

June 11, 2020 – Open Meeting Matter
March 26, 2020 – Open Meeting Matter
February 4, 2020 – Open Meeting Matter

To: The Board

From: Christopher M. Hammer



Date: June 1, 2020

Re: Proposed New Board Rules § 1-18: Endorsements

As directed by the Board at its March 2020 meeting (**Exhibit 1**), Staff submitted the proposed new Board Rules § 1-18 on endorsements for review and certification by the New York City Law Department and Mayor’s Office of Operations pursuant to the City Administrative Procedure Act (**Exhibit 2**). The Law Department and Office of Operations have certified the proposed rule with minor clarifying edits tracked in **Exhibit 3**, and technical edits related to the fact that the public hearing will occur by videoconference.

With the Board’s approval, Staff will formally submit the proposed rule to the City Record with the notice of the public hearing and opportunity to comment (**Exhibit 4**), as required by the City Administrative Procedure Act. See Charter Section 1043(b).

Minutes of the Open Meeting of the New York City Conflicts of Interest Board

Date: March 26, 2020

Present:

Board Members: Chair Richard Briffault and Members Fernando A. Bohorquez, Jr., Anthony Crowell, Jeffrey D. Friedlander, and Erika Thomas

Board Staff: Ethan Carrier, Chad Gholizadeh, Ana Gross, Christopher Hammer, Gavin Kendall, Julia Lee, Carolyn Miller, Katherine Miller, Ari Mulgay, Yasong Niu, Jeffrey Tremblay, Clare Wiseman, and Juliya Ziskina.

Guests: None

The Board and Staff participated by videoconference pursuant to Executive Order No. 202 issued on March 7, 2020. The meeting was called to order by the Chair at approximately 9:35 a.m. The Chair stated that the meeting was being conducted pursuant to the New York State Open Meetings Law and designated the undersigned as the Recording Secretary for purposes of the meeting.

The Chair stated that the meeting was called to discuss proposed amendments to Board Rules § 1-07; § 1-01(h); § 1-01(e)-(g); § 1-18; § 1-13; and §1-17.

Board Rules § 1-07

After a brief introduction, the Chair asked for any comments by the Board or Staff. The following comments constitute the changes as agreed upon by the Board and Staff to the proposed amendments to Board Rules § 1-07:

- In the Statement of Basis and Purpose, p. 4, line 10: change “unpaid or unpaid” to “paid or unpaid”
- § 1-07(d)(2)(i): replace “in role” with “no role”

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board unanimously voted to adopt the proposed amendments incorporating the proposed changes as the final rule.

Board Rules § 1-01(h)

After a brief introduction, the Chair asked for any comments by the Board or Staff. There were no comments. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board unanimously voted to adopt the proposed amendments incorporating the proposed changes as the final rule.

Board Rules § 1-01(e)-(g)

The Chair asked for any comments by the Board or Staff and upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board unanimously voted to continue discussions at a future open meeting.

Board Rules § 1-18

The Chair asked for any comments by the Board or Staff. The Board and Staff agreed to change the caption from “Endorsements” to “Use of City Title in Promotional Materials.”

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board unanimously voted to adopt the proposed amendments incorporating the proposed changes as the final rule.

Board Rules §§ 1-13 and 1-17

After a brief introduction, the Chair asked for any comments by the Board or Staff. There were no comments. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board unanimously voted to adopt the proposed amendments incorporating the proposed changes as the final rule.

The open meeting was adjourned at approximately 10:02 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Julia H. Lee
Recording Secretary

New York City Conflicts of Interest Board

Notice of Public Hearing and Opportunity to Comment on Proposed Rules Regarding the Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

What are we proposing? The Conflicts of Interest Board proposes to adopt rules regarding a public servant’s use of City title in promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity.

When and where is the Hearing? The Conflicts of Interest Board will hold a public hearing on the proposed rule. The public hearing will take place at [] on []. The hearing will be at [].

This location has the following accessibility option(s) available: [].

