

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

PUBLIC MEETING

November 8, 2017

6:30 p.m.

-----X

Bronx Community College

RBSC Playhouse
2155 University Avenue
Bronx, New York 10453

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE:

ANGELA FERNANDEZ, Acting Chairperson

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

Transcribed by:

Kathleen T. Keilty, CSR
License No. 000755-1

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Report from the Acting Chair
3. Report from the Executive Director
4. Presentation by Outreach on the CCRB
5. Presentation from Policy on Data
6. Comment from Community Groups
7. Public Comment
8. Old Business
9. New Business
10. Adjourn to Executive Session

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

=====

ANGELA FERNANDEZ Acting Chair

SALVATORE F. CARCATERRA Board Member

LINDSAY EASON Board Member

FRANK J. DWYER Board Member

FREDERICK R. DAVIE Board Member

MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS Board Member

JOHN SIEGAL, ESQ. Board Member

RAMON PEGUERO, ESQ. Board Member

YOUNGKIK YOON, ESQ. Board Member

=====

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

4

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKERS:

Christopher David	Butler Community Center
Hamzah Gumoneh	Butler Community Center
Marcus Rodriguez	Executive Board Member Bronx Community College's Criminal Justice Club
Cali Jordan-Gotay	Exalt Youth, Center for Court Innovation's Bronx Solutions Program, Daphne Foundation
Tatyana Wallace	Exalt Youth, Center for Court Innovation's Bronx Solutions Program
Jelani Anglin	Good Call
Kenneth Brown	Community Board 5 District Manager
Niko Williams	Bronx High School
Anthony D'Ambrosio	
Juan Garcia	Institute for Mediation and Conflict Resolution
Christian Phentermine Nunez	
Evangeline Williams	Sedgewick Houses
Robert Acosta, Jr.	
Brian Bramble	
Elizabeth Padilla	
James Felton Keith	
Salvatore Cartagena	

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKERS: (Continued)

Miriam Sanchez Council Member, VP PSA 8

Whitney Barnes Community Center

Derek

Terell

Howard Butler

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

6

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Good
3 evening. Buenas tardes.

4 AUDIENCE SPEAKERS: Buenas
5 tardes.

6 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
7 like to call the November meeting of the
8 Civilian Complaint Review Board to order.
9 My name is Angela Fernandez, and I'm the
10 Acting Chair of the CCRB tonight. I am a
11 mayoral designee.

12 Before we get started, I would
13 like to ask each of our board members to
14 introduce themselves, and we'll start at
15 the end over here.

16 MR. YOON: My name is Youngkik
17 Yoon, City Council designee.

18 MR. EASON: Good evening,
19 everyone. My name is Lindsay Eason. I'm
20 a Police Commissioner's appointee.

21 MR. SIEGAL: John Siegal,
22 designated by Mayor Bill de Blasio.

23 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: How y'all
24 doing? My name is Mabre Stahly-Butts,
25 I'm a City Council appointee, and it's

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

7

1 Proceedings

2 good to be here tonight.

3 MR. CARCATERRA: Hi everyone.

4 I'm is Sal Carcaterra and I'm a Police
5 Commissioner designee.

6 MR. DARCHE: I'm Jonathan
7 Darche. I'm the Executive Director of
8 the agency.

9 MR. PEGUERO: Buenas tardes.
10 Good evening. My name is Ramon Peguero.
11 I'm a City Council designee for the
12 County of Queens.

13 MR. DWYER: I'm Frank Dwyer and
14 I'm a Police Department designee.

15 MR. DAVIE: Hi. I'm Fred Davie
16 and I'm a mayoral designee.

17 (Whereupon, Acting Chair
18 Fernandez gives a Spanish address.)

19 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I
20 wanted to take a few minutes and explain
21 what the CCRB does. For those of you who
22 don't know, we are an independent
23 civilian oversight agency, and we are
24 charged with receiving, investigating and
25 evaluating any complaints that allege

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

8

1 Proceedings

2 police misconduct.

3 And again, we are an independent
4 agency we do not work for the New York
5 Police Department. None of us on the
6 board are employees of the New York
7 Police Department.

8 Tonight we have investigators on
9 hand if you would like to start a
10 complaint. It can -- the investigators
11 as part of the CCRB please stand up so
12 individuals know who you are.

13 MR. DARCHE: Frank. Frank.

14 They're in the book there
15 talking to Rudy.

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Can the
17 investigators please stand up.

18 So at any time throughout this
19 meeting or after this meeting if you
20 would like to speak about an issue, feel
21 free to turn to them. If you would
22 rather do this after the meeting or
23 another day, you can always call the
24 office, which the phone number is on
25 pamphlets outside, you could also go to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

9

1 Proceedings

2 the website, or you can go personally to
3 the office itself; the address is also on
4 our pamphlets outside.

5 So we're really, really thrilled
6 to be here in the community, and the
7 reason why we're thrilled is because this
8 is the best way that we can understand
9 what is happening on the ground. And,
10 what you share with us tonight informs
11 our work. So, please, if you haven't
12 signed up already to either ask questions
13 or make comments, please sign up, and it
14 can be in English, in Spanish, we would
15 love to hear from you.

16 To that end, we also have
17 members of the local precincts here and
18 various community organizations who will
19 be sharing their insights of what they
20 see happening in our neighborhoods and in
21 the Bronx.

22 Before we get started, I'd like
23 to acknowledge a few individuals that are
24 here. First I would like to thank
25 Adrianna Signalco and Marcos Rodriguez,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

10

1 Proceedings

2 who are students here at BCC, part of the
3 criminal justice team who helped organize
4 this. Adrianna, if you could just raise
5 your hand.

6 (Applause)

7 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: And
8 Marcos.

9 I would like to acknowledge a
10 representative of Luis Sepulveda's office
11 here, Bob Kappstatter.

12 Bob, would you like -- do you
13 want to say a few words?

14 MR. KAPPSTATTER: The
15 Assemblyman apologizes. He's tied up
16 at --

17 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: And,
18 Bob, I'm sorry, if I could ask you to go
19 to the podium since we're recording, and
20 so we need to hear you on the mic. Thank
21 you.

22 MR. KAPPSTATTER: The
23 Assemblyman apologizes. He's tied up at
24 another community meeting, but he asked
25 me to say a few words.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

11

1 Proceedings

2 First, he does applaud the work
3 of the CCRB, and he also notes the
4 decline in the number of cases over the
5 years as a positive sign and some
6 positive steps that have been taken by
7 the police department: Cutting down Stop
8 and Frisk, better training of officers,
9 introduction of neighborhood policing for
10 better community relations. He thinks
11 that this all works toward better
12 relations between the CCRB and the
13 department.

14 Of course, there are still
15 issues to be -- to remain, but he hopes
16 those will be worked out shortly and
17 amicably between both of you. Thank you
18 very much.

19 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
20 you very much.

21 I also would like to acknowledge
22 a representative from the Bronx Borough
23 President's office. Tracy, I thought I
24 saw you here. Can you please stand up so
25 folks can see.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

12

1 Proceedings

2 I think this is also a good
3 opportunity, we have staff and
4 representatives of the local elected
5 officials and please turn to them as well
6 to talk about any concerns that you may
7 have.

8 We have a representative from
9 the District Attorney Darcel Clark's
10 office. Please stand. Thank you very
11 much.

12 A representative from State
13 Senator Gustavo Rivera's office. Thank
14 you.

15 A representative from Council
16 Member Fernando Cabrera's office. Thank
17 you.

18 And we also have a
19 representative from the Community
20 Board 5. Thank you.

21 NYCHA Fort Independence. O.K.

22 And PSA Precinct Community
23 Council. Thank you. Up here. Thank
24 you.

25 O.K., very good.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

13

1 Proceedings

2 And with that we will move on to
3 the agenda. I'd like to invite the
4 Executive Director Jonathan Darche to
5 please provide the executive director's
6 report.

7 MR. DARCHE: Thank you all for
8 joining us at the Bronx Community College
9 tonight. I'd like to thank the college
10 and especially Professor Tumhara Mantuma,
11 Professor Crystal Rodriguez, and the
12 Criminal Justice Club for their
13 assistance at tonight's meeting.

14 (Applause)

15 MR. DARCHE: Please note that
16 the December board meeting will take
17 place on Wednesday, December 13th and
18 will be held in the CCRB offices at 100
19 Church Street.

20 I'd also like to take this
21 opportunity to welcome the agency's new
22 Director of Policy and Advocacy, Nicole
23 Napolitano. Nicole, I thought I saw you
24 earlier. If you could stand up.

25 (Applause)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

MR. DARCHE: Nicole received her Ph.D. in Criminal Justice from the CUNY Graduate Center. Most recently she served as Senior Policy Manager for the NYPD Inspector General. She's been studying, teaching and working in the criminal justice field for many years. In the short time she's been with the agency, she has brought her dedication and spirit to help us make progress on many important issues, including integrating the NYPD's body-worn camera data into our investigative process and pushing forward studies of NYPD's treatment of the homeless, as well as sexual misconduct.

For a full review of the agency's monthly statistics, please visit our website. If you do not have access to the website and would like a copy of the full report, please contact our Outreach Unit and we will send you a hard copy.

There are investigators here

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

15

1 Proceedings

2 now. Frank, stand up again since you
3 missed it the first time. And if you
4 need to talk to them, they'll be here
5 until the last person leaves this
6 meeting.

7 If you're watching at home and
8 would like to file a complaint, you can
9 call us at 1.800.341.2272 or by calling
10 311 or you can file on line at
11 nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint. Thank you.

12 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
13 you very much.

14 I would like to invite our
15 Director of Outreach, Keith Tubbs, to
16 share a presentation. Thank you.

17 MR. TUBBS: Good evening,
18 everyone. My name is Keith Tubbs. I'm
19 the Director of Outreach and
20 Intergovernment Affairs for the New York
21 Civilian Complaint Review Board. I'm
22 going to go through a short presentation
23 with you guys.

24 The Civilian Complaint Review
25 Board is a city agency that investigates

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

and mediates -- that investigates and mediates allegations of misconduct filed against members of the NYPD. In certain cases the CCRB's Administrative Prosecution Unit, the APU, prosecutes police officers who are found to have committed misconduct.

What the CCRB investigates, we investigate complaints alleging police misconduct. Each police allegation -- well, each police action that the complainant or the victim describes is considered a distinct allegation, and even though only one complaint is filed, there may be -- there may be considered multiple complaints.

We do not investigate -- we do not review and investigate every type of police encounter. The type of allegations that we have jurisdiction over, they fall under what we call FADO, that's excessive force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, and offensive language.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

17

1 Proceedings

2 Force will include punching,
3 kicking, grabbing, pushing, uses of a
4 impact weapon, like a night stick, pepper
5 spray, and a taser. Use of a firearm
6 even -- that would include if a police
7 officer were to point a firearm at you,
8 that would be considered a use of
9 force.

10 Abuse of authority, that would
11 include things like stops of persons in
12 vehicles, frisk of persons, searches of
13 persons in vehicles and residents without
14 sufficient cause, and refusal to provide
15 name and shield number if they don't give
16 you their name and shield number.

17 Discourtesy will include foul
18 language, use of profanity, discourtesy
19 conduct and discourtesy gestures or
20 actions.

21 Offensive language includes
22 racial or religious epithets, language
23 that improperly -- that inappropriately
24 refers to race, nationality, religion,
25 gender or perceived sexual orientation or

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

18

1 Proceedings

2 disability.

3 The life of a CCRB case, a
4 complaint can be filed in person, by
5 email, by phone, or on our website, and a
6 person from our Intake Unit will speak
7 with the complainant. The matter will
8 then be sent to our Investigations Unit.
9 The matter then can be mediated or
10 investigated.

11 If the matter is investigated,
12 the investigator presents his or her
13 findings and recommendations to a
14 three-member panel that includes an NYPD,
15 City Council, and mayoral appointee. The
16 panel reviews the investigator's finding
17 and makes a final recommendation. That
18 may go to the Administrative Prosecution
19 Unit.

20 How to file a complaint. You
21 can call 311. You can also go to
22 www.nyc.gov/ccrb. You can also call
23 1-800-341-CCRB. You can also come down
24 to 100 Church Street in New York, New
25 York 10007. You can also go to Assem- --

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

19

1 Proceedings

2 not Assembly Woman, Council Woman Vanessa
3 Gibson's district office to file a
4 complaint. She does have the resources to
5 file a complaint there as well.

6 Finally, the last thing that I
7 want to say, if anybody wants the
8 Outreach Unit to do a presentation, you
9 can sign up for presentations right at
10 the sign-up desk, and we will be happy to
11 come out to wherever you are and give you
12 guys a presentation. Thanks.

13 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
14 you very much.

15 (Applause)

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Before
17 we invite our next speaker from the CCRB,
18 if you have any questions about what our
19 speakers have said, please take note and
20 you can sign your name up to speak and
21 ask those questions. This is an open
22 forum and we encourage that people ask
23 questions to clarify any confusion.

24 The next person -- or actually
25 before I invite the next person, I would

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

20

1 Proceedings

2 like to acknowledge a representative from
3 Counsel Member Ritchie Torres's office.
4 Could you please stand so folks can know.
5 O.K.

6 And we also have Jelani Anglin,
7 co-founder and community organizer for
8 Good Call. Thank you. Thank you.

9 I'd like to introduce our
10 Director of Policy, Nicole Napolitano.

11 MS. NAPOLITANO: Where did you
12 go with that? O.K. Thanks. Sorry.
13 Thank you.

14 So hi, everyone. So I'm just
15 going to present a small snapshot of the
16 locally occurring data from the Bronx in
17 general but also focusing on the two
18 nearest precincts, the 46th and 52nd
19 Precincts.

20 So, you can see up here, there
21 is a map that we have of the complaints
22 that we've received in the Bronx in its
23 entirety. The -- and I realize it's a
24 little tough to read from this far away,
25 but the highest number of complaints in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

the Bronx has come from the 44th. The 46th precinct over there is third, and the 52nd comes right there in the middle. It's the last orange bar there. So the 46th Precinct had 87 complaints total and the seventy -- I'm sorry, the 52nd had 75. This is year-to-date 2017.

These charts or maps, rather, compare rates of complaints to help us to standardize what's going on across the precincts which have different populations.

So on the left, it's the number of complaints per 1,000 people who live in that particular precinct, all right? And so, for all of the Bronx you can see that there are some precincts that have a pretty high rate of complaints with the 41st Precinct in the South Bronx having the highest rate of complaints, followed by the 50th, and you can see the 52nd and the 46th precinct are sort of somewhere in the middle there.

On the right, that's a map of

1 Proceedings

2 the number of crime complaints as per
3 NYPD data per 1,000 people living in that
4 precinct. So it's a measure of crime
5 rate. And comparing those two maps shows
6 us that in some precincts there are
7 higher rates of crime but lower rates of
8 complaints, and so, what that might
9 indicate to us is that there are some
10 complaints that might not be getting to
11 us. And so, we can really use the
12 community's help in determining which of
13 those complaints might not be getting to
14 us, and so we can talk about that as
15 outreach.

16 And I think if there are
17 questions, those are to be waited until
18 after.

19 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: Where is the
20 reference to the PSAs' data points?
21 That's not listed (inaudible). That's
22 what my question is.

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So we'd
24 like -- let's address that after she
25 finishes speaking.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

23

1 Proceedings

2 MS. NAPOLITANO: I can address
3 that, yeah.

4 So these are the fully
5 investigated allegations by FADO for the
6 Bronx and also for Precincts 46 and 52,
7 and again, all of this data is 2017 year
8 to date. So this is what we're looking
9 at most recently.

10 So these are the allegations
11 that have been fully investigated. This
12 doesn't count the cases that we're still
13 investigating. You can see how each of
14 the precincts compares to the Bronx
15 overall, separated out by the allegation
16 type.

17 So the dark blue is abuse of
18 authority. The orange is force. The
19 light blue is discourtesy, and the green
20 is offensive language; and so, there are
21 some similarities across the board and
22 actually the Bronx looks a lot like
23 New York City as a whole. So we do see
24 similar types of complaints across the
25 borough and across New York. These are

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

the fully investigated allegations by
board disposition.

So board disposition refers to
the outcome of the case; and so there are
four possible outcomes here. So cases
can be substantiated, and that would be
the case if misconduct was found to be
improper based on a preponderance of the
evidence. Allegations might be
unsubstantiated, if there's not enough
evidence to determine whether or not that
misconduct occurred. Allegations can be
unfounded if the preponderance of the
evidence suggests that the event or the
act did not occur. They can also be
exonerated if the event did occur but was
not improper, not found to be improper by
a preponderance of the evidence. And in
some cases, we would also close cases or
close allegations as member of service
unidentified, so if the investigation
cannot identify the individual subject
officer.

And so, what we see here is for

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

the Bronx as a whole, the dark blue is unsubstantiated. The orange is exonerated. The light blue is substantiated. The yellow is the member of service was unidentified, and the green was unfounded. So again, these numbers actually do for the Bronx mirror what we see in the city as a whole.

Although, there are some interesting fluctuations between the 46th Precinct and the 52nd Precinct numbers that I'm doing a deeper dive on just to understand a little bit more about what's going on in the precincts here in the local area.

And so, the final slide here shows you a bit of what we're starting to see with video evidence, and as more and more video evidence becomes available, there are cases that we can close on what we call on the merits; and so, cases that are closed on the merits are cases in which there's a definitive answer there. And so, this combines cases that are substantiated, exonerated and unfounded,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

cases in which there's a pretty clear indication of what happened, but then cases that are unsubstantiated or where the member of service was unidentified would be in the blue bar there that's not on the merits.

And so, taking a look at the Bronx without video, only 11 percent of those cases could closed on the merits, but when we have video evidence available, that number jumps much higher to 33 percent, and that is -- the numbers are slightly different for the city at large, but pretty much in a similar sort of a pattern where if we have video evidence, it is much more likely that we will be able to close those cases on the merits.

And again, in the middle is the 46th Precinct and the 52nd Precinct is over on the right-hand side there. And so, we're starting to see some similar patterns as we get more and more video evidence in cases.

And, as mentioned before,

1 Proceedings

2 complaints can be filed in any number of
3 ways, but these are the web addresses, if
4 anyone would like to take them down for
5 the link to file a complaints on line.
6 Our data transparency initiative, so CCRB
7 has a ton of data available to the public
8 on its website, including different maps
9 and graphs and charts, how things have
10 changed over time. So, if you have any
11 interest in learning more about some of
12 our numbers, much of that is available
13 for you online.

14 And our reports, we issue
15 monthly statistical reports, annual and
16 biannual statistical reports as well as a
17 number of issue-based reports. And so,
18 those can all be found in our Reports
19 section of the website as well. So --

20 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Nicole,
21 before you step away, would you be able
22 to answer --

23 MS. NAPOLITANO: Sure.

24 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: -- the
25 question that we had earlier on the PSAs?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

28

1 Proceedings

2 MS. NAPOLITANO: Just to restate
3 the question so everyone could hear it,
4 the question, and correct me if I'm
5 wrong, is why don't we have data
6 available on the PSAs; was that right?

7 So the way that we calculate
8 these numbers is based on the physical
9 precinct of occurrence, so it's a
10 geographic location, right? So there are
11 natural geographic boundaries to the
12 precincts, but the PSAs are not
13 geographic locations. They're units
14 within NYPD.

15 So the only way to calculate a
16 unit within NYPD would be to calculate
17 where the subject officer was from. So
18 if that officer was stationed to the PSA,
19 then that would be a different type of
20 data entirely.

21 Does that make sense?

22 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: Yes.

23 MS. NAPOLITANO: O.K. Very good.

24 (Inaudible audience
25 participation off microphone.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

29

1 Proceedings

2 MR. DARCHE: Your -- one of
3 the questions was about PSA 8, and
4 so far the agency has closed
5 25 cases against PSA 8 this year,
6 and in 2016 at this time, they had
7 closed 22.

8 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: Do you
9 know how many they had? Do you
10 know how many complaints they had?

11 MR. DARCHE: So I don't
12 know by PSA 8 specifically, but we
13 can get that for you.

14 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: O.K.
15 Thank you.

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Very
17 good. Thank you.

18 MS. NAPOLITANO: Thank you.

19 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So now
20 we're going to open it up to
21 presentations from community groups, and
22 I just want to, before we start with this
23 portion of our meeting, that this is a
24 safe space for us to speak honestly and
25 openly about what's happening so that we

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

30

1 Proceedings

2 can do our job better.

3 I would like to invite Youth
4 from Directions for Youth from Butler
5 Community Center. If you could please
6 come up.

7 Welcome.

8 MR. DAVID: Thanks for having
9 me.

10 SPEAKER: Introduce yourself.

11 MR. DAVID: Good afternoon.
12 Man, this thing is short.

13 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: You can
14 pull. Yeah, you can pull. Right,
15 exactly.

16 MR. DAVID: Good afternoon. My
17 name is Christopher David from Butler
18 Community Center.

19 MR. GUMONEH: My name is Hamzah.

20 So like, when we came in like
21 they asked us a question like how we
22 could build on our relationships with,
23 like, police officers, and like in my
24 opinion -- in my opinion, the only way we
25 could build our relationships with police

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

31

1 Proceedings

2 officers is like we break off all
3 stigmas, all stereotypes, like -- forget
4 this.

5 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Speak
6 into the mic.

7 MR. GUMONEH: Right. Like on
8 the topic of stereotypes, like, if you
9 see like --

10 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Speak
11 into the mic, please.

12 MR. GUMONEH: If you see like a
13 black minority -- a minority person who
14 like lives on the, quote, unquote, a
15 hood, like any police, a police officer
16 will like give the stereotype that, oh,
17 yeah, he has that hoody on, he's going
18 inside a store, he's going to steal. He
19 has a hoody on he's going to go out, he's
20 going to like try to shoot or do
21 something.

22 Like if you give a stigma on us,
23 a stereotype on us we have -- we have to
24 have the same mindset. We have to give
25 back, we have to give back the same

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

32

1 Proceedings

2 stigma. We have to give back the same
3 stereotype. Like if we see any police
4 officer, for the safety of us, we have to
5 say, oh, yeah they're going to do
6 something bad to us. We have to think.
7 And like the only way like we're only
8 ever going to have a good relationship
9 with police officers is you break all
10 stigmas, if you break all discrimination,
11 and that's it.

