

CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION MEETING

TWEED COURTHOUSE

52 CHAMBERS STREET

NEW YORK, NEW YORK

8:58 A.M.

CHAIR: DR. MATTHEW GOLDSTEIN

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

JOHN H. BANKS, VICE CHAIR

ANTHONY PEREZ CASSINO

BETTY Y. CHEN

DAVID CHEN

HOPE COHEN

ANTHONY W. CROWELL

STEPHEN FIALA

ANGELA MARIANA FREYRE, SECRETARY

ERNEST HART

REV. JOSEPH M. Mc SHANE, S.J.

KENNETH M. MOLTNER

KATHERYN PATTERSON

CARLO A. SCISSURA

BISHOP MITCHELL G. TAYLOR

1

2

3

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Good

4

morning, I'm Matthew Goldstein. I'm

5

the Chair of the Charter Revision

6

Commission. I'd like to call this

7

meeting to order.

8

I'm told by counsel that we

9

have a quorum so that we can

10

officially conduct our business.

11

Let me just sort of outline in

12

a very broad strokes where we have

13

been and where we will be going. And

14

then very quickly I'm going to turn

15

these proceedings over to our

16

Executive Director Lorna Goodman and

17

any members of her staff that wish to

18

participate to really fill in, in

19

much greater detail the journey that

20

we have remaining.

21

Very briefly, up to this

22

particular point we have had five

23

open forums, one in each Borough.

24

During those forums we have heard

25

from a large group of people who

1
2 expressed their views about the
3 existing Charter and what
4 modifications to that Charter they
5 deem to be appropriate and timely.

6 As a result of that large
7 amount of testimony, the staff has
8 been very, very busy absorbing that
9 material, as our members of the
10 Commission, so we've been very, very
11 active in a listening mode, and we
12 will continue our listening over the
13 next couple of months but with a
14 little more participation as time
15 goes by.

16 After today's meeting we will
17 have a meeting with the full
18 Commission and a group of prior
19 Commission heads of Commissions that
20 have taken place in the past. And
21 when the names of those individuals
22 that will be participating are fully
23 known certainly we will make that
24 known to everybody.

25 The purpose of this, which is

1
2 not commonly done but we believe will
3 help inform the Commission, is that
4 seeing their experiences, kinds of
5 things that they confronted, will
6 help educate us even further than we
7 are today, so we look forward to
8 that, and when I call on Lorna, she
9 will give you more detail.

10 After that particular event, we
11 will have five issue forums. And we
12 will talk about the issues as a
13 result of actions that this
14 Commission will take later this
15 morning. But that again is about the
16 Commission and its staff to really
17 drill deep down into the bedrock of
18 issues that we believe as a result of
19 the five forums that we have already
20 had represent what I would consider
21 the major mass of ideas that we have
22 uncovered. And we will bring
23 together extraordinary people of
24 great reputation, blending people
25 with different views on the issues

1
2 that we will be discussing. We will
3 have academics. We'll have people
4 who practice in the City and beyond
5 who have their own experiences to
6 bring to the issues that we will be
7 discussing. And that will take us
8 well into towards the end of June as
9 we go through those issue forums.

10 The next event will be for the
11 Commission to meet and again assess
12 what we have learned, and staff will
13 prepare for us a briefing paper that
14 really will consolidate the issues in
15 ways that can bring some action that
16 the Commission wishes to make public,
17 and we expect that that will happen
18 by the early part of July.

19 Once that event is fulfilled,
20 we go back into the field. We will be
21 back with open forums, one in each
22 Borough, whereby the Commission will
23 come forward with ideas that we would
24 like to hear reactions by people who
25 will be coming up and testifying. And

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

obviously our ideas will be shaped,
maybe altered to some extent, as we
understand reaction of the various
individuals that will be coming up to
react to what it is that we're
proposing.

After that event occurs, the
Commission has to make a very pivotal
decision, and that decision is
whether to cull from a very wide
range of issues a subset of issues
that we believe ought to be responded
to by referendum in November of 2010.
That will be a decision that we will
have to make. Whether we do that or
whether we hold back. And that is yet
to the future.

I'm told that that event has to
take place prior to September 2nd of
2010 in order for us to satisfy the
legal requirements for getting
something on the ballot for the
voters to respond.

So that is a fairly, how shall

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I say it, gestalt view of how we are going to proceed.

But now I want to pass the microphone to our very distinguished Executive Director Lorna Goodman who has been working tirelessly with a very, very impressive staff of people. I know that they're working hard, because I call them early in the morning, I call them late at night, and they're all working, so they are very, very busy.

