

The City of New York Department of Investigation

## JOCELYN E. STRAUBER COMMISSIONER

180 MAIDEN LANE NEW YORK, NY 10038 212-825-5900

October 31, 2023

## **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Honorable Eric Adams Mayor City of New York City Hall New York, New York 10007

Honorable Adrienne Adams Speaker New York City Council City Hall New York, New York 10007

## Re: Whistleblower Law Complaints for Fiscal Year 2023

Dear Mr. Mayor and Madam Speaker:

The New York City Department of Investigation (DOI) is submitting this report pursuant to Section 12-113 of the New York City Administrative Code, the City's "Whistleblower Protection Law." Section 4, Subdivision (i) of the law provides that, "[n]ot later than October thirty-first of each year, the commissioner [of investigation], in consultation with the special commissioner of investigation [for the New York City School District] and the corporation counsel, shall prepare and forward to the mayor and the council a report" on the complaints governed by this section for the preceding Fiscal Year. The following is DOI's report to the Mayor and the City Council for Fiscal Year 2023.<sup>1</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This report does not incorporate whistleblower complaints received and investigated by the Special Commissioner of Investigation for the New York City School District (SCI) or the Corporation Counsel. That information is available in separate reports, which are attached.

Honorable Eric Adams Honorable Adrienne Adams October 31, 2023 Page 2 of 4

The Whistleblower Protection Law prohibits retaliation against New York City employees, as well as certain employees of City contractors and subcontractors, for reporting corruption, criminal activity, conflict of interest, gross mismanagement or abuse of authority in City government to DOI. The law protects such a report of information whether the employee makes a formal complaint to DOI or reports information to DOI as a witness in an already pending investigation.<sup>2</sup>

The City Council has periodically amended and expanded the categories protected by the Whistleblower Protection Law over the last 15 years. A 2007 amendment expanded the scope to include complaints concerning risk of harm to the health, safety or educational welfare of children. In 2012, the Law was amended to extend protection to officers and employees of vendors who have contracts with the City valued at \$100,000 or more. Further amendments to the law in 2021 added SCI as one of the designated entities for receipt of a complaint of retaliation, expanded the data DOI includes in its annual fiscal year report, and required DOI to send written notification every 90 days to a whistleblower complainant regarding the status of an open investigation.

Under 1978's Mayoral Executive Order 16 (MEO 16), all public officers and employees have an affirmative obligation to report corruption, fraud and other wrongdoing or risk their jobs and professional advancement if they do not.<sup>3</sup> MEO 16 operates in tandem with the Whistleblower Protection Law, with the latter providing essential protections to individuals who step forward as part of their 'duty to report' and suffer adverse actions as a result. Public servants who report wrongdoing are vital to DOI's mission to root out corruption, instill public confidence in government, promote integrity, and ensure that City services and operations are not undermined by misconduct, fraud, or waste.

DOI is providing the following information pursuant to Section 12-113 of the City's Administrative Code:

• In Fiscal Year 2023, DOI logged 1,968 complaints from City employees alleging corruption, criminal activity, conflict of interest, gross management or abuse of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Law also protects reports of information made to a member of the City Council, the Public Advocate, the City Comptroller, or the Special Commissioner of Investigation for the New York City School District (SCI), each of whom has a duty to refer the information to DOI unless (1) the conduct is within the jurisdiction of SCI, in which case the complaint shall be referred to SCI, or (2) the conduct is alleged to have been committed by the DOI Commissioner, the SCI Commissioner, or a DOI Deputy Commissioner, in which case the complaint must be referred to the corporation counsel.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Mayoral Executive Order 16, Section 4(d) states, "Every officer and employee of the City shall have the affirmative obligation to report, directly and without undue delay, to the Commissioner or an Inspector General any and all information concerning conduct which they know or should reasonably know to involve corrupt or other criminal activity or conflict of interest, (i) by another City officer or employee, which concerns his or her office or employment, of (ii) by persons dealing with the City, which concerns their dealings with the City. The knowing failure of any officer or employee to report as required above shall constitute cause for removal from office or employment or other appropriate penalty."

Honorable Eric Adams Honorable Adrienne Adams October 31, 2023 Page 3 of 4

authority, of which more than 239 resulted in investigations, preliminary investigations, or were merged into existing investigations. Additional City employees may have made complaints anonymously or without identifying their employment status. Many City employees provided valuable information in the course of DOI investigations, even if those investigations did not originate with an employee complaint.

- In Fiscal Year 2023, DOI did not log any complaints from employees of contractors. Additional employees of contractors may have made complaints to their contracting agency, or to DOI without identifying their employment status.
- In Fiscal Year 2023, DOI logged five complaints regarding the "risk of harm to the health, safety or educational welfare of a child." Most such complaints would be made in the first instance to DOE, ACS, or another law enforcement agency.
- DOI currently has more than 230 staff in its Investigations Division, including Inspectors General, attorneys, and investigators, who conduct or participate in whistleblower investigations.