12 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
13 you.

14 (Applause)

15 MR. DAVID: O.K. One thing that
16 I would like to change in this community
17 is that we should have more crossing
18 guards. The reason I would like to have
19 more crossing guards is because of the
20 abundant amount of children are dead
21 because of cars and traffic jams, and
22 police officers are not there to help
23 them when cars are crossing the light
24 when it's not their light.

25 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Very

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

33

1 Proceedings

2 good. Thank you.

3 (Applause)

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Does
5 anyone on the board want to address or
6 say anything?

7 O.K. Thank you very much, and
8 we appreciate your bravery in coming and
9 speaking. It's not easy to speak in
10 public, so thank you for that.

11 (Applause)

12 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: For the
13 community groups that I'm going to invite
14 up, we have a time limit of five minutes.
15 Please stay within the five minutes.

16 So first I'd like to invite
17 Marcus Rodriguez. Marcus Rodriguez?

18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Good evening.
19 My name is Marcus Rodriguez. I'm actually
20 also the IOC representative for the
21 Criminal Justice Club here in Bronx
22 Community College.

23 Originally there were a few
24 interviews done concerning students from
25 different boroughs in New York City, and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

most of these students actually felt in the long run that they couldn't actually go to police and nor could they have any -- did they have the actual resources to be able to get in contact with somebody in a safe location in case they had any type of complaints or even comments concerning the reviews.

Even in the last couple of years, we've seen reports both from the precincts, both within the school zones coming any particular school zone whether elementary school up to colleges that actually inflate -- seem to inflict more damage than they actually do any good.

Most students feel that they can't actually even speak about it even within the school community itself for the fear that because of their age, because of their race, because of their gender or even immigration status that they'll be rejected, that they'll be basically sent away.

That's one particular focus that

1 Proceedings

2 I would like to know what is the Outreach
3 group itself planning to do? How can we
4 actually expose the resources out there
5 both from CCRB and in general from every
6 precinct to the college students and
7 every other student in general?

8 Just like it was stated, this is
9 a safe place, but most will not feel that
10 way. Most even interviews, some
11 retracted from having their answers spoken
12 out because of that particular reason.
13 What can be done?

14 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Well,
15 thank you for bringing this up. I know
16 we have a team of outreach that represent
17 the CCRB that would be willing and eager
18 to come on campus, meet with groups,
19 maybe the Affinity groups, sometimes
20 those are safer spaces, any student
21 associations, but I definitely invite you
22 to speak to our staff from the Outreach
23 team who are very creative and very
24 willing to partner with you so that we
25 could have more people here on campus to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

36

1 Proceedings

2 explain the steps of how to file a
3 complaint with the CCRB or anything else
4 related to the CCRB.

5 Mr. RODRIGUEZ: Perfect. Thank
6 you. Thank you very much.

7 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
8 you.

9 (Applause)

10 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
11 like to invite Cali Jordan-Gotay, the
12 Youth Leaders representing Center for
13 Court Innovation's Bronx Solutions
14 Program.

15 MS. JORDAN-GOTAY: Hi, good
16 evening. My name is Cali Jordan-Gotay.
17 I'm representing Exalt Youth, Bronx
18 Community Solutions, and the Daphne
19 Foundation where I handle administration
20 and programming.

21 I would like to bring this to
22 your attention. As a community and the
23 CCRB, we need to realize that due to
24 over-policing many black and brown Latino
25 youth don't have the opportunity to be

1 Proceedings

2 kids compared to people of suburbia with
3 generally lower crime rates. They don't
4 have the opportunity to make mistakes,
5 you know, that come with growing up.

6 The first speakers brought up a
7 very legitimate point about
8 stigmatization in black communities.

9 Those who are interested, I suggest you
10 guys research Labeling Theory; it's a
11 very real thing especially in the black
12 community. And, not only is the system
13 against them, but many don't have the
14 foundation that comes with a stable home
15 or support system, and in reality, we
16 don't know much and we don't support the
17 community enough.

18 Instead of perpetuating these
19 stigmas, I propose that we support each
20 other and the kids of this community and
21 we show them what a good future looks
22 like. So, in general stop deeming kids
23 as bad or no good. Perhaps they're
24 seeking a better example than what is
25 surrounding them, right?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

38

1 Proceedings

2 It's easy to over-police and
3 criminalize a population with struggles
4 that you don't understand or refuse to
5 understand. So I propose that people
6 look into this, right, and look into the
7 issues in the community. That's all.
8 Have a good night.

9 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
10 you very much.

11 (Applause)

12 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
13 like to reiterate -- oh, I'm sorry,
14 you're part of --

15 MS. WALLACE: You can go ahead.

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I'm
17 sorry. Go ahead. Go ahead. Go ahead.

18 MS. WALLACE: O.K. On behalf of
19 Bronx Community College Solutions and on
20 behalf of Exalt also, I'm here to address
21 a question.

22 MALE SPEAKER: Get closer to the
23 mic.

24 MS. WALLACE: O.K. The question
25 is, what do you consider a major concern

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

about police action in your respective precincts? And in my response to that question, police should take into consideration that -- the rights of African-Americans.

The day when I got arrested, the cops showed up to my door saying that me and my aunt should get dressed and come down to the 42nd Precinct with them or else a warrant would have been out for arrest.

After we got to the precinct, we were thrown into a cell. Our rights were not read to us, and we were sent to 161st courthouse for arraignment, with our rights of connecting to a lawyer were denied. We spent 17 hours in jail for a crime that we did not commit.

If my parent could not have afforded a lawyer, I would have probably spent or wasted three days of my life in jail waiting for a public defender attorney. I assume that there are plenty of people who are incarcerated and

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

40

1 Proceedings

2 wasting time going to court for something
3 they did not do.

4 I believe that in NYC court
5 system African-Americans are guilty
6 before proven innocent. This showed that
7 this is a negative perception that NYPD
8 seems to have on African-Americans.

9 Thank you.

10 (Applause)

11 MR. DARCHE: Miss? Miss?

12 Could you give us your name?

13 MS. WALLACE: My name is
14 Tatyana Wallace.

15 MR. DARCHE: She didn't say
16 but she might not want to tell us.

17 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So I'm
18 sorry that that happened, and we do have
19 investigators here from the CCRB that we
20 had asked them to stand up before in the
21 beginning, if you would like to go and
22 speak to them about what happened.

23 And, for the other person who
24 spoke, I want to reiterate that any
25 racial slurs or any questions around

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

41

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

immigration status, those are items that one can go to the CCRB and file a complaint about. So it's not just physical misconduct, but also anything that has to do with any racial or immigration status comments, you can come to the CCRB and file a complaint.

So I would like to invite -- I think we're now ready for the public speaking.

What's the first name? Oh, they came in now. O.K. O.K.

So I apologize. Jelani Anglin co-founder and community organizer for Good Call.

MR. ANGLIN: Like the young men who spoke earlier, I'm not very good at public speaking either. I have some talking point here, but I'll try to make it brief because this comes from the heart.

Many times the police that are policing our communities would be afraid to even encounter some of the people that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

they're actually policing every day in their communities. It is sickening, it is disheartening to see that people of color are being killed on camera with the body cams, and that's supposed to be the new thing to implement that's going to save our lives.

And then there's a question of why folks don't report it, why is there no trust, because the actions that have been taken don't prove to be working and now there's just a montage of murders. We get to see it now. That's not good.

Our communities feel that they are at war with the police. Many times it's because there is no form of recourse. You don't have a way to complain. I heard it said tonight that, you know, police speaking to you in foul language and things like that can be reported to CCRB. I'll tell you as a young black man who grew up in New York City, I believe that's just the way police talk. I don't understand if this

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

organization is supposed to be a bipartisan organization, why is there no support for folks that are murdered by police? Why is there no shaming of the police when these things are done? This cannot be something of where you stand idly by and say nothing.

I am a person that does come with solutions, so I'm not just here speaking. I believe that there are things that you guys can do to actually move forward and really show the folks that you care, and that is more aggressive outreach strategies. This is great. This is amazing. But, I don't know if you guys are going out to the NYCHAs and doing this.

You have to make yourselves accessible to the folks that are actually dealing with these issues because they are already afraid. Sit in their lobby, just like the police do; sit in central booking just like ICE does. Be there where they're dealing with these police

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

officers so that they're are able to actually speak about it. The CJA doesn't report when you walk through the whole system. I'm not sure if there's something there that says hey, would you like to report your police interaction, or even when you meet with your public defender, can you report your police interaction? That should be a streamlined way that many times you have a way to report your interaction when you went through this process.

There also needs to be a different -- an amount of varieties to complain. The complaint process is daunting. You can't have somebody get abused by police and then send a letter and tell them that it's been unfounded. How do you feel? My ass-whooping was unfounded? People experience that, and it's not right.

There needs to be more transparency in this process when you file a complaint. There's more

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

45

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

transparency complaining in a dispute with PayPal than there is with the CCRB. Let me know what's happening. Don't send me back a letter and tell me it's unfounded. Who did you talk to? What information did you find?

Lastly, I just want to say that as an organization that is supposed to stand in the middle of police and the community and show that you guys are bipartisan, there are many youth that have had stories just like Tatyana that don't come to talk to you. I myself was arrested and went through some crazy stuff that I didn't speak to anybody about.

You need to go find these folks. Go to the schools. Just like how when I was younger, I was taught about stranger danger, we actually need to start having people going to schools and say, hey, if the police get out of line, we are who you call and this is what you do, because they have become predators in our

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

46

1 Proceedings

2 communities also.

3 I just honestly want to thank
4 everybody here, and if folks don't know
5 what I do, I am Jelani Anglin and I'm the
6 co-founder of Good Call. Good Call is a
7 completely free hot line in case of
8 arrest. God forbid, anyone gets
9 arrested, 24 hours a day, seven days a
10 week, you can call our hot line at 8
11 triple 3 good call, and that number here,
12 I had to ask my co-founder to write it
13 down, 833-346-6322. You can also find
14 out at goodcall.nyc. We will connect you
15 with a lawyer on the spot. We have a
16 hold time of under a minute.

17 The first person you speak to
18 you call our hot line is a lawyer. A
19 lawyer will invoke your rights and tell
20 the police not to question you until a
21 lawyer is present. It's -- it needs to
22 be a rap that they are not allowing folks
23 to see a lawyer or even talk to a lawyer.
24 You shouldn't speak to the police; you
25 need to speak to a lawyer first, and we

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

47

1 Proceedings

2 should make sure that that message is
3 spread within our communities and
4 nationally, and we're trying to do that
5 here with Good Call. Thank you.

6 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
7 you very much.

8 (Applause)

9 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So I'd
10 like to respond to some of the questions
11 that were actually very important
12 questions.

13 First, the recommendations, I
14 think, we are excellent that Jelani
15 shared and I hope that -- I know that our
16 community outreach group took note.

17 With regard to the information
18 after a case has been investigated, which
19 is fully investigated and evidence is
20 collected, when the complainant receives
21 the information, whether an allegation
22 has been substantiated or not, we are
23 bound by 50-a in terms -- with regards to
24 confidentiality, which is why the letter
25 itself may not have as much detail as you

1 Proceedings

2 would -- as one would like, and that is
3 one of the things that we are constrained
4 by. But, we do take very, very seriously
5 every allegation and it gets investigated
6 thoroughly.

7 And the one thing that I can say
8 in the experience that we have is that if
9 there is videotape, if there's recording,
10 it makes it clearly much easier to be
11 able to substantiate a claim, because
12 evidence is very important.

13 But thank you again for sharing
14 what you said before.

15 I would like to now --

16 MR. DARCHE: Can I just say
17 something?

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Oh, of
19 course, please. And if there's anyone
20 else from the board that also would like
21 to speak.

22 MR. DARCHE: I would just like
23 to ask the members of that Outreach team
24 to stand up because we do have a very
25 active program going into the schools to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

49

1 Proceedings

2 try and teach students not only what
3 their rights are but how to reach out to
4 us if they have issues with the police.
5 And so if any of you would like to talk
6 to one of our outreach people and try and
7 set something up for one of your schools,
8 they'll be happy to talk to you after the
9 meeting.

10 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
11 you.

12 Is there anyone else from the
13 board that would like to make a comment?

14 Yes.

15 MR. DAVIE: So I'd just like to
16 say that even though we are constrained
17 by 50-a, which is a regulation that
18 currently prohibits what can be said
19 about a member of service as it relates
20 to a CCRB complaint and its resolution,
21 that level of constraint has not always
22 been there, and there's been a recent
23 reinterpretation of that. And so, there
24 are efforts afoot now to address that so
25 that we are able to talk more in depth

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

50

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

about the actions of members of service in the resolution of complaints that have been registered against them.

It's my personal belief that people who enter into public service and are paid for by taxpayer dollars have a special responsibility to be accountable to the public, and that includes as much transparency about the activities that we take as public service -- as public servants as possible.

So, it is at least my hope that at some point we'll be able to provide more information about the resolution of these cases so that you have more confidence that this city and this board both are doing the best that they can possibly do to hold all public officials accountable, but particularly members of the NYPD, for the work that they do on our behalf. Thank you.

ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

(Applause)

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

51

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Anyone
3 else from the board?

4 O.K. So now we open our public
5 comments session. Each person -- now
6 we're still in the community leader
7 session.

8 O.K. Niko Williams, Youth
9 Leader from the Bronx High School.

10 MR. WILLIAMS: Hello. My name
11 is Niko Williams, and I was invited to
12 answer a couple of questions. And one
13 thing I answered was the NYPD plan just
14 to roll body-worn cameras to five
15 thousand patrol officers by the end of
16 2018. What issues or challenges if any,
17 do you anticipate arising from your
18 community with regard to body-worn
19 cameras?

20 If you look at it, you don't
21 know if the body-worn cameras will have
22 audio, so police officers can also say
23 that something was said to antagonize
24 what was going on or why they acted the
25 way they did. They can say someone said

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

52

1 Proceedings

2 I'm going to do this to you as a threat,
3 that's why they felt threatened. But I
4 feel even though police officers have the
5 body camera, that doesn't stop them from
6 doing anything. That doesn't stop them
7 from going like this with their jacket or
8 covering it up or saying, oh, something
9 happened to the camera while we were in
10 pursuit or something like that. It
11 doesn't stop bad action from the police
12 officers.

13 What do you consider a major
14 concern about police action in your
15 respective precincts? And I would say
16 abuse of authority. I have went through
17 it, I have friends that went through it,
18 just being stopped because we're walking.

19 I've been told by a police
20 officer to not wear my hat backwards, not
21 to wear my hoody up, because you would be
22 thought to be seen as a thug. But why
23 is -- I like to wear my hat backward,
24 that's my style. Everybody has their own
25 style, why should that be seen as being a

1 Proceedings

2 thug versus a kid just walking down the
3 street? Just because I live here doesn't
4 mean I act the way you would perceive
5 everybody there acts.

6 So agreeing with the kids that
7 spoke earlier, just because you're a
8 minority, you live, quote, unquote, in a
9 hood, yes, the crime rate is high, but
10 not everybody commits those crimes, so
11 not everybody is guilty. So they should
12 be seen as not guilty and to be stopped
13 or questioned without reasonable doubt or
14 suspecting of committing a crime, that's
15 unacceptable, and I feel like that should
16 be taken care of at a whole.

17 (Applause)

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
19 you very much.

20 So if you could address the body
21 camera question.

22 MR. DARCHE: So the NYPD's
23 body-worn cameras do have audio
24 recording, and the way the body-worn
25 cameras are supposed to work is when

1 Proceedings

2 they're powered on, they're constantly
3 recording video for 30-second loops, and
4 then once the police officer activates
5 it, it then -- it goes back 30 seconds
6 and then continues to record.

7 So while you only have audio for
8 the time that it's been activated, the
9 video starts 30 seconds before. So if
10 the officers are using the body-worn
11 camera the way they're supposed to, then
12 you should have audio and video for the
13 entire encounter.

14 The department has -- is rolling
15 out the body-worn cameras now and is
16 working on changing the procedures to
17 make sure that officers are turning on
18 their cameras when they are leaving the
19 precinct, that they're not turning them
20 off at inopportune times. And, as an
21 agency, we are making sure that after
22 90 days, people are -- officers are being
23 held accountable for properly using the
24 body-worn camera. Once they've had it
25 for 90 days, they've had it long enough,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

55

1 Proceedings

2 they should know how to use it, we're
3 going to recommend that the department
4 take disciplinary action if they haven't
5 used it properly.

6 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Very
7 good. Thank you.

8 Mabre?

9 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: So thank you
10 so much for that.

11 I think that if officers use it
12 appropriately, that's a huge if. I just
13 want to say that most of the footage that
14 we see is not actually from police
15 cameras. It's from folks like you who
16 record police officers, and there's a
17 long history in movements for liberation
18 for accountability in which people record
19 officers and those interactions and hold
20 them accountable in that way.

21 And so, I would just encourage
22 everyone, and that if you see an
23 interaction that you think is
24 problematic, to take out your phone and
25 record that and that you're protected by

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

56

1 Proceedings

2 the law to do that. And so, I would just
3 encourage folks to do that and submit
4 that as part of the evidence.

5 And I think you're right to be
6 suspicious of the body camera footage
7 that's being rolled out, and the policy.
8 Often it's not transparent. Who has
9 access to it is questionable and how
10 officers use it is questionable. So
11 thank you so much for that, and again, we
12 all have cell phones for the most part
13 now. I think that's one of the most
14 powerful tools that we have in holding
15 police accountable both through this
16 board but also through your own action
17 and you have the legal right to do that.
18 So keep doing it.

19 (Applause)

20 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
21 you, Mabre.

22 I would like to invite Kenneth
23 Brown, District Manager of Community
24 Board 5.

25 MR. BROWN: Thank you. Thank

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

57

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

you very much. My name's Ken Brown. I'm the District Manager for Bronx Community Board 5, which is where we're located right now.

One of the functions of the community board is to hold a precinct council meeting. Every month there's a meeting of a committee of the Community Board to act as a community and the 46th precinct liaison. Representatives from the precinct arrive. The meeting is chaired by civilians that are related to the Community Board, and it is an opportunity for residents of the community to actually interact with the administration of the precinct, and the inspector in charge of the precinct or his deputy attends these meetings. These are held once a month. The next one will be November 21st at 7:00 at Creston Avenue Baptist Church, which is 114 East 188 Street. And this is an opportunity to have a direct dialogue with the senior administration of our local precinct, the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

46th.

The two subjects that I chose to speak about tonight are the NCO Program, which is a relatively new program throughout the city, and at our precinct we're one of the first in the city to get it. And the concerns that we have about the neighborhood NCO Program is that we feel that there's inadequate outreach, that there's inadequate opportunities for NCO officers to make themselves present to stakeholders in the community, the residents in the community. So, we feel that the outreach and explaining what they do is not sufficiently robust.

As a part of that, it seems to me that the NCO Program also goes back to, I think, an old -- relatively old problem in community policing, which is, where do you blur the line between law enforcement and police activities and doing community social. Work, you know, and there's a question about whether NCO at its heart might be a distraction from

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

59

1 Proceedings

2 law enforcement and take away from what
3 communities should be doing. That's one
4 thing.

5 The other thing is in terms of
6 how we think police-community relations
7 can be better managed in our district is
8 at the precinct itself. At the 46th
9 Precinct, there's a long-standing concern
10 about the parking on the sidewalks. The
11 officers or people related to the
12 precinct, there seems to be a lot of
13 vehicles that are literally parked on the
14 sidewalks, and there are dedicated
15 parking lots that are built for the
16 precincts and my observation is those are
17 frequently not full. So that's something
18 that needs to be looked into.

19 And, lastly, there's a program,
20 and I'm not sure if this is NYPD or HPD,
21 that used to do Operation Clean Halls,
22 and there's a concern that apparently the
23 funding was withdrawn or the program is
24 dormant, and we found --

25 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: O.K.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

60

1 Proceedings

2 So on that, that was connected with Stop
3 and Frisk, and so the determination that
4 came out of the federal case on Stop and
5 Frisk also applied to Clean Halls.

6 MR. BROWN: So that is
7 terminated.

8 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I can't
9 say whether it's terminated or not, but
10 they have to follow the same rules that
11 came out of whatever restricts the Stop
12 and Frisk.

13 MR. BROWN: Ah, O.K. All right.
14 That was a concern. So thank you very
15 much for the opportunity.

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
17 you.

18 MR. BROWN: And, sorry, just so
19 you know the functions the community
20 board and district office is to help
21 residents, students with any concerns
22 they have with municipal agencies. Our
23 office is located at Gould Memorial
24 Library, Room 38.

25 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

61

1 Proceedings

2 you very much.

3 (Applause)

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
5 like to take a moment and invite any of
6 the representatives of the elected
7 officials' offices if they would like to
8 speak, limiting it to two minutes, before
9 we open it up to the public.

10 Okay, very well. Thank you.

11 I would like to invite Juan
12 Garcia up to speak. Thank you. And as a
13 reminder, we're limiting this portion to
14 two minutes.

15 MR. GARCIA: Thank you. Good
16 evening. My name is Juan Garcia. I'm
17 here representing --

18 MR. DARCHE: Use the mic.

19 MR. GARCIA: Is that better?

20 MR. DARCHE: Yes.

21 MR. GARCIA: O.K., wonderful. I
22 can hear me now.

23 All right. I represent the
24 Institute for Mediation and Conflict
25 Resolution. My name is Juan Garcia.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

62

1 Proceedings

2 Again, I am the Community Outreach
3 Coordinator there, and what we do is we
4 help the community with any dispute you
5 have, whether it be noise complaint with
6 a neighbor or anything like that. What
7 you could do is you could come to us and
8 you can bring your matter to us and we
9 will help you communicate it to whoever
10 it is that you have the matter with and
11 it helps alleviate the police, you know,
12 cases that they have to do, and the court
13 cases, and we are located on 149th Street
14 and Third Avenue.

15 You can contact us by phone at
16 718-585-1190, or you could look us up on
17 the web at imcr.org. Thank you.

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
19 you very much.

20 (Applause)

21 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I
22 would like to ask Christopher Paul
23 Sanchez. Christopher Paul
24 Sanchez?