So Lorna, do you want to come up and help us to understand? Let me give you a microphone. Or come up here. Why don't you do that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR GOODMAN:

Good morning, Commissioners. I'm Lorna Goodman. I'm the Executive Director of the New York City Charter Revision Commission.

First, I'd like to introduce my staff who we were able to put together on very short notice, but I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

think we have a very good group of people who, as the Chancellor has mentioned, have been working very, very hard.

First I'd like to introduce Ruth Markovitz, who is the Deputy Director. Ruth, please stand up.

And then we have our Research Director, Joe Vitteretti. Joe, you just want to show yourself?

And then we have our Administrative Director, Lisa Opal Jones. Lisa, where are you? Where'd she go? There she is.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: She is administering something.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR GOODMAN: Yes, she is administering.

And then we have Senior Counsel Myles Kuwahara.

Myles?

And Senior Counselor Ashley Goodale.

And Lisa Grumet from the Law

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Department who's been loaned to us.

And our -- oh, yes, I'm so
sorry. Our General Counsel Rick
Schaffer. Rick, where are you?

Matt Gorton, our Communications
Director.

And Jay Hershenson, our Senior
Advisor for Communications.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Mr. Fields,
our parliamentarian.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR GOODMAN: Oh
yes, Mr. Fields. Hi.

I want to tell you what we've
been doing. We all attended the five
hearings in the five Boroughs, and
we've had the -- all the issues,
we've collated all of those issues,
and we've come up essentially with
five areas which we think encompass
virtually all of those issues. And
the next five forums will cover those
issues. It doesn't mean that that's
the only thing that the Commission is
looking at, but these are the major

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

areas. And most issues will fit within those five categories.

The five categories are: Land use, focussing mainly on the ULURP procedure; term limits, which we all know what that is; voter participation, which will encompass nonpartisan vote -- nonpartisan elections as well as ways to increase the number of people who are voting; balance of powers, which we'll talk about at the Community Boards and the Borough Presidents and the City Council; and finally, fiscal integrity. We'll talk about the ethics issues, the Conflict of Interest Board, and the whole question of independent budgets for certain groups.

So we have looked at all of those issues. These are the issues that you, the public, told us they wanted to look at. And we've met with all of the Commissioners, the staff

1
2 has met with the Commissioners, and
3 we see them and talk with them
4 frequently. And we're very hard at
5 work trying to put together these
6 five forums and to prepare a
7 preliminary report by the end of
8 June.

9 CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Thank you.
10 At this particular point I would like
11 to call on Commissioner Fiala, who
12 will read a Resolution that derives
13 from what Lorna Goodman just said.
14 And I think at that particular point
15 in time there may be a number of
16 Commissioners that want to be heard
17 on that Resolution before we take the
18 next step of breaking it up to a
19 formal vote, which will then allow us
20 to take the steps that I outlined
21 briefly and what Lorna outlined.

22 So Commissioner Fiala, may I
23 ask that you read the Resolution?

24 COMMISSIONER FIALA: Certainly.
25 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Resolution number 2010 New York
City City Charter Revision.

Whereas, the 2010 New York City
Charter Commission has completed an
initial round of public hearings, one
in each Borough of the City; and

Whereas, the Commission has
heard and accepted written testimony
from elected officials and members of
the public at these meetings,
including the representatives of
public interest and advocacy groups,
political parties and private
citizens; and

Whereas in addition, the
Commission has encouraged public
comment through the mail and through
it's Web site; and

Whereas Commission staff has
also solicited comments and ideas
from heads of City departments and
their personnel; and

Whereas review of the
preliminary testimony and comments

1

2

received by the Commission indicates

3

widespread interest in the following

4

issues: Term limits, various measures

5

of electoral reform to increase voter

6

participation; land use issues,

7

including the roles of Community

8

Boards and Borough Presidents and the

9

Uniform Land Use (ULURP) Procedure;

10

the structure of the City of New

11

York; budget; and government

12

integrity and transparency; now,

13

therefore, be it

14

Resolved, that the Commission

15

further invite further discussion and

16

testimony, research and analysis from

17

experts and practitioners in this

18

issues; and may it be further

19

Resolved, that the Commission

20

direct staff to further research and

21

analyze these issues; and may it

22

further

23

Resolve that the Commission

24

arrange for experts and practitioners

25

in these areas to participate in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

public panel discussions to be held
in the Boroughs during the months of
May and June; and be it further

Resolved, that at the
conclusion of these discussions,
staff shall prepare a report
summarizing and analyzing the results
of said discussions and other
research and containing its
preliminary recommendations.

