CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

PUBLIC MEETING

May 10, 2017

6:30 p.m.

DREAM CHARTER SCHOOL
1991 SECOND AVENUE
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10029

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE:

Maya D. Wiley, Esq., Chairperson
Jonathan Darche, Esq., Acting Executive Director

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

1. Call to Order
2. Report from the Chair
3. Report from the Acting Executive Director
4. Presentation by Outreach on the CCRB
5. Presentation from Policy on East Harlem Data
   (Pct 23)
6. Remarks from Elected Officials

7. Comment from Community Members
   * Hector Geraldo - 1Freedom4All
   * Syreena Howard - First Corinthian Baptist Church Youth Leader
   * Elijah BRIAN - Youth
   * Ashley Viruet - DOME Project
   * Joaquin Maldanado - Youth

8. Public Comment

9. Adoption of Minutes

10. Old Business

11. New Business

12. Adjournment to Executive Session
BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:
=============================================  
Maya D. Wiley, Esq., Chairperson  
Jonathan Darche, Esq., Acting Executive Director  
John Siegal, Esq., Board Member  
Marbre Stahly-Butts, Board Member  
Salvatore F. Carcaterra, Board Member  
Ramón Peguero, Esq., Board Member  
Frederick Davie, Board Member  
Angela Fernandez, Esq., Board Member  
Deborah N. Archer, Esq., Board Member  
Youngik Yoon, Esq., Board Member
Proceedings

CHAIR WILEY: Good evening. I call this meeting of the New York City Civilian Review Board to order. My name is Maya Wiley, I Chair the Civilian Complaint Review Board. Thank you so much for your attendance and for welcoming us into the community.

Before I get started though, I would like to ask one of my colleagues, Angela Fernandez to translate.

(Whereupon, there is a translation from English to Spanish.)

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you, and since we're in community, I thought we would actually each introduce ourselves to you. I've obviously just introduced myself to you. My day job is at the New School where I'm a faculty member in Urban Policy and a Senior Vice President. I'm gonna ask, why don't we start with you, Fred.

MR. DAVIE: I'm Fred Davie, I am the Executive Vice President at Union Theological Seminary here in New York. I also serve on the Mayor's clergy advisory
Proceedings
council where I co-chair the public safety
committee and very pleased to be here
tonight, thank you.

MR. PEGUERO: Good evening, my
name is Ramón Peguero. I am the Queens
delegate to the CCRB. I work both in
Manhattan and the Bronx, and Brooklyn
working with affordable housing, social
services from childhood to adulthood. I've
done all those social services in the
community, thank you.

MS. FERNANDEZ: I'm the mayoral
appointee to the CCRB. My name is Angela
Fernandez and I'm also the Executive
Director of the Northern Manhattan
Coalition for Immigrant Rights, a community
based organization that provides free legal
services and also does advocacy to change
policies around immigration.

MR. DARCHE: I'm Jonathan Darche,
I'm the Acting Executive Director of the
CCRB.

MR. CARCATELLA: Hi, everybody.
I'm Sal Carcaterra, I'm one of the police
Proceedings

commissioner appointees to the CCRB and retired law enforcement in private business right now, and actually very glad to be with the members of this board who have done outstanding things, thank you.

MS. ARCHER: Good evening, I'm Deborah Archer, I'm a mayoral appointee and my day job is a professor of law at New York Law School and I also am the director of the New York Law School Racial Justice Project.

MR. YOON: Good evening, my name is Youngik Yoon, I'm a city council designee. I'm an attorney representing mainly, immigrants and small business people, thank you.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. Before we begin, I just want to really thank our hosts here in this beautiful glorious facility. We really appreciate all the support so that we can be in community. And I'm just -- I'm not gonna give a big report because it's really -- we're here because we really want to hear from you.
Proceedings
about what's happening with policing in
your community.

One of the things we have started
to do as a board is rather than just having
our monthly board meetings in our offices
downtown in Manhattan, is really actually
coming physically to the community so that
it could be much more of a dialogue so we
can hear much more directly from community,
and also inviting our partners in the
New York City Police Department to
participate in the conversation and be able
to hear from you directly as well and for
us to hear directly as well on that, and I
do want to note that Deputy Inspector
Christopher McIntosh, I'm sorry, I wrote
that wrong, actually wants to be here this
evening, was invited and wants to be here,
may be able to come, had a conflict so
hopefully, we'll see the deputy inspector
later but I just wanted community to know
that he was committed to attending if he
can make it.

So I've said why we're here. We
really want to hear from you so I'm going
to stop there except to say that we have
now -- we are trying to do this in every
borough. We have already been in Brooklyn,
we have been in Queens, we are now here
into Northern Manhattan, we will go to
Staten Island and we've been to the Bronx
and we'll continue to do this and we're
committed to doing it every other month.
But our board meetings at 100 Church
Street, downtown are also open to the
public and we do take public testimony at
those meetings as well so please feel
always welcome to come and speak to us and
share with us there as well. I am now
going pass it to our acting executive
director for his report.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Madam
Chair, and thank you all for joining us
this evening. Tonight, you are going to
hear from Conner Maher, a member of the
policy staff about the agency statistics as
they specifically apply to the 23rd
Precinct for a full review of the agency's
Proceedings

monthly statistics, please visit our website.

I would like to thank the following people for their work in bringing the CCRB to the Dream Charter School: Emily Parkey, the director of family and community engagement in government affairs at the Harlem RBI Dream Charter; Travis Walls, the operations manager at Dream Charter; Brian Barzey, IT manager at Dream Charter; Max Cantarero, the community affairs director for speaker Melissa Mark-Viverto, for her and the speaker support connecting us with Dream.

I'd also like to thank the members of the policy outreach, MIS and operations unit that are here tonight to help us have this meeting. Conner Maher, Raniece Medley, Eshwarie Mahadeo, Yahaira Alvarez (phonetic), Timothy Harrell, Yvanne Rinchere, Sorin Vatavu, David Duwick and then we also have three investigators here tonight so if any of you wish to file a complaint after the meeting, they'll be
Proceedings

able to take your complaint, and if they could stand up.

(Members comply.)

MR. DARCHE: Raquel Valasquez, Sarah Griffin and Miriam, and I forgot your last name, Miriam, I apologize.

I'd like you all to note that our June board meeting will take place on Wednesday, June 14th and will be held at the CCRB offices at 100 Church Street.

CHAIR WILEY: And before we move on to our presentation from our Outreach because we want to make sure you also understand who we are and what we do so that you can, if you have complaints, bring them to us and know how and what else we do but I should just say, we are live streaming so anyone who comes up and speaks, I just want to make sure that you're aware that it's live streaming because our meetings are public, and also that I will apologize in advance to everyone, I am unable to attend our June board meeting. I actually have a conflict.
Proceedings

and I have to travel to a mandatory meeting but Deborah Archer has graciously agreed to Chair that meeting in my absence. With that, I would like to ask Raniece to come and share from outreach. Thank you.

MS. MEDLEY: Good evening, everyone.

(Audience replies.)

MS. MEDLEY: Thank you all for attending this evening. I'm the director of outreach at the Civilian Complaint Review Board, this is an extension of our outreach efforts. We want to let you know that we are available to come out to wherever, pretty much, we're invited so that we can deliver information not only about our services and about how to access CCRB but also to bring information about knowing your rights and understanding what happens during the police/civilian encounter so you understand your rights and your responsibilities in that space. So we just wanted to take a moment so that everyone who, kind of, may not be as
familiar with the CCRB has some better understanding about what it is that we do.

So the Civilian Complaint Review Board is empowered to investigate, mediate and prosecute allegations of misconduct that are filed against members of the NYPD. To initiate a case, it could be a person who's directly involved in an encounter, or a person who has witnessed an encounter who can reach out to our office to file a complaint. To file a complaint, you can simply call 311 and ask to speak to CCRB or you could call the CCRB at 800-341-2227. You can also go to our website, nyc.gov/ccrb. If you picked up any of the handy items out there at the table, you have it with you so keep that with you so you have the number handy.

We have a jurisdiction or authority to manage certain types of allegations. Those allegations fall in categories that we remember with the acronym FADO. F-A-D-O. The F stands for force. So we handle cases that deal with
Proceedings

excessive or unnecessary force. We also have authority over cases of abuse of authority and it's just what it sounds like. If a person is in an encounter and they feel that an officer may have exceeded what is appropriate in the circumstance. We handle, D, which is discourtesy cases and it's just as it sounds. Rude behavior, profanity, language, et cetera. And the last category is offensive language. This is language that is demeaning to a person's race, color, creed, national origin, perceived disability, sexual orientation. I should also be clear that a person's immigration status or criminal status has no bearing on their ability to file a case. We won't ask, you don't have to tell.

In terms of how you can reach out, I've already mentioned that so you all know how that is that you can get in touch with us. We have open office hours. You can always come down to 100 Church Street and file a complaint live there as well.
Proceedings

So you are going to hear some statistics and that's gonna let you know a little bit more about how CCRB has had an impact or what interaction the community here has had with CCRB and so that again, will give you a little more knowledge and information about how CCRB is working in the community.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. And just to add one thing because it is a question that has come up for us in the past. Abuse of authority can include if someone feels sexually harassed by a police officer. Sometimes, because we don't say that explicitly, that's come up as a question so just anticipating in case anyone was wondering, that would fall under our jurisdiction.

So, Conner. As Conner comes up, one of the things we do receiving complaints, investigating what happened and we as a board independently then review the evidence and make a determination if we're able. We gather all the data so that we
Proceedings

can actually report to the public what transient patterns we're seeing. So what you're gonna hear is really just a snapshot of that and before you do that, I neglected and should very much welcome our partners from the New York City Police Department both Precinct Commander from the 23, Police Commander Gurley, thank you so much for being here and also Precinct Commander from the 25, Kathleen Walsh, thank you as well for being with us this evening.

MR. MAHER: Good evening. My name is Conner Maher and I work at the policy unit where we're responsible for collecting and analyzing data on police misconduct.

Since we are in East Harlem, I will provide a snapshot of data on the 23rd Precinct. So looking at complaints received from the top 25 precincts in 2016, the CCRB received the most complaints from the 75th Precinct in East New York. The precincts and the 207 complaints received are highlighted by the orange arrow. With
95 complaints received, the 14th Precinct in Midtown, Garment District the highest amount of complaints the CCRB received from Manhattan. The CCRB received 70 complaints from the 23rd Precinct. For a more detailed description on the complaints received in Northern Manhattan, be sure to check out the one-pager that was handed out at the door.

So what happens once the CCRB receives a complaint? Well, an investigator is assigned to the case and determines the types of allegations that fall within the CCRB's jurisdiction. Just to reiterate, abuse of authority could be a stop, question or frisk allegation. Force could happen during an arrest or the use of a taser. Discourtesy could happen through an officer cursing at a civilian or offensive language would be targeted language on the status such as race or gender.

So this visual right here is gonna be comparing the FADO allegations
Proceedings that the CCRB fully investigated in 2016. New York City as a whole is gonna be represented by the blue circle and the 23rd Precinct is gonna be represented by the bar chart. And so if you look at abuse of authority, which is the blue bar, if you look at the blue circle of New York City is gonna be in the middle at the top of the bar of the city -- of the 23rd Precinct and this means that these were both similar in the percentage of abuse of authority allegations that we investigated but if you look at the next, allegation of force, you can see that the bar chart is actually taller than the circle, which means that CCRB investigated more force allegations in 2016 in the 23rd Precinct than New York City on the whole. Oh, and just to back up on this one, so in 2016, the CCRB did not fully investigate an offensive language allegation within the 23rd Precinct, and there's multiple reasons why the CCRB may not fully investigate an allegation. It could be because the person that filed a
Proceedings

complaint withdrew it or it could be the person did not show up after multiple scheduled interviews.

Once an allegation is fully investigated, the CCRB Board can make one of five recommendations. The Board can exonerate the allegation and that is when the officer that committed the alleged act did so but the actions were lawful. The Board can unfound the allegation where there's credible evidence that the officer did not commit the alleged act. During the course of the investigation, the CCRB may not be able to identify a subject officer which would be, officer unidentified. In instances where there is not enough evidence where the officer did or did not commit misconduct, the CCRB Board could un-substantiate the allegation. And in instances where there's a preponderance of evidence the subject officer committed misconduct, the Board would substantiate the allegation.

