



CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

March 20, 2024 / Calendar No. 18

C 240122 PPM

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services, pursuant to Section 197-c of New York City Charter, for the disposition of one city-owned property, located at 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47) pursuant to zoning, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 1

This application for the disposition of city-owned property was filed by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) on October 13, 2023.

BACKGROUND

The Department of Citywide Administrative Services proposes to dispose of one city-owned lot, 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47), pursuant to zoning in the Tribeca neighborhood of Manhattan, Community District 1. The subject property is currently under the jurisdiction of the Department of Sanitation (DSNY).

7 North Moore has been city owned since 1857 and was the original location of Hook & Ladder 8 under the ownership of the Fire Department of New York (FDNY) until 1905, at which time Ladder 8 moved into its current facility at 12 North Moore and the lot was transferred to the Department of Street Cleaning (now absorbed into DSNY). The existing building at 7 North Moore was purpose built as a Section Station in 1939 and featured break rooms, locker rooms, administrative offices, and bathrooms with showers. Altogether, the building contains approximately 3,400 square feet of floor area across three stories with a built FAR of 2.41. From 1939 to 2015, the building was used as a DSNY Manhattan Community District 1 Garage Section Station and later shared the space with the headquarters for the Permit Inspection Unit (PIU).

The DSNY PIU used the facility to muster field inspectors responsible for issuing permits for certain types of garbage removal but it was relocated to the DSNY Brooklyn 2 Garage located at 465 Hamilton Avenue in Brooklyn in 2007.

After the completion of the DSNY Spring Street Garage located at 500 Washington Street (C 080280 PCM), which included ample accommodations for break and mustering rooms, this Section Station was closed in 2015.

After the relocation of the Section Station and PIU operations, DSNY considered repurposing the 7 North Moore Street building for other DSNY operational functions, but the anticipated high redevelopment costs for this relatively small property deterred the agency from moving forward with a plan for reuse and the property has been vacant since 2015. DSNY has now determined that this surplus property no longer meets any of their needs and has requested that DCAS seek disposition approval in their behalf.

7 North Moore is located between Varick Street and West Broadway in Tribeca, it measures 1,406 square feet of lot area with 18.75 feet of frontage along North Moore, a narrow street. The property is zoned C6-2A and sits within the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District (TMU), which was first established in 1976 and subsequently revised in 1995 (N 940310 ZRM) and 2010 (N 040544 ZRM). The TMU is one of many Special Zoning Districts in the City whose regulations can supersede underlying zoning. It is comprised of seven sub-areas ranging from A1 to A7 which further modify applicable zoning regulations. 7 North Moore is located within Area A6 of the TMU, where a minimum base height of 60 feet, a maximum base height of 85 feet, and a maximum height of 160 feet constitute the permitted bulk envelope for new developments. Area A6 of the TMU further modifies the commercial FAR to 5.4 for commercial uses from the underlying FAR of 6.0. The residential equivalent of C6-2A districts is R8A. The TMU designates Inclusionary Housing for C6-2A districts within Area A6. In such cases where IH provisions are met, residential FAR is increased to 7.2.

However, the lot occupied by 7 North Moore falls under the minimum lot size requirements for R8A zoning, reducing the allowable number of dwelling units pursuant to the special provisions for small lots within the Zoning Resolution. Furthermore, because the width of the lot is less than 45 feet, the “Sliver Law” (ZR 23-692) applies. For interior lots, the Sliver Law caps building height by the width of the street on which the street wall fronts or 100 feet, whichever is less. Therefore, the height of 7 North Moore Street’s building envelope is limited by the width of North Moore Street, which is 67 feet. However, narrow buildings fronting narrow streets may exceed the height

restrictions of the Sliver Law to that of the shorter of the two adjacent structures, which in this case is 74 feet. The site is also located within a Coastal Zone and subject to flooding. Moreover, 7 North Moore is located within FEMA’s 1 percent annual chance flood zone of the floodplain and referred to in the Zoning Resolution as the high-risk flood zone.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 240122 PPM) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The lead agency is DCAS. The application was determined to be a Type II action, which requires no further environmental review.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 240122 PPM) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on November 13, 2023 and duly referred to Manhattan Community Board 1 and the Manhattan Borough President, in accordance with Title 62 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b).

Community Board Review

Manhattan Community Board 1 held a public hearing on this application (C 240122 PPM) on December 11, 2023 and on December 20, 2023, by a vote of 36 in favor, none opposed, and none abstaining, adopted a resolution to disapprove the application with the following conditions:

“The applicant satisfactorily demonstrates to CB1 that the applicant, in conjunction with CB1, has conducted and fully exhausted additional review of possible alternative uses of the property, including through potential further discussions with HPD; and while the process of further review and potential repurposing of the property by the City for public use or benefit plays out, the 7 North Moore property should be inspected for current structural integrity, then repaired and maintained at a minimum.”

