Request for Information (RFI) Apprenticeship Expansion Ideas and Resources

This RFI seeks information and comments for review and consideration related to the design, management, growth, and ongoing support needed to launch and expand apprenticeships in New York City.

A. Background

The Mayor's Office of Talent and Workforce Development and the Workforce Development Corporation ("WDC") are releasing an RFI as part of an overall initiative to expand and diversify apprenticeships in New York City.

The Mayor's Office of Talent and Workforce Development ("NYC Talent") works to mobilize New Yorkers and the local talent development ecosystem to achieve an inclusive economy. NYC Talent's Strategy for a thriving and equitable workforce includes ensuring:

- NYC residents succeed in fulfilling, economically secure careers.
- NYC employers can thrive because they hire, train, and advance diverse talent and operate in a supportive local business environment.
- All New Yorkers benefit from shared prosperity.
- NYC promotes equity and relentlessly tackles historic employment disparities.

For a fuller background on NYC Talent's strategy, please see Exhibit A.

An apprenticeship program combines classroom learning with extensive on-the-job training that helps an apprentice master a set of skills related to a specific occupation. Apprentices are paid, receive increases in their wage over time as they hit milestones in their learning, and have a clear path to permanent employment with their employer. See Exhibit B for more detail and a list of threshold criteria.

Building from the recommendation of the <u>Future of Workers Task Force</u> to "Expand and Diversify Apprenticeships", Mayor Adams confirmed New York City's commitment to apprenticeship by setting the moonshot goal of 30,000 apprenticeships by 2030. In April 2024 **NYC Talent's Apprenticeship Accelerator** (described in Exhibit A) will release a set of solicitations, including this Request For Information, as a direct result of New York City's commitment to expand apprenticeship. (Please see Exhibit B for a list of threshold criteria that define an apprenticeship program and Exhibit C for a list of occupations that NYC Talent has identified as powering the New York City economy.) In contrast to the contracts, we will administer through the Apprenticeship Development RFP and Apprenticeship Implementation RFP, this **Request For Information** seeks to collect information to help us better understand the universe of apprenticeship programs and stakeholders in NYC and how the city can best support the expansion of Apprenticeships.

Please see the WDC's web site for the RFP solicitations: https://www.nyc.gov/site/sbs/about/wdc-contracting-opportunities.page)

B. Goals of the RFI

- To share our research-based definition of apprenticeship and receive feedback.
- Identify programs that meet some or all components of an apprenticeship.
- Build our understanding of the broader universe of apprenticeship programs and stakeholders in New York City
- Source feedback on potential supports to expand Apprenticeships to meet the Mayor's moonshot goal of 30,000 apprentices in New York City by 2030
- Expand NYC Talent's understanding on how the Apprenticeship Accelerator can most strategically help expand and diversify apprenticeships in NYC.
- Determine if there is interest among local stakeholders to form an apprenticeship community of practice to share learnings, strategies, and expertise.

C. CONTENT OF THE RESPONSE

Instructions:

Responses to this Request For Information (RFI) may include but are not limited to program details, solutions, designs, challenges, proposed support systems, and management of apprenticeship programs in New York City.

Please submit a response to this RFI that addresses some or all the following categories:

Basic Information

- Organization name
- Name and title of person making submission
- Email address
- Phone number
- Do you have an existing apprenticeship program or idea?
- What industry sector and/or occupations you are focused on or thinking of focusing on? (Please indicate if you are focused on any of the occupations listed in Exhibit C.)
- Please provide a brief description of the talent need you are addressing.

Building a Community of Practice

- Are you interested in being integrated into a community of practice to advance the expansion of apprenticeships in New York City?
- What types of information or resources would be most helpful to you and, if applicable, your program, from a community of practice?

Please answer the following questions only if you have an <u>existing program</u> that meets some or all of the threshold criteria of an apprenticeship program listed in Exhibit C.

Program Information

• Name of program

- Indicate the number of months or years the program has existed
- Type(s) of populations you serve (adults, youth, veterans, people with disabilities, etc.)
- Number of program participants served annually and to date
- Describe which of the threshold criteria your program meets and how you meet them (see Exhibit B).