So once again, we're gonna be
looking at New York City as a whole, the blue circle and 23rd Precinct is gonna be represented by the bar chart. You can see the that Board exonerated a higher percentage of allegations in the 23rd Precinct than New York City as a whole but the Board unsubstantiated a fewer amount of allegations than New York City as a whole, and during the course of the investigations that were closed in 2016, the CCRB was not able to identify as many officers as you see as a percentage in New York City.

So what helps the CCRB identify more officers in police misconduct complaints? The addition of video. A helpful way to look at fully investigated allegations are those that are decided on the merits. These are gonna be substantiated, exonerated and unfounded allegations. This is when the CCRB Board has enough information to provide a definitive recommendation if misconduct occurred. For unsubstantiated and officer unidentified allegations, the Board does
not have enough information to make a
definitive decision and they can be
considered as not on the merits.

So the two visuals on the left
are allegations that did not contain video
evidence. Both New York City as a whole,
which is the upper left visual, and the
23rd Precinct, which is the lower left
visual, have a greater percentage of
allegations where recommendations were not
on the merits. With the visuals on the
right, you can see the addition of video
within a complaint greatly improves the
percentage of fully investigated
allegations that are decided on the merits.

This is especially true for the
23rd Precinct where 86 percent of the fully
investigated allegations in 2016 in a
complaint that contained video were decided
on the merits.

This concludes that data snapshot
for the 23rd Precinct but if you have any
additional questions, be sure to check out
the data transparency initiative or the
Proceedings

reports that are published by the CCRB, and if you or anyone else feels that you have experienced police misconduct, please be sure to file a complaint with the office. Thank you.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you, Conner. So I want to -- one thing you should also know is in some cases, we have the opportunity, if it's eligible, to offer mediation. It doesn't mean a case doesn't go back into the investigation if it doesn't get resolved in mediation but one of our goals is to really help and support effective police community relationships, and sometimes that works well for people who file complaints to be able to go through a mediation process and it also can work very well for the officer. But just to mention, that's one of the things that we do.

At this point, we really want to here from you, and I want to first welcome any remarks, if any, from those representing our elected officials. Cassie
Proceedings

Addison (phonetic), did you want to make any remarks on behalf of the speaker?

(No response.)

CHAIR WILEY: No? Okay. And Theresa Richardson (phonetic), district leader, did you want to make any remarks?

(No response.)

CHAIR WILEY: Okay. Thank you. But thank you for being here. Both of you. So part of what we've learned to do to get the conversation started when we come to community is to actually ask leaders from the community to share with us first, although we want to hear from anyone who would like to share. So I'd like to welcome Hector Geraldo from 1freedom4All.

(No response.)

CHAIR WILEY: Not here. Okay. Syreena Howard from First Corinthian Baptist Church youth leader. Yes, please. Do you want to come to the microphone?

MS. HOWARD: Good evening, all.

Thank you for the invitation to come and speak and appreciation to the panel as
Proceedings

well. I'm gonna refer to the questions that they gave me here in regards to what are the major concerns about the police precincts in the neighborhood as well as with my experience as a youth director in the community and working with children. I'm really focused on their empowerment and how they have a relationship with police officers and precincts.

I'm gonna speak to that in saying that I believe that the police officers nowadays are not in tuned with the community. They don't have a relationship with the community so the model of protect and serve has been lost and it's just focusing on policing and making sure that their interaction is not dealing with safety and building everyone up and so that we know each other but more of making sure that kids, young people, young adults are intact, making sure that they're doing what they're supposed to be doing but in the midst of looking, I don't want to say down on them, but looking at them, they're
Proceedings

making assumptions about who they can be
based on what they look like, based on what
they're wearing.

So I think that it is time for
police officers to now be a part of the
community and not just police the
community. It's time for them to go into
the schools and introduce themselves, let
the principals know, let the teacher know,
let parents know who is protecting and
serving the surrounding areas. We have to
get to a point where we stay as a community
even though things are changing. We are
evolving, and it's a great thing but in the
midst of evolution, you still have that
community.

The saying of, it takes village
to build a child, we have to be that
village as politicians, as representatives,
as police officers we have to be that
village for our young people and the only
way that they can see and they can continue
to look up to police officers if they
become a part of that community so I'm not
Proceedings

sure what ways the precinct can involve themselves in that process but I think that will help turn how we, who live, who go to school, who work in the sounding areas can now build a relationship because there's no relationship between the community and the precinct or the police officers that are here to protect and serve.

CHAIR WILEY: Can I -- and I'll open it up for any board members to ask questions but are there -- because obviously, one of the things that the New York City Police Department has been doing is trying to reintroduce very actively community policing. So you're not -- are you seeing any aspects of community policing in your community?

MS. HOWARD: You'll see the constant face. The constant face does not have a name and so if I have a young person who is leaving high school, coming after school, they see the constant face, they see who it is but they don't know who they are. They don't know that if something
Proceedings

really happens to me, can I go to Officer Ortiz? Can I go to Officer Howard? Who are the people I can run to? I just know the face but the face also alarms me because if I run to them, are they going to be aggressive? Are they gonna ask me questions in regards to what am I doing? Were you supposed to be in that area? Instead of serving me, which it's protect and serve, and I don't think that they're getting the service part of what police officers are supposed to be doing.

(Appause.)

MR. CARCATERA: I just have a question, and I don't know if you want to do it right now or if you want to do it after but we have a couple of the commanders here right now. I wonder if you'd like to, kind of, address any of the concerns that she just raised as far as the interaction with your officers and what they may or may not be doing that she might not be aware of. Thank you.

CHAIR WILEY: One of the things
Proceedings

we hope to create is this kind of
communication between community and
community's police precincts. So thank you
for being here.

CO GURLEY: Yeah no problem.

You're referring to the 28th Precinct?
Where's your church located?

MS. HOWARD: Yes, that's correct.

CO GURLEY: Okay. I speak for
the 23 Precinct in regards. The 28th
Precinct is going through probably the same
thing the 23 Precinct went through, excuse
me, in June.

We started an NCO Program and,
let me talk to everybody, if you don't
mind. the NCO Program kind of reintroduces
Police to the community, alright. If
you're in an NCO command which is the 32
Precinct, 25 Precinct, 23 Precinct, PSA 5,
some are PSA 6 and now the 28, we have NCO
officers that go out on a daily basis.
They go to schools, they go to the
community meetings, they go to churches.
We have steady sectors, meaning that the
Proceedings

same cops will work in the same area every
day. Every day. Answering the same jobs
to become familiar with the people in that
geographical area.

The NCO Program started in June
of last year for my particular precinct,
and we've made plenty of end roads in the
23 Precinct in regards. I'm not gonna
speak for the 28 because I'm not the 28
commander. But my NCO's are always in
schools. They get involved in the youth
programs, we play basketball games in this
particular gym against the students, we've
played soccer games against students in the
other schools. We do a team-up Tuesday
where we go around to schools, we have
various church events and things like that.

We've kind of put that NCO
officer, which there is two per sector,
because we kind of redesigned every
precinct, and before how it used to be, it
used to be like over here, like 12 sectors
in a small area. I cover from 96th Street
to 115th Street from the water to Central
Proceedings

Park. We divided my precinct into four sectors at this point. Every sector has two steady NCOs and then they have steady sectors. The NCOs are our go-to people. They are the liaisons. If there's a chronic problem, our NCOs go out and they find out what the problem is.

Like case in point, we had youth that didn't quite understand what they were doing but they wrote some derogatory things on the floor in front of Mount Sinai and it had some anti-Semitism and things like that, and what we did was we tasked our NCOs to go out, talk to the schools, we recognized they had on school uniforms. We worked with the school, we identified the students, actually the school, we worked the with the school to get a curriculum together to kind of address it because these kids were young, you know, and it wasn't just about apprehending them and arresting them for that particular crime. They were 12, 13 year-old kids and the whole school had to understand and had to
Proceedings

learn what this was about.

So, you know, all of the stuff that we're doing is what the Department is rolling and they're rolling it out slowly. It's not in every precinct right now. Like I mentioned, I know the 28 just started theirs. The 25, I think you just started yours last -- what, a month?

CO WALSH: Two weeks.

CO GURLEY: About Two weeks ago, all right. Which is kind of like we're not bringing back the old community beat officer, which that had it's negative connotations, too. We're trying to make something different where the NCO officer goes out and actually liaisons and plus we have community affairs, which I don't know if you're familiar with your community affairs and the officers over there. I have mine here, Detective Miguel Murphy who kind of like, they reinforce that relationship.

Like Friday, like, this Friday, our command is doing a teen night at the
Proceedings

children's Boys and Girls Club. We're having a teen night where we're gonna sit and do a forum like this. My officers and the teens and discuss issues and sit down and have snacks and things like that. We do this on a regular basis and this is the turn of what we're trying to do to increase that relationship with the community.

So I apologize if that's not what you're seeing in the 28. It's kind of a new program. It's been rolled out in other places longer, like my precinct is coming up on a year and we're really seeing progress with that.

CHAIR WILEY: One follow-up question to that and obviously, not with regard to the 28 but just generally because one of the things that we have heard on occasion is the NCOs are great and community is really thankful for the NCOs but that sometimes there's a disconnect with officers who are the not the NCOs and then the question becomes, how does that get bridged?
Proceedings

CO GURLEY: That gets -- is this on? Yeah. That gets bridged at meetings in the precinct. I know in my particular command, my NCOs, the steady NCOs, let's say Sector Adam, whoever's covering that sector, my NCOs meet with the cops and the supervisors and that happens -- we have these meetings Tuesdays Wednesdays and Thursdays. They meet with the cops to talk about the conditions and what's going on. What are the chronic issues they're seeing? What might need to be addressed. Anything from homeless that's happening on the midnight to, you know, a robbery condition to a noise complaint that's coming up chronic that's coming up through 311 that might need to be referred to mediation and that's another thing we're starting in the commands with mediation amongst neighbors so, you know, when this stuff is discussed, the steady sector officer knows and understands, now I know what my chronic issues are. Even though they weren't present during that eight hour slot, they
 pretty much know because the NCO knows so
the NCO was that liaison that does all of
that looking at what's going on in that
sector and what needs to be addressed and
that is in a meeting setting with the cops.

    CHAIR WILEY: Thank you.

Ms. Howard, did you have anything else that
you wanted to add?

    MS. HOWARD: No.

    CHAIR WILEY: Did any of my
colleagues on the board have any
additional?

    MR. CARCATERRA: I thought that
was this was a perfect opportunity and it
was. I used to be, years ago, a precinct
commander as he is, and he has a phenomenal
handle on everything going on in the
command, and I think that exchange, I think
a lot of times things get lost. He's
probably being very humble because just in
a short amount of time, there's a lot
that's going on and if anything, maybe
something might get lost in translation
that is being done and when it comes to the
Proceedings

28, if it does, I think you take the best practices of what he's done here and try to mirror that and then expand upon it. But that was a great job. Thank you very much.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you both.

John, would you like to introduce yourself?

We all introduced ourselves before we began.

MR. SIEGAL: I apologize for being late. I'm John Siegal, a board member.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: We couldn't hear you.

MR. SIEGAL: I said, my name is John Siegal, I'm a member of the board and I apologize for being tardy.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. He's being humble. He was actually on trial today so thank you for being here.

So I want to next invite up Elijah Brown. Is Elijah Brown here?

(No response.)

CHAIR WILEY: Okay. Joaquin
Proceedings

Maldanado.

(No response.)

CHAIR WILEY: Okay. Dorlyn Pierre from Each One Teach One.

(Applause.)

MR. PIERRE: Hello. I hope you don't mind, I'm gonna use something from the paper.

CHAIR WILEY: Sure.

MR. PIERRE: Historically, the 23 and the 32nd Precincts had generated high CCRB complaint numbers. What can be done to address the issue? And so I thought that since last year, I had, like, an altercation with the cops. It was me and my friends and we was just standing outside and out of everybody in the group, they singled me out because they thought that I fit, like, a description of a suspect that lived in my building. So, like, I felt I don't know about the CCRB until this year so I'm blessed, like, be a part of this situation today.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. When
you had that, how was that resolved when you had that interaction with the police officer?

MR. PIERRE: Well, I just stayed calm and I cooperated and I felt that, like, I was just being singled out because, I guess, of my complexion. Like, I felt like it was more of a racial thing.

CHAIR WILEY: Did the officer tell you how you matched the description? Did you get any information?

