

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

AAMNAH KHAN
ALAN DUBROW
AVROHOM WOLFSON
ARTURO ENAMORADO III
BERNARD FREILICH
BETH SLEPIAN
CHAIM SCHNEIDER
CHESKY BLAU
DANIEL KERADNAM
DOUGLAS JABLON
EDGAR GLUCK
ELLIE KASTEL
ELLIOT SIDDIQUI
JACOB ASKAL
JOSEPH GROSS
JUDITH OJO-DIAZ
JULES FLEISCHER
MAMNUNUL HAQ
MARIA ARETTINES
MIRIAM HERSKO
MOSHE FRIDMAN
NAFTALI TESSLER
NICK BERGHALL
PETER REBENWURZEL
ROCHELLE ZAMI
SAM STOBER
SHARON FUCHS
SHLOMIE RIEGER
SOL WAHBA
WIL FISHER
YAAKOV KAPLAN
YERUCHIM SILBER
YIDEL PERLSTEIN
YONAH MOSES

STAFF PRESENT

BARRY SPITZER – DISTRICT MANAGER
GITTEL FEKETE – COMMUNITY
COORDINATOR

COMMUNITY RESIDENTS

APPROXIMATELY 25 RESIDENTS PRESENT

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

ADRIANA VINK
ALEXI SHALOM
ANA CALI
DAVID FRIEDLANDER
DAVID SHLOMOVICH
JACOB HASS
JACQUE FRIEDMAN
JEFFREY DWECK
JOHN TALMADGE
LOUIE LIU
MORRIS SENDEROVICH
MORDECHAI KATZ
ROMINA FERNANDEZ
YAAKOV SCHAPIRO
YITZCHOK MOSKOWITS

ELECTED OFFICIALS AND REPRESENTATIVES

JACOB EISDORFER, REP. BORO PRES.
ANTONIO REYNOSO
COUNCILMEMBER SHAHANA HANIF
COUNCILMEMBER ALEXA AVILES
COUNCILMEMBER KALMAN YEGER
ASSEMBLYMEMBER LESTER CHANG
EMMET TERAN, REP. CM AVILES
PINNY HIKIND, REP. COMPTROLLER BRAD
LANDER
SHARON FUCHS, REP. SENATOR FELDER
RABBI YECHIEL LANDAU, REP. SENATOR
KEVIN PARKER
SOYA RADIN, REP. AM LESTER CHANG
JACK PLUSHNICK, REP. CM DAN GOLDMAN
ELI SLAVIN, REP. CM YVETTE CLARKE
SHLOMIE RIEGER, REP. AM EICHENSTEIN
CHAIM SCHNEIDER, REP. AM EICHENSTEIN
DSNY SUPERINTENDENT

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ATTENDANCE

ADOPTION OF OCTOBER MINUTES

- **Chairman Yidel Perlstein** proposed a motion to adopt the October minutes.
- **Aamnah Khan- Board Member** opposed the motion as the minutes did not include the part with the Palestinians.
- **Maria Arettines- Board Member** joined in opposition and affirmed that there were comments missing from the minutes.
- The minutes were adopted.

CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS

Delivered by Chairman Yidel Perlstein.

- The Chairman wished all a wonderful Thanksgiving.
- Board members who need to renew their appointment should have gotten an email from the Boro President advising them to file their application.
- Board members who need to reapply are:

