CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD
PUBLIC MEETING
JANUARY 10, 2018
6:30 p.m.

37-44 21st Street
Long Island City, NY

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE:
FREDERICK R. DAVIE, Acting Chair
JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

Transcribed by:
Deirdre Smith
PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

1. Call to Order
2. Report from the Acting Chair
3. Report from the Executive Director
4. Presentation from CCRB Outreach Director
5. Presentation from CCRB Policy and Data Director
6. Comment from Community Groups
7. Public Comment
8. Old Business
9. New Business
10. Adjourn to Executive Session
BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

FRANK J. DWYER
LINDSAY EASON
ANGELA FERNANDEZ, ESQ
RAMON PEGUERO, ESQ.
JOSEPH A. PUMA,
YOUNGIK YOON, ESQ.
SPEAKERS:

Kenny Carter                Fathers Alive In The Hood, F.A.I.T.H
Reverend Thia Reggio        Astoria First Presbyterian Church
Karen Dennis                PS9 Police Precinct Community Council
Radeha Haque                Generation Citizen Community Change
Jonathan Logan             Vice President, Cambria Heights Civic Association
Maryanne Ryan
Susan Petza                 Community Mediation Services, Queens
Philip Nelson               Urban Upbound, Financial Counselor
Mirian Jones                Urban Upbound
L. Picard                   Speaker
Vanessa Jones Small         Astoria Housing and Residents Association
ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Good evening, and welcome to the first Civilian Complaint Review Board's community board meeting of 2018.

This happens to be my first community board meeting as CCRB's Acting Chair. I'm honored to serve along side with my colleagues here on the board and thankful to have the confidence of this great staff here at the CCRB and Mayor de Blasio as I lead one of the most important agencies for this city.

I would like to thank you all of you for being here tonight. It's actually quite balmy outside given what we had before, but it's still chilly so I'm glad you could make your way here. Some of you have just finished a long days work, or you were just at school, or some of you may have a shift ahead, but you're here and we're glad you're here. And we're here this evening to talk about police-community relations, and you're here because you want to be a part of that conversation, and we are very pleased about that.

As a proud resident of this borough, I think this is a reflection of our community here in Queens. I actually live in Long Island City, over on Vernon Boulevard. I've been there for almost ten
years. As we prepare to honor Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., on Monday and indeed for many of us this coming weekend, I remember his call when he said make real the promises of democracy. Make real the promises of democracy. And I believe that meetings such as this, ones in which we take time to listen to each other and to learn from each other in a effort to make New York a better place, meetings such as this are part of this process of making real the promises of democracy.

Tonight we will review key statistics about police-community relations in Queens. One statistic that is particularly promising here is that 33 percent of Queens complaints accompanied by video footage resulted in a definitive recommendation by the CCRB in 2017. So, 33 percent of Queens complaints that had video footage accompanying it resulted in a definitive recommendation by the CCRB in 2017. For the complaints that didn't have that kind of footage, the percentage was 11 percent.

So what this means for us is that video evidence makes a difference. And as New York City moves toward ensuring that every patrol officer has a body camera by the end of next year, video
evidence is going to have an even greater and more significant impact.

But I also want to say that as some of you are aware, City Council recently passed the Right To Know Act. This legislation will do two primary things. The first is it will require officers to give civilians a business card that includes the officer's name and shield number, and the city's hotline 311 number, which civilians can call to comment about their interaction with the law enforcement during the stop. The second thing it does, this Right To Know Act, is that it requires officers to inform civilians of their right to refuse consent to a search if the civilian agrees. If the civilian agrees the documented of consent through the officer's body worn camera will be presented. So, if the civilian agrees that consent will be so documented by the body worn camera.

The details of how this Right To Know Act will be enforced is still coming together, but the CCRB has been proactive in understanding how the Right To Know Act will affect your interactions, civilian's interactions, with police officers.

The legislation won't go into effect until later this year, so we won't observe its
impact right away. But let me say this, the Right To Know Act certainly will change policing in New York City. And if it increases New York City's ability to hold officers accountable for misconduct, then the CCRB welcomes that change.

I would like to thank all of you once again and issue a reminder that the conversation about police-community relations doesn't end when this meeting ends. This is a conversation that everybody in this room must have and must consider it their civic duty to ensure that respect is a fundamental pillar of policing in New York City.

Before I turn things over to our Executive Director, Mr. Darche, I would like to thank some of the following commanding officers and others that are here tonight.

So, Captain Esvaldo Nunez of the 114th precinct, welcome Captain Nunez.

CAPTAIN NUNEZ: Good evening.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Deputy Inspector Peter Fortune of the 103rd precinct.

INSPECTOR FORTUNE: Good evening.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Representatives from the 108th precinct, Officer Diaz. Officer Diaz.

OFFICER DIAZ: Hello.
ACTING CHAIR DAVIE:  And from the 110th precinct, Captain Nicola Ventre.

CAPTAIN VENTRE:  Hello.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE:  Welcome, Captain Ventre.

We also have the follow from the elected officials offices, from the Queens DA office, Executive DA Jesse Sligh.

A representative from Aravella Simotas' office. Is that representative here? That's you, okay, welcome.

We have a representative from Assemblymember Nolan's office. Is that representative here? Thank you, representative.

A representative from Council Member Moya's office. Welcome.

A representative from the comptroller's office and a representative from Assemblyman Barwell's office. Okay, I think that's it.

So, I will turn this portion of the meeting over to CCRB Executive Director, Jonathan Darche.

MR. DARCHE:  Thank you, Chairman Davie. I would like to thank our host, the Queens
Library in Long Island City, in particular the library manager, Ms. Smith, and her incredible staff for allowing us to use their facility tonight.

It means a lot to me to be here in Queens tonight. I grew up in Queens. I live in Queens and my son is growing up in Queens too.

If the investigators Patrick Yu and Charlie Hartford can stand up. So, they are CCRB investigators and they are here today if anyone wants to make a complaint, they're here to take your complaints down so we can investigate them. In addition, I would like to acknowledge Tricia Ramcharit. She's the agency's new Queens Outreach Coordinator. Tricia, she's right there. Welcome, Trish.

Since we intend to have the outreach and policy units do presentations that focus specifically on Queens I'm going to forgo my usual recitation of the monthly statistics. But the full complement of the agency's statistics is available on the agency's website.

Chairman Davie spoke a little about the Right To Know Act. Please note that should the
Right To Know Act be enacted, it will not go into effect until September of this year.

The act consists of two parts. The first involves people's rights when getting stopped by members of the NYPD. The second involves documenting how people give consent to search.

The agency is coordinating with the department to ensure we understand how they are training members of service and what is expected of officers.

The agency has also been in communications with 311 to better understand how they train operators to route comments received from civilians. We are updating the scripts that operators use when individuals call with complaints or comments. In addition, the agency is working with 311 to give presentations to 311 operators so that they will better understand when to route callers to the CCRB, as well as update the 311 website, to make it easier for New Yorkers to file complaints with the agency online.

Again, I would like to thank you all for attending.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Do any of our board
members have any questions for our Executive Director?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Then we would like to give our commanding officers, representatives from the precinct and other representatives from elected officials an opportunity to bring brief remarks. If you would like to, you can come here to the podium.

Precinct captains, precinct representatives, anyone?

(no response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Anyone from the elected officials offices?

(no response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No? We got a quiet group here.

MR. DARCHE: Mr. Chair, I just wanted to thank Mr. Sligh from the Queens DA Office for coming out today.

When I first went to the Queens DA Office, Mr. Sligh taught me so much and it means a lot to me, and the community, that he's here today. And I just wanted to tell the member of the community here how much he has done for Queens
County, and continues to do, and we are really lucky to have someone like him working for all of us.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

Mr. Sligh, are you sure we can't get you to say something?

MR. DARCHE: That was not what I was doing.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Well, welcome.

MR. SLIGH: Thank you.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I guess we will now move to public comment section. I want to give all the people who have signed up to speak an opportunity to speak. I will reminded you, we would like for you to keep your comment to two minutes, so if you will -- I'm sorry, I'm told that these current speakers get five minute and then for the public commentary period we will ask speakers to keep their comments to two minutes.

So, the first speaker I have is Kenny Carter, who is founder of Fathers Alive In The Hood, F.A.I.T.H, organization.

MR. CARTER: Peace everybody. How you all
doing? Like you said, it's a real quiet room here today.

So, just to tap into the quietness, in our communities every so often we have meetings such as this, or even other meetings that are really pertinent to the residents of the communities -- just by a show of hands, how many people live in this nearby area?

(Audience members raise hands.)