MR. PIERRE: No. He just said, you look like -- this is exactly what he said word for word: You look like someone that we were looking for the other night.

CHAIR WILEY: Are there other kinds of experiences you're hearing a lot from also your friends and people you know in the community?

MR. PIERRE: No, ma'am.

CHAIR WILEY: Okay, and have we given you enough information to have a sense of how to file a complaint if you had an issue?
Proceedings

MR. PIERRE: Yes, ma'am because today, I, like, learned more and more about how I could be involved with the CCRB 'cause I believe that you guys are out here 'cause you guys care about our community and you want to make sure that we have, like, a good foundation with the officers in our communities, and also that we have a good relationship with our officers 'cause at the end of the day, they're trying to protect and serve us so I believe we should just show them respect and, like, be cooperative with them and don't have any situations with them.

CHAIR WILEY: And is there anything -- if you had one thing you could ask for from the Police Department, what would it be?

MR. PIERRE: Why was I profiled?

MR. CARCATERA: I just, we as a board, when we do cases and when it comes to descriptions, we actually go back and forth with this, and I hear you loud and clear and I understand what you're saying
but just let me give you an example of some of the things that we see. If someone here in the audience is the victim of a crime, and police show up and you give the police officer a description, now, you've been shaken up, you're very nervous, you're giving the officer what you recall, and a lot of times it's not a complete total description that you want and the officers are working off of what they have and that's where the rub comes in sometimes. I get it, you want a perfect -- in a perfect world but I just try to push it back especially on the ones that come from a street encounter. When you're the victim of that crime and you're giving that information and it's rapidly and it's rapidly going on and the police officer shows up and now they're out there looking for the person that victimized you and sometimes it's not explained right. Sometimes they're looking further so I just want to throw that out to you because and again, as a board we've discussed this numerous times
Proceedings

and how much do you really need, you know, and we go back and forth ourselves.

CHAIR WILEY: Yeah. And I think that's a good -- 'cause I think it's also as Sal said, it's how we -- it's also how officers talk to you. Like, did they actually give you information and explain like why and what happened?

MR. PIERRE: Ms. Wiley, can I, like, from you what you asked me earlier if I had another question to ask, it would be about that. Like, what was the crime that was committed and why was I singled out and why did you think that I was the one that committed this crime or fit the description?

CHAIR WILEY: Yeah. I think one of the things that we've heard is sometimes just getting more information and how people are treated. If someone is wearing the same color sweatshirt and has a similar cap on that was in the description but the police officer didn't explain that. Like, oh, I'm sorry, but we got the description
Proceedings that the subject was wearing jeans and a red sweatshirt with a hoodie and a baseball cap that said Mets and you're wearing jeans and a red sweatshirt and a baseball cap that says Mets and that's why I stopped you, is very different from just being stopped and interrogated and then not getting any information. But there are legal standards and we look at the legal standards for whether there's sufficient information because in some cases, as Sal said, sometimes it's kind of hard to know but sometimes it's very clear that there was not enough information to stop someone. That there wasn't enough of a match in terms of the description. Sometimes, there was a lot of match for the description but it could have been getting more information like you were asking for.

MS. ARCHER: So first, I want to thank you for being willing to stand up and speak. I know it takes a lot of courage to be able to do that in front of such a large group, and you're doing a wonderful job and
we really appreciate your perspective.

MR. PIERRE: Thank you.

MS. ARCHER: I -- the commander just spoke and talked about some of the efforts that he's engaging in the community and I wonder if you've seen any of those in your community? Have you heard about the teen forums or the basketball games and the soccer games?

MR. PIERRE: I'm from Wagner Projects so I believe we're PSA 5 and around my building they're always putting fliers up where they're, like, trying to reach out to community so I know that the officers from around my area are actually trying to be involved.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

MR. PIERRE: You're welcome.

(Applause.)

MR. DAVIE: I also want to thank you for having the courage to be here tonight. I want to thank the officer who -- the commander who just spoke and talked about the things that are going on
Proceedings

here in this precinct and the young woman
from First Baptist -- First Corinthians
Baptist Church who also spoke because I
know that church is a powerhouse in the
community there and tries to do work and I
hope that you can develop a relationship
with the precinct there that it seems that
institutions in this precinct have with
this particular precinct.

The one thing I did want to say
to you is that even though an officer may
have a legitimate reason for singling you
out or anyone out because you perhaps match
the description of a suspect or come close
enough that they want to question you, I
understand that it never feels good to have
that happen. Particularly, if you haven't
done anything and particularly, if you make
a special effort not to do things, to just
be a good and decent person so I know that
it doesn't feel good and I want to
acknowledge that but I also want to say
that I think it's important not to draw too
many negative conclusions or stereotypes
Proceedings

Based on that one experience.

Now, we've had lots of issues in New York City needless to say over the last couple of decades but I think as we've heard tonight, a lot of efforts are trying to be made to address those but I want to acknowledge that it sucks when that happens but it doesn't have to have a lasting influence on you and your perception of the Police Department and how you interact with them but thank you for your courage tonight and stepping up.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. And Darrell Wilson from El Barrio. Do we have Mr. Wilson? Do we have Mr. Wilson? Oh, thank you. And while Mr. Wilson is coming up, I would just like to acknowledge that we have two more elected leaders here, Keith Wright (phonetic) and I'm sorry, I'm having trouble reading your name but, District Leader Ernestine Bell Temple. I hope I got that right. Thank you so much for being here and for your leadership.
Proceedings

MR. WILSON: Good afternoon,
everybody. My name is Darrell Wilson.

CHAIR WILEY: Good evening.

MR. WILSON: Thank you. Before I start, I just want to congratulate this young man for coming up here. I just want to say thank you. I'm a middle school educator so to see a young man of color come up here and speak to you guys and speak about the issues that's going on in our community is really big. So I just want to address the first question up here. What do you consider the major concern about the police action in your neighborhood precincts? I've seen a lot of concerns and I've also seen a lot of actions and police officers definitely contributing to the community.

I currently work in the school Urban Leaders for future leaders on 129th and Amsterdam. It's a District 5 public school. The police officers actually just came into the school where they had a basketball game with some of the kids so I
want to say that they're definitely making considerable efforts to come in but I think the issue is mainly with the negative connotation a lot of teens have toward police officers. I've done a few workshops with the teens and a lot of issues that came up were they feel negative about them. They feel they don't know their names. They don't know anybody on a first and last name basis. They don't see them active in the community. So I just feel if police officers can and they will come around to the community and continue to do things whether it's a lot of kids are on social media so a lot of the things that they see are basically on social media so if they see flyers on social media, if they're seeing videos posted, if they're walking around the in their neighborhood playing basketball, they see police officers standing there, I don't want them to have negative connotation, why is he watching me? Why is she watching me? Maybe a police officer could come up and introduce
Proceedings

him or herself to the students. Hey, my
name is so and so, you know, I'm here to
protect and serve your area. I'm not here
to do anything negative.

So a lot of the teens, they do
have that connotation and for the situation
that he brought up, I was in a few
situations myself when I was younger so it
definitely brought back memories but I do
want to say to the officer that came up
here and you spoke about the things you're
doing in the community and I agree, I did
see that. A lot of my students enjoyed
that you came and they played basketball
with you guys and they felt as if everyone
was equal, and I think that's another issue
as well, if everyone felt equal. That they
don't feel police officers have the right
to do whatever they want. They feel that
they're protecting them and serving them
and no one's on a higher playing field.

One of our issues in our
community is that people are on different
levels. Everyone needs to be on the same
Proceedings

level. So I just want to say thank you for everybody that's here tonight to take time out of their Wednesday night to come out here and serve our community and to be here and sit down and to hear our concerns and these are things that we need whether it's on the east side, the west side, the Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens. These are things we need and we need to have students in here as well, not just adults. There needs to be teenagers in here because their connotation for police officers or whoever it might be with authority is very disrespectful now and I see it in the school classrooms that I work in. Like I said, I did workshops on it and a lot of the things I get are just negative and I always question the children. Why is that? Why do you see that? I get it. I do get it, it's a lot from social media and they're not outside to see what's going on. So I just want to say basically, just going around to public schools and gettin' around to public schools and gettin' these kids in the
Proceedings

classroom. Maybe if they could introduce something in the curriculum. I know you said you did something with a school curriculum. I think that's a great idea to enforce that in the public school and the charter school curriculum. A teacher has to give a lesson based on, you know, policing, what's going on in your community. So that's all I want to say.

MR. PIERRE: Sir, going back to your comment on social media --

CHAIR WILEY: Can you come to the mic just so everyone can hear? We want to make sure everyone hears you.

MR. PIERRE: Relating to his comment on social media, I agree with you because nowadays, young people, like, we always on our phones and stuff so, like, what we see, the images that we see with cops is what we perceive in real life. We're outside and -- I'm not speaking for myself, I can speak for one of my friends. That we go outside, we see the cops and we like, F the cops and whatever and, like,
it's not because it's how we feel, it's basically like what we see and what other people have been through but if we don't have our own experience, how are we gonna be equal with the cops?

CHAIR WILEY: Any questions or comments from the board? And Marbre, oh, you did make it? I'm sorry. Did you want to introduce yourself quickly and then we'll open it up.

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Sure. My apologies, my flight was delayed. My name is Marbre Stahly-Butts and I'm from Brooklyn and it's an honor to be up here.

CHAIR WILEY: Okay. Thank you so much for your comments. We appreciate it.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: And I did want to make sure that we gave an opportunity to our elected leaders to come up and speak so I don't know if you -- if at any point you feel moved, please feel free to come speak. And I would like to ask up now, I know, I think Hector Geraldo from 1Freedom4All is
MR. GERALDO: Good evening, everybody.

CHAIR WILEY: Good evening.

MR. GERALDO: I came a little late. I'm sorry. I came from a strike. The car wash workers in Queens are striking right now. I'm the union rep for the car wash workers in New York City so any elected officials here that want to support the car wash workers and the passion they have, you should go over there.

(Laughter.)

MR. GERALDO: But yeah. So I guess we're here to talk about youth empowerment and creating more accountability and sensibility around youth and policing. So I heard some of the things that's happening even though I came a little late.

One of the things that 1Freedom believes is that we need to incorporate more trainings, sensibility trainings for police officers not just their ranks giving
them the training but having community members be part of that training and have youth be part of that training as well.

Them coming into our schools, we need to go into them so they can understand what we are doing. Coming from my perspective in their field. So that's one of the things we believe that we should have. Some trainings, more training for police officers to deal with young people.

Another thing is outside of that, that's the trainings that they need to get because our community has been here a long time so they need to come into our community to learn how to deal with us not us dealing with them because most of these cops, they come from Long Island, they come from many other different places. They not from this community. They don't understand us.

So we believe that -- I don't know, in Philadelphia, I don't know if anybody knows but they have the student union. We believe we should create a
Proceedings

student union here where all young people can have a say in city council. Sit in the city council's chair to talk about issues that really concerns them. That's one way to tackle this issue. Not just us being -- trying to understand them. We need to be more of they need to come, come into our community and we need to be the ones to be understood. So this is one of the things that we believe that we should be doing in our communities.

Other things is just open up programs. Right now, I run a program in the Bronx with young people. Every Saturday, we teach them different arts there and we teaching them community organizing. So teaching our young people how to organize and advocate for themselves. Who are their politicians? How can they go to Albany and advocate for themselves and their community? So some of those things are some of the things that we need to apply in our schools as well. Not just having the police being in our schools.
but how can we as a community be involved in the issues that's happening in our schools.

One of the things like peer mediation. Creating peer mediation trainings for young people and teachers and educators inside of schools so we don't need the cops. So we can have our own people dealing with the issues that's going on because people, when they see the cops, they feel afraid. Our schools feels like jail. Like, I come from Washington Irving high school so I don't know if anybody knows where that's at on 14th Street. When I graduated, 85 percent of my class graduated. After that year, it dropped because they started putting metal detectors and cops inside our schools. We look and we feel like we in jail and that's some of the things that we see, the images that we see and we don't need that in our schools. We need more counseling. We need people to spend more money on that. City councilmen to spend more money.
Proceedings

The first thing that gets cut in our communities is education and health care. What is that? Why is that? We need to invest more. The arts in our schools are nonexistent right now. Charter schools, they get it, and no offense to people that have their child in charter schools but our public schools, they get more money than small countries in South America right now. This Department of Education, they get more money so we need to start spending the money that we spend. Where that money goes that comes to our schools? We are graduating only 50 percent of our students. Only 50 percent. So that means that 50 percent of the peers, you got 30 people in one class so half of that is gonna maybe go to college. Maybe. Because we're not educating our young people and we need to spend money on that right now.