Nick Berghall

Anna Cali

Arturo Enamorado III

Romina Fernandez

Wil Fisher

Jules Fleischer

Bernard Freilich

Moshe Fridman

Sharon Fuchs

Joseph Gross

Douglas Jablon

Yaakov (Jack) Kaplan

Mordechai Katz

Bao Zhi (Louie) Liu

Judith Ojo-Diaz

Peter Rebenwurz

Shlomo Rieger

Yaakov Schapiro

Chaim Schneider

Alexi Shalom

Beth Slepian

Samuel Stober

Sol Wahba

Rochelle Zami

- The chairman congratulated community affairs Officer Mike Riomao on being promoted to Detective. Officer Mike Riomao, now Detective Mike Riomao, has been an integral part of what goes on in our district and has always been just a phone call away when anybody in the community needs any help. This promotion is well deserved, and we are all very proud of him.
- On behalf of the entire community, the chairman expressed condolences to the family, friends, and all of the Bk12 sanitation family on the passing of John Miley who worked at Bk12 for over 20 years. He poured his heart and soul into this community. He will be missed and may his memory be a blessing.
- The next board meeting will be on December 26.
- Before moving on to the public hearing segment, the Chairman addressed the complaints regarding last month's board meeting:
- As long as I've been chairman and as long as I will be chairman, I always try to keep myself to a high standard personally and regarding board business. What I discuss at the board is official city business and I run it according to Robert's Rules of Order. If someone walks into the board and has an emotional reaction, they may misinterpret something as me taking a stance, that's not who I am. When I make remarks or when it comes to the public hearing, I never stop anyone from making their remarks as long as it is within the rules for when members speak and when the

public speaks. If anyone misunderstood, when I make remarks, no one is supposed to interrupt those remarks. People are welcome to speak either at the public hearing for members of the public or during old business or new business for board members. Whether I agree with what they say or not, does not matter to me, my opinion does not matter, they can speak and say whatever they want. This is an open and public session and I keep my personal opinions to myself. If anyone did not understand that policy, we would like to make it clear, that is how it was and will always be.

- Not that it matters, but in fact, because of the demographics in this neighborhood according to census, between 80%-90% of the district are members of the Orthodox Jewish community. At the last board meeting, I prepared 3-4 papers of remarks, but I decided not to say anything and instead kept it brief and relevant to board business. Of course, we did have a moment of silence as we do when things happen in the world, for example, as when there was the devastating fire in Bangladesh.
- I hope I have made myself clear, but if anyone feels that somebody violated your rights or disrespected you at Community Board 12, feel free to reach out to me. In the past decade we've held in very high regard keeping this place civil and respectful, especially the board members. So, if you have any issues, please feel free to reach out to me, you have my cell phone so feel free to reach out to me.

Aamnah Khan- Board Member - Why did you dismiss my remarks and remove me from the meeting?

Yidel Perlstein-Chairman- Board Members can speak during old business and new business.

PUBLIC HEARING

Adrian Blader- Resident

- She is a community member and a public health professional at a public hospital where she has seen many members suffer from chronic illness and food insecurity. Intro- A07244 would require Medicaid coverage for medically tailored meals. The statistics on food insecurity in the district indicate there is a need. Currently, food and nutrition services are not covered. Research shows a 70% reduction in ED visits when there are medically tailored meals available. It indicates better diabetes management and other areas of improved quality of life and health.
- A study conducted by Tufts University indicates that providing medically tailored meals would lead to a reduction in 1.6 million hospitalizations and save the United States \$13.6 billion. Food nutrition can combat hunger and illness. Too many community members have to decide between food and medication.
- She urged all to reach out to state representatives to vote in favor of A07244.

Anthony Loum Branch Manager of the Mapleton Branch of the Brooklyn Public Library.

- Mr. Loum shared information about the Brooklyn Public Library, including the temporary closure for renovations.

Yidel Perlstein- Chairman.

- We are happy that Rabbi Gluck is here, feeling better and out of the hospital.

DISTRICT MANAGER'S REPORT:

Delivered by District Manager Barry Spitzer

- Board members whose terms are up should make sure to submit their applications. If you have problems with the new online only system, reach out to the office for help.
- I'm glad we have DSNY here, I want to publicly thank them for helping with an issue that's been going on going back a half a year now. DSNY issued tickets to a lot of residents the morning

after Purim. It was probably a lack of knowledge or understanding. Regardless, we just got final confirmation that all tickets were dismissed. So, I want to publicly thank everyone involved.

REPORTS FROM ELECTED OFFICIALS, REPRESENTATIVES & AGENCIES

- **Eli Slavin, representing Congresswoman Yvette Clarke.**
 - Mr. Slavin shared the Congresswoman's office information.
 - They deal in federal issues, such as passports. They helped around 2,000 with this during the period when the passport office was working at a slow pace.
 - Anyone requiring assistance should reach out, we are open for business.
 - He wished Happy Holidays to everyone.

- **Pinny Hikind, representing Comptroller Brad Lander**
 - He hoped everyone had a nice Thanksgiving, and wishes everyone, on behalf of the Comptroller, a happy Chanuka and a Happy Holidays.

