and break the law by driving, the most I'll probably do is drive two miles above the speed limit and if I get pulled over, I can't because I'm a friend, be freed from either incarceration or for a particular ticket that I might get.

It's just about police
accountability and that's all we're
asking for and we're all talking about.
And I'm sorry if you don't know -- like
the sister said, her son did such an
articulate job. You should -- they
should know very young about what the

2.0

CCRB does and that way the young people can start hearing this and making our jobs easier because, believe, it's not easy to sit up here at all because we try to make sure that --

I look -- when I look at the Chair and the work that she has to do working with the different entities and agencies, and to bring by each month some kind of resolve about what happens to us as a people and believe, it's happening to us as a people.

MR. DARCHE: And, AU, I was -- I was glad you brought it back to what Josh had said earlier because I've been kicking myself while I've been sitting here that I didn't address one of the things he brought up.

And one of the things Josh brought up was that he perceived a lack of representation in the NYPD and he had questions about the hiring practices, and we can't really control the NYPD's hiring practices.

But the CCRB is hiring. As we said,

1 the City Council and the Administration 2 restored the budget cuts and actually 3 gave us additional funds, and so we are going to be hiring more investigators 4 5 and more outreach folks. And so I encouraged -- AU, I might 6 7 be trying to steal Josh from you -- but I encourage Josh and I encourage you to 8 9 not only look for yourself, but tell 10 your friends that we're hiring and we're looking for good people who know the 11 12 community that we live in. It starts at 13 45. 14 MR. HOGAN: That's great. 15 MR. DARCHE: 46 -- 46. I didn't mean to lowball anybody. 16 17 MR. HOGAN: That's great. Thank 18 you. 19 CHAIR RICE: Thank you -- thank you, 2.0 AU, and thank you for reminding the 21 community of some of the job 22 possibilities that are available at 23 CCRB. 24 Sir, you can approach the podium. 25 Good evening.

2.0

MR. LELAND: My name is Steve Leland (phonetic). I'm a member of the South Jamaica Queens community and my question is kind of piggybacking off of the gentleman, Mike.

So, you go to the police when you have a problem. The police are supposed to police the community, right. So, we go to them to get help and these different organizations.

What happens when they don't have an answer -- and we come to these meetings and then certain people direct us to other people, and then it winds up, nothing happens.

With the smoke shops, I'm ready to go in there and -- excuse my language -- but I'm ready to shut them down -- bust their ass because they shouldn't be there. But the thing we're supposed to do is rely on the police to handle the situation.

Then what happens when they don't do it either? Everybody passes it off to someone else. What are we to do? Am I

1 supposed to get my -- cause if I go in 2 there and shut them down, I'm going to 3 jail. You're going to come for that, 4 but you're not going to address the 5 problem. These marijuana situations, it's out 6 7 of hand. Somebody is going to get hurt or die. They shouldn't have to wait 8 9 until that happens for something to be done. 10 So, when you pass off a -- you tell 11 12 us that somebody is going to check into it or -- can we make sure something 13 14 happens? CHAIR RICE: Well, this isn't about 15 16 policing, but actually they're supposed 17 to serve and protect --18 MR. LELAND: Right. CHAIR RICE: So, I think -- right. 19 2.0 So, I think that we -- that it's about 21 accountability for that service is what 22 you're asking for --23 MR. LELAND: Right. CHAIR RICE: -- And also for the 24 25 protection, no matter the zip code that

you live in. I just didn't want that

2.0

MR. DARCHE: But I think that -- I think one of the issues with the marijuana shops, in particular, is as the law changed -- and the Assembly Member left, so I apologize to him if I may be throwing him under the bus -- but the law changed and there is a gap.

And so no -- when you're saying,

"Why can't I go to someone and have them

resolve it for me", it is because there

is a gap, which has made it very tough

for the City Administration to address

these issues.

So, you know, if someone had been selling marijuana illegally, two years ago, the police were the right people to go to. But now we're talking about a matter of taxes and licenses. It's not a -- it's not a penal law crime and it's not a police issue.

And so -- that's -- and so when you're not getting a straight answer -- and I would much prefer to give you a

1 straight answer -- we don't know and it's not like the CCRB doesn't know. 2 Ι 3 think the City as a whole is looking for an answer on who is responsible. 4 5 (Indiscernible.) MR. DARCHE: But, again, it's a 6 7 larger issue than just, they're selling marijuana. It's -- it is a different 8 9 situation than it was two years ago, and 10 people are still trying to figure out 11 the way to address it. 12 So, that's why you're not getting straight answers when you go to people 13 14 because no one has the answer to give 15 you. 16 MR. LELAND: So, do we need to take 17 matters into our own hands because it 18 can be done. 19 MR. DARCHE: No, I don't -- I don't 2.0 think you should. That is not what I'm 21 saying, but I'm saying, it's an -- it is 22 a legislative thing that needs to get 23 fixed. 24 MR. LELAND: It's -- and I don't 25 want to sound like -- like, you know --

like that's the best thing to do cause I know it's not.