MR. CARTER: Case in point. Where you have a lot of individuals that they're are not hearing the call of civilians to be at these kind of meetings, to understand that their presence here is important. And it saddens me on a regular basis -- I'm also part of my community board, Community Board 12, in Jamaica. I've done numerous groups in this area here: Queensbridge Housing Projects, Astoria, Ravenswood. We've done a lot of mentorship programs that works with a lot of the youth in these communities.

So, just dealing with things around here, not only here but other places as well, people who are not affected, directly, they really don't respond. Do you agree?
If they're not affected directly by any kind of situation, whether it be a situation with an officer or whatever it might be this is going on in the community, if it's not that particular group of people that are really affected by it, not too many are going to show up to events like this to voice their opinion. So, you know, first, I think we need to, kind of like, revise a tactic that will get the community that's really being affected a lot more involved.

From doing work with the 103rd precinct in Jamaica, Southeast Queens area, we have BTG. It's a beautiful organization that was constructed with police and civilians to pretty much get together and it says exactly what it says BTG, bridge the gap. And at Bridging The Gap there is a Community Relations Liaison who's here right now, Sergeant Fason, from the 103rd, and there's a few other officers that work with it, hand in hand, and they kind of hear the hearts of the people.

These officers are some of the only officers that I probably ever seen that's really literally out doing hand to hand work,
like giving out turkeys, or coats, or whatever it might be, really forming relationships with the community.

At this particular point in time, we need more officers like Sergeant Fason and the rest of her partners that are actually out and really trying to aggressively form a relationship with the people that they're policing.

At this point there is not a lot of individuals who make it good for the officers that do come into the community, the CBOs, right? We have a CBO Program that they have, and you have outside of CBO, you have special units. So, they'll have a special unit from the Bronx or somewhere, and they'll come into the community not knowing anything that's been going on with CBOs or whatever with programs that have already been established and the relationships that are being built. You have these officers come from the Bronx, probably coming over here to the 108th precinct, from the 108 or the 114th precinct area, and then they will harass, they will violate some kind of rights, they will do something that will
infringe upon a relationship that was already kind of being constructed with the people that live in the community.

So, I don't know if there is some kind of system that can be put together so, that when you have visiting precincts from these special squads that come, you guys are familiar with what I'm talking about?

(Affirmations from audience.)

MR. CARTER: Am I speaking kind of left? Anybody understands what I'm saying?

MR. LOGAN: Right on point, brother.

MR. CARTER: All right. So, we have these special units that come from the Bronx or they will come from Brooklyn, wherever they come from, to police Queens. The young boy that we know --he goes to church every Sunday, he probably comes and he chills with his friends outside. We know he's not a threat. But we know he has that demeanor where it looks like kind of awkward or whatnot to somebody who is not from around here. So, for somebody who is not from around here, then automatically it goes to, well, this could be a possible problem. But we know that he lives with his
grandmother or by himself, his mom and pops past away when he was a young boy, and the kid has other issues. But opposed to looking at those kind of issues we go and put a stranger in the midst of the situation and we expect a stranger to respond in a pleasant manner, after we have a lot of the media that is already projecting a lot of the negative police behaviors -- and nine times out ten the negative police behaviors that I've been seeing recently are not even from New York City. It can be from a neighboring state or different states, and you have these same cops that come into your community. They're being judged by what people are seeing outside.

So of course when an officer comes in the community, and you got a community that what they're talking about is guns or violence or sex, or drugs or whatever it is, from out of this community, whether it be via a web series or via the internet, or Youtube, or whatever it is, there is an imagery that is being pushed out -- automatically. Anybody ever see a web series based on the projects --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I'm going to need you
to sum it up.

MR. CARTER: I'm about to sum it up right now. There is a web series called Project Heat. That's something out of pink house, that's one of the areas that we are particularly working in right now in East New York, Brooklyn. So, in Project Heat, there's nothing but a lot of gun slinging and a lot of people getting shot and murdered.

So, if someone was to look at this particular web series, they would really feel that these are some of the real particular situations that are really going on right now in East New York, Brooklyn.

What I'm saying is instead of individuals judging from outside, we need to have more people that are willing to get out of their cars and park for a minute and talk to some of the people in the community.

There is no relationship. There is really a hard, a hard dictatorship kind of relationship that is going on --

(Inaudible response from the audience.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, sir. Let
me see if anybody from any of the precincts
want to respond at all?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Nobody? Okay. Any of
the board members?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Okay, thank you,
Mr. Carter.

The next speaker is Reverend Pastor Thia
Reggio of Astoria First Presbyterian Church.

REVEREND REGGIO: Good evening everyone.

Thank you for those remarks. I knew that
anybody speaking, that we would overlap and
talk about similar issues.

If you live in Queens, you know it's about
the amazing diversity that's here and the need
to preserve that and be aware of it and work
with everybody.

The church that I serve in Astoria is a
very small congregation, but because we are
here, we have folks from every where, from
Japan and Philippines and Jamaica and Sudan and
other places in America. And what we've
noticed was that in this past year, since
November of 2016, people were having incidents
of real fear, and we got involved with, informally, forming some accompaniment programs for folks who felt uncomfortable from maybe walking from home, the book store, or some place where they were out. We had, there have been people coming in, literally, on a Sunday morning, coming in with experiences not with the police or other authorities, but with other people in the community who were saying things that they weren't before.

I have a young mother in my congregation who, as Mr. Carter said, is seeing things that are going on in the world. And I see the fear that she has for her son who's now six.

So, I feel that preserving that immigration quality, but not just immigration, I think it's really important to lift up that people sometimes come to this country against their will. And that's been a part of our history and that's a part of who we are currently and that we have that dynamic going on as well.

I think, coming from a Presbyterian background -- I don't know if you have heard the saying, the frozen chosen? But we tend to
have an emphasis on order. We have two parts of
our constitution, one is called The Book of
Order, so we're big on order. And I think
that's good in a sense of working together
within structures. I also think too often we
think of order as separating things out from
one another and creating boxes for people to be
in, and we're blessed to have a police officer
in our congregation who has been a way of
demonstrating to folks that that is not the way
that you build trust in communities.

So, I would love to see this program, this
camera program in particular, to be a way of
police supporting people and feeling safe and
that's it's not okay to be abusive to other
people in the community, and that the presence
of, the police presence, is something to
benefit that.

But I would also like to take this kind
of, I mean, I already now have information
about this other group that I would love to
know more about, and I think this is the
opportunity for us to work together because the
way that you build communities is to bring
people together, not separate them.
I will sum up by saying one of the questions was about the future and I think that as Queens hits the slow roll of gentrification, I think it's really important for us to remember that this is a community that is very diverse, and sometimes it's easy to default to people who feel more entitled to the attention of the police, or more attuned to a sense of authority, where as people who are coming from other cultures may be fearful or not aware of those systems, and if we can foster a sense that there is real equality and community through this kind of effort, I think that would be really beneficial.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, Reverend Reggio. Any questions from any of the board members?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Thank you. Next on the speakers list is Karen Dennis, the president of the PSA9 Police Precinct Community Council.

MS. DENNIS: Good evening everyone. I appreciate you allowing me the opportunity to speak.
As a board member, the title means nothing, but as a board member for the communities that we serve in the public housing developments that exist in Queens, we are very troubled. The Reverend made very clear that people are living in fear. I think people in public housing have extra fear because we are already prejudged to a certain degree.

And although the police department does insight that they are trying to do more community policing, there's a disconnect. And what we see is that they're managing people, but they're not connecting with people.

And we want more open dialogue around that because over the last six months, the four developments around here have experienced an extreme amount of crime. Public shootings during the day, people losing their lives, young people out on the street and just living in a chaotic manner, and quality of life has just gone through the door and out the window. And no one really wants to come out and serve the community if they are living in fear.

So, how do we engage with our police department, who of course, we expect them to
come out everyday and serve the community, and
do their job, and help the community. But
again, they're not the only ones out there
working. We have many business here. We have
many families that live in public housing that
are really good people and for some reason
everything gets overlooked.

She talked about a disconnect. There's a
disconnect. We can't get the merchants in the
community to embrace the public housing
community because they feel, you know, they're
only here to make their money and go home. So,
you take the economic dollars out of many
families who are living on extremely low income
or low income salaries or incomes of some sort,
and they don't come back and serve the
communities.

Then we have the police officers that
treat them just the same. It's just like
anything that is surrounding public housing
development doesn't really get the attention
that it should.

It's just policing, so they say, but for
me it's people just coming in to get their
paycheck every two weeks, or however many, and
then they go home. And I want them to go home
and I want them to be safe and I want to work
with them, but, as an advocate and as a person
who's supposed to be working with the police
department to do police-community engagement,
there is no engagement.