In Fiscal Year 2023, DOI received six complaints from individuals who specifically alleged job-related retaliation or sought protection for reporting misconduct in City government, and DOI opened five investigations. The remaining complaint was filed for intelligence purposes. Broken down by the agencies where the complainants worked, the whistleblower retaliation complaints DOI received in Fiscal Year 2023 are as follows:

Agency	Number of Complaints
Department of Citywide Administrative Services	1
Health + Hospitals	1
New York City Housing Authority	1
Department of Correction	1
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene	1
Human Resources Administration	1

Of the five complaints that were opened as Whistleblower Law investigations in Fiscal Year 2023, DOI closed two matters during the reporting period. Three remained open and under investigation as of the end of the reporting year, and two of those matters were subsequently closed between the close of the reporting period and the date of this letter. In total, DOI closed four investigations in Fiscal Year 2023, including two investigations opened in a prior fiscal year. At the end of the reporting period, there were four investigations remaining open, three of which were opened in Fiscal Year 2023 and one of which was opened in a prior fiscal year. Two of the four have subsequently been closed as of the date of this letter. Of the four investigations that remained open at the end of the reporting period, one had been open for more than 730 days, two had been open between 90 and 179 days, and one had been open for less than 90 days as of June 30, 2023. The median number of days the investigations remained open by the end of the reporting period was 162.5 days.

Honorable Eric Adams Honorable Adrienne Adams October 31, 2023 Page 4 of 4

With respect to the four investigations closed in the reporting year, none of the investigations resulted in a finding that the complainant was entitled to protection under the City's Whistleblower Protection Law. With respect to the complaint filed for intelligence purposes, DOI determined that the complainant had not been terminated as alleged and no other adverse personnel action was alleged.

The New York City Whistleblower Protection Law is fundamental to the work of DOI and supports the mandate that City employees report corruption when they see it, and provides protections when they do step forward. It is good government in action, holding public servants accountable and protecting them when they do the right thing, fostering a culture that does not tolerate corruption, fraud, abuse of authority or waste of public funds. DOI is committed to continuing its efforts to ensure the effectiveness and public awareness of this Law.

Sincerely,

Jocelyn E. Strauber Commissioner



THE CITY OF NEW YORK LAW DEPARTMENT 100 CHURCH STREET NEW YORK, NY 10007

Muriel Goode-Trufant First Assistant Corportation Counsel Room 6-101 (212) 356-2100 <u>mgoodetr@law.nyc.gov</u>

October 13<sup>th</sup>, 2023

Jocelyn Strauber Commissioner Department of Investigation City of New York 180 Maiden Lane New York, NY 10038

Re: Whistleblower Complaints for Fiscal Year 2023

Dear Commissioner Strauber:

The Office of the Corporation Counsel (hereinafter "Law Department") submits this report detailing complaints and statistics related to the New York City Whistleblower Law to the Commissioner of the New York City Department of Investigation ("DOI") in furtherance of the DOI Commissioner's obligation to report annually to the Mayor and the New York City Council the number and disposition of complaints under the statute. The New York City Administrative Code § 12-113, also known as the Whistleblower Law, relates to employees of an agency of the City, or employees of vendors conducting business with the City, who report information concerning conduct which they know or reasonably believe to involve corruption, criminal activity, conflict of interest, gross mismanagement, or abuse of authority in City government to the DOI Commissioner, the New York City Public Advocate, the New York City Comptroller, or a member of the New York City Council.

The Law Department's review of Whistleblower complaints is limited to complaints raised by DOI employees and by employees of the Special Commissioner of Investigation for the City School District of New York ("SCI"). The Whistleblower Law prohibits any adverse personnel action against a reporting employee in retaliation for whistleblower activity. In Fiscal Year 2023, the Law Department received two SCI complaints: the first alleging retaliation and the second alleging gross mismanagement. The retaliation investigation has been concluded and the matter has been closed with no further action.

HON. SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX Corporation Counsel Jocelyn Strauber Commissioner Department of Investigation City of New York October 13<sup>th</sup>, 2023 Page 2

The closed matter was open more than 180 days but fewer than 365 days. The second matter was pending for more than 90 days but less than 180 days at the end of Fiscal Year 2023.