How do I comment on the proposed rules? Anyone can comment on the proposed rules by:

- **Website.** You can submit comments to the Conflicts of Interest Board through the NYC rules website at <http://rules.cityofnewyork.us>.
- **Email.** You can email comments to Rules@COIB.nyc.gov.
- **Mail.** You can mail comments to Christopher M. Hammer, Deputy General Counsel, Conflicts of Interest Board, 2 Lafayette Street, Suite #1010, New York, New York 10007.
- **Fax.** You can fax comments to the Conflicts of Interest Board at (212) 437-0705.
- **By Speaking at the Hearing.** Anyone who wants to comment on the proposed rule at the public hearing must sign up to speak. You can sign up before the hearing by calling (212) 437-0730. You can also sign up in the hearing room before the hearing begins on []. You can speak for up to three minutes.

Is there a deadline to submit comments? Yes, you must submit written comments by [].

Do you need assistance to participate in the hearing? You must tell the Conflicts of Interest Board if you need a reasonable accommodation of a disability at the hearing. You must tell us if you need a sign language interpreter. You can tell us by mail at the address given above. You may also tell us by telephone at (212) 437-0721. You must tell us by [].

Can I review the comments made on the proposed rules? You can review the comments made online on the proposed rules by going to the website at <http://rules.cityofnewyork.us/>. A few days after the hearing, copies of all comments submitted online, copies of all written comments, and a summary of oral comments concerning the proposed rule will be available to the public at the Conflicts of Interest Board, 2 Lafayette Street, Suite #1010, New York, New York 10007.

1 **What authorizes the Conflicts of Interest Board to make this rule?** Sections 1043 and
2 2603(a) of the City Charter and authorize the Conflicts of Interest Board to make this proposed
3 rule. This proposed rule was not included in the Conflicts of Interest Board’s regulatory agenda
4 for this Fiscal Year because it was not contemplated when the Conflicts of Interest Board
5 published the agenda.

6
7 **Where can I find the Conflicts of Interest Board’s rules?** The Conflicts of Interest Board’s
8 rules are in Title 53 of the Rules of the City of New York.

9
10 **What rules govern the rulemaking process?** The Conflicts of Interest Board must meet the
11 requirements of Section 1043 of the City Charter when creating or changing rules. This notice is
12 made according to the requirements of Section 1043 of the City Charter.
13

14 **Statement of Basis and Purpose of the Proposed Rule**

15 City Charter § 2604(b)(2) prohibits a public servant from engaging in “any business,
16 transaction or private employment, or hav[ing] any financial or other private interest, direct or
17 indirect, which is in conflict with the proper discharge of his or her official duties.” As codified
18 in Board Rules § 1-13(b), this means that a public servant may not use City resources, including
19 his or her City title, “for any non-City purpose.”

20 The Conflicts of Interest Board proposes to adopt a new § 1-18 of the Board Rules to apply
21 City Charter § 2604(b)(2) to promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product,
22 program, or entity. The Board has addressed such promotional materials, including book blurbs
23 and print advertisements, in four advisory opinions on endorsements: Nos. 1991-1, 1995-2, 1998-
24 6, and 2000-3. These opinions reflect a determination by the Board that “the City’s interest must
25 be the clear determinant” for a public servant to use his or her City title to promote non-City
26 products, programs, or entities. A.O. No. 1995-2 at 4. Without such a clear City purpose, the use
27 of City resources would “present[] a significant risk of creating the appearance that the public
28 servant’s official position is being used to advance a private interest.” A.O. No. 1991-1 at 1.

1 The Board’s experience in the intervening years has shown that a City agency itself is in
2 the best position to decide how best to advance its mission. Thus, in Advisory Opinion No. 2008-
3 6, an opinion on official fundraising, the Board observed: “Elected and appointed officials are
4 selected for, among other things, their good judgment, and the Board finds no basis in Chapter 68
5 to limit the discretion of these officials as to their official charitable fundraising if they are
6 exercising discretion within their defined areas of responsibility.” A.O. No. 2008-6 at 10-11. As
7 a result, the Board advised in this Advisory Opinion, subsequently codified in Board Rules § 1-
8 14, that an agency head need not obtain the Board’s individualized approval every time the agency
9 wanted to fundraise on behalf of a not-for-profit organization.

