

Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015

1

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----x
PUBLIC MEETING
FRANCHISE and CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE
-----x

22 Reade Street
New York, New York 10007
Spector Hall

Thursday, November 12, 2015
2:42 p.m.

APPEARANCES:

Mayor: Peter Hatch
Office of the Mayor: Benjamin Furnas
Corporation Counsel: Sharon Cantor
Office of Management and Budget: Jane Bayer
Comptroller: Richard Friedman
Manhattan BP: James Caras
Queens BP: Jasmine Narang
Staten Island BP: James Shipp
Clerk: Stephanie Ruiz

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.
139 MAMARONECK AVENUE
MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543
212.95.DEPOS (953-3767) * 914.381.2061
FACSIMILE: (914) 722-0816
EMAIL: Stenokath@verizon.net

Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015

2

1 Proceedings

2 MR. HATCH: Good afternoon and
3 thank you for being here. The Franchise
4 and Concession Review Committee Public
5 Meeting will now come to order.

6 Will the Clerk please call the
7 roll?

8 MS. RUIZ: Mayor.

9 MR. HATCH: Here.

10 MS. RUIZ: Office of the Mayor.

11 MR. FURNAS: Here.

12 MS. RUIZ: Comptroller.

13 MR. FRIEDMAN: Here.

14 MS. RUIZ: Corporation Counsel.

15 MS. CANTOR: Here.

16 MS. RUIZ: Office of Management
17 and Budget.

18 MS. BAYER: Here.

19 MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of
20 the Bronx.

21 (No response.)

22 MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of
23 Brooklyn.

24 (No response.)

25 MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of

Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015

3

1 Proceedings

2 Manhattan.

3 MR. CARAS: Here.

4 MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of
5 Queens.

6 MS. NARANG: Here.

7 MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of
8 Staten Island.

9 MR. SHIPP: Here.

10 MR. HATCH: Will the Clerk please
11 call the first calendar item?

12 MS. RUIZ: New York City
13 Department of Parks and Recreation,
14 Calendar Item No. 1:

15 In the matter of the intent to
16 seek Franchise and Concession Review
17 Committee approval to utilize a different
18 procedure, pursuant to Section 1-16 of the
19 Concession Rules of the City of New York,
20 to authorize the New York City Department
21 of Parks and Recreation to enter into a
22 Sole Source Concession Agreement with the
23 Times Square District Management
24 Association, Inc. for the maintenance and
25 operation of Father Duffy Square in Times

Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015

4

1 Proceedings

2 Square, Manhattan, including the collection
3 of Special Event concession fees. A
4 proposed resolution was submitted relative
5 thereto and the resolution is calendared
6 for adoption.

7 MR. HATCH: Is there a member who
8 wishes to make a statement or ask a
9 question on this matter?

10 (No response.)

11 MR. HATCH: If not, will a member
12 please make a motion to move this item?

13 MR. CARAS: So moved.

14 MR. HATCH: Will another member
15 please second?

16 MR. FRIEDMAN: Second.

17 MR. HATCH: Will the Clerk please
18 take the vote?

19 MS. RUIZ: Mayor.

20 MR. HATCH: Yes.

21 MS. RUIZ: Office of the Mayor.

22 MR. FURNAS: Yes.

23 MS. RUIZ: Comptroller.

24 MR. FRIEDMAN: Yes.

25 MS. RUIZ: Corporation Counsel.

Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015

5

1 Proceedings

2 MS. CANTOR: Yes.

3 MS. RUIZ: Office of Management
4 and Budget.

5 MS. BAYER: Yes.

6 MS. RUIZ: And on behalf of the
7 borough presidents, President, Borough of
8 Manhattan.

9 MR. CARAS: Yes.

10 MS. RUIZ: Calendar Item No. 1,
11 the resolution is adopted.

12 We ask that the reporter make the
13 entire Public Meeting Agenda, which was
14 made publicly available and distributed at
15 this meeting, part of the final record of
16 this proceeding. That completes the
17 Calendar.

18 MR. HATCH: Thank you. Meeting
19 adjourned.

20 (Time noted: 2:51 p.m.)

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
) ss.:
COUNTY OF RICHMOND)

I, DANIELLE CAVANAGH, a Notary
Public within and for the State of New
York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the
within-entitled matter, and that the within
transcript is a true record of such
proceedings.

I further certify that I am not
related to any of the parties to this
action by blood or marriage and that I am
in no way interested in the outcome of this
matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
hereunto set my hand this 25th day of
November 2015.



