

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE
TRIALS AND HEARINGS

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR
CITYWIDE EVENT COORDINATION AND MANAGEMENT

Public Hearing regarding:

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS FOR STREET FESTIVALS

DATE: OCTOBER 13, 2016

ADDRESS: 100 CHURCH STREET
12TH FLOOR
HEARING ROOM A

APPEARANCES:

MICHAEL CAREY
 DAWN TOLSON
 MS. ASHLEY

<u>SPEAKER NAME, ORGANIZATION</u>	<u>PAGE NUMBER</u>
TOM TOMPKINS, TIME SQUARE	5
PHIL STAMM, HYATT	7
NANCY SHERAN, MURRAY HILL NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION	8
MARGARET SEGAN, MCBURNEY YMCA	10
WALLY RUBIN, COMMUNITY BOARD FIVE	11
FATIYA LEWTON, CB7	13
SHERRILL KAZAN, FRIENDS OF DAG HAMMARSKJOLD PLAZA	15
JEWEL DOI, VENDOR	19
DEADRA BIALO- PADIN, VENDOR	21
JUDITH SCHNEIDER, COMMUNITY BOARD EIGHT	23
BARRY SCHNEIDER, NONE	25
THEODORE RENZ, MYRTLE AVENUE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT	26
ANDREW ALBERT, W. MANHATTAN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE	29
TODD BERMAN, CLEARVIEW FESTIVAL PRODUCTIONS & POP UP NY	32
CYNTHIA MAURER, VISITING NEIGHBORS	35
MARIA DIAZ, GREENWICH VILLAGE CHELSEA CHAMBER OF COMMERCE	37
MIRIELLE MOOR, VENDOR	38
STEVE GOULD, CHELSEA VISITING NEIGHBORS	40
RICK RODRIGUEZ, NONE	42
SHAWN CAMPBELL, COMMUNITY BOARD 14	44
JOHN SHARP, NYS DC, COMMUNITY BOARD 4	46
NORMAN SIEGEL, CIVIL RIGHTS ATTORNEY	48
MARYANN ABDUL, ASSEMBLY MEMBER DEBORAH GLICK	52
NOAH PFEFFERBLIT, CB1	55
ANN TOBACK, WORKMAN CIRCLE	58
PAUL SCHMIEGE, ST. LUKE'S CHURCH	60
DIANA TUREK, 114TH CIVIC OPT IN	62
JOE GIOVANNI, MARDI GRAS PRODUCTIONS	64
GALE BREWER, MANHATTAN BOROUGH PRESIDENT	67
ARTHUR TISI, MARDI GRAS PRODUCTIONS	74
RAYMOND CLINE, BAMRA	76
NORMAN JONES, DANIEL JONES	78
MARIE TORNIALI, STEINWAY STRESS BID	80
MR. NEIL, UNKNOWN	82
MR. TISI, MARDI GRAS PRODUCTIONS	83
DORI LAMO, VENDOR	84
FRED ARCARO, MANHATTAN EAST COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION	86

HABIB VANI, VENDOR	89
BARBARA GERBER-KRASNA, OR OLAM EAST 55TH STREET	90
JUN NA, VENDOR	93
SUSAN DEMIHAND, VENDOR	94
GLORIA MOLONEY, DUTCH KILLS CIVIC ASSOCIATION	95
DENNIS KAWAS, SAMARITAN DAYTOP VILLAGE	96
JOE DALCHAND, VENDOR	98
SUNEAL JAN, VENDOR	102
MICHELLE WINFIELD, SAMUEL J. TILDEN DEMOCRATIC CLUB	104
JENNIFER HERLEIN, FRENCH INSTITUTE ALLIANCE FRANÇOISE	106
JOHN MUDD, MIDTOWN COMMUNITY COUNCIL	108
BILL BORECK, UNION SQUARE COMM. COALITION	110
ARTHUR PICCOLO, BOWLING GREEN ASSOCIATION	113
ROBERT ASHE, CLEARVIEW PRODUCTIONS	116
LESLIE BROWN, FOREST HILLS CHAMBER OF COMMERCE	119
KENYA CAGLE, ICE	123
BRIAN MCLAUGHLIN, CORE	125
WILLIAM RITTER, VENDOR	127
MELISSA CHAPMAN, BROOKLYN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE	129
KATHY JOLOWICZ, 16 BLOCK EAST 83RD, 84TH BLOCK ASSOCIATION	130
KAYANI FACEY, KREATIVITY KUSTOM	133
GEORGE SMITH, STORE OWNER	136
ROBERT AARONSON, W. 102ND & 103RD ST. BLOCK ASSOCIATION	139
JOHN KHAN, VENDOR	142
VICTOR TUV, VENDOR	144
GERRI BRESLER, VENDOR	146
BETTY COONEY, GRAHAM AVENUE BID	147
ARTINEH HAVAN, GRAND STREET BID	150
JESSICA WALKER, MANHATTAN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE	154
LILI FABLE, 9TH AVE. ASSOCIATION	157
MARY D'ELLA, 9TH AVE. ASSOCIATION	158
GARY TOMEI, W. 13TH ST., 100 BLOCK ASSOCIATION	159
ED WALTERS, VILLAGE CROSSTOWN TROLLEY COALITION	161
STEVE GRADMAN, PRIDE DEMOCRATS	163
MAUREEN REMACLE, SIXTH PRECINCT COMMUNITY COUNCIL	165
NATHAN JACOBS, VENDOR	167
RANDY MARTINS, BRAZILIAN AMERICAN CENTER	169
ROSEMARY HILL, NONE	170

1 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

2 MR. MICHAEL CAREY: Good morning, everyone.
3 We'll get this hearing started. I know there's a lot
4 of people still trying to get in. So, we'll let as
5 many folks as possible get into the room to be part of
6 today's testimony. This is the hearing on the
7 proposed rules for the street festival. I know, like
8 I said a lot of people had signed up previously, and
9 there's a lot of people here today, which is great.
10 We like, sort of hear folk's opinions and thoughts on
11 the proposed rules. And as many of you know, you have
12 the option as well to submit it in writing. So, I
13 will just say whether you submit in writing or you're
14 here talking it's of equal value to us. And you have
15 until next week to submit it in writing as well.

16 So, I am, quick in direction, I am Michael
17 Carey, Executive Director City Wide Events. I have
18 Dawn Tolson here with me, the Director of SAPO who
19 will be doing time checks for everyone. Folks have
20 three minutes to testify. And again, this is a rules
21 hearing, it's not a press conference. It is not a
22 counsel hearing. So, it is three minutes of you
23 giving your testimony here today.

24 And we will begin. Ms. Ashley will call you
25 up. Please come up front. Sit down at this lovely

1 ch-, it's on. Is it on? And you'll come up for three
2 minutes, give your testimony and then you're free --
3 obviously feel free to stay and to listen to everyone,
4 but if you choose to leave, you choose to leave as
5 well. We will be posting the entire transcript along
6 with all the testimony once we get the transcript
7 together. With that, let us begin, Ms. Ashley call
8 the first person up.

9 MS. ASHLEY: Yep. So, Tim Thompkins. If I
10 can have you come. Come and move up.

11 MR. TIM THOMPCKINS: So, three minutes -- is
12 everything.

13 MR. CAREY: Go ahead.

14 MR. THOMPCKINS: So, thank you. I just want
15 to start off by thanking the de Blasio Administration
16 for putting forth rules of trying reform what is a
17 very complex issue and very difficult. We feel that
18 two principals should guide the administration in
19 fashioning these rules. One is that every
20 neighborhood is different. That their one size fits
21 all doesn't work. Maybe neighborhoods and communities
22 want street fairs. That's wonderful. We think that's
23 a good thing.

24 The main thing is the second principal that
25 objective data about vehicular and traffic congestion

1 should guide how fairs are distributed by
2 neighborhood. The reason this is relevant for Time
3 Square is because Time Square is already extremely
4 dense and congested in terms of traffic. And unlike
5 business districts in Manhattan, Time Square is much
6 busier on weekends not slower. For instance, Saturday
7 two matinees, we also have 20 percent of the city's
8 hotel rooms. Most of those guests arrive by car.
9 About 40 percent of the people who come to Broadway
10 shows on weekends, a much higher percentage than usual
11 come by car. And we have about 70,000 entertainment
12 seats related to destinations. And so as a result of
13 all this, we're much -- even without street fairs,
14 we're much more densely packed. And yet, if one looks
15 at the distribution of street fairs, Time Square which
16 represents .1 percent of the city's geographic area,
17 has ten percent of all street fairs.

18 So, that community board five for instance
19 has 30 percent of all Manhattan street fairs, and Time
20 Square which is only 11 percent of community board
21 five, has 51 percent of all the street fairs in
22 community board five. And the net result of this is
23 that, that the, the many, many, many jobs that are
24 reliant on Broadway and hotel, literally \$350,000 job-
25 , 350,000 jobs related to the economy that's driven by

1 people who come to visit hotels and theaters is
2 threatened over time by the stranglehold that happens
3 to traffic.

4 So, we have some specific proposals which
5 we'll submit for how to modify the rules. We
6 understand the notion that it's -- the 50 percent
7 requirement may be heavy for some folks. So, there
8 may some other ways to acknowledge the difference
9 between a truly local street fair, and one that isn't
10 by having community review and weigh in. We also
11 think it's important to close some loop holes. But
12 the main thing is street fairs, we understand, they're
13 part of the life of the City, but how they're
14 distributed geographically we bear an undue burden,
15 and we're already much, much more busy on weekends
16 relative to other places. Thank you very much.

17 MR. CAREY: Thanks, Tim. Ashley?

18 MS. ASHLEY: Great. Can I have Phil Stamm
19 come to the front?

20 MR. PHIL STAMM: Thank you. Good morning.

21 MR. CAREY: Good morning.

22 MR. STAMM: My name is Phil Stamm. I'm the
23 General Manager of the Hyatt, Time Square on 45th
24 between Sixth and Seventh. I don't want to repeat the
25 accurate data and information that Tim and the Time

1 Square Alliance have already provided, but just wanted
2 to make it granular for one business in the district
3 with 300 plus employees and thousands of guests that
4 we're trying to accommodate every day. And just make
5 it real. It is a huge bottle neck that is created,
6 difficult for our associates to gain the living that
7 they're used to on a regular basis. And a challenge
8 for our travelers that are coming in on a regular day.

9 So, I'd be, certainly welcome to receive any
10 questions or anything I can give to the Commission,
11 but I thank you for taking the time to consider what
12 is very impactful on a pretty regular basis at this
13 point, particularly over the summer months. And thank
14 you for undertaking this difficult task. While we
15 appreciate the philanthropies and the vendors, we have
16 no beef. It is creating a, a ripple effect,
17 consequence that directly impacts our operation on a
18 day-to-day basis. So, thank you for your
19 consideration.

20 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. Nancy Sheran.

21 MS. NANCY SHERAN: Hello. Thank you for
22 this opportunity. I'm here on behalf of the Murray
23 Hill Neighborhood Association. Unfortunately, the
24 chair of our street fair committee, Thomas Horan could
25 not be here today. So, I'm reading his testimony for

1 him. By the way, Murray Hill Neighborhood Association
2 has been putting on street fairs for about 40 years.

3 As the person who has been primarily
4 responsible for trying to get local businesses to join
5 us at the Murray Hill Neighborhood Association Street
6 Fair over the last several years, I can you tell that
7 if a one-to-one ratio of local to out of town vendors
8 becomes New York street fair policy, it will have an
9 enormous detrimental effect on our fair. In fact, I
10 would go so far as to say that our street fair might
11 well cease to exist, since it would become cost
12 prohibitive. Our professional event manager would
13 still need to be paid for his services, but the total
14 revenue would be drastically reduced.

15 For years, I have tried to persuade local
16 restaurants and other businesses to join us, and have
17 a presence at our fair. I've stressed the advantages
18 which such a presence affords these local businesses.
19 That is almost free advertising, positive community
20 involvement, and attracting new customers who might
21 have been unaware of the vendor beforehand. As time
22 has passed, I have found it more and more difficult to
23 convince local area businesses to join us at our
24 street fair. I don't know why this is the case, but I
25 know it to be true. Our yearly street fair is a major

1 source of revenue for the association.

2 In my opinion, requiring as many local
3 merchants to attend New York City's street fairs as
4 non-local merchants would have an immediate and
5 severally detrimental impact on our fair. I believe
6 the same would be true for many, if not all,
7 neighborhood sponsored street fairs in New York City.
8 Respectfully submitted, Thomas Horan, Chairman of the
9 Street Fair Committee.

10 MR. CAREY: Thank you. Ashley.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. Can I have Margaret
12 Seyam [phonetic] from YMCA? Sorry if I mispronounce
13 your name. I cannot read it.

14 MS. MARGARET SEGAN: Hi, there. I'm
15 Margaret Segan from McBurney YMCA. I'm just here
16 today to speak on, on behalf of our executive
17 director, Jolaina Peltier, and say that we're in
18 support of not changing the rules and not having
19 owners' regulations on street fairs. We are a
20 community partner and it does benefit our annual --
21 like, sort of our annual campaign, and the money that
22 we're able to give back to children in the -- who
23 participate in our programs by letting the street
24 fairs exist is they are, not have all local vendors.
25 So, I just wanted to put out there, that community

1 members who do participate benefit from doing this
2 partnership with other vendors who aren't necessarily
3 local to our same block. But, but it still has a
4 positive impact on us and on the local people who come
5 and enjoy the fair. Thanks.

6 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

7 MS. ASHLEY: Wally. Wally Rubin.

8 MR. WALLY RUBIN: Thank you. Good morning,
9 I'm Wally Rubin, District Manager of Community Board
10 Five. Thank you for giving us this opportunity to
11 comment. For years, Community Board Five has been
12 calling for the rules to be revisited. There are
13 currently, approximately si-, 60 street fairs in our
14 district annually and infamously, no matter what the
15 neighborhood or the not-for-profit sponsor, they all
16 look virtually alike with their ubiquitous tube socks
17 and kebobs.

18 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 1: That's not true.

19 MR. RUBIN: This is because virtually all
20 the fe- festivals are in fact produced by two no-, for
21 profit entities with no rules for true community
22 engagement or participation. Wisely a few years ago,
23 CECM combined some festivals and shortened their
24 length. However, serious problems continue to exist.
25 There are still far too many street festivals in our

1 district. CB5 is, as you know, an extraordinary hub
2 for the close to 60 million tourists who visit our
3 city every year.

4 We're also the City's central business
5 district. On some of our avenues, sidewalks are so
6 con-, often congested that many New Yorkers feel the
7 need to walk in the street to get where they're going.
8 Particularly in the Time Square area rather than
9 vehicular traffic leveling off on the weekend, it can
10 actually increase. Therefore, we are extremely
11 gratified and relieved that CECM has proposed to
12 change the rules to allow only ten street fairs
13 annually per community board district.

14 We're equally pleased that CECM has proposed
15 that at least 50 percent of the participating vendors
16 at each street festival have a business or local
17 presence in that community district. It has long
18 since time that we put the neighborhood back into
19 these neighborhood street festivals.

20 CB5 would also like to suggest that CECM
21 seriously review the additional proposals being made
22 by our partners at the Time Square Alliance
23 particularly in a district as over burden as ours
24 often is. A data driven analysis of the impacts of
25 these street festivals on traffic and area businesses

1 would prove very useful in determining where it is and
2 isn't appropriate to locate these festivals.

3 Finally, I applaud Michael Carey of CECM and
4 Dawn Tolson of SAPO and our grateful to them and this
5 administration for listening to our concerns and
6 proposing these very welcome and important changes.
7 We look forward to having these proposals take effect
8 and hope that CECM will in addition adjust the
9 proposed rules to take into account data drive
10 analytics in further determining where street failure
11 -- street festivals are permitted. Thank you very
12 much for your time.

13 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: Boo.

14 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

15 MS. ASHLEY: Can I have Fatiya Lewton
16 [phonetic]?

17 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: That's what New York
18 is all about. To have fun.

19 MS. FATIYA LEWTON: Fatiya Lewton, Coalition
20 for Livable West Side. I'm really amused by the
21 statement of the previous speaker because it's board
22 seven -- board five that has really caused all of the
23 problems.

24 The new proposed street fair regulations
25 unfairly punish the street fairs held in Community

1 Board Seven. Community Board Seven set the gold
2 standard for street fairs more than 20 years ago. It
3 merged street fairs so that two, five and one C-3
4 organizations share a date. That cut in half the
5 number of street fairs held in CB-7. It required that
6 non-profits, elected officials, and charities be
7 provided space at no cost. It required that in
8 addition to the 20 percent given to N-, to New York
9 City, an additional 20 percent is donated to non-
10 profit organizations in CB7 that do have a street
11 fair. It offered reduced rates to businesses in CB7.

12 If proposed regulation where partner street
13 fair workers who will lose employment. That's about
14 3,000 jobs. These workers come from throughout the
15 City of New York. Most local crafts people do not
16 have a New York State sales tax certificate and a
17 consumer affairs permit. And state as they do the
18 fairs sporadically that they will not get the
19 necessary permits.

20 These proposed regulations do great harm to
21 non-profit organizations who depend on street fairs.
22 Instead the City should require that all street fairs,
23 including in CB7, follow the gold standard set by CB7
24 more than 20 years ago.

25 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

1 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

2 MS. ASHLEY: If I could just ask that people
3 refrain from clapping while someone's speaking 'cause
4 it does interfere with the recording and we want to be
5 able to hear everyone. And can I have Sherrill Kazan
6 next?

7 MS. SHERRILL KAZAN: Good morning. I, too,
8 wish to thank you for the opportunity to speak. I'm
9 Sherrill Kazan, president of the Friends of Dag
10 Hammarskjold Plaza, gateway to the United Nations, and
11 also the se-, most assaulted by -- as you know, we are
12 the preferred street of public assembly, which means
13 protest. So, on a daily basis, we are visited by the
14 world, both for grievances as well as enjoying the
15 environment. We're also overwhelmed by city tour
16 buses, other tour buses, it's out control. Therefore,
17 I'm going to read you the following that we wrote.

18 The Friends of Dag Hammarskjold Plaza
19 strongly oppose any legislation that would disrupt or
20 decrease the guaranteed income that we receive
21 annually as a not-profit sponsor of street fair
22 produced by Mardi Gras Productions. There was already
23 a moratorium on additional street fairs in Manhattan
24 when our organization and the promoter appealed to
25 City Hall and prevented a street fair on the grounds

1 that FDHP maintains the municipal park known as Dag
2 Hammarskjold Plaza.

3 In particular, the funds generated by the
4 street fair help offset the cost of cleaning the park
5 six fountains weekly by a maintenance contractor and
6 twice daily, litter removal by the dough fund, at a
7 combined cost of \$20,000 annually. The income
8 generated by the promoter amounts to 10,000 annually.

9 Already, we have felt the impact of
10 tampering with the street fair model. Initially, our
11 fair took place on Second Avenue, adjacent to the
12 park. Then it was moved to Third and combined with
13 our other not-profit sponsors requiring the promoter
14 to combine the income from several street fairs in
15 order to guarantee the income essential to our bottom
16 line.

17 Further, the proposed reduction in the
18 number of street fairs already in operation would mean
19 that some non-profits would be denied this crucial
20 source of income all together. To select some non-
21 profit for survival and reject others when all have a
22 mission to fulfill with the capricious and unjust.

23 In a neighborhood where there is no business
24 improvement district, to underwrite the cost of
25 maintaining a public land and give the City's

1 chronologically and adequate funding of park
2 maintenance, the income generated by the street fair
3 in its present form provides essential cleaning,
4 services from one of the city's most visible and
5 visited parks. Although the concept of showcasing
6 more visual art, artisanal food and craft merchandise
7 is ascetically appealing the street fair in its
8 current form does promote entrepreneurial enterprise
9 and more importantly it helps fulfill the mission of
10 many non-profit organizations which contribute good
11 works through New York City.

12 In conclusion, the Friends of Dag
13 Hammarckjold Plaza welcome more local vendors, along
14 with artisanal food, arts, and crafts, but we cannot
15 afford to change the equation which attracts
16 sufficient vendor participation and thus guarantees
17 our income as a street fair sponsor. We strongly
18 oppose proposed new rules demanding both a reduction
19 of events, ten maximum in each community board along
20 with a requirement to have 50 percent of the vendors
21 be local merchants --

22 MS. ASHLEY: Alright. Your time is up.

23 MS. DAWN TOLSON: Time.

24 MS. ASHLEY: You can submit your written
25 testimony if you like.

1 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

2 MS. ASHLEY: So, I do have one announcement
3 quickly. We cannot block the door because it is a
4 fire hazard. So, either you have to step into the
5 other room and wait until your time is called, or you
6 can step a little bit more alo-, along the wall. So,
7 we have people stand here. If you want you can come
8 and stand over here by this gentleman in back as well.

9 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

10 MS. ASHLEY: And then next, I will be
11 calling Jewel, Jewel Doi. You can stand right here.

12 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

13 MS. ASHLEY: There's some standing room over
14 here too.

15 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

16 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. So, I think that's about
17 it for the standing room. So, you can either go along
18 this side, but we do have to keep something clear so
19 that people can walk through. Thank you. Alright.
20 Jewel. You can go. Okay.

21 MS. JEWEL DOI: Okay.

22 MS. ASHLEY: Go.

23 MS. DOI: Hi. My name is Jewel Doi, and I
24 am a small business owner. I make my own Japanese
25 paper jewelry here in the City, and I'm a member of

1 Etsy New York. We're a group in the tristate area.
2 We, we all hand make all of our own items, and a lot
3 of us are participants in the street fairs. And they
4 have allowed us to grow our small businesses. Mo-
5 most of us can't afford brick and mortar, brick and
6 mortar stores. I'd like to say that I started my
7 business seven years ago making items on toilet paper
8 rolls, 'cause I couldn't afford anything else. And,
9 and because of the street fairs last year, I was able
10 to start doing this full time, and for that I'm very,
11 very grateful.

12 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

13 MS. DOI: And I'd like to say that I've met
14 some of the most hardworking talented people you could
15 ever meet at these street fairs. We're not just tube
16 sock and phone case vendors. We're hardworking
17 artisans, artists, cooks, and I think we represent the
18 City of New York incredibly well. I wish, I wish that
19 you could see me, like, be there for the conversations
20 that I have with all these tourists who are really
21 grateful for all of these fairs. Especially I'd like
22 to give a shot out to Pop Up New York, affiliated with
23 Clearview and Evan Berman, who's really, really done
24 an incredible amount of work to elevate the level of
25 the street fairs, to give exposure to artists and

1 artisans and I make sure that I write on all of my
2 items, handmade in New York City and the tourists are
3 very grateful that they can get that something that's
4 unique and handmade and unique to New York City.

