

**Minutes for the June 18, 2019 Meeting of the  
New York City Charter Revision Commission 2019**

A duly noticed meeting of the New York City Charter Revision Commission 2019 was held in the Committee Room at City Hall in Manhattan at 6:00pm on June 18, 2019.

The Chair, Gail Benjamin, presided at the meeting. The Chair called the meeting to order at 6:16pm. Also present were the following members of the Commission:

- Sal Albanese
- Dr. Lilliam Barrios-Paoli
- Lisette Camilo
- James Caras
- Eduardo Cordero
- Stephen Fiala
- Paula Gavin
- Lindsay Greene
- Alison Hirsh
- Rev. Clinton Miller
- Sateesh Nori
- Dr. Meryll Tisch
- James Vacca
- Carl Weisbrod

The chair acknowledged the presence of a quorum.

DRAFT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY COMMISSION

A motion was made by Commissioner Gavin to adopt the Minutes of the June 12, 2019 meeting of the Commission. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted unanimously by all Commission members present.

Chair Benjamin explained that the Commission would continue to discuss, debate and make decisions about which proposals for Charter amendments should be drafted by staff for the Commission's approval (along with all necessary materials) and placement on the ballot at the November 2019 general election. She went on to explain that this meeting would focus (i) the proposals referred back to staff from the Commission's June 12, 2019 public meeting for further review and re-presentation to the Commission for consideration; and (ii) the proposals that staff had not recommended, or which may have insufficient commissioner support, but which at least one commissioner wanted to raise. Instructions to staff regarding ten proposals were discussed, amended, adopted and/or rejected in turn by the Commission as described below.

The Commission first considered a revised Proposal No. 8 related to establishing a guaranteed Civilian Complaint Review Board (CCRB) budget which was revised pursuant to the Commission's instruction to staff at its June 12, 2018 public meeting (see attached 6/18/19 Draft Guaranteed Budget Proposals – Revised). A motion was made by Commissioner Greene to amend Revised Proposal No. 8 from one based on a percentage of the personnel budget of the New York City Police Department (NYPD) to one based on a ratio of 0.61% of the CCRB headcount to the number of uniformed headcount of the NYPD. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of seven in the affirmative (Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Cordero, Gavin, Greene, Weisbrod) and six in the negative (Benjamin, Caras, Fiala, Hirsh, Nori, Vacca). Following this vote, a motion was made by Chair Benjamin to further amend Revised

DRAFT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY COMMISSION

Proposal No. 8 to clarify the language regarding when the Mayor is permitted to make a determination that it is fiscally necessary to fund CCRB's personnel budget at an amount lower than otherwise mandated by this new requirement. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of ten in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Cordero, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Weisbrod), three in the negative (Fiala, Nori, Vacca), and one abstention (Tisch). Following this vote, a motion was made by Commissioner Nori to further amend Revised Proposal No. 8 to establish that the minimum ratio of CCRB staff to uniformed NYPD officers be 0.71% rather than 0.61%. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of twelve in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Cordero, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Nori, Vacca, Weisbrod), one in the negative (Fiala), and one abstention (Tisch). Following this vote, a motion was made by Commissioner Hirsh to further amend Revised Proposal No. 8 to clarify that it would go into effect for the fiscal year 2021 budget cycle. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of thirteen in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Cordero, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Vacca, and Weisbrod), one in the negative (Fiala), and one abstention (Tisch). Following this vote, a motion was made by Chair Benjamin to adopt Revised Proposal No. 8 related to a guaranteed CCRB budget, as amended. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of thirteen in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Cordero, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Vacca, and Weisbrod), one in the negative (Fiala), and one abstention (Tisch).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a revised Proposal No. 16 related to establishing guaranteed budgets for the offices of Public Advocate and Borough President, which was revised

DRAFT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY COMMISSION

pursuant to the Commission's instruction to staff at its June 12, 2018 public meeting (see attached 6/18/19 Draft Guaranteed Budget Proposals – Revised). A motion was made by Commissioner Camilo to amend Revised Proposal No. 16 to guarantee that the budgets for these offices be based on the budget for the office of the Mayor, excluding the office of Management and Budget, the office of Labor Relations, and the office of Contract Services, rather than having these budgets be based on the lesser of inflation or the overall increase in the City's budget. The motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of six in the affirmative (Albanese, Camilo, Gavin, Greene, Miller, Weisbrod) and nine in the negative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Caras, Cordero, Fiala, Hirsh, Nori, Tisch, Vacca, Weisbrod). Following this vote, a motion was made by Chair Benjamin to amend Revised Proposal No. 8 to clarify that downward departures in allocated funding were permissible in times of deflation or a year-over-year decrease in total City spending. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by all members present (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Cordero, Fiala, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Vacca, Tisch and Weisbrod). Following this vote, a motion was made by Chair Benjamin to adopt Revised Proposal No. 16 related to guaranteed budgets for the offices of Public Advocate and Borough President, as amended. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of eleven in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Caras, Cordero, Fiala, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Tisch, Vacca) and four in the negative (Camilo, Gavin, Greene, Weisbrod).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Albanese to establish a "democracy vouchers" system for financing local elections. A motion was made by Commissioner Albanese to adopt this proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of five in the affirmative (Albanese, Cordero, Fiala, Miller, Nori) and ten in the