2.0

MR. HOGAN: Look, the last three years -- is Fathers Alive In The Hood still here? He left -- okay.

Kenny must have left -- and we were on -- we were -- for three years, we were on a debate, and I was part of that tour, about legalizing marijuana. Some of you all might see me being crazy about not legalizing it because I knew what was going to happen to our community.

I've seen heroin. I've seen dope.

I've seen crack. I lived -- I lived in those eras. They didn't benefit us -- all right -- and so to legalize something -- to legalize a substance -- I'm just going to do real quick about this -- right -- and this is what I want Steve and Mike -- I want you to understand that -- right.

We're going to have to be patient -all right. That's what we're going to
have to be, Steve. All right. I speak

1 to you a lot. 2 MR. LELAND: It's hard --3 MR. HOGAN: Steve, just wait -- just 4 wait, just wait. 5 We have to be patient. We'll talk later on after we get out of here cause 6 7 I don't want anybody to go out and do anything that you're going to ask the 8 9 old man for some bail money. All right. 10 I have no bail money. 11 All right. I know you, Steve. All 12 right. So, what we have to do as men in our community is come together with a 13 14 real strategy to think and then go, and if we go to 90 doors and they don't have 15 16 the answer, we go to the 91st door and 17 be patient until somebody has the 18 answer, cause right now, as the 19 Executive Director that said, the City 2.0 doesn't have the answer. 21 But there was this push by both 22 community and elected officials to 23 legalize this. Okay. I'm not going to 24 get into why. Okay. I hope you all 25 know why -- right. You know, we didn't

2.0

push that law. Yes -- yes, we definitely didn't, you know -- and Black Spectrum Theatre was the last four times -- places that we had this particular debate at.

And we're really articulate about the information that was coming down, and it was too fast that the people that made it trending was 14, 15, and 16-years-old, and people that are not even legally going to be able to smoke in any way. 21 and over, no Federal subsidized housing living -- not in the public, unless there's a public space that is designated.

So, there's so many intangibles into that law -- right -- yeah, you know -- that to smoke it, you have to be a very different kind of person. You have to be privileged somewhere.

So, let's really just talk later.

All right -- all right, brother. You know -- and I know you came to the office a few times and we tried to do what we could do, but our hands are

```
1
             tied.
 2
                 The City doesn't know and I don't
 3
             want us to belabor it here cause we
             don't have the answer and not that we
 4
             shouldn't have it, but the City doesn't
 5
             have it and neither do we.
 6
 7
                 All right. Let's talk later.
 8
                 MR. LELAND: AU --
 9
                 (Indiscernible.)
                 MS. DENNY: You have an ID to
10
11
             sell cigarettes. I just went to buy --
12
             it's -- what do you call it -- it's a
             cough syrup and they asked me for ID.
13
14
             The syrup cannot be sold without an ID,
             so why are -- why are we giving our
15
16
             children and to be left to be smoking.
17
             Some young -- 13, 14 -- what is the
18
             smoke -- what is the age you start
19
             smoking in our community or in the New
2.0
             York State?
21
                 MR. HOGAN: You said the age?
22
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Yes, what's by
23
             law.
24
                 MR. HOGAN: Well, the legal age
25
             would be 21.
```

```
1
                 MS. DENNY: Right. But you know
 2
             something --
 3
                 MR. LELAND: 13 -- 16-year-old kids.
 4
                 MS. DENNY: So, we need to save our
 5
             children, but they need to have some sort
             of -- some sort of a recommendation
 6
 7
             happening.
 8
 9
                 (Indiscernible.)
10
                 CHAIR RICE: All right. Thank you.
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: It's crazy.
11
12
                 CHAIR RICE: Thank you -- and I
             understand the concern, but as we -- as
13
14
             we've heard from our Executive Director,
             and also from AU, this is a -- an issue
15
16
             that is outside of our jurisdiction.
17
                 But it's one that is clearly of
18
             concern to all community members and --
19
             so, did you have a comment.
2.0
                 MR. LELAND: I was just going to say
21
             that --
22
                 CHAIR RICE: Yes.
23
                 MR. LELAND: -- I just hope that no
24
             one has to die behind this --
25
                 CHAIR RICE:
                              Yes.
```

```
1
                 MR. LELAND: -- cause it's happening
 2
             too much.
                 (Indiscernible.)
 3
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: It's a state
 4
 5
             issue.
                 CHAIR RICE: Yeah, it is a state
 6
 7
             issue, but like I said, Gail Brewer at
 8
             the City Council is taking this up as
             well.
 9
                 So, we can further the conversation,
10
11
             but I'm going to ask the next speaker,
12
             if they can come to the podium.
13
                 Thank you.
14
                 MR. KARRIEM: How you all doing? My
15
             name is Bilal Karriem from Community
16
             Board 12.
17
                 AU, how you doing? Thank you all for
18
             coming out.
19
                 I'm not going to bust your all chops.
2.0
             I just want to know, if you all willing
21
             to work with me. I'll work directly with
22
             you all to connect to our community-based
23
             organizations, schools, and so forth.
24
25
                 But I want to know if you all
```