5 This 50 percent rule will especially be, be
6 negative for me and my fellow artisans, for our
7 exposure and for our growth. And I would like to say
8 also before I started vending I was also a consumer
9 and I, I can say that I would not to like to walk down
10 one of these street fairs in my neighborhood and see
11 50 percent of what I see every day already. So, and
12 al-, as well, they will, they will cripple the street
13 fairs. We -- I think that everyone, all the
14 organizers here are aware of this.

15 But I -- regardless of the outcome, I would
16 like to thank the City of New York for letting me get
17 as far as I can with my business. I am very, very
18 grateful as are all of Etsy New York and everyone
19 who's sold at the street fair so far. So, thank you
20 so much.

21 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

22 MS. ASHLEY: And Deadra, Deadra Bialo, from
23 Bialo Padin Designs.

24 MS. DEADRA BIALO-PADIN: Good morning.

25 Along with Jewel, I'm also at Etsy seller. I'm a sole

1 proprietor of a business. I am a jeweler and a medal
2 smith. And as a sole proprietor starting out for the
3 past year and half, needless to say I can't afford a
4 store front. Consignments would take too much of my
5 money. In order to actually to build up my business,
6 street fairs have provided me with a significant
7 portion of my income. It gives me exposure, and it
8 also --

9 I live in Brooklyn. So, the proposed rules
10 would essentially preclude me from participating in
11 any events in Manhattan. The borough that has the
12 most significant number of foot traffic for tourist,
13 so my sales would drop significantly. And since I
14 live near Gowanus needless to say, most of the craft
15 people in the City don't live in Manhattan. They may
16 live in Gowanus, they may live in Bushwick.

17 Given my proximity to Gowanus and the effect
18 that the proposals would have on lowering the number
19 of street fairs, what that would mean for me is that I
20 would be competing with a large number of hand crafts
21 people in the Gowanus area for a limited number of
22 positions in my neighborhood, which by the way extends
23 far beyond my community board. So, what that means
24 for me is a significant loss of income as I am trying
25 to start up a business.

1 morning, Director Carey and associates. My name is
2 Judith Schneider. In Community Board Eight,
3 Manhattan, and I speak in opposition to the new rules
4 proposed by the Office of City Wide Event and
5 Management for the following reasons. The Mayor and
6 OCEM are not listening to the local community boards
7 with these proposed new rules for conducting street
8 festivals.

9 I believe street festivals are one of the
10 items that make the City attractive to the tourists
11 while they are here. It appears to me that the mayor
12 does not care about how important tourism is to the
13 City of New York. As these rules will clearly reduce
14 the number of street festivals. When I speak with the
15 people not from Manhattan, they tell me the street
16 festivals are one of the reasons they like coming to
17 the City. The rules will make it impossible to get
18 street vendors to sign up a month in advance instead
19 of a week in advance as they do now. As the weather
20 is a huge factor in their decision whether or not to
21 participate in the street fair. It will make it very
22 difficult for not-for-profits in our district to raise
23 the funds they have counted on for the past
24 years.

25 If, if you start with these new rules

1 requiring 50 percent of the vendors be from the
2 district in the coming year, you will do away all the
3 existing street fairs in our community district. This
4 rule should be implemented gradually to see how it
5 works. The community board should be limited to the
6 number of street festivals we have had in 2015 and
7 '16, thereby not increasing the number of new multi
8 block or single block street festivals in the various
9 districts.

10 They say there are three community boards
11 that are problematic, why penalize the rest of the
12 City? But from what I heard it's really the district
13 five, and we're a small neighborhood group. We prune
14 all the trees in our district in the East 60s. We do
15 things for the hospitals. We have a clothing drive
16 collect 6,000 pounds of clothing in one day for people
17 who can't afford -- all the not-for-profits in
18 community district eight have street fairs. If you're
19 not a not for profit you can't have it. It seems to
20 me you will be cutting into our funding and cut down
21 on the good work that we do to make our community a
22 community. So, please listen to some of these
23 comments you're hearing today, and not just district
24 five.

25 MS. ASHLEY: Barry Schneider.

1 MR. BARRY SCHNEIDER: Good morning. Thanks
2 for the opportunity to speak this morning. I have
3 three points to make. Your office did enough to
4 identify three community boards as a problem out of
5 59. Consider the following: if a patient presented
6 you with an infected finger, would you as a prudent
7 physician treat the infection or cut off the hand?
8 What's your doing with these rules is cutting off the
9 hand; you're not treating the problem. The rush to
10 judgment is unseemly and not worthy of the greatest
11 city in the world. Before promulgating draconian
12 rules, go back to your office, examine the facts,
13 gather the data, listen to the people hear this, this
14 morning, and come back with something that works for
15 the City of New York.

16 I'll say one more thing, as a former chair
17 of Community Board Eight in Manhattan, I'd like to
18 call your attention to the resolution that was passed
19 last month unanimously opposing the rules you've
20 promulgated and making suggestion point by point. So,
21 when you have a moment, please take a look at the
22 resolution. Thank you very much.

23 MS. ASHLEY: Theodore Renz. Okay. Theodore
24 Renz.

25 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

1 MR. THEODORE RENZ: Good morning. My name
2 is Theodore Renz, and I'm representing the Myrtle
3 Avenue Business Improvement District in Queens and the
4 Ridgewood [unintelligible] [10:37:23] Corporation.
5 Thank you for allowing us to respond to the proposed
6 new rules for street fairs.

7 Why we commend your agency in taking a fresh
8 look at street fairs, and in particular your
9 recommendation to end the moratorium on new fairs, we
10 have some concerns with a number of the new rules
11 governing the street events. They are as follows:
12 applicants will have to prove 50 percent of vendors of
13 the street fair in local presence in the community
14 board where it is happening.

15 By requiring 50 percent of any percentage of
16 vendors, who have a local business and a presence is
17 impractical. The rules as proposed could disqualify
18 most groups from holding their respective events.
19 Street fairs serve as economic catalysts for local
20 businesses, move up, startups, craft vendors and
21 others. We recommend that 50 percent of exhibitors
22 have a business or a local presence in the community
23 board the festival will take place, or -- and, or in
24 the City of New York. To foster local participation,
25 rules should require a certain number of exhibit or

1 spaces be provided at little or no costs to local
2 businesses, local artists, local residents selling
3 their handmade and non-commercial products as well as
4 to non-profits and local merchant associations. We
5 already do not charge non-profits, artists, and
6 community based organizations. They go for free. And
7 merchants we charge a nominal fee, because if we tell
8 them it's free, they probably won't set up.

9 Signing up 30 days prior to the event, this
10 is not practical or doable. Most vendors and
11 merchants wait until the last few days when they see
12 the weather forecast. Since there are no more rain
13 dates, you know, they're not going to sign up any time
14 before that time.

15 New street fair fee structure. Raised from
16 20 percent of total pay by vendors to 1,375 for the
17 first block and 705 for any subsequent blocks. S-, we
18 believe that we should have the right to when the
19 event is over to filing our final income summary and
20 have an option to pay the 20 percent to all rental
21 fees, pay by vendors who are based on a number of
22 blocks listed on the permit which is proposed new fee
23 structure under rule change. But I also ask you take
24 a look at those rule changes.

25 The cookie cutter approach. Myrtle Avenue

1 is an S-shaped, east west artery where two different
2 grid patterns come into it. And it's not like an easy
3 fit like Steinway Street that has a, a, a definitive
4 grid, so where would you -- you know, one side of my
5 street has two blocks coming in another side has none.
6 You know, so you have to look at that.

7 Again, you know, I want to thank you for
8 taking a fresh look at street fairs. And thank you
9 very much.

10 MS. ASHLEY: Do you want to submit it in
11 writing?

12 MR. RENZ: What?

13 MS. ASHLEY: Did you want to submit that?

14 MR. RENZ: Sure you can it.

15 MS. ASHLEY: Okay.

16 MR. RENZ: And I'm, and I understand you do
17 have -- you've submitted -- you've revised the final
18 remarks the, the 27th now?

19 MR. CAREY: Yeah.

20 MS. ASHLEY: Yes.

21 MR. RENZ: Okay.

22 MS. ASHLEY: The 27th.

23 MR. RENZ: Thank you.

24 MS. ASHLEY: Andrew Albert.

25 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

1 MR. ANDREW ALBERT: Good morning.

2 MR. CAREY: Good morning, sir.

3 MR. ALBERT: My name is Andrew Albert. I'm
4 the Executive Director of the West Manhattan Chamber
5 of Commerce, a non-profit organization dedicated to
6 helping businesses, institutions and residences of the
7 West Side of Manhattan.

8 It has been our privilege to organize and
9 run two street fairs on the upper west side showcasing
10 the merchants along both Columbus and Amsterdam
11 Avenues for 40 years. Not only do we showcase our
12 local merchants but we give tremendous discounts to
13 participating merchants, highlight them in our
14 newspaper ads and promote them in many other ways.

15 I'm sad to say that under the proposed rule
16 changes to street fairs, we would no longer be able to
17 hold both of our events, even though we've been doing
18 it for over 40 years. Under the new rules an
19 organization can only produce one event, even if it's
20 been successfully doing two events for a very long
21 time.

22 In addition, while no one tries harder than
23 we do to the point of going in and speaking to each
24 and every business along our two festival routes to
25 try to get them to participate, the possibility of

1 getting 50 percent of those businesses to participate
2 is literally zero. Some businesses just don't lend
3 themselves to the street fair model. When was the
4 last time you saw a dry cleaner in pe-, in a street
5 fair? Even 25 percent is impractical. And then what
6 if you sent out festival applications, spoke to the
7 businesses, got applications in and didn't reach the
8 50 percent threshold? You'd have to cancel the fair
9 and give everyone refunds after the sponsor sent money
10 to SAPO, the Fire Department, the Department of
11 Sanitation, paid for advertising, paid people to get
12 ready for the fair, etcetera. Do you believe anyone
13 would sign up for a fair under those conditions? Not
14 knowing if the fair would take place, is there even a
15 sponsor who start the process under these conditions?

16 Finally, the fees under the new proposals
17 are a huge deal breaker. I can't speak for others,
18 but our fairs give many free spaces to local non-
19 profit organizations. We give two whole blocks to the
20 much beloved green market at our Columbus Avenue with
21 the new fees we could not afford to do that. Many
22 non-profits count on these free spaces to showcase
23 their organizations and their good work. If they had
24 to pay for their space, they could not participate.

25 So, to sum up, these new regulations would

1 spell the end of street fairs. While they proclaim to
2 encourage new fairs, they actually doom all fairs.
3 They would put our organization out of business. The
4 West Manhattan Chamber depends on our two fairs to
5 help us through the year and allows us to represent
6 our local businesses and residents in many ways. They
7 allow us to give out grants to local non-profit
8 organizations as well as to help us fund out programs.
9 Without our two fairs each year, we could not afford
10 to do that.

11 Why didn't SAPO sit down with street fair
12 producers, talk to us about the perceived problems and
13 get our opinions on how to solve them? Why was there
14 absolutely no dialogue between SAPO and the people who
15 organize and produce street fairs? If there's a
16 problem in one part of Manhattan, why isn't that
17 particular problem addressed rather than penalizing
18 all the other parts of the City? Many of the vendors
19 at our fairs are hardworking immigrants who depend on
20 fairs for their livelihoods. They come from all parts
21 of the City. Why put them out of business? How is
22 that a good result? I sincerely hope you will rethink
23 these regulations, sit down with producers, and let's
24 talk about ways to solve these problems. Thank you.

25 MS. ASHLEY: Todd Bergan. Todd Berman.

1 MR. TODD BERMAN: Yes.

2 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you.

3 MR. BERMAN: Good morning. Todd Berman. I
4 am president of Clearview Festival Productions and Pop
5 Up New York. I'd like to start off by acknowledging
6 SAPO and OCEM for your initiatives and efforts to
7 enhance street festivals. I am in total support of
8 your proposal to lift the current moratorium. I am
9 true believer that by injecting competition and
10 opening the doors up, we will have tremendous
11 invitation in terms of street experiences throughout
12 the City of New York.

13 However, the current rule changes you have
14 proposed would disqualify and wipe out most multi
15 block and single block fe- festivals and the funds
16 they generate for the not-for-profit sponsoring
17 organizations that rely on them to provide vital
18 services. I do not believe that this is your
19 intention.

20 Your proposed requirement that 50 percent of
21 vendors participating have a business or local
22 presence in the respective community boards is
23 onerous. While I appreciate and am aligned and share
24 your goal of increasing community participation, I
25 believe -- I know that this can be met by

1 incentivizing the community. I will put forward my
2 plan in writing, in detail, in terms of that.

3 In addition I -- in addition, I am
4 respectfully requesting that you consider increasing
5 the proposed cap on multi block and single block
6 festivals in the community boards that are not
7 overburdened. While your proposal may be well
8 intentioned and designed to address legitimate
9 concerns in any overburdened district, these rules
10 would have a unintended consequence with drastic
11 impact on the remaining districts in other portions of
12 the City and its neighborhoods. The City is a
13 collection of neighborhoods. No two are alike. We
14 urge that your final rules should address this
15 reality.

16 I am also requesting that you reconsider
17 honoring the tradition of allowing existing sponsors
18 conducting two street festivals a year that have been
19 doing it for more than ten years, any new applicant
20 would be limited to one per year.

21 In terms of your fee structure, I'm
22 respectfully requesting that you reevaluate the flat
23 fee per block fee structure. This is ultimately a
24 disincentive and penalizes groups for doing what we
25 want to do: increasing community participation by

1 offering free and reduced rates in the community.

2 I'm suggesting that the sponsoring
3 organizations reserve the right to either pay 20
4 percent or a flat fee per block based on the number of
5 blocks utilized.

6 I very much look forward to working closely
7 together with you in an effort to achieve your goals
8 and objectives. I will be submitting my full detail
9 testimony in coming days. Thank you very much for the
10 opportunity to be heard today.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Cynthia Maurer.

12 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

13 MS. CYNTHIA MAURER: I'm sorry. I'm getting
14 there. Start?

15 MR. CAREY: Yes.

16 MS. MAURER: My name is Cynthia Maurer, I
17 work with Visiting Neighbors. We're a non-profit
18 organization here that works with the elderly with the
19 goal to keep people independent, safe, and at home and
20 not be forced into nursing homes. Our client base is
21 aged 60 to 105. These are the most frail, vulnerable
22 seniors and people of our community.

23 We depend on street fairs for additional
24 revenue. And this is unrestricted funds. Whenever we
25 go after funding a lot of times there a lot of caveats

1 to that funding. And it's also an opportunity for us
2 to get our voice out there to the community to say we
3 need volunteers and to let people know about our
4 services. The years of Town Cryer's are gone. They
5 depend on a way for us to get out there, and it's
6 harder and harder for us to do it if we don't have
7 access. We not only go to our fairs, but we
8 participate in other groups not profit fairs and we
9 invite them to ours.

10 We -- when the first set of cuts happened,
11 we were hurt very, very badly because the rules were
12 ill-conceived. And when -- instead of to-, looking at
13 that and we tried to have an appeal we were denied
14 that appeal. We never had the opportunity. So, I
15 thank you -- this is the first time we've had an
16 opportunity to come before you and have a voice. Then
17 when the sets of cuts was about 30 percent, we were
18 actually suffered for 72 percent loss. And instead of
19 righting a wrong, it basically was cemented in.

20 These new proposed rules will wipe us out.
21 And I have to say when I called, I was told oh, this
22 will only be an hour. There won't be many people
23 here. Look around. This is an indication of
24 something here. We need to safe guard our fairs that
25 we have left. We basically also want you to know we

1 worked on trying to make them look different. We did
2 a pop up. Guess what? It didn't make us a whole lot
3 of money. So, including these new fee structures will
4 not enable us to get anywhere.

5 We want to work with you. Let's work
6 together, not against each other. We want to be a
7 City that is truly age friendly. And let me tell you,
8 if the day comes and you really need support services,
9 you better hope we're still here to do it. And after
10 40 years -- 40 -- actually, we've been around 46
11 years, we intend to con- continue.

12 So, we need these street fairs. We need you
13 to revisit them. We need you to relook at these
14 rules, and basically work us not against us. Thank
15 you.

16 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

17 MS. ASHLEY: Maria Diaz.

18 MS. MARIA DIAZ: Good morning. My name is
19 Maria Diaz, and I am the Executive Director of the
20 Greenwich Village Chelsea Chamber of Commerce. We're
21 an organization that has been in existence since 1949
22 and in which borders include both Community Boards
23 2,1,4. So you'll -- for example, the village and the
24 whole Chelsea.

25 Since, it's been exi-, in-, its inception,

1 our chamber has striven to be the champion of the
2 business owner in our footprint. However, it is the
3 small business owner who we always have in mind with
4 our programs and mission. For years, the Chamber has
5 been a sponsor of street fairs in the City. Today, I
6 implore that these stringent rules be reconsidered.

7 Our non-profit relies on the funds from the
8 events to produce one of our most important programs.
9 Most people have been talking about how the rules are
10 going to affect them overall. I'm going to give you
11 an example of a specific program that this will
12 impact. For 13 years, we've been honoring local NYPD
13 officers with a cop of the year program. This year
14 due to the additional funds that we were able to
15 receive from street fairs, we expanded that program to
16 a set of precinct tours at four of the precincts in
17 our jurisdiction in our footprint. These precinct
18 tours have been a tremendous success. Both the NYP-,
19 NYPD officers and the business owners who are allowed
20 to participate in these precinct tours appreciate the
21 opportunity to increase both the community
22 participation and both the community policing that
23 this city desperately needs.

24 With the cutting of these -- with the
25 implementation of these rules we will not be able to

1 continue implementing these programs. And therefore,
2 the City overall will suffer.

3 The Chamber also has been requesting our own
4 members to participate in these street fairs and have
5 not been successful. So, I also implore that the con-
6 , emplo-, the consideration of the 50 percent be
7 reconsidered. Thank you.

8 MS. ASHLEY: Can I have Mirielle Moor.

9 MS. MIRIELLE MOOR: Good morning. My name
10 is Mirielle Moor, and I'm here today because the
11 proposed changes to the street fairs will quite
12 honestly kill two of my jobs. My jobs are event mo-,
13 and membership coordinator at the Forest Hills Chamber
14 of Commerce, and I have a startup company called
15 Banger Rabbit. Banger Rabbit is a ri-, is an original
16 handcrafted bag company for men and women of all ages.

17 I exhibit my bags at two street fairs a
18 year. Sorry. Two street fairs a week in all boroughs
19 during the street fairs seasons from April to
20 November. I am also a student here in the City and my
21 jobs pay for my tuition expenses. Limiting the fairs
22 for the Forest Hills Chamber to one per year puts my
23 job at my risk as there will not be enough funding to
24 cover my salary. I am concerned that this rule may
25 cause the chamber to close.

1 The proposed rule to have 50 percent of the
2 participating vendors have a business or presence in
3 the community board district the fairs are held in
4 would exclude me in -- from exhibiting at all the
5 fairs I need to be in because I live on Long Island.
6 This will cause a big loss of income for me, limiting
7 Banger Rabbits exposure and stop me from growing my
8 company.

9 I can't afford a brick and mortar store.
10 And the street fairs truly are one of the last ways
11 for a business like me can put ourselves out there to
12 the public and get exposure. While participating at
13 these fairs, I get to meet great people from all over
14 whether they are buying from me or other vendors. It
15 teaches me so much and I would -- I wouldn't be able
16 to get the feedback or business I -- like I do from
17 these fairs.

18 MS. ASHLEY: Steve Gould.

19 MR. STEVE GOULD: Hello. My name is Steve
20 Gould from Chelsea Visiting Neighbors. And I won't
21 belabor the points that were covered. I am in
22 opposition to the proposed rules especially the fee
23 basis rather than a percentage basis, but that's been
24 talked about. I must say that if you listen to the
25 testimony of the gentleman from the Time Square

1 Alliance he brought up something that I, I know he's
2 in five, but he said why are you approaching with it -
3 - a cookie cutter attitude that you should look at
4 everything individually, and I'd really like you to do
5 that.

6 Chelsea Visiting Neighbors has for past 22
7 years had a senior talent show. And seniors from all
8 over the city participate in that. The oldest senior
9 that we had was a, a woman from the Upper East Side
10 that was 102 years old that actually won first place
11 that year, singing -- I forget now what it was. But
12 anyhow, the, the, the fact of the matter is that fair
13 does something that's absolutely wonderful for the
14 City of New York, and people whether they're tourists
15 or residents or people from other boroughs coming in.
16 It shows the incredible power that even seniors have
17 at that age. And more importantly, we also are able
18 to get the word out for looking for other seniors that
19 we can help. And street fairs that we participate in
20 we do in other areas too. And also for volunteers
21 because that's how non-profit organizations like ours
22 survive.

23 Everything's that happened thanks to the
24 City, unfortunately, we used to get one of the wagons
25 donated by the Parks Department, and then they said

1 well we'd have to pay a, a - -this was for the stage.
2 Then they said we'd have to pay not, not for profit
3 fee, and then that was changed. And then all of
4 sudden they said no, you're going to have pay the full
5 price. And all of these things keep happening and we
6 lost all of our funding with the City, so this is a
7 very, very important revenue producer for us, as well
8 as getting word out for seniors and volunteers. So, I
9 thank you for this opportunity.

10 MR. CAREY: Thank you, sir.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Rick Rodriguez.

12 MR. RICK RODRIGUEZ: Good morning. My name
13 is Rick and I'm here to speak on behalf of the
14 vendors. I'm a resident actually of New York. I've
15 been a resident of New York for over 55 years. I
16 actually live in Time Square. And pass through it
17 four times a day. The gentleman who spoke from the
18 Hyatt, I guarantee you does not live in Time Square.
19 You sign up to party with the big dogs; you play with
20 the big dogs. I'm really here to speak for the
21 smaller people.

22 I look around this room and I see people
23 that I see every week. I've worked with -- on both
24 sides, I've worked both for the production companies
25 and I am artist and a crafts person here in New York.

1 And I can say that this administration promised us
2 equality, not just for the one percent, but for the 99
3 percent. This room is filled with the 99 percent.

4 The truth at the end of the day is I've
5 spoken to merchants, I've worked with the merchants,
6 I've worked with the vendors, if these rules go in, we
7 talk about creating a pathway away from poverty, we'll
8 be creating a pathway to poverty for a lot of the
9 people here. People who can't find traditional
10 employment. People who are craftspeople. This is
11 America. And the truth is at the end of the day, this
12 City, what people come here for, not large
13 multinational corporations, a Dunkin' Donuts, a
14 Starbucks, a Hyatt, they come here for the texture of
15 the City. Yes, there are tube socks. Yes, there are
16 sausage and pepper stands. But they wouldn't be there
17 if people were not supporting them.