DRAFT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY COMMISSION

negative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Tisch, Vacca, Weisbrod).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Albanese to establish a two-year appearance ban for elected officials and senior appointed officials. A motion was made by Commissioner Albanese to adopt this proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of thirteen in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Caras, Cordero, Fiala, Gavin, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Tisch, Vacca, Weisbrod) and two abstentions (Camilo, Greene).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Albanese to prohibit members of the Conflicts of Interest Board from making political donations to candidates for local office. A motion was made by Commissioner Albanese to adopt this proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of nine in the affirmative (Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Cordero, Fiala, Gavin, Miller, Nori, Tisch, Vacca), five in the negative (Benjamin, Camilo, Caras, Greene, Weisbrod), and one abstention (Tisch).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Caras to clarify the Mayor's budget impoundment power. A motion was made by Commissioner Caras to adopt this proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of one in the affirmative (Caras) and fourteen in the negative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Cordero, Fiala, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Tisch, Vacca, Weisbrod).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Albanese to establish a commission to study the management and investment performance of the City's public pension funds. A motion was made by Commissioner Albanese to adopt this proposal. The

motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of four in the affirmative (Albanese, Cordero, Fiala, Miller) and eleven in the negative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Nori, Tisch, Vacca, Weisbrod).

Thereafter, the Commission discussed a proposal by Commissioner Albanese to prohibit employees and advisors of real estate firms from serving on a variety of boards that regulate land use such as the City Planning Commission. Commissioner Albanese made a motion on this proposal, but withdrew it prior to a vote being taken.

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Fiala to give Borough Presidents the power to call a “Borough Joint-Agency Technical Review Meeting” that would require the attendance of representatives from a variety of agencies to review, discuss, schedule and coordinate land use proposals, infrastructure, and building projects within the borough, including but not limited to review and discussion of pre-application materials for land use applications. A motion was made by Commissioner Fiala to adopt this proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of seven in the affirmative (Albanese, Caras, Cordero, Fiala, Miller, Nori, Vacca) and eight in the negative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Tisch, Weisbrod).

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Vacca to require that Community Boards and the office of the applicable Borough President be included in inter-agency pre-certification meetings on Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP) applications held by the Department of City Planning. A motion was made by Commissioner Vacca adopt this proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of six in

DRAFT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY COMMISSION

the affirmative (Albanese, Caras, Cordero, Fiala, Miller, Vacca) and nine in the negative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Nori, Tisch, Weisbrod).

Thereafter, a motion was made by Commissioner Weisbrod to reconsider Proposal No. 7 related to false official statements in CCRB matters, which had been previously voted on by the Commission at its public meeting of June 12, 2019. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of twelve in the affirmative (Benjamin, Albanese, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Cordero, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Weisbrod), two in the negative (Fiala, Vacca) and one abstention (Tisch).

Thereafter, the Commission re-considered Proposal No. 7 related to false official statements on CCRB matters. A motion was made by Chair Benjamin to adopt Proposal No. 7 related to false official statements on CCRB matters. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted by a vote of eight in the affirmative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Caras, Cordero, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Weisbrod), six in the negative (Albanese, Camilo, Fiala, Gavin, Greene, Vacca) and one abstention (Tisch).

Thereafter, the Commission discussed a proposal by Commissioner Albanese to establish a commission to study the establishment of a “democracy vouchers” program for local elections and, if the study concluded that it was deserving, to put the issue before the voters as a referendum in 2021. Commissioner Albanese made a motion on this proposal, but withdrew it prior to a vote being taken.

Thereafter, the Commission considered a proposal by Commissioner Vacca to prohibit lobbyists from serving on the City Planning Commission. A motion was made by Commissioner Vacca to adopt the proposal. The motion was seconded and subsequently failed by a vote of three

DRAFT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY COMMISSION

in the affirmative (Albanese, Cordero, Vacca) and twelve in the negative (Benjamin, Barrios-Paoli, Camilo, Caras, Fiala, Gavin, Greene, Hirsh, Miller, Nori, Tisch, Weisbrod).

Finally, a motion was made by Commissioner Barrios-Paoli to adjourn. The motion was seconded and subsequently adopted unanimously by all Commission members present.

The meeting adjourned at 10:22pm.

[Attachment]