Offer this, the 10th day of
May, 2010 for consideration by the
Commission, I move that it be
discussed, debated and voted on,
Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Thank you,
Commissioner Fiala. I will second
that Resolution and open it up for
questions or comments by any members
of the Commission.

Yes, Commissioner Scissura.

COMMISSIONER SCISSURA: Good
morning, Chancellor, thank you.

Two quick things on the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Resolution and also on some of the comments that were made this morning.

First of all, I think as we go out and have these issue forums and really start hearing about what people think about these issues, it's important to not just get input from what we call experts but to get input from New Yorkers. I would not support an issue forum where we are just hearing from a panel of what we perceive as experts if the people of New York are not given an opportunity to speak either through written means or public meeting. That's very important that we continue to allow New Yorkers to come out and hear. So that's one thing that I think needs to be either put into this Resolution or agreed on by the Commission.

My second issue is as we begin to look at specific issues, I think it's important that we look at setting up subcommittees that will

1
2 look at each individual issue. We
3 don't have to do that today. But I
4 do think it's something that this
5 Commission should really think about.

6 And then just briefly for the
7 third point that I wanted to make, as
8 we go out back into the Boroughs, I
9 really urge this Commission to do
10 something that I think we've all
11 agreed that is important, is to
12 really go out into the neighborhoods
13 of New York City and not just be at
14 the standard sites, but really go out
15 into communities so that they can be
16 heard. Thank you.

17 CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN:
18 Commissioner Scissura, let me respond
19 to all of the three that you just
20 mentioned.

21 Your first comment absolutely
22 has been endorsed, I believe, by all
23 of us.

24 When we do the issue forums not
25 only are we going to be listening to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

our expert panels but we will have opportunities to have comments from, because these are all going to be open to the public, and we're going to invite as many people as wish to show up to listen as we listen and we will ask for comments from the people in the audiences. And we will bring those views in consort with the testimony that we hear from the experts. So I totally subscribe to that, and it was always the intention to keep that open.

With respect to your third point about making sure that we get a balanced piece of geography in each of the Boroughs, that will be essential. We need to look at where we held the first group of forums and choose parts of those Boroughs that are different, far away, or give opportunities for people in those Boroughs that may have had difficulty getting, so we really want to open

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

this up as much as possible.

We have always expected, which is your second point, about impanelling groups of us to really take ownership to particular issues that are brought up and to work with staff to do a further refinement. So I view this whole process as a series of iterations that you come up with a certain set of ideas and you constantly refine those ideas by the use of experts, by people in the field, by members of the Commission. And at some point we're going to converge on a set of views that we as a Commission feel comfortable with and then bring forward our recommendation. Does that --

COMMISSIONER SCISSURA: Yes, it does, thank you.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Any other? Yes, Commissioner Hope Cohen.

COMMISSIONER COHEN: Yes, I think I want to kind of follow up

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

what Commissioner Scissura was saying.

First, the Resolution refers to the public comment that has already been gathered, and it has been substantial. Obviously, we had five substantial hearings and lots of additional material that has been submitted in other ways, but I think we have to make it clear that we are continuing to collect; that there has been no deadline; that we welcome organizations and members of the public to continue to contact us. And as their ideas get formulated, either in response to the panel discussions we'll be holding or just as an ongoing process. So I think we need to make it clear that there are still -- we continue to be open to receiving comments.

The other thing that I wanted to bring forward was the question of how we interact with the public, not

1

2

just that we go to different

3

locations for our meetings, which I

4

heartily endorse, but I think that we

5

should be using technology, which we

6

started to do, even more extensively

7

for our own transparency. And I

8

think that ultimately when we look at

9

the Charter there are opportunities

10

to increase the continuing

11

transparency and accessibility of

12

government through technological

13

tools.

14

Particularly what I like to

15

bring forward right now is perhaps

16

less for the panel discussions but

17

certainly by the time of the next

18

round of hearings that our Web casts

19

should not just be one with Web casts

20

but should be capable of receiving

21

input from members of the public

22

remotely.

23

There are all kinds of

24

technological tools that enable that,

25

and I think that not only physically

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

being in different places but making ourselves available in real time electronically would really open up this process.