18 I've watched Morton Ray, Todd Berman,
19 Clearview Pop Up, you name it, the Ninth Avenue, I've
20 watched them try to evolve, I've been part of the
21 evolution. Everything happens slowly. This is a law
22 that will take place next year. There is no time for
23 anyone to accurately respond to it on an economic
24 level.

25 The truth is, if this is a City for the

1 people, by the people, and about the people this isn't
2 the answer. It's quite simply is not the answer. I
3 really urge that you give more time to look at this,
4 that you work with the organizers because you are
5 directly creating a pathway into poverty for people
6 who work this. Quite simply. Thank you.

7 MS. ASHLEY: Can I have Shawn Campbell? Is
8 he here? Okay. John Sharp. Oh, wait, Shawn, are you
9 --

10 MS. SHAWN CAMPBELL: I'm Shawn.

11 MS. ASHLEY: I couldn't see you coming up.

12 MS. CAMPBELL: Good morning.

13 MR. CAREY: Good morning.

14 MS. CAMPBELL: I am Shawn Campbell, District
15 Manager of Community Board 14 Brooklyn, and I
16 appreciate the opportunity to present comments on
17 behalf of Chairman Alvin Berk and the board members of
18 CB14. Currently Community Board 14 hosts four multi
19 block street events, one single block festival per
20 year. In addition, we consider approximately 70
21 applications for other events, side walk sales,
22 weekend walks, containers, etcetera. We approve,
23 typically over 95 percent of those applications.
24 There are additional events that we do not have
25 opportunity to weigh on including construction,

1 utility repair, street openings and demonstrations.
2 And so far in 2016, nearly 150 film crews in our 2.9
3 square miles.

4 Up until this year SAPO has always upheld
5 our recommendations, but in 2016, we have had three
6 recommendations overturned by SAPO CECM. And so we
7 would like to see more specificity in these rules
8 concerning the roles of community boards and police
9 precincts in our approval process and we are specific
10 in our testimony that we will provide in writing.

11 For brevity's sake, I just want to request a
12 couple of additions. One is a language that would add
13 accountability or some transparency when CECM SAPO
14 does overturn a police precinct or community board
15 recommendation. So, we have the reasons why our, our
16 on the ground, community based, hyper local
17 perspective was overturned by a central agency. We'd
18 like the reasons enumerated and in writing and for the
19 record. And in cases where SAPO CECM makes
20 significant exceptions to your own rules, we would
21 like the reasons for those exceptions to also be
22 documented and made public record.

23 CECM has maintained as a moratorium as we've
24 heard today, on the basis of police overtime, but at
25 the same time the city has opened up opportunities for

1 weekend walks through DOT permits. And we'd like to
2 see more specificity in these rules that clarify where
3 these counts fit in or where street weekend walks fit
4 in with these rules in terms of counts and activities
5 in the, in the community districts. Weekend walks, by
6 the way, having heard from so many vendors, weekend
7 walks are the events where there's no outside vendors.
8 That's 100 percent merchant participant. So, that
9 might be taking care of with that event, depending on
10 where they fit into these rules.

11 And then finally, we would like an allowance
12 for each community board to limit the number of times
13 a specific, a particular street is opened. So, we
14 have the number in the districts overall, but if every
15 single one of those events were on one of our blocks,
16 that would be a problem. Again, additional details
17 are in our written testimony which we will provide
18 online. Thank you very much for the time and all of
19 your efforts on this issue.

20 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. John Sharp, you are
21 next.

22 MR. JOHN SHARP: Mr. Carey and other members
23 of the committee, thank you for the opportunity to
24 comment on these proposed rules. My name is John
25 Sharp. I am a resident of community board 4 and the

1 New York State Democratic Committee Member
2 representing the 75th assembly district which is
3 Chelsea and Hell's Kitchen. I have been approached by
4 many small, grass roots, non-profit organizations in
5 community board four. That since 2007 have become
6 reliant on street fairs as a revenue, revenue source.
7 All have asked that SAPO reconsider the implementation
8 of the regulations because it would cause undue
9 hardship and possibly total elimination of this
10 income. I have asked them -- that they send their
11 comments directly to S- SA- SAPO via e-mail.

12 I do have a concern with some of the
13 proposed rules. I realize that when you ask most
14 people they would want to see 50 percent of all
15 vendors coming from the community. I also agree that
16 I see where this will cause difficulty for everyone
17 concerned, and will need additional time to implement.
18 Each borough in the City is different and must be
19 treated accordingly.

20 In CB4, stores already pay very high rents
21 and would want -- would not want to pay additional
22 fees to participate in an event even for good causes.
23 I can see the difficulty for the promoters of the
24 street fairs to find members of that community who
25 would commit to taking a booth on a regular basis,

1 thereby giving them the ability to -- not giving them
2 the ability to properly plan. I also see the lost
3 revenue for the non-profits trying to fund these good
4 works.

5 I would ask SA- SAPO to consider, instead of
6 making it reserved for New York City residents,
7 instead of community specific. If that is not the
8 case, I would then ask SAPO to allow the
9 implementation of the 50 percent rule to be spread
10 over a four year period: 20 percent in the first year,
11 30 in the, in the second, 40 in the third, finally 50.
12 This would give time for the promoters to develop an
13 outreach strategy and work with the community to find
14 innovative ways to get more commercial groups and
15 stores involved making the 50 percent. This
16 implementation could also be evaluated at each
17 milestone to see if it is feasible at all.

18 I also just would like to add in that I was
19 asked by the Chelsea Reform Democratic Club who also
20 has one of the street fairs involved, and is also one
21 of the pe-, most progressive and long term democratic
22 clubs in Manhattan. They los--

23 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you.

24 MR. SHARP: Okay. Alright. Thank you. I -
25 - they're -- they -- they're submitting their, their

1 notes via -- and I can give --

2 MS. ASHLEY: You can give it to me if you
3 like.

4 MR. SHARP: Okay.

5 MS. ASHLEY: Norman Siegel. Thank you.

6 MR. SHARP: Is there anything on it?

7 MS. ASHLEY: If you want to submit that to
8 us --

9 MR. SHARP: Yeah.

10 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you so much.

11 MR. SHARP: Thank you. Hey, Norman. Good
12 to see you.

13 MR. NORMAN SIEGEL: Good morning. I am a
14 civil rights attorney. And I am here today
15 representing the interests of vendors and community
16 sponsors who have participated in New York City street
17 fairs. Some of who are here, they're standing,
18 they're sitting, unfortunately, some of them are
19 outside, and unfortunately, some are even downstairs.
20 And that's because of po- poor planning for this
21 public hearing, unless this was the intent to repress
22 opposition to the proposed rules. I am speaker number
23 22, and according to my figures, only three people
24 support, that's 86 percent are opposed to your
25 proposed rules. This is a constitutional democracy.

1 You should take that into consideration.

2 There are serious and substantial concerns
3 and problems procedurally and [unintelligible]
4 [11:08:13] with your proposed rules. We need adequate
5 input from the primary participants in the past street
6 fairs. Whether the vendors, community sponsors,
7 community boards, neighborhood block associations,
8 churches, synagogues, and community groups consulted
9 prior to today's hearing? If yes, I'd like you to
10 publish the times and the dates that you had the
11 consultations. That should be made public. If they
12 were con- consulted, then I recommend you delay any
13 changes to the rules and such consultations should
14 occur and parti-, be heard.

15 Moreover, the OCECM quote undertook an
16 extensive review of the current state in street fairs
17 and collected substantial information through surveys
18 and outreach. The public is interested as you can see
19 today, and should be able to review those complete
20 surveys and the outreach materials before the rule
21 changes are adopted.

22 Substantive objections. We object to the
23 overall thrust of the proposed change on the ground
24 that you have not and cannot justify that the
25 government interest in making the particular changes

1 is substantial, and that the proposed rule change
2 advance that substantial interest in a matter that is
3 not more extensive and restrictive than is necessary
4 to serve that interest. Nor does it appear to be a
5 rational relationship between the proposed rule
6 changes and the legitimate government purpose. I
7 suggest you check with the corp. counsel on what I
8 just said. For example, you make a major point that
9 the NYPD argues that the street fairs "place an
10 excessive burden on police resources and divert
11 uniform personnel from core crime fighting, public
12 safety and counterterrorism duties." Yet, you offer
13 no documentation, no documentation to substantiate
14 this position. We need to question the validity of
15 such NYPD allegations.

16 Similarly, we need to question the argument
17 that the street closing significantly add to
18 neighborhood traffic congestion resulting in the
19 detriment to neighborhood concerns. Where is the
20 evidence for this asse- assertion? You've heard
21 people saying just the opposite. The 50 percent rule,
22 this proposed rule in my opinion is unfair,
23 potentially discriminatory, and not warranted. It's
24 unfair because it potentially burdens the right to
25 trade for vendors who do not have a business or a

1 local presence within the same community board. It's
2 potentially discriminatory, because if you look, my
3 understanding and confirmed here, the overwhelming
4 majority of these people are people of color, they're
5 immigrants, and they're working people. And they're
6 women. Finally, it's unwarranted --

7 MS. ASHLEY: [Unintelligible] [11:10:39].

8 MR. SIEGEL: Let me conclude, ten seconds,
9 saying, we want to work with you. If you don't want
10 to work with us, and you don't listen to people, we'll
11 have to meet you in another venue on another day to
12 then challenge these rules.

13 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

14 MS. ASHLEY: Maryann, Maryann Abdul.

15 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

16 MS. ASHLEY: You may submit -- October 27th.

17 MR. SIEGEL: What you just took.

18 MS. ASHLEY: You want me to give you back --

19 MR. SIEGEL: Give me back and I'll give you
20 a clean copy.

21 MS. ASHLEY: I got it. Thank you so much,
22 sir.

23 MS. MARYANN ABDUL: Hello. Thank you for
24 the opportunity to testify today. I'm providing
25 testimony on behalf of Assembly Member Deborah Glick.

1 Street festivals can be a wonderful addition to the
2 community.

3 While the Mayor's office of City Wide Event
4 Coordination and Management contends that the proposed
5 rules are intended to broaden the permitting process
6 and alleviate the strain on NYPD resources, the
7 proposals neglect to take into account the impact
8 these changes would have on community organizations
9 and small businesses which rely on street festivals to
10 engage with the community.

11 Some communities are inundated a
12 disproportionate number of applications and some
13 amendments might be warranted, but the proposed
14 changes will seemingly have a disproportionate impact
15 on smaller, local organizations and vendors, and will
16 eventually drive them out and result in the exact type
17 of street fair that the communities are trying to
18 limit.

19 The change to a flat rate fee per block from
20 the existing 20 percent share of profits is
21 particularly burdensome for community organizations
22 that sponsor street festivals to provide a common good
23 for the community. For example, some of these
24 organizations set up stages for free programming on
25 one block and would have to make significantly more

1 money on the other block in order to cover the cost of
2 the permits for both blocks.

3 Many of these organizations already face
4 limited budgets and this amendment would price out
5 many good participants from being able to host a
6 community fair. Similarly, the tight restrictions
7 that only allow ten multi block events in each
8 community board and 20 single block events per year in
9 a given community board will make it even harder to
10 diversify the quality of street permits. It is also
11 unclear how these rules will impact organizations that
12 might want to host or co-sponsor more than one event.
13 I understand there is a cap of one multi block fair
14 per group per year, but would a partner organization
15 also be barred from applying for an additional permit?

16 And lastly, while in many circumstances, the
17 proposal to require half of the participating vendors
18 reside or have a business address in the same
19 community board is a positive thing, many community
20 organizations provide services throughout various
21 community boards and boroughs and could be limited in
22 their ability to allow partners to participate.
23 Addressing the demand that certain communities face is
24 a laudable goal, but these generalized strict
25 regulations would have detrimental consequences.

1 Furthermore, street permits issues through
2 SAPO are far from the most intrusive permits that the
3 city grants. For example, what reviews are being done
4 to limit the number of permits for TV, and movie
5 filming in our communities? Street permits offer-
6 offered through SAPO are one of the few things that
7 the community has input on. And strictly limiting the
8 applications does not change the real demands on the
9 community. The proposed regulations don't take into
10 account the needs of the whole community. I would
11 hope that you would reevaluate some of the changes
12 that would negatively impact non-profits and community
13 organizations under this new proposal. Thank you for
14 the opportunity to testify and I have the entire
15 testimony for record. Thank you.

16 MS. ASHLEY: Noah Pfefferblit.

17 MR. NOAH PFEFFERBLIT: Good morning. It's
18 still morning. And thank you for holding this
19 important public hearing today regarding these
20 proposed changes in the rules for street fairs. My
21 name is Noah Pfefferblit. I am the District Manager
22 of Community Board One in Lower Manhattan which
23 includes most of Manhattan below Canal Street and
24 south of the Brooklyn Bridge.

25 At our board meeting on September 27th of

1 2016, we unanimously adopted a resolution strongly
2 urging the, the City Wide Event coordination and
3 management to postpone today's public hearing by at
4 least one month to enable community boards to provide
5 meaningful input on the proposed rules changes, a
6 request that should be noted was also made by
7 Manhattan Borough president Gale Brewer.

8 We noted in our resolution that the
9 extremely and unusually compressed time frame adopted
10 precluded meaningful input as community boards require
11 at least 45 days advance notice. The proposed changes
12 would make very significant changes to the rules for
13 street fa-, street fairs, setting a maximum of ten
14 multi block events in any community district per year
15 and a maximum of 20 one block events, far fewer than
16 the current number in many Manhattan districts, and
17 the maximum of one festival per organization. This
18 sharp reduction in the number of events would require
19 a lottery to determine which organizations would have
20 the ability to sponsor fairs, which would make it
21 impossible for us, for CB1 and other organizations
22 that currently sponsor fairs and raise essential funds
23 from them to continue doing so.

24 CECM has not offered any explanation of why
25 it believes that these drastic changes are needed or

1 the reason for this extremely compressed time frame.
2 CECM has moved forward with this hearing despite
3 numerous requests to postpone it, and while we
4 therefore cannot address the proposed changes, we have
5 some comments regarding how the new rules will affect
6 our internal operations and our budget.

7 CB1 has sponsored street fairs in our
8 district for many years. While we review all
9 applications for street fairs and events regardless of
10 the sponsor, we sponsor our own events in order to
11 supplement our budget and conduct work on behalf of
12 our community. In past years, CB1 has sponsored as
13 many as six fairs annually, including in the aftermath
14 of 9/11 and post 9/11 reconstruction when additional
15 funds were needed to provide the services that are
16 members and constituents needed during extraordinarily
17 challenging times. It is inconceivable that we would
18 have been able to meet the challenges of 9/11 and post
19 9/11 reconstruction without such funds and other
20 community boards have come to rely on additional funds
21 raised in this way as well to meet their unique
22 challenges.

23 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. The, the time is --

24 MR. PFEFFERBLIT: Oh. The time is up?

25 MS. ASHLEY: Yeah.

1 MR. PFEFFERBLIT: Let me just see if there's
2 anything I absolutely have to say.

3 MS. ASHLEY: You can submit your written
4 testimony. Can I have Ann --

5 MR. PFEFFERBLIT: We did that.

6 MS. ASHLEY: -- Toback.

7 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

8 MR. PFEFFERBLIT: I'll take a copy of it
9 too.

10 MS. ANN TOBACK: Hi.

11 MR. CAREY: Good morning.

12 MS. TOBACK: I'm Ann Toback. Good morning.

13 And I'm the Executive Director of the Workman Circle.
14 We're a progressive Jewish culture and social justice
15 non-profit organization founded in 1900 that today
16 connects a growing community of Jews with their
17 cultural and social justice heritage.

18 For over three decades, the Workman's Circle
19 has presented a robust calendar of free outdoor Jewish
20 cultural programs in the five boroughs, starting with
21 our summer concert series, Yiddish fest, founded by
22 Joseph Papp in the '70s. Yiddish fest highlight
23 concert takes place at our annual street fair first on
24 Madison Avenue and now on Sixth Avenue since we moved
25 our headquarters in 2012 to West 37th Street.

1 In the past years, we've expanded on our
2 concert offering at the street fair, and have used a
3 block to host our workman circle taste of Jewish
4 culture fair. The fair features over 25 curated
5 specialty New York City food vendors from across the
6 five boroughs, offering new takes on traditional
7 Jewish cuisine, world class music, social justice
8 campaigns and family programs. This past year, we had
9 people from all over New York, multiple states and
10 Canada come to Manhattan specifically to attend our
11 fair. Our one of a kind cultural program is part of a
12 larger street fair on Sixth Avenue featuring blocks of
13 multicultural vendors who come from all over New York
14 City to sell their products. Over 90 percent of the
15 vendors at our street fair live in New York City;
16 however, the majority of them cannot afford to live in
17 Manhattan and instead commute from the outer boroughs.
18 These proposed changes will put most of these
19 hardworking, mostly immigrant and minority small
20 business vendors out of business.

21 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 4: Right.

22 MS. TOBACK: We understand the City's need
23 to oversee -- we understand the City's need to oversee
24 the use of street fair permits, but the outcome of
25 these proposed rules will be to all but eliminate

1 outdoor cultural events such as ours. We strongly
2 oppose the proposed 2017 street fair rule changes.

3 We're sure that an equitable solution to all
4 the issues raised can be developed. However, in order
5 for a fair and equitable solution to be reached, we
6 ask that you reconsider these proposed rules and to
7 commit to a new process and timetable that will allow
8 for real community participation in drafting rules
9 that take into account the longstanding contributions
10 of not-profit cu- cultural organizations and the
11 thousands of small business vendors for whom these
12 fairs represent an integral part of their commercial
13 revenue. Thank you.

14 MS. ASHLEY: Can I have Paul from St. Luke's
15 pe-, Paul Schmiede? Did I pronounce that right?
16 Sorry, if I mispronounced.

17 MR. PAUL SCHMIEGE: Good morning.

18 MR. CAREY: Good morning, sir.

19 MR. SCHMIEGE: I'm Paul Schmiede. Pastor of
20 St. Luke's Lutheran Church. I live of West 46th
21 Street, I -- in Community Board Four. I am a daily
22 witness to what is probably the world's largest
23 unintended parking lot. I am therefore sympathetic
24 with the alliances vision of trying in some way to
25 regulate the existence of street fairs --

1 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 5: Boo.

2 MR. SCHMIEGE: -- with the flow of traffic.
3 But I have a more direct concern today.

4 I am writing to express concern about how
5 street fairs effect congregations and houses of
6 worship in general. Others have written about traffic
7 congestion and sanitation, but the issue of Sunday
8 street fairs for us, or of street fairs for any house
9 of worship on their gathering day is a vital one to
10 me. Just anecdotally, in the past two years, we have
11 been seriously impeded by Sunday street fairs.

12 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 5: Boo.

13 MR. SCHMIEGE: In both --

14 MR. CAREY: [Unintelligible] [11:22:23] --

15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 5: Boo.

16 MR. SCHMIEGE: In both years we discovered
17 an Oktoberfest being set up on our block. The sale of
18 beer and bratwurst was taking place immediately in
19 front of the church steps during the morning mass.
20 And our members were unable to access the church.
21 Access-A-Ride could not drop off of those with
22 disabilities. Commuters could find nowhere to park
23 and gave up and returned home. Smoke and the odors of
24 cooking were penetrating the church during the worship
25 service.

1 I ask, simply, that there be some provision
2 in the rules for the planning of street fairs so that
3 the needs of houses of worship on their gathering days
4 be taken into provision. Perhaps as simple as asking
5 sponsors of street fairs to certify that they've been
6 in touch with the local houses of worship. I think
7 this particularly affects those who are in single
8 block street fairs. Thank you.

9 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. Can I have Diane
10 Turek from the 114th Precinct? Also, could we please
11 refrain from commenting during someone speaking
12 because it does affect the recording.

13 MS. DIANA TUREK: My name is Diane Turek.
14 I'm a volunteer member of the 114th Civic Opt In.
15 President of our organization couldn't make it, so I'm
16 just going to read what she gave me.

17 The 114th Civic Opt is a unique organization
18 where volunteers serve as extra eyes and ears for the
19 police department without getting physically involved.
20 We observe and report what we see to the authorities.
21 Our efforts are specifically formulated to decrease
22 crime activity, create a cleaner and safer quality of
23 life within the community, improve relationships
24 between our police and the community to include
25 residents, property and business owners, non-profit

1 organizations and agencies and religious
2 establishments within our area covered.

3 We are a community sponsor for a smaller
4 multi block street fair usually no more than six
5 blocks. Proceeds from this event directly support
6 national night out against crime in the 114th Precinct
7 area. This event attracts over 2,000 people every
8 year. If the new rules are passed, all community
9 boards will be able to have ten multi block street
10 fairs per year. This will cause great financial ha-
11 hardship to some non-profit organization like ours
12 should they be denied a permit. Most sponsors in our
13 district have been using proceeds from these street
14 fairs to fund activities to have benefit their
15 communities for fai-, for years. Without these funds,
16 the community loses.

17 Based on your current proposal, excessive
18 amounts of street fairs are noted to be held in a few
19 district. Is it possible to make exceptions in some
20 community boards that may slightly exceed your
21 proposed amount based on individuals' circumstances in
22 the community? For example, our organizations event
23 is a small multi block festival which requires less
24 police resources and the proceeds are used to
25 facilitate activities that foster improving community

1 relationships with our police department.

2 In addition, we feel that requiring a 50
3 percent present of local participation is expecting
4 too much. Local businesses are always invited to
5 participate in our street festival for a reduced
6 price. We have noticed that many of the businesses in
7 the area where we hold our festivals are closed on
8 Sundays. We also invite local non-profit
9 organizations to participate for free. We would
10 embrace ideas and incentives this city could develop
11 that would encourage more community participation yet
12 not cause a drastic drop in revenue from our much
13 needed fund raiser event. Thank you for your time.

14 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

15 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. Joe Giovanni.

16 Thank you.

17 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

18 MR. JOE GIOVANNI: Good morning or
19 afternoon, I guess, Michael.

20 MR. CAREY: Still morning.

21 MR. GIOVANNI: My name is Joe Giovanni. I'm
22 from Mardi Gras Festival Productions, a local New York
23 City event production company and business since 1979.
24 We were -- we represent many of the local not for
25 profit community org- organizations most of whom are

1 very grassroots that have been conducting their
2 respective street fair for over 20, 25, and many over
3 30 years in their own communities with full community
4 support.