So we just feel that we don't need cops and jails. I mean, cops in schools. We need more educators in our schools. We need them to be prepared to
Proeceedings

deal with our young people. That's all I came so to say.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: Any questions?

(No response.)

CHAIR WILEY: Okay. Thank you so much for coming and for your time. Guy Fisher from the Doe Fund.

MR. FISHER: Hello.

CHAIR WILEY: Hello.

MR. FISHER: Good evening.

CHAIR WILEY: Good evening.

MR. FISHER: My name is Guy, I'm here from the Doe Fund. I was asked to come by Mr. Timothy Harrell to come today to this meeting to speak, and I'm glad that I have -- I'm glad that you gave me the opportunity to come and hear what I have to say.

I heard a lot of good stuff around the room so far. I heard a lot of good things around the room but, you know, one of the things for me is that as being an older male, I have two sons, and I teach
Proceedings

my two sons, like, to respect life. To respect things that go on. I don't just blame the police for everything. I don't just put everything and say, oh, it's their fault, it's their fault because, you know, I was born and raised in Harlem. I been in Harlem from the 70s, the 80s, the 90s up to now. I've seen Harlem when it was gray to compared to now with brownstones coming up and one thing was when I was coming up in my neighborhood, this might sound kind of weird but I remember the drug dealers in the neighborhood. We used to go to the drug dealers and say, we want to be like you and they used to be like, what do you mean you want to be like us? Oh, we want to dress nice like you, you know, we want to be in cars like you, we want to do what you doing. And they used to tell us, go to school, go to school. I'll a make sure you're dressed nice, go to school.

Officers used to come to our neighborhood, they put up milk crates by the 28th, 123rd Street near the PAL. They
put a milk crate up for us to play basketball. We used be up there and play basketball with them. They knew us, they knew our parents. We knew them, they knew who was who in the neighborhood.

Part of policing in the neighborhood, part of it falls on the parents. I believe a great part of that falls on me on what I'm telling my child when he walks out the house and what I teach my child when he's in certain parts. You know, my mother wouldn't let me stand on any corner. My mother used to -- my mother would literally come outside and be like, you know, run me off the corner and I used to be embarrassed. I'm like, lady, what are you doing? You know, like, get out of here. I was 22 years old and my mother tried to give me my last beating, you know, and I'm like, this is ridiculous.

But, you know, I don't put everything off on police officers. I don't say -- because I deal with the youth and I'm not saying these youths here but a lot
of times these youths are a little aggressive. They a little aggressive in their approaches and when they are standing together, I can't tell the difference. I can't tell which kid is who, which kid will throw the punch and which kid won't. I don't have time to decipher that. I have to do things to protect myself when I'm outside sometimes so I don't put anything off in their lap. I don't say, you know, it's hard but my job as an older man and a parent, every young person that I come across, I sit down with them and have a talk and my thing is to teach them what I, you know, teach them don't make the mistakes that I've made. Don't do the things that I've done.

We're taught help the police, you know. Help them because you right, they don't know what is what. You come outside, you doing a job every day, you come out, the intensity of what's going on. Jump out the car, everything that's happening, things just happen, life takes place.
Proceedings

I thank god that, at least I was told, I could be wrong, I could be wrong but I thank god that New York police don't lead in shootings. That we not leading in shootings. I do know police New York will whoop your ass, I'm sorry if I said that wrong but I do know that. They used to do that to us when we was growing up because they used to tell us get off the corners. Get off the corners, go to school. You don't belong out here. Take your behind where you belong. These are the things that were illustrated to us when I was growing up.

Now, some of these things are missing because I believe that now, you know, neighborhoods, the relationships has grown cold, you know, I believe you need more mothers and fathers. You need more grandmothers, the aunts involved in the -- because this is a complex issue, you know, because it's like you asking how they policing the neighborhood and it falls on both sides because things are going on both
Proceedings

sides and each side is having a
preconceived notion of the other side.
Everybody is assuming and everybody is
assuming and people assuming that you're
this, you're that, and the communication
gets broke down. I believe it's time for
communication. I believe it's time to open
up, have a better communication.

I do believe that we have to be
taught to know how to communicate with
police officers as well as police officers
need to know how to communicate with us
because they police our neighborhoods and
I'm gonna be honest with you, I'm glad
there's cops because my mom can go to
store. My mom is safe to go to store, my
sons can go outside and play. I'm glad
there's cops. I'm never gonna say that I
have anything against police policing the
neighborhood because they keep it safe for
people like that because I've been around
some bad guys in my life. I've been around
some bad guys and I appreciate the fact
that police are around because if they
Proceedings

wasn't here and some dudes can have their way, you know, it would be like the wild, wild west out here so I thank god for the police that they are here.

I don't put the full -- as I said, I don't put the full blame on them. I believe that each parent, that each guardian, that each older person has an obligation to teach their children or go to the precinct, well, listen, if my child is stopped, what should he do? You know, do that and say, stop I'm in the Doe Fund. I put my time in the Doe Fund. There's a lot of the young guys there. I went to a hundred black men, I said listen, help me give these young guys vision. Let me show these guys that hard work, pressing forward it can pay. Let them see that it can pay.

The thing is like not to -- to get them off the corners. That's my job. My job is to try to get them off the corners. My job is to make it so I want the precincts and I want Rikers Island empty. That's my job. My job is to see
Proceedings

that the precincts, Rikers Island, Upstate New York is empty and that jobs, colleges, professors, school teachers, future civilian review board members, councilmen are the ones that are taking the places. That's my job. That's what I'm trying to do now.

I'm little nervous here so forgive me if I'm mumbling but it's -- that's my thought when it comes to policing the neighborhoods. I know we don't have that much time but this is really a complex issue. I don't know if you can really sit there with this issue and the quotes that was made around the room that you heard, I don't know if the issue can really get answered. I believe this is a roll your sleeves up, put your hands in the dirt type of issue. You know, in order for a flower to grow you gotta be willing to bend down in the dirt and take care of it. If you're not willing to bend down and take care of the flower, it's going to wither and die. The relationship has always withered and
Proceedings
died because I don't think nobody's willing
to roll their sleeves up, get their knees
dirty and reach down into the dirt.

I appreciate what the 23rd is
doing as far as the NCO. I wasn't aware of
that, now I am. That's new information
that I'm armed with that I can speak to
when I go speak to my youth but, you know,
you know, life, you know, life is too short
right now. Life is really too short to
be -- there's a lot of stuff going on, you
look on social media, you look on Facebook,
you she these shootings, everybody is
scared. They even got jokes where they
say, you know, they had a joke one time on
Facebook where they had a little kid
telling his mother, mommy, I just want to
grow up, I don't want to get shot by a cop.
I didn't think that was cute, you know what
I mean, especially when relation so intense
right now, you know.

People are scared to even, you
know, some people, some youth are scared to
even say anything to cops but all the youth
 aren't bad. I think I take the blame for that because a lot of youth don't understand. Nobody really took time to show them how to be a gentleman. When I was growing up, I was taught how to be a gentleman. I watched older men deal with people in the neighborhood. I watched older men parade masculinity in front of me, how to be a man and they taught me, being a man doesn't mean you could ball your fist up, you could hit somebody, you could yell at somebody. Being a man was sometimes being the guy to back down. Being a man sometimes was being the guy that was willing to shake a hand. Being a man was the guy that he used to buy ice cream for the kids on the block and stuff like that. We didn't do that. We got away from that so a lot of these youth don't know that so they grow up raising each other up so a lot of their aggressiveness and things, that's what they know but they not really that because I'm telling you, I speak to them daily. I walk right up to
Proceedings

them with all their little gangster acts
and everything and I speak to them and a
lot of them, they don't know what to do.

Be honest with you, a lot of
times they have no idea, no vision,
nothing. One guy told me, he said, Guy,
every time I think, I can't get past 125th
Street. Every time I try to dream, I can't
get past 125th Street. So no, I'm not
gonna put everything on NYPD's lap. You
know, yes, NYPD shares, holds some blame
but we do, too and I do, too. You know and
that's it. I'm out.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. All
right. We also -- I'm going to go to our
list of folks who have asked to have the
opportunity to speak. John Brian.

MR. BRIAN: Hi. At the last
board meeting, it was mentioned about the
budget and I was reading the budget and I
was wondering in regards to the deputy
executive directors position, what was the
job description or the duties performed by
Proceedings

the former deputy executive director?

CHAIR WILEY: I'm not sure which
deputy. We have multiple deputy executive
directors but all the job descriptions for
posting are on the website and our jobs but
do you recall the specific --

MR. BRIAN: Well, the position
that was eliminated.

CHAIR WILEY: I don't -- we may
have -- you may have misunderstood.

MR. BRIAN: Let me read from the
budget then.

CHAIR WILEY: Okay.

MR. BRIAN: The fiscal year 2018
preliminary budget eliminates the deputy
executive director due to the restructuring
of the CCRB. This position was deemed no
longer necessary. So CCRB will recognize a
baseline cost saving of 159,650 for the
elimination of one management position.
What were the duties performed by that
position?

CHAIR WILEY: Outreach. That was
a deputy director for outreach. So that
Proceedings

position we have the director for outreach, Raniece Medley and other outreach positions.

MR. BRIAN: So all the duties were sent over to that position?

CHAIR WILEY: That position already had those duties so we had some redundancy.

MR. BRIAN: So what were the -- if that position already had those duties, what was this position doing at the time?

CHAIR WILEY: Outreach.

MR. DARCHE: That's why we eliminated the position.

CHAIR WILEY: Right.

MR. BRIAN: I'm slightly confused.

CHAIR WILEY: That's fine.

MR. BRIAN: The person -- the deputy executive director's position was doing outreach?

CHAIR WILEY: It was the head of outreach. We had two different positions in outreach that were managerial positions.
MR. BRIAN: Okay.

CHAIR WILEY: So we eliminated one of them.

MR. BRIAN: Okay. So then -- so how many different deputies are there?

CHAIR WILEY: I forgot. I have to --

MR. DARCHE: So we, excuse me, there is a chief prosecutor. There is -- we now have two co-chiefs of investigations as opposed to one chief of investigations.

MR. BRIAN: Can you mention who the two co-chiefs are?

MR. DARCHE: Winston Mathowell (phonetic) and Chris Duerr (phonetic).

MR. BRIAN: Okay.

MR. DARCHE: I'm the chief prosecutor. We have the deputy chief prosecutor for administration and that's Janine, and I'm blanking out her last name and I apologize.

CHAIR WILEY: Marie.

MR. DARCHE: Janine Marie. Thank you.
Proceedings

CHAIR WILEY: You're welcome.

MR. DARCHE: And we have a general counsel, Matt Kadushin. We have a secretary to the board, Jerika Richardson.

MR. BRIAN: You mentioned Chris Duerr?

MR. DARCHE: Yes.

MR. BRIAN: Are civilians able to contact him?

MR. DARCHE: Yes.

MR. BRIAN: Yes. Okay. I filed a foil request at the CCRB asking for his phone number to contact him, and I was informed that basically with respect to Mr. Duerr's phone number, your request is denied. Mr. Duerr's phone number is confidential. Why would that be?

CHAIR WILEY: I think that just refers to the direct line. There's a general line that you can call and ask for Chris Duerr.

MR. BRIAN: Yes. I have done that numerous times since January 5th and he has not returned one of my calls or
Proceedings

e-mails or messages. Is there a reason for that?

MR. DARCHE: Not that I'm aware of but if you would like to, I don't think you want to give to everyone here but if you want to give to me after the meeting I will make sure he calls you back.

MR. BRIAN: Okay. So in terms of transparency, which was an issue that Ms. Wiley brought up that last board meeting as well, if you can go left to right for some people have arrived late to this, if you can identify yourself and tell us the amount of compensation that you receive from the CCRB?

CHAIR WILEY: No. I'm gonna ask that you can actually foil for that information and just because we want to be respectful of community's time to speak about community, we're happy to receive that request. But to go down the line, and the truth is we're paid, just so everyone's clear, we're paid on an hourly basis and our hours shift from week to week and month
Proceedings
to month so it's not like we get a specific
amount of money and in fact, some of the
board members make the decision not to
accept money and donate their time. So the
point is, it would be different every month
and probably most board members, I know I
can't remember month to month what I
submitted for any particular month.