I do have some concerns, coming from my Community Board background, and things that happen with public hearings in that context, about our next round of public hearings being in July. I certainly know from my Community Board background that Community Boards object and members of the public object that the summer months -- July, August particularly -- are not a welcoming time for public participation process, and it's always a hot button for things to be -- to have deadlines and hearings in July and August, so I just bring that forward as something that we have to figure out, how extensive we might want to do something in September, when in fact our only choice for public hearings

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to comment on it would be July and August.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: I appreciate those comments, Commissioner Cohen.

With your comment about Web casting, it's always been our intention to fully utilize the technology tools that exist today to allow not only one-way receipt but an interactive kind of effort. And I'm told by our technical people that that is the intention all along, and I expect that that will happen.

With respect to continuing to get commentary and reaction, that again is a given. I mean, I'm sure all of us individually, and, therefore, collectively, are in receipt of lots of individuals and also good government groups, newspapers, others that really feel a need and a sense of wanting to be heard. So I think that's important

1

2

all of that is communicated to our

3

staff, and so it is an ongoing

4

aggregation of material that we're

5

getting.

6

And lastly, your point about

7

the summer. Yes, the summer is a

8

sleepy time, but we were impaneled in

9

early March, and if our intention is

10

to make a decision with respect to

11

something on the ballot in September,

12

we don't really have much of an

13

opportunity to redo the calendar. I

14

understand that. And I think your

15

point is an important point, that

16

given that there may be less

17

propensity for people to come out in

18

July, we'll just have to work even

19

harder to get the numbers up. And so

20

I appreciate those comments.

21

Yes, Commissioner Cassino.

22

COMMISSIONER CASSINO: I wanted

23

to just make a follow-up comment

24

regarding outreach, which will be

25

decidedly low-tech in terms of what I

1

2

want to recommend. And that is I

3

think it be would helpful, I don't

4

know if the Commission can do this

5

because of time constraints, but I

6

have an opportunity often to attend

7

many meetings through my Borough, of

8

different organizations, Community

9

Groups, Community Boards. And I

10

think it makes sense if we, during

11

those outreach periods when we're out

12

in the Boroughs, we can do this, is

13

to be able to talk with the people

14

and let them know about the

15

Commission and our upcoming meetings

16

and we could have a set of talking

17

points and something to hand out in

18

our travels.

19

I think anytime we have

20

personal contact with the group it's

21

an opportunity to really publicize

22

and get the people engaged in a

23

different way. So sometimes that

24

personal touch, many of us have

25

obligations in our own Boroughs that

1
2 could lend themselves to having more
3 of a personal contact with groups. So
4 that if we have some talking points
5 and some material to hand out, I
6 think that would be helpful.

7 Also I want to thank the staff
8 for working with us in terms of
9 setting up location, talking about
10 venues and the Boroughs, trying to
11 balance that whole thing out. So I
12 appreciate that as well.

13 CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN:
14 Commissioner Cassino, I think those
15 are very good points, and Lorna would
16 agree, to which we can provide
17 briefing material that could be used
18 into the field.

19 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR GOODMAN:
20 Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: I think
22 that would be a very good thing to
23 do. I think that's a great comment,
24 Anthony. Thank you for that.

25 Yes, Commissioner Hart.

1

2

COMMISSIONER HART: I just want

3

to make a comment. Consistent with

4

Commissioner Cohen's concern, and I

5

think the concern that the Commission

6

has always been aware of, and that is

7

rushing issues to the ballot, which

8

is not the intent of the Commission,

9

I think as evinced by the Resolution

10

itself we voted on. It is approved.

11

Basically, what the Resolution

12

points out is that this will be a

13

deliberative process, and we will not

14

bring anything to the voters until we

15

feel that it is fully vetted and

16

investigated and we have gotten the

17

most expert opinion necessary in

18

order to feel comfortable that we are

19

doing the role that we were tasked to

20

do.

21

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN:

22

Commissioner Hart, I couldn't agree

23

more. I think you've heard me say

24

this many times that this has to be a

25

deliberative process, and what I mean

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

by a deliberative process is not playing at the issues but really having a sense of comfort; that we as a Commission really fully understand the issues as we can, and that is a given. I don't think anybody among us would have it any other way. So I appreciate you again in underlining that very important point. And that will be a guiding principle that we will follow as we continue on our work. So I appreciate you bringing that up.

Commissioner Scissura.

COMMISSIONER SCISSURA: One quick thing to follow up on what Commissioner Cassino said. I think, I don't know if it was yesterday or the day before, there was a great article about New York City's ethnic press, what richness we have in that, and I think it be would valuable for us to really get into all of New York City's ethnic presses, schedule them

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

for the next hearings as soon as we have them.