Borough President Recommendation

On February 2, 2024, the Manhattan Borough President issued a recommendation to approve the application.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On February 7, 2024 (Calendar No. 11), the City Planning Commission scheduled February 21, 2024, for a public hearing on this application (C 240122 PPM). The hearing was duly held on February 21, 2024 (Calendar No. 12).

Four speakers from the applicant team spoke in favor of the application, providing an overview of the proposal. The speakers detailed the described site's location at 7 North Moore between West Broadway and Varick Street, detailed the facility's former operational functions and the current state of repair, noting the presence of water damage and mold. The applicant team concluded their presentation by describing the process through which the property was evaluated for alternative uses. The speaker stated that the decision to advance the disposition of the property at 7 North Moore was made after the determination that it did not meet any criteria for outstanding agency needs, including those of HPD.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this application for the disposition of city-owned property (C 240122 PPM) is appropriate.

The subject property at 7 North Moore Street is a three-story building purpose-built for use as a DSNY section station but no longer needed by that agency and has been vacant since 2015.

The Commission notes that DSNY relocated the operational units and functions that had historically used this building to more appropriate locations nearly a decade ago and that DSNY had explored options for repurposing the building for new DSNY functions but were unable to

develop cost-effective plans to continue to use the building and it has been empty for a number of years.

The Commission acknowledges the community board's desire to have more affordable housing opportunities in this area. They note that the applicant has consulted with the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD), which determined that the site would yield very few housing units given the property's significant site constraints. In particular, the small lot size of 7 North Moore Street coupled with a restrictive zoning envelope in this zoning district would preclude the development of affordable housing as a feasible option. The Commission also notes that the rehabilitation and repurposing of this small building as a City facility for another agency may also be infeasible due to the small size and deteriorated condition of the building.

The Commission acknowledges the position expressed by the Manhattan Borough President that the redevelopment of this site would require significant resources from multiple City agencies at a time when other initiatives may better address the City's housing and facility needs.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant adverse impact on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter, that based on the consideration described in this report, the application submitted by the Department of Citywide Administration Services (DCAS), for the disposition of city owned property located at 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47) in the Tribeca neighborhood of Manhattan, Community District 1, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 1, is approved.

The above resolution (C 240122 PPM), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on March 20, 2024 (Calendar No. 18), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Manhattan Borough President in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

DANIEL R. GARODNICK, Esq., *Chair*
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES Esq., *Vice-Chairman*
GAIL BENJAMIN, ALFRED C. CERULLO, III, ANTHONY. CROWELL, Esq.,
JOSEPH DOUEK, DAVID GOLD, Esq., LEAH GOODRIDGE, Esq.,
RASMIA KIRMANI-FRYE, ORLANDO MARÍN, JUAN CAMILO OSORIO,
RAJ RAMPERSHAD, *Commissioners*



COMMUNITY/BOROUGH BOARD RECOMMENDATION

| | |
|---|---|
| Project Name: 7 North Moore Street - DCAS Disposition | |
| Applicant: DCAS - NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services | Applicant's Primary Contact: Christian Grove |
| Application # 240122PPM | Borough: |
| CEQR Number: | Validated Community Districts: M01 |

Docket Description:
IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services, pursuant to Section 197-c of New York City Charter, for the disposition of one city-owned property, located at 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47) pursuant to zoning, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 1.

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|---|---|
| RECOMMENDATION: Conditional Unfavorable | | | |
| # In Favor: 36 | # Against: 0 | # Abstaining: 0 | Total members appointed to the board: 50 |
| Date of Vote: 12/20/2023 12:00 AM | | Vote Location: 1 Centre Street, 19th Floor | |

Please attach any further explanation of the recommendation on additional sheets as necessary

| | |
|---|--|
| Date of Public Hearing: 12/20/2023 6:00 PM | |
| Was a quorum present? Yes | <i>A public hearing requires a quorum of 20% of the appointed members of the board but in no event fewer than seven such members</i> |
| Public Hearing Location: | 1 Centre Street, 19th Floor |

| | | |
|-----------------------------|--------|---------------------------|
| CONSIDERATION: | | |
| | | |
| Recommendation submitted by | MN CB1 | Date: 12/28/2023 11:12 AM |