Identifying Barriers

- Which threshold criteria does your program not currently meet?
- What type of support would help you implement these additional items?
- Is your program a Registered Apprenticeship Program? Why or why not?
- What barriers do you see facing relevant stakeholders in implementing the components of apprenticeship?
- What supports do you believe are needed to overcome those barriers?
- What policy recommendations would you make to City government that you believe would help New York City reach its goal of 30,000 apprentices by 2030?

Submissions

Electronic Submissions

All submissions must utilize electronic mail and be sent as a Microsoft Word or PDF document by **May 8, 2024,** to: Chenelle Dennis — cdennis@sbs.nyc.gov

EXHIBIT A:

Background on the Mayor's Office of Talent and Workforce Development's Investment and Implementation Strategy

A. Overall NYC Approach to Talent Development

The Mayor's Office of Talent and Workforce Development ("NYC Talent") works to mobilize New Yorkers and the local talent development infrastructure to achieve an inclusive economy and realize the citywide employment objectives laid out in Mayor Eric Adams' Executive Order #22 (2022). To do this, NYC Talent partners with and mobilizes public agencies, educational institutions, non-profits, unions, communities, and industry so that:

- NYC residents succeed in fulfilling, economically secure careers
- NYC employers can thrive because they hire, train, and advance diverse talent and operate in a supportive local business environment
- · All New Yorkers benefit from shared prosperity

To promote equity and relentlessly tackle historic employment disparities, we aggregate and align public and private resources to match talent to opportunity; disaggregate data to understand and adapt to the rapidly changing labor market; leverage technology advancements; promote targeted policies; and engage employers and jobseekers.

B. New York City Talent Investment Fund

Another recommendation of the Future of Workers Task Force was to launch a "Talent Investment Fund." The **New York City Talent Investment Fund** is a model with public/philanthropic collaboration where public and private partners collaborate, innovate, and invest together in a co-design model by developing shared investment criteria, identifying joint learnings and data to influence and direct other investments, increase their transparency by creating a clear, public, and high-profile competitive process for grant awards, and braid together funding streams and close gaps in the system.

C. Goals of the Initiative

The overarching objective of this initiative is to expand and diversify apprenticeships in New York City, with emphasis on achieving the Mayor's goal of 30,000 apprentices by 2030 and by enabling economically disadvantaged individuals and communities to access these opportunities. See Section II — Summary of the Request for Proposals above for more background on our approach to apprenticeships, Exhibit B for the minimum criteria that define an apprenticeship program, and Exhibit C for the list of occupations that we believe power the New York City economy and would make strong candidates for apprenticeship programs.

Key Goals:

1. Foster the development of new apprenticeship programs

- a. Award contracts to **intermediary organizations** that can identify the needs of multiple employers and identify where apprenticeship is an appropriate solution, as well as develop effectiveness mechanisms for connecting economically disadvantaged individuals and communities to apprenticeships.
- b. Support the development of **comprehensive plans** for apprenticeship programs.

2. Award contracts to support the launch of new apprenticeship programs

a. Provide financial support to **intermediaries** to launch new apprenticeship programs with groups of employers.

3. Explore strategies to align apprenticeship pipelines with the City of New York's procurement spending

- a. Develop strategies to ensure there are apprenticeship opportunities that are responsive to the needs of City of New York vendors that are subject to Community Hiring, a new state law that allows City agencies to set hiring goals on their procurement contracts across a broad range of industries. See section "D" below for more details.
- b. Ensure economically disadvantaged individuals and communities have access to pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship programs.

D. Community Hiring

Authorized by recent State legislation, Community Hiring allows City agencies to set hiring goals on their contracts for vendors to provide employment and apprenticeship opportunities to eligible candidates. Community Hiring will apply to procurement contracts for construction, professional services, standard services, and human services. Community Hiring will be a key tool for NYC Talent's broader place-based workforce strategies, which will include connecting jobseekers to pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship opportunities, serving employers by sourcing talent for them to meet their workforce needs, and identifying ways to strengthen how the public workforce system partners with non-profits and community-based organizations. NYC Talent will work with other City agencies to identify ways to strengthen how the public workforce system partners with place-based networks of nonprofit and community-based organizations.