25 O.K. I would like to invite,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

63

1 Proceedings

2 and I'm sorry, Hamzah Gumoneh.

3 O.K. Christian Phentermine
4 Nunez.

5 The interpreters, the team,
6 please come up. And he's going to speak
7 in Spanish, and if you could speak --
8 translate it into English, please. And
9 because we're going to be translating,
10 we're going to give you more than two
11 minutes. We will give you four minutes.

12 MR. NUNEZ: (In English) Thank you.

13 (Through the Translator) Good
14 evening. The reason why I'm here tonight
15 is I felt limited and impotent in a
16 situation that I had with a police
17 officer at the 40th Precinct in the
18 Bronx. I was driving my vehicle --

19 MR. DARCHE: If you have an
20 issue you want to share with the agency,
21 you really need to tell the investigator
22 instead of telling the public meeting.

23 (The Translator translates.)

24 MR. NUNEZ: O.K.

25 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: (Speaks

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

64

1 Proceedings

2 in Spanish.)

3 MR. NUNEZ: (Speaks in Spanish.)

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Muy
5 bien. Thank you.

6 I'd like to invite Evangeline
7 Williams.

8 MS. WILLIAMS: Good evening. My
9 name is Evangeline Williams. I am from
10 Sedgewick Houses.

11 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Good
12 evening.

13 MS. WILLIAMS: And I have
14 another question also. I've been living
15 in Sedgewick for about 30 years now, and
16 I'd liked to know, when the police are
17 called, why don't they come? And then
18 when they do come, they act as though
19 they're afraid of all the young men
20 there --

21 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So --

22 MS. WILLIAMS: -- whether
23 they're black, Hispanic, Latino, they're
24 more afraid coming in than the guys that
25 are there.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

65

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So we
3 can't speak for the NYPD.

4 MS. WILLIAMS: Right.

5 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Because
6 we don't represent the NYPD, but I saw
7 one of my board -- one of our board
8 members, it looks like he would like to
9 share something.

10 MR. EASON: Yes, ma'am. I would
11 like to think that that's not all of the
12 police officers, just a few, and if
13 that's the case, then a community affairs
14 officer or the precinct commanding
15 officer, and through all of these groups
16 that are represented here tonight, join
17 their voices and make sure that the PSA
18 that covers your area is aware of your
19 concern. That should not be.

20 MS. WILLIAMS: Well, we work
21 with them closely. I'm on the tenants
22 association there, the secretary. We
23 work with them closely. It's the same
24 thing, you know, it's like two people who
25 are there all the time and --

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

66

1 Proceedings

2 MR. EASON: So I strongly
3 suggest that -- I know the precincts --
4 there are sympathetic ears, if you get
5 one to listen, I'm sure that they will
6 come to your location. I'd like to think
7 that they all are not afraid to come to a
8 location if a call for service goes out.

9 So that should be dealt with
10 through the -- you know the precincts are
11 going to be held accountable.

12 MS. WILLIAMS: Exactly.

13 MR. EASON: So hold them
14 accountable, and it starts here tonight.

15 MS. WILLIAMS: O.K.

16 MR. DARCHE: What PSA is Sedgewick
17 Houses in?

18 MS. WILLIAMS: Excuse me?

19 MR. DARCHE: What PSA is
20 Sedgewick houses in?

21 MS. WILLIAMS: This is in --
22 Sedgewick is in four six.

23 MR. DARCHE: The four six. O.K.

24 (Audience cross-talk.)

25 MR. CARCATERRA: Can I ask you

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

67

1 Proceedings

2 one question?

3 MS. WILLIAMS: And when are they
4 going to be retrained, the officers?

5 MR. CARCATERRA: Let me ask you
6 one question first, because I just want
7 to couple up a couple of things.

8 Do you attend the Community
9 Board meetings?

10 MS. WILLIAMS: Yes, I do.

11 MR. CARCATERRA: You do.

12 And I have a question for the
13 gentleman in back. Mr. Garcia?

14 MR. GARCIA: Yes, sir.

15 MR. CARCATERRA: Do you attend
16 the Community Board meetings?

17 MR. GARCIA: I just started to.
18 Yes, I will be attending.

19 MR. CARCATERRA: O.K. And the
20 reason I just bring this up because there
21 are a bunch of groups that kind of are
22 operating in a vacuum, and as a former
23 precinct Commander, the Community Board
24 can do a lot to bridge the gap and bring
25 these complaints together, and especially

1 Proceedings

2 with the youth.

3 There's youth officers, it's a
4 nice environment, it's a good setting,
5 it's monthly. However you need to find
6 out when the Community Board meetings are
7 and to get there because there are all
8 the representatives from the precinct.
9 When I used to go, it was myself, my XO,
10 we had lieutenants, we had youth
11 officers, we had school officers, and
12 everybody left there with some kind of an
13 answer. Now, you didn't always like it,
14 but we got back to you if we didn't have
15 the right answer.

16 And I think it's important, and
17 especially what you just brought up,
18 'cause that is, as Lindsay said, I hope
19 that's a perception, more the exception
20 than the rule, and it is if and you're
21 seeing that that can be brought up in
22 that setting and that will be addressed
23 and followed up on. And then when you go
24 back the following month, you should
25 expect an answer and a response back of

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

69

1 Proceedings

2 what you've seen in that -- in the month
3 in between.

4 MS. WILLIAMS: O.K.

5 MR. CARCATERRA: So I just bring
6 it up, and, please, if you want to jump
7 in as the Community Board, 'cause it
8 really is, that is the quarterback here
9 that could pull all this stuff together.

10 MR. BROWN: (Off microphone)
11 Thank you very much. I just want to say
12 I'm the district manager. So if anyone
13 has any concerns about the Community
14 Board (inaudible), I'm going to move
15 right back there. I'd like to
16 (inaudible) now.

17 MR. EASON: Before you leave the
18 podium, you asked a question about
19 training?

20 MS. WILLIAM: Yes.

21 MR. EASON: I spent a great deal
22 of my career in the Police Academy, and I
23 can tell you that training is ongoing,
24 constantly, and there is an
25 opportunity -- I don't know, maybe my

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

70

1 Proceedings

2 colleague may know -- the Citizen's
3 Police Academy that you should look into.
4 So --

5 (Inaudible audience
6 participation.)

7 MR. EASON: The Citizen's Police
8 Academy. It would give you an inside
9 view -- more of an inside view into the
10 police department that is there to serve
11 you and all of us here.

12 MS. WILLIAMS: O.K., Thank you.

13 MR. EASON: Thank you for coming
14 up.

15 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
16 you.

17 (Applause)

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
19 like to invite, and I apologize, because
20 I can't read the handwriting, Arrington.
21 Robert Arrington.

22 MR. ACOSTA: Acosta?

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Yes,
24 Acosta.

25 MR. ACOSTA: Acosta, Jr.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

71

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Oh,
3 Acosta, Jr. That one I should be able to
4 read.

5 MR. ACOSTA: Good Evening,
6 ladies and gentlemen. The reason why I
7 am -- I want to come and speak to you,
8 because there was a speaker who spoke
9 about the schooling issues that was going
10 on in the Bronx and all, and he was -- I
11 think he was wearing a jacket and all he
12 was speaking about the schooling issue
13 with the police and how they are doing
14 stuff based on stereotype.

15 I also want to say this from a
16 different perspective, that of a quota,
17 because I've noticed that in the many
18 decades going back since Giuliani and
19 Bloomberg became mayors, the police were
20 doing things based on a quota, and they
21 were collecting information for tickets.
22 And they're not just doing that for
23 people but they're doing it on
24 commercial.

25 And I also say this because it

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

72

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

is a frustrating thing with the politicians, it's a frustrating thing with the landlords, it's a frustrating things with NYCHA and it's a frustrating thing with the Community Board. Thank God you are one of the few people that I could speak to about this.

I have family that lives in a different part of the Bronx, I'm not going to get too deep into this, but there's a thing with broken pavement in which the floors are cracked. If a police officer sees that, they're going to -- they're going to just think that the worst of the worst. And in my case, I live in a private building. I live in the Nelson section, and I live in one of the oldest buildings in the area. It's managed by a group of people that are in the Flushing, Kew Gardens section of Queens, New York, and they own property in the Bronx. It is the worst building in our jurisdiction. That is where the police, the stopping programs, that's

1 Proceedings

2 where we got screwed up, because there
3 was there was a lot of people doing
4 unsanitary things.

5 I had to call the Department of
6 Human Rights Commission of the New York
7 State to look over that. I didn't
8 even know -- I just found out now that
9 that was part of the decision, the
10 federal jurisdiction decision. So that's
11 why it's frustrating because the
12 landlords and the corporate businesses,
13 they have a strong hold on this, and the
14 quotas, they're killing -- they're just,
15 they just, it's a problem, and I would
16 know. Thank you.

17 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
18 you. Thank you.

19 (Applause)

20 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
21 like to invite Brian Bramble. Brian
22 Bramble?

23 MR. BRAMBLE: Good night,
24 everyone. I'm glad to be here.

25 I just want to find out what are

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

74

1 Proceedings

2 the specific things that I could speak
3 on? Because I know you had an issue with
4 going off topic. What can I specifically
5 speak on? What are you guys handling
6 tonight?

7 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Well,
8 because this is a board meeting of the
9 CCRB --

10 MR. BRAMBLE: Yes.

11 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: -- so
12 this is the Civilian Complaint Review
13 Board.

14 MR. BRAMBLE: Mm-hmm.

15 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So
16 anything related to the CCRB, our
17 jurisdiction, police --

18 MR. BRAMBLE: Excessive force?

19 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Exces-
20 sive -- absolutely. Any of the items
21 around police misconduct.

22 MR. BRAMBLE: O.K.

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: If you
24 would like to speak about that generally.

25 MR. BRAMBLE: Yes.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

75

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: We
3 invite you to speak about that.

4 MR. BRAMBLE: O.K. I'll try to
5 keep it general, because it applies to my
6 own life, so --

7 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: The
8 only reason I say that is because if it
9 was something personal, specific, we
10 would invite you to speak to the
11 investigator for your only
12 confidentiality purposes.

13 MR. BRAMBLE: I'd rather not. I
14 have nothing to hide.

15 And that's my issue here today,
16 I would like to be truthful and open.

17 I was a victim of a false
18 arrest, and I'm being accused of
19 assaulting an elderly white woman right
20 by the Mayor's office, right where the
21 dancers dance. You can normally go
22 there. There's like the Brooklyn Bridge
23 there, 1 Police Plaza is there. They're
24 saying that I punched a woman in her arm
25 and they arrested me for it. But there's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

cameras everywhere. There's Argus cameras everywhere. Those are the NYPD counterterrorism cameras, so much technologies, 360 degree views; it can zoom in a mile and catch a license plate, things of that nature. So I was more than confident to be released from the detention at that time.

But after 30 minutes of waiting, I guess after they told me they would watch the tapes, I was arrested. When I got to the precinct, I was cuffed. Of course I can't really walk too well. They didn't like that I was trying to stand up for my rights. I told them that I actually taped the exchange between us, me and the cops.

I had a lot of like things to tell them, but they wasn't trying to hear me. I was like pushed to the ground. My head hit the floor. I have handcuffs on so I can't protect myself. It's just a really big ordeal, that the judge did not issue an order of protection. I don't

1 Proceedings

2 know why.

3 The cameras, the NYPD is saying
4 that they deleted the tape. I didn't
5 even go to trial yet. So I don't
6 understand why they would delete the
7 videotape from cameras that are meant to
8 protect New York City and its citizens.

9 This is messing up my life. I
10 have a lot of mental and health
11 difficulties now because this is all that
12 I have to deal with. And this is about
13 the twelfth time that I've been arrested
14 falsely since 2014. So in four years,
15 I've been arrested twelve times, and I'm
16 innocent, and I can't prove it because
17 the cases are still ongoing.

18 But these are just my issues,
19 specifically, the camera and what it's
20 meant to do in New York City and how the
21 police go about preserving evidence for
22 the guilty and for the innocent, because
23 it seems as if they only prosecute the
24 guilty and they have no regard to
25 presenting evidence for the innocent.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

78

1 Proceedings

2 Thank you.

3 (Applause)

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
5 you.

6 You brought up multiple points,
7 and I hope that you're sharing that with
8 your defense attorney in this particular
9 case.

10 MR. BRAMBLE: (Inaudible off
11 microphone comments.)

12 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: O.K.
13 Very good. Thank you.

14 I would like to invite Elizabeth
15 Padilla.

16 MR. BRAMBLE: I'm sorry. Are
17 you going to speak on anything I brought
18 up (inaudible)?

19 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So with
20 regard to the video that the police may
21 be recording on the street, I can't speak
22 on that, and I don't know if anyone on
23 the board could speak to that?

24 MR. DARCHE: But I think it's
25 important not to discuss the individual

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

79

1 Proceedings

2 cases, and if you want to speak with an
3 investigator, we have investigators here,
4 but we can't discuss your individual case
5 in the public session.

6 MR. BRAMBLE: (Inaudible).

7 MR. DARCHE: Yeah, they're in
8 the back. So as soon as they're done
9 they'll speak with you.

10 MR. SIEGAL: I think it's just
11 important to add that when complaints are
12 filed, the CCRB investigators go out and
13 look for video from whatever sources
14 there are surrounding the location of the
15 incident.

16 Many of the cases that we review
17 have video not just taken by bystanders
18 but from stores or commercial facilities
19 or security cameras in apartment houses
20 and whatnot. So they're very thorough
21 about trying to find that.

22 That doesn't speak to your
23 situation, but in general, a lot of the
24 cases we see have video that doesn't come
25 from either the person who was arrested

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

80

1 Proceedings

2 or from the police but from a third
3 source that just happens to be there.

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
5 you.

6 MR. EASON: Brian, have you --
7 in any of the encounters, the twelve
8 encounters that you spoke of, have you
9 filed a CCRB complaint in any of those
10 cases?

11 MR. BRAMBLE: (Inaudible off
12 microphone comments.)

13 MR. EASON: O.K., thank you,
14 Brian.

15 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
16 you.

17 MS. PADILLA: Good evening. My
18 name is Elizabeth Padilla, and I reside
19 in the Northern Bronx in the 52nd
20 precinct area. I have been living in the
21 community for over 20 years, and I am
22 here today to voice my concerns in the
23 lack of urgency placed on certain crimes
24 committed in our neighborhoods. I think
25 it's important for me to tell this

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

81

1 Proceedings

2 unfortunate occurrence so that we can stay
3 aware of our surroundings at all times
4 and take nothing for granted.

5 This past Sunday, November 5th,
6 at approximately 8:00 a.m., I was
7 enjoying my morning jog at Jerome Park
8 Reservoir. As I passed the Bronx High
9 School of Science, a man stopped directly
10 in front of me and would not let me pass
11 him. He proceeded to take out his penis
12 and expose himself with the most horrific
13 grin I have ever encountered. I was
14 scared, angry, and determined to take his
15 picture.

16 When he saw that I took out my
17 phone to take his picture, he proceeded
18 to run away in the opposite direction.
19 Foolishly, I took off after him. I was
20 able to retrieve his wallet and his cell
21 phone. However, he got away.

22 By the time I realized what
23 happened and what I had done, I became
24 hysterical. A man stopped in his car to
25 help me. Thank you, stranger, whoever

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

82

1 Proceedings

2 you are and wherever you are today to
3 take the time out to help me.

4 As we were talking to 911, a
5 patrol car pulled up behind us, and I
6 proceeded to explain what happened. The
7 officers were from the 52nd Precinct.
8 They were very professional and did their
9 job. We drove around to see if we saw
10 the suspect to no avail. They took me
11 home and I was grateful for their
12 assistance and their words of advice.

13 But this is not where this ends.
14 On Monday morning I received a call from
15 the sergeant on duty from the 52 Precinct
16 to inform me that my case would be
17 transferred to the 50th Precinct, that
18 someone would be calling me. No problem,
19 I will take that call because I want this
20 man caught.

21 What I'm not fine with is the
22 slow attention of informing the community
23 that there is a perverted degenerate
24 exposing himself to women joggers and
25 anyone else he chooses to victimize.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

83

1 Proceedings

2 This is happening in an area surrounded
3 by campuses, clearly there should be some
4 sense of urgency in this matter.

5 I took the time out to review
6 CompStat. I don't know if people here
7 know what CompStat is, but I also think
8 we should be informing ourselves in the
9 community about what CompStat is. I
10 discovered that citywide misdemeanor sex
11 crimes have increased from the last year
12 this time period from 71 cases to 90
13 cases, and you can check that. I checked
14 my facts before I stand here today. As
15 it relates to the 50th Precinct, since
16 July 2017, there has been three separate
17 incidents in the vicinity of Jerome Park,
18 and today I stand before you as number
19 four. And my community doesn't know.

20 I've been calling the 50th
21 Precinct since Monday afternoon to obtain
22 a complaint number only to be hung up on
23 by an automated system that says the
24 person I'm trying to reach is not
25 available, to call back later. This is

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

84

1 Proceedings

2 my 50th Precinct.

3 It's counterproductive and not
4 helpful to the community when you can't
5 speak to anyone when you want a simple
6 complaint number so that you can pursue
7 someone who's making our life difficult
8 in such a beautiful park and reservoir
9 that we enjoy running, jogging, walking
10 and being with our families on a daily
11 basis. There has to be a better system
12 for citizens to obtain their complaint
13 numbers, perhaps an online procedure,
14 something.

15 I'm using this forum today to
16 express to our Bronx community the
17 importance of crime to our police
18 precincts and not to minimize any crime.
19 We are a strong courageous and resilient
20 community that deserves and expects
21 better from our police department to be
22 responsive and to help support the
23 community because over 20 years I've been
24 running and nothing has ever occurred,
25 and when you look at the stats, the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

85

1 Proceedings

2 stats say different.

3 So I challenge the community, I
4 challenge everyone here in this room to
5 stay on your precinct. Don't let these
6 little things go away, because these
7 little things that we tend to ignore get
8 bigger. This person that's doing this in
9 my neighborhood, I am sure that he has
10 done it more than three or four times.
11 And if you're a mother walking with a
12 child, and you are undocumented, you may
13 not say anything because you're afraid
14 to. So please think about those things
15 and report them anyway. Report them so
16 you don't feel like I feel when I walked
17 down the park today. Thank you.

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
19 you very much.

20 (Applause)

21 MR. DARCHE: Ms. Padilla? Ms.
22 Padilla?

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Ms.
24 Padilla.

25 MR. DARCHE: If you could give

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

86

1 Proceedings

2 your contact information to one of the
3 Outreach people and we'll reach out to
4 the precinct commander and make sure that
5 someone follows up with you.

6 MS. PADILLA: Thank you.

7 (Inaudible off microphone
8 audience comments.)

9 MR. DARCHE: So if -- are we
10 done with our list of people to --

11 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: No. We
12 have one more. We have one more. A
13 Keith James -- James Keith.

14 MR. DARCHE: And if there are
15 any other people who would like to speak,
16 if you could line up down over here...
17 Thank you, ma'am.

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: And
19 Crayton Davis.

20 So were you able to help, to
21 help her?

22 MR. KEITH: We're waiting?

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Yes, go
24 ahead. What is your name, please?

25 MR. KEITH: It's James Felton

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

87

1 Proceedings

2 Keith.

3 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: O.K.

4 MR. KEITH: Yeah. So I just
5 have a couple of questions and points.

6 Part of the presentation given
7 earlier, it looks like the more -- the
8 more complaints filed, the lower violent
9 crimes, I think per the investigator, the
10 woman that spoke earlier, and as I'm
11 sitting here in the front, I'm seeing a
12 common thread of people talking about the
13 data that's collected and the way that
14 they are allowed to or the processes that
15 are built for them to engage the
16 precincts. And so, I just have a few
17 questions along those lines with regards
18 to data.

19 So per the DTI, the Data
20 Transparency Initiative, how much of that
21 data is available on the nyc.gov/dti
22 website that's available for citizens to
23 manipulate? I think it's important
24 especially in this day and age,
25 especially here with all these students

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

available, I'm sure there are a more than a few software developers, et cetera, who'd like to access that information and play on it. So I think that's number one. And, if the data is only readable on this site, I'd like to know how we can work with the CCRB to make that data available to be manipulated.

Second, I'd like to know, in the Citizens Policing Academy, I know that the citizens go through something similar to what the police go through, but also is it possible for the CCRB to work with the community to implement a piece of the program that gets into data management and data analytics. And what I'm really getting at here is the more information we collect on police-civilian interaction, I think the better off that will be, not only from just a generally transparency standpoint but also how we use that to go become about organizing the precincts.

And last but not least, and this

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

is not really a data issue, I'd like to say transparency isn't just about data. When I think about the last two stories that came up, it seems as though the community needs an opportunity to share their stories in a public forum, even if their names, et cetera, are anonymized [sic], because it's just a healing process. I think the majority of people who came up here today want to tell a very personal story, and I know that the CCRB isn't charged with hearing that personal story, that's what the investigators are for. But I think it also should be recommended to the CCRB that we have a reoccurring forum in the same fashion that a CCRB meets for people to tell their stories in the communities so that we hear ones, especially like the last two that were given up here. I think that should be a priority just from a community engagement standpoint. And that's all.

ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

90

1 Proceedings

2 you.

3 (Applause)

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
5 like the policy person to answer the tech
6 questions, or you can answer it?

7 So I'd like to ask our executive
8 stiff director to answer your
9 technology-related questions.

10 But before we go into that,
11 absolutely, we want to hear from the
12 community on more creative ways to
13 engage, so thank you for sharing at last
14 piece.

15 MR. DARCHE: So with regard to
16 downloading the data, you people can
17 download the data and manipulate it on
18 their own. Some of the data that we put
19 up and some of the, for lack of a better
20 terms, the slides are static. So -- but
21 a lot of the data can be downloaded, and
22 I think that the crime data that we got
23 might be the comparison of the complaints
24 that we've always had up, but I don't
25 know that the crime data slide has gotten

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

91

1 Proceedings

2 up on the DTI 'cause that's new data that
3 we have.

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Very
5 good. Thank you.