5 We also represent over a 1,000 local New
6 York City licensed street fair vendors. These vendors
7 have always been and will always be new immigrants, a
8 variety of different minorities, many are of people of
9 color, many of them are women, but most importantly
10 over 90 percent are residences of New York City. They
11 pay taxes. They pay rents. They pay mortgages. They
12 pay everything that all of the big businesses of Time
13 Square and New Town [unintelligible] [11:27:44] paid
14 to keep our entire City and streets running in one New
15 York City.

16 It's clear that these proposed changes are
17 to greatly reduce and restrict community events in
18 Midtown Manhattan, specifically Time Square while
19 advocating increasing events in the outer boroughs.
20 To me and almost everyone else that has heard of this
21 proposal it's clear, nimbi, not in my backyard. It
22 seems to me that a proposal to limit the amount of
23 events in Manhattan where basically we all know the
24 outer boroughs are great, and they're developing year
25 in -- year after year, but vendors need to make money.

1 That's why they do this. And the same reason that
2 they build billion dollar buildings in Midtown
3 Manhattan as opposed to building them in Queens or
4 Staten Island or the Bronx is because tourists come
5 here, businesses are all here in Midtown Manhattan,
6 people are in Midtown Manhattan. It's all about
7 money. That's why real estate is, is, is building
8 buildings like that and people are gravitating to
9 Midtown Manhattan. We can't help that.

10 Most of the organizations that run their
11 events in Community Board Five have been doing them
12 long before there was a Time Square Alliance. The
13 [unintelligible] [11:29:03] Time Square Alliance
14 basically orchestrated Broadway to close the traffic
15 from 42nd to 5-, to 47th to, 47th Street to 5-, to
16 42nd Street, and now they're looking to go to 52nd
17 Street which anybody will tell you, seven days a week,
18 gridlock city is caused by Broadway being closed.
19 That's why there's so much traffic in Time Square
20 area. The six or eight hours of one street fair one
21 day is not really impacting that. I know a lot people
22 say that, but that's really not the truth. And if
23 there is -- if it was the truth, outside of the
24 complaints from the Time Square Alliance, you'd be
25 having 311 calls, and you'd be having a multitude of

1 other complaints for years and that just does not
2 happen.

3 I ask you to really evaluate, sit down with
4 all of us, and see how we can work it out. We've
5 worked -- we've had relationships with the go-, with
6 government for many, many years, and we'll be glad to
7 sit down and work with you.

8 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. [unintelligible]
9 [11:30:03] next.

10 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

11 MS. GALE BREWER: Thank you. I know a lot
12 of people want to testify, so I appreciate this very
13 much. I am Gale Brewer. I am the Manhattan Borough
14 President. And I appreciate the leadership of the
15 Office of City Wide Events Coordination and
16 Management.

17 I appreciate Michael Paul Carey and I
18 appreciate all the work that Dawn Tolson has done
19 particularly because you came to the recent borough
20 board meeting, borough service cabinet to talk with
21 the community boards and elected officials. And I
22 appreciate that. And I thank you for extending the
23 deadline to comment on this proposal until October
24 27th, 2016. The extension allows community boards,
25 city wide, to engage their communities, discuss the

1 proposal with the general public, and adopt
2 resolutions that serve as their comments in a way that
3 truly reflects the views of the people of this city.

4 I am one of the few elected officials, I
5 think who has had a table with government material at
6 a street festival every weekend since 2002 and even
7 before. And in my experience, neighborhood residence
8 attend local block events and the multi street
9 festivals, particularly people in wheel chairs, often
10 with family members and friends, because they can
11 easily access the goods and services. I know, because
12 I'm at the table. I also want to add that my office
13 has been working with the African community in
14 particular, to help members of the community apply for
15 temporary vendor licenses so that they can work at
16 street festivals and other venues. I believe they
17 need, and you know this better than I do in the room,
18 the New York State Certificate of Authority and the
19 New York City Consumer Affairs permit and many of them
20 either don't speak English well or haven't applied and
21 we're helping them to do that.

22 So, in Manhattan, and I heard a lot about
23 Manhattan today, street and single block festivals are
24 more than community events or tourist attractions.
25 They allow community based organizations to raise

1 money for additional equipment or programing, proceeds
2 that pay for rain gear for the [unintelligible]
3 [11:32:22] police, walkie talkies for cert. teams and
4 free outdoor summer concerts. A festival is often the
5 annual signature event at the Metropolitan level in
6 celebration of a particular ethnic or religious
7 community whose members come, perhaps, from all five
8 boroughs and beyond to vend its specialty wears and
9 partake in its heritage or it can just be a local
10 neighborhood organization.

11 Yes, some communities have too many
12 festivals. And Community Board Seven, where I --my
13 home board, confronted this issue 20 years ago. They
14 came up with a good solution. No portion of a street
15 can be used more than twice in any year. Sponsors
16 must combine their festival with another sponsor's
17 festival and the result was that the total number of
18 festivals was cut by 50 percent. I'm sure you heard
19 this from others. CB7 also required sponsors to
20 donate 20 percent of their revenue to another not
21 profit, which perhaps did not participate in the
22 festival. This, of course, in addition to the 20
23 percent that the sponsors pay to the City. Had other
24 community boards followed suit, we may not be here
25 today.

1 Street festivals are important to Manhattan
2 and to the City, but yes, avenues some used over and
3 over. So, I want to come up with some concerns that I
4 have, but also say there are some good proposals that
5 are in the discussion today.

6 The cap on the number of festivals. The
7 proposal will limit each community board as we know to
8 ten street and 20 single block festivals a year. I
9 understand the need to support th-, to reduce festival
10 oversaturation, but I find that the hard cap fails to
11 accommodate the needs for some of our communities,
12 like Community Board Six, home to 26 single block
13 festivals. Under this proposal, some of these smaller
14 festivals which was the heart and soul of the
15 neighborhood may be put out of existence or forced to
16 merge with their community sponsors facing revenue
17 loss and they [unintelligible] [11:34:21] production
18 of services, or work with a community board if they
19 want to merge. That's not part of the proposal.

20 Second, first come first serve application.
21 While I acknowledge the interest in an objective
22 application system, I find the proposed system fails
23 to consider the needs of the community sponsors.
24 Single street and single block festivals can only
25 thrive and bring in proceeds if they are reliably held

1 year after year. It is easy to foresee that first
2 come first serve puts community organizations against
3 one another for an arbitrarily limited resource and
4 can cause a long established major event to be
5 discontinued.

6 The new system will also lead to unwanted
7 financial volatility for the community sponsors as
8 festival proceeds, now a major part of their revenue,
9 could be here this year and gone the next. Why not
10 involve the community board, like, board seven did,
11 and worked to merge fairs where appropriate, but not
12 where not appropriate.

13 The 50 percent local vendor requirement is
14 unmitigated hell. Nobody likes it. It's unworkable.
15 For example, a festival celebrating an ethnic or
16 religious community often features vendors coming from
17 all over the region to the [unintelligible] [11:35:32]
18 neighborhood where the festival is held. Vendors for
19 Kalieer [phonetic], Kaldasha [phonetic], Jannan
20 [phonetic] Festival, the only [unintelligible]
21 [11:35:42] synagogue in the western hemisphere could
22 be members of this particular community or they could
23 be from all over the city or even beyond. It is
24 however, an ongoing cultural festival that's important
25 to that community.

1 The 50 percent requirement would foreclose
2 many of these vendors from participating in the annual
3 gathering and celebration of their religious
4 community, as they may not live or work near their
5 spiritual home anymore. Some people may think that
6 they shouldn't exist, but groups like this I say do
7 bring New York City spiritual, civic home to our
8 neighborhoods.

9 The other issue is local storefront
10 businesses may or may not be willing to participate in
11 festivals. Their top priority is keeping their doors
12 open, particularly with high rents. And it's my
13 understanding that some don't want to participate, but
14 if they do the festival sponsor could make some spots
15 available for reduced fee or no fee, but not 50
16 percent of the slots.

17 On terms of the vendors, vendors are unable
18 to afford store front rents, that's often why they're
19 vending. Their livelihood depends on participating in
20 large number of festivals all over the City, the
21 region and the country.

22 So, as a City, we need to run workshops so
23 more artisans and ethnic vendors get the proper
24 credentials, but the issue of 50 percent local vendor
25 requirement has to be looked at very carefully.

1 Application fees at proposal will fix the
2 application fee for street and single block festivals
3 at \$1,375 on the first block on the first day, with
4 the fee for each subsequent block or day at \$705. It
5 represents a substantial departure from the current
6 fee assessed at 20 percent of the total fees paid by
7 vendors to participate.

8 I am concerned that the fee could be
9 unaffordable to smaller community sponsors. Although
10 SAPO will have authority to waive or reduce fees, the
11 festival applicant will have to demonstrate that the
12 fee is in excess of 25 percent of its festival derived
13 revenue, up from 20 percent for which the applicant is
14 currently responsible. Also, with the increase of
15 application fee, community sponsors will be less
16 inclined to provide space for not profit public
17 service organizations, like me, government, which are
18 dependent on street and single block festivals to
19 engage their community.

20 I want to say in conclusion, these festivals
21 celebrate our city. A festival is a venue for
22 vendors, non-profits, community residents to interact
23 and intermingle in the joint effort to showcase their
24 community where the festival is held. Over the years,
25 the current festivals have thrived despite the

1 constraints and limitations imposed upon them. The
2 proposal before us may not have fully taken into
3 account that these successful festivals, along with
4 their community sponsors, participating vendors and
5 neighborhoods behind them could be in jeopardy. So, I
6 am supportive of the broader goals of the proposal,
7 but I would like to see some of these concerns
8 addressed. Thank you very much.

9 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 6: This time we are
11 conducting a full building evacuation fire --

12 MR. CAREY: We do not have to leave.

13 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

14 [OFF THE RECORD]

15 [ON THE RECORD]

16 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

17 MR. ARTHUR TISI: Alright. Good morning,
18 Director Carey and company. My name is Arthur Tisi.
19 I've worked for Mardi Gras Festival Productions for 37
20 years. We know the rules that have been proposed.

21 So, let me start off by saying I'm against
22 the rules and I will you give my reasons. My first
23 reason is that I lived in Lower Manhattan and was a
24 street fair vendor. And my wife lived in Albioto
25 [phonetic], and she was a street fair vendor. On

1 October 8th, we celebrated our 49th wedding
2 anniversary. If these rules were written in those
3 days, I would have had to stay where I lived and she
4 would have had to stay where she lived and we would
5 not be the loving grandparents that we are today.

6 Two when then mayor Edward Koch [phonetic]
7 created SAPO, the purpose was to help not-for-profit
8 groups and the like to make some funds and stay
9 afloat. It was not to torture them. They raised
10 funds to exercise their first amendment rights. We
11 are sure that our now great Mayor, Bill de Blasio,
12 will not allow this injustice to take place. How many
13 young people of color, who are first timers to retail
14 will be told there is no place for them to display
15 their merchandise or art? These new entrepreneurs can
16 develop and perfect their trade at street fairs.

17 Next, along with our mayor, let us continue
18 to encourage those who are new to the business world.
19 Do the new vendors have to apologize to those who
20 think they are not sheik or high end enough? Director
21 Carey, part of the rules that prohibit street
22 festivals between 42nd and 50th etcetera were in
23 effect in 2016. You've done -- you then knew this was
24 an attempt by some to control the city streets, and
25 you wisely allowed festivals in this area. Please

1 don't allow a few to control, manage, and destroy the
2 lives of so many of these people. Besides the
3 [unintelligible] [11:43:22] entrepreneurs who
4 honorably make a living, and feed and shelter their
5 families, festivals in these areas for many years have
6 assisted in the improvement on minorities to the
7 police and fire department.

8 Finally, how many young people -- well, le-
9 let's go on, let's go on to, to, to this. A family of
10 five can come from any part of New York to Manhattan.
11 They can't afford The Lion King and they can't afford
12 a restaurant, but at our street fairs, they feel
13 welcome.

14 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 6: Yes.

15 MR. TISI: They can -- is it really up?

16 MR. CAREY: It is.

17 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

18 MR. TISI: Alright.

19 MS. ASHLEY: [unintelligible] [11:44:17].

20 MR. RAYMOND CLINE: Thank you. Good
21 morning. My name is Raymond Cline. And I'm
22 representing the, the BAMRA, which is the Bleecker
23 Area of Merchants and Residents Association and the
24 Village Reform Democratic Club. Now, I've been
25 working with non-profits and street fairs for -- since

1 the late '70s. I remember when Ed Koch asked many of
2 the churches for funding to help put people up for
3 nights. We had to be able to fund these things.
4 Since that time I've been gi-, able to give
5 scholarships to a number of different people. We are
6 able to help other not profits. And thank you, I know
7 my time is limited --

8 MR. CAREY: No, no --

9 [OFF THE RECORD]

10 [ON THE RECORD]

11 MR CLINE: Wasn't that delightful? Last
12 year, BAMRA was able to help out Visiting Neighbors
13 when they lost some of their funding. We were happy
14 to do that. We were able to help out the, the parade
15 for the Halloween parade that non-profit. The
16 children's basketball league in Greenwich Village,
17 there's a whole domino effect. They, they were -- we
18 are able to have a street fair and were able to help
19 the businesses in our area, and the communities in our
20 area deal with the different boroughs. So, we, we are
21 mediating group for the community.

22 Now, there are a lot of non-profits that do
23 not have street fairs. That they come to us and we
24 gi-, are able to give them spaces in our street fairs.
25 So, we have no employees in either one of these

1 organizations, yet we give the money away and even
2 then some. By not being able to have some income from
3 these street festivals, we would not be able to help
4 the community in which we live in. Thank you.

5 MR. CAREY: Thank you, sir.

6 MR. NORMAN JONES: Good morning. My name is
7 Norman Jones and I'm reading this statement on behalf
8 of New York City Councilman Daniel Jones. While I
9 appreciate SAPO efforts to address this issue, I
10 believe that the proposed rules will have a
11 detrimental impact on the communities I represent and
12 the organizations that serve them. [unintelligible]
13 [11:47:34] district which encompasses Jackson Heights
14 and Elmhurst Queens, host many ethnic and cultural
15 events throughout the year including street festivals.
16 I ask that you tailor rules to consider events,
17 especially outside of Manhattan that are more grass
18 roots in their origin and focus.

19 Festivals provide a wonderful means for
20 members of certain communities to connect with other
21 and align our neighborhood. Us- Us-, almost 25 years
22 ago, I invited the Queens Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and
23 Transgender pride and pride parade at festivals to
24 combat homophobia and transphobia. The event has
25 grown into a premiere pride event. And one keep

1 component has been the multicultural festival.
2 Visibility at parades and festivals is key to progress
3 in the eligible team with me. But the propose rules
4 threaten the success of these modest size events which
5 serve a valuable, social and political purpose.

6 In addition the proposed rules potentially
7 impact a wide array of ethnic and religious events in
8 my district, including the Jackson Heights Bangladeshi
9 Business Association, MAYLA [phonetic]. I'd like to
10 highlight some of the points I made in the written
11 comments I'll be submitting.

12 First, the cap on multi block street
13 festivals should be raised to 15, and also there
14 should be a procedure for community boards to weight
15 this. Especially where smaller [unintelligible]
16 [11:48:45] are concerned. Second, the requirement
17 that 50 percent of exhibitor be local would especially
18 for a bank that dropped them wide geo- geographic
19 area, especially pride events. I ask that you
20 consider other ways to encourage local participation.

21 Next the restriction to one street festival
22 per organization per year would impact organizations
23 that hold festivals as part of their service --
24 holding multiple festivals such a requirement should
25 be rejected or include a waiver. Finally, the flat

1 per block fee would be unduly harsh on events that do
2 not make that much money or that might not use all the
3 blocks they originally planned to use. I strongly
4 urge to revise the rules based on these comments and
5 input from impacted community based organizations.
6 Thank you for the opportunity to speak.

7 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

8 MS. ASHLEY: Maria Torniali. Marie from
9 Steinway --

10 MS. MARIA TORNIALI: That's me.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Yep.

12 MS. TORNIALI: Good morning, Director Carey.

13 MR. CAREY: Good morning.

14 MS. TORNIALI: And colleagues. I did -- I
15 am a Marie Torniali from the Steinway Street business
16 improvement district. And we applaud the fact that
17 you have looked over the street fair regulations;
18 however, we are in opposition of three of them. The
19 cap on the multi block street fairs at ten would not
20 achievable or good in Astoria Queens, which is where I
21 am from, or Community Board One as we already have 12
22 that are by different, that have major stakeholders in
23 the community and on the district where they hold the
24 street fair. The proceeds by, by the way, are also
25 used for events, programming, hallway lighting and

1 like on the districts.

2 In reference to the proposed rules that
3 vendor participation be submitted 30 days prior, I
4 must say having sponsored street fairs for more than
5 20 years on Steinway Street, I can attest that neither
6 outside vendors or businesses signed up 30 days in
7 advance. They're very cognizant of the impact of the
8 weather as it's a huge factor on how they will do.
9 So, at best five days, seven days when they get the
10 weather forecast for the week.

11 Thirdly, while we -- it is great to ha-, 50
12 percent of the vendors to come from within the local
13 community board, this again is not achievable. We
14 have tried everything. While we do get a good
15 participation, we think from our merchants, this is
16 through incentives, we hardly -- their fee is very
17 low, nominal. This -- as some of them -- is -- as
18 somebody else pointed out it just doesn't work for
19 them to go on the street. They have to hire more
20 help.

21 We also give free spots to community groups
22 and to arrests and other not-for-profit organizations.
23 So, perhaps asking that the vendors come from New York
24 City or I don't know Queens perhaps, that's for you to
25 decide, but the local community board is unachievable.

1 Thank you.

2 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

3 MS. ASHLEY: Neil from the Central Astoria
4 Development. And then after that we'll have Michael
5 Tisi from Mardi Gras.

6 MR. NEIL: Good morning and thank you very
7 much for the opportunity to testify today.

8 MR. CAREY: Good morning, sir.

9 MR. NEIL: I think the previous speakers
10 have more than eloquently presented the case against
11 the proposed changes that you're willing to make.

12 The things that are troubling us is the fact
13 that who is going to make the decision as to which
14 groups get a license and which groups cannot get one
15 because in our district there are 12. So, you're
16 going to start a situation where you're going to have
17 neighbor against neighbor vying for this, for these
18 permits. Are we going to go back to favoritism and
19 possibly other reasons that everybody's going to
20 assume? So, we urge you from that standpoint, from
21 the grassroots standpoint, you've heard all the
22 reasons why this is not a go, go. I'd like to stop at
23 that point and save some time for everybody. Thank
24 you very much.

25 MS. ASHLEY: And then after Michael we have

1 Dori Lamo, also from Mardi Gras.

2 MR. MICHAEL TISI: Good afternoon. My name
3 is Michael Tisi and I work for Mardi Gras productions
4 for 21 years. I've worked very closely with many,
5 many street fair vendors over the years.

6 The new rules proposed by OCECM will
7 basically destroy the businesses of many vendors who
8 are immigrants, minorities, woman and new arrivals to
9 our great city. These vendors who am I proud to call
10 my friends are tax payers and good honest citizens.
11 Cutting the number of street fairs that take place in
12 Manhattan annually in half will do the opposite of
13 what our great mayor has always fought for. Mayor de
14 Blasio's vision is and I quote, New York City will
15 have an inclusive equitable economy that offers well-
16 paying jobs and opportunities for all New Yorkers to
17 live with dignity and security. I implore the mayor
18 of our great city to stop the proposed rules before a
19 great injustice is done. Thank you.

20 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

21 MS. DORI LAMO: Hello.

22 MR. CAREY: Good morning.

23 MS. LAMO: Actually I'm a vendor, I'm not
24 staff or something. I'm a vendor. I'm an immigrant
25 from Tibet since 2005. I'm a single mother of four

1 kids. I used to work, like eight years ago, I used to
2 work like two job. And it is really tough because
3 like you -- when you have four kids, like, most of the
4 women knows about how to raise the kids, you know,
5 it's so difficult, but my kids are falling apart,
6 because I cannot give them 100 percent for there -- I
7 get any --

8 Then I found out the street fair. And
9 street fair save my family because I can focus on my
10 kids for five days and the school from their academic
11 achievement and two days I can work in a street fair
12 which that money it feeds for my kids. And, and I pay
13 tax to city and my revenue is almost 200 to 300,000
14 which I every year I'm giving to city and federal. s.
15 The tourists -- because I, I -- two days I work in the
16 street fair, lot of tourists they enjoy, you know,
17 what we sell. They love it. And since I have like so
18 many dependents, I never took any benefit from City.
19 I bring up all my four kids by myself.

20 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 7: Yeah.

21 MS. LAMO: Income from street fair. And I
22 request to City, we need more in Time Square. We need
23 more in Time Square. And most of street fair are
24 owned by women; 59 percent are women owned business.
25 It's not easy job in street fair. It's really hard.

1 I drive truck, big truck.

2 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

3 MS. LAMO: Yeah. Everybody knows and I
4 [unintelligible] [11:57:28] such a huge box maybe like
5 30 pounds myself. I, I do every weekend, you know.

6 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 6: Me too.

7 MS. LAMO: Yeah. And I'm sure that city
8 will take care of 99 percent, not for the one percent.
9 Yeah. And [unintelligible] [11:57:46] like big hotel,
10 the big hotel, maybe they have some problem, you know,
11 because they have some difficulty, but that's only for
12 two days. Yeah. One day because we don't have much
13 in Time Square these day because City cut off
14 everything and we are struggling this year. We don't
15 have any business. It's so bad shape because we have
16 -- used to have Seventh Avenue which is really good.

17 We had -- used to have lot of in Broadway in
18 Time Square, which is good, because we make only -- we
19 don't make much money in downtown because it's tough.
20 There's no tourists. So, I'm sure, you know, like
21 city will help us, you know, to be better future for
22 my kids, and I want to see my kids in the workplace
23 one day. Thank you.

24 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

25 MS. ASHLEY: This last name I can't read it,

1 but it's from Mardi Gras and it's Fo -- F-O-V-X, I
2 think? Or something with an F. Can you -- someone
3 with an F, F-O-- I'll, I'll come back to you.

4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 8: Maybe Alfredo?

5 MS. ASHLEY: Huh?

6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 8: Okay.

7 MR. CAREY: Let's skip that one.

8 MS. ASHLEY: We'll skip it. Maybe I'll have
9 someone else read it. Fred, Fred Arcaro?

10 MR. FRED ARCARO: Yes.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Yep, that's him.

12 MR. ARCARO: Just about the afternoon, 12:00
13 p.m., noon. I'll be speaking on behalf of two
14 organizations. My name is Fred Arcaro, president of
15 Manhattan East Community Associa- Association. Thank
16 you for the opportunity to speak today about the
17 proposed street festival regulation.