- **Jack Plushnik, representing Congressman Dan Goldman**
 - He wishes everyone a Happy and Healthy Holiday.
 - He left a district update newsletter with a lot of updates on what is going on in the district at the front of the room.
 - He encouraged everyone to reach out to him if they're in need of help.

- **Councilmember Shahana Hanif**
 - Councilmember Hanif came to the meeting to address the issues of the last meeting:
 - The main reason I attended the meeting is because I heard about my constituent Aannah who was appointed by my predecessor and was kicked off the meeting. She was here on zoom. I'm here to observe and see how this meeting is run. This is not the first instance of complaints that have come to my office, and not just from Aannah, but also from other members who have reached out over the last several weeks. And I take issue with any disrespect or harassment that members have raised with me. The folks who we appoint, irrespective of how many appointments we have, are appointed because they are leaders of our community, they want to serve and be able to have the capacity to transform our neighborhoods. A big part of that is ensuring that we are not alienating. As leaders who represent the board, at what is considered the most local level of government and a democratic space, we must foster inclusivity. I hope what took place at the last meeting does not happen again and I hope she will be given the space to address her comments and concerns and that a formal apology be put forward to ensure it doesn't happen again.
 - I would like additional space, not in this forum, to be able to raise the issues that have come my way and have not been addressed.

- **Yidel Perlstein- Chairman**
 - He hopes the Councilwoman will come to meetings more often. Meeting recordings are available publicly. I will be shy to apologize for something that was done wrong because I don't think anybody did anything wrong but I do apologize if anyone misunderstood and felt offended. The board follows Robert's Rules of Order, and in following the rules, it was not the intention to disrespect anyone. We respect every board member from all demographics. And we know and recognize that members represent different communities.

- **Councilmember Shahana Hanif**

- I don't think this is the most productive space. Our Community Board is diverse, with communities across racial and religiosity and political perspectives. I don't take it lightly that you are not naming the member who was harmed, and I want to talk after the meeting and come to a resolution. We need to be respectful of how members feel about issues, and we don't want anyone feeling like they can't come to the community board. And we would like to encourage more members of the public to be a part of this space. Nonetheless, thank you for raising this and being open to having that conversation.
- **Yidel Perlstein – Chairman-** He is always happy to discuss any issue. He learned from his mentor, board member Alan Dubrow who was the chairman of this board for 22 years, who he welcomes into this process, how to be welcoming and inclusive.
- **Councilmember Alexa Aviles**
 - I represent district 38, which is a small part of Boro Park. You have probably seen one of my staff representing. My Chief of Staff is here tonight. I just want to underscore that Community Boards are the most local form of government. It's important that these spaces are safe and inclusive and that we can engage in debate in a respectful manner. We will hold that standard and expect nothing less because we have to model that behavior. We will review the recordings and get back to you.
 - Councilmember Aviles shared a few updates:
 - The most recent round of budget cuts announced a 5% cut across the board, including cuts affecting everything from schools to libraries to sanitation. The most egregious are cuts to human services, like DSS that already has a 40% backlog, with people trying to get access to food and benefits. These cuts are egregious, and this is the first of three rounds of cuts we will experience in the next 6 months. There are many questions about what choices are being made and where the cuts are found. There is much disagreement from my perspective, there are certain things that should not be cut if we want a safe community and need to provide the bare essentials for our community members, especially those most vulnerable so they are safe. Over the next several months we will see where these cuts are. The council is pushing back on a good number of the cuts and asking the administration to articulate why they have chosen to cut in certain places. This is an evolving situation.
 - We recently passed Intro 708, which is a truck bill. The truck routes hadn't been looked at since 1970 and the city has changed. We see big trucks on streets and neighborhoods that cannot handle it and are being impacted. And there is also the sheer level of pollution we need to contend with from the trucks. The bill has passed, and we are waiting for it to be signed so the city can begin to look at how to revise the truck routes. DOT will need to get feedback from the community, DOT must include a variety of community voices and perspectives. We look forward to seeing the bill implemented.
 - The Department of Buildings will be at our Sunset Park office on December 20. The representative can talk to anyone about violations, or any questions you may have.
 - I hope you have a good holiday season. You will see my staff here. Obviously, redistricting will change the district quite substantially come January. We are still figuring out what the implications of that will be. Our district is one of the most diverse in the city. We have to encourage inclusive safe spaces for all of our residents. We believe in the human dignity of all people, all of us in this room are leaders and we need to espouse that.
 - Thank you for your service and have a good holiday.