MR. BRIAN: Would any of you be
willing to ballpark it for the people that
just came in?

CHAIR WILEY: So I'm gonna ask,
because I want to be respectful of the
community's time to speak about community
issues, that you write us and request that
and we will provide that to you.

MR. BRIAN: Am I over my limit as
of yet?

CHAIR WILEY: Yes.

MR. BRIAN: Of speaking?

CHAIR WILEY: Yes.

MR. BRIAN: That was --

CHAIR WILEY: If you have a
question specific to policing in this
Proceedings

community, we're happy to hear it.

MR. BRIAN: I'm not from this community. I tried to attend the last board meeting but I was denied entry.

CHAIR WILEY: Okay and we have the next board meeting is June 14th.

MR. BRIAN: I can't discuss other issues in regards to what I want to speak about at this board meeting?

CHAIR WILEY: What we do at each board meeting, just to be clear for everyone, is we try to be respectful of giving everyone an opportunity to speak who would like to which means unfortunately, we can't give hours to any one individual but we also have monthly board meetings for this reason, and now that I recall who you are, as we said, we've addressed the issue so you also will be able to attend the June board meeting as well.

MR. BRIAN: Yes but since this meeting is concerning this community board and I attempted to go to the last board meeting and was denied entry so --
Proceedings

CHAIR WILEY: Yes, and we've received --

MR. BRIAN: Don't you think that this would be the appropriate time to allow me to speak about the issues that I wanted to speak about at the last board meeting but was denied?

CHAIR WILEY: Are the issues related to CCRB business -- so here's my point, we definitely want to hear from you. You chose to take and front load issues that are specific to our operations which we're happy to receive separately so that we can give people opportunities to speak about community. So in that vein, that was obviously an opportunity that we have afforded you. If there's something very specific that you can raise that we can deal with quickly so we can also get to -- I have a number of some people who have also asked to speak who are from the community and we would also welcome you to future board meetings.

MR. BRIAN: Can I ask you about
Proceedings

the letter that Mr. Kadushin sent me on Monday?

CHAIR WILEY: You can ask Mr. Kadushin about the letter because he's here.

MR. BRIAN: I'm asking if you got CC'd it?

CHAIR WILEY: I have not seen the letter.

MR. BRIAN: Have you seen it Mr. Darche?

MR. DARCHE: I saw an early draft of it.

MR. BRIAN: An early draft.

Okay. Basically, on April 12th, I tried to attend the monthly board meeting at 100 Church Street.

CHAIR WILEY: Yes and we've had --

MR. BRIAN: I provided --

CHAIR WILEY: And we've had communications with you about that.

MR. BRIAN: Excuse me. I provided proper identification to enter the
CHAIR WILEY: Yes and we have said to you that we have taken care of that and you will be able to attend the June meeting.

MR. BRIAN: Yes but that does not mitigate the circumstances of what occurred.

CHAIR WILEY: I understand that and that's why we have an opportunity for you to take that issue up, and I think we have responded to that issue and I believe we have appropriately corrected the problem so that you will able to have admission to the 100 Church Street building.

MR. BRIAN: Okay. If I can continue speaking, it would be okay.

CHAIR WILEY: No. I'm sorry. I really have to give attention to all the other people I have waiting on the list. Unfortunately, we have a hard stop in this space and --

MR. BRIAN: What's the hard stop in this space?
Proceedings

MS. GERMAN: Other people need to speak --

MR. BRIAN: Yes. I understand.

MS. GERMAN: -- who live in this community and who care about policing here.

MR. BRIAN: Correct, and I'm trying to --

MS. GERMAN: And they're giving you and opportunity to speak with them directly another time. There are other people that need to speak.

MR. BRIAN: But if I want to have the other members hear what I have to say, I think that would be also helpful for them as well that's why I wanted to discuss that at the last meeting but was denied, you understand? I think my issues will still --

MS. GERMAN: Understand that we have limited time.

MR. BRIAN: I understand that.

MS. GERMAN: And that this meeting is only here now.

MR. BRIAN: I understand that but
if I can continue and not be interrupted, it would go more smoothly.

CHAIR WILEY: Unfortunately, we do have some time limits. I will also have to --

MR. BRIAN: I understand that.

CHAIR WILEY: -- limit the time of everyone who wishes to get up and speak and so --

MR. BRIAN: Okay. In regards to the CCRB website about why filing --

MR. CARCATERRA: Excuse me. Excuse me.

MR. BRIAN: -- it gives you --

MR. CARCATERRA: Hello?

MR. BRIAN: Issues. It says, why file --

MR. CARCATERRA: Your time is over.

MR. BRIAN: -- to speak directly to an officer, to create a record, to change officers behavior and to change Police Department practices. Now, I want to speak about the third one. Why file
Proceedings

with the CCRB --

CHAIR WILEY: This is not --

MR. BRIAN: Is to create a record. I want to discuss that for them to know what it means to create a record. By filing a complaint, you are making a permanent record that will remain in the officer's personal history. In terms of making a criminal record history in terms of making a permanent record, by filing a complaint you're make a permanent -- who has access to those -- that officer's personal history?

CHAIR WILEY: Right now, there's a state statute that precludes release of those records and we're working on legislation in order to try to change the state law so that we can make more of those records available at the conclusion of proceedings. Thank you for your time.

MR. BRIAN: Okay. Are --

(Appause.)

CHAIR WILEY: And I'm now going to ask, I'm sorry, Syreena Howard.
Proceedings

MS. HOWARD: I spoke already.

CHAIR WILEY: Oh, Syreena, I'm sorry. And our next speaker will be Patrick Williams. Patrick Williams, are you here?

(No response.)

MR. BRIAN: Are you able to -- who has access? Are you able to change information in the personal files?

CHAIR WILEY: Is Patrick Williams here?

MR. BRIAN: Excuse me, are you going to answer?

CHAIR WILEY: No. I'm not. I'm sorry. I'm going to give the other folks who have signed up an opportunity to speak. I'm missing my one other sheet. Yes. We have, and I apologize if I'm not pronouncing the name correctly, Tiajuana Cooper. Thank you.

MR. BRIAN: I filed a complaint with the CCRB --

CHAIR WILEY: Please come to the mic. We'll use this mic, thank you.
MS. COOPER: I would end up in the front.

(Laughter.)

MS. COOPER: Hello, my name is Tiajuana Cooper and so I just enjoyed hearing everybody's response to tonight's event. So I'm coming before you as a mother of ten children. I have five girls and five boys.

(Applause.)

MS. COOPER: And so one of my sons is in law enforcement while the other is on the run from the police. So I'm looking at both sides of the story. So on one end, the gentlemen from the Doe Fund, I truly do acknowledge what he said. I don't blame the police officers because I know that, I want to believe and I believe that they do the best that they can with what they have and I know that at the end of the day, they still want to go home to families because they have families and because I have a son who's in law enforcement, no matter what, at the end of the day, the
Proceedings

I want my child to come home. However, because I have a child who is on the run, I understand that he broke the law and that it's not okay for him to break the law and think that it's okay and that he could just get away with it.

I was one of those mothers, I was a single parent, I ran through the projects with my belt. I ran through the projects with my broomstick, I did all of that and I still present to my children in a way that's no nonsense but that doesn't mean that they are not gonna break the law. That doesn't mean that they are gonna walk the state and narrow path, you understand?

So I don't blame the police officers. I don't put it all on them nor do I blame the parents. The way I'm looking at it now is that there has to be some kind of commonality where we as a community have to come together. When we remove the title of parent and we remove the title of, you know, police officers,
when it all comes down to it, we all human beings and we want to live safe. We want to live in a community where our children can play, and like, I have an issue when I watch TV and I see that when a young man or a young woman is shot down and then there's this community outrage but then when a drug dealer or somebody shoots an innocent child, I don't see the same response. I have a problem with that.

(Applause.)

MS. COOPER: I don't have an issue, I don't have an issue with the police officers, right, because I know at any given moment, if they go on strike, our communities are driven to hell. I'm gonna be honest. No. It's gonna be issues. Why do I say that? Because I see with the police officers there how it is. I don't see, you know, okay, not all churches and not all the communities and parents. You have some parents and community people who go out and they do police the communities. However, on the level that it needs to be,
it's not. It's really not.

In my area, the police, they do what they need to do. I feel safe coming home 2, 3, 4:00 in the morning. I feel safe walking down the street with my grandchildren. I have 12 grandchildren. I have grandsons. I want them to grow up to respect the police officers. I take them into the police stations to talk to the police officers when they out of hand. Not in a way where I want them to be afraid but where they know if he acts out that he has a respect for these people and they need to have respect for police officers and I don't care what nobody say or what they believe, I know for a fact that if the police officers go on strike in the communities that we live in, it's already in hell so where's it gonna go when the police officers go on strike?

I don't see the parents going out there on the corner with broomsticks and belts beating these young men off the corner selling drugs and guns. I don't see
nobody doing that. I see these police officers, like my son, going out there doing that. And I'm not saying that it's okay for them to take our children's life either, I'm not saying that either but you know what, when the parents don't step up, they are the ones who are literally killing our children and that's how I see it.

(Applause.)

MS. COOPER: So with that, how do we deal with this? Okay, yeah, we can develop programs for the teens. My company or my organization is called Women With Purpose Envision. It's not just about the teens. It's not just about the police officers. It's about the family. It's about the family. And when I say family, I'm not talking about bloodline. I'm talking about family. We all come together with a common cause. What is the common cause? To save families so that we can save our children, so that we can save our communities, so that we can save our police officers from their losing their lives as
Proceedings

well.

So that's just how I see it. So it's just not the police officers. It's just not the parents. It's everybody and until we adults come together and listen to these young people right here, we gonna continue to lose them because one thing with our young people it's nobody listens to them. You think because they're young and because they're babies, they don't know. They are wiser then we will ever be because of the time that we are living in and until we sit down with them, we will forever be lost. This is our future, we are not the future. We are the wisdom, they are the future and until we humble ourselves from that pedestal because we have the title, we will lose this war and they will lose.

We don't have to worry about Donald trump. Here it is right here. We need to deal with this. We are failing our children and I say that because in some aspect, I failed mines. I'm not perfect.
Proceedings

I did the best but I failed mines, too. So how am I fixing that? I go out into the community. I live around the corner from the Covenant House. I live right down the block from the strategic response unit. They standing outside in front of the police precinct with guns that I don't even know what the hell those things are. They couldn't even, I mean -- dinosaurs, they can kill dinosaurs with them damn things.

(Laughter.)

MS. COOPER: So why are you going after human beings for with that? I don't understand. So until we listen to them, we all going to hell. Thank you.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. Thank you. And as I mother, I will say I appreciate how hard we try but we are not perfect. Mr. O'Grady.

(Applause.)

MR. O'GRADY: The adversary embezzled $200,000 from the property. HPD put him off property. In the -- well, I
Proceedings

don't know if I say in the street, but the police are sometimes referred to as B-U-L-L. Bull. Bull. G-U-L -- B-U-L-L. They are commonly referred to with that term. Seventeen years on the job. This was provided by WINS radio. March, 2017. Seventeen years on job. This detective trespass on residential unit. This is WINS radio. March, 2017. Masturbate male genital. Detective shine battery-operated flashlight at night. Trespass on residential unit. He live in Rockville Center. New York City police detective but why did Robert Lonergan investigate a manager and indicate go beyond what their attorney provided? Rita Dumain indicated she could not go beyond what attorney provided.

Mysterious disingenuous. You know, I had a long time mastering this word, disingenuous rumor. Mysterious disingenuous rumor floated 30 residential tenants want male negro to own building because he is some male negro employed by
Proceedings

Esther Shenkman, (phonetic) white woman.
This male negro thrown on to sidewalk.

Ulysses S. Grant want more and more recruit young. Recruit young men want to know what happened to recruit just sent to south. Young men reported fleeing the military struggle into or across Canadian border. President Lincoln in order to obtain young men to put down the Confederate south rebellion, according to the book on the dark blue uniform. 42nd Street library, union army. Executive order. Elderly female parent, white woman deported to Canada. Joined her son in the Canadian nation.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you, Mr. O'Grady.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: I also want to recognize Athena Moore has also joined us
Proceedings

from Borough President Gail Brewer's office. Thank you for joining us. Oh, Gail, where are you Gail? Gail, you're hiding in the back. Hi, Gail.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you very much for being here. And I now want to recognize Carmen Williams. Carmen Williams?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: She left.