6 I'd like the next speaker to
7 come up. And please just state your
8 name.

9 MR. D'AMBROSIO: Good evening.
10 My name is Anthony D'Ambrosio. I'm a law
11 abiding citizen with no criminal history.

12 First of all, I'd like to say
13 that I am not anti police. I am anti
14 police abuse. The police have a
15 difficult job but make it even more
16 difficult when they do things they
17 shouldn't be doing. The police take an
18 oath to serve and protect, not to abuse
19 and harass.

20 I have had a problem with the
21 police for 20 years, and Frank, the
22 investigator, directed me to Internal
23 Affairs. Thanks, Frank.

24 My suggestion is when the police
25 are sued, the settlement comes out of

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

92

1 Proceedings

2 their police benefits instead of the
3 taxpayers having to foot the bill. If
4 that happens, then we just might see the
5 police clean up their act.

6 That's all I have to say. Thank
7 you very much.

8 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
9 you.

10 (Applause)

11 MR. CARTAGENA: Hello. My
12 name is Salvatore Cartagena, and I
13 have a question for the board, and
14 the question that I have --

15 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I'm
16 sorry. If I could ask you to just pull
17 the mic. Thank you.

18 MR. CARTAGENA: My name is
19 Salvadore Cartagena, and I have a
20 question for the board.

21 And I could see where the young
22 youth are having a problem with the
23 police officer and even the board. How
24 is this board -- does this board have to
25 explain how they vote? Do the people

1 Proceedings

2 know if you're saying undisputed all the
3 time that it's on circumstances? Like a
4 politician, we see his record on how he
5 votes. Do we see your record on how you
6 vote?

7 Because if the same person is
8 saying, oh, no, this is unfounded, this
9 is unfounded, this is unfounded every
10 single time, how is the community going
11 to be able to come to you when they know
12 what you just said, we're not allowed to
13 say certain things because -- I think it
14 was number 50 something, 50 you said,
15 you're not -- how is the community
16 supposed to feel when the same police
17 department is being sent for the same
18 things, complaints, and they coming out
19 unfounded all the time?

20 If your -- mother said to you,
21 or -- I'm a father, Yo, I smell marijuana
22 in the room. Oh, I didn't see it. I
23 didn't -- I smell marijuana tomorrow. I
24 didn't see it. I smell marijuana
25 tomorrow. And, you know, come on. This

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

94

1 Proceedings

2 has got to be a blind eye.

3 If something comes up 50 times
4 and you say there's something there.

5 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: You got it.

6 MR. CARTAGENA: This is what
7 everybody -- this is why these youth
8 don't have no respect for the police
9 officers any more, and it's a shame
10 because the police have to do a tough
11 job. But if you got no respect, it's
12 even tougher for you guys and if you guys
13 are doing the wrong things, just like
14 when I was a Marine, we did the wrong
15 things, you got punished and that's it.
16 And if you guys can't do that, you need
17 to put the community people in charge and
18 get the people out of there and put
19 community people, then they decide if the
20 person did what can they did or didn't
21 do. Not you decide --

22 (Applause)

23 MR. CARTAGENA: -- because you
24 got -- you got political things involved
25 with you and you might lose your job.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

95

1 Proceedings

2 That's not what it is. You're supposed
3 to serve the community, then let the
4 community decide on the complaints, not
5 you guys.

6 (Applause.)

7 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
8 you very much.

9 Does anyone on the board want to
10 comment?

11 So we hear your frustration,
12 absolutely, and that the restriction
13 didn't -- came after many years of
14 discussion and votes on it. It's a City
15 Council decision as well. I'm not trying
16 to pass the buck here.

17 There are -- there are certain
18 reasons as well in terms of
19 confidentiality.

20 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So I
21 absolutely --

22 MR. CARTAGENA: When you go
23 to the Bronx courthouse, they got
24 the jury what decides.

25 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Ab-

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

96

1 Proceedings

2 solutely.

3 MR. CARTAGENA: (Inaudible)
4 to take the advice (inaudible).

5 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Ab-
6 solutely. So we could not agree
7 with you more in terms of the need
8 for the board members of the CCRB
9 to actually be coming from the
10 community, and I think that many
11 of the members that are on the
12 board here actually do indeed come
13 from the community. I think that
14 this is the first time in history
15 that we have at least three people
16 on the board that actually work
17 for or lead community-based
18 organizations, including myself,
19 including Senor Peguero and
20 including Mabre. We three work in
21 organizations that are dedicated
22 to the pursuit of civil rights and
23 human rights, and we actually --
24 so, I mean -- so I agree with you
25 on that, and I think there's

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

97

1 Proceedings

2 better representation.

3 Excuse me?

4 MR. CARTAGENA: There's five
5 lawyers on the panel, three or four
6 police officers. There's not a guy from
7 the store. There's not a guy from the
8 supermarket. There's not a guy from
9 here. That's what I'm saying. You guys
10 live in a different world from us.

11 MR. DAVIE: Angela? Angela?

12 MR. CARTAGENA: I mean, we don't
13 live in the same world. It's a different
14 world.

15 MR. DAVIE: I would just say
16 that I don't spend all my days in a
17 necktie and a suit, but --

18 MR. CARTAGENA: But you don't go
19 (inaudible).

20 MR. DAVIE: Well --

21 MR. CARTAGENA: (Inaudible)
22 police officers. They get stopped all
23 the time because (inaudible).

24 MR. DAVIE: Sir, I get stopped
25 by police officers. I get pulled over.

1 Proceedings

2 I get stopped, I've had cops turn around
3 on me and pull me over when I'm driving.
4 I've come through Harlem and been pulled
5 over and told that my front headlight was
6 out when it wasn't.

7 So I know the experience, and
8 I'm here to try to bridge this gap
9 between the police and the community
10 because I don't think it does anybody any
11 good to have this kind of hostility and
12 misunderstanding that seems to
13 characterize this relationship in too
14 many communities. So I know it. I know
15 it well. And I'm trying to do what I can
16 to help address it. Because not all
17 police officers --

18 MR. CARTAGENA: I didn't say
19 nothing about police officers
20 (inaudible).

21 MR. DAVIE: But let me finish.
22 I listened to you.

23 I don't think all police
24 officers are bad, and I clearly don't
25 think all people who get pulled over

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

99

1 Proceedings

2 necessarily have done anything wrong, but
3 we can't continue as a society to have
4 this kind of animosity between these two
5 communities, and I'm committed, because I
6 think we need police, to try to make sure
7 that we improve these relations.

8 So you have people on this board
9 who know what this experience is like,
10 and I -- you know, I just know what it
11 is, and I'm gonna bring -- I bring that
12 experience to bear every time I get into
13 that conversation, a negotiation with my
14 colleagues on this board about how we
15 adjudicate an allegation against a member
16 of service.

17 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
18 you.

19 MR. CARTAGENA: Do we know
20 how you vote, every single one of
21 you? Is there a record?

22 MR. DAVIE: The challenge we
23 have with that is, I mean, you have --
24 think about where you work. Not all
25 allegations are sustained, not all

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

100

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

allegations are real, not all allegations are valid, and if we -- if we opened up every decision, every conversation that we had, then people get unfairly tainted, both the complainant and the police officer. So we have to recognize this as a personnel issue.

This is an agency where people are employed, and with that certain rules and regulations apply, and I wouldn't want those removed from my job. I don't think you want to remove them from yours.

But that said, we do need to be as transparent as the law allows, and where the law is too restrictive like I think 50-a is, we need to address it, so that you know what public servants are doing and how they are disciplined should they be found guilty of some charge. And I hope that we can get the state legislature to do what it needs to do so that we can go back to reporting more details about how these issues are settled, particularly for those people

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

101

1 Proceedings

2 who are found in violation of the
3 regulations.

4 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: Sir, you used
5 the word "hope" and "try." We as adults,
6 we all know what two those words mean.
7 They're not definites.

8 MR. DAVEY: Nothing's definite,
9 and if we don't stay in this game and
10 work as hard as we can to have as much
11 accountability as we can, then we'll all
12 be at each other's necks, and the idea
13 here is to create a community where
14 everybody can live with as little
15 frustration and difficulty and harassment
16 as possible. That's what I'm committed
17 to do by being on this board and by the
18 other things I do here in New York City
19 as an African-American man who's
20 experienced lots of discrimination in my
21 life.

22 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
23 you.

24 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: I just want
25 to --

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

102

1 Proceedings

2 (Applause)

3 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Go
4 ahead, Mabre.

5 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: So I want to
6 quickly honor what was said, that lots of
7 us have experiences that you may not
8 assume by looking at us, that come from
9 backgrounds and that have been influenced
10 by police and police brutality, but I
11 also want to honor the fact that no one
12 on this board has been incarcerated,
13 right, and so it is definitely true that
14 there's --

15 MR. CARTAGENA: (Inaudible) But
16 I'm just saying (inaudible off
17 microphone.)

18 MR. SIEGAL: Let her finish.

19 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: No, no, but
20 what -- right. I mean, that's a
21 different topic and if you let me finish,
22 I will get to it.

23 But I think in terms of the
24 point of like who is actually
25 representing you on the board, that it's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

important to, A, not assume things about folks but also to honor the fact that there's some privilege that comes with that. And I think it's important for folks to push and say that those who are most impacted should be making decisions about accountability and that's essential. And so, I just want to honor that and also honor that we walk into this room with very different experiences that you may not assume about us.

And then in terms of the transparency, I absolutely would support and I want to say publicly I think that all voting records should be public even though there are state law limitations to that that I think we should vigorously fight against but absolutely agree that we should be held accountable to our positions especially when the outcome is that there is a guilty verdict or a decision that impact is sustained. So I want to say that as well.

ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

104

1 Proceedings

2 you very much.

3 So I'd like to invite our next
4 speaker, and if you could please state
5 your name.

6 MS. SANCHEZ: O.K. Miriam
7 Sanchez. I'm also one of the Council
8 Members and Vice President of Police
9 Service Area 8, and I'm also with the
10 Department of Youth and Communities. I
11 did eight years with them.

12 And I just want to say that out
13 of all these people how many people go to
14 the council meetings? Raise your hand.

15 O.K., not all, everybody, O.K.

16 I would suggest you go to the
17 council meetings and I would suggest that
18 you get more involved with your children,
19 too, because they're doing -- they may,
20 and I'm not saying every kid -- they may
21 be doing something outside. They act
22 different when they're outside.

23 But there's also a lot of
24 programs. There's programs for the
25 Citizens Police Academy. There's also

1 Proceedings

2 the mock jury that one of the judges
3 takes in and does in the schools.

4 There's also programs, I know there used
5 to be the DARE program, and we didn't see
6 it, and I know that the district
7 attorney's office still goes into the
8 schools and speaks to the schools, and
9 has these kids -- you know, teach them
10 what is right and what is wrong. What is
11 the name of that program that's lately?

12 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: Concept.

13 MS. SANCHEZ: No, it's not
14 Concept. Oh, yeah, yeah, yeah, yeah,
15 yeah. It is Concept. Sorry. Right.

16 It explains what happens when
17 you go through -- like the gang, you
18 know, the gangs go through their sides
19 and stuff like that.

20 And the bottom line is we don't
21 want our kids being taken by the streets
22 and that's what's happening a lot. And I
23 know this because my daughter has been
24 very involved in the schools. She's been
25 on the PTAs for forever, and it's like a

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

106

1 Proceedings

2 lot of these parents don't get involved
3 and go to school.

4 My grandson is gonna be 17 years
5 old on Tuesday and my daughter still
6 takes him to high school and picks him up
7 but you gotta stay on top of your kids
8 also, you know.

9 And if you get a chance to do
10 the mock jury in the district attorney's
11 office where they have that too, I would
12 advise you to go and do that because
13 you're deeply questioned on if you're
14 affiliated with police, whether it be
15 boyfriend, girlfriend, whatever. They
16 drill you and you're from the community
17 that's in that mock jury. I've done that
18 myself. So has the young lady and the
19 young man over there done it. It's
20 you're questioned and grilled, and you
21 get to critique the ADAs in the -- when
22 you go to that thing.

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Won-
24 derful. Thank you.

25 MS. SANCHEZ; O.K.?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

107

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
3 you very much.

4 (Applause.)

5 MS. SANCHEZ: Oh, one more
6 thing. I just want to say one
7 more thing. One more thing.

8 Look, when I was with the DYCD,
9 the Department of Youth Communities,
10 that's a big process. You have to do
11 surveys. You have to have a public
12 hearing. You have to do a lot of things.
13 I had to do a lot of surveys, and let me
14 tell you I'm the first person who brought
15 back the most, and you know why? Because
16 to the non profits in my area, they
17 wanted to cut all the funding, O.K.?

18 What happened was I sacrificed a
19 whole summer and one of the places where
20 I went was my Community Board meeting,
21 the general meeting. I gave out 50
22 surveys, and I got 48 back. You know
23 why? Because every time there's a
24 shooting in my community, or a homicide,
25 we march. The children march, and they

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

108

1 Proceedings

2 chant, "Guns down, lives up, I want to
3 grow up."

4 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thanks
5 for sharing.

6 MS. SANCHEZ: O.K.? So that is
7 a very important thing.

8 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Ab-
9 solutely, and thank you for sharing that
10 with us.

11 MS. SANCHEZ: And, we got
12 everything back.

13 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
14 you.

15 MS. SANCHEZ: The money.

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: So,
17 thank you.

18 We have our last, our final
19 three speakers from the public because we
20 are time limited in the use of the space.

21 MS. BARNES: Good evening, and I
22 promise to be brief.

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: No,
24 that's O.K. Go ahead.

25 MS. BARNES: Many people have

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

109

1 Proceedings

2 touched on the things I'm going to touch
3 on.

4 My name is Whitney Barnes and
5 I'm here representing the Community
6 Center as well as I work closely with
7 DYCD as well. We're funded by the
8 Department of Youth and Community
9 Development.

10 And I just want to say that
11 accountability, I just will be 15th to
12 honor that accountability is a big thing
13 when it comes to police and community
14 relations, and sometimes -- you know, the
15 first thing we hear when cops mess up is
16 not all cops are bad, and that's honestly
17 the truth, right?

18 But the same thinking has to go
19 for our youth as well. If, you know, a
20 youth has a hoody on or one youth in or
21 one youth in your community mess up, not
22 all youth are the same. And I think that
23 we got to take a lot of the power back
24 into our communities. And I encourage we
25 got to understand that statistically

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

110

1 Proceedings

2 parents are getting younger, grandparents
3 are getting younger, O.K.? So when you
4 have three generations of people in the
5 same household that grew up and were
6 raised the same way and we have to take
7 that power back.

8 Stop turning the other cheek
9 when you see people that look like you
10 that are younger than you and don't say
11 anything. You taking for granted that
12 they're being taught how to behave on
13 these streets, O.K.? You have to as well
14 as an adult, when you see this messing
15 up, man, we do this all the time, it's
16 not my business or that parent going, you
17 know, that's not my business. Parents
18 want to get all mad when you're up in the
19 kids' business. But the only thing
20 that's worse than kids acting up on the
21 bus, kids cussing and acting the fool is
22 the adults that sat around them and
23 didn't say anything O.K.?

24 So we could put all -- we could
25 put stuff on the police, 'cause they got

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

111

1 Proceedings

2 a lot of work to do too, but I do
3 encourage and I empower all of you to not
4 turn the other cheek when you see youth
5 doing something wrong. Not just when
6 they look like you, but even especially
7 when they look like you, O.K.? Don't
8 take for granted that somebody else is
9 teaching them how to be on these streets,
10 O.K.? And that's all I'm gonna say. I'm
11 going to believe it there.

12 (Applause)

13 DEREK: Hi, I just wanted to
14 give a teen's perspective.

15 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Could
16 you state your name, please.

17 DEREK: I'm Derek.

18 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: O.K.,
19 hi, Derek.

20 DEREK: I just want to ask why
21 police, well, yeah, these systems aren't
22 taking more preventive measures, like
23 not -- like introducing themselves to the
24 school and just being more open with the
25 community instead of basically just

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

112

1 Proceedings

2 babysitting the community and not really
3 getting to know us.

4 And I also agree with the man in
5 the blue hoody. I feel as if I -- of
6 course, you're a black man and you've
7 been through stuff and you've been
8 discriminated, but you have to realize,
9 we're in a very dire situation right now,
10 and you're not in that situation. Like I
11 feel like we're like we're placed in this
12 compact space and we're told to be, like,
13 act O.K. and act good when we don't feel
14 safe.

15 The people who are guarding
16 these communities aren't really guarding
17 it, like they're con- -- it's almost like
18 I they're trying to fight us sometimes.

19 And I'd just like to speak on
20 what the lady said. She was talking
21 about teenagers and gang affiliations.
22 Most of the time when teens go to gangs,
23 it's not even because of parents. It's
24 because they don't feel safe. They feel
25 like they have to protect somebody. So

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

113

1 Proceedings

2 that's -- that's the problem. We need to
3 protect ourselves from the people who are
4 trying to protect us.

5 (Applause)

6 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
7 you so much for sharing that.

8 MR. DAVIE: Angela? Angela?

9 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: O.K.,
10 go ahead.

11 MR. DAVIE: I just want to say
12 to that young man, when he's ready to run
13 for public office, I'm ready to sign up.

14 AUDIENCE SPEAKER: Exactly.

15 (Applause)

16 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I would
17 like to invite our final speaker.

18 TEREELL: Hi, good evening. My
19 name is Terell. I would like to thank
20 Ms. Yahaira Alvarez for coming out to my
21 high school to do a presentation on what
22 the Civil Complaint Board does for the
23 community.

24 I'm an upcoming educator. I
25 want to teach special education, which is

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

114

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

an important part of our school system,
and going forward I want to be also one
of the people that writes the curriculum.
And I wanted to know, is there any way
that I could work along with the CCRB and
the NYPD to make sure that the students
in these high schools -- from not only
high schools, middle schools, elementary
schools are being educated early on.
Like it's a requirement as part of the
curriculum for students to learn all
their rights and know the inside and
outside of police and also the racial
issues in the police department.

Just a little quote to share why
there is so much racism in the department
that I have not only faced by also family
members. You can go back to one of our
presidents, Thomas Jefferson. He said,
"I tremble for my country when I
reconcile that God is just and that his
justice cannot sleep forever." You need
to realize that it haunted him to his
grave because he knew that this system of

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

115

1 Proceedings

2 racism would continue to pass on, and he
3 predicted the condition that we would be
4 in today.

5 So we need to get rid of that
6 ignorance and move forward, which will
7 take a long time but can be done. Have a
8 great evening. Thank you.

9 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Thank
10 you very much.

11 So we, along with the outreach
12 that we have a section that
13 involves public -- that deals with public
14 education, and when we look at policies
15 as a well in the CCRB, I think it's worth
16 looking at partnering with the Department
17 of Education, potentially. So I think we
18 should actually look into that. So thank
19 you so much for that idea.

20 We have one more person here.

21 So can I ask you, please, to go
22 speak at the mic and then this will be
23 the last one.

24 MR. BUTLER: Good evening. My
25 name is Harvey Butler. I'm on board with

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

116

1 Proceedings

2 PSA 8 and I'm Vice President of Sec 1
3 Houses and also I went to the Police
4 Academy.

5 I would like to ask the people
6 on the board, do you ever change your
7 dress and vehicles and ride around these
8 neighborhoods?

9 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I'm
10 sorry. I didn't hear the first part of
11 the your question.

12 MR. BUTLER: Should I repeat it
13 again? Do you ever change the way you
14 dress?

15 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Some of
16 us live in these communities and --

17 MR. BUTLER: It still doesn't
18 matter. Still doesn't matter.

19 Change the way you dress,
20 different car and ride around these
21 neighborhoods?

22 (Inaudible audience
23 participation off microphone.)

24 MR. BUTLER: You don't
25 understand what I'm saying?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

117

1 Proceedings

2 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Some of
3 us don't -- so I think that --

4 MR. BUTLER: In other words, get
5 out of shirt and tie, put on jeans,
6 sneakers.

7 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Yes.

8 MR. BUTLER: Cap, different
9 vehicle and ride around the neighborhoods
10 and just se --

11 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Yes, or
12 just walking in the neighborhoods we live
13 in.

14 MR. BUTLER: No. Ride around
15 and you'll get picked up quickly or get
16 stopped quicker.

17 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Yes.

18 MR. BUTLER: You never thought
19 of that, right? No, you didn't.

20 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: I
21 myself have also been stopped for a
22 broken taillight in a car when I had it.
23 I think we've all experienced something
24 of that nature, but thank you for that
25 question.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

118

1 Proceedings

2 So with that, we will conclude.

3 So first we have a small matter of
4 business at the board level.

5 Can I have a motion to approve last
6 month's minutes.

7 MR. PEGUERO: So moved?

8 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Second?

9 MR. SIEGAL: Second.

10 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: All
11 those in favor?

12 (Chorus of ayes.)

13 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Any
14 no's.

15 O.K. Thank you.

16 And with that can I have a
17 motion to adjourn to executive session?

18 MR. CARCATERRA: Move.

19 MR. DAVIE: Second.

20 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: All
21 those in favor.

22 (Chorus of Ayes.)

23 ACTING CHAIR FERNANDEZ: Any
24 opposed?

25 Thank you. I want to thank

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

119

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

everyone here. I want to thank Bronx
Community College for being part of this
together. We have learned quite a bit
and we hope that you have also learned
from us. Thank you very much.

(Whereupon, the board holds an
Executive Session.)

(Whereon, the board meeting
concludes.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

120

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

STATE OF NEW YORK)
) ss.:
COUNTY OF WESTCHESTER)

I, KATHLEEN T. KEILTY, a
Certified Shorthand Reporter and Notary
Public within and for the State of New
York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in
the within-entitled matter, and that the
within transcript is a true record of
such proceedings;

I further certify that I am not
related, by blood or marriage, to any of
the parties in this matter and that I am
in no way interested in the outcome of
this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
hereunto set my hand this 28th day of
November 2017.

Kathleen T. Keilty

KATHLEEN T. KEILTY, C.S.R.