And the other thing I think would be interesting to do, I don't know how we do it, while we're doing the Facebook and we're doing all these great new technological things, I still think direct mailing is a great, great way to do it. And when we had a hearing in Brooklyn our Borough President sent mailings to all Community Board members and civic groups, and we had a great turnout. So I think it's important that as we have issue hearings that we look at some form of direct mailing to New Yorkers throughout the City.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: I do know that both Matt Gorton and Jay Hershenson have been talking about the ethnic presses, of which there are many, and more proliferating on a daily basis, to really inform them of our work. I know that they're taking

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

this very seriously and they will
continue to move very aggressively
and head in that direction.

Yes, Commissioner Fiala.

COMMISSIONER FIALA:

Mr. Chairman, I have served on a
previous Charter Revision Commission,
and I am a student of government and
have closely observed as a Councilman
and as a private citizen every
Commission since the Goodman
Commission.

I think it's important to
communicate to the public in this
public meeting, my perceptions:

1. The efforts of -- and I
share the sentiments, by the way, of
my fellow Commissioners, I share
their sentiments. I share their
concerns. But having had the
privilege of participating previously
and having closely witnessed the
efforts of previous commissions, it's
incumbent upon me to point out to the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

public that may be watching them on a Web cast that the outreach efforts of this Commission are impressive. And I myself wouldn't know how to work Facebook or a Twitter, but I do know that those outreach efforts are reaching people who do. A live Web cast is something we've never done before. The level of outreach that Jay and Matt have been working on, again, unprecedented. I appreciate all of those efforts.

I appreciate the concerns that holding meetings in the summer months are never convenient. In my daily life I serve as a Commissioner, and one of the things that I run is the Richmond County jury operation. What I like to tell potential jurors are, "It's January. I know this isn't convenient for you. Then comes July. It's not convenient there either. And it turns out it's a Mother's Day or Valentine's Day, Thanksgiving. So

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

it's never, ever convenient. There may be more times that are more convenient for more people. But the reality is in a Democracy, particularly as a representative Democracy, some level of engagement coupled with an informed citizenry are required."

I mean, those are the two requirements to ensure that Democracy, representative Democracy, particularly a republic as old as ours, continues to strive and move forward. So I don't share the same level of concern that the members of the general public do or probably members of the Commission do.

Democracy was never designed to be a spectator sport. It does require a little bit of effort every now and again. It is not unusual -- indeed it is the established norm -- that commissions do do work through the summer months. The Resolution before

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

us, and it still is before us, we need to vote on it, has in it in one of those resolved sections the words "preliminary". I said numerous times before there are three R's to the Charter Revision: Review, revise, resolve. And those are to help the younger students understand Charter Revision.

We're in the first stage, we're in the review phase. The expert forums, which are traditionally held in those warm summer months, have always been an opportunity to bring in experts, allow the Commissioners to engage them so as to inform our opinions to hopefully yield better decisions.

Then a preliminary document is presented to us by staff -- preliminary as opposed to final -- and all it does is outline for us in a more thoughtful format those things that we have heard throughout the

1

2

process. And then we get to decide

3

whether or not we're going to move

4

forward.

5

I think it's a very difficult

6

charge today, not only for a Charter

7

Revision Commission, but for elected

8

officials, appointed officials,

9

anybody trying to work for the public

10

good in government, it's becoming

11

increasingly difficult to try and

12

keep everyone focused on the same

13

page and remind us as, you said,

14

there are iterations, there's

15

sequence to events. And we're still

16

in that first iterative phase, and I

17

don't want the public to be misled

18

into thinking that somehow something

19

has been concluded that we're talking

20

about issuing final report.

21

The Resolution is specific. We

22

vote on the Resolution so as to

23

charge the staff with a task, a

24

series of tasks.

25

I think Carlos' point about

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

hearing from the public is a very,
very good one., and we have discussed
that informally. Perhaps we should
just add that one caveat in there,
that subsequent to the expert
testimony the public will be able to
testify. That had been our intent all
along based on the discussions we had
with Carlo and the other
Commissioners here, including myself.
So I do think that that's worthy of
having that one little caveat put in
there.

I point out finally, because
the facts don't cease to exist
because people choose to ignore them.
For the record, expert forums in the
past have been just that. They've
been forums where Commissioners bring
in experts, listen, engage, debate,
and then close down the meeting.

