Questions & Answers Based on Public Comment

Released July 25, 2019

NSSRI Framework

1. Is this a New York City initiative or a national one?
   This is a national initiative. The National Salt and Sugar Reduction Initiative (NSSRI) is a partnership of over 100 state and local health authorities and national health organizations from across the country, convened by the New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to encourage voluntary corporate commitments to sugar and salt reduction targets.

2. Is the initiative focused on salt, sugar or both?
   The initiative focuses on both salt and sugar reduction. When the initiative launched in 2009, it was the National Salt Reduction Initiative (NSRI) and the partners focused on setting and calling for the food industry to meet sodium reduction targets. The Food and Drug Administration (FDA) is finalizing sodium guidance that was informed by the partnership’s work on sodium reduction. Companies that committed to meeting the sodium targets are already well positioned to meet FDA guidance. In 2018, the partnership was updated to include a new goal of reducing sugar in the packaged food and beverage supply.

3. How will removing sugar from packaged foods affect other ingredients?
   Removing sugar from packaged foods will not necessarily affect other ingredients. The NSSRI encourages food companies to remove sugar in food without replacing it with other unhealthy ingredients such as saturated fat, sodium or refined carbohydrates. During the salt reduction phase of the initiative, reductions in calories and sodium occurred in tandem, suggesting that manufacturers reformulated for more than one health goal at the same time. In addition to monitoring salt and sugar reduction over time, the NSSRI will monitor other nutrients, such as fat and calories, over time.

4. Will reducing sugar affect the taste of foods?
   Companies are experts in reformulating products, and many consumers are unaware of stealth changes. Targets were set at levels already met by similar products on the market, demonstrating feasibility.

Voluntary Sugar Reduction Targets

1. Why is it important to reduce added sugar intake?
   Added sugars contribute calories but few essential nutrients. Research shows that consuming added sugars is associated with increased risk of excess weight, Type 2 diabetes, hypertension, stroke, heart disease and cavities. In children, research shows a link between consumption of added sugars in sugary drinks and body mass index (BMI). Most of the added sugar in the U.S. diet is not added by individuals at home. Sugar has become widespread in the national food supply. Currently, 68% of packaged foods and beverages purchased in the U.S. contain added sugars, making it difficult for individuals to reduce their sugar consumption. To improve public health, we must change manufacturing practices to create a food supply with fewer added sugars.

2. How does the NSSRI set its sugar reduction targets?
   First, we defined the categories of food and beverages that contribute to sugar intake in the U.S. population. For those categories, we merged Nielsen sales data with nutrition information from Label Insight and manufacturer websites by Universal Product Code to create the NSSRI Packaged Food Database. For each category, we calculated the sales-weighted mean (SWM) and distribution in grams
(g) of sugar per 100 g of food or 100 mL of beverage for the products that are in the top 80% of sales volume. We set preliminary reduction targets based on a percentage reduction from the SWM. Industry is invited to provide feedback on the preliminary categories and targets to help refine the category definitions and to help the NSSRI set gradual, achievable and meaningful targets for each category.

3. Are the targets voluntary?
Yes, the targets are voluntary. When companies make a voluntary commitment to a target, they help create a healthier food supply, improving the public’s health. The public health authorities and organizations that make up the NSSRI partnership are joining together to put forth a single set of transparent targets to measure and recognize industry’s progress toward meaningful, achievable goals.

4. Are the targets for total sugars or added sugars?
Targets are based on total sugar, consistent with the approach taken in the United Kingdom. In most categories the total sugar content is equivalent to the amount of added sugars because the products do not contain naturally occurring sugars. The exception is for products containing milk, fruit, nuts or legumes, which also contain some natural sugars. We have carefully reviewed products with these ingredients and developed a proposed allowance for natural sugar in products containing milk. We will monitor added sugar content, by product and by category, when available on Nutrition Facts Labels.