So, how do we fix that? It shouldn't
always be complaints about the police. It
should be things that are showing up where you
see partnership because that's what my board is
supposed to be about, a partnership, from the
housing development. As a resident of housing,
I'm supposed to be on this board to be the
voice of the people who live in these
developments, and bring back resources and
initiatives, and some type of, you know,
connection with the police department, so we
can live in harmony. But there is no harmony.

And again, we are living in troubled
times, we understand that. But where do we
build that relationship, that communication,
that connection with the police department that
is going to serve both the police department
and the people that live and work in these
communities, especially the people living in
public housing?

Because you know what, those are little cities. If you look at it, those are virtual cities because from the ground up, you can have -- Ravenswood has over six thousand residents. Queensbridge is supposed to have what, ten thousand? It's really more like twenty. And when you look at these little cities, how do you serve them? There's no program. We have a PAL program. You can't get a PAL program over here --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, Ms. Dennis are you saying that these issues can't be addressed or they're not be being addressed by the precinct community council?

MS. DENNIS: They're not -- talk is cheap is what I'm saying.

MR. LOGAN: That's right.

MS. DENNIS: You know, you go on the website and you read all of these initiatives that are out there for the communities that the police are supposed to engage but they are not slowing up in communities of trouble.

(Clapping from audience.)

MS. DENNIS: It's a very sad case of just
not being present, okay? And one thing I believe is that people that are will willing to get engaged and get involved, but if they're living in fear they are not going to come out of their doors to connect with what's out there. You know, this is not the Mayor's forum, so we can't talk about funding, but we can talk about the fact that if people would just learn to communicate better -- a lot times with the police department, what I get, as a board member, and as a person that is supposed to be engaging a police community initiative, I get the information 12 hours, 24 hours, 48 hours before something is supposed to jump off, okay? Now, if it wasn't for the fact that I stay in touch with CCRB, I know when you guys have meetings, but not everybody is out there, connecting with that. So, what I think that we need as far as the police department is concerned is although we have neighborhood community officers, it's not enough. It's not showing up.

And I know that they have policing duties and things that they're supposed to deal with but it's the breakdown in communications is
really bad. And these people that are living in fear now are mainly seniors and young people, okay? We have very large populations. So, as the work that you do, I think that collectively if we would come to the table together a little bit more often and have these types of conversations. It doesn't have to be a town hall --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

MS. DENNIS: -- but there needs to be more communication --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

MS. DENNIS: -- whatever that looks like.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you so much. Thank you, thank you. I'll ask the members again, do you have any questions, comments? (No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Then we will hear from, forgive me if I miss pronounce it, Radia Rahdiao?

MS. RADEHA: You pronounce it right the first time.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Okay.

MS. RADEHA: Hello. I was an intern in the outreach unit at the CCRB this past summer.
Today it's important to talk about the concerns and ideas on policy and police interaction with Queens residents.

It's crucial to understand how much sharing experiences about police misconduct can help create a more trusting relationship with the police.

In the past, precincts in Queens amassed high CCRB complaints, proving that people are not afraid of reporting misconduct from a person of authority and are able to trust CCRB to investigate and mediate and prosecute their complaints.

However, there are severe issues among police-communities relations. The Police Executive Research Forum, back in 2015, hosted a nation wide conference to develop tactics to build trust among the precincts. A great proposal was mentioned, being that police officers should try their best to understand and acknowledge past allegations, to confront these issues with residents.

This meeting is gathering elected officials, community leaders, residents and officers to discuss the past allegations.
Ideally, the best way to continue is hosting meetings in the problematic precincts to help mend the police-community relations.

CCRB can foster public trust between officers and residents too by increasing the number of presentations that outreach has done. From my experience with presenting with CCRB, you are able to see the audience engagement in learning how to interact with officers and knowing how to initiate a proper interaction.

With CCRB being a neutral agency, it's not against officers, and their agency's best interest is to build an understanding and do justice to combat further complaints of police misconduct. Because more often local precincts can generate more complaints due to attention of other misconducts who lose trust in police in general.

The neighborhood community officers helped decrease the rate of crime among the community and increase the chances of a trusting relationship knowing that officers devote their time to help create a safer environment for their residents.

The body worn camera act, I think the
cameras will severe a great, concrete evidence, related to any misconduct against the officer.

Officers are assured to have the best behavior knowing that they're being watched, and residents will also tend to give their best behavior during an interaction because they, too, being watched.

However, this sudden addition can not be sufficiently guaranteed to be an efficient tool because of privacy issues and can be manipulated to the police's advantage.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, very much. I should say that Ms. Hawk is a high school student and a Generation Citizen Community Change fellow.

MR. DARCHÉ: And a great asset to the agency when she was an intern this summer.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Any comments?

MR. PUMA: May I?

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

MR. PUMA: I actually have a comment about the previous speaker.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

MR. PUMA: I just wanted to thank you for lifting up the issues around public housing.
I'm a member of this board, but I'm also a life long resident of public housing, and I wrote my masters thesis on this topic of stigmatization of public housing and its residence, and I'm well aware -- I do advocacy on housing and public housing issues outside of here -- and I'm well aware the largest public housing development in North America is just a few blocks away.

And I just wanted to point your attention, if you haven't picked up the monthly report. Several months ago and with the help of the CCRB staff, which, you know, they did a lot of work to actually begin to present statistics about the public service areas, the PSAs.

And so, on page 26 and 27, they have statistics as far as what our agency is getting from each PSA. It's something that I requested and thankfully got the support of other board members and staff, so that we can present this information and maybe get more of a picture of what's happening.

Because one of my concerns was that there was a period, it may not still be the case, I'm not quite sure, but there was a period where
crime in public housing was higher even though
crime was going down in the city --

      MS. DENNIS: It is.

      MR. PUMA: -- and I believe that's still
the case. So, that's one of the reasons why I
decided to ask that we begin to present this
information more explicitly.

      So, I would be very curious to see, if you
get to stay, to hear what your thoughts are on
that.

      MS. DENNIS: I would love to stay.

      MR. PUMA: Thank you.

      ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, Mr. Puma.

      Let me just say that one of the things
about being new to this is that you make
mistakes.

      So, I missed a couple of presentations
from the staff that are on the agenda. So we
will hear from one other speaker, and then we
will go back and hear a couple of presentations
from the staff on some of the reports they have
produced for this evening.

      So, let me call to the podium, Jonathan
Logan, who is the Vice President of the Cambria
Heights Civic Association.
MR. LOGAN: Hello and good evening. I'm going to get right into this. So, thank you, Chair.

Like you said, I'm the Vice President of the Cambria Heights Civic Association. I'm a board member of Community Board 13.

But I'm really here to talk about two concerns of my community, and possibly quite, communities around New York City, possibly around New York State, and possibly, probably around the country.

The first concern I'd like to talk about really is conversations and dialogues that focus around how interactions should be between members of the public and the police.

And those conversations tends to be -- they're tuned in, that narrative is tuned in to how the civilians should act when they are confronted with the police.

And I think that's somewhat of a backwards narrative, right? I think that's somewhat of a reverse narrative, whereby, I think the real focus should be on how the police officer should interact -- we talk about CPR on the side of every car -- how the police officers
should be acting and held accountable to the people.

So, with that -- I'm not here to have a bleeding heart ceremony. I'm here to talk about hardcore facts.

So, what I'm going to hold up -- one of the most, the two most compelling reports that I've ever read were the Attorney General's report. One from Eliot Spitzer 1999, and the 2013 report, which gave hardcore evidence of implicit bias. Okay, so anyone know what implicit bias is?

Okay. So, it's time to start having some honest dialogue and honest conversations about implicit bias, and if you want to really talk about it, we can talk about -- everyone heard about Dr. Kenneth Clark? They did the doll test, it's been reproduced many, many times, black doll, white doll -- 3, 4, 5 years olds -- bad doll, black doll.

We have to start having an honest dialogues as to why police officers act certain ways. So, I'm just going to refer to some of my notes here as we get into this discussion. I'm trying to have a little bit of a basic
discussion on this, and trying to really get into why these things are happening.

   So, I'm not only here to present facts but I'm here because I'm concerned, and more so to present some solutions. If we want to get into that, these conversations are about always about complaints, but I'm really here to talk about solutions, so we can really get down to the bottom of it, okay? We don't want this just to be a formality and everyone comes and just goes home, we want to create some solutions.

   Okay. So, there's a narrative like I said, it's always about where the police officer comes in, but I'm just going to read one thing really quick, that proves something that I'm talking about. This is from the Schneiderman Report, this is from our current Attorney General. He talks about 1999 the OAG issued an extensive report concerning NYPD Stop and Frisk, and Stop and Frisk used to be a very popular topic, it used to be very trendy topic, it's not so much anymore.