COMMUNITY BOARD 1 – MANHATTAN
RESOLUTION

DATE: DECEMBER 20, 2023

COMMITTEE OF ORIGIN: LAND USE, ZONING, & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

| | | | | |
|-----------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-----------|
| COMMITTEE VOTE: | 11 In Favor | 0 Opposed | 0 Abstained | 0 Recused |
| PUBLIC VOTE: | 0 In Favor | 0 Opposed | 0 Abstained | 0 Recused |
| BOARD VOTE: | 36 In Favor | 0 Opposed | 0 Abstained | 0 Recused |

RE: Application number C 240122 PPM submitted by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services, Pursuant to Section 197-c of New York City Charter, for the Disposition of One City-Owned Property, Located at 7 North Moore Street

WHEREAS: On October 13, 2023, the NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) filed an application with the NYC Department of City Planning (DCP), seeking approval under the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP) at Section 197-c of the New York City Charter for the disposition of City-owned real property located at 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47) in Community District 1 (CD1). The full application package is available on the DCP’s Zoning Application Portal at <https://zap.planning.nyc.gov/projects/2023M0412>; and

WHEREAS: According to the application, the 7 North Moore property is currently under the jurisdiction of the NYC Department of Sanitation (DSNY), which used the site from 1905 until 2015 for various uses, including as a “section house” in the current structure (built in 1939), which provided DSNY field personnel with break rooms, locker rooms, administrative offices, and bathrooms with showers. Since 2015, when DSNY operational units were relocated including to the newly built Spring Street Garage, the building has remained vacant; and

WHEREAS: The application states that the purpose of the ULURP disposition now is the following: “After the relocation of the District Garage and PIU staff, DSNY had considered repurposing the 7 North Moore Street building for other DSNY operational functions, but the anticipated high redevelopment costs for this relatively small property had deterred the agency from moving forward with a plan for reuse. DSNY has determined that this surplus property no longer meets any of their needs and has requested that DCAS seek disposition approval”; and

WHEREAS: DCP certified the application for public review on November 13, 2023, and according to the DCP’s Notice of Certification referring the application, the 45-day period for review by Manhattan Community Board 1 (CB1) begins on November 22, 2023 and must be completed by January 22, 2024; and

WHEREAS: According to DCAS’s Project Description of the Site (Project ID: 2023M0412) for 7 North Moore, “The back room of the first floor has water damage which has

led to some tiles from the drop ceiling to fall out (and) has led to some mold on the wall and ceiling in the same room”; and

WHEREAS: The Land Use, Zoning, and Economic Development (LZE) Committee of CB1 reviewed the application at the Committee’s December 11, 2023 meeting, where the applicant addressed questions concerning options for repurposing the property for public use or benefit and how or why the property was allowed to fall into disrepair; and

WHEREAS: The Honorable Christopher Marte, NYC Council Member (District 1), attended the meeting and participated with the LZE Committee in its review and questioning of the applicant; and

WHEREAS: The LZE Committee expressed deep concerns about simply disposing of the property by, for example, selling it to the highest-bidding private developer, when CD1 and the City generally have other great needs for public uses or benefits, including but not limited to additional affordable housing in the District; and

WHEREAS: During the LZE Committee meeting, the applicant conceded there was no particular rush to complete the ULURP process and agreed that it was within the applicant’s authority to waylay the application while the applicant, in conjunction with CB1, conducts additional review of possible alternative uses of the property, including through potential deeper discussions with the NYC Department of Housing Preservation & Development (HPD); and

WHEREAS: The LZE Committee expressed to the applicant that, while the process of further review and possible repurposing of the property by the City for public use or benefit plays out, the 7 North Moore property should be inspected for current structural integrity, then repaired and maintained at a minimum; now

THEREFORE
BE IT
RESOLVED

THAT: CB1 **opposes** the 7 North Moore ULURP application **unless and until** the applicant satisfactorily demonstrates to CB1 that the applicant, in conjunction with CB1, has conducted and fully exhausted additional review of possible alternative uses of the property, including through potential further discussions with HPD; and

BE IT
FURTHER
RESOLVED

THAT: While the process of further review and potential repurposing of the property by the City for public use or benefit plays out, the 7 North Moore property should be inspected for current structural integrity, then repaired and maintained at a minimum.



BOROUGH PRESIDENT RECOMMENDATION

| | |
|---|---|
| Project Name: 7 North Moore Street - DCAS Disposition | |
| Applicant: DCAS - NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services | Applicant's Administrator: Christian Grove |
| Application # 240122PPM | Borough: Manhattan |
| CEQR Number: | Validated Community Districts: M01 |

Docket Description:
 IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services, pursuant to Section 197-c of New York City Charter, for the disposition of one city-owned property, located at 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47) pursuant to zoning, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 1.