5. How do the allowances for natural sugar work?
The allowances account for naturally occurring sugars, primarily lactose, in dairy milk and yogurt. A smaller allowance has been made for sugars in plant-based milk substitutes and yogurts. To develop the allowances, we reviewed peer-reviewed literature, analyzed data in the NSSRI Packaged Food Database, reviewed the USDA Food Composition Database, and spoke with content experts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Product Type</th>
<th>Sugar Allowance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Sweetened milk</td>
<td>Dairy milk is the first ingredient</td>
<td>4 g/100 mL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dairy milk is not the first ingredient (i.e., it is the second ingredient)</td>
<td>2 g/100 mL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Sweetened milk substitute</td>
<td>Plant-based milk substitute</td>
<td>2 g/100 mL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Yogurt</td>
<td>Dairy yogurt</td>
<td>4 g/100 g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Plant-based yogurt</td>
<td>2 g/100 g</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The allowance is subtracted from the total sugar density of each product. For example, in the sweetened milk category, a chocolate milk (where milk is the first ingredient) with a total sugar density of 7.6 g/100 mL has an adjusted sugar density of 3.6 g/100 mL (7.6−4=3.6); a sweetened coffee beverage (where milk is the second ingredient) with a total sugar density of 5.9 g/100 mL has an adjusted sugar density of 3.9 g/100 mL (5.9−2=3.9). The adjusted values were used to calculate the baseline sales-weighted mean (SWM) and targets in these three categories.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Packaged Food Category</th>
<th>Category Description</th>
<th>Baseline 2018 Sales-Weighted Mean g sugar per 100 mL or 100 g</th>
<th>Sales-Weighted Mean Targets g sugar per 100 mL or 100 g</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2023</td>
<td>2026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Sweetened milk</td>
<td>Drinks containing milk as a first or second ingredient.</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Sweetened milk substitute</td>
<td>Flavored drinks containing milk substitute as a first or second ingredient.</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Yogurt</td>
<td>Dairy and non-dairy yogurt and yogurt drinks.</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. How do companies meet the sales-weighted mean target?
Companies can shift their sales-weighted mean (SWM) within a category by promoting sales of certain products, reformulating or introducing new, less sugar dense products. The SWM target is the average sugar density within a packaged food category, weighted by product sales. The purpose of the SWM target is to encourage companies to reduce the overall sugar density of the products within a category,
with greater emphasis on products that contribute the most to population sugar intake. The use of a
SWM target provides companies with flexibility in how they meet proposed targets. Some of their
products can be above the SWM and some below.

7. How do the guidance maximums work?
Guidance maximums are the suggested upper limits for sugar density of products in each category.
Companies do not need to commit to meeting the maximums, but they are encouraged to utilize the
guidance values for new product development and product reformulation.

8. Why are there new categories for sweetened milk substitutes and granola bars?
Updates to these categories were made following the review of public comment. We initially proposed a
single category that included both dairy milk and plant-based milks and have since proposed splitting
them into two separate categories because: milk substitutes do not contain lactose and are, therefore,
functionally different than dairy milk; sweetened milk substitutes made up a significant portion (~20%) of
the prior sweetened milk and milk substitute category. Also, in the scientific literature, granola bars are
classified as part of the grain-based dessert category, which is a top contributor to added sugar intake.

9. Is there evidence that the NSSRI will work to reduce sugar intake?
There is evidence that suggests this model works. Based on a successful model on sodium in the United
Kingdom, the NSSRI worked with the food industry to set voluntary sodium reduction targets for 62
packaged food and 25 restaurant food categories for 2012 and 2014. Using national nutrition and
sales data, a 6.8% reduction in sodium levels in top-selling packaged foods between 2009 and
2014 was observed. Further, the FDA subsequently adopted this voluntary target-setting approach for
sodium. The UK recently extended this framework to sugar. They released results for the first year of
their program in which they observed a 5% decrease in sugar in three of eight categories.

10. How will you know if the initiative succeeds?
The NYC Health Department created databases to monitor nutrient and ingredient content of
packaged foods over time, as well as to inform target setting and to assess overall and individual
company progress toward the NSSRI targets. Companies can also publicly commit to sugar reduction
targets through a pledge coordinated by the NYC Health Department.

11. How will this initiative affect consumer choice?
The result of the initiative will be to accelerate the creation of a healthier food supply that, in turn,
increases consumer choice. Consumers may not realize how much sugar is in many packaged foods;
some products that appear healthy may contain just as much sugar as dessert. If industry works
toward meeting the targets, those wanting to consume less sugar can do so more easily. Consumers
can add more sugar to products but they cannot remove what was added during processing.

12. Can companies use non-nutritive sweeteners?
Industry is advised to consider existing and new scientific research and regulations to determine the
appropriate use of non-nutritive sweeteners in their products. The NSSRI recommends limiting use of
non-nutritive sweeteners in products marketed to children.

13. How is the NSSRI different from company announcements about salt or sugar reduction?
The NSSRI targets represent an objective, measurable standard developed with a broad range of
industry data and input. NSSRI targets provide a level playing field for companies.

For additional information, visit nyc.gov/health/nssri or email sugar@health.nyc.gov