   The report demonstrates that even when controlling for crime rates and demographics of
high crime neighborhoods where police are more
heavily deployed, Blacks and Hispanics are
stopped at a disproportion rate. Further,
police data reveal that only about 15 percent
of the stops are made on the basis that an
individual fits the description of a crime
suspect.

In this report, Stop and Frisk data
confirmed that racial disparities documented at
stops continued through to arrests, disposition
and sentencing. The disparity is especially
pronounced in marijuana arrest in which whites
defendants charged with misdemeanor marijuana
possession after a stop are nearly 50 percent
more likely than Blacks to receive an ACD --
everyone here know what an ACD is -- and
thereby avoid a conviction. In a ACD the
conviction is basically just thrown out.

We have to start having an honest
conversation about why this happens, okay? And
this is a major concern to me and to people in
my community. I would like some feedback on
that. We're not just going to have some
conversation that is stepped over, and I would
like to have to some honest conversations about
Real quick, my next concern is really about quotas. Quotas used to be a very, very hot topic. There were ten -- there was a class action suit, ten officers sued New York City anyone know about that?

Well, okay, let's have some feedback and talk about it. Because I know this is something that's on a lot of people's minds. At least it is for me, because it affects me, and it affects my children.

So, there was a class action suit, I know at least 18 million-dollar was paid out just for the attorney fees, and probably many millions of dollar more, but what's significant about this, what I found was -- and this is the settlement of the Sharif Stinson et al verses The City Of New York. The City of New York Police Department never said that they were guilty of anything -- and I'm going to try to sum this up -- I'm trying to to have some interesting dialogue here. They never had, or admitted that any type of quotas or anything really existed, yet there all types of legislative reformations, all types of policy
reformations that they had to -- there was a
court monitor, and there was also a message
that was mandated, that the PC, the police
commissioner had to give out to the public,
stating that there had to be punitive actions
if any, if any supervisors had, or were in
fact, enforcing quotas.

So, why would a court monitor have to be
appointed, and all these public messages, if in
fact these thing did not exist?

Quotas, I believe is probably, if not the
most, insidious and treacherous act imposed
upon the city and the people in the City of New
York.

And why? I'm going to take a pro-cop
perspective at this point. Police officers who
have to go out in the street, who have to
essentially hunt people to meet their quotas
are faced with dire conditions and tons of
retaliation, okay? And that is a problem when
it comes to how we want to get served as
people.

When you have a police officer who is
literally afraid of not getting their time off,
can't get vacation time, can't go home early,
can't do any of that, they'll do anything to get their numbers, okay?

    So, this is a major problem, here are the facts, and these are the types of conversations that I think we need to have so that we can get somewhere.

    ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure, thank you.

    MR. LOGAN: So, I would like to have some feedback, because the sister right here was talking about not having any real connection. So, we need to establish some real connections and I think the CCRB -- I can provide some real solutions, robust solutions, that we need to have -- but I think people like this, who are boots on the ground, really understand.

    I know this is your first meeting and I know that there are things -- you know, I can respect that, we all get twisted up and sometimes things go around, but sometimes you just have to let things flow -- that's a little bit of advice for you.

    But I'm concerned that we are not getting to the bottom of the issues. So, with that being said, I'd like to have some conversation, I would like to have someone -- and I'm not
saying I'm due a response, but I would like to have some type of response as to how we can get some of these things solved, and some feedback from the board.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. So, let me please say a couple of things and then I will open it up to my colleagues.

I think one is that -- first of all in these forums we hear you. The people, the representatives from the precincts are here, as well as representatives from elected officials, all of this goes into consideration of policies and procedures for how everybody does business, vis a vis, this question of police-community relations. So, that's the first piece.

The second thing I would say is this is a marathon and not a sprint.

MR. LOGAN: Absolutely.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, it's, things got to where they were not over a short time but over a long time. It's going to take some time to get the kind of relationships we want to have. But I think from top to bottom, many people of good will are working on it.

MR. LOGAN: I believe that.
ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: And then the final thing I would say is that it's forums like this that hold all of my colleagues here, all of the people who are in public office here, accountable for ensuring that we do what we need to do.

We made a lot of progress on Stop and Frisk. We have the strongest civilian oversight board in the country and we are trying to make it stronger. We got new legislation coming out of the City Council, we have cooperation from the commissioner and precinct captains and others.

So, we're going to work really hard to ensure that we have safe communities. That we have respect in those communities. That we have accountability and transparency, and that everybody assumes their responsibility to make this system work.

So, that's our commitment. It's going to take some time. I think we have made progress, and we'll hear a little more on that when our staff speaks, but we are committed to doing this. It's just going to take a while.

MR. LOGAN: Okay, good. Is there anyone
else who wants to respond to that? Because we want to establish some real hardcore -- and I don't know if you noticed, I have kind of stood up here to get a response. I don't want to dictate the floor, I know you have an agenda, so I'm going to move off, but encourage everyone to just not be so formal. These meetings are for the people, all right? And we really need to establish some real hardcore --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Well, we have a speakers list, so anybody who wants to speak who didn't get their name on the list, this is the time.

MR. LOGAN: Okay. Very good. Thank you for your time.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We will probably have another twenty people on our list to speak.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Logan.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, if we can hear from our staff then, which I missed, on outreach and on policy and data.

MR. TUBBS: Hello everybody, my name is Keith Tubbs, and I'm the Director of Outreach for the New York Civilian Review Board. I'm going to give a short presentation to you guys
today.

The New York Civilian Complaint Review Board is the largest independent oversight agency in the United States of America. We investigate, mediate, and in certain cases, prosecute allegations of misconduct against members of service.

What do we investigate? We investigate four types of allegations; force, abuse of authority, discourtesy and offensive language. That's commonly known FADO.

Last but not least, how to file a complaints with the CCRB. You can file a complaint a few different ways. You can call 1-800-341-2272. You can also dial 311 to file a complaint. You can also log onto the website, which is www.NYC.gov/ccrbcomplaint.

And in Queens, we do have office hours with Councilmember Donovan Richards. We have some forms up front, so if you want to file a complaint there, and you can also file a complaint at your local precinct.

Last but not least, I did want to say that our outreach department, we go into communities and we give presentations to schools, churches,
law enforcement. So, anybody who wants us to do
a presentation feel free to contact me or anyone
else in our Outreach Department. Can the folks
in the outreach department please stand up so
they know who you are?

(Outreach employees from CCRB
standup.)

MR. TUBBS: So, these are the folks in our outreach department.

So, if you have any questions after the meeting or during the meeting, you want to know a little bit more about what we do, please come over and contact us.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

Questions, comment from board members?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: And the presentation on our policy and data.

MS. NAPOLITANO: Good evening everyone.

I'm Nicole Napolitano, I'm the Director Of Policy and Advocacy for the CCRB.

I have some data here, it's Queens at large, but also focusing on the two closest precincts from where we are right now.

In the hands outs you will find a list of
complaint related data for all precincts in Queens. So, for any information that's not up here, it should be in there, and if not, come find me.

So, just looking at a quick snapshot, and I know everyone can't see these in back, so this is just an overall map of all of the complaints that we received in 2017 in Queens.

And you can see, or hopefully you can see, because I can barely see from where I am, that we have some pretty high rates of complaints actually in the 114, where we are right now. So, that's red. So, any precincts that you see that are red have higher numbers of complaints. And we also try to take a look at how complaints match up to the number of people who live in those precincts, so that's what this map covers.

So, on the left here, we have complaints per one thousand people. The right map is actually the crime rate, so the number of crimes per one thousand people. And what this tells us, the reason why we compare these two numbers together, is to take a look at what precincts might have higher crime rates but
lower complaint rates. Those are areas that we need to focus on in terms of our own outreach.

And I can show you also here the percent of fully investigated allegations via FADO for Queens. FADO is force, abuse of authority, discourtesy and offensive language. And over here on the left, we have Queens at large, Queens as a total number. And so these are fully investigated allegations for all of Queens and then in the middle precinct 108, and then on the right is precinct 114.

And give me a second -- for the borough of Queens at large, we had 180 force complaints, compared to 557 abuse of authority complaints, 130 discourtesy complaints and 33 offensive language complaints. And the percentages are pretty similar between Queens at large and the 114th precinct. The 108th precinct has a higher proportion of abuse of authority, and a lower rate of force-related complaints.

And so, what I'll show you next are the breakdowns of the substantiations/unsubstantiations for all of the complaints in Queens as well.

So, an allegation is considered
substantiated if misconduct is found to be improper based on a preponderance of the evidence.

Allegations are unsubstantiated if there's not enough evidence to determine whether or not misconduct occurred.

Unfounded if a preponderance of the evidence suggests that the event, or alleged act did not occur.

Exonerated, if the event did occur but was not found to be improper by preponderance of the evidence.

And, closest officer unidentified, if we could not tell who the officer was in question.