CHAIR WILEY: She left. Okay.

Wade Jewell or Jewell Wade, I'm sorry.

MS. WADE: Hello everyone. My name is Jewell. I'm really not from this community. I'm from 95th Street and Amsterdam. I grew up under the 24th Precinct. And I just have one question before I continue. What happened to the Mr. Peanut contest? Does anyone remember that? The precincts did something every year. It was called the Mr. Peanut contest. Every precinct did it, every PAL did it and basically what they did was they had the neighborhood youth come in and they
Proceedings

had a bunch of relay races and the first one that came in first place got a two-week trip to camp for free. The mother didn't have to pay for it. The second place, it was about five of them because I participated as a youth. I'm 52 years old now. We won bikes. Third place won skates. Fourth place, the girls won jump ropes and the boys won basketballs. That was the way the neighborhood was incorporated into the precinct. The cops knew us, personally. We knew who they were personally. They knew our parents. This was the 24th Precinct on 100th Street but this also happened on 123rd Street as well, the 28th Precinct. They had the Mr. Peanut contest so I'm trying to figure out what happened to the neighborhood cooperation with the Police Department?

I understand with the 23rd Precinct with the NCO. The 28th Precinct is actually doing that. I work at Costco and we donate to them. So they are participating to the neighborhood. We make
Proceedings
donations every month to them where they go
g out to schools and communities and after
school programs and they participate but
what I also wanted to speak on and what I
wanted to piggyback off of was, the young
lady that was up here with the ten kids. I
took my son and I moved to Jacksonville,
Florida. Me and his dad and my little
girl. At the time, she was six months old.
When my son turned 16 and he decided he
wanted to jump in my face, his father gave
strict order, grab him by his Adam's apple
and throw him down on the ground. Period.
That was it. And when that didn't work,
Florida has a thing called, "time out."
Where it's not about going downtown and
you're getting, what you call that when you
go downtown and you get that little paper
on the teenager that's acting up? You
don't do that in Florida. What you do is
you call your precinct and you say, listen,
my child is acting up. They come and they
get them and it's called time out. And the
keep them for five days. And that's how
you maintain order in your house with the kids.

I agree, it's not gonna always be the parent's fault when it comes to the children, you know. As parents, we have to teach our kids to be respectful. We have to teach our kids to know how to go out in society and act the way they're taught at home but there's a flip side to that as well. The police officers, you guys have to respect the youth as well. This young man should not be fearful of the police when he sees them coming. Listen, I drive and I'm gonna be honest with you, when I see you behind me, I shake. That's real and I've never been arrested before but it's become so crucial in the neighborhoods. It's become so crucial in the streets. Our relationship with you guys that as a black woman with three kids who are doing well, I don't have issues with none of my children at all. My daughter right now is gonna be a sophomore at A&T. My son graduated from A&T. I don't
Proceedings

have problems with my kids but at the same

time, I'm fearful when you're behind me.
I'm thinking to myself, okay, is there
gonna be a reason why he's gonna pull me
over? I keep my hands on my steering
wheel, I answer all the right questions but
is something still gonna happen to me?
Just like you guys worry about going home,
I worry about going home as well.

I have grandsons. I taught my
son, and I must say, their father is an
officer. Okay. He worked out of the 32
for a very, very long time and he taught my
son, your father is an officer but at the
end of the day, I don't care what you did,
no matter how much you're wrong, they're
gonna always be right. You say, yes, sir.
You say, no, sir and you make it back home.

You guys gotta understand that
the youth are scared. They scared. When
they see y'all coming, they immediately
start shaking. You have honor roll
students that have never done anything
wrong, that they're coming from a
Proceedings

two-parent home. It's not necessarily that it has anything to do with Facebook or social media either. It's what's told to them. You understand? They're hearing stories from their friends. They're hearing stories from what's going on inside the school. And then you saying -- I understand you said NCO, they're walking the neighborhoods and they're walking the beat, I don't see none of the cops saying hello to the kids. I work in Costcos right here which is down the block from the projects. I'm parking my car, I see the police officers walking by the children. I don't see them bending over and saying hey, how you doing? I don't see them speaking to young teenagers that's standing out on the corner.

I started growing up on 117 Street between 7th and Lenox. The cops spoke to me, they spoke to my dad, they spoke to my mother. You police officers, y'all don't speak to us. You don't say anything. I remember being at the Harlem
Proceedings

Day Parade and I spoke to a police officer and he frowned and I'm an adult and I took that personally so imagine how the youth are gonna take that and I'm supposed to be a little bit more wiser than they are. You understand what I'm saying?

So at the end of the day, I just think that the community, the parents need to teach the children and you guys, the officers, you guys need to come together and as far as the Mr. Peanut contest is concerned, look it up. Seriously. It worked.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you.

(Applause.)

CHAIR WILEY: William Evans. Did you want to respond to that? Yes. Please come to the mic and if William Evans is here, we'll just have you come after.

MR. PIERRE: To refer back to what she said about fear, I don't believe it's really a fear of cops. It's just like a fear of our surroundings. Back to what she's saying, I think our fear of the cops
Proceedings

really come from, like, what we see with, like, our peers so I don't really think, like, me, personally, I don't really have a fear of cops but, like, I do have a fear when I go outside. I'm in fear that maybe one day a cop is gonna approach me 'cause he sees me hanging out with someone they know is a convicted felon or if he has a past record. That's all I wanted to say.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you for that. Thank you for sharing. Yes, Mr. Evans.

MR. EVANS: How you doing?

CHAIR WILEY: Hello.

MR. EVANS: Thank you for being here and thank you for having me. Well, my name is William Evans. I know a couple of faces in here as well. I'm the founder of Neighborhood Benches. The reason we're here because we wrote out a project, right, where we focus on the residents NYCHA, which is New York City Housing Authority housing developments and it's a thing out called, restorative justice that a lot of schools are implementing now. It's way to
Proceedings
understand, forgive and work through your issues.

I was just in Lehman giving a workshop and we was focused on the restorative justice but you have a lot of people where they're actually using it where they are actually using it in a limited space right so I explained to the people -- first, let me just start with this, I'm a survivor of gun violence. I was shot in the throat at the age of 16, right. I was arrested at the age of 15, right. And I also grew up in an abusive home. So I went through a lot of the things that some of our young guys are actually going through but I'm able to stand here today and say I do not have a conviction record and I am alive because I'm standing here talking to you now.

So the reason we designed this program is because it helps some of our youths focus on things like public speaking, advocacy and those are the things that empower some of our youths. Before I
learned about CCRB, I was kind of stuck because it was a lot of things going on in the neighborhood where it was like us against them. Us against them. When I say them, I mean police officers. Yes, there's some bad police officers out there and I've also been caught up in situations like that but there's something about being able to empower yourself and speak about some of the things that's actually bothering you whether it's at home, whether it's about bullying, whether it's about just your human rights as an individual.

I always teach kids, right, we're not focused on you doing things right because you already supposed to be doing things right. We're not focused on you not doing things wrong because sometimes we mimic things that we see, like I hear the young brother up here and some other individuals where they speak about when they touched base on some of the things that we see in the media about police officers and that goes on around the world,
Proceedings

right. But we also see situations where parents are actually attacking the kids and doing injustices and we have to reroute that type of energy and try to focus on how we empower our youth and we teach them how to speak up when something happened to them.

When I learned about the CCRB, even though I wasn't sure if it was gonna work, I still wrote to them. I didn't care if -- I take that back because I did care if someone did get back to me, but the fact that I was able to write to someone and someone would get back to me and it really works. So I definitely want to commend y'all for that because I remember writing complaints and getting a call back just to find out about it, right. Just to find out about where it's at in the process, right. So that's something I definitely want to encourage some of the young guys to use as well as parents.

So I want to get back to the program, right. The program focus on you
Proceedings

understanding that it's not just an issue with the individual, it's an issue with the community. So what we was teaching at Lehman was showing the professors and stuff that although you have an individual that comes to you, I used to be a counselor in alternative to incarceration program for six years, although you have an individual that comes to you, that individual have to still return to their community. So if the individual have to return to the community and they don't feel same, meaning if they don't feel safe because police officers are around, other individuals from the community is around, they gonna repeat the same type of behavior all over again. So we make sure we implement the restorative justice practice in a circle in three different layers, meaning the community involved, the community members and that individual that been impacted in some type of way.

So out in the Bronx, they have another organization that's called Lead by
Proceedings

Example, reversing a trend. And they actually work with the parole office over on 161st, which is neon, and they also run tournaments where the officers playing the students and they have a lot things going on and that has a huge impact but then you sit back and say what happened to the kids that's not in school? What is happening to the kids that can't afford to go to school because they being bullied out of school? Those are some of the individuals that actually have to -- that we actually have to work together to drill it in and I say us because I'm also addressing this to the officers as well because those are some of the kids that's actually lost, you know. If there's some way to actually get some of the funds from the precinct and use some of these individuals from the community because what we discovered was that people are interested in better behavior in their neighborhood. So what we did, we go out to the housing developments, right, because there
Proceedings

are precincts assigned to the housing developments which are the PSAs and we find those leaders of that community and we make sure those community members, which are leaders, they take the front stage and they actually, we actually work with them to design programs for that development and what that does is it takes the kids that's out of school and get them back in school. We get them back in school but we also use the assistance from officers. Officers help us and they're actually not seen as an officer, they're seen as an individual.

So I think this is something that's real vital for those out there who don't really know about the restorative justice, just to look at it because it touched base on a lot of things and a lot of officers is using that now in the Bronx and we do plan on coming to Washington Houses so this is one of the reasons that we're here. Thank you.

(Appause.)

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you. Thank
you. Did I miss anyone who wanted to speak who signed in? Was there anyone else?
Yes, please come to the mic.

MS. GERMAN: Hello.
CHAIR WILEY: Hello.

MS. GERMAN: My name is Rosaly German and I'm new to organizing with Community Voices Heard. As part of my work, I've started a listening campaign and one of the things by speaking to youth that I'm hearing a lot about is surveillance with the Police Department, and so when I hear, for instance, the young man who spoke and who said, I do not feel safe in my neighborhood, I wonder how that links to, for instance, the big pentagon that comes up on certain corners and you feel like you're being watched or the different vehicles that show up and are hard to identify and you, kind of, don't know what this is and you, kind of, wonder what happened on this block that this thing showed up and how does that implicate me?
And in what way? And so I'm wondering how
Proceedings

can we talk about more about surveillance
and the different tools that are used as
law enforcement, I don't know, and how do
we increase transparency with the community
so that we are all clear on how these tools
enhance our safety as people who are law
abiding and just trying to, you know, live?
Be.

CHAIR WILEY: Can I ask if either
one of our precinct commanders want to come
up and speak to that?

CO WALSH: Good afternoon,
everyone. As they said earlier, I'm Deputy
Inspector Kathleen Walsh, I'm an officer at
the 25th Precinct. I want to first thank
you all for inviting us here. It's
important as a commanding officer to know
what's going on in the community and what
are the issues and concerns. So again,
thank you so much.

To answer your question, what's
she talking about is what we call a sky
watch and we currently have one by the 25th
Precinct. It's up on 131st. It's actually
on the border of the 25 and the 32. It's on West 131st Street and 5th Avenue and the reason it was placed there was because we had an increase of shots-fired jobs. Year to date, we have a total of ten in that area where, by the grace of God, nobody was hit but there was vehicle damage done to the cars in the area. Building damage, store windows blown out so we'll generally put those up as a crime fightin' tools. I feel like I'm not addressing you. They're used as crime fightin' tools for shots fired, confirmed shots-fired jobs. When I say confirmed shots fired, it means we found shell casings, there was property damage and in this situation, there was and it was all along 5th Avenue from 129 to 135 and actually since we've put the sky watch up, it's moved to Madison Avenue but it really is just to deter the violence.