10 In providing advice about an individual public servant’s use of City title for endorsements,
11 the Board under normal circumstances defers to an agency head’s determination provided that a
12 demonstrable nexus exists between the product, program, or entity and the agency’s mission.
13 Accordingly, the Board proposes to codify a rule that would permit public servants, with the
14 approval of their agency head, to use their City titles in promotional materials produced by or on
15 behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity, provided that there is a demonstrable nexus
16 between the product, program, or entity and the mission of the public servant’s City agency.

17 The determination of whether a demonstrable nexus exists depends on the specific
18 circumstances of the endorsement and the nature of the public servant’s work for the City:

- 19 • In A.O. No. 2000-3, the Board advised the Police Commissioner that he may
20 write and sign a letter that would serve as the introduction to a book published
21 to raise funds for the NYPD Museum, a not-for-profit organization with the sole
22 mission of educating the public about the New York City Police Department.
23
- 24 • In confidential advice, the Board advised an elected official that the elected
25 official may author a welcome letter for the first edition of a privately published
26 freely distributed magazine promoting public transportation in the City. The
27 Board advised the official that the official may write the letter for the purpose

1 of promoting tourism and the use of public transportation within the elected
2 official's district.

- 3
- 4 • In confidential advice, the Board advised an elected official that the elected
5 official may **not** appear in an advertisement for a hospital located within the
6 elected official's district. The Board provided similar advice to a high-ranking
7 public servant's proposed appearance in an advertisement for a for-profit
8 business in A.O. No. 1991-1.
 - 9
 - 10 • In confidential advice, Board staff advised a high-ranking public servant that
11 the public servant may author a testimonial for a book on the alleviation of
12 inequality and poverty for the City purpose of demonstrating the City's role in
13 alleviating poverty.
 - 14

15 To ensure that a public servant is not acting to benefit an associated person or firm, the rule
16 would prohibit an endorsement where the public servant or the public servant's agency head is
17 associated, within the meaning of City Charter § 2601(5), with either the entity or an employee of
18 the entity that is the subject of the endorsement. This means, for example, that if an agency head's
19 spouse wrote a book on a matter connected to the mission of the agency, an agency employee may
20 not provide a promotional blurb for the book on behalf of the agency.

21

22 **Text of the Proposed Rule**

23

24 New material is underlined.

25

26 [Deleted material is in brackets.]

27

28 **Section 1.** Title 53 of the Rules of the City of New York is amended by adding a new section 1-
29 18, to read as follows:

30 **§ 1-18 Use of City Title in Promotional Materials**

- 31 (a) Pursuant to Charter § 2604(b)(2) and § 2604(b)(3), a public servant may use or permit the
32 use of his or her City title and/or City agency in promotional materials produced by or on

1 behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity provided that all of the following
2 conditions are met:

3 (i) a demonstrable nexus exists between the product, program, or entity and the mission
4 of the public servant’s agency;

5 (ii) neither the agency head nor the public servant is associated, within the meaning of
6 Charter § 2601(5), with either the entity or an employee of the entity that is the subject
7 of the endorsement or whose product or program is the subject of the endorsement;

8 (iii) the public servant’s agency head approves in writing the use of the public servant’s
9 City title and/or City agency; and

10 (iv) if the promotional materials solicit donations for a not-for-profit organization, the
11 public servant and public servant’s agency comply with the requirements of Board
12 Rules § 1-14.

13 (b) For purposes of this section, an elected official, including a District Attorney, is the agency
14 head of the staff members in his or her office. The Speaker of the New York City Council
15 is the agency head of the central staff of Council, and a Council Member is the agency head
16 of the staff of his or her office.