So, Queens is again, over on the left hand side, the blue is the unsubstantiated rate, the orange is exonerated, the kind of teal color is substantiated -- thank you, I'm going to need some glasses -- the kind of goldish color there is MOS unidentified, member of service unidentified, and the last one is a unfounded.

And again, these numbers are all in the hand out for all precincts.

So, for Queens the total, for all the fully investigated complaints, we had 35 that
were substantiated, 54 were exonerated, 12
unfounded, 17 MOS/unidentified, and 107 that
were unsubstantiated. Questions?

MR. CARTER: Once you substantiate the
claim, what's the next step after that? You
said you identify the one that are
substantiated, after that, then what?

MS. NAPOLITANO: So, any number of things
might happen after that --

MR. CARTER: What are things that are
likely to happen, or most likely did happen
already, after the substantiation of the claim
was determined?

MS. NAPOLITANO: So, once a complaints has
been substantiated, it depends on what the
recommended discipline was.

So, if the board recommended charges and
specifications, then our APU, our
Administrative Prosecution Unit, will prosecute
those charges.

Typically, off hand, I can't actually
recall the numbers, but those are on our
website. The rest of the substantiated
disciplinary recommendations would go through
the department's Advocate's Office, and then
there's an potential penalty associated with those disciplinary recommendations. So command discipline, verses training, verses instructions.

MR. CARTER: Do you have an example that you can give to us with regard to an officer or someone who may have been disciplined, that you most recently dealt with?

MS. NAPOLITANO: So, I can't give you any specific examples, but I can, when I'm done here, if you want to talk about where to find all of our reports on the website, I can absolutely show you exactly where that is. So, So, there are some case studies that are in there that are anonymous.

(Inaudible talk from the audience.)

MS. NAPOLITANO: So, just to finish up quickly, and this is something that Mr. Davie had mentioned as well, that video evidence plays a major role in closing all complaints on what we call, on the merits.

So, that would be substantiated, exonerated or unfounded complaints, things in which we know a little bit more clearly about
what went on.

So, for Queens, the rate at which video has an impact on closing cases on the merits is much higher, 33 percent as compared to 11 percent of cases in which we did not have video evidence. So, video evidence is becoming increasingly important to CCRB's closing of any investigation on the merits.

To file a complaint, as was mentioned nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaints. Our data transparency initiative has a wide variety of numbers on there, complaints that are broken down in fifty different ways.

And our reports can be found at nyc.gov/ccrbreports. We issue an annual report, a semiannual report, a monthly statistical report and then also issue-based reports.

If you have any question about that please feel free to come and find me.

MR. CARTER: One more we question.

MS. NAPOLITANO: Sure.

MR. CARTER: In regards to visual, is the audio also included in the cameras apparatus? Sometimes you have a visual, where you can see what's going on, but you don't hear anything.
MS. NAPOLITANO: It depends on what type of video evidence it is.

So, for example body worn cameras do have audio, when people shoot cellphone footage that also has audio, and if it's video evidence for example, like security footage from a store, that typically does not.

MR. CARTER: Specifically, in regards to the officers that we will be paying for them to be utilizing the camera, will the audio also be operational so that we don't only see the video but we can hear the audio?

MS. NAPOLITANO: Yes, there is audio on the body worn camera.

MR. DARCHE: So, Mr. Carter is very loud, so it's not too much of an issue, but if people have questions they should really come up, because we try to record everything, and it's not easy for the reporter to get the questions if people don't come up.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I'm also going to ask Executive Director Darche if he will talk, just a little bit about the entire process, from, and quickly, from the time we receive a complaint to how the board engages around it,
and how the board engages around those.

And then we'll get questions.

MR. DARCHE: So, as Keith mentioned, there are a variety of ways that people can make complaints to the agency.

As soon as we get a complaint through our Intake Unit, two things happen. Number one, our Field Evidence Collection Unit goes into motion to try to collect evidence. Whether it's going to the scene to try to find witnesses, or collect video evidence from surveillance cameras. And the case is also assigned to an investigator, like two who I introduce earlier in the evening, and those investigators speak to the complainant, get as much information about the incident as they can, and then start trying to find other evidence. Whether it's speaking to other civilian witnesses, gathering medical records, and then they also request document from the police department. They request body worn cameras footage from the police department. And then once they've accumulated all the other evidence they're going to need, we interview the police officers who are involved.
We interview officers who were accused of misconduct. We also interview witnesses who we believe may have witnessed what happened, who may have been witnesses to the incident.

Once the investigators have gathered all the evidence, they apply that evidence to the law, whether it's the constitution, or the laws of the State of New York, or the case law that governs what is legal what isn't legal in New York state. But they also use the patrol guide for how officers are trained to determine whether the officer has committed misconduct or not.

Then, once all that evidence is marshaled and presented, it's presented to the board. Generally, cases go to panels of three board members. Each panel has one person who was designated by the mayor, one person who was designated by the city council, and one person who was designated by the police commissioner.

And these panels meet and they discuss the cases as they are presented in the closing report. They review video evidence and other pieces of evidence that are associated with the case, and they make a determination.
And it's one of those questions, I think it was Mr. Carter who asked, like what are the dispositions?

So, if the board determines by preponderance of the evidence, so anything above 50 percent, that misconduct occurred they substantiate the allegation.

It may be that the board can determine by preponderance of the evidence that the act occurred, that the person complained that they were stopped and they shouldn't have been stopped, the board may determine that that stop occurred, but that the police officer had the right to make that stop, in which case they exonerate that allegation.

And it may be that the board determines that the alleged conduct did not occur. So the person says, I was stopped, and the board was able to determine that the stop did not occur, in that case the allegation is unfounded.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Questions?

MR. LOGAN: I don't mean to interrupt you but -- do you want me to approach the mic?

MR. DARCHE: You should approach the mic
if you have a question.

    MR. LOGAN: Jon Logan, Cambria Heights. I appreciate everything that you're saying. And I just want to thank you, the board, the CCRB is on our side.

    This is wonderful information, and it's all on the website, but these guys do a great job. I know some people who have filed some complaints and the process is very good, I must say that.

    But what we're trying to get across to you is there is a disconnect between people. The people who need this information, the majority of them are probably not here.

    MS. DENNIS: Exactly.

    MR. LOGAN: They are not in this room. They don't attend these types of meetings. The deepest injustices that are on the people and the city of New York and the people that pass through this city, they're not here.

    And so, the leaders, some of them are here, but we need some kind of robust program that gets this information back to the people.

    Whether it be some type of video series, brother Robert Reich does the inequality for
all. He has a ton of videos -- there needs to be some type of substantial, robust program that brings --

Everyone is on their phone now. People are not reading. Now, I love to read. I read these two 400 page reports, I read these things because it gives me some good information to bring back to the people, but people need to understand what their rights are, so they can really know where to go and how to bring some type of change.

So, I appreciate the process, the process is a very good process, there are people on the phone, they record everything, it's very good, so I appreciate you going through all that, but how can we get this information where it needs to go?

And I can speak more and more about the implicit biases -- we need to have some real conversations about things.

MR. DARCHE: So, Mr. Logan, I actually think that the podcast, or videocast, that you were just describing is a pretty good idea. So, thank you for that.

As Keith was describing in his
presentation, our outreach unit does do a lot
work to try to get to people so they can find
out about us.

MR. LOGAN: They absolutely do.

MR. DARCHE: In 2017, I think there were,
approximately, four thousand complaints that
were within our jurisdiction that we
investigated.

And I don't think that there were only
four thousand times people interacted with the
police where they thought they weren't treated
properly.

MR. LOGAN: Exactly.

MR. DARCHE: So, I think that there is
clearly a lot of work that this agency has to
come up with ways to let people find out about
this agency. And I think the videocast idea is
a very good idea and I appreciate that and will
look into it.

MR. EASON: I would encourage you also,
Mr. Logan, to speak with our outreach unit.
And for the young lady who spoke from the
community board prior to you, I would encourage
you to take these conversations that needs to
be had, and we all recognize that, we all know
that, to the police precincts where the neighborhood community officer, start with him or her, and have that dialogue spread out from there, and it will be a continuation of what's going on here tonight -- at every opportunity that you can.

These conversations should be had, and certain individuals should be at the table.

It's disheartening to hear there is a disconnect, nobody is doing this, nobody is doing that. Because I believe on both fronts, you're doing, you're speaking out, and the police precincts also want to be held responsible.

And, you heard Mr. Darche speak of the number of ways that the complaints are investigated, and he mentioned that police officers are also bound by a code of conduct --

MR. LOGAN: They are.

MR. EASON: -- their patrol guide.

MR. LOGAN: Which is available on website, the patrol guide.