License No. 000755-1

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

A		
a.m (1) 81:6	affiliations (1) 112:21	applaud (1) 11:2
Ab- (3) 95:25 96:5 108:8	Affinity (1) 35:19	Applause (29) 10:6 13:14,25 19:15 32:14 33:3,11 36:9 38:11 40:10 47:8 50:25 53:17 56:19 61:3 62:20 70:17 73:19 78:3 85:20 90:3 92:10 94:22 95:6 102:2 107:4 111:12 113:5,15
abiding (1) 91:11	afforded (1) 39:21	applied (1) 60:5
able (11) 26:18 27:21 34:6 44:2 48:11 49:25 50:14 71:3 81:20 86:20 93:11	afoot (1) 49:24	applies (1) 75:5
absolutely (6) 74:20 90:11 95:12 95:21 103:14,19	afraid (6) 41:24 43:22 64:19,24 66:7 85:13	apply (1) 100:11
abundant (1) 32:20	African-American (1) 101:19	appointee (3) 6:20,25 18:15
abuse (6) 16:23 17:10 23:17 52:16 91:14,18	African-Americans (3) 39:6 40:5,8	appreciate (1) 33:8
abused (1) 44:18	afternoon (3) 30:11,16 83:21	appropriately (1) 55:12
Academy (6) 69:22 70:3,8 88:11 104:25 116:4	age (2) 34:20 87:24	approve (1) 118:5
access (3) 14:20 56:9 88:4	agencies (1) 60:22	approximately (1) 81:6
accessible (1) 43:20	agency (9) 7:8,23 8:4 14:10 15:25 29:4 54:21 63:20 100:9	APU (1) 16:6
accountability (5) 55:18 101:11 103:8 109:11,12	agency's (2) 13:21 14:19	area (7) 25:15 65:18 72:19 80:20 83:2 104:9 107:16
accountable (8) 50:8,20 54:23 55:20 56:15 66:11,14 103:20	agenda (2) 2:2 13:3	Argus (1) 76:2
accused (1) 75:18	aggressive (1) 43:15	arising (1) 51:17
acknowledge (4) 9:23 10:9 11:21 20:2	agree (4) 96:6,24 103:19 112:4	arm (1) 75:24
Acosta (8) 4:20 70:22,22,24,25,25 71:3,5	agreeing (1) 53:6	arraignment (1) 39:16
act (8) 24:16 53:4 57:10 64:18 92:5 104:21 112:13,13	Ah (1) 60:13	arrest (3) 39:12 46:8 75:18
acted (1) 51:24	ahead (8) 38:15,17,17,17 86:24 102:4 108:24 113:10	arrested (8) 39:7 45:15 46:9 75:25 76:12 77:13,15 79:25
action (6) 16:12 39:2 52:11,14 55:4 56:16	allegation (6) 16:11,14 23:15 47:21 48:5 99:15	Arrington (2) 70:20,21
actions (3) 17:20 42:11 50:2	allegations (11) 16:3,21 23:5,10 24:2,10,13,21 99:25 100:2,2	arrive (1) 57:12
activated (1) 54:8	allege (1) 7:25	asked (4) 10:24 30:21 40:20 69:18
activates (1) 54:4	alleging (1) 16:10	ass-whooping (1) 44:20
active (1) 48:25	alleviate (1) 62:11	assaulting (1) 75:19
activities (2) 50:10 58:22	allowed (2) 87:14 93:12	Assem- (1) 18:25
acts (1) 53:5	allowing (1) 46:22	Assembly (1) 19:2
actual (1) 34:5	allows (1) 100:15	Assemblyman (2) 10:15,23
ADAs (1) 106:21	Alvarez (1) 113:20	assistance (2) 13:13 82:12
add (1) 79:11	amazing (1) 43:16	association (1) 65:22
address (10) 7:18 9:3 22:24 23:2 33:5 38:20 49:24 53:20 98:16 100:17	amicably (1) 11:17	associations (1) 35:21
addressed (1) 68:22	amount (2) 32:20 44:15	assume (4) 39:24 102:8 103:2,12
addresses (1) 27:3	analytics (1) 88:17	attend (2) 67:8,15
adjourn (2) 2:13 118:17	Angela (7) 1:19 3:4 6:9 97:11,11 113:8,8	attending (1) 67:18
adjudicate (1) 99:15	Anglin (5) 4:11 20:6 41:14,17 46:5	attends (1) 57:19
administration (3) 36:19 57:17,25	angry (1) 81:14	attention (2) 36:22 82:22
Administrative (2) 16:5 18:18	animosity (1) 99:4	attorney (3) 12:9 39:24 78:8
Adrianna (2) 9:25 10:4	annual (1) 27:15	attorney's (2) 105:7 106:10
adult (1) 110:14	anonymized (1) 89:8	audience (14) 6:4 22:19 28:22,24 29:8,14 66:24 70:5 86:8 94:5 101:4 105:12 113:14 116:22
adults (2) 101:5 110:22	answer (9) 25:23 27:22 51:12 68:13,15,25 90:5,6,8	audio (4) 51:22 53:23 54:7,12
advice (2) 82:12 96:4	answered (1) 51:13	aunt (1) 39:9
advise (1) 106:12	answers (1) 35:11	authority (4) 16:24 17:10 23:18 52:16
Advocacy (1) 13:22	antagonize (1) 51:23	automated (1) 83:23
affairs (3) 15:20 65:13 91:23	Anthony (2) 4:15 91:10	avail (1) 82:10
affiliated (1) 106:14	anti (2) 91:13,13	available (10) 25:19 26:11 27:7,12 28:6 83:25 87:21,22 88:2,9
	anticipate (1) 51:17	Avenue (3) 1:12 57:22 62:14
	anybody (3) 19:7 45:16 98:10	aware (2) 65:18 81:3
	anyway (1) 85:15	ayes (2) 118:12,22
	apartment (1) 79:19	
	apologize (2) 41:14 70:19	
	apologizes (2) 10:15,23	
	apparently (1) 59:22	

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

B		
babysitting (1) 112:2	Bob (3) 10:11,12,18	call (23) 2:4 4:11 6:7 8:23 15:9 16:22 18:21,22 20:8 25:21 41:16 45:24 46:6,6,10,11,18 47:5 66:8 73:5 82:14,19 83:25
back (21) 31:25,25 32:2 45:5 54:5 58:18 67:13 68:14,24,25 69:15 71:18 79:8 83:25 100:23 107:15 107:22 108:12 109:23 110:7 114:19	body (4) 42:6 52:5 53:20 56:6	called (1) 64:17
backgrounds (1) 102:9	body-worn (9) 14:13 51:14,18,21 53:23,24 54:10,15,24	calling (3) 15:9 82:18 83:20
backward (1) 52:23	book (1) 8:14	camera (9) 14:13 42:5 52:5,9 53:21 54:11,24 56:6 77:19
backwards (1) 52:20	booking (1) 43:24	cameras (14) 51:14,19,21 53:23 53:25 54:15,18 55:15 76:2,3,4 77:3,7 79:19
bad (5) 32:6 37:23 52:11 98:24 109:16	borough (2) 11:22 23:25	campus (2) 35:18,25
Baptist (1) 57:22	boroughs (1) 33:25	campuses (1) 83:3
bar (2) 21:5 26:6	bottom (1) 105:20	cams (1) 42:6
Barnes (4) 5:5 108:21,25 109:4	bound (1) 47:23	Cap (1) 117:8
based (4) 24:9 28:8 71:14,20	boundaries (1) 28:11	car (4) 81:24 82:5 116:20 117:22
basically (2) 34:24 111:25	boyfriend (1) 106:15	Carcatera (10) 3:5 7:3,4 66:25 67:5,11,15,19 69:5 118:18
basis (1) 84:11	Bramble (15) 4:21 73:21,22,23 74:10,14,18,22,25 75:4,13 78:10 78:16 79:6 80:11	care (2) 43:14 53:16
BCC (1) 10:2	bravery (1) 33:8	career (1) 69:22
bear (1) 99:12	break (3) 31:2 32:9,10	cars (2) 32:21,23
beautiful (1) 84:8	Brian (5) 4:21 73:21,21 80:6,14	Cartagena (16) 4:24 92:11,12,18 92:19 94:6,23 95:22 96:3 97:4,12 97:18,21 98:18 99:19 102:15
beginning (1) 40:21	bridge (3) 67:24 75:22 98:8	case (12) 18:3 24:5,8 34:7 46:7 47:18 60:4 65:13 72:16 78:9 79:4 82:16
behalf (3) 38:18,20 50:22	brief (2) 41:21 108:22	cases (26) 11:4 16:5 23:12 24:6,20 24:20 25:20,21,22,24 26:2,4,10 26:18,24 29:5 50:16 62:12,13 77:17 79:2,16,24 80:10 83:12,13
behave (1) 110:12	bring (7) 36:21 62:8 67:20,24 69:5 99:11,11	catch (1) 76:6
belief (1) 50:5	bringing (1) 35:15	caught (1) 82:20
believe (4) 40:4 42:24 43:11 111:11	broken (2) 72:12 117:22	cause (5) 17:14 68:18 69:7 91:2 110:25
benefits (1) 92:2	Bronx (35) 1:11,13 4:5,7,10,14 9:21 11:22 13:8 20:16,22 21:2,17 21:20 23:6,14,22 25:2,8 26:9 33:21 36:13,17 38:19 51:9 57:3 63:18 71:10 72:10,23 80:19 81:8 84:16 95:23 119:2	CCRB (34) 2:7 6:10 7:21 8:11 11:3 11:12 13:18 16:9 18:3 19:17 27:6 35:5,17 36:3,4,23 40:19 41:3,8 42:22 45:3 49:20 74:9,16 79:12 80:9 88:8,14 89:13,16,18 96:8 114:6 115:15
best (2) 9:8 50:18	Brooklyn (1) 75:22	CCRB's (1) 16:5
better (12) 11:8,10,11 30:2 37:24 59:7 61:19 84:11,21 88:20 90:19 97:2	brought (7) 14:10 37:6 68:17,21 78:6,17 107:14	cell (3) 39:14 56:12 81:20
biannual (1) 27:16	brown (9) 4:12 36:24 56:23,25 57:2 60:6,13,18 69:10	Center (10) 4:3,4,7,9 5:5 14:4 30:5 30:18 36:12 109:6
bien (1) 64:5	brutality (1) 102:10	central (1) 43:23
big (3) 76:24 107:10 109:12	buck (1) 95:16	certain (5) 16:4 80:23 93:13 95:17 100:10
bigger (1) 85:8	Buenas (3) 6:3,4 7:9	CERTIFICATE (1) 120:1
bill (2) 6:22 92:3	build (2) 30:22,25	Certified (1) 120:8
bipartisan (2) 43:3 45:12	building (2) 72:17,23	certify (2) 120:10,15
bit (3) 25:14,17 119:4	buildings (1) 72:19	cetera (2) 88:3 89:8
black (7) 31:13 36:24 37:8,11 42:23 64:23 112:6	built (2) 59:15 87:15	chaired (1) 57:13
Blasio (1) 6:22	bunch (1) 67:21	Chairperson (1) 1:19
blind (1) 94:2	bus (1) 110:21	challenge (3) 85:3,4 99:22
blood (1) 120:16	business (6) 2:11,12 110:16,17,19 118:4	challenges (1) 51:16
Bloomberg (1) 71:19	businesses (1) 73:12	chance (1) 106:9
blue (6) 23:17,19 25:2,4 26:6 112:5	Butler (14) 4:3,4 5:10 30:4,17 115:24,25 116:12,17,24 117:4,8 117:14,18	
blur (1) 58:21	bystanders (1) 79:17	
board (67) 1:6 3:2,5,6,7,8,9,10,11 3:12 4:5,12 6:8,13 8:6 12:20 13:16 15:21,25 23:21 24:3,4 33:5 48:20 49:13 50:17 51:3 56:16,24 57:4,7,10,14 60:20 65:7,7 67:9 67:16,23 68:6 69:7,14 72:6 74:8 74:13 78:23 92:13,20,23,24,24 95:9 96:8,12,16 99:8,14 101:17 102:12,25 107:20 113:22 115:25 116:6 118:4 119:7,9	C	
	C.S.R (1) 120:24	
	Cabrera's (1) 12:16	
	calculate (3) 28:7,15,16	
	Cali (3) 4:7 36:11,16	

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

<p>change (4) 32:16 116:6,13,19 changed (1) 27:10 changing (1) 54:16 chant (1) 108:2 characterize (1) 98:13 charge (3) 57:18 94:17 100:20 charged (2) 7:24 89:13 charts (2) 21:9 27:9 check (1) 83:13 checked (1) 83:13 cheek (2) 110:8 111:4 child (1) 85:12 children (3) 32:20 104:18 107:25 chooses (1) 82:25 Chorus (2) 118:12,22 chose (1) 58:3 Christian (2) 4:17 63:3 Christopher (4) 4:3 30:17 62:22,23 Church (3) 13:19 18:24 57:22 circumstances (1) 93:3 citizen (1) 91:11 Citizen's (2) 70:2,7 citizens (6) 77:8 84:12 87:22 88:11 88:12 104:25 city (17) 6:17,25 7:11 15:25 18:15 23:23 25:9 26:14 33:25 42:24 50:17 58:6,7 77:8,20 95:14 101:18 citywide (1) 83:10 civil (2) 96:22 113:22 civilian (6) 1:6 6:8 7:23 15:21,24 74:12 civilians (1) 57:13 CJA (1) 44:3 claim (1) 48:11 clarify (1) 19:23 Clark's (1) 12:9 clean (3) 59:21 60:5 92:5 clear (1) 26:2 clearly (3) 48:10 83:3 98:24 close (4) 24:20,21 25:20 26:18 closed (4) 25:22 26:10 29:4,7 closely (3) 65:21,23 109:6 closer (1) 38:22 Club (3) 4:6 13:12 33:21 co-founder (4) 20:7 41:15 46:6,12 colleague (1) 70:2 colleagues (1) 99:14 collect (1) 88:19 collected (2) 47:20 87:13 collecting (1) 71:21 college (7) 1:11 13:8,9 33:22 35:6 38:19 119:3 College's (1) 4:5 colleges (1) 34:14 color (1) 42:5 combines (1) 25:24</p>	<p>come (24) 18:23 19:11 21:2 30:6 35:18 37:5 39:9 41:7 43:9 45:14 62:7 63:6 64:17,18 66:6,7 71:7 79:24 91:7 93:11,25 96:12 98:4 102:8 comes (7) 21:4 37:14 41:21 91:25 94:3 103:4 109:13 coming (7) 33:8 34:13 64:24 70:13 93:18 96:9 113:20 commander (2) 67:23 86:4 commanding (1) 65:14 comment (4) 2:9,10 49:13 95:10 comments (7) 9:13 34:9 41:7 51:5 78:11 80:12 86:8 commercial (2) 71:24 79:18 Commission (1) 73:6 Commissioner (1) 7:5 Commissioner's (1) 6:20 commit (1) 39:19 commits (1) 53:10 committed (4) 16:8 80:24 99:5 101:16 committee (1) 57:9 committing (1) 53:14 common (1) 87:12 communicate (1) 62:9 communities (15) 37:8 41:24 42:3 42:15 46:2 47:3 59:3 89:19 98:14 99:5 104:10 107:9 109:24 112:16 116:16 community (90) 1:11 2:9 4:3,4,5 4:12 5:5 9:6,18 10:24 11:10 12:19,22 13:8 20:7 29:21 30:5,18 32:16 33:13,22 34:19 36:18,22 37:12,17,20 38:7,19 41:15 45:11 47:16 51:6,18 56:23 57:3,7,9,10 57:14,16 58:13,14,20,23 60:19 62:2,4 65:13 67:8,16,23 68:6 69:7,13 72:6 80:21 82:22 83:9,19 84:4,16,20,23 85:3 88:15 89:6,23 90:12 93:10,15 94:17,19 95:3,4 96:10,13 98:9 101:13 106:16 107:20,24 109:5,8,13,21 111:25 112:2 113:23 119:3 community's (1) 22:12 community-based (1) 96:17 compact (1) 112:12 compare (1) 21:10 compared (1) 37:2 compares (1) 23:14 comparing (1) 22:5 comparison (1) 90:23 complain (2) 42:19 44:16 complainant (4) 16:13 18:7 47:20 100:6 complaining (1) 45:2 complaint (24) 1:6 6:8 8:10 15:8</p>	<p>15:21,24 16:15 18:4,20 19:4,5 36:3 41:4,8 44:16,25 49:20 62:5 74:12 80:9 83:22 84:6,12 113:22 complaints (26) 7:25 16:10,17 20:21,25 21:6,10,15,19,21 22:2,8 22:10,13 23:24 27:2,5 29:10 34:8 50:3 67:25 79:11 87:8 90:23 93:18 95:4 completely (1) 46:7 CompStat (3) 83:6,7,9 con- (1) 112:17 Concept (3) 105:12,14,15 concern (6) 38:25 52:14 59:9,22 60:14 65:19 concerning (2) 33:24 34:9 concerns (5) 12:6 58:8 60:21 69:13 80:22 conclude (1) 118:2 concludes (1) 119:10 condition (1) 115:3 conduct (1) 17:19 confidence (1) 50:17 confident (1) 76:8 confidentiality (3) 47:24 75:12 95:19 Conflict (2) 4:16 61:24 confusion (1) 19:23 connect (1) 46:14 connected (1) 60:2 connecting (1) 39:17 consider (2) 38:25 52:13 consideration (1) 39:5 considered (3) 16:14,16 17:8 constantly (2) 54:2 69:24 constrained (2) 48:3 49:16 constraint (1) 49:21 contact (4) 14:22 34:6 62:15 86:2 continue (2) 99:3 115:2 Continued (1) 5:2 continues (1) 54:6 conversation (2) 99:13 100:4 Coordinator (1) 62:3 cops (5) 39:8 76:18 98:2 109:15,16 copy (2) 14:21,24 corporate (1) 73:12 correct (1) 28:4 council (13) 5:3 6:17,25 7:11 12:15 12:23 18:15 19:2 57:8 95:15 104:7,14,17 Counsel (1) 20:3 count (1) 23:12 counterproductive (1) 84:3 counterterrorism (1) 76:4 country (1) 114:21 County (2) 7:12 120:5 couple (5) 34:10 51:12 67:7,7 87:5 courageous (1) 84:19</p>
--	---	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

course (4) 11:14 48:19 76:14 112:6
court (6) 4:7,10 36:13 40:2,4 62:12
courthouse (2) 39:16 95:23
covering (1) 52:8
covers (1) 65:18
cracked (1) 72:13
Crayton (1) 86:19
crazy (1) 45:15
create (1) 101:13
creative (2) 35:23 90:12
Creston (1) 57:21
crime (11) 22:2,4,7 37:3 39:19 53:9,14 84:17,18 90:22,25
crimes (4) 53:10 80:23 83:11 87:9
criminal (7) 4:6 10:3 13:12 14:3,8 33:21 91:11
criminalize (1) 38:3
critique (1) 106:21
cross-talk (1) 66:24
crossing (3) 32:17,19,23
Crystal (1) 13:11
CSR (1) 1:23
cuffed (1) 76:13
CUNY (1) 14:3
currently (1) 49:18
curriculum (2) 114:4,12
cussing (1) 110:21
cut (1) 107:17
Cutting (1) 11:7

D

D'Ambrosio (3) 4:15 91:9,10
daily (1) 84:10
damage (1) 34:16
dance (1) 75:21
dancers (1) 75:21
danger (1) 45:21
Daphne (2) 4:8 36:18
Darcel (1) 12:9
Darce (29) 1:20 3:15 7:6,7 8:13 13:4,7,15 14:2 29:2,11 40:11,15 48:16,22 53:22 61:18,20 63:19 66:16,19,23 78:24 79:7 85:21,25 86:9,14 90:15
DARE (1) 105:5
dark (2) 23:17 25:2
data (27) 2:8 14:14 20:16 22:3,20 23:7 27:6,7 28:5,20 87:13,18,19 87:21 88:6,8,16,17 89:2,3 90:16 90:17,18,21,22,25 91:2
date (1) 23:8
daughter (2) 105:23 106:5
daunting (1) 44:17
DAVEY (1) 101:8
David (6) 4:3 30:8,11,16,17 32:15
Davie (13) 3:8 7:15,15 49:15 97:11

97:15,20,24 98:21 99:22 113:8 113:11 118:19
Davis (1) 86:19
day (6) 8:23 39:7 42:2 46:9 87:24 120:21
days (5) 39:22 46:9 54:22,25 97:16
de (1) 6:22
dead (1) 32:20
deal (2) 69:21 77:12
dealing (2) 43:21,25
deals (1) 115:13
dealt (1) 66:9
decades (1) 71:18
December (2) 13:16,17
decide (3) 94:19,21 95:4
decides (1) 95:24
decision (5) 73:9,10 95:15 100:4 103:23
decisions (1) 103:7
decline (1) 11:4
dedicated (2) 59:14 96:21
dedication (1) 14:10
deeming (1) 37:22
deep (1) 72:11
deeper (1) 25:13
deeply (1) 106:13
defender (2) 39:23 44:9
defense (1) 78:8
definite (1) 101:8
definitely (2) 35:21 102:13
definites (1) 101:7
definitive (1) 25:23
degenerate (1) 82:23
degree (1) 76:5
delete (1) 77:6
deleted (1) 77:4
denied (1) 39:18
department (17) 7:14 8:5,7 11:7 11:13 54:14 55:3 70:10 73:5 84:21 93:17 104:10 107:9 109:8 114:15,17 115:16
depth (1) 49:25
deputy (1) 57:19
Derek (6) 5:8 111:13,17,17,19,20
derful (1) 106:24
describes (1) 16:13
deserves (1) 84:20
designated (1) 6:22
designee (6) 6:11,17 7:5,11,14,16
desk (1) 19:10
detail (1) 47:25
details (1) 100:24
detention (1) 76:9
determination (1) 60:3
determine (1) 24:12
determined (1) 81:14
determining (1) 22:12

developers (1) 88:3
Development (1) 109:9
dialogue (1) 57:24
different (16) 21:12 26:14 27:8 28:19 33:25 44:15 71:16 72:10 85:2 97:10,13 102:21 103:11 104:22 116:20 117:8
difficult (3) 84:7 91:15,16
difficulties (1) 77:11
difficulty (1) 101:15
dire (1) 112:9
direct (1) 57:24
directed (1) 91:22
direction (1) 81:18
Directions (1) 30:4
directly (1) 81:9
director (10) 1:20 2:6 3:15 7:7 13:4 13:22 15:15,19 20:10 90:8
director's (1) 13:5
disability (1) 18:2
disciplinary (1) 55:4
disciplined (1) 100:19
discourtesy (5) 16:24 17:17,18,19 23:19
discovered (1) 83:10
discriminated (1) 112:8
discrimination (2) 32:10 101:20
discuss (2) 78:25 79:4
discussion (1) 95:14
disheartening (1) 42:4
disposition (2) 24:3,4
dispute (2) 45:2 62:4
distinct (1) 16:14
distraction (1) 58:25
district (10) 4:13 12:9 19:3 56:23 57:3 59:7 60:20 69:12 105:6 106:10
dive (1) 25:13
doing (20) 6:24 25:13 43:18 50:18 52:6 56:18 58:23 59:3 71:13,20 71:22,23 73:3 85:8 91:17 94:13 100:19 104:19,21 111:5
dollars (1) 50:7
door (1) 39:8
dormant (1) 59:24
doubt (1) 53:13
download (1) 90:17
downloaded (1) 90:21
downloading (1) 90:16
dress (3) 116:7,14,19
dressed (1) 39:9
drill (1) 106:16
driving (2) 63:18 98:3
drove (1) 82:9
DTI (2) 87:19 91:2
due (1) 36:23
duty (1) 82:15