New York City Conflicts of Interest Board

Notice of Public Hearing and Opportunity to Comment on Proposed Rules Regarding the Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

What are we proposing? The Conflicts of Interest Board proposes to adopt rules regarding a public servant’s use of City title in promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity.

When and where is the Hearing? The Conflicts of Interest Board will hold a public hearing on the proposed rule. The public hearing will take place by videoconference at [] on []. ~~The hearing will be at [] and is accessible by:~~

- ~~• This location has~~**Internet Video and Audio.** To access the hearing by Zoom, use the following accessibility option(s) available URL: [].
- ~~• Telephone.~~ To access the hearing by telephone, dial []. When prompted, use the following access code [] and password [].

How do I comment on the proposed rules? Anyone can comment on the proposed rules by:

- Website.** You can submit comments to the Conflicts of Interest Board through the NYC rules website at <http://rules.cityofnewyork.us>.
- Email.** You can email comments to Rules@COIB.nyc.gov.
- ~~• Mail.~~ ~~You can mail comments to Christopher M. Hammer, Deputy General Counsel, Conflicts of Interest Board, 2 Lafayette Street, Suite #1010, New York, New York 10007.~~
- ~~• Fax.~~ ~~You can fax comments to the Conflicts of Interest Board at (212) 437-0705.~~
- By Speaking at the Hearing.** Anyone who wants to comment on the proposed rule at the public hearing ~~must sign up to speak. You can sign up before the hearing by calling (212) 437-0730. You can also sign up in the hearing room before the hearing begins on []. You can speak for up to three minutes.~~ may speak for up to three minutes. Please access the public hearing by Internet Video and Audio or by Telephone using the instructions above. It is recommended, but not required, that commenters sign up prior to the hearing by contacting the Conflicts of Interest Board by phone at (212) 437-0730 or by email at lee@coib.nyc.gov.

Is there a deadline to submit comments? Yes, you must submit written comments by [].

This hearing has the following accessibility option(s) available: The Zoom platform accommodates screen reader software. Simultaneous transcription or a sign-language interpreter are available upon request.

1 **Do you need assistance to participate in the hearing?** You must tell the Conflicts of Interest
2 Board if you need a reasonable accommodation of a disability at the hearing. ~~You must tell us,~~
3 ~~including~~ if you need a sign language interpreter. ~~or simultaneous transcription.~~ You can ~~tell~~ advise
4 us by ~~mailemail~~ at ~~the address given above.~~ You may also tell us lee@coib.nyc.gov or by telephone
5 at (212) 437-~~0721~~0730. You must tell us by .

6
7 **Can I review the comments made on the proposed rules?** You can review the comments
8 made online on the proposed rules by going to the website at <http://rules.cityofnewyork.us/>. ~~A~~
9 ~~few days after the hearing, copies~~ Copies of all comments submitted online, copies of all written
10 comments, and a summary of oral comments concerning the proposed rule will be available to
11 the public ~~at the Conflicts of Interest Board, 2 Lafayette Street, Suite #1010, New York, New~~
12 ~~York 10007~~ on the Conflicts of Interest Board’s website ([https://www1.nyc.gov/site/coib/public-](https://www1.nyc.gov/site/coib/public-documents/open-meetings-and-public-hearings.page)
13 [documents/open-meetings-and-public-hearings.page](https://www1.nyc.gov/site/coib/public-documents/open-meetings-and-public-hearings.page)) as soon as practicable.

14
15 **What authorizes the Conflicts of Interest Board to make this rule?** Sections 1043 and
16 2603(a) of the City Charter and authorize the Conflicts of Interest Board to make this proposed
17 rule. This proposed rule was not included in the Conflicts of Interest Board’s regulatory agenda
18 for this Fiscal Year because it was not contemplated when the Conflicts of Interest Board
19 published the agenda.

20
21 **Where can I find the Conflicts of Interest Board’s rules?** The Conflicts of Interest Board’s
22 rules are in Title 53 of the Rules of the City of New York.