It's not audio recording anybody. It's for police presence and it does it has been proven to have worked and so it's just really a crime fightin' tactic and just to
Proceedings

answer some of the questions or at least
comment on some of the issues, it seems one
of the issues tonight and common concerns
here is the relationship between the
community and the police and how we can
improve and I'm confident that with this
new NCO program or NCO model of policing if
you will, the neighborhood coordination
officer program, we just started in the 25,
like I said, we're in our second week and I
really think it will improve community and
police relations. We go out, get involved,
hold meetin's, hold workshops and I think
somebody eluded to it before that we really
are a partnership. It's not us versus the
community or community versus the police,
we work together and together we can
definitely solve a lot of these issues and
I think one of the gentlemen earlier had
mentioned problems in schools and it's not
necessarily police presence is not
necessarily the answer and I agree, we're
not always the answer. Sometimes it is
community members, clergy that -- parents
Proceedings

that can do more good than police coming into schools. So again, it really is important that we work together as a partnership and resolving some of these issues.

Just to take a look around the room, we talked already about some of the school programs, basketball games. I see some of our youth here that we at the 25 have partaken in basketball games in some of the schools and it was -- it's funny because before the basketball games we always take a photograph of the police and the students, at least we try and at the beginning of the basketball game you'll have the students not wanting to stand really close to us, by the end of the basketball game, we're all standing and we're hugging each other and this is our photograph. Our first one is like this (indicating). Our second one is like this (indicating). We're like that.

So it is important for us to definitely interact, to reach out to youth
and definitely if we could reach out and there was more youth present at these meetings because that's who we really need to reach because we're all here for the same reason. We know we need to reach the youth so it is important if we can try and get that audience here and perhaps invite the some of the NCO officers to hear some of the concerns that the community has.

Thank you.

CHAIR WILEY: That's an excellent idea.

CO WALSH: Did I answer your question or did do you have any others?

MS. GERMAN: It starts to. I mean just to --

CHAIR WILEY: Can you actually come to the mic?

MS. GERMAN: I think making a comment on how it feels and how there isn't very much upfront information when these vehicles and, sort of, policing tools are used, and so then what it does, I mean, personally, is that then I start to really
Proceedings

wonder what happened? Am I more unsafe
than I was yesterday? And, sort of, what
exactly -- how long will this be here? How
does it deter crime? How am I safer
because this thing is here? Those kinds of
questions I don't ever feel resolved or
settled and so it's an observance that I
see more and more and so that's part of why
I'm, sort of, commenting on it and it's
also something that I'm hearing from the
young people that I'm talking to. And so
they have an emotional and, sort of,
physical response to it and so it's just an
area -- I guess it's an issue of concern
even though I hear your points about it
being a crime deterrent or policing tool.

CO WALSH: Just to answer that
question, we'll get both sides of that
coin. We'll get the thank you for putting
it out there or we'll get the what are you
doing? Why aren't you putting a police
officer on this block because we're getting
shot up over here and that's what we get.
We'll get -- we hold -- just so everybody
Proceedings

is aware here, every precinct holds a community council meetin'. Ours, the 25th Precinct, I don't know, ma'am, where you live.

MS. GERMAN: I live in the 30.

CO WALSH: Okay. The 25th Precinct, we hold our community counsel meetin' the third Thursday of very month. It's held at the 25th Precinct at 6:00 p.m. every month. We invite everybody to come out, and if there's any issues or concerns particularly to the 25, I can't answer for the 30 if they have a sky watch up in the 30 or not but I can tell you why our sky watch is on 131 and 5th because of the violence. And it has worked along 5th but it has unfortunately kind of pushed it towards Madison. It's not always the answer but it's one of our crime fightin' tools. We put more police officers out, which we have. We put out the sky watch, like I said, we recently went to NCO commands so there's more officers in our command now as well so hopefully, that will
help with the crime fightin' and, yes.

So I encourage if you are, you know, I encourage you to attend your precinct community council meeting regardless what precinct you live in or work in 23, the 28 the 30, the 25 please come out. You can just Google it actually and you'll find when your community council meetin' is held and that's also a place where you can, you know, address your concerns or at least put them out on the floor so they can be addressed. Yeah. Okay.

MS. GERMAN: Okay.

CO WALSH: Thanks. Thank you all.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you both very much.

FEMALE SPEAKER: Hello, everyone. First off, I just came from work and I work 12 hours today so I made it my business to come from the Bronx down here even though I live in Harlem, I work in the Bronx. I work between 3rd and Washington so in that
Proceedings

area, it's very, very, it's scary sometimes. I'm very close with the
gentleman with Lead by Example, the CEO of
Lead by Example. Very close with him and
we need more lead by examples. We need
more mentors. We need more men that are
men, not act as men. We need more of those
coming out and speaking to our youth
because remind you, a lot of us are kind of
older so the crime wasn't the same like it
was back in the day. The crime now is
ridiculous. Our youth do not respect no
one. Okay.

I have an organization it's
called, We Are Phenomenal Women. And we
talk about domestic violence. We talk
about bullying. Okay. So with that being
said, we need more CCRB to come out. We
need more mentors coming out and speaking
to our youth about not using the b-word.
Let's start addressing each other as woman,
princess, queen okay. All that ghetto
fabulous don't get you nowhere, understand
what I'm saying? You are a king. You want
Proceedings

someone to treat you as one but you gotta
treat yourself as one and treat that woman
as one as well.

So with that being said, Mr. Akil Rose, we just had a wonderful parade on
Saturday and we was out there marching from
133rd Street and Lenox Avenue over to
Marcus Garvey and it was a pre-Mother's Day
event, we couldn't really get nobody to
come out. So this is the problem with our
community. People don't like to come out
and it's bad.

Lead by Example always having,
every summer, have a tournament with the
officers, with the youth, and the purpose
of him doing what he does is because not
all officers are bad. Not all black
children are bad. Let's really be honest.
You know, we have some children that is
raised up well in the household. In the
household. But when they get outside, it's
totally different. It's one little boy I
heard one day I heard him tell another boy
to suck his thing. I told him, if you was
Proceedings

in prison, you would never have come out
your mouth and tell another man to suck
your thing 'cause you would get your butt
whipped. The lack of respect now is
disgusting.

I am really upset with my
community and I see the towers. Of course
they have the towers out. They should have
the towers out. You know why? Because
that's letting you know over here they had
a gun shooting. They had something that
went down. They have this app called
citizen. Yes, they have this app. Why?
Because we could take a look at it and go,
well, I'm not gonna take 145th Street, I'm
gonna take 144th, 143rd Street. So these
things are out there. Why? Because things
are getting bad and it's not with us.

Listen, work two jobs, have an
organization, help with Lead by Example,
all these different type of things that I'm
doing, I don't have time for no bull crap
for the next woman. The youth does. Why?
Because they too much time on their hands.
Proceedings

However, if there was PAL, if there was certain things that we had back in the day. I used to play hopscotch. They don't even do that anymore. They hoppin' all right. Hoppin' to get your pocketbook. Ain't nobody got time for that. No time. So I don't look down at the officers.

Tuesday, I'm gonna be on a panel in Tuesday in the Bronx talking about safety. For safety at home, and safety in the street with Vanessa Gibson. So I am out there. I do talk to people. We need to bring our youth to figure out what they need and a lot of our youth, they don't feel safe. They don't respect the cops. Why? Because they see all the gun shootings and then the cops cover up the stuff that they do. They cover it up. With some bull crap, oh, he was about to pull out a gun. He wasn't about to pull out no gun, he standing like this (indicating). But they officers, this is how the officers don't gain respect anymore because they cover up their wrongdoing and
then you expect the kids to respect the officers. No. Have more respect for the youth. Come out in the community. They scared to grab you, hold you, why? Because they feel like if I touch them, they might shoot me.

I was in the store, I was like let me not go too close to her because she might, you know, but I shouldn't feel that way. At the end of the day, I've been living in Harlem forever. Why should I feel scared to walk on any block? Any block. I live on 140th Street. And 140th Street at one point was the worst block ever in Harlem but why should I be scared? Just because I see a bunch of cops. I greet them hey, how you doing? That's just me. Not everybody's gonna to that.

So with that being said, these organizations, CCRB, Lead by Example my organization, We need more of those out there. Mr. Akil Rose, we need more people out there in the community that's doing that. Ms. Aretha, (phonetic) yes. Coming
Proceedings

out and speaking but we have it in a closed setting. Maybe we need to meet them where they at and go out in the street and in Harlem or matter fact, we in Harlem in the east side but we should be out in the projects, not inside. A lot of kids be like nah, I ain't going in there. Or offer some food or something to get them. You gotta, like, fishing. I love to fish. So we sit up there and reel them in on here. Let them have a good time. That's what Lead by Example do. They shut down the block, have the music playing and there's a message after that. They call themselves incredible messages. Am I right? I thank y'all for coming out. I am tired but I'm gonna stay right here with y'all.

CHAIR WILEY: Thank you so much. Thank you for coming.

MS. COBBS: Good evening. My name is Geraldine Cobbs and I found out about this meeting at my other organization, the Mid-Manhattan Branch of the NAACP. Unfortunately, I don't believe
it was advertised in this neighborhood too
much because it was not in a lot of the
buildings. I think we would have had more
people. But I have a question. I raised
my children in this neighborhood, they were
born here and my son, when he was about the
age of this young man, he was on his way
home from school and he and his friends
were approached by some policeman not
because they were doing anything wrong but
the policeman offered them $10 each if they
would participate in a lineup. Well, my
son told me this and I was wondering how
did this happen? I mean, is this a
practice today? I know you said you are
retired now, so it may have happened when
you were active. I don't know how it is
with the active police now in this
community and in this precinct but I also
understand that they were going to the
classrooms as well and they were allowed to
go into the schools.

MR. CARCATERA: I know there are
rules around that so maybe if one of the
Proceedings

commanders would like to answer the question, as far as with the lineups when we do a --

CO GURLEY: Yeah. We still do the lineups. Depending on the age of the child, we'll have to get permission.

MS. COBBS: Well, you said child right then and there. You said depending on the age of the child.

CO GURLEY: Right.

MS. COBBS: So that means you do approach children on the street --

CO GURLEY: We don't --

MS. COBBS: -- without the parents --

CO GURLEY: Wait a minute. Wait a minute. When you say child, some kids that are 16 look like they're 25 and some kids that are 25 may look like they're 16. It's not about the age of the person. We have a person in custody already who is the subject of a crime. That person looks a certain way. So in order to give him a proper lineup, legally. Legally. So that
Proceedings

we don't sterilize the case, we need five other people who look just like this person to be in the lineup so if we have a 16 or 17-year-old kid, we can't put 25 year old, 45 year old or 35-year-old men in that lineup if they don't look like this kid. So you need somebody that looks similar. So it can't be impartial.

So if I get arrested, I'm 43 years old, right. If I get arrested, and some people say I look young, they gotta take somebody that looks exactly like me. They need five people that look kind of close to me. Same haircut, they can't have braids, I don't have braids. They can't not have a mustache, they need a little mustache. They cant have a bald head because I don't have a bald head and we'll ask them to participate and we use police officers as well by the way so anybody that fits that specification. And once the lineup is done, the victim of the crime will have an opportunity to see if they can recognize their perpetrator out of the
Proceedings

We know who the perpetrator is. If somebody that wasn't the perpetrator is picked, they're not arrested. That means that we got to do a lot more work and maybe the victim can't identify or they're not really sure what the person looks like so that takes us back to the drawing board in terms of putting the case together but that does happen.

MS. COBBS: So my question is: Children are coming home from school and at that time he was in junior high school. Some children, as you say, look older but still, if you're approaching a child, and offering them $10 to participate; isn't that illegal?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.

CO GURLEY: You're saying offer the child $10. I'm sure if the parent wasn't with the child, they probably approached the child --

MS. COBBS: I wasn't with my son.

CO GURLEY: -- and then talked to mother. Your circumstance, I really can't
Procedings

speak about personally because I had nothing to do with it but with the detectives nowadays if they approach a child and they find out it's a child and they say, hey, you guys, we need to speak to your parents, possibly can you assist us in a lineup? The child is gonna say right now, well, let me call my mom or whatever the case is. I don't know what your case was.

MS. COBBS: Cellphones were not invented then.

CO GURLEY: What this young man's age and what your son is now, I don't know the difference is. That could be ten years, that could be fifteen years, that could be 20 years, I don't know but I know speaking for right now, we will talk to a parent before we use that child. But if you see a child in the street, you may approach him and say, hey, wait a minute, we need to speak to your parent, we might want to use you for a lineup if your parent allows you to.
Proceedings

MS. COBBS: That sounds perfectly fine because you're presenting it that way, however, that's not the way it was presented --

CO GURLEY: I'm sure it --

MS. COBBS: Hey, I want to speak to your parent. No, no, no. It wasn't presented that way.