1 willing to come out, and on top of that, 2 there should be standing room only. 3 lot of people don't know about this 4 organization. I'm pretty sure you've 5 heard that many, many times. So, like I said, I'm willing to 6 7 extend myself, work with you, and get 8 you out in the community, but I need to 9 know if you're willing to come out so 10 that people can see you. 11 You've explained what your 12 organization do, so that way we can empower people cause there are a lot of 13 14 people I know who need to be here who 15 could benefit from you. 16 Thank you. 17 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. And, hopefully, we've been clear 18 19 that the answer to that is yes, but can 2.0 you say your name one more time --21 Bilal Karriem. 22 Okay. Oh, great. Thank you. 23 MR. MARCHANT: Hi. Good evening. My 24 name is Rabbi Garth Marchant. I happen to liaison with South -- the 25

2.0

Borough Commander of NYPD and, of course there are some problems with police officers who do bad things, and that's why I'm glad you're there.

However, I want to tell you that in South Queens Borough Patrol, we're trying to resolve those issues. We have a very good commander, Commander Williams, and we have some very new commanders in the 113th Precinct, Commander Jenkins, which we work with very carefully.

Like, for example, today we had a picnic for all the children in the park. It was overcrowded -- and we have the Explorers Program. We have all those programs and I want to tell you, the Commander for the 113th Precinct and Commander Williams don't tolerate no mis-abuse by police officers. They discipline them. I've seen it.

And, also, I want to tell you for the community, I am a graduate of the Police Academy -- Citizen Police
Academy. Some of us need to be -- go to

2.0

the Citizen Police Academy. You know what I do as a graduate of the Citizen Police Academy? I do patrol with the police officers, sector officers.

I take the young people and I walk with them with the police officers, and they have a cellphone and I let the police -- that the young people get the phone number for the police officers if they have a problem -- and I take some of those gang members -- you know what I do -- I take them into the precinct and I introduce them to the officers.

So, we have to be proactive. You know, I mean, we can just sit back and say, "This is happening", "This is happening". We got to help our kids because today, you know, what I did, right there when the police was, I already sent over 50 students to go to college for free in the State University of New York.

That's what we have to do. We got to be proactive.

But I'm glad you're there because no

1 -- you have bad doctors, bad every 2 profession -- right -- and so you were 3 there as the last resort if there is that -- and you're doing a good job --4 5 if there is any problem with the police. 6 I want to congratulate you for what 7 you do, but at the same time, we have to understand that we got to work with the 8 9 police because they're the last resort 10 in our community and I want to say this 11 community is doing a very good job with 12 the officers that we have and with the command that we have, and you got to 13 look at Chief Williams. 14 He's a very great guy and he makes 15 16 sure that our community is not abused. 17 So, I just want to bring that to your 18 attention. 19 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. 2.0 MS. VASSEL: Good evening, everyone. 21 Okay. So, my name is Angel Vassel 22 (phonetic), mother of three. I'm a 23 hairstylist. My -- I have a

16-year-old, 13-year-old, and a

3-year-old.

24

25

2.0

My 13-year-old -- I moved here like seven years ago. My 13-year-old started Success Academy when he just -- when we just moved here. He went there for five years.

A day -- I'm going to cut it short.

I had to pull him from Success Academy
because the principal locked him out
because he was five minutes late. I
changed schools. He went to PS 116 down
the block.

His second day, he was bullied. I went to the school. I spoke to the Parent Coordinator. There was no principal at the time. It was an Assistant Principal and she wasn't on the compound at the time when I went there.

So, I spoke to the Parent

Coordinator. She said, this -- it's two kids. They have been troubled in the school from ever since -- they had calmed down, but now they are on the rise again.

So, apparently, my son -- because he

2.0

just started, his second day, he was bullied -- faced a lot of physical fight.

On his fourth day, he went back to school. He called me -- cause I give him a phone -- he called me. He said, "Mommy, they did it again". I went there. On my way to go in there, I said, "Okay. I'm going to wait on you outside and I'll go around to see if I could speak to someone from inside again".

On my way out -- on their way out -- I saw them coming out, so I picked up my son. On my way going around, I saw that -- my son like, "Mommy, there he is. He's following me". So, I went up to him and I said, "What is it with you and my son? Is your mom coming to school -- coming to pick you up cause I would like to speak to your mom".