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

<p>Dwyer (3) 3:7 7:13,13 DYCD (2) 107:8 109:7</p> <hr/> <p align="center">E</p> <hr/> <p>eager (1) 35:17 earlier (6) 13:24 27:25 41:18 53:7 87:7,10 early (1) 114:10 ears (1) 66:4 easier (1) 48:10 Eason (12) 3:6 6:18,19 65:10 66:2 66:13 69:17,21 70:7,13 80:6,13 East (1) 57:22 easy (2) 33:9 38:2 educated (1) 114:10 education (3) 113:25 115:14,17 educator (1) 113:24 efforts (1) 49:24 eight (1) 104:11 either (3) 9:12 41:19 79:25 elderly (1) 75:19 elected (2) 12:4 61:6 elementary (2) 34:14 114:9 Elizabeth (3) 4:22 78:14 80:18 email (1) 18:5 employed (1) 100:10 employees (1) 8:6 empower (1) 111:3 encounter (3) 16:20 41:25 54:13 encountered (1) 81:13 encounters (2) 80:7,8 encourage (5) 19:22 55:21 56:3 109:24 111:3 ends (1) 82:13 enforcement (2) 58:22 59:2 engage (2) 87:15 90:13 engagement (1) 89:23 English (3) 9:14 63:8,12 enjoy (1) 84:9 enjoying (1) 81:7 enter (1) 50:6 entire (1) 54:13 entirely (1) 28:20 entirety (1) 20:23 environment (1) 68:4 epithets (1) 17:22 especially (9) 13:10 37:11 67:25 68:17 87:24,25 89:20 103:21 111:6 ESQ (5) 1:20 3:10,11,12,15 essential (1) 103:9 et (2) 88:3 89:8 evaluating (1) 7:25 Evangeline (3) 4:19 64:6,9 evening (17) 6:3,18 7:10 15:17 33:18 36:16 61:16 63:14 64:8,12 71:5 80:17 91:9 108:21 113:18</p>	<p>115:8,24 event (2) 24:15,17 everybody (9) 46:4 52:24 53:5,10 53:11 68:12 94:7 101:14 104:15 evidence (14) 24:10,12,15,19 25:18,19 26:11,16,24 47:19 48:12 56:4 77:21,25 exactly (3) 30:15 66:12 113:14 Exalt (4) 4:7,9 36:17 38:20 example (1) 37:24 excellent (1) 47:14 exception (1) 68:19 Exces- (1) 74:19 excessive (2) 16:23 74:18 exchange (1) 76:17 Excuse (2) 66:18 97:3 executive (11) 1:20 2:6,13 3:15 4:5 7:7 13:4,5 90:7 118:17 119:8 exonerated (3) 24:17 25:4,25 expect (1) 68:25 expects (1) 84:20 experience (5) 44:21 48:8 98:7 99:9,12 experienced (2) 101:20 117:23 experiences (2) 102:7 103:11 explain (4) 7:20 36:2 82:6 92:25 explaining (1) 58:15 explains (1) 105:16 expose (2) 35:4 81:12 exposing (1) 82:24 express (1) 84:16 eye (1) 94:2</p> <hr/> <p align="center">F</p> <hr/> <p>F (1) 3:5 faced (1) 114:18 facilities (1) 79:18 fact (2) 102:11 103:3 facts (1) 83:14 FADO (2) 16:22 23:5 fall (1) 16:22 false (1) 75:17 falsely (1) 77:14 families (1) 84:10 family (2) 72:9 114:18 far (2) 20:24 29:4 fashion (1) 89:18 father (1) 93:21 favor (2) 118:11,21 fear (1) 34:20 federal (2) 60:4 73:10 feel (17) 8:20 34:17 35:9 42:15 44:20 52:4 53:15 58:10,14 85:16 85:16 93:16 112:5,11,13,24,24 felt (3) 34:2 52:3 63:15 Felton (2) 4:23 86:25 Fernando (1) 12:16</p>	<p>field (1) 14:8 fight (2) 103:19 112:18 file (10) 15:8,10 18:20 19:3,5 27:5 36:2 41:3,8 44:25 filed (7) 16:3,15 18:4 27:2 79:12 80:9 87:8 final (4) 18:17 25:16 108:18 113:17 Finally (1) 19:6 find (6) 45:7,18 46:13 68:5 73:25 79:21 finding (1) 18:16 findings (1) 18:13 fine (1) 82:21 finish (3) 98:21 102:18,21 finishes (1) 22:25 firearm (2) 17:5,7 first (17) 9:24 11:2 15:3 33:16 37:6 41:12 46:17,25 47:13 58:7 67:6 91:12 96:14 107:14 109:15 116:10 118:3 five (4) 33:14,15 51:14 97:4 floor (1) 76:22 floors (1) 72:13 fluctuations (1) 25:11 Flushing (1) 72:21 focus (1) 34:25 focusing (1) 20:17 folks (13) 11:25 20:4 42:10 43:4,13 43:20 45:18 46:4,22 55:15 56:3 103:3,6 follow (1) 60:10 followed (2) 21:21 68:23 following (1) 68:24 follows (1) 86:5 fool (1) 110:21 Foolishly (1) 81:19 foot (1) 92:3 footage (2) 55:13 56:6 forbid (1) 46:8 force (5) 16:23 17:2,9 23:18 74:18 forever (2) 105:25 114:23 forget (1) 31:3 form (1) 42:17 former (1) 67:22 Fort (1) 12:21 forum (4) 19:22 84:15 89:7,17 forward (4) 14:15 43:13 114:3 115:6 foul (2) 17:17 42:20 found (8) 16:7 24:8,18 27:18 59:24 73:8 100:20 101:2 foundation (3) 4:8 36:19 37:14 four (8) 24:6 63:11 66:22,23 77:14 83:19 85:10 97:5 Frank (7) 3:7 7:13 8:13,13 15:2 91:21,23 Fred (1) 7:15</p>
---	--	---

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017

FREDERICK (1) 3:8
free (2) 8:21 46:7
frequently (1) 59:17
friends (1) 52:17
frisk (5) 11:8 17:12 60:3,5,12
front (3) 81:10 87:11 98:5
frustrating (5) 72:2,3,4,5 73:11
frustration (2) 95:11 101:15
full (3) 14:18,22 59:17
fully (4) 23:4,11 24:2 47:19
functions (2) 57:6 60:19
funded (1) 109:7
funding (2) 59:23 107:17
further (1) 120:15
future (1) 37:21

G

game (1) 101:9
gang (2) 105:17 112:21
gangs (2) 105:18 112:22
gap (2) 67:24 98:8
Garcia (10) 4:16 61:12,15,16,19,21
61:25 67:13,14,17
Gardens (1) 72:21
gender (2) 17:25 34:22
general (8) 14:6 20:17 35:5,7
37:22 75:5 79:23 107:21
generally (3) 37:3 74:24 88:21
generations (1) 110:4
gentleman (1) 67:13
gentlemen (1) 71:6
geographic (3) 28:10,11,13
gestures (1) 17:19
getting (6) 22:10,13 88:18 110:2,3
112:3
Gibson's (1) 19:3
girlfriend (1) 106:15
Giuliani (1) 71:18
give (13) 17:15 19:11 31:16,22,24
31:25 32:2 40:12 63:10,11 70:8
85:25 111:14
given (2) 87:6 89:21
gives (1) 7:18
glad (1) 73:24
go (47) 8:25 9:2 10:18 15:22 18:18
18:21,25 20:12 31:19 34:4 38:15
38:17,17,17 40:21 41:3 45:18,19
68:9,23 75:21 77:5,21 79:12 85:6
86:23 88:12,13,23 90:10 95:22
97:18 100:23 102:3 104:13,16
105:17,18 106:3,12,22 108:24
109:18 112:22 113:10 114:19
115:21
God (3) 46:8 72:7 114:22
goes (4) 54:5 58:18 66:8 105:7
going (39) 15:22 20:15 21:11
25:14 29:20 31:17,18,19,20 32:5

32:8 33:13 40:2 42:7 43:17 45:22
48:25 51:24 52:2,7 55:3 63:6,9
63:10 66:11 67:4 69:14 71:9,18
72:11,14,15 74:4 78:17 93:10
109:2 110:16 111:11 114:3
gonna (3) 99:11 106:4 111:10
good (45) 4:11 6:2,18 7:2,10 12:2
12:25 15:17 20:8 28:23 29:17
30:11,16 32:8 33:2,18 34:16
36:15 37:21,23 38:8 41:16,18
42:14 46:6,6,11 47:5 55:7 61:15
63:13 64:8,11 68:4 71:5 73:23
78:13 80:17 91:5,9 98:11 108:21
112:13 113:18 115:24

goodcall.nyc (1) 46:14
gotta (1) 106:7
gotten (1) 90:25
Gould (1) 60:23
grabbing (1) 17:3
Graduate (1) 14:4
grandparents (1) 110:2
grandson (1) 106:4
granted (3) 81:4 110:11 111:8
graphs (1) 27:9
grateful (1) 82:11
grave (1) 114:25
great (3) 43:16 69:21 115:8
green (2) 23:19 25:7
grew (2) 42:23 110:5
grilled (1) 106:20
grin (1) 81:13
ground (2) 9:9 76:21
group (3) 35:3 47:16 72:20
groups (7) 2:9 29:21 33:13 35:18
35:19 65:15 67:21
grow (1) 108:3
growing (1) 37:5
guarding (2) 112:15,16
guards (2) 32:18,19
guess (1) 76:11
guilty (7) 40:5 53:11,12 77:22,24
100:20 103:22
Gumoneh (5) 4:4 30:19 31:7,12
63:2
Guns (1) 108:2
Gustavo (1) 12:13
guy (3) 97:6,7,8
guys (13) 15:23 19:12 37:10 43:12
43:17 45:11 64:24 74:5 94:12,12
94:16 95:5 97:9

H

Halls (2) 59:21 60:5
Hamzah (3) 4:4 30:19 63:2
hand (4) 8:9 10:5 104:14 120:21
handcuffs (1) 76:22
handle (1) 36:19

handling (1) 74:5
handwriting (1) 70:20
happened (7) 26:3 40:18,22 52:9
81:23 82:6 107:18
happening (6) 9:9,20 29:25 45:4
83:2 105:22
happens (3) 80:3 92:4 105:16
happy (2) 19:10 49:8
harass (1) 91:19
harassment (1) 101:15
hard (2) 14:23 101:10
Harlem (1) 98:4
Harvey (1) 115:25
hat (2) 52:20,23
haunted (1) 114:24
head (1) 76:22
headlight (1) 98:5
healing (1) 89:9
health (1) 77:10
hear (10) 9:15 10:20 28:3 61:22
76:20 89:20 90:11 95:11 109:15
116:10
heard (1) 42:19
hearing (2) 89:13 107:12
heart (2) 41:22 58:25
held (5) 13:18 54:23 57:20 66:11
103:20
Hello (2) 51:10 92:11
help (13) 14:11 21:10 22:12 32:22
60:20 62:4,9 81:25 82:3 84:22
86:20,21 98:16
helped (1) 10:3
helpful (1) 84:4
helps (1) 62:11
hereunto (1) 120:21
hey (2) 44:6 45:22
hi (7) 7:3,15 20:14 36:15 111:13,19
113:18
hide (1) 75:14
high (9) 4:14 21:19 51:9 53:9 81:8
106:6 113:21 114:8,9
higher (2) 22:7 26:12
highest (2) 20:25 21:21
Hispanic (1) 64:23
history (3) 55:17 91:11 96:14
hit (1) 76:22
hold (6) 46:16 50:19 55:19 57:7
66:13 73:13
holding (1) 56:14
holds (1) 119:7
home (3) 15:7 37:14 82:11
homeless (1) 14:16
homicide (1) 107:24
honestly (3) 29:24 46:3 109:16
honor (6) 102:6,11 103:3,9,10
109:12
hood (2) 31:15 53:9

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

hoody (5) 31:17,19 52:21 109:20
112:5
hope (7) 47:15 50:13 68:18 78:7
100:21 101:5 119:5
hopes (1) 11:15
horrific (1) 81:12
hostility (1) 98:11
hot (3) 46:7,10,18
hours (2) 39:18 46:9
household (1) 110:5
houses (6) 4:19 64:10 66:17,20
79:19 116:3
Howard (1) 5:10
HPD (1) 59:20
huge (1) 55:12
human (2) 73:6 96:23
hung (1) 83:22
hysterical (1) 81:24

I

ICE (1) 43:24
idea (2) 101:12 115:19
identify (1) 24:23
idly (1) 43:8
ignorance (1) 115:6
ignore (1) 85:7
imcr.org (1) 62:17
immigration (3) 34:22 41:2,7
impact (2) 17:4 103:23
impacted (1) 103:7
implement (2) 42:7 88:15
importance (1) 84:17
important (12) 14:12 47:11 48:12
68:16 78:25 79:11 80:25 87:23
103:2,5 108:7 114:2
impotent (1) 63:15
improper (3) 24:9,18,18
improperly (1) 17:23
improve (1) 99:7
inadequate (2) 58:10,11
inappropriately (1) 17:23
inaudible (19) 22:21 28:24 69:14
69:16 70:5 78:10,18 79:6 80:11
86:7 96:3,4 97:19,21,23 98:20
102:15,16 116:22
incarcerated (2) 39:25 102:12
incident (1) 79:15
incidents (1) 83:17
include (4) 17:2,6,11,17
includes (3) 17:21 18:14 50:9
including (5) 14:12 27:8 96:18,19
96:20
increased (1) 83:11
Independence (1) 12:21
independent (2) 7:22 8:3
indicate (1) 22:9
indication (1) 26:3

individual (3) 24:23 78:25 79:4
individuals (2) 8:12 9:23
inflate (1) 34:15
inflict (1) 34:15
influenced (1) 102:9
inform (1) 82:16
information (8) 45:7 47:17,21
50:15 71:21 86:2 88:4,18
informing (2) 82:22 83:8
informs (1) 9:10
initiative (2) 27:6 87:20
innocent (4) 40:6 77:16,22,25
Innovation's (3) 4:7,10 36:13
inopportune (1) 54:20
inside (4) 31:18 70:8,9 114:13
insights (1) 9:19
inspector (2) 14:6 57:18
Institute (2) 4:16 61:24
Intake (1) 18:6
integrating (1) 14:13
interact (1) 57:16
interaction (5) 44:7,10,12 55:23
88:20
interactions (1) 55:19
interest (1) 27:11
interested (2) 37:9 120:18
interesting (1) 25:10
Intergovernment (1) 15:20
Internal (1) 91:22
interpreters (1) 63:5
interviews (2) 33:24 35:10
introduce (3) 6:14 20:9 30:10
introducing (1) 111:23
introduction (1) 11:9
investigate (3) 16:10,18,19
investigated (8) 18:10,11 23:5,11
24:2 47:18,19 48:5
investigates (3) 15:25 16:2,9
investigating (2) 7:24 23:13
investigation (1) 24:22
Investigations (1) 18:8
investigative (1) 14:14
investigator (6) 18:12 63:21 75:11
79:3 87:9 91:22
investigator's (1) 18:16
investigators (8) 8:8,10,17 14:25
40:19 79:3,12 89:15
invite (22) 13:3 15:14 19:17,25
30:3 33:13,16 35:21 36:11 41:9
56:22 61:5,11 62:25 64:6 70:19
73:21 75:3,10 78:14 104:3
113:17
invited (1) 51:11
invoke (1) 46:19
involved (4) 94:24 104:18 105:24
106:2
involves (1) 115:13

IOC (1) 33:20
issue (9) 8:20 27:14 63:20 71:12
74:3 75:15 76:25 89:2 100:8
issue-based (1) 27:17
issues (10) 11:15 14:12 38:7 43:21
49:4 51:16 71:9 77:18 100:24
114:15
items (2) 41:2 74:20

J

J (1) 3:7
jacket (2) 52:7 71:11
jail (2) 39:18,23
James (4) 4:23 86:13,13,25
jams (1) 32:21
jeans (1) 117:5
Jefferson (1) 114:20
Jelani (5) 4:11 20:6 41:14 46:5
47:14
Jerome (2) 81:7 83:17
job (6) 30:2 82:9 91:15 94:11,25
100:12
jog (1) 81:7
joggers (1) 82:24
jogging (1) 84:9
John (2) 3:10 6:21
join (1) 65:16
joining (1) 13:8
Jonathan (4) 1:20 3:15 7:6 13:4
Jordan-Gotay (4) 4:7 36:11,15,16
Jr (3) 4:20 70:25 71:3
Juan (4) 4:16 61:11,16,25
judge (1) 76:24
judges (1) 105:2
July (1) 83:16
jump (1) 69:6
jumps (1) 26:12
jurisdiction (4) 16:21 72:24 73:10
74:17
jury (4) 95:24 105:2 106:10,17
justice (7) 4:6 10:3 13:12 14:3,8
33:21 114:23

K

Kappstatter (3) 10:11,14,22
Kathleen (3) 1:23 120:7,24
keep (2) 56:18 75:5
Keilty (3) 1:23 120:7,24
Keith (9) 4:23 15:15,18 86:13,13
86:22,25 87:2,4
Ken (1) 57:2
Kenneth (2) 4:12 56:22
Kew (1) 72:21
kicking (1) 17:3
kid (2) 53:2 104:20
kids (9) 37:2,20,22 53:6 105:9,21
106:7 110:20,21

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

kids' (1) 110:19
killed (1) 42:5
killing (1) 73:14
kind (4) 67:21 68:12 98:11 99:4
knew (1) 114:25
know (65) 7:22 8:12 20:4 29:9,10
 29:12 35:2,15 37:5,16 42:20
 43:17 45:4 46:4 47:15 51:21 55:2
 58:23 60:19 62:11 64:16 65:24
 66:3,10 69:25 70:2 73:8,16 74:3
 77:2 78:22 83:6,7,19 88:7,10,11
 89:12 90:25 93:2,11,25 98:7,14
 98:14 99:9,10,10,19 100:18
 101:6 105:4,6,9,18,23 106:8
 107:15,22 109:14,19 110:17
 112:3 114:5,13

L

Labeling (1) 37:10
lack (2) 80:23 90:19
ladies (1) 71:6
lady (2) 106:18 112:20
landlords (2) 72:4 73:12
language (6) 16:25 17:18,21,22
 23:20 42:21
large (1) 26:14
lastly (2) 45:8 59:19
lately (1) 105:11
Latino (2) 36:24 64:23
law (7) 56:2 58:21 59:2 91:10
 100:15,16 103:17
lawyer (9) 39:17,21 46:15,18,19,21
 46:23,23,25
lawyers (1) 97:5
lead (1) 96:17
leader (2) 51:6,9
Leaders (1) 36:12
learn (1) 114:12
learned (2) 119:4,5
learning (1) 27:11
leave (1) 69:17
leaves (1) 15:5
leaving (1) 54:18
left (2) 21:14 68:12
legal (1) 56:17
legislature (1) 100:22
legitimate (1) 37:7
let's (1) 22:24
letter (3) 44:18 45:5 47:24
level (2) 49:21 118:4
liaison (1) 57:11
liberation (1) 55:17
Library (1) 60:24
license (3) 1:23 76:6 120:25
lieutenants (1) 68:10
life (6) 18:3 39:22 75:6 77:9 84:7
 101:21

light (4) 23:19 25:4 32:23,24
liked (1) 64:16
limit (1) 33:14
limitations (1) 103:17
limited (2) 63:15 108:20
limiting (2) 61:8,13
Lindsay (3) 3:6 6:19 68:18
line (9) 15:10 27:5 45:23 46:7,10
 46:18 58:21 86:16 105:20
lines (1) 87:17
link (1) 27:5
list (1) 86:10
listed (1) 22:21
listen (1) 66:5
listened (1) 98:22
literally (1) 59:13
little (6) 20:24 25:14 85:6,7 101:14
 114:16
live (11) 21:15 53:3,8 72:17,17,18
 97:10,13 101:14 116:16 117:12
lives (4) 31:14 42:8 72:9 108:2
living (3) 22:3 64:14 80:20
lobby (1) 43:22
local (4) 9:17 12:4 25:15 57:25
locally (1) 20:16
located (3) 57:4 60:23 62:13
location (5) 28:10 34:7 66:6,8
 79:14
locations (1) 28:13
long (4) 34:3 54:25 55:17 115:7
long-standing (1) 59:9
look (15) 26:8 38:6,6 51:20 62:16
 70:3 73:7 79:13 84:25 107:8
 110:9 111:6,7 115:14,18
looked (1) 59:18
looking (3) 23:8 102:8 115:16
looks (4) 23:22 37:21 65:8 87:7
loops (1) 54:3
lose (1) 94:25
lot (15) 23:22 59:12 67:24 73:3
 76:19 77:10 79:23 90:21 104:23
 105:22 106:2 107:12,13 109:23
 111:2
lots (3) 59:15 101:20 102:6
love (1) 9:15
lower (3) 22:7 37:3 87:8
Luis (1) 10:10