DANIELLE CAVANAGH

**Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015**

<p align="center">A</p> <p>action (1) 6:16 adjourned (1) 5:19 adopted (1) 5:11 adoption (1) 4:6 afternoon (1) 2:2 Agenda (1) 5:13 Agreement (1) 3:22 APPEARANCES (1) 1:10 approval (1) 3:17 Association (1) 3:24 authorize (1) 3:20 available (1) 5:14 AVENUE (1) 1:23</p>	<p align="center">E</p> <p>E (2) 6:2,2 EMAIL (1) 1:25 enter (1) 3:21 entire (1) 5:13 Event (1) 4:3</p>	<p>move (1) 4:12 moved (1) 4:13</p>
<p align="center">B</p> <p>Bayer (3) 1:14 2:18 5:5 behalf (1) 5:6 Benjamin (1) 1:12 blood (1) 6:16 borough (7) 2:19,22,25 3:4,7 5:7,7 BP (3) 1:16,17,18 Bronx (1) 2:20 Brooklyn (1) 2:23 Budget (3) 1:14 2:17 5:4</p>	<p align="center">F</p> <p>F (1) 6:2 FACSIMILE (1) 1:24 Father (1) 3:25 fees (1) 4:3 final (1) 5:15 first (1) 3:11 Franchise (3) 1:3 2:3 3:16 Friedman (4) 1:15 2:13 4:16,24 Furnas (3) 1:12 2:11 4:22 further (1) 6:14</p>	<p align="center">N</p> <p>Narang (2) 1:17 3:6 New (8) 1:6,6,23 3:12,19,20 6:4,8 Notary (1) 6:7 noted (1) 5:20 November (2) 1:8 6:21</p>
<p align="center">C</p> <p>C (2) 6:2,2 calendar (4) 3:11,14 5:10,17 calendared (1) 4:5 call (2) 2:6 3:11 Cantor (3) 1:13 2:15 5:2 Caras (4) 1:16 3:3 4:13 5:9 CAVANAGH (2) 6:7,23 certify (2) 6:9,14 City (3) 3:12,19,20 Clerk (4) 1:19 2:6 3:10 4:17 collection (1) 4:2 come (1) 2:5 Committee (3) 1:3 2:4 3:17 completes (1) 5:16 Comptroller (3) 1:15 2:12 4:23 concession (6) 1:3 2:4 3:16,19,22 4:3 Corporation (3) 1:13 2:14 4:25 Counsel (3) 1:13 2:14 4:25 COUNTY (1) 6:5</p>	<p align="center">G</p> <p>Good (1) 2:2</p> <p align="center">H</p> <p>Hall (1) 1:7 hand (1) 6:20 Hatch (10) 1:11 2:2,9 3:10 4:7,11 4:14,17,20 5:18 hereunto (1) 6:20</p>	<p align="center">O</p> <p>Office (6) 1:12,14 2:10,16 4:21 5:3 operation (1) 3:25 order (1) 2:5 outcome (1) 6:17</p> <p align="center">P</p> <p>p.m. (2) 1:8 5:20 Parks (2) 3:13,21 part (1) 5:15 parties (1) 6:15 Peter (1) 1:11 please (5) 2:6 3:10 4:12,15,17 President (6) 2:19,22,25 3:4,7 5:7 presidents (1) 5:7 procedure (1) 3:18 proceeding (1) 5:16 proceedings (6) 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:10,13 proposed (1) 4:4 Public (4) 1:2 2:4 5:13 6:8 publicly (1) 5:14 pursuant (1) 3:18</p>
<p align="center">D</p> <p>DANIELLE (2) 6:7,23 day (1) 6:20 Department (2) 3:13,20 different (1) 3:17 distributed (1) 5:14 District (1) 3:23 Duffy (1) 3:25</p>	<p align="center">I</p> <p>including (1) 4:2 intent (1) 3:15 interested (1) 6:17 Island (2) 1:18 3:8 item (4) 3:11,14 4:12 5:10</p> <p align="center">J</p> <p>James (2) 1:16,18 Jane (1) 1:14 Jasmine (1) 1:17</p>	<p align="center">Q</p> <p>Queens (2) 1:17 3:5 question (1) 4:9</p>
	<p align="center">K</p> <p align="center">L</p> <p align="center">M</p> <p>maintenance (1) 3:24 MAMARONECK (2) 1:23,23 Management (4) 1:14 2:16 3:23 5:3 Manhattan (4) 1:16 3:2 4:2 5:8 marriage (1) 6:16 matter (4) 3:15 4:9 6:11,18 Mayor (6) 1:11,12 2:8,10 4:19,21 meeting (5) 1:2 2:5 5:13,15,18 member (3) 4:7,11,14 motion (1) 4:12</p>	<p align="center">R</p> <p>R (1) 6:2 Reade (1) 1:6 record (2) 5:15 6:12 Recreation (2) 3:13,21 related (1) 6:15 relative (1) 4:4 reported (1) 6:10 reporter (1) 5:12 REPORTING (1) 1:22 resolution (3) 4:4,5 5:11 response (3) 2:21,24 4:10 Review (3) 1:3 2:4 3:16 Richard (1) 1:15 RICHMOND (1) 6:5 roll (1) 2:7 Ruiz (19) 1:19 2:8,10,12,14,16,19 2:22,25 3:4,7,12 4:19,21,23,25 5:3,6,10</p>

**Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
November 12, 2015**

Rules (1) 3:19	0
S	1
second (2) 4:15,16	1 (2) 3:14 5:10
Section (1) 3:18	1-16 (1) 3:18
seek (1) 3:16	10007 (1) 1:6
SERVICES (1) 1:22	10543 (1) 1:23
set (1) 6:20	12 (1) 1:8
Sharon (1) 1:13	139 (1) 1:23
Shipp (2) 1:18 3:9	2
Sole (1) 3:22	2:42 (1) 1:8
Source (1) 3:22	2:51 (1) 5:20
Special (1) 4:3	2015 (2) 1:8 6:21
Spector (1) 1:7	212.95.DEPOS (1) 1:24
Square (3) 3:23,25 4:2	22 (1) 1:6
ss (1) 6:4	25th (1) 6:20
State (2) 6:4,8	3
statement (1) 4:8	4
Staten (2) 1:18 3:8	5
STENO-KATH (1) 1:22	6
Stenokath@verizon.net (1) 1:25	7
Stephanie (1) 1:19	722-0816 (1) 1:24
Street (1) 1:6	8
submitted (1) 4:4	9
T	914 (1) 1:24
T (2) 6:2,2	914.381.2061 (1) 1:24
take (1) 4:18	953-3767 (1) 1:24
thank (2) 2:3 5:18	
thereto (1) 4:5	
Thursday (1) 1:8	
Time (1) 5:20	
Times (2) 3:23,25	
transcript (1) 6:12	
true (1) 6:12	
U	
utilize (1) 3:17	
V	
vote (1) 4:18	
W	
way (1) 6:17	
WHEREOF (1) 6:19	
wishes (1) 4:8	
within-entitled (1) 6:11	
WITNESS (1) 6:19	
X	
x (2) 1:2,4	
Y	
York (8) 1:6,6,23 3:12,19,20 6:4,9	
Z	

PUBLIC MEETING

FRANCHISE AND CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 12, 2015 @ 2:30 P.M.

22 READE STREET, NEW YORK, NY

NOTE: INDIVIDUALS REQUESTING SIGN LANGUAGE INTERPRETERS SHOULD CONTACT THE MAYOR'S OFFICE OF CONTRACT SERVICES, 253 BROADWAY, 9TH FL., NEW YORK, NEW YORK, N.Y. 10007 (212) 788-7490, NO LATER THAN SEVEN (7) BUSINESS DAYS PRIOR TO THE PUBLIC MEETING. TDD USERS SHOULD CALL VERIZON RELAY SERVICE.

*Franchise and Concession Review Committee Meeting
Thursday, November 12, 2015 @ 2:30 P.M.*

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 1: **IN THE MATTER** of the intent to seek Franchise and Concession Review Committee approval to utilize a different procedure, pursuant to Section 1-16 of the Concession Rules of the City of New York, to authorize the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation ("Parks") to enter into a Sole Source Concession Agreement ("Agreement") with the Times Square District Management Association, Inc. ("the Alliance") for the maintenance and operation of Father Duffy Square in Times Square, Manhattan, including the collection of Special Event concession fees. The Alliance shall provide, or cause to be provided, services for the maintenance and operation of the Licensed Premises including the Statuary, Plaza, and the Public Stairs to the reasonable satisfaction of the Commissioner. As set forth in the Agreement, the Alliance shall collect sixty percent (60%) of the Special Event concession fees ("Fees") from third parties and use all Fees it collects to offset the Alliance's costs of providing maintenance and operation services under this Agreement. The term of this Agreement shall commence upon Parks' giving written Notice to Proceed to Licensee and shall terminate on the earlier of (i) January 6, 2025, or (ii) the termination of the Ticket Stand License.

**A proposed resolution was submitted relative thereto.
RESOLUTION FOR ADOPTION.**