CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

September 17, 2014/Calendar No. 2 C 140210 ZSR

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by Gateway Cathedral pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 74-53 of the Zoning Resolution to modify the requirements of Section 25-12 (Maximum Size of Accessory Group Parking Facilities) to allow a group parking facility accessory to uses in a large-scale community facility development with a maximum capacity of 618 spaces, on property located at 200 Boscombe Avenue (Block 7577, Lot 3), in an R3X District, within the Special South Richmond Development District, Borough of Staten Island, Community District 3.

The application for the special permit was filed by Gateway Cathedral on December 19, 2013, to allow a group parking facility, accessory to a large scale community facility development, to exceed the maximum number of allowed parking spaces.

RELATED ACTIONS

In addition to the special permit, which is the subject of this report, implementation of the proposed development also requires action by the City Planning Commission on the following applications which are being considered concurrently with this application:

N 140211 RAR Authorizations for the removal of trees in the Special South Richmond Development District (SSRDD) pursuant to Section 107-64 and for the modification of existing topography pursuant to Section 107-65.

N 140212 RAR Authorization for modification of group parking facility and access regulations in the SSRDD pursuant to Section 107-68.

BACKGROUND

The applicant, Gateway Cathedral, is seeking a special permit to allow a group parking facility which serves their congregation to exceed the maximum number of allowed parking spaces. The parking facility is within the church's campus, a 16.7 acre interior zoning lot with 760 feet of frontage on Boscombe Avenue, located in an R3X zoning district within the Special South Richmond Development District (SSRDD). The subject site is currently developed with a 78,884 square foot church building, with the largest assembly hall having 704 seats, and a 44,589 square foot school. There are 422 accessory open parking spaces on the site, accessible from 2 curb cuts onto Boscombe Avenue, which is along the northern lot line.

The applicant is proposing to increase the size of the church by 57,728 square feet, increase the size of the existing school by 12,022 square feet, and construct a new 2,400 square feet maintenance building. The entire development would have approximately 147,739 square feet of floor area (0.207 FAR) and approximately 87,404 square feet (15.8%) of lot coverage. The existing parking lot would be enlarged from 422 to 618 accessory parking spaces and continue to utilize the two existing curb cuts on Boscombe Avenue. The parking area will be landscaped with 144 additional trees in order to meet SSRDD landscaping requirements, except where solar panels on a canopy is proposed over a portion of the parking area. An outdoor athletic field will also be constructed on the southwest corner of the site with a running track. There would be a 6-foot wide pedestrian path between this development site and a proposed residential subdivision development to the south.

Gateway Cathedral's zoning lot (Block 7577, Lot 3) had been much larger, occupying about 22.5 acres of property. On August 20, 2014, the City Planning Commission (CPC) approved a number of actions (N 140224 RCR, N 140225 RCR, N 140226 RAR), including the subdivision of the zoning lot (Block 7577, Lots 3 and 200), the removal of trees, and modification of topography to facilitate the sale of approximately 5.8 acres (Tax Lot 200) south of the church to a private developer for the construction of approximately 35 two-family detached homes, which would be accessed from private roads off of Richmond Valley Road. The area around the church is predominately developed with detached residential homes to the east and west, the Outerbridge Crossing and West Shore Expressway (Route 440) to the north, and vacant land zoned R3X, to the south.

The church was initially built pursuant to SSRDD authorizations approved by the CPC on June 12, 1991, (N 900589 RAR) for the removal of trees, modification of topography, and modification of an accessory group parking facility regulations to allow a parking lot with more than 30 parking spaces. The existing school was constructed as-of-right in early 2004.

Subsequently, on March 20, 2006 the City Planning Commission (CPC) approved a Special Permit (C 060134 ZSR) to modify the requirements of Section 25-12 (Maximum Size of Group Parking Facilities) of the Zoning Resolution to allow a group parking facility accessory to a large scale community facility development. The parking facility was approved for a maximum of 941 parking spaces accessed from 3 curb cuts, two on Boscombe Avenue and one on Richmond Valley Road. The City Council did not assume jurisdiction of the application and the Resolution of approval by the City Planning Commission became effective on April 10, 2006. Related

SSRDD Authorizations for the Removal of Trees, Modification of Existing Topography, and Modification of Group Parking Facility and Access Regulations to allow a parking lot with more than 30 parking spaces were also approved by the City Planning Commission on March 20, 2006 (N 060135 RAR, N 060136 RAR). Only 422 of the approved 942 parking spaces were subsequently built.