This will be the first time
that I can remember where a
Commission actually is charging

1
2 itself with listening to the public
3 subsequent to those experts and
4 allowing for some additional insight
5 and dialogue. That hasn't existed in
6 the past. So that's a further
7 testament to not only the level of
8 outreach, but the true desire for us
9 all to be as informed as we can be
10 and when we have to make a decision
11 at some point in the future as to
12 whether or not we move forward.

13 CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Thank you
14 Commissioner Fiala.

15 Let me respond, too, because I
16 am very supportive of your very
17 friendly amendment to the Resolution,
18 and I'd like to bring that up for
19 discussion and then ultimate vote and
20 then get back to the overall set of
21 Resolutions.

22 Again, the way that you're
23 looking at it and the way I'm looking
24 at it and I think all of us are
25 looking at it, is that we are going

1

2

to have to iterate. Iterate really

3

is just a fancy word to say that we

4

go through a pass and we see where we

5

are and we get more information and

6

we go through another pass and

7

another pass and another pass until

8

we converge on what we think is the

9

right solution. And I think each of

10

those passes is a result of acquiring

11

information, and I think that is

12

really an operative principle here,

13

that we are charged with getting the

14

best information that we can from a

15

wide swath of opinions. And each one

16

of those is going to be iterated

17

until we converge on a solution. So

18

I totally subscribe to that.

19

I also want to second your

20

friendly amendment to add to all of

21

the opportunity for the public beyond

22

just the Commission to respond and we

23

will put that into the Resolution as

24

you suggested. But I'd like to see

25

if there is a consensus on that. So

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I'll move it. You'll second it?

COMMISSIONER SCISSURA: Second.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: You'll second. All in favor?

(A chorus of aye's.)

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Fine. The amendment is now in place.

Let's get back to the set of Resolutions, which is the main thing. Commissioner McShane.

COMMISSIONER McSHANE: Thank you very much, Chancellor. In light of what the other Commissioners have said this morning, I wonder if the Commission would be open to adding yet a fifth Resolution or sixth, depending on how you just put before us, Chancellor. That is in light of the fact that everybody here is concerned about transparency and thoroughness and time, I wonder if it would be good if we added a Resolution which would say something to the effect to resolve at the end

1
2 of our review of the recommendations
3 contained in the staff reports the
4 Commission shall revisit the question
5 of its own timetable for presentation
6 of resolutions for ballot
7 consideration?

8 Just so that we signal both
9 yourselves and to the City that we
10 serve that we want to make sure,
11 Matthew, a very important observation
12 you made, Chancellor, that this is a
13 deliberative process, and in order to
14 be a successful deliberative process
15 we the Commissioners, we have to, I
16 would say, not only analyze but at
17 the end of the day weigh whether we
18 have enough of an obligation at each
19 stage to go forward with a ballot
20 proposal.

21 CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: I agree. I
22 think it's already imbedded in what
23 it is we want to say here, because
24 again, remember what it is that we're
25 saying, Commissioner McShane, that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

after we get all of this commentary, expert witnesses, people who are listening in, going back to the field, we will constantly have to reassess where we're going to go. I mean, that is imbedded just in everything that we're doing. So I agree with you but I think it's already there. If that is acceptable to you.

Any other further comments on the Resolution that's before us? We now have it amended slightly, given Commissioners's Fiala amendment? If there are not, I'd like to call in question all in favor of the Resolution say aye.

(A chorus of ayes.)

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: Opposed?
Any abstentions?

The Resolution passes
unanimously, and our work for this particular meeting is completed. So I thank you for all of that. We look

1

2 forward to meeting the public very,
3 very soon. And thank you all for
4 being here.

5

6 I want to thank again the
7 wonderful women and men that are part
8 of this Commission. They are great
9 people and we are fortunate in this
10 City to have people as committed and
11 as smart and as skilled as
12 knowledgeable about the very subtle
13 and difficult issues that we're going
14 to face. And again I thank our very
15 fine staff for the work that they
16 have done. So thank you all.

17

So I'll move to join?

18

19

(Continued on the next page.)

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMISSIONER McSHANE: Second.

CHAIRMAN GOLDSTEIN: All in favor?

(A chorus of aye's.)

(Whereupon, at 9:44 A.M., the
above matter concluded.)

I, NORAH COLTON, CM, a Notary
Public for and within the State of
New York, do hereby certify that the
above is a correct transcription of
my stenographic notes.

NORAH COLTON, CM