23
24 **What rules govern the rulemaking process?** The Conflicts of Interest Board must meet the
25 requirements of Section 1043 of the City Charter when creating or changing rules. This notice is
26 made according to the requirements of Section 1043 of the City Charter.

27
28 **Statement of Basis and Purpose of the Proposed Rule**

29 City Charter § 2604(b)(2) prohibits a public servant from engaging in “any business,
30 transaction or private employment, or hav[ing] any financial or other private interest, direct or
31 indirect, which is in conflict with the proper discharge of his or her official duties.” As codified
32 in Board Rules § 1-13(b), this means that a public servant may not use City resources, including
33 his or her City title, “for any non-City purpose.”

34 The Conflicts of Interest Board proposes to adopt a new § 1-18 of the Board Rules to apply
35 City Charter § 2604(b)(2) to promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product,
36 program, or entity. The Board has addressed such promotional materials, including book blurbs

1 and print advertisements, in four advisory opinions on endorsements: Nos. 1991-1, 1995-2, 1998-
2 6, and 2000-3. These opinions reflect a determination by the Board that “the City’s interest must
3 be the clear determinant” for a public servant to use his or her City title to promote non-City
4 products, programs, or entities. A.O. No. 1995-2 at 4. Without such a clear City purpose, the use
5 of City resources would “present[] a significant risk of creating the appearance that the public
6 servant’s official position is being used to advance a private interest.” A.O. No. 1991-1 at 1.

7 The Board’s ~~experience in the intervening years~~ has ~~shown~~often concluded, both in this
8 context and others, that a City agency itself is in the best position to decide how best to advance
9 its mission. Thus, in Advisory Opinion No. 2008-6, an opinion on official fundraising, the Board
10 observed: “Elected and appointed officials are selected for, among other things, their good
11 judgment, and the Board finds no basis in Chapter 68 to limit the discretion of these officials as to
12 their official charitable fundraising if they are exercising discretion within their defined areas of
13 responsibility.” A.O. No. 2008-6 at 10-11. As a result, the Board advised in this Advisory
14 Opinion, subsequently codified in Board Rules § 1-14, that an agency head need not obtain the
15 Board’s ~~individualized~~ approval every time the agency wanted to fundraise on behalf of a not-for-
16 profit organization.

17 In providing advice about an individual public servant’s use of City title for endorsements,
18 the Board under normal circumstances defers to an agency head’s determination provided that a
19 demonstrable nexus exists between the product, program, or entity and the agency’s mission.
20 Accordingly, the Board proposes to codify a rule that would permit public servants, with the
21 approval of their agency head, to use their City titles in promotional materials produced by or on
22 behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity, provided that there is a demonstrable nexus
23 between the product, program, or entity and the mission of the public servant’s City agency.

1 The determination of whether a demonstrable nexus exists depends on the specific
2 circumstances of the endorsement and the nature of the public servant’s work for the City. For

3 example:

- 4 • In A.O. No. 2000-3, the Board advised the Police Commissioner that he may
5 write and sign a letter that would serve as the introduction to a book published
6 to raise funds for the NYPD Museum, a not-for-profit organization with the sole
7 mission of educating the public about the New York City Police Department.
8
- 9 • In confidential advice, the Board advised an elected official that the elected
10 official maycould author a welcome letter for the first edition of a privately
11 published freely distributed magazine promoting public transportation in the
12 City. The Board advised the official that the official maycould write the letter
13 for the purpose of promoting tourism and the use of public transportation within
14 the elected official’s district.
15
- 16 • In confidential advice, the Board advised an elected official that the elected
17 official maycould not appear in an advertisement for a hospital located within
18 the elected official’s district. The Board provided similar advice to a high-
19 ranking public servant’s proposed appearance in an advertisement for a for-
20 profit business in A.O. No. 1991-1.
21
- 22 • In confidential advice, Board staff advised a high-ranking public servant that
23 the public servant maycould author a testimonial for a book on the alleviation
24 of inequality and poverty for the City purpose of demonstrating that
25 demonstrated the City’s role in alleviating inequality and poverty.
26