18 While SAPO proposal, proposed rule to have
19 at least 50 percent of local, small business
20 participation is commendable; however, it is next to
21 impossible to achieve. The reasons, local -- the
22 location assigned for our street fair have very few
23 local businesses. The few businesses there are there,
24 either don't are not interested or complaint about the
25 fees are being too costly. And certainly, the newly

1 priced fee structure will only make that more costly.

2 Street vendors that do participate in our
3 street fair are small mom and pop businesses living in
4 the Uni-, in the New York City which pay their taxes,
5 just like anybody else. The proposed rule will reduce
6 their income drastically. Reducing the number of
7 street fairs per community boards I fear is the
8 beginning of the end of well-established neighborhood
9 association such as Manhattan East Community
10 Association which has been in existence since 1994.

11 We have sponsored annual street fairs for
12 over 20 years, and it should continue. We have used
13 all our funds, from the street fair, our only source
14 of fun- funds to beautify our neighborhood, to -- by,
15 by plantings, cleaning, installing dog
16 [unintelligible] [12:01:08] of street beds. In
17 addition to planting in the water fou-, East River
18 Esplanade, when funds are available. I'm also the
19 trustees of the 17th Precinct Council -- Community
20 Council, and I am authorized to speak on its behalf.
21 Funds from the street fairs are their only source in-,
22 revenue to promote li-, public safety issues to our
23 residences. Sa-, such as night out against crime when
24 hundreds of families come with their children to get
25 the latest crime prevention tips and police updates

1 while enjoying music, entertainment, food and children
2 have fun with tumble house.

3 We sponsor [unintelligible] [12:01:56] night
4 we were honor our police pr- precinct officers who are
5 recently awarded for their special service as well as
6 getting the latest police updates for a, all in our
7 din- dining setting. We have monthly meetings where
8 we have guest speakers to give valuable public safety
9 and other community affairs information. All these
10 activities would not be possible without st- street
11 fair revenue.

12 In closing, are -- both or- organization
13 oppose the proposed ruling and hope that you
14 reconsider. As, as a personal note, I feel that we're
15 losing the community spirit. Our neighborhood
16 association is the glue for, for our unity. Take that
17 away you'll lose our unity. Thank you.

18 MS. ASHLEY: Next we Vani and then it will
19 be Barbara from OR OLAM.

20 MR. CAREY: Yep, just leave it there.

21 MR. HABIB VANI: Good afternoon, sir. My
22 name is Habib Vani [phonetic]. I'm the vendor of the
23 street fairs. I've been doing street fair past 17
24 years for the Mardi Gras, Clear View, and
25 [unintelligible] [12:03:11].

1 Sir, do to these cuts, it definitely effect
2 all the vendors, especially Midtown, Seventh Avenue,
3 and studio by me, first of all, I have a support my
4 mother which is disabled, I have to afford her
5 insurance. My father disable immigrant from Kashmiri,
6 India, Kashmiri is a very conflicted part in the
7 world, and my fa-, I, I cannot really afford to have
8 my family there, but bring them here. And obviously I
9 have to be able to expense because I cannot go to
10 government to ask for assistance.

11 The question is we cannot really -- I, I can
12 make living only on a street fair from past 15 years,
13 and we just humbling to [unintelligible] [12:04:01]
14 for the -- not to curve these street fairs. We really
15 need to -- this is the only source for me and my
16 family and the rest of the vendors, and, and that's
17 all I can say.

18 And I can only -- another thing, my expenses
19 I can only complete through the fairs, which is my
20 mother's insurance which is 70-, \$700 a month, \$540 a
21 month to me, and \$490 to my dad just give me God's
22 sake where I'm going to get this money if I don't work
23 on the street fair? But otherwise I have no option
24 but the government. Thank you. Thank you Mardi Gras,
25 Clearview and [unintelligible] [12:04:39].

1 MS. ASHLEY: Barbara.

2 MS. BARBARA GERBER-KRASNA: I'm Barbara
3 Gerber-Krasna, the President of OR OLAM East 55th
4 Street Synagogue, located at 308 East 55th Street off
5 of Second Avenue. I reside at 140 East 56th Street
6 off of Lexington Avenue.

7 My synagogue has been the sponsor for more
8 than 20 years at the Lexington Street Fair and it has
9 been able because of the revenue earned from being the
10 sponsor to sponsor other social organizations at my
11 synagogue. Every Wednesday we have a non-
12 denominational alcoholics anonymous meeting. We have
13 on Thursdays a meeting of learning disabled adults.
14 We run a clothing drive that is for the homeless
15 shelters. We run a top -- Toys for Tots operation
16 around the Christmas holiday and now Hanukah holiday.
17 We have been able to allow people from the area who
18 live in rent stabilized apartments. We're Indy Plus,
19 and they've been in the neighborhood for many, many
20 years to participate in our ci-, excuse me, in our
21 services at no cost, because of the fact that they
22 can't afford to do so.

23 So, your revenue, which I have to say has
24 gone from 15,000 for us down to about 8,000 over the
25 years is still a revenue that helps us to fray our

1 expenses for these free services.

2 I also want to say that as a resident in the
3 area, I have also been a consumer from the vendors in
4 that area. I admire the diversity of the vendors.
5 The food that is provided -- now I can't eat a lot of
6 the food because I'm Kosher, but I do know that the
7 food that is there, the tourists adore. They really
8 love the crepes, they love the corn, they love the
9 ethnic food of Thai, [unintelligible] [12:06:56], the
10 Chinese cuisine, the Indian cuisine. They enjoy
11 buying the spices that they normally can't even get in
12 the local supermarkets.

13 And I want to say that the rents in New
14 York, especially Manhattan, have gone up so high, a
15 store from around the corner where I live, a framing
16 store, had to move out because the rent from \$10,000 a
17 month to \$18,000 a month. Do you think that those
18 vendors are going to want to spend more money on
19 street fairs?

20 Yet, I can say one thing that I've noted,
21 because I have personally sat at the table during
22 these years, and that is that the store, near the
23 corner of 56th, which is owned by people of Indian
24 background, selling some of their ethnic jewelry and
25 also ethnic blouses etcetera, stay open on the day of

1 the fair and benefit from these increased traffics.
2 There are other shops that have stayed open. Maybe
3 they don't participate in the fair. They also benefit
4 from the increased traffic. So, I think that you have
5 to consider that the higher fees you want are going to
6 discourage anyone from wanting to be there, and that
7 the -- if I may so also, the percentage of vendors
8 that have to be from the area would be absurd, they
9 could not afford those rents. They certainly can't
10 reside in the area. And I think that these fairs do
11 benefit some of the residents of the area, and also
12 many of the tourists whom I have provided information
13 about everything in the area: restaurants, museums,
14 other shops -- okay. Thank you. Thank you for your
15 time.

16 MS. ASHLEY: Can we have Jun Na and then
17 Stacey Long. And then after we'll have Susan Demihand
18 [phonetic].

19 MR. JUN NA: Hello. And thank you for the
20 opportunity to speak. My name is Jun Na and this is
21 my wife Stacey Long. We have three young daughters
22 and we live in Brooklyn, New York. We design and make
23 our own line of jewelry.

24 We started street fairs tw-, 12 years ago.
25 And it allowed us to leave our professional jobs so we

1 are very grateful, but the same time, deeply relying
2 on street fairs. As we were growing up, we were
3 taught to become more successful in life, you have to
4 work hard. And me, my fellow vendors, we put our
5 blood, sweat and tears into making these fairs
6 successful.

7 Street fairs are more unique than the
8 streets of New York itself. If you walk down the
9 streets today, all you see are franchises, pharmacies
10 and banks. Where's the uniqueness in that? We bring
11 our handmade crafts and merchandise that are actually
12 made by New Yorkers, not just tube socks and shish-
13 kebabs.

14 Most small businesses are being driven out
15 of Manhattan due to expense events. So, this is our
16 only outlet for us to distribute and promote our
17 products. Any changes or cuts will cripple our
18 livelihood and give us nothing to fall back on.

19 MS. SUSAN DEMIHAND: Hi. First of all, I'd
20 like to say I'd like to meet you, you look great in
21 that suit.

22 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

23 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

24 MS. DEMIHAND: I would like to really --
25 maybe I'm embarrassed to say this -- I'm a little

1 embarrassed to stay this, I took care of my mom when
2 she was young, she was sick. She got no education. I
3 never had an opportunity in life to do something. I
4 don't have no education to work at a McDonalds or
5 anything. So, I have this job and whoever is
6 controlling this, please don't take my job away.
7 Thank you.

8 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

9 MS. ASHLEY: Gloria Moloney from Dutch Kills
10 Civic. Gloria? Okay good. And then after that we'll
11 have Dennis from the Sama-, Samaritan Daytop Village.

12 MS. GLORIA MOLONEY: Good afternoon.

13 MR. CAREY: Good afternoon.

14 MS. MOLONEY: My name is Gloria Moloney.
15 I'm with the Dutch Kills Civic Association in Long
16 Island City, Queens. I don't want to be repetitive.
17 I think you've heard enough from everybody, and I
18 think you really know which way this has to go.

19 But saying that, we have a civic
20 organization that's been around for 35 years,
21 homeowners and renters in the neighborhood. We
22 provide meetings every month for them. We provide
23 speakers for them. We have other activities, we give
24 scholarship awards through ten schools every June,
25 and we have a small street fair, it's nothing huge.

1 It's the only one on this avenue that we have,
2 there's no other street fairs on this avenue. It's
3 only about six, seven blocks.

4 But the revenue that we get from this street
5 fair helps to fund our organization to keep us going
6 ou-, the money that we need to keep going and the
7 money that we need to give these scholarship awards
8 and whatever else we have to do. The people that
9 live in the neighborhood like it. We have a lot of
10 hotels now. This is a new booming area. There's a
11 lot of hotels. There's new residential finally
12 coming in after 20 years. And it shows off the
13 neighborhood to these people who are new to the
14 neighborhood. They come up, they see the stores,
15 they see the restaurants that are there.

16 You're not going to get the people to
17 participate that have stores on this avenue. First
18 of all, majority of them are cleaner, hair salon,
19 candy store, a bodega, you know, they're not going to
20 take tables at the street fair, but the vendors are
21 there. And the vendors work very hard and without
22 the street fair it would severely inhibit what we
23 could do with our organization, and I think listening
24 to everybody else that was here it's quite evident
25 what has to be done. So, thank you very much.

1 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

2 MR. DENNIS KAWAS: Good afternoon. My name
3 is Dennis Kawas. I'm the Director of Family Services
4 for Samaritan Daytop Village. Thank you for hearing
5 me today. About ten days ago I guess, I got an, an e-
6 mail from Clearview, my friend at Clearview alerting
7 me to what was being proposed. These, these rule
8 changes and which brings me here.

9 Samaritan Village, I, I just want to talk a
10 little bit about my agency and the work we do.
11 Sanitarian Village is a premiere health and human
12 services agency providing services to other 28,000 New
13 Yorkers annually. We serve men, women, adolescents,
14 young mothers and infants with substance use issues,
15 military veterans, senior citizens, and families of
16 substance users. In 50 facilities throughout New York
17 City, Long Island, and upstate New York, we offer
18 substance use services, health and mental health
19 programs, a senior center, recovery services to
20 reinforce independent living in the community, and
21 shelter and permanent housing.

22 You know, as I'm sitting here, I'm thinking
23 to myself, as a side note, that if the, if thi-, if
24 these rule changes go through we'll be seeing more
25 people in our shelter system. These very small

1 business owners will -- have nowhere to go and nowhere
2 to live.

3 Within the community board that we operate
4 our, our festival in, it's a new festival and we move
5 from community bo-, community board five to four, we
6 have three of our facilities, a, a very long standing
7 facility on, on 43rd Street, we have a, a residential
8 facility for veterans on 44th Street. We, we have a
9 facility which -- for supportive services, for
10 veterans and their families and on 35th an outpatient
11 facility.

12 Our main focus for our festival is, is -- in
13 sponsoring the festival on Ninth Avenue is of, of
14 community outreach. To let the community that we're
15 fighting the fight against homelessness and the rising
16 epidemic of substance use and to inform residents of
17 the services available to them through our vast array
18 of programs. We believe it's important to the
19 community residents to have opportunities to learn
20 about the resources available to them. That is why we
21 strongly believe the continuation of this, these
22 festivals would be a huge asset to the community and I
23 implore you to please take a look at the suggested
24 amendments proposed by Clearview Festivals. Thank you
25 very much.

1 MR. CAREY: Thank you, sir.

2 MS. ASHLEY: Next we have Keith Santangelo
3 [phonetic]. And then after him Joe Dalchard
4 [phonetic]. I think I said that correctly. Keith
5 Santangelo? Not here. Okay. Joe, Joe -- there you
6 go.

7 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 8: Who's next?

8 MS. ASHLEY: And then after Joe it's Suneal
9 Jan [phonetic].

10 MR. JOE DALCHAND: Good afternoon everyone.
11 My name is Joe Dalchand. I was originally from
12 British Guyana. I came to this country in 1979. When
13 you come to this country, everybody says you're going
14 to get the American Dream. So, I sta-, I -- my father
15 died when I was 11 years old. I went -- in 1986, I
16 was working for a necktie company, they were paying me
17 3.35 an hour. So, I met someone there when I was
18 doing the street fair, they said why are you wasting
19 your time here? Come and do the street fair. So, I
20 bought some neck ties, I went to the street fair, and
21 some tube socks. And I started my business there.

22 From 19-, from 1986 and on to today, I'm
23 doing the street fair, and I'm making a very good
24 living doing that. And by cutting these street fair
25 down -- you need to add some street fair, so every one

1 of these vendors could have the American Dreams.

2 I stron-, in 1986, I started with a 10 x 10,
3 right now, I'm doing, I'm doing two location at 10 x
4 40, two location. I have four brothers and four
5 sisters, five of them is helping me on the weekends so
6 they could survive. They, they can't make enough with
7 their job, so I help them out.

8 And I heard a gentleman saying here earlier
9 that oh, that tourists, with the street fair in Time
10 Square that they're blocking up his hotel. Every
11 person that comes out of that Hyatt, that buys from
12 me, they're like oh my God, this is the greatest thing
13 I ever seen in my life. We are so lucky to stay here.
14 The next time I come to New York, I want to stay in
15 that hotel. And it's -- so, I mean, so, the gentleman
16 from Hyatt should thank the street fair, not complain
17 against the street fair. The, the tourists don't come
18 to look at buildings and light. They come to see
19 attraction and we give them great food, great
20 merchandise, and great atmosphere and they all love
21 it. They said this is the best thing they ever seen
22 in their life is coming to New York and see this. If
23 I would get a dollar for every time they ask me where
24 I'm going to be next, I'll be a multimillionaire.

25 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 6: Me too.

1 MR. DALCHAND: I'll make so money it's
2 unbelievable with every -- they want to know, oh,
3 where are you going tomorrow? I'm like sir, we don't
4 have any street fair. Are you serious? Yeah, I'm
5 sorry, we don't have anymore. So, instead of cutting
6 street fair, we need to add street fair.

7 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 8: Yes, sir.

8 MS. ASHLEY: You still have time if you
9 want.

10 MR. DALCHAND: Oh, I still have time. Yes.
11 So, all I'm saying is please don't cut any street
12 fair. I need more street fair in Time Square so I can
13 survive. I have a wife and kids and without the
14 street fair I got to look for government help and you
15 can't live on government help.

16 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 8: We can't live on the
17 government. No. No. No government.

18 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

19 MR. DALCHAND: A one-bedroom apartment in
20 Queens in \$1,700. Two-bedroom is 2,200. Where am I
21 going to get that money? You can't go work for
22 McDonalds making \$15 an hour. Where are you going to
23 make that money?

24 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 7: It's 9.75.

25 MR. DALCHAND: \$9.75. My bad. I'm sorry.

1 So, what I'm saying here, please --

2 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

3 MR. DALCHAND: -- don't, don't cut any
4 street fair. Just leave it the way it is. If you
5 want to do something please add street fair. We all
6 need to work. Look at all these people here, they all
7 need to work. You don't want them to be homeless.

8 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 8: Yes.

9 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 6: Please save our
10 jobs.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Well, you still have time, but,
12 you -- if you want to let other people go, we have 85
13 people.

14 MR. DALCHAND: Okay. I'm good thank you.

15 MS. ASHLEY: Alright. Suneal Jan. And then
16 after that we have Michelle Winfield.

17 MR. SUNEAL JAN: My name is Suneal, but my
18 name is not important. The reason why I've come, that
19 is more important for me. I heard the news by the
20 Mardi Gras Production that City is reducing the street
21 fair to a great extent. I came to this country in
22 1999, and in 2001, I start doing the street fairs. I
23 have two kids. They're born in USA. And they used to
24 come with me in the street fair when they are six
25 month and infants. And now they're grown up, 16 and

1 14. The people used to say, oh, they were born in the
2 flea market or state fair. But there's no other way
3 to do, to make the money in New York City.

4 So, the -- what is street fair
5 [unintelligible] [12:20:22]. Street fair is that true
6 faith of New York City. You see the whole New York
7 City in the street fair. How they're different,
8 different people belong to different religions, cars,
9 countries and race. They bring people together, and
10 putting there and bringing their stuff from their
11 country, from their [unintelligible] [12:20:42]
12 Kashmir to Kenya, Africa to Australia [unintelligible]
13 [12:20:44] in the [unintelligible] [12:20:45] of their
14 stuff, ethnic to different custom stuff to sell. And
15 the people they like their stuff.

16 The businessmen, the big businesses in the
17 New York City, they're not seeing this stuff. And the
18 people, who the tourists, they like this stuff and
19 they buy this stuff. And they are happy to buy that.
20 One of the gentleman in the previous -- I heard that
21 the City is cutting the street fair due the heightened
22 traffic on weekends, but on the weekends is less
23 traffic than the, than the big, the big days. The big
24 days, they're [unintelligible] [12:21:18] and this
25 condition that in the weekend.

1 So, when the City needs some regulations to
2 curtail the traffic on the weekdays? Because on the
3 weekend there is already less traffic and less
4 congestion. And that is true [unintelligible]
5 [12:21:35] and an accent to deprive the hardworking
6 street fair vendors of their income. I think that the
7 proposed rules are introduced to satisfy of handful of
8 big businessmen in the [unintelligible] [12:21:52] and
9 because of thousands of hardworking vendors like us.

10 So, I ask -- I request the City not to
11 reduce the number of street fair, but we have to
12 increase the number of street fair throughout the year
13 and in the winter too. So, that the -- we can make
14 more money and be more [unintelligible] [12:22:11] the
15 community of the Ne-, of the New York City. Thank you
16 very much.

17 MS. MICHELLE WINFIELD: Michelle Winfield.
18 I am proudly answering the clarion call, the State of
19 New York City street fairs. The Samuel J. Tilden
20 Democratic Club has participated in the Third Avenue
21 street fair since 1983 and has donated over \$300,000
22 to projects in the com- community board six area on
23 the east side. The bus-, the revenues benefit our
24 community and I am opposed to the 2017 rule changes
25 for street fairs.

1 After Superstorm Sandy in 2012, at Bellevue
2 Hospital, the clothing room was housed in the
3 basement, everything was destroyed. It was the Tilden
4 Club that replaced new underwear for patients to leave
5 the hospital from the street fair funds. There is
6 also a need to provide meals for homebound seniors
7 within the six board area. We did that.

8 [Unintelligible] [12:23:40] programs at the Friend
9 Seminary and the Brotherhood Synagogue serving
10 homeless have received support from Tilden. The
11 Gallup Autistic Children's Writing Program has
12 benefited. An environmental overnight retreat was
13 provided to the students at the school for the deaf
14 and hard of hearing. Funds have also been given to
15 the public library.

16 To deny donations for needy populations from
17 street revenues is wrong. To deny donations for art
18 and music program in our community is wrong. To deny
19 the ability to seniors to stroll down the avenues free
20 of cars is wrong. To deny our families to participate
21 in free activities in the fresh air is wrong. To deny
22 our residents the right to buy a new [unintelligible]
23 [12:24:38] at a street fair is wrong. Is this really
24 a war on immigrants who are the majority of the
25 workers at the fairs? And a line from the Hamilton

1 musical, it's the immigrants getting the job done.

2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 9: Yes.

3 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

4 MS. WINFIELD: So I -- so, I say enough is
5 enough. Leave the street fairs which helps make the
6 City a vibrant place to live vote no, reject the 2017
7 rule changes for street fairs. I thank you.

8 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

9 MS. ASHLEY: Jennifer from the French
10 Institute Alliance. And then Richard from Mardi Gras.
11 Did you want to speak -- I, I just have the first name
12 Richard. Not here? Okay.

13 MS. JENNIFER HERLEIN: Hello.

14 MR. CAREY: Good afternoon.

15 MS. HERLEIN: First of all, thank you for
16 giving us this opportunity. My name is Jennifer
17 Herlein, and I'm here on behalf of the French
18 Institute Alliance Française and its president Marie-
19 Monique Steckel. And I'm here expressly to make it
20 clear that we oppose to the proposed changes to the
21 city's street fairs. And I know a lot of really great
22 points have been brought up from people in the rooms.

23 I'm going to keep my remarks rather brief,
24 but just to give you a little bit of context, we are a
25 501 (C) (3) not for profit organization, and our

1 mission is to offer education and programs in the arts
2 that promote French culture -- the diversity and
3 enrichment of French culture.

4 And we host an annual Bastille Day
5 celebration on 60th in between Pa-, Fifth Avenue and
6 Lexington Avenue on or around the date of Bastille Day
7 in July. And this festival has given us a really
8 invaluable way to pursue our mission. And the
9 festival has been going on for about 20 years. And
10 this year we welcome 40,000 people, some -- both New
11 Yorkers, tourists, people from all over the place, not
12 necessarily just from our area. And we were also
13 thrilled to have 70 vendors who participated in our
14 festival. And this festival allows French and French
15 inspired businesses, many of th-, which are small
16 businesses and some which are not French oriented
17 businesses, the opportunity to reach a public that
18 they would not otherwise reach. And for us as an
19 organization, it's, it's an extremely invaluable way
20 that we do community outreach and promote what we're
21 offering and, and get new members, get new students.

22 Our festival is free and open to the public.
23 We offer different set of programming inside because
24 our building is located in the heart of the festival.

25 The proposed 50 percent rule would end our

1 festival because of the nature of it. It's a cultural
2 festival and in order to promote French and
3 francophone festivals. We welcome vendors from all
4 over the place and for us that's an important way to
5 showcase what we do and what we're about.