To facilitate the proposed project, the applicant requests a special permit (C 140210 ZSR) pursuant to Section 74-53 Special Permit for Accessory Group Parking Facilities for Uses in Large-Scale Community Facility Developments of the Zoning Resolution. The action would modify the requirements of Section 25-12 (Maximum Size of Accessory Group Parking Facilities) to allow a group parking facility accessory to uses in a large-scale community facility development with a maximum of 618 spaces, which exceeds the maximum amount of permitted spaces. For Houses of Worship, zoning regulations require a minimum of one space for every ten persons based on the capacity of the largest room of assembly. The proposed largest room assembly has a 1,800 person capacity, which equates to 180 required parking spaces. The existing development currently has a group parking facility with 422 spaces, which already exceeds the minimum parking requirement of 180 spaces. No parking is required for a school in an R3 zoning district. The applicant is requesting a total of 618 spaces, an addition of 438 above the required amount.

The project also requires authorizations (N 140211 RAR) for the Removal of Trees and Modification of Topography and (N 140212 RAR) for the Modification of Group Parking Facilities and Access Regulations in the SSRDD; these actions are not subject to ULURP.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 140210 ZSR), in conjunction with the applications for the related actions (N 140211 RAR, N 140212 RAR), was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA), and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 06DCP027R. The lead is the City Planning Commission.

After a study of the potential environmental impact of the proposed action, a Negative Declaration was issued on June 23, 2014.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 140210 ZSR) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on June 23, 2014, and was duly referred to Community Board 3 and the Borough President in accordance with Title 62 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b), along with the related non-ULURP applications (N 140211 RAR and N 140212 RAR) which were referred for information and review, in accordance with the procedures for non-ULURP matters..

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 3 held a public hearing on this application (C 140210 ZSR) at a special meeting on July 9, 2014, and by a vote of 17 to 2 with no abstentions, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the application.

Borough President Recommendation

This application (C 140210 ZSR) was considered by the Borough President of Staten Island, who issued a recommendation on July 22, 2014, approving the application.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On August 6, 2014, (Calendar No. 3) the City Planning Commission scheduled August 20, 2014, for a public hearing on this application (C 140210 ZSR). The hearing was duly held on August 20, 2014 (Calendar No. 18). There were three speakers in favor of the application and none in opposition.

The applicant's primary representative spoke in favor of the application, describing the current proposal and noting the site's proximity to major streets and highways for access. The applicant's architect spoke in favor of the application, describing the proposed enlargements to the building, the prior larger hall of assembly that was approved by the CPC but not constructed, and the proposed solar array over a portion of the parking lot. A third applicant representative explained that the current proposal is revised from the original CPC approval due to changed circumstances including economic conditions, and described how an unfinished portion of the prior enlargement was used to benefit the local community.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

Waterfront Revitalization Program Consistency Review

This application was reviewed by the Department of City Planning for consistency with the policies of the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program (WRP), as amended, approved by the New York City Council on October 13, 1999 and by the New York State Department of State on May 28, 2002, pursuant to the New York State Waterfront Revitalization and Coastal Resources Act of 1981 (New York State Executive Law, Section 910 et seq.). The designated WRP number is 05-070.

The City Planning Commission, acting as the City Coastal Commission, having reviewed the waterfront aspects of this action, finds that the actions will not substantially hinder the achievement of any WRP policy and hereby determines that this action is consistent with WRP policies.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that the grant of this special permit is appropriate.

The special permit allows a group parking facility accessory to a large scale community facility development to exceed the prescribed maximum number of parking spaces set forth in Section 25-12. The applicant proposes an enlargement of an accessory group parking facility for a large scale community facility development on a 16.7 acre zoning lot with two curb cuts on Boscombe Avenue. The applicant is requesting a total of 618 spaces, an increase of 196 spaces.

The minimum accessory parking required by zoning regulations is one parking space for every

ten persons, based on the capacity of the largest room of assembly. The applicant has studied their current parking utilization rate and finds that more parking capacity is needed because many of their congregants drive from locations which have inadequate transit links to southern Staten Island, such as New Jersey. The proposed parking capacity of 618 spaces equates to about one space for every three people. The current proposal has fewer parking spaces, on a proportionately smaller zoning lot with a smaller proposed largest hall of assembly, than the 941 parking spaces previously approved by the CPC (C 060134 ZSR).