27 To ensure that a public servant is not acting to benefit an associated person or firm, —
28 including a close family member such as a spouse, sibling, parent, or child, or any person or firm
29 having a business or financial relationship with the public servant—the rule would prohibit an
30 endorsement where the public servant or the public servant’s agency head is associated, within the
31 meaning of City Charter § 2601(5), with either the entity or an employee of the entity that is the
32 subject of the endorsement. This means, for example, that if an agency head’s spouse wrote a
33 book on a matter connected to the mission of the agency, an agency employee may not provide a
34 promotional blurb for the book on behalf of the agency.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

Text of the Proposed Rule

New material is underlined.

~~{Deleted material is in brackets.}~~

Section 1. Title 53 of the Rules of the City of New York is amended by adding a new section 1-18, to read as follows:

§ 1-18 Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

(a) Pursuant to Charter § 2604(b)(2) and § 2604(b)(3), a public servant may use or permit the use of his or her City title and/or City agency in promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity provided that all of the following conditions are met:

(i) a demonstrable nexus exists between the product, program, or entity and the mission of the public servant’s agency;

(ii) neither the agency head nor the public servant is associated, within the meaning of Charter § 2601(5), with either the entity or an employee of the entity that is the subject of the endorsement or whose product or program is the subject of the endorsement;

(iii) the public servant’s agency head approves in writing the use of the public servant’s City title and/or City agency; and

(iv) if the promotional materials solicit donations for a not-for-profit organization, the public servant and public servant’s agency comply with the requirements of Board Rules § 1-14.

(b) For purposes of this section, an elected official, including a District Attorney, is the agency head of the staff members in ~~his or her~~their office. The Speaker of the New York City

As Approved at COIB Open Meeting – 03/26/2020

With Edits by Law Department and Mayor’s Office of Operations

- 1 Council is the agency head of the central staff of Council, and a Council Member is the
- 2 agency head of the staff of ~~his or her~~their office.

New York City Conflicts of Interest Board

Notice of Public Hearing and Opportunity to Comment on Proposed Rules Regarding the Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

What are we proposing? The Conflicts of Interest Board proposes to adopt rules regarding a public servant's use of City title in promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity.

When and where is the Hearing? The Conflicts of Interest Board will hold a public hearing on the proposed rule. The public hearing will take place by videoconference at on and is accessible by:

- **Internet Video and Audio.** To access the hearing by Zoom, use the following URL: .
- **Telephone.** To access the hearing by telephone, dial . When prompted, use the following access code and password .

How do I comment on the proposed rules? Anyone can comment on the proposed rules by:

- **Website.** You can submit comments to the Conflicts of Interest Board through the NYC rules website at <http://rules.cityofnewyork.us>.
- **Email.** You can email comments to Rules@COIB.nyc.gov.
- **By Speaking at the Hearing.** Anyone who wants to comment on the proposed rule at the public hearing may speak for up to three minutes. Please access the public hearing by Internet Video and Audio or by Telephone using the instructions above. It is recommended, but not required, that commenters sign up prior to the hearing by contacting the Conflicts of Interest Board by phone at (212) 437-0730 or by email at lee@coib.nyc.gov.

Is there a deadline to submit comments? Yes, you must submit written comments by .

This hearing has the following accessibility option(s) available: The Zoom platform accommodates screen reader software. Simultaneous transcription or a sign-language interpreter are available upon request.

Do you need assistance to participate in the hearing? You must tell the Conflicts of Interest Board if you need a reasonable accommodation of a disability at the hearing, including if you need a sign language interpreter or simultaneous transcription. You can advise us by email at lee@coib.nyc.gov or by telephone at (212) 437-0730. You must tell us by .