He was like, "Oh, no, my mom don't want to speak to you. My mom -- don't speak to me".

Story short, on my way going around,

2.0

I saw the mom coming up. So, that was one of them. She came to me. She asked me what happened. I was explaining to her. While we there talking, I see the other kid's mom coming. She just came up in my face. I was on the school premises -- came up in my face. "What are you going to do with my kid? What are you going to" -- and she punched me and it started a fight.

My three-year-old was there. At the time, he was two. He started crying.

We all started crying and the reason I'm like this now is because nothing came from it. I called the police. I made the reports. They call me. I explain what happened. They speak to the Coordinator. The Coordinator said, "You got to lock up that lady cause this has been going on for too long".

She spoke to the police. She gave them everything they needed. The principal called me, so they said they're going to have to do -- what you call it -- a transfer -- emergency

2.0

transfer for my son. They can't do anything about the kid. They can't transfer him from the kid -- from the school or anything. It's my kid that has to get transferred.

So, they transfer my son now to -PS 208. Now -- he had been taking the
school bus then. Now, he's going into
7th grade and now he's going to be
dropped off the school bus. He's like,
"Mommy, what if I'm going on the school
bus and I see this kid again. What am I
going to do".

So, you know, he's worried and he's frustrated going to school publicly now because the school bus no longer going to take him to school. So -- I don't know.

That young lady never get arrested.

Nothing came from it, so I'm wondering

if there's any help in this room that

can assist me in moving forward, so that

my son can feel safe going to school.

CHAIR RICE: Ms. Vassel -- Ms. Vassel, thank you for sharing that with

us and I want you to know -- I know that there's people that are here in this room that are going to be -- work hard in order to provide you with the help and support in order to deal with your son.

Okay. Thank you.

2.0

MR. ABBADY: Yeah, thank you. Good evening. My name is Amir with Council Member Nantasha Williams' office. The Council Member asked me to give regards in her absence.

I do want to acknowledge the very difficult job the CCRB does in helping support our law enforcement. We do need someone to hold them accountable and you guys have a tremendous responsibility on your shoulders and you do a great job of executing that responsibility.

The City Council is working
diligently to get you the resources and
the jurisdiction you need to do even
more. I want us all to just take a
moment to acknowledge the fact that if
you throw a stone outside of New York

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 City and find any jurisdiction anywhere, 2 the opportunity to get justice from an 3 independent body just doesn't exist. Nassau County, Westchester County --4 5 this is a unique organization that sets an example and I just want to compliment 6 7 them on that example. I also want to particularly 8 9 highlight Jahi Rose, the Director of Community Outreach, who has done a 10 tremendous job pulling community members 11 12 in, in this conversation. There's always more to be done, but 13 14 I just wanted to acknowledge the great work he's done so far and all the great 15 16 work you guys have done as well on 17 behalf of the Council Member. 18 Thank you. CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much for 19 2.0 your comment. 21 MS. KELLER: My name is Michelle 22 Keller (phonetic. I'm the Vice -- 1st 23

MS. RELLER: My name is Michelle

Keller (phonetic. I'm the Vice -- 1st

Vice President of Community Board 12 and
as the Chair said, I am a retired

Detective, Second Grade, and I did 21

24

25

2.0

years and it's nice to see that you are out here to listen to the public.

But I'm a little disturbed because I would have liked to hear your statistics as to how many police officers have been reprimanded, whether they lost time or what have you.

I, myself, one time was in a situation with a police officer. I was on duty. It was a highway cop and he pulled us over. We were just finishing a resident check because I worked in Applicant Processing Division and we went to -- I went to show him in my utility belt, I'm on the job.

My partner had his badge out and the highway officer went to pull his gun and I filed a complaint with CCRB and nothing came. Now, the community doesn't need your sympathy. It's -- you have to be empathetic and if you've never experienced anything and -- how could you really understand what the community is going through.

Now, to the young man from Camp Life

2.0

(sic) wanting to know about how you can get into the Police Department -- cause a lot of stuff came today and it was good -- but it wasn't really directed towards CCRB.

A lot of times, they're protected -the police officers -- whether it's
through the COs or higher up, and people
don't have that vote of confidence.

And as far as people coming on the job, you don't have to have ever worked as long as you don't have any real blemishes. You could have been a mother living in a housing development, never worked a day in your life, and apply, and as long as there's nothing bad in your background, you can become a police officer.

Now, I'm a little befuddled about how policing is going on today because when I was on patrol, you saw police officers. You saw them in their cars -- sector cars. Now, they come, they can't do anything.

Whenever you ask them -- if you call

2.0

them about a landlord/tenant, there's nothing they can do. Anything, nothing they can do. Talking about -- what's that, when you hang on the corner -- loitering. There ain't nothing you can do unless someone is -- some kind of physical interaction.