MR. EASON: Correct. And that's just like the public is expected to be guided by a code of conduct, the police officers are trained in
that also. So, it's on both sides. The responsibility is there. Maybe, it may not be always to your satisfaction --

MR. LOGAN: No, no.

MR. EASON: -- but it's there.

MR. LOGAN: We have to have honest conversations. The Mayor acknowledges -- he's not here to speak for himself, but the Mayor acknowledges that implicit bias exists. NCO officers get implicit bias training, so they get that.

See, if you ask a police officer right now -- if he's required to have ten contact cards on him every tour -- if you ask for one, he may curse at you. I don't know if you have ever been cursed at by a police officer. I'm not here to broad stroke anyone, what I'm saying is there are problems out there.

MR. EASON: Of course, that's why we're all here --

MR. LOGAN: Absolutely.

MR. EASON: -- because we want to get at the root of those problems.

MR. LOGAN: That's right.

MR. EASON: Nobody wants to sweep them
under the rug. It's there. That's why we're here. That's why the public is here. That's why the precinct representatives are here.

MR. LOGAN: I would like to hear from some of the precinct representatives.

MR. DARCHE: We have a lot people who signed up to speak, so thank you, Mr. Logan, but we really need to --

MS. DENNIS: I really want to address the issue that you're going through the protocol of what happens with these inquires around officers that are showing up badly in these communities that we live and serve in, and what I'm seeing is, the residual affect of that, is that the relationship is broken. Once that happens, results come back, and no one is being held accountable.

How do you change people's mind set around the police department if you slam the mallet down and say, case closed? People are not feeling that, okay? They're in fear and if they're in fear of the officers that are serving the communities that they're living in, then they're not going to trust them, they're not going to approach you or anybody else and
come and say, this is what happened.

A lot things are getting brushed to side. You don't see half of the things going on, you only hear about the ones that might be broadcasted in the news. You don't really walk these streets, working these trenches like we do, so, when we come to you and ask for solutions and you tell us that a due process is going to happen between an officer that has behaved badly in the community, and really mistreated someone, and then that officer walks away scot free, how do you turn that person's attitude around about community partnerships, community relationships or community building? You can't engage people after that.

And that's what I see. I talked to mothers. I talked to teenagers. I've talked to people right from the DA's office that say they got better treatment from the DA's office then they did from the police department. And they don't trust the police, but they'll call the DA's office for services rather than dealing with the police officers that are here, that are in the communities.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I think that's why we
have these meetings.

MS. DENNIS: And one more thing, the NCOs are being dumped on, okay? They cannot serve the masses that they're trying to cover with the number of NCOs that are in these communities. They are being dumped on and they can't handle the work, and the police department is just worried about their status.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, the value of this kind of public airing is that these issues have been raised, there are people here who are responsible for addressing them, and they will be addressed.

Again, it won't change overnight. It's going to take some time, but that's why we are here. That's why we're here.

MS. DENNIS: That's all I'm asking.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, we are going to go to the speaker's list, and after speakers list, if people still have questions then we'll take questions.

So, I have first on the speakers list, Maryanne Ryan. And two minutes please, Ms. Ryan, thank you.

MS. RYAN: As we know NYPD has special
divisions, and that includes the police that go into the department of homeless service shelters.

Now, as a residence of one of those shelters I have seen marijuana get by, I've seen K2 get by. But I have -- when I go through the metal detector, my titanium in my leg goes off. I am often asked to go back through the metal detector even though I have a medical card that says I have metal in my body.

Now, I feel that's a violation of my rights as a person with a disability. And nobody else does that. There are some officers that do recognize I will always bleep off. But there are always a few that go above and beyond the arrogant and ignorant, and insist I go back through, even though I'm trying to find that card, and I always keep it on me. That is hubris at its height.

Unfortunately, I can't make a complaint every time they do this about this disrespect. I mean, I have seen them speak discourteously to the residents. I have seen them use excessive force with the residents and excessive authority with the residents.
I can't complain until I leave the shelter for fear of retribution when this happens.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, can I suggest Ms. Ryan, that you at least have a conversation with -- who are the investigators here from CCRB?

MR. DARCHE: Patrick.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Would you just have a conversation with him, yes? Next on the speakers list is Susan Petza.

MS. PETZA: Hi, my name is Susan Petza. I'm here representing Community Mediation Services.

We are a nonprofit. We offer services to the community, to the police. We're on 311. We receive calls from communities with relation to problem with family conflicts, parents/teenagers, separating couples, divorce, custody/visitation, and the list goes on in like different cases that go through our agency.

We have also a DT cases for first nonviolent offenders, and this service is out there for the community, and I'm here to
represent that you don't have to go beyond
going to court or calling the police, or
anything that we can resolve by ourselves.

We have mediators, and I assume that you
guys have mediators here too, to resolve the
conflicts with the police and the communities.
And this extends beyond the police and
community and extends to the the whole
community itself.

We're here offering Queens, all of Queens,
there are five boroughs and we represent
Queens. The service is there, it's free of
costs and we are here to serve you.

So, please call us in case you have any
conflicts. We're here to help and this is a
confidential, so whatever is said there, stays
there. Of course, if there is violence, child
neglect, child abuse or any violence or threat
to the parties involved we don't have those
case there.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, ma'am, if you can
give your card to our outreach people.
Actually, I think Rose is here, right?
So, you can give your card to Rosemary,
she's the deputy in our mediation unit.
MS. PETZA: Great. I will talk to you soon.

So, we are here offering the services, and again, it's a volunteer process.

So, finishing off, and if there is an agreement, your case doesn't have to be out there. It can be resolved. We have our on right to have that service. Thank you very much, I appreciate it.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you very much.

Next on the list is Philip Nelson.

MR. NELSON: Good evening everyone. My name is Philip Nelson, I'm from Urban Upbound, we're just around the corner, different sites in New York City. We do breaking the cycles of poverty through out workforce development program child readiness program, free tax prep, college access, job placement, job readiness, financial literacy.

I'm one of the financial counselors for the youth pathway in partnership with NYC and human resources administration.

So, I'm going to be very brief, but one of the things I'm hearing this is my first -- meeting with CCRB -- you have to find a way to
connect with the youth.

I'm around the corner. I run the youth pathway program financial, I found out about this meeting an hour and a half ago, and our offices are right around the corner. We handle Queensbridge, Ravenswood, Astoria, and I just found out about it, so I know the youth don't know about it.

So, technology is important, I'm from the tech business before I got into nonprofit, there has got to be ways, a website or apps, that kids just know that hey there's a meeting, or hey, here's what you do if you get stopped by the cops, or here's what you do -- a lot of things are going on around here like the new bike lanes. I've seen kids harassed for riding their bikes on the sidewalk because they're probably going to get hit by a car on Vernon Boulevard, because everyone in this area knows that Vernon Boulevard is a very, very busy street. They get harassed for riding their bike, going to their job, or going to an F train to go to job placement. So, the discouragement starts as soon as they leave their house in order to better their life.
So, we have to really try to find -- like the brother said -- solutions. You know, forums are great but we have to try to find solutions. And again, we're just around the corner, we have to find a way to reach the youth and obviously the aging population. Okay. That's it.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Can we have our Outreach Director --

MR. NELSON: They were there today, so I'll give them credit. He did come by the office today.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: -- and here's another one, right here, so we will continue to try to work together.

MR. DARCHE: Give our regards to Bishop Taylor.

MR. NELSON: Yeah, I know you guys know Bishop Tayor, our CEO.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

We have Mirian Jones. Did I get that right?

MS. JONES: Good evening everybody. My name is Miriam Jones, and I'm also from Urban Upbound.
I run the College Access Department and I'm the College Access Coordinator. I actually sent, for the last four years, I've sent my high school interns to CCRB to intern in the summer.

I'm very familiar with CCRB, but after hearing everybody talk, especially you, and the religious figure as well, I definitely see that there is a need to get to the youth.

This Friday I'm actually having a session with -- what's your name again -- Tricia -- she's coming to my organization to speak to the youth about Know Your Rights.

Phil teaches financial literacy, I do college prep workshops, and you know, unfortunately, we have to have children know their rights. So, you know what to do if a creditor calls you saying you owe a debt, and what to do if you owe a loan. Since there is a problem that exist, we have to you know, know what to do if you get into an issue with a police officer.

So, I just recently -- I used to only teach high school students, but recently we partnered with HRA for young adults that are 18
to 24 year olds to come to our program every day. A lot of them are undereducated, or they may have records, or they may have had encounters with the police, and I guarantee you that they don't know about CCRB.

And I definitely want to make a conscious effort for, you know, the youth and communities like this and for people that look like me, to know what they can do when they're approached by police officers or if have an issue with police officers. I'm going to help the outreach team too, since I have worked with CCRB for the last four years. My boss was on the board and I've sent many -- at least 16 -- interns to you guys.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. I think that is the end of the -- no, I have an L. Picard.