Yidel Perlstein – Chairman. We appreciate your staff coming and we would love to see more of you as well.

- **Sharon Fuchs representing Senator Simcha Felder**
 - We will have an MTA van on 13th Avenue and 51st Street on Wednesday, any seniors who have MetroCard issues, the van will be here between 10 to 3.
- **Rabbi Yechiel Landau, representing Senator Kevin Parker**
 - Happy holidays
 - He thanked the board for all the hard work they put in.
- **Soya Radin, representing Assemblymember Lester Chang**
 - Assemblymember Change representing the 49th district, is available for any constituent needs. Stop by if you need help.
 - The Assemblymember is hosting a resource event on December 5th. They are also having an OATH resource event on December 7th from 11 to 3 for anyone with city violations.
- **Shloimy Rieger, representing Assemblymember Simcha Eichenstein**
 - He took a moment in the theme of thanksgiving to thank the board, the District Manager, and the Chairman for their service. We feel heard and feel safe and hope we continue down the path where anyone representing anyone feels safe at the board.
 - Thank you for all the work you do.
- **Assemblymember Lester Chang**
 - Thank you and please stay warm.
 - He wanted so state that he supports Israel. As someone who was in the military for 24 years and served in Afghanistan fighting the Taliban, I am 100% with this community and other communities. We all have to be safe, that is the most important thing.
- **Jacob Eisdorfer, representing Boro President Antonio Reynoso**
 - He reminded everyone that board member applications to join the community board are open as of November 15 and will be open until February 19. If anyone wants to join, or knows someone who wants to join, please be sure to apply. Those whose terms are expiring should have received an email and be sure to reapply in time.
- **Yidel Perlstein- Chairman-**
 - Before we go to old business and new business, I want to remind everyone that you can always reach out to me. You should all have my cell phone number.

Old Business:

Aamnah Khan- Board Member:

- This past month, this community board made no mention of the Palestinian lives lost, of their grief and unexpressed love. When I commented on this observation AFTER the opening remarks and during the roll call and after Assemblymember Carroll's remarks with no interruption, I was silenced, muted, dismissed, and removed from the meeting. How can they claim to be following Robert's rules when they removed me? When I tried to log in again, they then tried to intimidate me for not having my camera on and threatened for being in-person or else, even though meetings have always been conducted hybrid since COVID and even though they have never questioned others. In-person meetings are also held at the

Senior Center not usually at their office today. They then purposely ended the meeting and didn't let me have the final word after patiently waiting. I have screenshots and screen recording. They did not apologize, and they were not held accountable.

Today, I stand right here, showing my face.

This is not representative of the political diversity Brooklyn Community Board 12 claims to represent and how they should ever be conducted, but it is clear those who run the meeting have their own agenda as they attempt to silence and terrorize their members and homogenize the community and public to solely being Orthodox Jewish. Who is "us", who is "our," who is "they", and what "support" are they referring to?

I call for a public apology which I have not yet received, and I call for the community to watch the YouTube recording of last month's meeting as the public deserves to know how their taxpayer dollars are being funded. I call for more transparency on how to join a committee, on the voting items and for meeting information being sent in advance for the public to sign up and speak, etc. I implore all of you who have been silenced and censored with lack of transparency to speak up. Beyond demands related to my incident, I call for a more, diverse, inclusive, equitable reform of the membership of Brooklyn Community Board 12 itself including its respective removal so that each neighborhood has a significant number of Brooklyn Community Board 12 member representatives. I, and my respective community members, do not feel safe. As your constituents, and as public servants of the government, it is essential and it is your imperative duty the Community Board, a government entity, reflects such.