Can I review the comments made on the proposed rules? You can review the comments made online on the proposed rules by going to the website at <http://rules.cityofnewyork.us/>. Copies of all comments submitted online, copies of all written comments, and a summary of oral comments concerning the proposed rule will be available to the public on the Conflicts of

Interest Board's website (<https://www1.nyc.gov/site/coib/public-documents/open-meetings-and-public-hearings.page>) as soon as practicable.

What authorizes the Conflicts of Interest Board to make this rule? Sections 1043 and 2603(a) of the City Charter and authorize the Conflicts of Interest Board to make this proposed rule. This proposed rule was not included in the Conflicts of Interest Board's regulatory agenda for this Fiscal Year because it was not contemplated when the Conflicts of Interest Board published the agenda.

Where can I find the Conflicts of Interest Board's rules? The Conflicts of Interest Board's rules are in Title 53 of the Rules of the City of New York.

What rules govern the rulemaking process? The Conflicts of Interest Board must meet the requirements of Section 1043 of the City Charter when creating or changing rules. This notice is made according to the requirements of Section 1043 of the City Charter.

Statement of Basis and Purpose of the Proposed Rule

City Charter § 2604(b)(2) prohibits a public servant from engaging in “any business, transaction or private employment, or hav[ing] any financial or other private interest, direct or indirect, which is in conflict with the proper discharge of his or her official duties.” As codified in Board Rules § 1-13(b), this means that a public servant may not use City resources, including his or her City title, “for any non-City purpose.”

The Conflicts of Interest Board proposes to adopt a new § 1-18 of the Board Rules to apply City Charter § 2604(b)(2) to promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity. The Board has addressed such promotional materials, including book blurbs and print advertisements, in four advisory opinions on endorsements: Nos. 1991-1, 1995-2, 1998-6, and 2000-3. These opinions reflect a determination by the Board that “the City's interest must be the clear determinant” for a public servant to use his or her City title to promote non-City products, programs, or entities. A.O. No. 1995-2 at 4. Without such a clear City purpose, the use of City resources would “present[] a significant risk of creating the appearance that the public servant's official position is being used to advance a private interest.” A.O. No. 1991-1 at 1.

The Board has often concluded, both in this context and others, that a City agency itself is in the best position to decide how best to advance its mission. Thus, in Advisory Opinion No. 2008-6, an opinion on official fundraising, the Board observed: “Elected and appointed officials are selected for, among other things, their good judgment, and the Board finds no basis in Chapter 68 to limit the discretion of these officials as to their official charitable fundraising if they are exercising discretion within their defined areas of responsibility.” A.O. No. 2008-6 at 10-11. As a result, the Board advised in this Advisory Opinion, subsequently codified in Board Rules § 1-14, that an agency head need not obtain the Board’s approval every time the agency wanted to fundraise on behalf of a not-for-profit organization.

In providing advice about an individual public servant’s use of City title for endorsements, the Board under normal circumstances defers to an agency head’s determination provided that a demonstrable nexus exists between the product, program, or entity and the agency’s mission. Accordingly, the Board proposes to codify a rule that would permit public servants, with the approval of their agency head, to use their City titles in promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity, provided that there is a demonstrable nexus between the product, program, or entity and the mission of the public servant’s City agency.

The determination of whether a demonstrable nexus exists depends on the specific circumstances of the endorsement and the nature of the public servant’s work for the City. For example:

- In A.O. No. 2000-3, the Board advised the Police Commissioner that he may write and sign a letter that would serve as the introduction to a book published to raise funds for the NYPD Museum, a not-for-profit organization with the sole mission of educating the public about the New York City Police Department.
- In confidential advice, the Board advised an elected official that the elected official could author a welcome letter for the first edition of a privately published freely distributed magazine promoting public transportation in the

EXHIBIT 4

City. The Board advised the official that the official could write the letter for the purpose of promoting tourism and the use of public transportation within the elected official's district.