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

RECOMMENDATION: Favorable

Please attach any further explanation of the recommendation on additional sheets as necessary

CONSIDERATION:

| | | |
|-----------------------------|-------|------------------------|
| Recommendation submitted by | MN BP | Date: 2/1/2024 5:05 PM |
|-----------------------------|-------|------------------------|



OFFICE OF THE

MANHATTAN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

1 Centre Street, 19th Floor, New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f
431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027
(212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f
www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov
Mark Levine, Borough President

February 2, 2023

Recommendation on ULURP Application No. 240122PPM – 7 North Moore Street By DCAS - NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services

PROPOSED ACTIONS

NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) (“The Applicant”) seeks approval to dispose of City-owned property located at 7 North Moore Street (Block 190, Lot 47) in Community District 1. The site is currently under the jurisdiction of the New York City Department of Sanitation (“DSNY”) and is improved by a vacant 3-story building that formerly served as a DSNY Manhattan Community District 1 Garage Section Station and as the headquarters for the Permit Inspection Unit (PIU). DCAS seeks approval to dispose of the property because DSNY no longer has use for the station.

BACKGROUND

Proposed Development

Prior to its use as a DSNY Section Station and Permit Inspection Unit headquarters beginning in 1939, 7 North Moore Street was originally used by the Fire Department as the location of Hook & Ladder 8. Once the station closed, the building was used by sanitation workers as a break facility and contained break rooms, locker rooms, administrative offices, and bathrooms with showers. In 2007, the Department of Sanitation considered options for new uses for the building but determined that the cost of redevelopment was too high. In 2015, DSNY relocated the break room operations to DSNY Spring Street Garage at 500 Washington Street, which had larger facilities for employees.

The lot at 7 North Moore Street is approximately 1,405 square feet and includes a vacant 3-story city-owned building totaling 3,393 square feet. The vacant building is in disrepair, with some water damage and mold issues. The site is zoned C6-2A and is within area A6 of the Tribeca Mixed Use District. The site has a current built floor area ratio of 2.41, but has a maximum FAR of 5.4, which could be increased to 7.0 with the inclusion of affordable housing. Although DCAS is seeking to dispose of the site, there currently are no plans for its future use or development.

While residential development is allowed as-of right on the site, DSNY has stated that high redevelopment costs prohibit the agency from repurposing the site. HPD has also represented that the site would yield at most few housing units at a much higher cost per unit than alternative options for affordable housing would cost the City.

DSNY has also represented that the disposition of the building from the agency's portfolio will help meet PEG requirement and allow saved funds to be used towards other essential DSNY services.

Area Context

The site is located in the Tribeca neighborhood of Manhattan Community District 1, between Varick Street and West Broadway. Nearby zoning districts include commercial and manufacturing districts, as well as contextual medium- and high-density residential districts. There are several institutions nearby, including the Tribeca Community School, the New York Academy of Art, the Borough of Manhattan Community College, the Tribeca Performing Arts Center, the Portfolio School, the Church Street School for Music and Arts, and C3 and New York Chinese Baptist churches. There are several parks within a few blocks of the site including Hudson River Park and Tribeca Park. The area is well served by public transit, with the MTA 1 Subway line one block south of the site and A, C, and E lines two blocks northeast, as well as the M20 bus line half a block west.

COMMUNITY BOARD RESOLUTION

Community Board 1 heard and discussed the proposal at its Land Use, Zoning and Economic Development Committee meeting on December 11th, 2023. The Committee expressed concerns about disposition of the site without considerations for its potential use for affordable housing development or other alternate public uses. On December 20th, Community Board 1's Full Board voted to recommend disapproval of this application, unless and until further review of the site could be completed in conjunction with HPD to determine if the site could be utilized for a public use or benefit.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S COMMENTS

7 North Moore Street is a small site, with a lot that is about 18 feet wide and a depth of 75 feet - significantly smaller than most lots in Manhattan. The size of the site, in addition to limitations imposed by its zoning, impose significant constraints on potential development, especially because residential development would introduce additional requirements, such as elevators, on an already-small floorplate. HPD has demonstrated that due to the high cost of redevelopment on the site, only a minimal number of units could be constructed. HPD has represented that the site would produce approximately 3.5 units at a cost of over half a million dollars per unit. The agency also indicated that current zoning restrictions on the site would require any affordable units to be affordable at high Area Median Income (AMI) levels. Moreover, the redevelopment of this site would require time and resources from several City agencies at a time when there are other priorities that could make more meaningful contributions to our City's housing needs. Given these challenges, I believe that the site would much better serve the City if it is disposed and sold.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

No. 240122PPM

I therefore recommend approval of ULURP application No. 240122PPM.



Mark Levine
Manhattan Borough President