- As freedom of speech continues to be suppressed throughout the nation, I call on YOU, the elected officials and your team, to condemn the abhorrent acts of Community Board 12 which is not at all reflective of the shifting demographics of the community and the multiplicity of opinions, including principled and growing support among residents for the ceasefire. Mischaracterizing ceasefire and voicing one-sided empathy that excludes Palestinians (even though we have Palestinian constituents) within this current context of turbulence is extremely inappropriate and requires rectification. I am one of three Muslim members on the board representing Muslim-heavy neighborhoods of Kensington & Midwood (respectively "Little Bangladesh " & "Little Pakistan"). Incidents like these signify the reluctance and discouragement of my neighbors to join civic engagement.

I condemn the violent anti-Palestinian racism and the violent Islamophobia and I condemn those electeds, representatives, membership & leadership, including in this room refusing to publicly acknowledge it. I mourn for the 6 year-old Palestinian Wadea al-Fayoume who was murdered in Illinois. I mourn for the 3 Palestinian students shot (Hisham, Kinnnan, and Tahseen) in Vermont who may never be able to walk again. I mourn for the Lenape and Canarsie people, whose land we are on. I mourn for the ongoing blockade, siege, ethnic cleansing, concentration camp/open air prison, genocide happening now in Gaza. I mourn for the Palestinians who have no food, fuel, water, or electricity amidst the bombings of refugee camps, hospitals, bakeries, even fishing boats, amidst a brutal genocide that has left Gaza a "graveyard for children. I mourn for the 20,000 Palestinian lives and counting lost and counting (including my own friends right here in NY whose entire bloodlines have been wiped in Gaza & West Bank). I mourn for the Palestinian hostages who are often children, or those without charge or trial. We know that behind each and every number is a full life lost — a person with hopes, dreams, countless loved ones, and the basic human desire to be safe and loved. We will not be ignored, we will not be silenced, we will not be censored. Thank you.

Yidel Perlstein- Chairman

- Once again, we will take Councilmember Hanif's recommendation and take this up in private if anyone wants to feel heard. I do want to reiterate that Community Board 12 is not a political body and politics plays no part here, this is a city office, and everyone is welcome and free to say whatever they want. You have my cellphone and can call me at any time.

Maria Arettines- Board Member

- I have been a member of this board since 2021. Unfortunately, I missed last month's meeting, but I did watch the video recording and feel a responsibility to comment on what I saw.
- I was very upset to see two members of our board, two women, specifically, be cut off, literally silenced, and blatantly disrespected.
- I was not surprised to see this, sadly, because I myself have experienced and witnessed similar behavior from this board before.
- I am still not on any committees despite actively trying to do so for several years.
- Chairman Perlstein, you said earlier we can reach out to you any time we have a concern or want to speak. I have emailed you multiple times and never once heard back from you.
- When I have spoken up in board meetings you have asked who I am and why I am speaking, even though I have been a board member for several years now.
- It also seems that different rules of order are called on for different members of this board – and certain board members are given space to utilize the board as a body, while others are not. This is unacceptable. Some might even suggest or speculate that it is also not legal.
- Lastly, I would like to remind everyone that we have Palestinian constituents in this district, as well. To not acknowledge the enormous suffering that Palestinians have also gone through, and the loss of innocent Palestinian lives these past few months, is deeply upsetting and, quite simply, biased.
- As a public serving body that is also, in part, publicly funded, this is also unacceptable.

Beth Slepian- Board Member

- She wanted to say a few things. She appreciates Aamnah coming forward, that takes a huge amount of courage. She also wants to say that it was very hard to hear her remarks, though she has been able to hear other speakers fine and that seems very suspicious. She wanted to say it for the record and hopes to get a copy of their remarks.
- She also wanted to echo what Maria said in support of Palestinian lives as well as Israeli lives that are lost. She is a Jewish American and has deep concern for all innocent life lost, including the Palestinian lives, and she wants to say that for the record.
- She also wanted to echo what Maria said regarding committee assignments. It was brought to her attention last month that the Boro President released a demographic report of all Community Boards, including CB 12. There is an entire list of all members, and it includes committee assignments for many members. Included are legislative committees, environmental committees, public safety, housing and buildings, parks and recreation, civic and consumer affairs. She has never heard reports from any of these committees and has never been notified of any meetings of these committees. The only committee the board hears from is the Land Use Zoning Committee. And while she appreciates those reports, she would

love to hear from the other committees to know what is happening. She would also love to be on a committee.