- In confidential advice, the Board advised an elected official that the elected official could not appear in an advertisement for a hospital located within the elected official's district. The Board provided similar advice to a high-ranking public servant's proposed appearance in an advertisement for a for-profit business in A.O. No. 1991-1.
- In confidential advice, Board staff advised a high-ranking public servant that the public servant could author a testimonial for a book that demonstrated the City's role in alleviating inequality and poverty.

To ensure that a public servant is not acting to benefit an associated person or firm—including a close family member such as a spouse, sibling, parent, or child, or any person or firm having a business or financial relationship with the public servant—the rule would prohibit an endorsement where the public servant or the public servant's agency head is associated, within the meaning of City Charter § 2601(5), with either the entity or an employee of the entity that is the subject of the endorsement. This means, for example, that if an agency head's spouse wrote a book on a matter connected to the mission of the agency, an agency employee may not provide a promotional blurb for the book on behalf of the agency.

Text of the Proposed Rule

New material is underlined.

Section 1. Title 53 of the Rules of the City of New York is amended by adding a new section 1-18, to read as follows:

§ 1-18 Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

(a) Pursuant to Charter § 2604(b)(2) and § 2604(b)(3), a public servant may use or permit the use of his or her City title and/or City agency in promotional materials produced by or on behalf of a non-City product, program, or entity provided that all of the following conditions are met:

(i) a demonstrable nexus exists between the product, program, or entity and the mission of the public servant's agency;

(ii) neither the agency head nor the public servant is associated, within the meaning of Charter § 2601(5), with either the entity or an employee of the entity that is the subject of the endorsement or whose product or program is the subject of the endorsement;

(iii) the public servant's agency head approves in writing the use of the public servant's City title and/or City agency; and

(iv) if the promotional materials solicit donations for a not-for-profit organization, the public servant and public servant's agency comply with the requirements of Board Rules § 1-14.

(b) For purposes of this section, an elected official, including a District Attorney, is the agency head of the staff members in their office. The Speaker of the New York City Council is the agency head of the central staff of Council, and a Council Member is the agency head of the staff of their office.

**NEW YORK CITY LAW DEPARTMENT
DIVISION OF LEGAL COUNSEL
100 CHURCH STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10007
212-356-4028**

**CERTIFICATION PURSUANT TO
CHARTER §1043(d)**

RULE TITLE: Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

REFERENCE NUMBER: 2020 RG 037

RULEMAKING AGENCY: Conflicts of Interest Board

I certify that this office has reviewed the above-referenced proposed rule as required by section 1043(d) of the New York City Charter, and that the above-referenced proposed rule:

- (i) is drafted so as to accomplish the purpose of the authorizing provisions of law;
- (ii) is not in conflict with other applicable rules;
- (iii) to the extent practicable and appropriate, is narrowly drawn to achieve its stated purpose; and
- (iv) to the extent practicable and appropriate, contains a statement of basis and purpose that provides a clear explanation of the rule and the requirements imposed by the rule.

/s/ STEVEN GOULDEN
Acting Corporation Counsel

Date: May 29, 2020

**NEW YORK CITY MAYOR'S OFFICE OF OPERATIONS
253 BROADWAY, 10th FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10007
212-788-1400**

**CERTIFICATION / ANALYSIS
PURSUANT TO CHARTER SECTION 1043(d)**

RULE TITLE: Use of City Title in Promotional Materials

REFERENCE NUMBER: COIB-17

RULEMAKING AGENCY: Conflicts of Interests Board

I certify that this office has analyzed the proposed rule referenced above as required by Section 1043(d) of the New York City Charter, and that the proposed rule referenced above:

- (i) Is understandable and written in plain language for the discrete regulated community or communities;
- (ii) Minimizes compliance costs for the discrete regulated community or communities consistent with achieving the stated purpose of the rule; and
- (iii) Does not provide a cure period because it does not establish a violation, modification of a violation, or modification of the penalties associated with a violation.

/s/ Francisco X. Navarro
Mayor's Office of Operations

May 31, 2020
Date