EXHIBIT B:

Definition of an Apprenticeship Program

An apprenticeship program combines classroom learning with extensive on-the-job training that helps an apprentice master a set of skills related to a specific occupation. Apprentices are paid, receive increases in their wage over time as they hit milestones in their learning, and have a clear path to permanent employment with their employer. See below for the full list of threshold criteria. In the United States, apprenticeship programs have historically been concentrated in the construction trades, but increasingly other sectors – including healthcare, professional services, tech, and others – are starting to adopt apprenticeship programs as a robust way to develop talent.

Some organizations choose to formally *register* their apprenticeship program with the New York State Department of Labor or the U.S. Department of Labor. We consider <u>Registered Apprenticeships</u> to be the "gold standard" of apprenticeship programs, given all of their requirements and intended supports for apprentices and employers. We recommend that all proposers, if they ultimately launch an apprenticeship program, consider registering their apprenticeship program with the New York State Department of Labor. If a proposer does not register their apprenticeship program, then the program must meet all of the standards listed in Exhibit B.

Minimum Criteria for Apprenticeship Programs

Category ¹	Threshold Criteria	Best Practice
Career Path	 Designed in partnership with industry, with a focus on jobs that power the economy. Designated track into a full-time employment role – and a continued career path – upon program completion Transferable skills recognized by employers other than apprenticeship sponsor/employer 	 Clearly defined skillset achieved that are transferable across multiple employers Focus on in-demand, cross-industry occupations with economic mobility and access to multiple career pathways Clear career path steps for apprentices

¹ The information in this chart is from the New York City Landscape Report, a report prepared by Accenture for the Mayor's Office of Talent and Workforce Development: https://www.nyc.gov/assets/wkdev/downloads/pdf/nyc-apprenticeship-landscape-report.pdf

Category ¹	Threshold Criteria	Best Practice
Opportunity	 Commitment to accessibility and a programmatic design that supports people from a diversity of backgrounds Program design should recruit broadly and in ways that address historic disparities 	Ensure apprenticeship includes key practices, including but not limited to: • Measurable commitment and goals internally and externally • Incorporation of participant voice in program design • Intentional recruitment efforts across wide range of education, community and workforce partners
Compensation	 Earn-and-learn (i.e., paid wages) throughout apprenticeship Increased wages as skills and productivity increase; pathway to a living wage 	Living wage (or above) based on the cost of living in apprenticeship location and benefits such as health insurance
Training	Formal structured learning (i.e., industry-aligned curriculum in the form of instructor-led classroom courses, web-based academic trainings, webinars) either via in-person or virtual, combined with on-the-job training	 Portable credential (industry or academic) achieved at the end of the apprenticeship, such as a certificate or associate degree 144 hours of training time (structured learning only)
Apprentice Support	Established supervisor relationship and dedicated mentorship	Soft skills development, cohort programming, stipends for transportation/childcare, mental health, services, covering program costs such as uniforms/exams fees, support to access benefits such as SNAP
Duration	 Can be time-based, competency-based or hybrid If time-based, approximately 12 months or 2,000 hours minimum If competency-based (and does not meet 2,000 hours requirement) must use formal competency framework 	

EXHIBIT C:
Occupations Identified by NYC Talent as
a Good Candidate for an Entry Level or Advancement Apprenticeship