CO GURLEY: I'm sure of it. Now, we're not getting into a timeframe here but how many years ago was it?

MS. COBBS: Thirty years ago.

CO GURLEY: Much different. Much different.

MS. COBBS: And that's why I wanted to know is that still in practice today when children are walking down the street are they still approached by policemen offering them money? Maybe it's $20 today.

CO GURLEY: They will. But we will speak to the parent. We won't just take the child and go in and do a lineup.

CHAIR WILEY: But you do speak to
Proceedings

them in the absence of a parent. In order
to get the contact information for the
parent --

CO GURLEY: We have to ask that
child without the parent and tell them what
it's about and say, we would like to speak
to your parent to see if you can help us
out with a lineup. That's the only way we
could do it because we have to see the
child. We have to see the kid. Am I
making my point?

CHAIR WILEY: You're making your
point. I think the mothers, I'll a speak
as a mother, are a little horrified by it.
Not because of your intent. It's not about
your intent or it's lawfulness. It's the
idea that a police officer approaching
someone who is very young and asking them
to participate in a lineup without the
presence of an adult who might be able to
either --

CO GURLEY: Well we --

CHAIR WILEY: -- make a judgment
or -- because you have to understand that a
Proceedings

young person might not know or understand what you're really asking of them and even the context or whether they're even under some suspicion.

CO GURLEY: But we're missing an important piece here. We can't take that child and remove that child to the precinct and use that child in the lineup without the permission of a parent.

CHAIR WILEY: No. I understand that point. I think we're talking about -- I just -- what I'm hearing, and this is I'm just gonna reflect what I'm hearing is that I feel some maternal sympathy for is that children don't necessarily understand it the way you're thinking of it because they're children.

CO GURLEY: Right.

CHAIR WILEY: And so if you have a police officer approaching you to say, are you willing to participate in a lineup, that's a very frightening thing and here's some money to do it and that can have some psychological harm even though that's not
Proceedings

your intent. I'm not talking about your intent but depending on the age of the child and the level of understanding that's the thing I think that at least I'm hearing as a concern.

CO GURLEY: That is correct. When we're talking about a police officer in this particular case, it's not an officer in uniform with a vest and a uniform walking up to kids and saying, hey, you know, forcibly stopping the kid and saying, oh, we're gonna take you in. It's a detective in a suit that is well spoken in investigations and things like that who says basically, hey, can we possibly do this or whatever the case may be.

CHAIR WILEY: I'm seeing a lot of heads shaking.

MS. COBBS: I have to ask a question.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: No. That's --

MS. COBBS: Excuse me.

CHAIR WILEY: Yeah. I'll give you a minute after. Let her ask the
Proceedings

MS. COBBS: The way you said you approach it, do any parents actually give you permission once you say you go to the parent and ask can your child please participate in a lineup? Have you ever gotten permission from a parent of a teenager who is 13 years old to participate in a lineup? Have you ever actually gotten permission from a parent?

CO GURLEY: Yes. We have.

MS. COBBS: For $10?

CO GURLEY: Yes. We have. We just talked -- listen to this. Listen to this. This is a clear example. Clear example. There's a shotgun and there's five youth that walk into a bodega. One of them produces a shotgun, alright. Puts it to the bodega owner, says, give me everything. Alright. We have video inside the bodega and we get images of who these people are. Now, we have to identify who these people are and once we identify them and we apprehend them, a lineup has to be
Proceedings

done. It has to be done.

CHAIR WILEY: I understand.

CO GURLEY: In order to get these people. It's not just go out and conjure the streets and say, oh, let's find kids off the street immediately. There's a process. Is that always the process? No, that's not always the process. A lot of times you have young officers, clean shaven that fit the build and we'll primarily use police officers if we find them. We'll go to precincts in Brooklyn, we'll go to precincts in Queens, we'll use my guys, 25, whatever and we'll try to do that first. If the kid is very, very young. Very young and it's a heinous crime and you have to identify this person. You have to do a lineup and it has to be done legally and it has to be done non-arbitrarily and the only way to get them is try to get kids. Are we always successful? I can't talk about stats about how successful we are at approaching in the streets and things like that. I can't say. Is that a practice
Proceedings

that will probably happen in the streets if we have to? Yes. But that's not always -- that's not our only recourse to say let's go to the street and just round up kids. That's not the process and we will never use the child without the permission of the parent and that's been the process of the way it is.

Any DA's office that before we do a lineup, they want to know that it's not very exclusive. That it's not if he's a male, light-skinned and he's 14 years old, don't put men with beards and different things with this kid. Because basically you're violating this perpetrator's life. You're blaming him for a crime, I mean, you're violating his rights.

CHAIR WILEY: I completely understand.

CO GURLEY: You're blaming him for a crime, a lineup has to be done but it has to be done the right way. So it's to protect the person we arrested and properly prosecute him. It's not to hurt the person
Proceedings

in the lineup or -- it's very private, too. It's not like you see in the movie. It's very, very private. Lawyers are there in most cases. It's not intrusive to the point where this kid gets paraded around, like, you been -- and even if the kid -- there's no consequences to the kids being in the lineup. And it's totally arbitrarily. If the parent says, no, I don't want my kid in the lineup, no problem. I'm sorry but that's the only way we could do it if we have perpetrators that look like that. That fit that 15, 14 or 13-year-old kid.

CHAIR WILEY: I just want to both appreciate the time you're taking to explain it and I think all of us do. I want to allow some folks who I know want to share either some experiences and views. Before I do, I'll apologize in advance. We're talking a lot about parenting and children and I actually have two teenagers at home alone right now and I actually have to get back to central Brooklyn so
unfortunately, I have to leave. I'm gonna say to the Board to allow folks to finish, we will forego our executive session and we will reconvene our executive session separately so that the Board is not kept and I know we have a hard stop in the space and I want to be respectful of the space so please continue and I apologize that I have to leave but I very much want to thank the community for coming out, for your time, for your honesty and also to our elected officials and leaders and our New York Police Department colleagues and we do consider you colleagues and part of the community as well so thank you.

(Applause.)

FEMALE SPEAKER: I'm sorry that was very, very disturbing because the main objective is you offered money to get these kids to come out and be in the lineup. Most of our children are poor who might not have any money so you come at them with money. Come and do this lineup for $10, $20. That is a bribe. Because if I came
Proceedings

to you and say, hey, officer, you saw me
sell some crack but here's $20, hold that
down, and don't say nothing. That's the
wrong approach to me and you won't see it
that way because you are a officer.

However, people like myself who is a parent
see it differently.

I'm sorry, that approach is scary
to me because you -- and then you trying to
explain a scenario. That wasn't even her
scenario. That was her scenario. We
talking about her scenario, her case. Her
case was different than the scenario you
explained to us officer. At the end of the
day, you should not offer no child no money
to come do a lineup. No. You are a
officer. They gonna do what you asked and
don't say nothing. Here's some money.
Here's a stack of dough. Would you want to
keep your mouth closed? And I hope our
children hear that. If an officer come to
you and offer you some money to do a
lineup, you're gonna say no. Say no and go
to your parent 'cause there's no way our
Proceedings

children should be getting involved with something like that. Nowadays, it's dangerous. Not only for them but if the person even heard that they did that, they are now called a snitch.

MR. DARCHÉ: Miss. Miss. Miss. We have two more speakers that want to speak and we're running out of time.

FEMALE SPEAKER: That just really upset me and I'm from the streets so that was kind of like, no way. I'm sorry. I'm sorry.

CO GURLEY: We can speak after.

MR. DOYLE: My name is Parker Doyle (phonetic). I'm 15 and I go to school at Coalition High School and I just want to refer to what she said and before what she said, like, I feel like we as men, we should treat women with respect because, like, back then, I feel like I was follower at first, like, I used to follow the wrong dudes in these places, like, I'm not gonna lie, I used to call people, like females, the b-word. I would like to apologize to
Proceedings

every woman that's in here and out there.

(Appplause.)

MR. DOYLE: Right now, like, back then in November, I made a mistake that I truly, really regret, and what I realize to now, I realize, like, that mistake I've done, I should've never done it. The family and the support I have around here is, like, amazing and, I mean, like, I'm lucky. Especially the captain at the 25th Precinct, I feel like she really cares for me like she treats me like I'm her son and I want to appreciate you for what you've done.

(Appplause.)

MR. DOYLE: And I feel like what you said about black children, they're bad. I will agree and disagree because I feel like I made a mistake that I regret but I learned from that mistake. Right now, I have a hundred percent attendance. I have four honor role mentions and I feel like I can represent the black people.

(Appplause.)
Proceedings

MR. DOYLE: I feel like me having a positive mindset helps me become successful throughout the years of my life because I am doing good right now and I'm gonna make sure that mistake I made will never happen again and I would like to thank my mother because she's always telling me make sure you treat everyone with respect and make sure you stay in school and listen to people that actually cares for you and I just wanted to say that 'cause you really brung [sic] a good point on that. Thank you guys.

(Applause.)

MR. DARCHE: This will be the last speaker the evening.

MALE SPEAKER: Thank you all for being here. I have a very specific question from Conner's presentation and in general, we know that video taping police altercations introduces a new level of accountability and from Conner's presentation, it obviously helps the CCRB to decide cases, complaints when you are
able to have video footage of an altercation but I've seen and witnessed incidences where a police officer will threaten or -- basically, my question is if someone is video taping a police altercation, what is to stop the police officer from confronting that individual? So if they are ten feet away video taping the altercation, is it at the officer's discretion whether or not that's threatening to the officer and this is primarily a question for current and former law enforcement. Could you just explain a little bit the process behind what is legal and what is illegal when it comes to video taping police altercation? Thank you.

MR. DARCHE: So we actually have one of our policy analysts that's been studying that. Hanna, can you come briefly speak to that? Briefly.

MS. KARSEVAR: You have no faith in my ability to be brief?

MR. DARCHE: None.

MS. KARSEVAR: We have been
Proceedings investigating that. My name is Hanna Karsevar. I'm an attorney in the CCRB policy unit and have been working on a report that looks at the incidents of police interference with individuals who are taping police conduct.

As to the legal question, there are definite boundaries as to when a person is interfering with police activity and they no longer have a right to be recording it because they are actually preventing the police officers from carrying out their duties. That's a different situation than someone saying -- an officer telling a civilian to put the camera away. So we have gone through all of our cases that the CCRB has received, that have been closed in the last three years from 2014 and 2016 and looked at cases where police officers stop civilians or attempt to stop civilians --

MR. DARCHÉ: Hanna?

MS. KARSEVAR: Yeah.

MR. DARCHÉ: So just focus on what is permissible and don't get into what
Proceedings

we found in the report.

MS. KARSEVAR: What is permissible is for anyone to film police conduct, that's being any police officer who is performing his official duties in a public space, it's okay for a civilian to record that activity. What a civilian cannot do necessarily is record an officer while the civilian is being placed under arrest or being stopped or in a situation that causes safety risks to other individuals or prevents the police from carrying out their duties.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you.

MS. KARSEVAR: I guess I couldn't be brief but that's -- I hope that answers.

(Applause.)

MR. DARCHE: I'd like to thank everyone for coming out tonight and this was a really great meeting so thank you all for coming out.

(Applause.)

(Time noted: 8:51 p.m.)
CERTIFICATE

STATE OF NEW YORK )
    ) ss.:
COUNTY OF KINGS )

I, JOANNA GARCIA, a Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the within-entitled matter, and that the foregoing transcript is a true record of such proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage; and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 19th of May 2017.

__________________________
Joanna Garcia

JOANNA GARCIA

G

52 (1) 90:7
5th (5) 69:24 105:3,18 110:16,17
___ 6
6 (2) 2:1 27:21
6:00 (1) 110:10
6:30 (1) 1:5
___ 7
7 (1) 2:2
70 (1) 16:5
70s (1) 56:8
75th (1) 15:23
7th (1) 94:21
___ 8
8 (1) 2:9
8:51 (1) 138:24
800-341-2227 (1) 12:14
80s (1) 56:8
85 (1) 53:16
86 (1) 20:18
___ 9
9 (1) 2:10
90s (1) 56:8
95 (1) 16:2
95th (1) 89:16
96th (1) 28:24