The Commission believes that the proposed use is located to draw a minimum of vehicular traffic through local streets in residential areas. The site currently has two curb cuts on Boscombe Avenue. Boscombe Avenue is a two-way, four lane street built to a width of approximately 75 feet with direct access to the eastbound side of Route 440 and access via two other thoroughfares, Tyrellan Avenue and the Veterans Road West, to the westbound side of Route 440. Many congregants arriving from New Jersey, immediately west of the site, and the West Shore Expressway, immediately east of the site, use Route 440 and the thoroughfares, thereby minimizing the use of local streets in residential areas. The Commission also believes that these thoroughfares and adjoining highway ramps will be adequate to handle the traffic demand.

FINDINGS

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 74-53 of the Zoning Resolution:

(a) that such use is located as to draw a minimum of vehicular traffic to and through local streets in residential areas;

(b) that such use has adequate reservoir space at the vehicular entrance to accommodate either ten automobiles or five percent of the total parking spaces provided by the use, whichever is greater, but in no event shall reservoir space be required for more than 50 automobiles;

(c) the streets providing access to such use will be adequate to handle the traffic generated thereby;

(d) not applicable.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission, in its capacity as the City Coastal Commission, has reviewed the waterfront aspects of this application and finds that the proposed action is consistent with WRP policies; and be it further

RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination, and the consideration and findings described in this report, the application of Gateway Cathedral for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 74-53 of the Zoning Resolution to modify the requirements of Section 25-12 (Maximum Size of Accessory Group parking Facilities) to allow a group parking facility accessory to uses in a large-scale community facility development with a maximum of 618 spaces on property located at 200 Boscombe Avenue (Block 7577, Lot 3), in an R3X District, within the Special South Richmond Development District, Borough of

Staten Island, Community District 3, is approved subject to the following terms and conditions:

1. The property that is the subject of this application (C 140210 ZSR) shall be developed in size and arrangement substantially in accordance with the dimensions, specifications and zoning computations indicated on the following plans, prepared by Todd R. Phillippi RA Architect, filed with this application and incorporated in this resolution:

Drawing No.	Title	Last Date
C0	Cover Sheet	06/04/14
C1	Site Plan	03/28/14
C2	Landscaping Plan	03/28/14
C3	Tree Removal Plan	03/28/14
C4	Topography Modification Plan	03/28/14
C4a	Detail Plans & Section	03/28/14

2. Such development shall conform to all applicable provisions of the Zoning Resolution, except for the modifications specifically granted in this resolution and shown on the plans listed above which have been filed with this application. All zoning computations are subject to verification and approval by the New York City Department of Buildings.

3. Such development shall conform to all applicable laws and regulations relating to its construction, operation and maintenance.

4. All leases, subleases, or other agreements for use or occupancy of space at the subject property shall give actual notice of this special permit to the lessee, sublessee or occupant.

5. Upon the failure of any party having any right, title or interest in the property that is the subject of this application, or the failure of any heir, successor, assign, or legal representative of such party, to observe any of the covenants, restrictions, agreements, terms or conditions of this resolution whose provisions shall constitute conditions of the special permit hereby granted, the City Planning Commission may, without the consent of any other party, revoke any portion of or all of said special permit. Such power of revocation shall be in addition to and not limited to any other powers of the City Planning Commission, or of any other agency of government, or any private person or entity. Any such failure as stated above, or any alteration in the development that is the subject of this application that departs from any of the conditions listed above, is grounds for the City Planning Commission or the City Council, as applicable, to disapprove any application for modification, cancellation or amendment of the special permit hereby granted.

6. Neither the City of New York nor its employees or agents shall have any liability for money damages by reason of the city's or such employee's or agent's failure to act in accordance with the provisions of this special permit.