MS. PICARD: Yes, that is a correct.

Good evening, I'm the mother of an adolescent child. I'm here about police activities with the adolescent children. Not just the children that your are able to turn into prisoners or make the count at the end of
the month.

There's a situation going on in district 30, and I'm not sure if any of these parents who have children in district 30 are aware of a Ms. Dionne Jaggon, who is married to a police officer, who is just outrageous when it comes to the discipline inside of PS 111 Community School Jacob Blackwell. District 30, Dr. Composto has been aware of these situations. I have brought it to his attention. It took me eight visits, lasting four hours each, in order to get my daughter an emergency safety transfer after she was assaulted by Ms. Jaggon, and it is on camera.

District 30 -- I went to the district. I filed a complete report with the district and Dr. Composto showed me what he filed, three complaints, not even a paragraph.

He also filed a complaint stating that it was handled, the parent is satisfied. The parent is not satisfied. The child is not satisfied.

And if the police would like to, like maybe get another PAL because PAL is seven blocks from here.
We have a hard time letting our children going to the corner store, especially with all this new violence activity happening in the neighborhood.

So, there is a lot going on in District 30, within this Long Island City, Astoria community. That's several schools --

MR. DARCHE: Ma'am, are these problems with police officers or are these problems within the schools about students, among the students themselves?

MS. PICARD: Ms. Jaggon put her hand on my child and --

MR. DARCHE: The teacher?

MS. PICARD: She's the principal.

MR. DARCHE: Oh, okay.

MS. PICARD: And the school did not have a first grade teacher for eight months. I complained to the district about these things.

I'm not exactly sure, I know this is about police and everything like that, but the safety officer, who is still working there, informed me of several routes to take. And I do have my hands on the security tape where this woman is putting her hand on my daughter.
So, District 30 and the police, you should all been aware of what might be going on, coming soon.

So, I would like to thank you all for coming out to the community and finding out what's happening, and 8, 9, 5, 6, 7, two and a half, they go to early childhood development --

MR. DARCHÉ: So, it is either Charlie or Patrick in the back?

MS. PICARD: I filed my complaint with these young men already.

MR. DARCHÉ: Oh, okay, so thank you very much ma'am.

MS. PICARD: All right. Thank you and have a good night.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you very much.

So, I'm going to ask our board member, Angela Fernandez, if she will say a few words in Spanish and then we'll see if there are any people who want to make comments in Spanish and she can translate.

SPEAKER: Is there any public speaking time left?

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No, I'm sorry. Well, other than to hear from people who haven't
already spoken and who like to speak in Spanish only.

SPEAKER: We haven't heard anything from the police officers and community officers.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We gave them an opportunity to speak.

(Mr. Fernandez addresses audience in Spanish.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Then we'll have the one final person in the back who said they wanted to speak, for two minutes, and then we'll move on with the agenda.

SPEAKER: I'll be really quick. There's a lot conversation about the youth and --

MR. DARCH: Can you give us your name?

SPEAKER: I'm good. There's a lot of conversation about the youth, and seeing as I'm a young person myself, I'm 21, and a lot of my close colleagues are in college or high school, I live right next to Jamaica High School, and I think we need to be a little more clarification -- but I really want to backtrack to some of the comments that were made earlier.

And to clarify, it shouldn't be on the burden of people who are victims of police
misconduct, police brutality to then take their traumas and go to those people who are causing that in order to get justice. Justice should just naturally flow down.

But one thing when it comes to the youth, there was this one comment that was made, you know, it a marathon and not a sprint. I think that's kind of a little bit insulting to the intelligence of everybody that's in here because of the fact that 400 years is a long ass marathon in order to get justice. And the fact that we all kind of know the systematic things that are going on. And one problem with the CCRB is that through its complaint system, it treats these things as individual cases of misconduct. It doesn't actually attack the systematic idea and the premise that the brother was touching upon.

(Police exit.)

SPEAKER: Awesome. Good to see them go.

So, see, this is the type of disconnect that happens when other people are speaking and when the meeting isn't finished, you have the people who are supposed to serve our communities just walk out.
MR. LOGAN: That's what I was speaking about.

SPEAKER: After they took the pictures, sat in the back --

MR. LOGAN: That's right.

SPEAKER: -- they walk out. See, this is the type of behavior that the youth see, but what's worse is we're expected to show up to Know Your Rights Campaigns. We're supposed to show up at each and every type of instance, and what that does is it tells us that police misconduct is normal. That through Knowing Your Rights, they're going to be a abridged at some point, so make sure you're ready up. That you're going to be stopped on the sidewalk, that your humanity at each and every turn, from when you walk to the corner store, to when you're coming to the library, or when you're in the school with the safety officers, that those types of things are normal. And I'm here to tell you it's not.

MR. LOGAN: That's right.

SPEAKER: So, me asking a lot of my colleagues to come here tonight -- I told a lot of my friends, a lot of high schoolers -- hey,
I know you have a lot of things going on, but I said, come -- and you know what they said? No.

Like this question is always framed to the youth but the answer is no, because why, why would I want to show up here and talk to people who, one, aren't listening to the fact there is a disconnect, but to hear the constant framing of this issue as a, dialogue, as if our experiences are the same. As if the experiences of people who are subject -- I'll finish, don't worry -- people who are subject to misconduct and people who perpetuate misconduct, those experiences are on the same plane.

But what should really be talked about is, and what the CCRB should really recommend is actually investing in our communities, right? People don't want to grow up and commit crimes. My peers don't want to --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I'm going to have to have to ask you to wrap it up.

SPEAKER: I got you, don't worry. So people, I find it funny, the day that I'll be convinced that we need an increase in police officers and we need this dialogue to happen is
when we show up to show-and-tell days, or
what-do-you-want-to-be career days, and people
are saying, I want to grow up and be a
criminal. That's the day that I'll
understanding why we need to have increased
enforcement of police officers in our community
is when people decide when they grow up they
want to rob the local corner store, right?
People don't want to do that. What should
really be discussed here is how can we better
invest in our youth, invest in our communities
so that these things don't happen in the first
place.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

SPEAKER: Hold on -- I'm almost done.

Rather than diagnosing the problems, we should
have a solution to the problems.

MR. LOGAN: Please let him finish.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. Thank you.

SPEAKER: I'm almost done.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No, you're done.

SPEAKER: I'm almost done.

MR. LOGAN: Mr. Chair?

SPEAKER: Let me wrap up --

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No you are done.
SPEAKER: -- all I want to do is wrap up. I'm going to finish.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We are going to cut off the mic. I'll give you ten seconds and then we're done. Thank you.


ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. We are done. So, who has the mic? Soren?

SPEAKER: How is this engaging? All I wanted to do was wrap up. How is this engaging? I'm going to finish anyway. So, what should really be discussed here is how we can actually embolden the youth to come out here, not to show up for a photo op, not to show up to get shut down, but to show up in a way that actually empowers them.

What a lot of this is inspiring people to come here, without actually giving them the tools to solve their own communities. What we should be asking people is why they feel that it's necessary to have police in their communities in the first place. Why should we have this conversation in the first place? But the dialogue is all wrong. We're not speaking
the same language, and we not coming from the same place.

So, what you guys need to do is take a step back.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

SPEAKER: What you guys need to do are research and studies about how you can help empower the youth, not just ask them to show up to some bullshit meeting.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

(Some clapping.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We have Vanessa Jones. It seems she signed up to speak as well. Okay. Ms. Jones, two minutes, please.

MS. JONES: Good evening everyone. My name is Vanessa Jones Hall. I'm from Astoria Housing and Residents Association as well as a community board member of one.

I'm sorry that had to happen to you young man, although the time is limited. But what you said was very positive.

In my own community we had to fight for those NCOs who are bombarded, and who are overwhelmed, that come into protect our neighborhood. We had to really fight for the
officers to come and walk the beat, like it used to be when I was young.

And when the officers were part of the community, they became part of the family. And when you have officers coming in and engaging in your community -- engaging in your community is not riding through in your vehicle. Because that's intimidating. Engaging is actually coming in and meet and greeting with the residents of the community that they're in. Come in to say hello. Speak to them. Have a conversation. Not just try to inquire about what just happen, or what is about to happen, or what might occur, but have a general conversation. Just a pow wow. Just to see where everyone is coming from. And there you will see a better relation, because if I'm going to be out there, as a resident's associate member, or even as a community board member, and tell the youth, the young people to respect law, they have to see for themselves that the law is being respected.