Now, I hope that this era, that you all are a lot more powerful to do things to police officers who are bad.

I came through 113. I've worked in 113, 105, 106, 103 -- all of that when they were -- the 103 was bad. The 113 was becoming bad, trying to follow the 77th Precinct.

So, now I hope -- you know, Ms.

Esmeralda. You were there for a long time. A lot of you don't know her. We got four of you esquires on the Board, hopefully that it will be more powerful because you are elected by -- you're appointed by mayors and whomever -- elected officials.

We need more people coming out of the community, like AU. We need other

1 people coming out, especially --2 particularly people like myself who 3 worked in the Department -- Michelle Mosley, Carlene Thorbs -- but we can't 4 5 get on this Board. So, I don't know really how 6 7 effective you're going to be. I don't want nobody telling me, "Thank you for 8 9 the many years you put on in the street" and -- I don't need that. I need you to 10 show us statistically what's going on 11 12 and how these police officers -- bad police officers are being reprimanded. 13 14 If they have to be fired or suspended -- you go in there sometimes, 15 16 officers are sitting behind the desk 17 cause their investigation is going on for however long, you know. 18 19 So, I hope things get better with 2.0 the CCRB. Thank you. 21 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Thank you, Ms. 22 Keller. 23 Could I respond to her question -to her -- to some of the issues that she 24 25 raised?

2.0

First of all, I wanted to let you know that through legislation that recently passed with 5-A, we are able to have statistics on our -- on the CCRB website.

So, at any given point in time, you can go on and log-on and see all of the reports on the cases that have been brought before us, the recommendations that we made, the times that we made recommendations and the Police Commissioner agreed with it or did not agree with it, and the letter that they sent back saying why they did not concur with what we had given to them.

So, that is now all public information and it has not always been public information. So, just so you know, that is on the CCRB website and you can access it.

(Indiscernible.)

CHAIR RICE: Sure. I just wanted to let you know that it was available and then I'm going to turn it over to -- to Jon to speak more specifically about

```
1
             that -- and if there are people that are
 2
             interested in serving on this Board, you
 3
             can speak to your -- either your City
             Council Member and/or you can -- if you
 4
 5
             have a connection with the Mayor
 6
             directly.
 7
                 We're all appointed to these
 8
             positions and so if you're interested in
 9
                 (Indiscernible.)
10
                 CHAIR RICE: Yeah, so --
11
12
                 (Indiscernible.)
                 CHAIR RICE: Sure -- sure. And part
13
14
             of the reason why we're here is kind of
15
             to dispel some of the things that may be
16
             prevailing and also to tell you those
17
             things that have evolved.
18
                 So, the CCRB that you all -- that
19
             you interacted with when you were in the
2.0
             Police Department is different than the
21
             one that's here now -- right.
22
                 (Indiscernible.)
23
                 CHAIR RICE: Right -- exactly,
24
             exactly.
25
                 But thank you for your comments.
                                                     I
```

do appreciate them, yes.

2.0

MS. KELLER: Question:

Is it still -- are you still able to go online and see -- like, say, Officer

Joe Schmo -- we can check and see how many times he was in front of the CCRB and how many times it was substantiated? You can just look up an officer and find out?

MR. DARCHE: So, if you go to our website, you can not only see the statistics for the Agency for the year and past years, but you can also look up individual officers. You can also look up by command.

So, if you wanted to see the officers in your local precinct and see how their CCRB history is, you could do that.

In 2023, so far, the CCRB has substantiated at least one allegation against 525 members of service. That is roughly on pace with 2022, in which the Board substantiated allegations of misconduct against 1,027 police

1 officers. 2 There is a delay in between when the 3 Board recommends discipline and when the Police Department actually imposes 4 5 discipline. So, I can -- when I'm giving you the statistics for 6 7 discipline, it is not for the people who 8 were disciplined -- where the Board 9 recommended discipline in this year because those cases are still in front of 10 the Police Commissioner. 11 12 For the cases that were not charges 13 cases -- so, either the Board 14 recommended a command discipline or 15 training -- the Police Department 16 concurred with -- the Police Department 17 issued discipline 46 percent of the 18 time. 19 For charges cases, the Police 2.0 Department concurred with our recommendation 61 percent of the time. 21 CHAIR RICE: It's a good 2.2 23 recommendation. 24 MS. SIMMONS: May I? 25 CHAIR RICE: Mm-hmm.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

MS. SIMMONS: We have been advocating to have the final say -final disciplinary authority for this Board, rather than having all the investigations, all the work, all the charges go to the Police Department and then come back with most of the time 50/50 or less of our recommendations for discipline be adhered to. That's the way it stands right now. We would like your support to all your elected officials -- State included, but particularly City -- to have the CCRB be the final arbiter of discipline against police officers. There's going to be a big pushback, you know, for that, and some people like it exactly the way it is. So, you make your complaints and 50 percent of the time -- and those are the cases that we

(Indiscernible.)

found something happened.