6 So, I most certainly hope that this rule
7 doesn't go through and that will be limited to our
8 community district which is not all French
9 organizations. So, I thank you for your time. Thank
10 you.

11 MR. CAREY: Thanks.

12 MS. ASHLEY: Next Bill Boreck from the Union
13 Square Community Coalition. And then after Bill, we
14 have John Mudd from the Midtown Council. Bill?

15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 9: I think Bill stepped
16 out to the restroom.

17 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. I'll come back to him.
18 John Mudd?

19 MR. JOHN MUDD: Hi. My name is John Mudd.
20 I'm with the Midtown Community Council. It's Midtown
21 South Community Council. It's -- we're with board
22 four and board five area. I'm, I'm so impressed with
23 all the outpour from the people and the not-for-profit
24 groups that are thriving off some of these funds. And
25 we're, we're no exception. I don't see how any other

1 answer could be had.

2 I don't even know why we weren't even called
3 in when these rules were, were being thought about.
4 And I'm, I'm hoping that we're, we're not decided on
5 the rules, and that we're just here as, as -- to allow
6 our voice to be heard. It's an impressive group. And
7 I, I echo everybody's sentiments.

8 And Wally's -- although I appreciate what
9 Wally's done for the community board four, but his
10 data cannot include these people and, and their
11 livelihoods, and, and if we're building a city, you
12 know, the City's for, for, for people basically, you
13 know, it's, it's -- we can't forget about -- all the
14 renter are, are sky high. The rents for residential,
15 rents for businesses. The people -- and we're not
16 really building a com- community this way. And, and,
17 you know, to, to think about cutting off the lifeline
18 is absurd. I mean ar- ar-, we're going to push
19 everybody into working for Wal-Mart? You know, I, I,
20 I can't, I can't fathom the idea of, of, of cutting
21 lifeline because it might be upsetting to a small
22 group. We have to think of all of us rather than just
23 maybe the -- a small group.

24 I don't know whether it's come from Time
25 Square bid, or where this, this thought come from, but

1 it didn't certainly include the community boards, not
2 most of us anyway. It certainly didn't include the
3 council itself.

4 Now, let me, let me tell you a little about
5 us and then I'll leave it at because I don't want to
6 repeat everything. We've been in existence for 33
7 years. We -- well, the first decade or so, we had no
8 funding. Alright. This funding -- we've, we've,
9 we've been transforming the community council. We've
10 been part of -- we were very successful. We were very
11 involved with having the internet cut off on the kiosk
12 that were causing so much problems. We're working on
13 the homeless issues. We, we, we grew from a three
14 person board -- actually a two person board, and
15 somebody handwriting notes to building a, a wonderful
16 website, reaching out for, for support from -- we
17 have, we now have a beautification person involved.
18 We have a homeless outreach. We're, we're being --
19 we're very involved with. We're networking with the
20 mayor's office. We're networking with --

21 MS. TOLSON: Thank you for your time.

22 MR. MUDD: Time?

23 MS. TOLSON: Yeah.

24 MR. CAREY: Yep.

25 MR. MUDD: That went quick.

1 MS. ASHLEY: Is Bill Boreck here?

2 MR. MUDD: Anyway, I, I thank you.

3 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

4 MR. BILL BORECK: I guess it's afternoon
5 now. Good afternoon. My name is Bill Boreck. I'm a
6 board member of a group called the Union Square
7 Community Coalition that was formed in 1980, 36 years
8 ago to help improve the quality of the conditions in
9 Union Square Park.

10 We looked at the regulations and we actually
11 sp-, are a sponsor for one of the Clearview's Block
12 Assoc-, block street fairs, a multi block one. We
13 have some concerns. One concern was that I know Wally
14 Rubin from community board five mentioned the problem
15 of traffic -- actually some members of our board are
16 concerned about the traffic, but we were amazed that
17 in your 15 page document you used words about, and I
18 quote them, you write negative effects not serving the
19 public interests, burdens on, on the community and I
20 think you were referring to the traffic, but not, not
21 one place in your document did you have any
22 suggestions or talk about trying to do something about
23 the so-called problem.

24 So, we would suggest, and I think some
25 members, people here have talked about that when you

1 present a plan, it would be very good if you can
2 include some of the sponsors, some of the vendors here
3 and some of the producers because they could give you
4 the real story about what's going on, and what needs
5 to be done. I mean [unintelligible] [12:33:22], you
6 certainly have a blend of all kinds of people here,
7 making livings here. So, we hope that you haven't
8 come here with a decision already made and are just
9 having a performer, you know, public hearing. Of
10 course you've heard a lot of, a lot of good comments
11 from the people here.

12 Now, specifically for our view, we're
13 concerned about, for the vendors, the 50 percent
14 quota. We think that's really not workable, and
15 you've heard time and time again from the people here
16 that it's not good and how it will affect them. So,
17 from the vendor's point of view, we feel that's not
18 good. From a sponsor's point of view, we're in
19 community board five, we're not in the Time Square
20 area, we're in the lower area, but if you have a multi
21 block cap of 20 and there's -- as Wally said, there's
22 30, 40, 50, who's going to make the choice? I think
23 someone else said that. We get our main funds from
24 being a sponsor. So, who's going to make the choice
25 over 20? Do you just say pick it out of a hat and say

1 you won't get it anymore? And many, many groups won't
2 be able to get the funds. And you've heard about the
3 good work.

4 So, I -- in any amount of sa-, we submitted
5 it, a, a document to you, you know, our testimony.
6 It's a lot more than what I say, but I just want to
7 say since we have more time, just look at the faces of
8 the people here. You've heard their stories, you
9 know. There's more than one side to the story. So,
10 please, please, you know, we urge you not to pass the
11 regulations. That you should put it aside, talk to
12 the vendors, talk to the sponsors, talk to everybody,
13 get an idea, and then make a decision, but don't do it
14 now. We -- so, we urge you that it shouldn't be
15 passed and it should be delayed. Thank you.

16 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

17 MS. ASHLEY: [unintelligible] [12:35:09].

18 Arthur?

19 MR. ARTHUR PICCOLO: Chairman of the Bowling
20 Green Association. Dear Mr. Carey, I oppose all the
21 rule changes, but I have carefully reviewed the
22 proposed ru-, SAPO rule change 105 4(E), which would
23 drastically impact our organization, Bowling Green
24 Association as well as many, many other not-for-profit
25 groups. The new rule would require that 50 percent of

1 all vendors participate in New York street fairs,
2 you'd have a pre-existing business within the
3 community board area or some other involvement in that
4 community. The clear and unambiguous result of such a
5 rule change would be to eliminate every street fair in
6 New York City, and this is an impossible requirement,
7 as you well are well aware. No street fair can
8 possibly meet this proposed requirement regarding so
9 called local involvement, none ever has.

10 The very nature of street fairs in New York
11 City has always been that the important local
12 component is the sponsoring, not-for-profit group
13 responsible for each street fair. This is the core
14 logic of New York street fairs and has been for
15 generations.

16 The proposed rule change would drastically
17 alter the very useful formula that benefits so many to
18 be able to [unintelligible] [12:36:24] the draconian
19 new rule that will destroy the New York City street
20 fair tradition. A tradition that goes all the way to
21 colonial times and is an integral part of the very
22 fabric of our city and its street life. New York str-
23 , City street fairs likewise accomplish the important
24 role of providing many immigrants and members of
25 minorities the ability to support themselves and their

1 families by participating in street fairs.

2 Existing retail businesses, with their own
3 store fronts, in the district, have no need or
4 interest in participating in street fairs. They
5 already have well-appointed retail locations where
6 they can display and sell their products and services
7 for maximum effect. And who are these local business?

8 Local retail businesses in local Manhattan
9 and often elsewhere is confined to the likes of dry
10 cleaners, laundromats, nail salons, barbers, shoe
11 repairs, and a few other assorted business. The vast
12 majority of retail businesses in Manhattan are owned
13 by multinational and national conglomerates located
14 outside of New York City. As for others who might
15 have some existing involvement in the district, what -
16 - that is a useful vague nebulous term that means
17 nothing at all without a specific precise definition.

18 And even more, as those -- as there is no
19 logic as to why these individuals would want to
20 participate in street fairs simply because they have
21 some involvement in that district. Again, they have
22 always been [unintelligible] [12:37:43].

23 The very nature of street fairs is
24 inclusive. SAPO has no legal right to use a devious
25 misleading rule change to accomplish the unstated

1 goal, in this case, the elimination of all New York
2 City street fairs with an impossible requirement
3 beginning in 2017. Further to which, placing a rigid
4 geographic requirement on the right to do business in
5 specific communities in New York City is blatantly
6 illegal and discriminatory and forbidden by the U.S.
7 Constitution, the New York State Constitution, and the
8 New York City Charter. There is not a single other
9 provision of city government in New York City that
10 demands that in order to conduct legitimate business
11 within New York City that one must have a pre-existing
12 business in that community or some other involvement.

13 If Mayor de Blasio is not going to represent
14 all of us, I'm sure many of us can find a candidate to
15 support next year for mayor who will represent all New
16 Yorkers and not a few elite powerful groups.

17 MS. ASHLEY: Habib Vani.

18 MR. VANI: Actually, I, I finished.

19 MS. ASHLEY: You already went?

20 MR. VANI: Yeah. Oh.

21 MS. ASHLEY: Okay.

22 MR. VANI: If you want, I can go one more
23 time.

24 MS. ASHLEY: No. Robert Ashe from
25 Clearview. And then next after Robert, we have Nazir.

1 MR. ROBERT ASHE: Good morning Mr. Carey.
2 Good morning Ms. Tolson. Good morning ladies and
3 gentleman. My name is Robert Ashe. I'm the man-
4 managing director of Clearview Productions and Pop Up
5 New York Events. Today you have heard and will
6 continue to hear -- the testimonies of both sponsors
7 and organizations participate -- sponsoring
8 organizations and participating exhibitors who's
9 fundraising and livelihoods depend upon New York City
10 street fairs.

11 I'd like to take to this time to tell you
12 about the initiatives I have personally taken to
13 enhance New York City street fairs. Approximately
14 seven years ago, in an effort to incentivize artisans
15 and crafters to participate in traditional New York
16 City street fairs, I launched a reduced exhibit known
17 as my crafter's rate. Artisans and crafters could
18 participate in events managed by Clearview Productions
19 at drastically reduced rates. These crafters allowed
20 me the opportunity introducing an eclectic vendor base
21 to New York City street fairs. This vendor base in
22 turn was the foundation and launching platform of my
23 new Pop Up New York Events brand. If you're not aware
24 that's our cura-, culinary and craft band that you've
25 all heard of I'm sure.

1 Pop Up New York's mission is provide the
2 residents in, in -- residents and visitors of this
3 city, mem- memorable New York City com- community
4 street experience while showcasing local businesses,
5 artisans and up and coming culinary concepts. We do
6 this by inviting local merchants, yes, that's brick
7 and mortar businesses to participate in drastically
8 reduced rates. As well as working hand and hand with
9 city based [unintelligible] [12:40:48] incubators and
10 art and craft alliances to gather an Eleatic exhibitor
11 base not found in your classic street fair. We comp-,
12 compliment this by providing interactive games,
13 entertainment, visual art -- oh and picnic areas for
14 people to sit down. These are -- these up and coming
15 artisanal culinary minds that I mentioned come from
16 throughout the five boroughs and represent the
17 diversity and creativity that is truly New York City.

18 In 2015, Pop Up managed and produced three
19 unique multi block street experiences. This was just
20 the beginning. In 2016, I multiplied that number
21 tenfold by transforming over two dozen classic street
22 fairs in to our new pop up concept. This rapid growth
23 is a reflection of those communities and cities as a
24 whole embracing and loving this new concept.

25 This ne-, the new regulations if approved,

1 as proposed would drastically inhibit Pop Up New
2 York's mission of transforming New York City street
3 fairs. Therefore, I ask you to take a moment, review
4 what you're doing and give me the chance to continue
5 re- revitalizing and drai-, bringing unique
6 initiatives to New York City street events. Thank
7 you. Have a good day.

8 MS. ASHLEY: Nazir Azid. Nazir? Oh, yeah,
9 I'll come back to you. Swan Co-, Swan Conway? Swan
10 Conway? I'll come back. Alfredo Valahan?

11 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

12 MS. ASHLEY: Alfredo. Okay. Oh, someone
13 turned the light off in the back. Thank you. Allison
14 Tupper. Allison Tupper? They might be in the other
15 room. Leslie Brown?

16 MS. LESLIE BROWN: Good afternoon Director
17 Carey. I'm Leslie Brown. I'm the President of the
18 forest Hills Chamber of Commerce. It's my pleasure to
19 serve as chamber president, to have owned a business
20 in [unintelligible] [12:43:07], chosen to be a
21 lifelong resident of Forest Hills. I also understand
22 what it's like to run your own small company and I
23 know what the challenges of being self-employed
24 entails.

25 I'm here today to say that I am against the

1 proposals, and I'm just -- I'm to sp-, I'm here also
2 to speak about the p-, what the proposed rule changes
3 for street fairs would do to my small not-for-profit
4 organization. We represent over 200 small businesses
5 in Forest Hills. What this would do to our vendors,
6 to startup businesses, and to the community that loves
7 and supports our fairs.

8 The Forest Hills Chambers of Commerce has
9 held two fairs in the spring and the fall for over 16
10 years. By reducing our fairs to one puts us in
11 serious jeopardy of closing our doors. I urge you to
12 consider allowing all existing sponsoring
13 organizations, such as the Forest Hills Chamber to
14 continue to conduct two street fairs per calendar year
15 as has been our tradition. Families and businesses
16 alike look forward to coming out and being together as
17 one community to enjoy the sights, the sounds, and the
18 tastes of a New York street fair.

19 Required as the new proposed rules states
20 that 50 percent of particip- participating vendors
21 have a business or presence in the community board,
22 where a fair is taking place will in all actuality not
23 be possible. I am really proud to say that my fairs,
24 I have close to 40 percent participation of my
25 membership and I have been told that this one of the

1 highest participation rates. More than half of our
2 members join the street fairs. And I don't -- and I
3 don't see how I could be able to meet this 50 percent
4 requirement.

5 Many, many of our members sign up at the
6 last minute due to staffing or scheduling issues that
7 small businesses with only one, two or three employees
8 have. Some register late because they have not had
9 the time as they work in many cases seven days a week
10 to get everything in place in order to exhibit. The
11 current rule of providing the addresses and phone
12 numbers of participating vendors to be submitted 30
13 days in advance of the event would be quite a hardship
14 for so many. The more vendors we have, the better our
15 fair is.

16 I could say in my own words what the street
17 fairs have meant, and do mean to everyone involved
18 making them the great events that they are, but I
19 would like to read some comments from the people that
20 attend, work and support our fairs. The comments come
21 from a petition that I started on change.org a few
22 days ago, and as of today, I have well over 600
23 signatures in a very short time.

24 So, here are some of the comments. I'm a
25 full-time artist and in these fairs have let me grow

1 my small business. These fairs add so much to the
2 vibrancy and cultural fabric of New York City. Please
3 save the fairs, Jewel, New York City. The fair is our
4 community pride. It brings business to small
5 businesses such as us and we in turn pay taxes for the
6 city. The street fair cut will impact our business
7 greatly. Please do not cut the street fairs directly
8 or indirectly. Joselyn, Forest Hills, New York. I'm
9 signing because I love New York and I love street
10 fairs. When I visit New York, I always check out some
11 street fairs. It adds atmosphere to a city. Glenn
12 Larson all the way from Australia. One of the main
13 reasons I love visiting New York City is the street
14 fairs. It's so diverse with food and wears from so
15 many cultures. New York City would not be the same
16 without them. Roberta from East Branch, New York

17 MS. TOLSON: Thank you.

18 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you for your time.

19 MS. BROWN: Okay. Thank you.

20 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

21 MS. ASHLEY: Is Nazir -- I'm calling you
22 again. Nazir Asheep [phonetic]? No. Swan Conaway.
23 Okay. Allison Tupper? Alright. Kenya Cagle?

24 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 9: Right here.

25 MS. ASHLEY: Kenya? Okay. Great. After

1 that we have Brian McLaughlin.

2 MR. KENYA CAGLE: Good morning, ladies and
3 gentleman. My name is Kenya Cagle, and I'm the
4 Director of the Special Projects for ICE. ICE is the
5 Innovative Community Enterprises. And I appreciate
6 tonight -- today that you give me a chance to express
7 my opposition to the proposed changes of the street
8 rules.

9 For many years, ICE has used the street
10 fairs as a major annual fundraising. Not only does it
11 provide us financial means to fulfill our mission of
12 encouraging people, especially young people to open
13 small businesses, but it also give those people a path
14 to gain experience in rev-, in revenue so they can
15 grow their business into a brick and mortar shop of
16 their own. We have helped young people become
17 entrepreneurs to make money where they don't have to
18 rely on jobs in industry. Not long after the mor-
19 moratorium, half of our street fair was given to
20 another organization. This prohibited change to our
21 budget, greatly reduced our ability to force the small
22 business.

23 After review -- after reviewing the proposed
24 changes, I know that no one is going to be able to
25 meet a local business of, of quota for our vendors.

1 This means that we will not be eligible to sponsor a
2 street fair and we will not be able to help people any
3 longer. Instead of helping organizations, the
4 proposed changes will stifle and end our ability to
5 effectively help the people of New York City,
6 especially young people who are out here and they
7 cannot get normal jobs.

8 We help kids and young people that have had
9 harder times than anyone else. We know -- we know our
10 children. We know where they come from and they need
11 people like us to be able to guide them in the right
12 direction and street fairs is an opportunity for all
13 Americans and to -- and this proposal, even though it
14 may have been -- meant to be a good im-, proposal, it
15 discriminates against all of us, young people, poor
16 people, white people, it's a discriminatory thing and
17 we are very much against it. Thank you.

18 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

19 MS. ASHLEY: We have Brian McLaughlin.
20 Okay. Are you Brian?

21 MR. BRIAN MCLAUGHLIN: Yes, ma'am.

22 MS. ASHLEY: Okay, great.

23 MR. MCLAUGHLIN: Good afternoon. My name is
24 Brian McLaughlin. I'm the Executive Director of CORE,
25 the Congress of Racial Equality. We're founded in

1 1942 and next year is our 75th anniversary. Thank you
2 all for giving us the opportunity to speak against the
3 proposed 27 street fair rule changes.

4 CORE has been sponsoring street fairs in
5 Manhattan for over 20 years. I've been with CORE for
6 14 of those years and do not like what I've seen
7 happen. Since the moratorium was put into place, the
8 City has decreased the amount of street fairs taking
9 place each year. This has forced us to now share half
10 of our street fairs with another organization. Not
11 only does that decrease the amount of funds both
12 organizations can raise, but it also has competing
13 against each other for sponsors and vendors wasting
14 valuable time seeking support from companies that
15 might already have a booth in the other half of the
16 street fair.

17 The proposed 50 percent rule change means
18 that the vendor pool is going to shrink drastically.
19 No one will be able to meet it. It will further
20 exasperate the problems. Organizations are already
21 struggling economically from previous decisions by the
22 city, now might face the loss of participating in even
23 half of a street fair, reducing their already
24 decreasing budgets.

25 In other words, the proposed rule changes

1 are a slippery slope that will lead to the end of
2 organizations that depend on street fairs as their
3 major fundraiser for the year. Changing the
4 definition of street fair from community sponsored
5 event to street event sponsored by a community sponsor
6 headquarter [unintelligible] [12:51:52] as the
7 proposed event creates an economic test for
8 organizations seeking street fairs. For profit
9 business have difficulty maintaining rent in Manhattan
10 and you want to require non-profit organizations to
11 take on this financial burden.

12 As with CORE, many other organizations have
13 seen a 50 percent or more decrease in funds raised
14 because of decisions made by the city. Some of those
15 organizations can no longer afford to be headquartered
16 in Manhattan. So, first you take away their funding,
17 and then you place an economic test on them. This is
18 institutionalized economic discrimination. Now --
19 thank you.

20 After the Tulsa race riots in Oklahoma, over
21 1,200 black owned businesses and homes were destroyed,
22 the Tulsa City Commission and the Chamber of Commerce
23 worked together to change local laws making rebuilding
24 prohibitively expensive for the original owners. The
25 land would then be changed and redeveloped to

1 commercial and industrial, no longer residential.
2 These gradual changes we've seen from the street fair
3 rules have us simmering right now. And in light of
4 the proposed changes, we now refuse to be the
5 metaphorical frog in the pot as you bring the water to
6 boil. The stand with us -- to stand with all of us as
7 we say no economic discrimination and say no to the
8 prope-, proposed street fair changes. Thank you.

9 MS. ASHLEY: William Ritter. William
10 Ritter.

11 MR. WILLIAM RITTER: Good afternoon. My
12 name is William Ritter. I'm from Brooklyn, New York.
13 I'm one of the -- one of the only vendors here that
14 actually does something besides sell socks or sell
15 clothes or sell food which those are all great things.

16 We do rides. We are one of the -- we are
17 one of the premier ride vendors in the five boroughs.
18 We provide an experience that other vendors don't.
19 We, we help families build relationships when they
20 come to our, our beautiful festivals throughout the
21 five boroughs. We, we build a character. We build
22 stamina. We build an experience that, that children
23 around the five boroughs take to school, take to their
24 families, take to everyday life.

25 Due to budget cuts in schools throughout the

1 five boroughs, kids don't have the space to have fun.
2 The parks are being re- rebuilt. The atmospheres are,
3 are dropping. And people don't have the space. But,
4 but what they do have -- what they can afford is a
5 street festival. They can't go the Lion King like
6 some people said. They can't go to an NBA game.
7 They, they can ride on our rides. That, that costs
8 pennies on a dollar. Or they can have an expe-,
9 that's what, that's what I'm here to say. That, that
10 we, we -- these festivals mean the world to me. From
11 a guy who grew up in Sunset Park Brooklyn, where every
12 person in my family was a gang member or was in jail,
13 a street festival gave me on my first job. My
14 opportunity to build a better life for my family. And
15 that's, that's all I want to say today. Thank you.

16 MS. ASHLEY: We have Melissa Chapman from
17 the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce and then after that
18 Kathy Jolowicz. Okay.

19 MS. MELISSA CHAPMAN: Good afternoon, Mr.
20 Carey, staff and guests. I'm Melissa Chapman. I
21 serve as a senior vice president for public affairs in
22 the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce. The Brooklyn
23 Chamber of Commerce is a membership based business
24 organization that represents the interests of over
25 2,100 member businesses as well as other businesses

1 across the borough of Brooklyn.

2 Today we respectfully ask for amendments to
3 the proposed rules that would see a more practical
4 implementation of the 50 percent local vendor
5 participation requirement as well as shorter lead time
6 to provide a list of anticipated vendor participants
7 in order for a permit to be issued.