And you have to make sure when you say that you're here to serve the people of the communities that all these officers serve, I'm
in the 114 precinct, PSA9, and we do have PSA9 officers that are very engaging. Our N C.O. officers are very engaging. But the 114th precinct, when they came out to our community they did a planned raid. Two school terms ago, beginning of the school year, in Astoria houses, and they planned it on the first day of school. And that was so disheartening to our community. It was terrifying to our community. We had children that had to be sent home because they were terrified. We had residents who were waiting to get on the bus to go to work who was terrified.

     Now this was a planned thing, it wouldn't have wouldn't have been done in any other neighborhood.

     MR. CARTER: That's right.

     MS. JONES: It was unfair. We got apologies from the 114, only because we came out in outrage of how dare they did that to us.

     Now, it's one thing to say you're going to plan a raid, because like us, we would like to get rid of those element in our community but there is certain way of how you do it, and what was done is we were terrorize, the entire
community, when this took place.

I just want to say, like everyone else said, let's properly engage one another. Let's properly give each other respect. Because, just like us, we want to feel safe in our communities. Just like us, we want to make sure that the law is respected. Just like us, we want the law to enter our communities with respect.

Have a good night everyone.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you so very much. Thank you.

That ends the Public Comment Section of the meeting.

We will move to see if there is any Old Business to come before the board?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Any New Business to come before the board?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Hearing none I have a motion to adjourn to Executive Session. Is there a motion?

MR. DARCHE: Motion.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Is there a second?
MR. EASON: Second.

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All those in favor of adjourning to Executives Session, please say aye.

(A chorus of ayes)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Any opposition?

(No response.)

ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you all. We will adjourn to Executives Session. I thank you all for coming. Thank you for your comments. I want you to know you have been heard. And I want you to know that we don't meet here and not take it seriously. So, keep fighting. Keep contributing. Keep being good citizens. And we are hear to do it with you.

Thank you so much. The meeting is being adjourned to Executive Session.

(Whereupon, the board holds an Executive Session.)

(Whereupon, the board meeting concludes.)
STATE OF NEW YORK )
 ) ss.
COUNTY OF WESTCHESTER )

I, DEIRDRE SMITH, Court Reporter and Notary Public within and for the County of Westchester, State of New York, do hereby certify that I reported the proceedings that are hereinbefore set forth, and that such transcript is a true and accurate record of said proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

WITNESS MY HAND, this 6th day of February, 2018.

Deirdre Smith

Deirdre Smith               My commision expires:  
Notary Public              April, 2019
sincerely (1) 86:13
serve (14) 5:6 20:19 24:3,22 25:1
67:13 77:24 83:24,25
served (1) 40:21
service (8) 11:9 33:15 45:7 49:20
65:2 66:24 67:12 68:8
services (5) 4:10 63:22 66:14,15
68:3
serving (1) 62:23
session (7) 2:12 71:10 85:22 86:3
86:9,17,19
set (2) 62:18 87:10
settlement (1) 39:17
seven (1) 73:24
severe (2) 30:14 32:1
sex (1) 18:19
Sharif (1) 39:17
sharing (1) 30:5
shelter (1) 66:2
shelters (2) 65:3,5
shield (1) 7:8
shift (1) 5:17
shoot (1) 53:4
shootings (1) 24:17
shops (1) 71:15
short (2) 42:20 44:25
shot (1) 19:8
show (13) 14:7 15:6 48:3,21 51:13
78:8,10 79:5 80:1 81:15,16
82:8
show-and-tell (1) 80:1
showed (1) 73:17
showing (3) 26:9 28:22 62:12
shown (1) 81:16
side (5) 5:6 35:25 49:16 57:5 63:2
sides (1) 61:1
sidewalk (2) 69:17 78:15
signed (3) 13:14 62:7 82:13
significant (2) 7:2 39:15
similar (2) 20:14 48:17
Simotas' (1) 9:9
sir (1) 19:25
sister (1) 41:9
sites (1) 68:14
situation (4) 15:2,2 18:5 73:2
situations (2) 19:13 73:10
six (3) 21:14 24:15 27:5
slam (1) 62:19
Sligh (9) 9:8 12:19,22 13:5,11
slinging (1) 19:8
slow (1) 23:3
slowing (1) 27:23
small (2) 4:15 20:20
Smith (4) 1:19 10:2 87:6,21
snapshot (1) 47:5
solution (1) 80:17
solutions (8) 37:5,8,12 41:13,13
63:8 70:2,3
solve (1) 81:20
solved (1) 42:3
somebody (2) 17:21,22
somewhat (2) 35:20,21
son (2) 10:7 21:14
soon (4) 54:6 68:2 69:24 75:3
Soren (1) 81:9
sorry (3) 13:17 75:24 82:19
sort (1) 25:15
Southeast (1) 15:13
Spanish (4) 75:19,20 76:1,8
speak (18) 13:14,15 23:25 44:11
44:17 54:15 58:18 59:21 60:15
61:8 62:7 65:22 71:12 76:1,6,11
82:13 83:11
speaker (22) 4:14 13:22 20:9
32:22 34:19 75:22 76:3,13,16
77:20 78:3,6,23 79:22 80:15,20
80:22,24 81:1,6 10 82:6
speaker's (1) 64:19
speakers (8) 4:1 13:18,20 23:20
44:11 64:19,22 66:11
speaking (8) 17:10 20:13 54:18
60:12 75:22 77:22 78:1 81:25
speaks (1) 43:23
special (5) 16:14,15 17:6,14 64:25
specific (1) 51:10
specifically (2) 10:19 53:8
specifications (1) 50:18
Spitzer (1) 36:9
spoke (2) 10:24 59:22
spoken (1) 76:1
spread (1) 60:3
sprite (2) 42:17 77:7
squads (1) 17:7
ss (1) 87:3
staff (8) 5:8 10:3 33:13,20 34:18,21
43:23 44:20
stand (2) 10:9 46:4
standup (1) 46:7
start (5) 36:13,21 38:19 54:17 60:2
starts (1) 69:24
state (6) 18:12 35:10 55:8,10 87:2
87:8
states (2) 18:13 45:4
statistical (1) 52:16
statting (2) 40:5 73:19
statistic (1) 6:13
statistics (5) 6:11 10:20,22 33:14
33:17
status (1) 64:8
stay (3) 28:15 34:9,11
stays (1) 67:16
step (2) 50:5 82:4
stepped (1) 38:24
stigmatization (1) 33:4
Stinson (1) 39:17
stood (1) 44:3
stop (9) 7:11 37:20,21 38:8,14 43:7
56:12,14,19
stopped (7) 11:4 38:3 56:11,12,18
69:13 78:15
stops (2) 38:5,10
store (5) 21:4 53:6 74:2 78:17 80:8
stranger (2) 18:4,6
street (4) 1:6 24:19 40:17 69:21
streets (1) 63:6
stroke (1) 61:17
stronger (1) 43:10
strongest (1) 43:8
structures (1) 22:5
student (1) 32:14
students (3) 71:24 74:10,11
studies (2) 51:14 82:7
subject (2) 79:10,11
substantial (1) 58:2
substantiate (2) 50:4 56:7
substantiated (7) 49:1,18 50:1,7
50:15,23 51:23
substantiation (1) 50:12
substantiations/unsubstantiated...
48:23
Sudan (1) 20:22
sudden (1) 32:8
sued (1) 39:5
sufficiently (1) 32:9
suggest (1) 66:4
suggests (1) 49:8
suit (2) 39:5,12
sum (4) 19:1,2 23:1 39:21
summer (3) 29:25 32:17 71:5
Sunday (2) 17:17 21:6
supervisors (1) 40:6
support (1) 33:19
supporting (1) 22:14
supposed (10) 26:4,11,13 27:6,22
28:11,14,24 77:24 78:9
sure (13) 13:5 29:9,12 32:20,23
33:25 41:7 52:21 73:3 74:20
78:14 83:23 85:7
surrounding (1) 25:20
surveillance (1) 54:12
Susan (3) 4:10 66:11,12
suspect (1) 38:7
sweep (1) 61:25
system (3) 17:5 43:19 77:14
systematic (2) 77:12,17
systems (1) 23:11

T

table (2) 29:5 60:8
tactic (1) 15:9
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>37-44 (1)</td>
<td>1:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 (2)</td>
<td>2:6 36:19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400 (2)</td>
<td>58:6 77:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 (1)</td>
<td>28:13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 (3)</td>
<td>2:7 36:19 75:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 (2)</td>
<td>38:14 56:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54 (1)</td>
<td>50:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>557 (1)</td>
<td>48:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 (2)</td>
<td>2:8 75:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:30 (1)</td>
<td>1:5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6th (1)</td>
<td>87:18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 (2)</td>
<td>2:9 75:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 (2)</td>
<td>2:10 75:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 (2)</td>
<td>2:11 75:6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>