M

ma'am (2) 65:10 86:17
Mabre (5) 6:24 55:8 56:21 96:20
 102:4
mad (1) 110:18
major (2) 38:25 52:13
majority (1) 89:10
making (3) 54:21 84:7 103:7
MALE (1) 38:22

man (11) 30:12 42:23 81:9,24
 82:20 101:19 106:19 110:15
 112:4,6 113:12
managed (2) 59:7 72:20
management (1) 88:16
manager (5) 4:13 14:5 56:23 57:3
 69:12
manipulate (2) 87:23 90:17
manipulated (1) 88:9
Mantuma (1) 13:10
map (2) 20:21 21:25
maps (3) 21:9 22:5 27:8
MARBRE (1) 3:9
march (2) 107:25,25
Marcos (2) 9:25 10:8
Marcus (4) 4:5 33:17,17,19
marijuana (3) 93:21,23,24
Marine (1) 94:14
marriage (1) 120:16
matter (12) 18:7,9,11 62:8,10 83:4
 116:18,18 118:3 120:12,17,19
Mayor (1) 6:22
Mayor's (1) 75:20
mayoral (3) 6:11 7:16 18:15
mayors (1) 71:19
mean (6) 53:4 96:24 97:12 99:23
 101:6 102:20
meant (2) 77:7,20
measure (1) 22:4
measures (1) 111:22
mediated (1) 18:9
mediates (2) 16:2,3
Mediation (2) 4:16 61:24
meet (2) 35:18 44:8
meeting (20) 1:7 2:2 6:7 8:19,19
 8:22 10:24 13:13,16 15:6 29:23
 49:9 57:8,9,12 63:22 74:8 107:20
 107:21 119:9
meetings (6) 57:19 67:9,16 68:6
 104:14,17
meets (1) 89:18
member (17) 3:5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12
 4:5 5:3 12:16 20:3 24:21 25:5
 26:5 49:19 99:15
members (12) 3:2 6:13 9:17 16:4
 48:23 50:2,20 65:8 96:8,11 104:8
 114:19
Memorial (1) 60:23
men (2) 41:17 64:19
mental (1) 77:10
mentioned (1) 26:25
merits (5) 25:21,22 26:7,10,18
mess (2) 109:15,21
message (1) 47:2
messing (2) 77:9 110:14
mic (7) 10:20 31:6,11 38:23 61:18
 92:17 115:22

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

microphone (7) 28:25 69:10 78:11
80:12 86:7 102:17 116:23
middle (5) 21:4,24 26:19 45:10
114:9
mile (1) 76:6
mindset (1) 31:24
minimize (1) 84:18
minority (3) 31:13,13 53:8
minute (1) 46:16
minutes (9) 7:20 33:14,15 61:8,14
63:11,11 76:10 118:6
Miriam (2) 5:3 104:6
mirror (1) 25:8
misconduct (9) 8:2 14:17 16:3,8
16:11 24:8,13 41:5 74:21
misdemeanor (1) 83:10
missed (1) 15:3
mistakes (1) 37:4
misunderstanding (1) 98:12
Mm-hmm (1) 74:14
mock (3) 105:2 106:10,17
moment (1) 61:5
Monday (2) 82:14 83:21
money (1) 108:15
montage (1) 42:13
month (4) 57:8,20 68:24 69:2
month's (1) 118:6
monthly (3) 14:19 27:15 68:5
morning (2) 81:7 82:14
mother (2) 85:11 93:20
motion (2) 118:5,17
move (5) 13:2 43:13 69:14 115:6
118:18
moved (1) 118:7
movements (1) 55:17
multiple (2) 16:17 78:6
municipal (1) 60:22
murdered (1) 43:4
murders (1) 42:13
Muy (1) 64:4

N

name (32) 6:9,16,19,24 7:10 15:18
17:15,16 19:20 30:17,19 33:19
36:16 40:12,13 41:12 51:10
61:16,25 64:9 80:18 86:24 91:8
91:10 92:12,18 104:5 105:11
109:4 111:16 113:19 115:25
name's (1) 57:2
names (1) 89:8
Napolitano (8) 13:23 20:10,11 23:2
27:23 28:2,23 29:18
nationality (1) 17:24
nationally (1) 47:4
natural (1) 28:11
nature (2) 76:7 117:24
NCO (5) 58:4,9,12,18,24

nearest (1) 20:18
necessarily (1) 99:2
necks (1) 101:12
necktie (1) 97:17
need (16) 10:20 15:4 36:23 45:18
45:21 46:25 63:21 68:5 94:16
96:7 99:6 100:14,17 113:2
114:23 115:5
needs (6) 44:14,23 46:21 59:18
89:6 100:22
negative (1) 40:7
negotiation (1) 99:13
neighbor (1) 62:6
neighborhood (3) 11:9 58:9 85:9
neighborhoods (6) 9:20 80:24
116:8,21 117:9,12
Nelson (1) 72:18
never (1) 117:18
new (22) 1:13 2:12 8:4,6 13:21
15:20 18:24,24 23:23,25 33:25
42:7,23 58:5 72:22 73:6 77:8,20
91:2 101:18 120:3,9
nice (1) 68:4
Nicole (5) 13:22,23 14:2 20:10
27:20
night (3) 17:4 38:8 73:23
Niko (3) 4:14 51:8,11
no's (1) 118:14
noise (1) 62:5
non (1) 107:16
normally (1) 75:21
Northern (1) 80:19
Notary (1) 120:8
note (3) 13:15 19:19 47:16
notes (1) 11:3
Nothing's (1) 101:8
noticed (1) 71:17
November (5) 1:8 6:7 57:21 81:5
120:22
number (16) 8:24 11:4 17:15,16
20:25 21:14 22:2 26:12 27:2,17
46:11 83:18,22 84:6 88:5 93:14
numbers (6) 25:8,12 26:13 27:12
28:8 84:13
Nunez (5) 4:18 63:4,12,24 64:3
NYC (1) 40:4
nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint (1) 15:11
nyc.gov/dti (1) 87:21
NYCHA (2) 12:21 72:5
NYCHAs (1) 43:18
NYPD (15) 14:6 16:4 18:14 22:3
28:14,16 40:7 50:21 51:13 59:20
65:3,6 76:3 77:3 114:7
NYPD's (3) 14:13,15 53:22

O

O.K (46) 12:21,25 20:5,12 28:23

29:14 32:15 33:7 38:18,24 41:13
41:13 51:4,8 59:25 60:13 61:21
62:25 63:3,24 66:15,23 67:19
69:4 70:12 74:22 75:4 78:12
80:13 87:3 104:6,15,15 106:25
107:17 108:6,24 110:3,13,23
111:7,10,18 112:13 113:9 118:15
oath (1) 91:18
observation (1) 59:16
obtain (2) 83:21 84:12
occur (2) 24:16,17
occurred (2) 24:13 84:24
occurrence (2) 28:9 81:2
occurring (1) 20:16
offensive (3) 16:24 17:21 23:20
office (15) 8:24 9:3 10:10 11:23
12:10,13,16 19:3 20:3 60:20,23
75:20 105:7 106:11 113:13
officer (14) 17:7 24:24 28:17,18
31:15 32:4 52:20 54:4 63:17
65:14,15 72:14 92:23 100:7
officers (33) 11:8 16:7 30:23 31:2
32:9,22 44:2 51:15,22 52:4,12
54:10,17,22 55:11,16,19 56:10
58:12 59:11 65:12 67:4 68:3,11
68:11 82:7 94:9 97:6,22,25 98:17
98:19,24
offices (2) 13:18 61:7
officials (2) 12:5 50:19
officials' (1) 61:7
oh (11) 31:16 32:5 38:13 41:12
48:18 52:8 71:2 93:8,22 105:14
107:5
Okay (1) 61:10
old (4) 2:11 58:19,19 106:5
oldest (1) 72:19
once (3) 54:4,24 57:20
ones (1) 89:20
ongoing (2) 69:23 77:17
online (2) 27:13 84:13
open (6) 19:21 29:20 51:4 61:9
75:16 111:24
opened (1) 100:3
openly (1) 29:25
operating (1) 67:22
Operation (1) 59:21
opinion (2) 30:24,24
opportunities (1) 58:11
opportunity (9) 12:3 13:21 36:25
37:4 57:15,23 60:15 69:25 89:6
opposed (1) 118:24
opposite (1) 81:18
orange (3) 21:5 23:18 25:3
ordeal (1) 76:24
order (3) 2:4 6:8 76:25
organization (3) 43:2,3 45:9
organizations (3) 9:18 96:18,21

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

<p>organize (1) 10:3 organizer (2) 20:7 41:15 organizing (1) 88:23 orientation (1) 17:25 Originally (1) 33:23 other's (1) 101:12 outcome (3) 24:5 103:21 120:18 outcomes (1) 24:6 outreach (18) 2:7 14:23 15:15,19 19:8 22:15 35:2,16,22 43:15 47:16 48:23 49:6 58:10,15 62:2 86:3 115:11 outside (5) 8:25 9:4 104:21,22 114:14 over-police (1) 38:2 over-policing (1) 36:24 overall (1) 23:15 oversight (1) 7:23</p> <hr/> <p align="center">P</p> <p>p.m (1) 1:9 Padilla (8) 4:22 78:15 80:17,18 85:21,22,24 86:6 paid (1) 50:7 pamphlets (2) 8:25 9:4 panel (3) 18:14,16 97:5 parent (2) 39:20 110:16 parents (4) 106:2 110:2,17 112:23 park (4) 81:7 83:17 84:8 85:17 parked (1) 59:13 parking (2) 59:10,15 part (13) 8:11 10:2 38:14 56:4,12 58:17 72:10 73:9 87:6 114:2,11 116:10 119:3 participation (3) 28:25 70:6 116:23 particular (5) 21:16 34:13,25 35:12 78:8 particularly (2) 50:20 100:25 parties (1) 120:17 partner (1) 35:24 partnering (1) 115:16 pass (3) 81:10 95:16 115:2 passed (1) 81:8 patrol (2) 51:15 82:5 pattern (1) 26:16 patterns (1) 26:23 Paul (2) 62:22,23 pavement (1) 72:12 PayPal (1) 45:3 Peguero (5) 3:11 7:9,10 96:19 118:7 penis (1) 81:11 people (48) 19:22 21:15 22:3 35:25 37:2 38:5 39:25 41:25 42:4 44:21 45:22 49:6 50:6 54:22 55:18 59:11 65:24 71:23 72:7,20 73:3 83:6 86:3,10,15 87:12 89:10,18</p>	<p>90:16 92:25 94:17,18,19 96:15 98:25 99:8 100:5,9,25 104:13,13 108:25 110:4,9 112:15 113:3 114:4 116:5 pepper (1) 17:4 perceive (1) 53:4 perceived (1) 17:25 percent (2) 26:9,13 perception (2) 40:7 68:19 Perfect (1) 36:5 period (1) 83:12 perpetuating (1) 37:18 person (18) 15:5 18:4,6 19:24,25 31:13 40:23 43:9 46:17 51:5 79:25 83:24 85:8 90:5 93:7 94:20 107:14 115:20 personal (4) 50:5 75:9 89:12,14 personally (1) 9:2 personnel (1) 100:8 persons (3) 17:11,12,13 perspective (2) 71:16 111:14 perverted (1) 82:23 Ph.D (1) 14:3 Phentermine (2) 4:17 63:3 phone (6) 8:24 18:5 55:24 62:15 81:17,21 phones (1) 56:12 physical (2) 28:8 41:5 picked (1) 117:15 picks (1) 106:6 picture (2) 81:15,17 piece (2) 88:15 90:14 place (2) 13:17 35:9 placed (2) 80:23 112:11 places (1) 107:19 plan (1) 51:13 planning (1) 35:3 plate (1) 76:6 play (1) 88:5 Playhouse (1) 1:12 Plaza (1) 75:23 please (26) 8:11,17 9:11,13 11:24 12:5,10 13:5,15 14:19,22 19:19 20:4 30:5 31:11 33:15 48:19 63:6 63:8 69:6 85:14 86:24 91:7 104:4 111:16 115:21 plenty (1) 39:24 podium (2) 10:19 69:18 point (5) 17:7 37:7 41:20 50:14 102:24 points (3) 22:20 78:6 87:5 police-civilian (1) 88:19 police-community (1) 59:6 policies (1) 115:14 policing (5) 11:9 41:24 42:2 58:20 88:11 policy (6) 2:8 13:22 14:5 20:10</p>	<p>56:7 90:5 political (1) 94:24 politician (1) 93:4 politicians (1) 72:3 population (1) 38:3 populations (1) 21:13 portion (2) 29:23 61:13 positions (1) 103:21 positive (2) 11:5,6 possible (4) 24:6 50:12 88:14 101:16 possibly (1) 50:19 potentially (1) 115:17 power (2) 109:23 110:7 powered (1) 54:2 powerful (1) 56:14 precinct (40) 12:22 21:3,6,16,20 21:23 22:4 25:11,12 26:20,20 28:9 35:6 39:10,13 54:19 57:7,11 57:12,17,18,25 58:6 59:8,9,12 63:17 65:14 67:23 68:8 76:13 80:20 82:7,15,17 83:15,21 84:2 85:5 86:4 precincts (19) 9:17 20:18,19 21:12 21:18 22:6 23:6,14 25:15 28:12 34:12 39:3 52:15 59:16 66:3,10 84:18 87:16 88:24 predators (1) 45:25 predicted (1) 115:3 preponderance (3) 24:9,14,19 present (4) 3:2 20:15 46:21 58:12 presentation (8) 2:7,8 15:16,22 19:8,12 87:6 113:21 presentations (2) 19:9 29:21 presenting (1) 77:25 presents (1) 18:12 preserving (1) 77:21 President (2) 104:8 116:2 President's (1) 11:23 presidents (1) 114:20 pretty (3) 21:19 26:2,15 preventive (1) 111:22 priority (1) 89:22 private (1) 72:17 privilege (1) 103:4 probably (1) 39:21 problem (6) 58:20 73:15 82:18 91:20 92:22 113:2 problematic (1) 55:24 procedure (1) 84:13 procedures (1) 54:16 proceeded (3) 81:11,17 82:6 process (6) 14:14 44:13,16,24 89:10 107:10 processes (1) 87:14 profanity (1) 17:18 professional (1) 82:8</p>
--	--	---

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

Professor (2) 13:10,11
profits (1) 107:16
program (13) 4:8,10 36:14 48:25
 58:4,5,9,18 59:19,23 88:16 105:5
 105:11
programming (1) 36:20
programs (4) 72:25 104:24,24
 105:4
progress (1) 14:11
prohibits (1) 49:18
promise (1) 108:22
properly (2) 54:23 55:5
property (1) 72:22
propose (2) 37:19 38:5
prosecute (1) 77:23
prosecutes (1) 16:6
Prosecution (2) 16:6 18:18
protect (6) 76:23 77:8 91:18
 112:25 113:3,4
protected (1) 55:25
protection (1) 76:25
prove (2) 42:12 77:16
proven (1) 40:6
provide (3) 13:5 17:14 50:14
PSA (10) 5:3 12:22 28:18 29:3,5,12
 65:17 66:16,19 116:2
PSAs (3) 27:25 28:6,12
PSAs' (1) 22:20
PTAs (1) 105:25
public (27) 1:7 2:2,10 27:7 33:10
 39:23 41:10,19 44:8 50:6,9,11,11
 50:19 51:4 61:9 63:22 79:5 89:7
 100:18 103:16 107:11 108:19
 113:13 115:13,13 120:9
publicly (1) 103:15
pull (5) 30:14,14 69:9 92:16 98:3
pulled (4) 82:5 97:25 98:4,25
punched (1) 75:24
punching (1) 17:2
punished (1) 94:15
purposes (1) 75:12
pursue (1) 84:6
pursuit (2) 52:10 96:22
push (1) 103:6
pushed (1) 76:21
pushing (2) 14:15 17:3
put (6) 90:18 94:17,18 110:24,25
 117:5

Q

quarterback (1) 69:8
Queens (2) 7:12 72:22
question (22) 22:22 27:25 28:3,4
 30:21 38:21,24 39:4 42:9 46:20
 53:21 58:24 64:14 67:2,6,12
 69:18 92:13,14,20 116:11 117:25
questionable (2) 56:9,10

questioned (3) 53:13 106:13,20
questions (14) 9:12 19:18,21,23
 22:17 29:3 40:25 47:10,12 51:12
 87:5,17 90:6,9
quicker (1) 117:16
quickly (2) 102:6 117:15
quite (1) 119:4
quota (2) 71:16,20
quotas (1) 73:14
quote (3) 31:14 53:8 114:16

R

R (1) 3:8
race (2) 17:24 34:21
racial (4) 17:22 40:25 41:6 114:14
racism (2) 114:17 115:2
raise (2) 10:4 104:14
raised (1) 110:6
Ramon (2) 3:11 7:10
rap (1) 46:22
rate (4) 21:19,21 22:5 53:9
rates (4) 21:10 22:7,7 37:3
RBSC (1) 1:12
reach (3) 49:3 83:24 86:3
read (4) 20:24 39:15 70:20 71:4
readable (1) 88:6
ready (3) 41:10 113:12,13
real (2) 37:11 100:2
reality (1) 37:15
realize (4) 20:23 36:23 112:8
 114:24
realized (1) 81:22
really (12) 9:5,5 22:11 43:13 63:21
 69:8 76:14,24 88:17 89:2 112:2
 112:16
reason (7) 9:7 32:18 35:12 63:14
 67:20 71:6 75:8
reasonable (1) 53:13
reasons (1) 95:18
received (3) 14:2 20:22 82:14
receives (1) 47:20
receiving (1) 7:24
recognize (1) 100:7
recommend (1) 55:3
recommendation (1) 18:17
recommendations (2) 18:13 47:13
recommended (1) 89:16
reconcile (1) 114:22
record (8) 54:6 55:16,18,25 93:4,5
 99:21 120:13
recording (5) 10:19 48:9 53:24
 54:3 78:21
records (1) 103:16
recourse (1) 42:18
reference (1) 22:20
refers (2) 17:24 24:4
refusal (1) 17:14

refuse (1) 38:4
regard (5) 47:17 51:18 77:24 78:20
 90:15
regards (2) 47:23 87:17
registered (1) 50:4
regulation (1) 49:17
regulations (2) 100:11 101:3
reinterpretation (1) 49:23
reiterate (2) 38:13 40:24
rejected (1) 34:23
related (5) 36:4 57:13 59:11 74:16
 120:16
relates (2) 49:19 83:15
relations (5) 11:10,12 59:6 99:7
 109:14
relationship (2) 32:8 98:13
relationships (2) 30:22,25
relatively (2) 58:5,19
released (1) 76:8
religion (1) 17:24
religious (1) 17:22
remain (1) 11:15
reminder (1) 61:13
remove (1) 100:13
removed (1) 100:12
reoccurring (1) 89:17
repeat (1) 116:12
report (11) 2:5,6 13:6 14:22 42:10
 44:4,7,9,12 85:15,15
reported (2) 42:22 120:11
Reporter (1) 120:8
reporting (1) 100:23
reports (6) 27:14,15,16,17,18
 34:11
represent (3) 35:16 61:23 65:6
representation (1) 97:2
representative (8) 10:10 11:22
 12:8,12,15,19 20:2 33:20
representatives (4) 12:4 57:11
 61:6 68:8
represented (1) 65:16
representing (5) 36:12,17 61:17
 102:25 109:5
requirement (1) 114:11
research (1) 37:10
reservoir (2) 81:8 84:8
reside (1) 80:18
residents (4) 17:13 57:15 58:14
 60:21
resilient (1) 84:19
resolution (5) 4:16 49:20 50:3,15
 61:25
resources (3) 19:4 34:5 35:4
respect (2) 94:8,11
respective (2) 39:2 52:15
respond (1) 47:10
response (2) 39:3 68:25

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

responsibility (1) 50:8
responsive (1) 84:22
restate (1) 28:2
restriction (1) 95:12
restrictive (1) 100:16
restricts (1) 60:11
retracted (1) 35:11
retrained (1) 67:4
retrieve (1) 81:20
review (9) 1:6 6:8 14:18 15:21,24
 16:19 74:12 79:16 83:5
reviews (2) 18:16 34:9
rid (1) 115:5
ride (4) 116:7,20 117:9,14
right (28) 19:9 21:4,16,25 28:6,10
 30:14 31:7 37:25 38:6 44:22 56:5
 56:17 57:5 60:13 61:23 65:4
 68:15 69:15 75:19,20 102:13,20
 105:10,15 109:17 112:9 117:19
right-hand (1) 26:21
rights (10) 39:5,14,17 46:19 49:3
 73:6 76:16 96:22,23 114:13
Ritchie (1) 20:3
Rivera's (1) 12:13
Robert (2) 4:20 70:21
robust (1) 58:16
Rodriguez (8) 4:5 9:25 13:11
 33:17,17,18,19 36:5
roll (1) 51:14
rolled (1) 56:7
rolling (1) 54:14
room (4) 60:24 85:4 93:22 103:11
Rudy (1) 8:15
rule (1) 68:20
rules (2) 60:10 100:10
run (3) 34:3 81:18 113:12
running (2) 84:9,24