8 As a voice of the Brooklyn business
9 community, we manage a number of shop local
10 initiatives. As such we applaud the end goal of, of
11 an increase in local vendor participation and street
12 events. However, rushed implementation will threaten
13 the very existence of these events. It will be better
14 to have a two to three year period by which community
15 organizations and sponsors will be required to be
16 compliant with the new rules governing the
17 participation. In addition, changing the definition
18 of local to include neighboring community boards and
19 zip codes would allow more flexibility in meeting such
20 a goal while still insuring a more robust, local
21 presence at these street events.

22 Another well-meaning prevention as you've
23 heard before is the 30 day leave time with which to
24 provide of local participants and all participants as
25 a matter of fact. I -- as you've heard, again, very

1 often, small businesses are unable to make commitments
2 that far in advance since this issue is regarding
3 staffing and other resources cannot be confirmed
4 beyond a week. As such we hope that the proposed
5 rules take this into consideration and make the
6 requirement one week instead.

7 Collectively these amen- amendments will
8 give community sponsors adequate time to be compliment
9 with the proposed rules. They will also help to
10 strike a balance between preserving these events and a
11 steady increase in local vendor participation. Thank
12 you for the opportunity to testify.

13 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

14 MS. ASHLEY: Kathy Jolowicz and Kayani Facey
15 or Fasi from Kreativivity Kustom.

16 MS. KATHY JOLOWICZ: Hello. I'm Kathy
17 Jolowicz. As a community leader and founding member
18 of both the 16 Block East 83rd, 84th Street Block
19 Association and the 19th Precinct Community Council
20 both started in 1973. We are against the city's new
21 plan for curbing street fairs and fundraising
22 opportunities for charitable sponsors.

23 As a present vice president of the 44 year
24 old 19th Precinct Community Council, I wish to inform
25 you that besides bringing the community and the police

1 together in a crime prevention forum. We also provide
2 the police with needed funds to support fallen and or
3 injured officers and their families, pay for necessary
4 supplies and projects for the precinct which are not
5 readily available from the City. And monetarily
6 support NYPD generated programs and more.

7 When we started we funded the Stanley
8 Isaack's projects youth programs such as the
9 basketball tournaments and leagues. Later precinct
10 council members also participated in the 19th precinct
11 funded baseball team whose star member was a CBS TV
12 news anchor, Jim Jenson. And where we competed
13 against other community teams in the baseball field
14 under the 59th Street Bridge. We also funded the
15 successful choose a subject, teach a kid program,
16 which not concluded classroom subjects but such subj-,
17 such subjects as sewing, woodworking, and makeup
18 classes for kids.

19 Our annual six block street fair is a main
20 source of income. And, and, and should the city's
21 proposal become law, we would be reduced to just
22 holding public meetings and be beholden to small
23 amounts of donations. I have been working with
24 Clearview Festival and other promoters since 1987 when
25 street festivals were in their infancy.

1 I have, I have seen the wonderful asset
2 these fairs brought to community organizations via
3 funding for the charitable work they do. They also
4 bring residents together in doing that work. Street
5 fairs are a wonderful source, not only for the
6 charitable income, but to provide a relaxing venue for
7 family outings and local businesses have always been
8 welcome to take spots just as outside vendors.

9 So, how would this change if the rules were
10 changed? When these street fairs started I remember
11 the vendors were a wonderful mix of local stores of
12 mom and pop shops. The city's proposal advocates that
13 50 percent of the vendors must be vocal -- local
14 businesses with a free or discounted rates. However,
15 that is not a realistic idea. These neighborhood
16 businesses no longer exist due to the demolition of
17 their buildings and the freely tripling -- freely
18 tripling of rents in order to increase real estate
19 income by ruling those new involving chain and big box
20 stores who are not interested in taking spots. Nor
21 are the fancy new stores who replace them in the new
22 expensive high rises. Subsequently, the charitable
23 sponsors will be inhibited to do their programs, and
24 this ar-, this era of retail and charity partnership
25 will cease to exist. Thank you for honoring this

1 meeting.

2 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

3 MS. KAYANI FACEY: Hi. Good afternoon. My
4 name is Kayani Facey, and I'm the President of my
5 company, Kreativitiy Kustom. That I started while I
6 was a senior in college. Living in the United States,
7 New York, New York City, is and always be will the
8 land of the free and the home of the brave.

9 As I ride in from Staten Island on the ferry
10 and I see the statute holding the flame, I feel true
11 pride that as a 23 year old black woman in America, I
12 have been able to reclaim my financial freedom. I
13 have been able to take control of my financial
14 destiny. I can truly say, at 23 years old, I am
15 living the American dream. No Donald Trump, the
16 American Dream is not dead. No Time Square Alliance.
17 No New York City. And no Mayor de Blasio the American
18 Dream is not dead. It is alive. It is well. It is
19 living and thriving through me, through all of us who
20 live and work in New York City street fairs as our
21 means to love and support ourselves and our business.

22 This is about free enterprise. This is
23 about small business. This is about our faith and
24 undying belief that we can achieve anything if we have
25 ambition and we work hard. With love and dead trust

1 in our basic human kind, we can make our name for
2 ourselves on the streets of Manhattan. That we run
3 our small business. Cutting street fairs is
4 counterintuitive to progress. Cutting street fairs
5 does not promote progress. It diminishes an
6 intuition.

7 Why is Toys 'R Us a staple in New York City,
8 a staple in Time Square not able to afford rent? How
9 is anyone is supposed to start a small business if you
10 can't run a small business in New York? What is your
11 solution? We need to be where the people are. Stop
12 cutting out the little guys. We matter. Our
13 businesses matter. Just as much, if not more, than
14 these big corporations. We have employees. We pay
15 taxes. We matter. This seems pretty un-American to
16 me. I asked the square alliance why are you against
17 fostering entrepreneurship and against driving
18 business activity and innovation in New York?

19 So, basically you want to squander an
20 opportunity. This is about having a full tuition
21 scholarship to college based solely on merit and still
22 being \$25,000 in debt in New York City. I graduated
23 with honors. Got 55 -- got a \$55,000 a year paying
24 job and I still can't afford to live in New York City.

25 So, I started a small business. This is

1 about free enterprise. This is about small business.
2 It's about my choice and about my living. This is
3 about me as a black woman being able to reclaim my
4 financial destiny and connect with people on the most
5 basic level. The New York City street fairs are not
6 only my livelihood. It is the reason that my business
7 is successful.

8 I have been able to market and promote my
9 business in the financial capital of the world. How
10 we can undo a legacy like that? How are you going to
11 cut off an opportunity like this? New York City, you
12 should be working to double, if not triple the street
13 fairs. We're all driving around in cars, living our
14 little lives, and when the street fairs happen, it is
15 our only opportunity for some community and basic
16 human interaction. This is about not going backwards
17 in history, promoting and working with companies to
18 provide incentives to help make more of these things
19 happen.

20 MS. ASHLEY: Iskmanov [phonetic]? Sh-,
21 Iskmanov with Gyros? No? Okay. Frank Zuccarello?
22 Frank Zuccarello? Nope. I'll come back.

23 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 9: [unintelligible]
24 [1:05:20] again.

25 MS. ASHLEY: He's not here? Okay. I'll

1 come back. Dan Cohen? Dan Cohen? With Valley
2 Restoration LDC. George Smith?

3 MR. GEORGE SMITH: That's, that's me.

4 MS. ASHLEY: Yeah, there you go. Winner.

5 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 10: Oh, George.

6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 11: Yay, George.

7 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

8 MR. GEORGE SMITH: How are y'all doing
9 today? Thank you for taking time to hear me talk. I
10 am happy to be -- I am, I am a brick and mortars
11 business which I was based in New York City and I got
12 kicked out New York City when my rent went through the
13 roof.

14 We are a party entertainment business so I
15 have felt this before, and 35 percent of businesses is
16 street fairs. So, if you, if you tell -- if you say
17 that we, we're -- you've got to have 50 percent of
18 people that live in the city -- I live in New York
19 City and I can't keep my business [unintelligible]
20 [1:06:12] New York City. I have to, I have to move to
21 Nassau County because we got kicked out from the high
22 rents. You know, and 35 percent of our business is
23 street fairs. And we hire -- I think we hire local
24 people in the community. We have 30 employees that
25 depend on me to give them a job for the weekend and

1 they don't have other 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. that they
2 have. They're not business people like we are. That
3 without a small business or a vendor we want to say,
4 they're regular people that have a job, 9:00 a.m. to
5 5:00 p.m., every single day and they cannot make
6 enough to live here in the city. Okay. And I employ
7 about 30 to 35 of them.

8 We, we, we, we [unintelligible] [1:06:52] we
9 do rides for the kids. I did all not-for-profits, but
10 we -- the, the [unintelligible] [1:06:58] pay rent so
11 it goes for the street fairs. They pay us to be here,
12 to give back to the community. There's nothing more
13 than I can say that when you see a child's face light
14 up, okay, because they're getting a free ride on an
15 amusement ride. They can't afford -- the parents ca-,
16 have the money, they have three or four kids and they
17 can have a [unintelligible] [1:07:15] and they cannot
18 afford to go to Coney Island. They cannot afford to
19 go to Great Adventure. They cannot afford to go to
20 Disney World and we bring that to them.

21 Well, by you raising the price that, that
22 all the fairs have to pay for the street fair, you
23 have to make a, a series of cuts. So, where, where
24 are we going to cut? We're going to hurt the families
25 in the community and they get a -- and, and they can't

1 afford to give back what they get back today. That's
2 all I got to say. Thank you very much.

3 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

4 MR. SMITH: Thank you for hearing me. Thank
5 you so much.

6 MS. ASHLEY: Alright. We have Laura Sharp
7 from Visiting Neighbors and then after that Barry
8 Balinsky [phonetic].

9 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 7: I gave you her
10 testimony.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Oh, she's not coming.

12 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 7: She couldn't get in.
13 She's back --

14 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. Barry. Barry Balinsky?
15 Robert Aaronson?

16 MR. ROBERT AARONSON: Yep. Good morning.
17 My name is Bob Aaronson, longtime resident of the
18 Upper Westside and a member of the Board of Directors
19 of the West 102nd, 103rd Street Block Association. A
20 small 501 (C) (4) community service not-profit
21 representing the residents of a four block residential
22 area in Manhattan's Upper West Side bounded by
23 Broadway and Riverside Drive including 102nd and 103rd
24 Streets.

25 The new rules are designed to attra-,

1 address traffic congestion and NYPD resources. It
2 appears that there's a distinction finally between
3 multi block festivals and single block festivals.
4 There is however an apparent arbitrary cap on the
5 number of single block festivals.

6 I'm probably the only person here speaking
7 today about single block festivals, but it's important
8 to us. I helped to organize a single weekend day,
9 single block street fair on a residential one-way side
10 street with no commercial traffic and little non-
11 commercial traffic. We've organized this street fair
12 for our communities for more than 20 years, for our
13 com-, right, as a community builder. The police
14 provide [unintelligible] [1:09:25] traffic barriers
15 and supervise the going o-, the goings on with their
16 routine patrolling.

17 In addition, we provide space for the
18 community affairs officers to answer questions and run
19 their operation idea. I'm particularly concerned that
20 the arbitrary cap on number of single street fairs
21 would cause our permit -- our street activity permit
22 application to be denied despite this minimal impact.

23 In addition, it is less than clear why as
24 organizers we need to provide identifying details
25 about vendors, especially information like tax id

1 numbers, Department of Consumer Affairs numbers. Most
2 of our vendors are in fact members of our block
3 association, neighbors, residents within our four
4 block attachment area. How does this detail, personal
5 and business data relieve the minimal traffic
6 congestion or lower the already minimal NYPD burden?

7 As an organizer, I will be willing to attest
8 to the 50 percent local nature of our vendors. In
9 fact, we would be happy to accept for the single --
10 for a higher minimum if it would ensure that our
11 application was accepted and we could have our fair.

12 Finally, we believe the fee structure, at
13 least for our sm-, our and similar small events is
14 unreasonable. We operate on a shoe string and turning
15 over 20 percent of revenue will provide only a small
16 amount of revenue for the City, but a substantial
17 drain on our resources. Please, please consider
18 scaling that fee. Thank you.

19 MR. CAREY: Thank you, sir.

20 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. Collegan [phonetic]
21 Ferry with Midway Development Corporation. Barry?
22 No? Okay. Steve H. with Cooper Square Committee?
23 Steve H.? Alright. John Khan with --

24 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 12: With me.

25 MS. ASHLEY: With you. Thank you, Don.

1 Thank you.

2 MR. JOHN KHAN: Marty, how you doing this
3 morning?

4 MR. CAREY: Good afternoon. Fantastic.

5 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

6 MR. KHAN: It just seems like it's morning.
7 My name is John Khan. From 1968 to 1971, I was in the
8 U.S. Marines during the Vietnam War. That makes me a
9 veteran. Com-- thank you. Currently, I'm 67 years
10 old. I plan to get older. That makes me a senior
11 citizen.

12 I'm a New York City street vendor. That
13 makes me a living. I want the panel to understand
14 that it makes me a living as well it makes all these
15 other people a living. I support my family, even
16 though a lot of them are old now. They support their
17 families. And this is very important to us, as it
18 should be very important to you. We add a certain
19 dynamic to the city.

20 People who come in, tourists, we make a lot
21 of money from tourists. And tourists come and see us.
22 And we support the local communities. And we buy -- I
23 buy my supplies from other people in the city. I
24 support them. They buy from someone else. They
25 support them. It's a domino effect. It's common

1 sense here. If you cut back the street fairs, you're
2 cutting back a lot of the industry. You're cutting a
3 lot of the support. You're cutting back people,
4 putting food on their tables for their family. I
5 don't think any of you have really worked on these
6 street fairs. Just say no. These people, including
7 myself --

8 MR. CAREY: We're not allowed to answer but
9 go ahead.

10 MR. KHAN: Okay. You can just wink or nod.
11 That will be enough for me. These people get there at
12 8:00 a.m., [unintelligible] [1:13:31], but they're,
13 they're packed prior to. They're set up. They're
14 there from 8:00 a.m. until 6:00 p.m., packing after
15 6:00 p.m. That's 10, 12 hours. Then they go home and
16 they feed their families.

17 And during the week they supply to work
18 those two days. It's not just two days. It's
19 preparation. I used to do it on the weekends
20 thinking, oh, it'll just be a part time thing. No.
21 It doesn't work that way. I have friends who work for
22 me. They have family members who work for them. We
23 support -- it's a community here. We support each
24 other. We watch out for each other. But
25 [unintelligible] [1:14:15] it feels like we're the

1 only ones watching out for each other.

2 I don't think you're watching out for us. I
3 think you're watching out for the big corporations,
4 and that's what I feel. Simple as that. You watch
5 out for BID -- I've seen what happened in Union Square
6 with the street orders though, how they were pushed
7 aside because BID didn't want them there. They said
8 there was congestion, but yet, the farmer's market who
9 parked their trucks through a lot of congestion --

10 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you --

11 MR. KHAN: -- nothing's done about that.

12 Oh. I'm done?

13 MS. ASHLEY: Yeah. Thank you.

14 MR. KHAN: I'm going to waive good-bye.

15 MS. ASHLEY: Can we have Jerry Brash? Jerry
16 Brash?

17 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 12: Rasley [phonetic]?

18 MS. ASHLEY: Huh?

19 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 12: Rasley.

20 MS. ASHLEY: No. So, Victor Tuv? Tuv?

21 Victor, great.

22 MR. VICTOR TUV: Good afternoon, everybody.
23 My name is Victor Tuv. The company name Retra and Y
24 Metra I'm a founder. As a hobby I restore the old New
25 York [unintelligible] [1:15:36] as a hobby. I'm

1 making the coasters and placemats for my restores for
2 us. I have a question. I was born in the Ukraine.
3 I'm an immigrant. And because of that I'm probably
4 not educated enough.

5 I have question why we are here. Is the
6 mayor office receive 10, 20, 30, 100,000 letters from
7 residents who complained about street fair? Or some
8 group of people 10 or maybe 20 made the decision to
9 change the rules? That's the next question. And now
10 we're siting her and begging to ask please do not
11 change the rules.

12 And about 50 percent close. I am an
13 American citizen. I'm a Brooklynite. I'm a New
14 Yorker. Why I have to pay attention about this quote?
15 Is this not the first step to segregation? The next
16 step gonna be a Italian restaurant have to have 50
17 percent of visitors just Italians. The others, you
18 have to wait. The next step, maybe more difficult.
19 I'm trying to find the words.

20 And maybe again, I'm not, I'm not educated
21 enough. Who can explain me the math why is 50
22 percent? Why is not 17? Not 23? Or not 97? Who
23 create this number, those numbers? And why? Maybe
24 some statistics. And of course every street fair will
25 create some inconvenience for traffic. This is true.

1 I can tell you more. You work by a phone, you create
2 much more problem what the traffic. And probably in
3 2018, we'll have a new rule [unintelligible] [1:18:02]
4 for one block only. Logically, it have to be correct.

5 Right here, we have a very specific public.
6 It's self-made people. They did not ask about the
7 public assistance. They did not enjoy the welfare.
8 They created themselves. They created the job. They
9 gave the opportunity for the other people to make a
10 living. Each city have a -- thank you.

11 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you.

12 MR. TUV: I just hope New York City will not
13 waste their own place.

14 MS. ASHLEY: We have Gerri and then it'll be
15 Betty and Artineh.

16 MR. GERRI BRESLER: Good afternoon,
17 everybody.

18 MR. CAREY: Good afternoon.

19 MR. BRESLER: My name is Gerri Bresler
20 [phonetic]. I have been a vendor in New York City for
21 almost 40 years. And I have watched the City regulate
22 against the smallest of smallest of businesses until
23 we're almost out of existence. We can't sell on the
24 street because you can't get a vendor's license. I
25 had a store. The tax-, the taxes and the rent became

1 horrendous. My last resort is street fairs. Now, you
2 want to, you want to price this is out of existence,
3 because you are for the one percent, and Manhattan is
4 becoming a city for the rich.

5 I, I was born and raised in New York. And
6 in New York, at one time was a City for all my parents
7 came here as immigrants. And when the --my father
8 couldn't work, what did he do? He went and sold on
9 the street. And that's how I learned when I needed
10 it, out of necessity, because I had a child to raise
11 on my own. Okay. Go to the street, bring your goods
12 to the street. Now it's becoming impossible.

13 You know, please, for everybody here,
14 immigrants, and nonimmigrants, those educated and not,
15 this is how we make our living. And this is the only
16 resource many of us have left. So, please consider
17 what you're going to do. And hopefully it's not 50
18 percent of a neighborhood.

19 I live downtown. I don't know many vendors
20 who live in the downtown. I mean, are you going to
21 regulate street fairs out of downtown New York where
22 they're wonderful? And when you get a mom-, you know,
23 you get craftspeople at those fairs. And you know,
24 all kinds of merchandise and food. That is not
25 normally in the neighborhood. Thank you.

1 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

2 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. Betty Cooney.

3 MS. BETTY COONEY: Good afternoon.

4 MR. CAREY: Good afternoon.

5 MS. COONEY: My name is Betty Cooney. I run
6 the Graham Avenue Business Improvement District in
7 Brooklyn.

8 We run a street fair, an annual street fair
9 every year. For more than 15 years, Grand Avenue BID
10 has sponsored an eight block fiesta. The event draws
11 more than 20,000 and outs-, from people locally in
12 from outside the district. It is one of the largest
13 and most well attended events in this underserved
14 area. It is not run to make the BID rich. It is too
15 promote for the area. It brings new tastes, sounds
16 and fun that are not here already. It provides a
17 community stage with free, all day live entertainment
18 for our community. Many Hispanic entertainers come
19 here year after year to share their talents with our
20 community because of this event. The district also
21 promotes other people that have an opportunity to, to
22 perform on the stage. It gives them an opportunity to
23 be heard.

24 Area merchants are encouraged to participate
25 without any fees. We do not charge fees for our

1 stores at this point and we don't intend to. It helps
2 to put the retail district and encourages new shoppers
3 to come to an area they may never come to if this did
4 not exist. The low cost fees offer to vendors and
5 sponsorships from businesses who want to reach the
6 community are what support this event. Plus the
7 volunteer efforts and the administrative talents of
8 our business improvement district. We don't make a
9 lot of money on this, but we do give back a lot to the
10 community.

11 The needs of Mid-Manhattan are not the same
12 as ours. We rely on these events to build our retail
13 district and to provide for underserved community.
14 The new proposal would require that our vendors be 50
15 percent from this district. This will not work. It
16 is currently open to all who want to participate. It
17 will restrict some great entertainment, food, and
18 other programs from coming here for the day. It says
19 our community can only enjoy what is here and they
20 don't deserve to have the opportunity for something
21 special. We bring something special to this
22 community, because of this event.

23 We can't take everyone to Manhattan. So, we
24 bring the community things they can enjoy for the day.
25 That said, we also have the expectation that the

1 people that come here from outside our community will
2 see the potential that we have in this community.
3 That they will relocate to our district, open stores,
4 and provide for our community so it can grow.

5 Our businesses need this coverage. They
6 need this exposure. The fiesta brings in more than
7 20,000 potential customers for the day. Many in the
8 area thank us for this, for this event. They say it's
9 one of the greatest events they have in the area.

10 The new proposal wants to require vendors to
11 sign up way before the event. This will not work. As
12 they wait to see what the weather will be like. Some
13 of our best events nearly double with the last minute
14 signups. Remember, the City doesn't give us rain
15 dates. It is all or nothing. Bad for us and bad for
16 business. Why regulate something that is working in
17 our district? Maybe the City should add the option of
18 a rain date to really help make these, make these
19 events profitable.

20 The money raised by this event is shared
21 with our co-sponsor who makes the event possible for
22 us. I have a small staff of one. It is also shared
23 with the cost of running each, each event which are
24 high. And the 20 percent that the City already takes
25 for these vents.

1 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you. We're out of time.

2 MS. COONEY: Thank you.

3 MS. ASHLEY: Artineh Havan.

4 MS. ARTINEH HAVAN: Good afternoon. My name
5 is Artiriah Havan. I am the Executive Director of the
6 Grand Street Business Improvement District in East
7 Williamsburg Brooklyn. I am also the co-chair of the
8 New York City BID association street fair working
9 group. And I will submit this testimony on their
10 behalf.

11 This is testimony is on behalf of the New
12 York City BID Association Street Fair Working Group
13 which includes individual bids from different boroughs
14 of New York City. The New York City BID Association
15 Street Fair Working Group organized a year and half
16 ago to look at City Wide Events coordination and
17 management practices and provide recommendations to
18 the New York City BID Association.