MS. SIMMONS: No, this is -- this is higher than the Community Board -- thank God for the Community Board.

```
1
                 City Council, the Mayor, the
             Assembly, the Governor -- it's a big
 2
 3
             pushback against this. They like it the
             way it is.
 4
 5
                 (Indiscernible.)
                 MS. SIMMONS: Too long.
 6
 7
                 (Indiscernible.)
 8
                 MS. SIMMONS: This is what's
 9
             important -- now, I'm on a soapbox.
                 Your coming out is what's important.
10
             The folks up here, we get to do the
11
12
             cases. We get to listen to the tapes of
13
             the computer video -- not pleasant by
14
             the way -- but you're coming out and the
15
             community getting organized is more
16
             important than what we do. When you get
17
             organized, this will change.
18
                 CHAIR RICE: And with that said, is
19
             there anyone else in the room who wanted
2.0
             t.o --
21
                 (No response.)
22
                 CHAIR RICE: No -- okay.
23
                 Do we have any more comment from the
24
             community?
25
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: One more comment.
```

```
1
                 CHAIR RICE: One more comment.
 2
                 (Indiscernible.)
 3
                 MR HOGAN: Bilal What did you say?
                 MR. KARRIEM: You have the same
 4
             power as the Justice Center --
 5
                 MR. KARRIEM: They do the investigation --
 6
 7
                 MR. KARRIEM: -- when they do the
 8
                 investigations.
 9
                 MR. KARRIEM: Pretty much the
10
                 Justice Center --
11
                 (Indiscernible.)
12
                 MR. DARCHE: The mic.
13
                 MR. KARRIEM: Sorry. Pretty much the
14
                 Justice Center, they investigate
15
16
             allegations when there is abuse, like,
17
             in group homes or young people with
             mental health.
18
19
                 I think -- yeah, so I think they
             should look at that model and consider
2.0
21
             giving you all the same power.
2.2
                 (Indiscernible.)
23
                 MR. KARRIEM: Say it again. MS.
24
                 SIMMONS:
                            That's because there
25
             are social workers -- there are social
```

1 workers involved. There are group home workers involved, not NYPD officers. 2 That's the difference. 3 I agree with you completely -- I 4 5 agree with you. MR. KARRIEM: They don't really come 6 7 to them for advice and so forth. They do their own private investigation, then 8 9 they make a decision -- yeah. 10 MS. SIMMONS: I agree --MR. KARRIEM: I think, for future 11 12 reference, they should pretty much see that structure, and monitor it, and give 13 14 you all that same power. Thank you. 15 CHAIR RICE: Ms. Ketchum, did you 16 have another comment? 17 MS. KETCHUM: Yes, I'd just like to 18 put on the record a request for quarterly 19 meetings in each borough in Queens. 2.0 know you -- monthly might be too much, 21 but quarterly or at least biyearly. 22 They said you're only going to come 23 to Queens once a year. 24 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIR RICE: We go to all five boroughs and then we also have meetings in the -- in our office downtown in downtown Manhattan. MS. KETCHUM: Queens -- you know Oueens is so far from all the other boroughs, especially Southeast Queens is at the farthest tip, almost Long Island. So, I'm putting in an on the record request for at least quarterly meetings. I think that's doable -- or even a small committee, not the whole group -- but maybe, like, three or four so that we can invite people on a regular basis. CHAIR RICE: Ms. Ketchum, your request is -- your request is received

CHAIR RICE: Ms. Ketchum, your request is -- your request is received and if you can step to the mic as well, just because there's people who are listening online and they can't necessarily hear you if you speak in the auditorium.

MS. LAWRENCE: In regards to her statement about having you come out quarterly, but there are opportunities for one -- members of the Board to come

to some of our community meetings.

2.0

It doesn't have to be the whole

Board, but maybe when one of you could

come, say, to a Civic Association

meeting to represent the organization or

come to some of the clubs in the

community to represent -- to tell us -
to make -- so we can continue to be

informed about your activities and what

you do.

The other thing I wanted to comment on, as far as police officers and their offenses against the citizen, they was trying to block that -- that the public will not be able to access their record -- their disciplinary record.

Now, is that going forward or -- you won the case because I know when the member mentioned that, it appears that he was unaware that we now can go online, and go on your website, and get the history of the person's disciplinary actions.

Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: Absolutely.

```
1
                 Thank you, Ms. Lawrence.
 2
                 Do we have any other comments from
 3
             the community?
 4
                 (No response.)
                 CHAIR RICE: All right. Thank you
 5
             so much.
 6
 7
                 Do we have any old business to come
 8
             before the Board?
 9
                 (No response.)
                 CHAIR RICE: Any old business?
10
                 MR. DARCHE: Is there an online --
11
12
             there's an online -- online speaker.
13
                 CHAIR RICE: Yojaira, Do we have
14
             somebody online?
15
                 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes.
16
                 First, we'll be hearing from Judy
17
             Ortiz.
18
                 MS. ORTIZ: Yes, can you hear me?
19
                 MR. DARCHE: Yes, ma'am.
2.0
                 MS. ORTIZ: This is about when
21
             people file FOIA requests -- Freedom of
22
             Information Law. A lot of people have
23
             said to me that sometimes when they
24
             filed it, they will get a runaround
25
             because it takes months and by the time
```

2.0

that came back, a lot of the data or
things were being missing, like the
videos are real camera will be broken or
something.

Have you heard about complaints
about that?

CHAIR RICE: Let me make sure that
we heard your comment.

You were talking about people filing
a complaint, but before they can file
the complaint, the -- there are problems
with the video or the video is missing.

Did I hear you correctly?

MS. ORTIZ: Yes -- FOIA requests -- when they file a FOIA request, it looks like police don't like that and a couple of people mentioned about it, FOIA requests, but -- Freedom of Information Law.

So, when -- there was one guy that said it took six months until -- he kept going back and forth because you have to keep asking what's going on with that and I think that's a lot of problem -- because I know Jahi a long time when he

```
1
             was in the SEEK Program in York College.
                 Yeah -- and I'm -- he's the one that
 2
 3
             told me about this thing today -- hello.
 4
             Can you hear me?
                 MS. SIMMONS: I'm one of the Board
 5
             Members. I'm just trying to understand
 6
 7
             your question.
 8
                 Are you saying that -- that New
 9
             Yorkers are going to try to get FOIL --
             information by FOIL so they can file a
10
             complaint with CCRB?
11
12
                 MS. ORTIZ: Yeah, with the --
13
             against the Police Department.
                 MS. SIMMONS: You should file a
14
15
             complaint with us --
16
                 CHAIR RICE: Yeah.
17
                 MS. SIMMONS: -- and then we'll do
18
             the investigation.
19
                 MS. ORTIZ: Okay.
2.0
                 MS. SIMMONS: It's not necessary for
21
             the citizen to come to the CCRB with all
             the information. We can get that easier
22
23
             than you can.
24
                 MS. ORTIZ: And, also, I know your
25
             -- New York communities will change.
```

1	know the (indiscernible) believe from
2	(discernible) have changed.
3	MS. SIMMONS: I don't understand
4	what she's saying.
5	MR. DARCHE: Ma'am, you don't You
6	don't need to know anyone. You just
7	need to file a complaint with us and
8	then we do the investigation.
9	MS. ORTIZ: Yeah. So, CCRB is what
10	people have to go to so they can do it.
11	MR. DARCHE: Yes, ma'am.
12	MS. ORTIZ: Okay. Thank you.
13	CHAIR RICE: Okay all right.
14	Thank you.
15	MS. ORTIZ: You're welcome.
16	CHAIR RICE: Yojaira is telling me
17	that the next person on the line is
18	Tanya Cruz.
19	Ms. Cruz.
20	MS. CRUZ: Thank you for coming to
21	Southeast Queens and this has been very
22	robust.
23	I currently serve on the Queens
24	Traffic Safety Board as well as
25	Community Board 13. I also am a member

2.0

of the Motorcycle Advisory Council led by DOT and NYPD for over eight years. I am also a motorcycle rider for over 35 years.

So, tonight I just wanted to get -I wanted to get an idea from the CCRB
regarding some things that we are seeing
now with the proliferation of
two-wheeled vehicles.

So, back on June of 26th of 2021, we -- Chief Royster actually did an intimate motorcycle engagement for key police officers, and we conducted it here in Southeast Queens, and we saw that we had a person from the Transportation Bureau. We also had somebody from Queens South. We had three of the following -- the 103, 105, 113 -- and we also had a police officer that demanded to come from Brooklyn Precinct 72.

So, my question and statement has more to do with your second about how major police can do better community relations.

2.0

Back on May 24th -- I'm not sure if you guys have seen the viral where a police officer was trying to, I guess, get them -- the electric moped off of a particular highway, which is not allowed -- but what he did was really put this operator in danger, and every time he was cutting him off, it's viewed in Transportation Safety and Vehicle -- and the VTLs of New York State that that was attempted murder. So, I did personally reach out to the Mayor and back to my Transportation Bureau.

So, what we see now is -- Eric did get back in touch with me within four hours. I appreciated it -- and the Inspector at Transportation Bureau actually got back to me in two hours.

Now, I want everybody to know, I reached out to these two individuals at 2 in the morning, so we're saying 5:30 NYPD came in. At 7 o'clock, the Mayor actually returned my texts.

So, what we look at is, there's a discipline -- there's going to be an

2.0

investigation of these individuals.