S

sacrificed (1) 107:18
safe (5) 29:24 34:7 35:9 112:14,24
safer (1) 35:20
safety (1) 32:4
Sal (1) 7:4
Salvadore (1) 92:19
Salvatore (3) 3:5 4:24 92:12
Sanchez (11) 5:3 62:23,24 104:6,7
 105:13 106:25 107:5 108:6,11,15
sat (1) 110:22
save (1) 42:8
saw (5) 11:24 13:23 65:6 81:16
 82:9
saying (10) 39:8 52:8 75:24 77:3
 93:2,8 97:9 102:16 104:20
 116:25
says (2) 44:6 83:23
scared (1) 81:14

school (13) 4:14 34:12,13,14,19
 51:9 68:11 81:9 106:3,6 111:24
 113:21 114:2
schooling (2) 71:9,12
schools (12) 45:19,22 48:25 49:7
 105:3,8,8,24 114:8,9,9,10
Science (1) 81:9
screwed (1) 73:2
se (1) 117:10
searches (1) 17:12
Sec (1) 116:2
Second (4) 88:10 118:8,9,19
seconds (2) 54:5,9
secretary (1) 65:22
section (4) 27:19 72:18,21 115:12
security (1) 79:19
Sedgewick (6) 4:19 64:10,15
 66:16,20,22
see (31) 9:20 11:25 20:20 21:17,22
 23:13,23 24:25 25:9,18 26:22
 31:9,12 32:3 42:4,14 46:23 55:14
 55:22 79:24 82:9 92:4,21 93:4,5
 93:22,24 105:5 110:9,14 111:4
seeing (2) 68:21 87:11
seeking (1) 37:24
seen (5) 34:11 52:22,25 53:12 69:2
sees (1) 72:14
Senator (1) 12:13
send (3) 14:23 44:18 45:4
senior (2) 14:5 57:24
Senor (1) 96:19
sense (2) 28:21 83:4
sent (4) 18:8 34:24 39:15 93:17
separate (1) 83:16
separated (1) 23:15
Sepulveda's (1) 10:10
sergeant (1) 82:15
seriously (1) 48:4
servants (2) 50:12 100:18
serve (3) 70:10 91:18 95:3
served (1) 14:5
service (10) 24:21 25:6 26:5 49:19
 50:2,6,11 66:8 99:16 104:9
session (6) 2:13 51:5,7 79:5
 118:17 119:8
set (2) 49:7 120:21
setting (2) 68:4,22
settled (1) 100:25
settlement (1) 91:25
seven (1) 46:9
seventy (1) 21:7
sex (1) 83:10
sexual (2) 14:17 17:25
shame (1) 94:9
shaming (1) 43:5
share (6) 9:10 15:16 63:20 65:9
 89:6 114:16

shared (1) 47:15
sharing (7) 9:19 48:13 78:7 90:13
 108:5,9 113:7
shield (2) 17:15,16
shirt (1) 117:5
shoot (1) 31:20
shooting (1) 107:24
short (3) 14:9 15:22 30:12
Shorthand (1) 120:8
shortly (1) 11:16
show (3) 37:21 43:13 45:11
showed (2) 39:8 40:6
shows (2) 22:5 25:17
sic (1) 89:9
sickening (1) 42:3
side (1) 26:21
sides (1) 105:18
sidewalks (2) 59:10,14
Siegel (6) 3:10 6:21,21 79:10
 102:18 118:9
sign (5) 9:13 11:5 19:9,20 113:13
sign-up (1) 19:10
Signalco (1) 9:25
signed (1) 9:12
similar (4) 23:24 26:15,23 88:12
similarities (1) 23:21
simple (1) 84:5
single (2) 93:10 99:20
sir (3) 67:14 97:24 101:4
sit (2) 43:22,23
site (1) 88:7
sitting (1) 87:11
situation (4) 63:16 79:23 112:9,10
sive (1) 74:20
six (2) 66:22,23
sleep (1) 114:23
slide (2) 25:16 90:25
slides (1) 90:20
slightly (1) 26:14
slow (1) 82:22
slurs (1) 40:25
small (2) 20:15 118:3
smell (3) 93:21,23,24
snapshot (1) 20:15
sneakers (1) 117:6
social (1) 58:23
society (1) 99:3
software (1) 88:3
solutely (3) 96:2,6 108:9
solutions (6) 4:8,10 36:13,18
 38:19 43:10
somebody (4) 34:7 44:17 111:8
 112:25
soon (1) 79:8
sorry (12) 10:18 20:12 21:7 38:13
 38:17 40:18 60:18 63:2 78:16
 92:16 105:15 116:10

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

sort (2) 21:23 26:15
source (1) 80:3
sources (1) 79:13
South (1) 21:20
space (3) 29:24 108:20 112:12
spaces (1) 35:20
Spanish (5) 7:18 9:14 63:7 64:2,3
speak (39) 8:20 18:6 19:20 29:24
31:5,10 33:9 34:18 35:22 40:22
44:3 45:16 46:17,24,25 48:21
58:4 61:8,12 63:6,7 65:3 71:7
72:8 74:2,5,24 75:3,10 78:17,21
78:23 79:2,9,22 84:5 86:15
112:19 115:22
speaker (15) 19:17 22:19 28:22
29:8,14 30:10 38:22 71:8 91:6
94:5 101:4 104:4 105:12 113:14
113:17
speakers (6) 4:2 5:2 6:4 19:19
37:6 108:19
speaking (7) 22:25 33:9 41:11,19
42:20 43:11 71:12
speaks (3) 63:25 64:3 105:8
special (2) 50:8 113:25
specific (2) 74:2 75:9
specifically (3) 29:12 74:4 77:19
spend (1) 97:16
spent (3) 39:18,22 69:21
spirit (1) 14:11
spoke (6) 40:24 41:18 53:7 71:8
80:8 87:10
spoken (1) 35:11
spot (1) 46:15
spray (1) 17:5
spread (1) 47:3
ss (1) 120:4
stable (1) 37:14
staff (2) 12:3 35:22
Stahly-Butts (7) 3:9 6:23,24 55:9
101:24 102:5,19
stakeholders (1) 58:13
stand (14) 8:11,17 11:24 12:10
13:24 15:2 20:4 40:20 43:7 45:10
48:24 76:16 83:14,18
standardize (1) 21:11
standpoint (2) 88:22 89:23
start (4) 6:14 8:9 29:22 45:21
started (3) 6:12 9:22 67:17
starting (2) 25:17 26:22
starts (2) 54:9 66:14
state (9) 12:12 73:7 91:7 100:21
103:17 104:4 111:16 120:3,9
stated (1) 35:8
static (1) 90:20
stationed (1) 28:18
statistical (2) 27:15,16
statistically (1) 109:25

statistics (1) 14:19
stats (2) 84:25 85:2
status (3) 34:22 41:2,7
stay (5) 33:15 81:2 85:5 101:9
106:7
steal (1) 31:18
step (1) 27:21
steps (2) 11:6 36:2
stereotype (4) 31:16,23 32:3 71:14
stereotypes (2) 31:3,8
stick (1) 17:4
stiff (1) 90:8
stigma (2) 31:22 32:2
stigmas (3) 31:3 32:10 37:19
stigmatization (1) 37:8
stop (9) 11:7 37:22 52:5,6,11 60:2
60:4,11 110:8
stopped (9) 52:18 53:12 81:9,24
97:22,24 98:2 117:16,21
stopping (1) 72:25
stops (1) 17:11
store (2) 31:18 97:7
stores (1) 79:18
stories (4) 45:13 89:4,7,19
story (2) 89:12,14
stranger (2) 45:20 81:25
strategies (1) 43:15
streamlined (1) 44:11
street (6) 13:19 18:24 53:3 57:23
62:13 78:21
streets (3) 105:21 110:13 111:9
strong (2) 73:13 84:19
strongly (1) 66:2
struggles (1) 38:3
student (2) 35:7,20
students (10) 10:2 33:24 34:2,17
35:6 49:2 60:21 87:25 114:7,12
studies (1) 14:15
studying (1) 14:7
stuff (6) 45:16 69:9 71:14 105:19
110:25 112:7
style (2) 52:24,25
subject (2) 24:23 28:17
subjects (1) 58:3
submit (1) 56:3
substantiate (1) 48:11
substantiated (4) 24:7 25:5,25
47:22
suburbia (1) 37:2
sued (1) 91:25
sufficient (1) 17:14
sufficiently (1) 58:16
suggest (4) 37:9 66:3 104:16,17
suggestion (1) 91:24
suggests (1) 24:15
suit (1) 97:17
summer (1) 107:19

Sunday (1) 81:5
supermarket (1) 97:8
support (6) 37:15,16,19 43:4 84:22
103:14
supposed (7) 42:6 43:2 45:9 53:25
54:11 93:16 95:2
sure (13) 27:23 44:5 47:2 54:17,21
59:20 65:17 66:5 85:9 86:4 88:2
99:6 114:7
surrounded (1) 83:2
surrounding (2) 37:25 79:14
surroundings (1) 81:3
surveys (3) 107:11,13,22
suspect (1) 82:10
suspecting (1) 53:14
suspicious (1) 56:6
sustained (2) 99:25 103:23
sympathetic (1) 66:4
system (8) 37:12,15 40:5 44:5
83:23 84:11 114:2,25
systems (1) 111:21

T

T (3) 1:23 120:7,24
taillight (1) 117:22
tainted (1) 100:5
take (24) 7:20 13:16,20 19:19 27:4
39:4 48:4 50:11 55:4,24 59:2
61:5 81:4,11,14,17 82:3,19 91:17
96:4 109:23 110:6 111:8 115:7
taken (5) 11:6 42:12 53:16 79:17
105:21
takes (2) 105:3 106:6
talk (10) 12:6 15:4 22:14 42:25
45:6,14 46:23 49:5,8,25
talking (5) 8:15 41:20 82:4 87:12
112:20
tape (1) 77:4
taped (1) 76:17
tapes (1) 76:12
tardes (3) 6:3,5 7:9
taser (1) 17:5
Tatyana (3) 4:9 40:14 45:13
taught (2) 45:20 110:12
taxpayer (1) 50:7
taxpayers (1) 92:3
teach (3) 49:2 105:9 113:25
teaching (2) 14:7 111:9
team (5) 10:3 35:16,23 48:23 63:5
tech (1) 90:5
technologies (1) 76:5
technology-related (1) 90:9
teen's (1) 111:14
teenagers (1) 112:21
teens (1) 112:22
tell (12) 40:16 42:22 44:19 45:5
46:19 63:21 69:23 76:20 80:25

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

89:11,19 107:14
telling (1) 63:22
tenants (1) 65:21
tend (1) 85:7
Terell (3) 5:9 113:18,19
terminated (2) 60:7,9
terms (7) 47:23 59:5 90:20 95:18
96:7 102:23 103:13
Thanks (5) 19:12 20:12 30:8 91:23
108:4
Theory (1) 37:10
thing (22) 19:6 30:12 32:15 37:11
42:7 48:7 51:13 59:4,5 65:24
72:2,3,6,12 106:22 107:6,7,7
108:7 109:12,15 110:19
things (26) 17:11 27:9 42:21 43:6
43:12 48:3 67:7 71:20 72:5 73:4
74:2 76:7,19 85:6,7,14 91:16
93:13,18 94:13,15,24 101:18
103:2 107:12 109:2
think (50) 12:2 22:16 32:6 41:10
47:14 55:11,23 56:5,13 58:19
59:6 65:11 66:6 68:16 71:11
72:15 78:24 79:10 80:24 83:7
85:14 87:9,23 88:5,20 89:4,10,15
89:22 90:22 93:13 96:10,13,25
98:10,23,25 99:6,24 100:13,17
102:23 103:5,15,18 109:22
115:15,17 117:3,23
thinking (1) 109:18
thinks (1) 11:10
third (3) 21:3 62:14 80:2
Thomas (1) 114:20
thorough (1) 79:20
thoroughly (1) 48:6
thought (4) 11:23 13:23 52:22
117:18
thousand (1) 51:15
thread (1) 87:12
threat (1) 52:2
threatened (1) 52:3
three (8) 39:22 83:16 85:10 96:15
96:20 97:5 108:19 110:4
three-member (1) 18:14
thrilled (2) 9:5,7
thrown (1) 39:14
thug (2) 52:22 53:2
tickets (1) 71:21
tie (1) 117:5
tied (2) 10:15,23
time (27) 8:18 14:9 15:3 27:10 29:6
33:14 40:2 46:16 54:8 65:25 76:9
77:13 81:22 82:3 83:5,12 93:3,10
93:19 96:14 97:23 99:12 107:23
108:20 110:15 112:22 115:7
times (8) 41:23 42:16 44:11 54:20
77:15 81:3 85:10 94:3

today (9) 75:15 80:22 82:2 83:14
83:18 84:15 85:17 89:11 115:4
told (5) 52:19 76:11,16 98:5 112:12
tomorrow (2) 93:23,25
ton (1) 27:7
tonight (11) 6:10 7:2 8:8 9:10 13:9
42:19 58:4 63:14 65:16 66:14
74:6
tonight's (1) 13:13
tools (1) 56:14
top (1) 106:7
topic (3) 31:8 74:4 102:21
Torres's (1) 20:3
total (1) 21:6
touch (1) 109:2
touched (1) 109:2
tough (2) 20:24 94:10
tougher (1) 94:12
Tracy (1) 11:23
traffic (1) 32:21
training (3) 11:8 69:19,23
Transcribed (1) 1:22
transcript (2) 1:16 120:13
transferred (1) 82:17
translate (1) 63:8
translates (1) 63:23
translating (1) 63:9
Translator (2) 63:13,23
transparency (8) 27:6 44:24 45:2
50:10 87:20 88:22 89:3 103:14
transparent (2) 56:8 100:15
treatment (1) 14:16
tremble (1) 114:21
trial (1) 77:5
triple (1) 46:11
true (2) 102:13 120:13
trust (1) 42:11
truth (1) 109:17
truthful (1) 75:16
try (8) 31:20 41:20 49:2,6 75:4 98:8
99:6 101:5
trying (9) 47:4 76:15,20 79:21
83:24 95:15 98:15 112:18 113:4
Tubbs (3) 15:15,17,18
Tuesday (1) 106:5
Tumhara (1) 13:10
turn (4) 8:21 12:5 98:2 111:4
turning (3) 54:17,19 110:8
twelfth (1) 77:13
twelve (2) 77:15 80:7
two (11) 20:17 22:5 58:3 61:8,14
63:10 65:24 89:4,21 99:4 101:6
type (5) 16:19,20 23:16 28:19 34:8
types (1) 23:24

U

unacceptable (1) 53:15

understand (8) 9:8 25:13 38:4,5
42:25 77:6 109:25 116:25
undisputed (1) 93:2
undocumented (1) 85:12
unfairly (1) 100:5
unfortunate (1) 81:2
unfounded (10) 24:14 25:7,25
44:19,21 45:6 93:8,9,9,19
unidentified (3) 24:22 25:6 26:5
unit (7) 14:23 16:6 18:6,8,19 19:8
28:16
units (1) 28:13
University (1) 1:12
unquote (2) 31:14 53:8
unsanitary (1) 73:4
unsubstantiated (3) 24:11 25:3
26:4
upcoming (1) 113:24
urgency (2) 80:23 83:4
use (10) 17:5,8,18 22:11 55:2,11
56:10 61:18 88:23 108:20
uses (1) 17:3

V

vacuum (1) 67:22
valid (1) 100:3
Vanessa (1) 19:2
varieties (1) 44:15
various (1) 9:18
vehicle (2) 63:18 117:9
vehicles (4) 17:12,13 59:13 116:7
verdict (1) 103:22
versus (1) 53:2
Vice (2) 104:8 116:2
vicinity (1) 83:17
victim (2) 16:13 75:17
victimize (1) 82:25
video (13) 25:18,19 26:9,11,16,24
54:3,9,12 78:20 79:13,17,24
videotape (2) 48:9 77:7
view (2) 70:9,9
views (1) 76:5
vigorously (1) 103:18
violation (1) 101:2
violent (1) 87:8
visit (1) 14:19
voice (1) 80:22
voices (1) 65:17
vote (3) 92:25 93:6 99:20
votes (2) 93:5 95:14
voting (1) 103:16
VP (1) 5:3

W

waited (1) 22:17
waiting (3) 39:23 76:10 86:22
walk (3) 44:4 76:14 103:10

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

<p>walked (1) 85:16 walking (5) 52:18 53:2 84:9 85:11 117:12 Wallace (6) 4:9 38:15,18,24 40:13 40:14 wallet (1) 81:20 want (42) 10:13 19:7 29:22 33:5 40:16,24 45:8 46:3 55:13 63:20 67:6 69:6,11 71:7,15 73:25 79:2 82:19 84:5 89:11 90:11 95:9 100:12,13 101:24 102:5,11 103:9 103:15,24 104:12 105:21 107:6 108:2 109:10 110:18 111:20 113:11,25 114:3 118:25 119:2 wanted (4) 7:20 107:17 111:13 114:5 wants (1) 19:7 war (1) 42:16 warrant (1) 39:11 wasn't (2) 76:20 98:6 wasted (1) 39:22 wasting (1) 40:2 watch (1) 76:12 watching (1) 15:7 way (21) 9:8 28:7,15 30:24 32:7 35:10 42:18,24 44:11,12 51:25 53:4,24 54:11 55:20 87:13 110:6 114:5 116:13,19 120:18 ways (2) 27:3 90:12 we'll (4) 6:14 50:14 86:3 101:11 we're (26) 9:5,7 10:19 23:8,12 25:17 26:22 29:20 32:7 41:10 47:4 51:6 52:18 55:2 57:4 58:7 61:13 63:9,10 86:22 93:12 109:7 112:9,11,11,12 we've (4) 20:22 34:11 90:24 117:23 weapon (1) 17:4 wear (3) 52:20,21,23 wearing (1) 71:11 web (2) 27:3 62:17 website (7) 9:2 14:20,21 18:5 27:8 27:19 87:22 Wednesday (1) 13:17 week (1) 46:10 welcome (2) 13:21 30:7 went (6) 44:13 45:15 52:16,17 107:20 116:3 WESTCHESTER (1) 120:5 whatnot (1) 79:20 WHEREOF (1) 120:20 Whereon (1) 119:9 white (1) 75:19 Whitney (2) 5:5 109:4 WILLIAM (1) 69:20 Williams (20) 4:14,19 51:8,10,11 64:7,8,9,13,22 65:4,20 66:12,15</p>	<p>66:18,21 67:3,10 69:4 70:12 willing (2) 35:17,24 withdrawn (1) 59:23 within-entitled (1) 120:12 WITNESS (1) 120:20 woman (5) 19:2,2 75:19,24 87:10 women (1) 82:24 Won- (1) 106:23 wonderful (1) 61:21 word (1) 101:5 words (5) 10:13,25 82:12 101:6 117:4 work (17) 8:4 9:11 11:2 50:21 53:25 58:23 65:20,23 88:8,14 96:16,20 99:24 101:10 109:6 111:2 114:6 worked (1) 11:16 working (3) 14:7 42:12 54:16 works (1) 11:11 world (3) 97:10,13,14 worse (1) 110:20 worst (3) 72:16,16,23 worth (1) 115:15 wouldn't (1) 100:11 write (1) 46:12 writes (1) 114:4 wrong (6) 28:5 94:13,14 99:2 105:10 111:5 www.nyc.gov/ccrb (1) 18:22</p> <hr/> <p align="center">X</p> <hr/> <p>X (2) 1:5,10 XO (1) 68:9</p> <hr/> <p align="center">Y</p> <hr/> <p>y'all (1) 6:23 Yahaira (1) 113:20 yeah (12) 23:3 30:14 31:17 32:5 79:7 87:4 105:14,14,14,14,15 111:21 year (3) 23:7 29:5 83:11 year-to-date (1) 21:8 years (11) 11:5 14:8 34:11 64:15 77:14 80:21 84:23 91:21 95:13 104:11 106:4 yellow (1) 25:5 Yo (1) 93:21 Yoon (3) 3:12 6:16,17 York (17) 1:13 8:4,6 15:20 18:24 18:25 23:23,25 33:25 42:23 72:22 73:6 77:8,20 101:18 120:3 120:10 young (7) 41:17 42:23 64:19 92:21 106:18,19 113:12 younger (4) 45:20 110:2,3,10 Youngkik (2) 3:12 6:16 youth (23) 4:7,9 30:3,4 36:12,17</p>	<p>36:25 45:12 51:8 68:2,3,10 92:22 94:7 104:10 107:9 109:8,19,20 109:20,21,22 111:4</p> <hr/> <p align="center">Z</p> <hr/> <p>zone (1) 34:13 zones (1) 34:12 zoom (1) 76:6</p> <hr/> <p align="center">0</p> <hr/> <p>000755-1 (2) 1:23 120:25</p> <hr/> <p align="center">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 (3) 2:4 75:23 116:2 1-800-341-CCRB (1) 18:23 1,000 (2) 21:15 22:3 1.800.341.2272 (1) 15:9 10 (1) 2:13 100 (2) 13:18 18:24 10007 (1) 18:25 10453 (1) 1:13 11 (1) 26:9 114 (1) 57:22 13th (1) 13:17 149th (1) 62:13 15th (1) 109:11 161st (1) 39:15 17 (2) 39:18 106:4 188 (1) 57:23</p> <hr/> <p align="center">2</p> <hr/> <p>2 (1) 2:5 20 (3) 80:21 84:23 91:21 2014 (1) 77:14 2016 (1) 29:6 2017 (5) 1:8 21:8 23:7 83:16 120:22 2018 (1) 51:16 2155 (1) 1:12 21st (1) 57:21 22 (1) 29:7 24 (1) 46:9 25 (1) 29:5 28th (1) 120:21</p> <hr/> <p align="center">3</p> <hr/> <p>3 (2) 2:6 46:11 30 (4) 54:5,9 64:15 76:10 30-second (1) 54:3 311 (2) 15:10 18:21 33 (1) 26:12 360 (1) 76:5 38 (1) 60:24</p> <hr/> <p align="center">4</p> <hr/> <p>4 (1) 2:7 40th (1) 63:17</p>
---	--	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
November 8, 2017**

41st (1) 21:20
42nd (1) 39:10
44th (1) 21:2
46 (1) 23:6
46th (9) 20:18 21:3,6,23 25:11
26:20 57:10 58:2 59:8
48 (1) 107:22

5

5 (5) 2:8 4:12 12:20 56:24 57:4
50 (4) 93:14,14 94:3 107:21
50-a (3) 47:23 49:17 100:17
50th (5) 21:22 82:17 83:15,20 84:2
52 (2) 23:6 82:15
52nd (8) 20:18 21:4,7,22 25:12
26:20 80:19 82:7
5th (1) 81:5

6

6 (1) 2:9
6:30 (1) 1:9

7

7 (1) 2:10
7:00 (1) 57:21
71 (1) 83:12
718-585-1190 (1) 62:16
75 (1) 21:8

8

8 (9) 1:8 2:11 5:3 29:3,5,12 46:10
104:9 116:2
8:00 (1) 81:6
833-346-6322 (1) 46:13
87 (1) 21:6

9

9 (1) 2:12
90 (3) 54:22,25 83:12
911 (1) 82:4