19 The Street Fair Working Group is pleased
20 that City Wide Event Coordination and Management take
21 into consideration, we have a recommendations to New
22 York City BID Association provided in the street fair
23 position statement in June 2015. These
24 recommendations included lifting the moratorium on
25 street fairs for outer boroughs and Upper Manhattan,

1 improving permitted criteria, improving coordination
2 and giving more weight to local supports.

3 While we are grateful for this efforts and
4 move the changes that CECM would implement, there are
5 still a number of issues in the new rules that may
6 have unforeseen any negative consequences for New York
7 City's commercial corridors.

8 The following are additional recommendations
9 from the New York City BID Association Street Fair
10 Working Group. The BID Association Street Fair
11 Working Group applauds the [unintelligible] [1:26:39]
12 of street fairs on the side street near Time Square
13 and strongly urges the City to further limit street
14 fairs in heavily congested commercial business
15 districts in Midtown Manhattan. Closing the street in
16 a heavily congested commercial corridor create serious
17 congestion issues for hundreds of thousands of workers
18 coming into Manhattan to their jobs on weekdays. On
19 weekends, street closures in these congested
20 commercial corridors creates severe service mobility
21 issues for those trying to get into a commercial
22 corridor. Many of which include major cultural
23 entertainment attractions or just travel throughout
24 the City.

25 With the many street [unintelligible]

1 [1:27:13] changes underway including the addition of
2 plazas and sidewalk extensions to improve pedestrian
3 safety as well as the extension of bike lanes on many
4 of these commercial corridors, street fairs hinder
5 pedestrian, vehicular and bike travel. That said
6 individual bi- BIDS are expected to offer testimony on
7 their own behalf. Our focus is City Wide, not case by
8 base.

9 The BID Association Street Fair Working
10 Group applauds the lifting of the moratorium on street
11 fairs. However, the following rules as currently
12 proposed will make a very difficult -- would make it
13 difficult to conduct a street fair for a new
14 commercial corridors, even if the moratorium is
15 lifted. These new rules would also hinder street
16 fairs that are already in operation in the outer
17 boroughs.

18 The Street Fair Working Group urges the City
19 to consider the concerns of the neighborhoods,
20 community boards and business improvement district
21 with regard to the 50 percent local vendor requirement
22 as each neighborhood is different. Some need to have
23 more involvement where the 50 percent works. Some
24 look to bring in new businesses from outside their
25 neighborhoods as part of their economic development

1 strategy where the 50 percent rule can be harmful.
2 While the BID association agrees that some street
3 fairs have been generic, the 50 percent local vendor
4 requirement is too onerous to implement from multi
5 block street fairs in smaller commercial corridors.

6 MS. TOLSON: Thank you for your time.

7 MS. HAVAN: Thank you.

8 MS. ASHLEY: I have Shaimila DeSarino.

9 DeSarino? With Open Loop. Okay. Tyra Emerson with
10 Cultural Collaborative Jamaica. Tyra? No. Patricia
11 Gandice [phonetic]? Patricia? I have another name
12 that I can't read. I think it's P-U-E-R-N, and it's
13 last name begins with P. If you know you have bad
14 handwriting, maybe it's you. Jessica Walker?

15 MS. JESSICA WALKER: Hello. I'm Jessica
16 Walker, the President and CEO of the Manhattan Chamber
17 of Commerce. The Manhattan Chamber of Commerce is a
18 membership organization that drives economic
19 prosperity by helping sole proprietors and
20 entrepreneurs and startups, long time neighborhood
21 businesses, and of course large companies here in the
22 city to, suc- succeed in business.

23 We currently run two of the oldest and
24 largest street fairs here in the city. We do the
25 Second Avenue Community Benefit Festival which is

1 almost four years old. It takes place each May,
2 between 66th and 86th Streets. And we also run the
3 Third Avenue Community Benefit Festival which takes
4 place each September, also between 66th and 86th
5 Streets.

6 [Unintelligible] [1:30:10] these festivals
7 is a win-win for the community for several reasons.
8 First is, it's a day of fun, obviously, for thousands
9 of people who walk the Avenue. The entrepreneurial
10 vendors, many of whom we've heard from today, have an
11 opportunity to sell their wares. And lastly, all of
12 our proceeds are actually donated to non-profit
13 organizations in the surrounding community. To date,
14 the Manhattan Chamber has donated more than three
15 million dollars to organizations seeking to improve
16 the health, welfare, social and cultural lives of
17 residents within the community board district where
18 our street fairs, our street fairs are held which is
19 community board eight.

20 Unfortunately, we will forced to seize
21 operation of our street fairs if the rules currently
22 under consideration are adopted. First, the rule for
23 each organization to only run one festival would
24 automatically end one of ours. The, the rule to --
25 that basically that you cannot be, you have to be

1 headquartered in the community district where you hold
2 the festivals would also basically put us out of
3 business for, for both of them as well. We used to be
4 in that community when we began the street fairs, but
5 we are -- our headquarters are in another community
6 district now. Even though the focus of our activities
7 and work is actually borough wide.

8 But even if those two things were changed,
9 on top of that, I think that some of the new
10 requirements would also be very burdensome and make it
11 unprofitable for us to continue. You've heard it
12 already today, but specifically I want to single out
13 the 50 percent vendors be from the local community.
14 That would greatly reduce the length of our fair. And
15 I -- it just wouldn't be profitable at that point.
16 And two, having to submit the vendor info a month out
17 instead of a week before hand again, you heard today
18 that weather is a, a factor in when vendors sort of
19 make these last decisions based on the weather if
20 they're going to participate or not.

21 So, in closing, we just think that, you
22 know, we, we understand what the, what the city here
23 is trying to do. And we, we certainly want to be
24 helpful in trying to achieve some of those goals, but
25 I just think that this is not the right plan. Thank

1 you.

2 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

3 MS. ASHLEY: Wendy Wineman, 92Y. Wendy? We
4 have Lily and Mary with Ninth Avenue Association.
5 Lily and Mary? They're here. Okay. And then after
6 Lili and Mary, it's Gary with the blo-, 100 Block
7 Association West 135th Street, you'll be next.

8 MS. LILI FABLE: And then I'll give this to
9 you. Good morning and good afternoon. We've been
10 here a long time, but I think it's important that
11 we're here. The Ninth Avenue International Food
12 Festival was started in 1973. And it was to bring
13 honor and recognition to the small businesses in our
14 community, once very busy, popular known as Patty's
15 Market. We realized that much of our business was
16 going away, because of the deterioration of the
17 neighborhood, and we felt that we needed to have
18 something to do with the city to honor all of the
19 ethnic groups in our neighborhood. We've always
20 gotten along very well with our neighbors.

21 We're a grassroots organization that was
22 started by five people, and the whole idea was to make
23 and show off what we do, mostly food. And to connect
24 with our community and to give back because all that
25 we earn is poured back into the community with

1 services for children and seniors, mostly not-for-
2 profits: the Dwelling, Covenant House, St. Mary's
3 Hospital, PAL, Holy Cross, Sacred Heart. We give away
4 35 to 40 spots to community residents to come out and
5 show what they do. And when we saw that after the
6 first few years we had a half of million, we were told
7 by the police department in two days, we realized we
8 couldn't do it on our own, because we offer this to
9 our merchants first. That's when we welcomed vendors,
10 God bless them. They come, they participate, they
11 make money. This year will be our 43rd annual and
12 we're looking forward to being with all of you. Mary
13 just has one or two things to say.

14 MS. MARY D'ELLA: Thank you. Thank you. As
15 Lili said, we've been in business over 40 years. One
16 of the problems -- the only problem that we have that
17 I see with the new rules is the 50 percent participant
18 of the merchants. We -- eight years ago we had 30
19 merchants. Last ye-, last one we had 64. We are
20 doing everything we can to get the merchants to
21 participate, but we had bodegas, we had nail salons,
22 we have barbershops. Those people do not come out for
23 fairs. But so -- it would be prohibitive for us to
24 ever become 50 percent. So, I'd like you to think of
25 that and how it operate -- how it would affect all of

1 the fairs in the city and maybe take that down. Thank
2 you.

3 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

4 MS. ASHLEY: After Gary, we have Ann Seleman
5 from the MCB Six. The Manhattan Community Board Six.

6 MR. GARY TOMEI: Good afternoon. My name is
7 Gary Tomei. I'm the President of the West 13th
8 Street, 100 Block Association. We have abo-,
9 approximately 1,100 members who are residents of the
10 block between Sixth and Seventh and West 13th Street.
11 I'm here to support the change that has been proposed.
12 If not entirely, it's certainly it's -- the idea is
13 excellent.

14 We have suffered with these street fairs for
15 -- in 2000 -- as a matter of fact, for -- since I've
16 been on this block which is approximately 20 years.
17 And in 2006 -- well, let me go -- back up.

18 The idea is to cut down on the number of
19 street fairs. And to make it local, which is what
20 exactly what was the original purposes of these street
21 fairs. Not to make it a, a, a moneymaking proposition
22 for some organization that licenses these vendors.
23 And if we cut down on the fairs, and I am sympathize
24 with a lot of these people about their making a
25 living, why doesn't these sponsor give them more

1 money? Give a greater percentage? We cut down on the
2 fairs and we, we a force these -- it's my opinion,
3 scam artists, to give the proper amount of money to
4 the vendors.

5 The problem with the street fairs is that
6 they're all the same. They're generic. They don't
7 reflect the neighborhood. It's not the original
8 purpose of the street fairs. It ties up traffic. We
9 get noise pollution. We get air pollution. We have -
10 - lose money. The city loses a fortune in money,
11 every year from these fairs instead of making money.
12 And at one time -- oh by the way, the local businesses
13 lose money. And I've heard many, many complaints by
14 local businesses because of these street fairs.

15 But I wanted to say one other thing about
16 these non-for-profits. And I'm not casting any
17 aspersion on the, on the people here, with their none
18 -- not-for-profits. But in 2006, I testified before
19 CB-2 and in order to have these street fairs cut back.
20 Particularly in Greenwich Village where we're
21 saturated. Almost every weekend during the summer,
22 you can't go -- get in or out of Greenwich Village but
23 that's beside the point. That isn't my point. I
24 discovered at that time, that there are a number for
25 not-for-profits that shouldn't bet getting money. For

1 instance, at that time, and I'm not sure about how it
2 is presently, but at that time, we had about four --
3 five -- approxima--

4 MS. TOLSON: Time.

5 MR. TOMEI: -- approximately --

6 MS. TOLSON: Thank you for your time.

7 MR. TOMEI: -- this is my last comment.

8 Approximately, five republican political clubs getting
9 money as part of this -- part of this street fair.
10 Those -- there's no reason for, for the citizens of
11 the city to, to support a political club. It's
12 outrageous. And, and there are -- there were others
13 that were not, they have to vet these people, the not-
14 for-profits that are getting the money, because it's,
15 -- that is also a, a scam --

16 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

17 MS. ASHLEY: Ann from Manhattan Community
18 Board Six. Ann from Manhattan --

19 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

20 MS. ASHLEY: Okay. Ed Walters. After Ed,
21 we have Steven Gradman from Pride Democrats.

22 MR. ED WALTERS: Hello. My name is Ed
23 Walters. I'm a member of the Village Crosstown
24 Trolley Coalition. And this is a 501 (C)(3) non-
25 profit that seeks to improve the walking environment

1 into a great local service public transportation in
2 our community by advo-, advocating river to river
3 cross town trolley in the village. Neighborhood
4 street cars have been gaining favor throughout the
5 U.S. and VCTC has been a pioneer in proposing one for
6 our community.

7 For over two decades, VCTC has sponsored a
8 street fair on the block of Astor Place between
9 Broadway and Lafayette Street. This has been an
10 important source of revenue for VCTC helping to enable
11 to provide information about the benefits of this
12 proposal to, to interested residents, organizations
13 and businesses in the community.

14 The street, the street fair has been
15 overseen by a very capable contractor who makes
16 arrangements with several dozen small businesses or
17 vendors to display their products on the street and
18 collects a fee from each participant. The co-, the
19 contractor covers the cost of setup and cleanup after
20 the event and provides the city with a fee of 20
21 percent of the gross revenue from the event. After
22 deducting expenses, the profit is divided equally
23 between the con- contractor and the sponsor.

24 VCTC strongly opposes the proposed rules in
25 their current form. By limiting 50 percent of vendors

1 to small businesses located in the community district
2 where the street fair occurs, many small businesses
3 located in other community districts elsewhere in the
4 city will be adversely affected. Many of these
5 businesses survive by participating in the many street
6 fairs held throughout the city. This is a specialized
7 business that relies on adequate volume of events.
8 While VCTC supports the proposed rule that would limit
9 vendors to those based in NYC, New York City, it
10 strongly opposes that the be limited to district where
11 the event is held.

12 We respectfully request that the proposed
13 rules be modified accordingly. Thanks for your time.
14 I appreciate it.

15 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

16 MS. ASHLEY: Steven, your next. And then
17 after Steven we have Maureen from the Sixth Precinct
18 Community Council.

19 MR. STEVEN GRADMAN: Okay. Thank you very
20 much. My name is Steve Gradman from Pride Democrats.
21 Thank you Mr. Carey. And I know that SAPO has done
22 fine work over the years. However the new proposal
23 would hurt many of the non-profits. The groups which
24 we have street festivals.

25 We're a 501 (C) (4) organization. Political

1 clubs do provide a public service. We register a lot
2 of voters. We hold political forums. And our street
3 festival, which is simply a one block, one day affair,
4 is our major fundraiser for the year. A problem for
5 us is that we meet in Community Board Two in Manhattan
6 and many of our members are there, and if we were
7 pushed out to the outer boroughs, it might be, you
8 know, hard for us to find a home somewhere out there.
9 I don't know exactly where we'd go. And also, most of
10 our vendors can't afford to be located within
11 community board two territory downtown. They're all
12 coming in from the outer boroughs.

13 So, the 50 percent requirement would be
14 another problem. We're not located -- we don't have
15 our festival on 13th Street where this gentleman was
16 saying they have too many. We're on Aster Place in a
17 commercial block. And our street festival has gone
18 very well. People enjoy themselves and I haven't
19 heard any objections for anything that's happened at
20 our street festival over the past four years that
21 we've had it. I thank you very much.

22 MR. CAREY: Thank you.

23 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you.

24 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

25 MS. ASHLEY: Oh, do you want to sit in the -

1 - sorry, the first one.

2 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 8: Oh, okay. Okay.

3 MS. MAUREEN REMACLE: I really wanted to sit
4 in this one, but I'll take the other one. Are you
5 ready?

6 MR. CAREY: Go ahead, yes.

7 MS. REMACLE: Okay. Hi. I'm Maureen
8 Remacle. I'm the President of the Sixth Precinct
9 Community Council and we also have a street fair. I
10 think that street fairs are our only source of funding
11 as I'm sure is true of other community organizations.

12 Everybody in the Sixth Precinct Community
13 Council is a volunteer. We don't have staff to go out
14 and do fundraising. I think if street fairs are cut
15 back and certain groups are denied street fairs, they
16 will be unable to do what they are supposed to do, and
17 we have -- I don't want to use the word mandates.
18 Let's say guidelines from the City of New York as to
19 what they would like us to do. We're very much a part
20 of the community where we have our street fair. The
21 money goes back into the community. We do national
22 night out, which I'm sure at least half the room has
23 heard of. We also do a fundraiser where the -- we pay
24 for all of the things in the fundraiser and all of our
25 money goes to the senior center at Our Lady of Pompeii

1 Church. We also donate to the church because that's
2 where we have our meetings.

3 So, not only are we accomplishing our goals,
4 but we are also helping other groups that are non-
5 profits. And I think that it's necessary to keep
6 these fairs alive to keep groups like mine alive.

7 And I, I actually -- I'm going to say
8 something 'cause I know you're not going to answer my
9 questions, but I don't comprehend this 50 percent
10 thing that we're supposed to have vendors at 50
11 percent from community board two. The ven-, the
12 people who are in community board two already have
13 brick and mortar stores that they're paying a lot of
14 rent for and I can't see them participating in my
15 street fair necessarily when their store is far away
16 from where my street fair is. And having to hire an
17 extra person and get their stuff to the street fair,
18 these people have established businesses that are
19 brick and mortar businesses that they want to continue
20 using as brick and mortar businesses. The people who
21 do street fairs are people who do street fairs.
22 They're used to transporting their goods every
23 weekend, and I don't know the 50 percent is going to
24 be achieved.

25 I mean what are we going to do if we only

1 get 40 percent? Does that mean the street fair is
2 closed? We can't have it because we only got 40
3 percent? I don't know where this 50 percent number
4 came from. I could see you saying we'd like you to
5 give proof of outreach by sending certified mail or
6 something.

7 So, at least you know we attempted to do it,
8 or put an ad in the local paper, advertising we have
9 the opportunity for them. But other than that, giving
10 us a, a quota of 50 percent, if it's not achievable,
11 what happens? You know? And 50 percent is a huge
12 quota. I can't imagine that. And quite honestly, I
13 would not even want to think of offering a discount to
14 Coach bag, which is in CB2 or Michael Koors or Marc
15 Jacobs. I don't think they need a discount at the
16 expense of my, my community and the seniors and the
17 church and all the other people that we are helping in
18 the community. So, I, I -- the 50 percent rule sounds
19 kind of crazy --

20 MS. TOLSON: Thank you for your time.

21 MS. REMACLE: Thank you.

22 MS. ASHLEY: Nathan Jacobs?

23 MR. NATHAN JACOBS: Yes. Hello. I've been
24 a street vendor for the last 15 years. And I'm here
25 to just explain how the vendors add to the fabric, add

1 to the importance, add to the diversity of the City.
2 These are the most hardworking people you'll ever want
3 to meet. They work in the rain. They work in the
4 wind. They work when it's very hot and when it's very
5 cold. They're out there doing their best. These
6 people are heroes to their families, to their kids, to
7 their spouses, to their communities. The thing I
8 think we forget about in all these rules is the
9 individual. The dignity of work. Their dignity that
10 these people have, including myself. That we have a
11 job to go to. We have a place to go to that our kids'
12 families look up to us. To take that away would be a
13 horrible thing.

14 Rather than restricting the street fairs,
15 you should be looking to extend them. Especially in
16 the Midtown areas that draw the most visitors and
17 tourists. I would invite you to visit the street
18 fairs. See the smiles on the people, on the tourists,
19 on the people who come to visit, how happy they are,
20 and how they are and they constantly g-, are you going
21 to be here tomorrow? When does this happen again?
22 And we have to always give them different answers.
23 But the importance of it is to remember the
24 individuals. The people that work the street fairs
25 are hardworking people, looking for an opportunity.

1 You have a sign behind you, the City of New York.

2 The City of New York has always stood for
3 opportunity and upward mobility. And I would like you
4 to really think about this as you deliberate and
5 hopefully extend the street fairs and not restrict
6 them. Thank you.

7 MR. CAREY: That concludes the folks that
8 signed up. I often given an opportunity to folks that
9 if you didn't sign up you can testify now, not again.
10 But if there's anyone that did not have an opportunity
11 to speak that wishes to speak before we conclude feel
12 free to raise your hand.

13 MS. ASHLEY: Anyone else? If you want to
14 raise your hand and then you can come next.

15 [OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

16 MR. CAREY: Go ahead.

17 MS. ASHLEY: You have three minutes.

18 MR. CAREY: Three minutes, sir.

19 MR. RANDY MARTINS: Thank you for the
20 opportunity. My name is Randy Martins with the
21 Brazilian American [unintelligible] [1:50:33] Center.
22 We belong the career [unintelligible] [1:50:35] Brazil
23 in New York City, we want to do Brazilian Day. Very
24 famous event for over 32 years. To give an idea, the
25 city, the event was televised live to over 70

1 countries. When I travel to those countries, might
2 resist travel agency. Everybody look forward to come
3 to, to New York, the capital of the world. They talk
4 about the se-, the street fairs over the summertime in
5 New York. They all love it. For some reasoning,
6 here, some people take it for granted.

7 And I'm very proud to know that, our event,
8 I'm sure every one of them generates many, you know,
9 [unintelligible] [1:51:16] a lot of revenue to the
10 City, and the most important would give opportunity to
11 many. Not just vendors to have a better life in this
12 very expensive city to live. This makes me feel very
13 good.

14 What I don't understand is that they say
15 there is a lot of complaint, but every year, when I go
16 to community board five in my face, they never say
17 there is any complaints. Every time is approval,
18 [unintelligible] [1:41:43] for everyone. So, in the
19 name of the half million Brazilian people that live in
20 this area, we are completely opposed of this new rules
21 and we ask you to keep the way it is, something good
22 we cannot change. Thank you.

23 MS. ROSEMARY HILL: Hi. Good afternoon.
24 I'm Rosemary Hill. I'm here as a mother, a family
25 head, and I come to talk about the street fair. I was

1 diagnosed with a sickness the other day, I couldn't
2 work, and I heard about the street fair. So, I
3 applied. Now, I am paying my rent, and I, you know,
4 my family is living much better and we are doing much
5 better.

6 So, I'm just here to tell you that sometimes
7 the street fair, if you come and see, for yourself,
8 you would see how it make an impact in u-, in us, the
9 lower budget family lives. And when you see,
10 especially when you see the children, and the tourists
11 and all of those [unintelligible] [1:52:54] you know
12 that. New York City cannot stop the street fair or
13 cannot lower -- higher the budget because it will
14 affect us and it affect family. And what it is doing
15 is to build family member. We, we are here. We are
16 of living proof to sho-, to tell you and to show yo
17 what the New York City street fair is doing for us.

18 So, I'm begging you, don't stop the street
19 fair. Don't higher the, the rate, because we, we are
20 not going to be able to afford it, and that help us to
21 pay our rent, to, to, to -- just to live. And to be
22 good citizen. Thank you.

23 MR. CAREY: Thank you very much. Anyone
24 else that did not get to speak that would like to
25 speak? Okay. Once again, you can also submit your

1 testimony in writing. And you have until the 27th of
2 October to submit the writing. And we will post not
3 only the entire the transcript of this, but all anyone
4 who submitted testimony, probably on the 27th as well.
5 With that this hearing is concluded. Thanks to
6 everyone.

7 MS. ASHLEY: Thank you.

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF ACCURACY

I, Lea Simmons, certify that the foregoing transcript of Public Hearing on Street Festivals on October 13, 2016 was prepared using the required transcription equipment and is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Certified By

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Lea Simmons", written over a horizontal line.

Date: October 20, 2016

GENEVAWORLDWIDE, INC

256 West 38th Street - 10th Floor

New York, NY 10018