Sincerely,

Muriel Goode-Trufant

Muriel Goode-Trufant

City of New York THE SPECIAL COMMISSIONER OF INVESTIGATION FOR THE NEW YORK CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT 80 Maiden Lane, 20th Floor New York, New York 10038

Anastasia Coleman Special Commissioner

Via Electronic Mail

Telephone: (212) 510-1400 Fax: (212) 510-1550 www.nycsci.org

October 24, 2023

Honorable Jocelyn E. Strauber Commissioner New York City Department of Investigation 180 Maiden Lane New York, NY. 10038

Re:

SCI Whistleblower Complaints and Statistics for Fiscal Year 2023

The Special Commissioner of Investigation for the New York City School District ("SCI") submits this report detailing complaints and statistics related to the New York City Whistleblower Law to the Commissioner of the New York City Department of Investigation ("DOI") in furtherance of the DOI Commissioner's obligation to report annually to the Mayor and the New York City Council the number and disposition of complaints under the statute.<sup>1</sup>

The New York City Administrative Code § 12-113, commonly known as the Whistleblower Law, relates to employees of an agency of the City, or employees of vendors conducting business with the City, who report information concerning conduct which they know or reasonably believe to involve corruption, criminal activity, conflict of interest, gross mismanagement, or abuse of authority in City government to the DOI commissioner, the New York City Public Advocate, the New York City Comptroller, or a member of the New York City Council. In matters where the underlying claim includes allegations stemming from a report regarding the physical or educational welfare of a child, the statute includes reports made to the Mayor or to the head of an agency or that agency's designee.<sup>2</sup>

For the purposes of SCI's review of Whistleblower complaints, New York City Department of Education ("DOE") employees are considered employees of a city agency. The Whistleblower Law prohibits another employee from taking any adverse personnel action against the reporting employee in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This report will also be made available publicly on the SCI website at www.nycsci.org.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For the purposes of reports regarding the New York City Department of Education, the "head of agency" title refers to the Chancellor or a deputy chancellor.

retaliation for making such a report. If an employee believes they have been the subject of such retaliatory adverse personnel action, they may report such conduct to the Commissioner of DOI or, in the case of complaints regarding the DOE, the Special Commissioner, who maintains the powers conferred upon a deputy to the DOI Commissioner.

The Board of Education ("BOE") Whistleblower Resolution (1992) prohibits adverse personnel actions against an officer or employee of the DOE who reports information concerning conduct, which they know or reasonably believe to involve corrupt or other criminal activity, conflicts of interest, unethical conduct or misconduct by another officer or employee of the City School District, or by persons dealing with the City School District, to SCI.<sup>3</sup> SCI will then conduct an investigation into the matter. If SCI finds that an adverse personnel action was taken in retaliation for making such a report, the employee will be accorded protection and, if necessary, remedial relief, under the Whistleblower Law and the BOE resolution (together, the "WB Statutes").

In Fiscal Year ("FY") 2023, SCI received 18 complaints from individuals alleging retaliation for having previously reported official wrongdoing. Seven of those matters were investigated and closed within the FY with no further action. The chart below breaks down the complaints received by statutory subsection in FY 2023:

§2 (b)(1)	§2 (b)(2)	§2 (b)(5)
15	1	2

In addition, four complaints received by SCI during previous FY, were closed without further action in FY 2023, after findings that the complainants were not entitled to protection under the WB Statutes.

Fourteen cases being evaluated under the WB Statutes remained open and under investigation by SCI at the close of FY 2023 that commenced in FY 2023 or earlier.<sup>4</sup> The chart below breaks down the total open investigations under the WB Statutes by number of days active at the close of FY 2023:<sup>5</sup>

0 - 89	90 - 179	180 - 364	365 - 729	730 or greater
4	5	5	0	0

Finally, pursuant to New York City Administrative Code § 12-113, Section 4 (i)(5)(f), SCI currently employs approximately 20 full-time field investigators. Of those, eight investigators are assigned to a select team who solely investigate matters involving sexual or other inappropriate conduct by DOE employees or those doing business with the DOE. Those investigators would likely not be assigned an investigation involving a potential violation of the WB Statutes. The remaining 12 field

<sup>4</sup> Four of those investigations have since been closed during the current FY.

-2-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Board of Education is now referred to as the Panel for Educational Policy of the Department of Education.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Pursuant to local law, the officer or employee who initiated the complaints in these open matters have received written notice of the status of their claim by SCI personnel at least once in every 90-day period.

Hon. J. E. Strauber

investigators would all be eligible to investigate allegations of retaliation under the WB Statutes, and may be assigned those investigations on a rotating basis.

Sincerely,

ANASTASIA Coleman

ANASTASIA COLEMAN Special Commissioner of Investigation for the New York City School District

AC:DS:lr

cc: Andrew Brunsden – Deputy Commissioner/General Counsel Rebecca Chasan – Director of Intergovernmental Affairs/Special Counsel

-3-