SOC Codes ²	Occupations	Entry Salary	Median Salary	Experienced Salary	NYC Jobs 2023
11-3013	Facilities Managers	\$82,474	\$130,635	\$168,692	3,720
11-3071	Transportation, Storage, and Distribution Managers	\$88,073	\$130,409	\$177,358	1,900
13-1071	Human Resources Specialists	\$55,027	\$82,821	\$113,611	29,780
13-1082	Project Management Specialists	\$76,352	\$114,718	\$153,053	34,630
13-1111	Management Analysts	\$76,943	\$113,414	\$158,611	37,200
13-1161	Market Research Analysts and Marketing Specialists	\$59,665	\$98,349	\$122,398	54,460
15-1211	Computer Systems Analysts	\$84,251	\$131,770	\$156,983	10,070
15-1212	Information Security Analysts	\$96,342	\$144,713	\$186,206	4,530
15-1231	Computer Network Support Specialists	\$62,273	\$87,909	\$116,605	4,190
15-1241	Computer Network Architects	\$105,719	\$148,170	\$183,707	6,040
15-1242	Database Administrators	\$69,924	\$114,230	\$150,712	2,420
15-1243	Database Architects	\$94,888	\$144,380	\$175,635	2,520
15-1244	Network and Computer Systems Administrators	\$77,571	\$112,124	\$144,772	11,460
15-1252	Software Developers	\$101,527	\$146,062	\$186,721	60,630
15-2051	Data Scientists	\$84,072	\$135,682	\$171,784	10,100
21-1029	Social Workers, All Other	\$61,698	\$79,918	\$94,636	670
29-1031	Dietitians and Nutritionists	\$63,066	\$81,006	\$98,630	2,150
29-1122	Occupational Therapist	\$73,067	\$104,845	\$128,775	2,830
29-1123	Physical Therapist	\$82,074	\$106,614	\$137,382	5,180

-

² The data for these occupations was sourced from the New York State Department of Labor: https://www.bls.gov/oes/current/oes_ny.htm

SOC Codes ²	Occupations	Entry Salary	Median Salary	Experienced Salary	NYC Jobs 2023
29-1126	Respiratory Therapists	\$84,570	\$103,640	\$110,716	2,660
29-1141	Registered Nurses	\$86,935	\$108,976	\$126,111	79,350
29-2034	Radiologic Technologists and Technicians	\$72,717	\$86,353	\$98,802	5,030
29-2035	Magnetic Resonance Imaging Technologists	\$88,402	\$104,959	\$112,141	1,210
29-2055	Surgical Technician	\$52,353	\$66,976	\$78,871	2,390
29-2061	Licensed Practical Nurse	\$54,761	\$65,378	\$70,786	12,410
29-2072	Medical Records Specialists	\$40,800	\$56,270	\$70,754	3,660
31-2011	Occupational Therapy Assistants	\$60,600	\$74,931	\$88,243	720
31-2021	Physical Therapist Assistants	\$58,067	\$68,179	\$76,743	1,250
31-9092	Medical Assistant	\$38,940	\$46,921	\$51,852	15,410
35-2019	Cooks, All other	\$38,140	\$53,232	\$64,160	N/A
47-2031	Carpenters	\$48,110	\$74,374	\$99,853	13,460
47-2061	Construction Laborers	\$40,042	\$59,976	\$80,583	15,330
47-2111	Electricians	\$52,774	\$88,374	\$114,096	16,920
47-2121	Glaziers	\$44,189	\$73,635	\$98,910	1,070
47-2141	Painters, Construction and Maintenance	\$42,554	\$59,768	\$76,686	5,620
47-2152	Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters	\$50,522	\$81,189	\$109,991	10,380
47-2181	Roofers & Water proofers	\$42,791	\$58,671	\$80,007	950
47-2221	Structural Iron and Steel Workers	\$61,986	\$103,287	\$116,051	1,370
47-4011	Construction and Building Inspectors	\$59,144	\$83,305	\$103,297	3,570
49-3011	Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians	\$64,745	\$83,780	\$103,010	2,150
49-3031	Bus and Truck Mechanics and Diesel Engine Specialists	\$51,948	\$80,663	\$86,301	4,680
49-9021	Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics and Installers	\$50,207	\$77,778	\$92,938	7,280

SOC Codes ²	Occupations	Entry Salary	Median Salary	Experienced Salary	NYC Jobs 2023
49-9041	Industrial Machinery Mechanics	\$49,071	\$64,922	\$87,152	1,820
49-9051	Electrical Power-Line Installers and Repairers	\$80,294	\$109,662	\$123,913	N/A
49-9071	Maintenance and Repair Workers, General	\$38,301	\$53,322	\$68,281	66,590
51-4041	Machinist	\$40,562	\$60,974	\$76,665	740
51-4121	Welders	\$43,804	\$60,937	\$81,556	1,480
53-3032	Heavy and Tractor- Trailer Truck Drivers	\$44,388	\$60,548	\$74,083	15,700