- She thanked Councilmember Hanif and Councilmember Aviles for their presence at the meeting. She appreciated Councilmember Aviles for bringing up the budget cuts. Ms. Slepian is deeply concerned about the cuts as well and perhaps if the board had committees perhaps something could be done about that. She is concerned about cuts to community composting, which is important for mitigating climate change. Perhaps if there was an active sanitation committee, which she would love to be on, they could do some work to remedy that.
- She is here because she believes in bringing the community into the community board. She wants to work for the community. As a community board member, she too has been silenced and has experienced many times where they announced old business, new business, meeting adjourned, with no chance for members to speak at all. She appreciates this meeting but would like to see all meetings open, and for all people to be able to speak.

Arturo Enamorado III- Board Member

- Hello, I will not beat a dead horse. As one of one of newest members of the district, I want to reiterate same points. There has been talk about committees but with no way to do this. This is an ongoing problem that has not been addressed by the community board.
- One thing that has really been frustrating and that does lack inclusivity, is the aspect that we get reports at the last minute. And it is very difficult to read them, I will go with my colleagues on the board who have put this so eloquently.
- I simply wish to address another point, as a member of PSC Local 2334, and a professor at Kingsborough community college, I want to highlight what councilmember Aviles was saying as well as the Council regarding the budget cuts. Because we can tell you right now from Kingsborough Brooklyn's only community college that we are seeing programming cut, including for the winter metro cards and book stipends. This is a wonderful opportunity for the community board to be involved, to spread awareness, to call for legislative help to prevent these cuts. And again, there is no way to address these issues except right now, when we finally have a chance to speak. So, I would like these things to be addressed, but I would also like to ask the rest of the community and the community board and the council members for help to prevent these cuts that are really serious and affect Brooklyn's only community college.

Wil Fisher- Board Member

- Good evening, it is nice to see everyone.
- I was not able to attend last month's meeting. I do remember that Beth was similarly silenced in September. The meeting was adjourned while she was attempting to bring new business. The zoom was quickly shut off when it was decided by the leadership that she was going to bring up something that had already been discussed during the meeting. So, this is not something that is new, this is something that is concerning and frustrating to those of us that feel that the board meets but once a month. For those of us that have never been assigned or invited to a committee there is but a couple of hours to discuss these type of issues once a month and for these meetings to be brought to a close as quickly as possible is consistently frustrating. For example, the nominating committee met to nominate a slate of leadership

and, while I have respect for those who have served on this board a long time, we did not know that the committee had met until it was over. And the results of their recommendations were quickly voted through in February.

- Finally, I would quickly like to commend Aannah for taking a difficult position today in front of the community board and for returning after a challenging meeting last month. This is a diverse district with a lot of different perspectives we have a lot of turmoil happening in the world right now and a lot of people in pain, so I also want to uplift the fact that we need to respect diverse perspectives and work hand in hand toward peace and unity among us. Thanks everyone and good evening.

Judith Ojo Diaz- Board Member.

- Hi, thank you so much for allowing me to speak. I have been on the board for almost 2 years and have never spoken, so I just want to speak.
- I came from a Community Board in the Bronx where they do things completely differently. I have been in Brooklyn for almost 2 years. I would also like to get involved, specifically, in the community committees that deal with housing, education, and a lot of the other things I have heard.
- I also would like to see, in the Bronx the Community Board I was on was very family oriented, I don't sense that here. But I would like to get more active in the board and also, I feel when I do reach out the communication is not the greatest. I feel like I have to send 5 emails out. I have an HR consulting company, so I am a people person by nature, so when I usually join something new I sit back and am quiet and try to learn what is going on.
- So, I just wanted to say hello and also to just stress the importance of communication to me and board members. We want to get involved in the community, that is important. I have a 14year old son, so education is dear to my heart. There are a lot of things that I would like to do in this community.
- If you could give us information on the committees and how we can join, that would be great.

Yidel Perlstein- Chairman.

We will continue this conversation at next month's board meeting.

We want every board member to always feel safe and comfortable.

Happy Holidays and Happy Chanukah to those celebrating and good night.

MEETING ADJOURNED

Respectfully submitted by: Gittel Fekete