The above resolution (C 140210 ZSR), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on September 17, 2014 (Calendar No. 2), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough President together with a copy of the plans of the development, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

CARL WEISBROD, Chairman
RAYANN BESSER, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ALFRED C. CERULLO, III, MICHELLE R. DE LA UZ, RICHARD W. EADDY, CHERYL COHEN EFFRON, BOMEE JUNG, ANNA HAYES LEVIN, ORLANDO MARIN, Commissioners

LARISA ORTIZ, Commissioner abstaining

Community/Borough Board Recommendation

Pursuant to the **U**niform **L**and **U**se **R**eview **P**rocedure

Application #: **C 140210ZSR**	Project Name: **Church at the Gateway**
CEQR Number: 06DCP027R	Borough(s): Staten Island Community District Number(s): 3

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

SUBMISSION INSTRUCTIONS

1. Complete this form and return to the Department of City Planning by one of the following options:
   - **EMAIL (recommended):** Send email to **CalendarOffice@planning.nyc.gov** and include the following subject line**:** (CB or BP) Recommendation + (6-digit application number), e.g., "CB Recommendation #C100000ZSQ"
   - **MAIL:** Calendar Information Office, City Planning Commission, Room 2E, 22 Reade Street, New York, NY 10007
   - **FAX:** (212) 720-3356 and note "Attention of the Calendar Office"
2. Send one copy of the completed form with any attachments to the applicant's representative at the address listed below, one copy to the Borough President, and one copy to the Borough Board, when applicable.

Docket Description:

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by Church at the Gateway pursuant to Sections 197-c of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 74-53 of the Zoning Resolution to modify the requirements of Section 25-12 (Maximum Size of Accessory Group Parking Facilities) to allow a group parking facility accessory to uses in a large-scale community facility development with a maximum capacity of 618 spaces, on property located at 200 Boscombe Avenue (Block 7577, Lot 3), in an R3X District, within the Special South Richmond Development District, Borough Of Staten Island, Community District 3.
Plans for this proposal are on file with the City Planning Commission and may be seen in Room 3N, 22 Reade Street, New York, N>Y. 10007

Applicant(s):	**Applicant's Representative:**
Church at the Gateway 200 Boscombe Avenue Staten Island, NY 10309	Phillip L. Rampulla Rampulla Associates Architects 155 3rd Street Staten Island, NY 10306

Recommendation submitted by:
Staten Island Community Board 3

Date of public hearing: July 9, 2014 **Location:** 655 Rossville Ave., Suite 218, Staten Island, NY 10309

Was a quorum present? **YES** ☒ **NO** ☐ *A public hearing requires a quorum of 20% of the appointed members of the board, but in no event fewer than seven such members.*

Date of Vote: July 9, 2014 **Location:** 655 Rossville Ave., Suite 218, Staten Island, NY 10309

RECOMMENDATION

☒ Approve ☐ Approve With Modifications/Conditions
☐ Disapprove ☐ Disapprove With Modifications/Conditions

Please attach any further explanation of the recommendation on additional sheets, as necessary.

Voting

 # In Favor: 17 **# Against:** 2 **# Abstaining:** **Total members appointed to the board:** 41

Name of CB/BB officer completing this form	*Title*	*Date*
Charlene Wagner	District Manager	7/14/2014

NYCPLANNING
DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING CITY OF NEW YORK

BOROUGH PRESIDENT RECOMMENDATION
Pursuant to the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure

Application #: C 140210 ZSR	Project Name: Church at the Gateway
CEQR #: 06DCP027R	Borough(s): Staten Island
	Community District Number(s): 3

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

Docket Description:

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by Church at the Gateway pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 74-53 of the Zoning Resolution to modify the requirements of Section 25-12 (Maximum Size of Accessory Group Parking Facilities) to allow a group parking facility accessory to uses in a large-scale community facility development with a maximum capacity of 618 spaces, on property located at 200 Boscombe Avenue (Block 7577, Lot 3), in an R3X District, within the Special South Richmond Development District, Borough of Staten Island, Community District 3.

Plans for this proposal are on file with the City Planning Commission and may be seen in Room 3N, 22 Reade Street, New York, N.Y. 10007.

Recommendation:

- [x] **Approve**
- [ ] **Approve With Modifications/Conditions**
- [ ] **Disapprove**
- [ ] **Disapprove With Modifications/Conditions**

Explanation of Recommendation, Conditions or Modification:

Related Applications: N 140211 RAR N 140212RAR

Contact:
Address questions about this recommendation to:
OFFICE OF THE STATEN ISLAND BOROUGH PRESIDENT
ATTN: LAND USE DIRECTOR

Address: 10 Richmond Terrace, Staten Island, NY 10301 (Room G-12)
Phone: 718.816.2112
Fax: 718.816.2060

James S. Oddo
James S. Oddo
President of the Borough of Staten Island

July 22, 2014
DATE