There's disciplinary. He has been suspended -- that I can understand.

I'll file the actual complaint with CCRB on behalf of the rider, but there's a bigger problem here. The problem is the police officers are not trained.

So, I go back to that 2021 when we brought a master trainer. We only have a few in the United States and we have one that resides in Dutchess County.

She came down. She explained -even talking about pulling over a
motorcycle or two-wheel -- or the
capabilities that people think that
these instruments have and the skill
level is, like, close to zero.

The fatalities are up on motorcycles and now I heard somebody talk about the proliferation of ATVs and dirt bikes.

She should be glad to know that your

Mayor actually spoke out on it at Hot 97 just yesterday saying, "We need to get a park. We need to put people that want to speed in a park to get -- get it out

1 their system". 2 So, that's a movement -- after 3 knowing him 30 years, to actually see him come and say that, we're moving 4 5 where we need to move. However, the police officers are not trained to deal 6 7 with these vehicles on the road. 8 So, are they gonna get a pass on the 9 CCRB level because they wasn't trained -- because the Patrol Book doesn't speak 10 to it -- or will they be held 11 12 accountable for the basic VTL laws, 13 which is attempted murder? 14 Just asking because I do like that 15 mediation thing because I could probably 16 train these officers, but that's my 17 statement. Any response? MR. DARCHE: It's unclear to me 18 19 whether or not the CCRB has an 2.0 investigation here because we are not 21 part of the Police Department. MS. CRUZ: I know you don't. 2.2 23 MR. DARCHE: If the -- either the 24 operator of the two-wheeled vehicle had 25 filed a complaint with us, or anyone

1 else who viewed the video filed a 2 complaint with us, then we would pursue 3 a separate investigation from the NYPD. 4 MS. CRUZ: Right. And so you guys 5 don't take --MR. DARCHE: The NYPD has already 6 7 conducted an investigation and has suspended the officer that you're 8 9 referring to pending the outcome of 10 their investigation --MS. CRUZ: Correct. 11 12 MR. DARCHE: -- but that is separate from a CCRB investigation and if you 13 either have filed or would like to file 14 a complaint with the CCRB, we can -- we 15 16 would look at it, see if it was within 17 our jurisdiction, and if it is, 18 investigate the matter. 19 MS. CRUZ: Okay. But do you guys 2.0 also follow the VTLs of New York State? 21 MR. DARCHE: We look at the Patrol 22 Guide, and we look at the laws of New 23 York State, and the Constitution of the 24 United States and New York State when 25 determining whether a member of service

```
acted appropriately.
 1
 2
                 MS. CRUZ: Right. Are you guys also
             -- when we talk about mediation -- have
 3
             the capabilities of understanding that
 4
 5
             some police officers are bad, as you
             heard earlier, but some police officers
 6
 7
             just lack training and they're operating
             out of fear or anger -- road rage.
 8
 9
                 CHAIR RICE: Thank you very much for
10
             your comment, Ms. Cruz. We appreciate
             it -- and thank you to our Executive
11
12
             Director for his response.
                 I just wanted to double-check again
13
14
             to make sure that we do not have any
             more comments from anyone here in the
15
16
             room and/or online before we move on
17
             with the meeting.
18
                 (No response.)
19
                 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing none, do
2.0
             we have any old business to come before
21
             the Board?
22
                 (No response.)
23
                 CHAIR RICE: Do we have any new
24
             business to come before the Board?
25
                 (No response.)
```

```
1
                 CHAIR RICE: Hearing none, I'm going
             to move now that we break into executive
 2
 3
             session and the agenda for the Executive
             Session is the Board will receive an
 4
             update from the General Counsel on
 5
             litigation and the Executive Director
 6
 7
             will discuss pending personnel issues
             and discuss Board Member training.
 8
 9
                 I'd like to call this meeting to a
10
             close. Do I have a second -- I mean, do
11
             I have a motion?
12
                 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Motion.
13
                 CHAIR RICE: Do I have a second?
                 MS. SIMMONS: Second.
14
15
                 CHAIR RICE: So moved.
                                          The July
16
             meeting of the CCRB is concluded.
                                                 Thank
17
             you.
18
                 (Time noted: 8:38 p.m.)
19
2.0
21
22
23
24
25
```

1 2 CERTIFICATION 3 I, JULIA M. SPEROS, a Notary Public 4 for and within the State of New York, do 5 hereby certify: 6 7 That the witness whose testimony as 8 herein set forth, was duly sworn by me; 9 and that the within transcript is a true record of the testimony given by said 10 11 witness. 12 I further certify that I am not 13 related to any of the parties to this 14 action by blood or marriage, and that I 15 am in no way interested in the outcome 16 of this matter. 17 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto 18 set my hand this 12th day of July, 2023. 19 2.0 21 22 23 24 25