

**COMMUNITY BOARD 7/MANHATTAN  
FULL BOARD MEETING Minutes**

May 5, 2020

*The Chair called the meeting to order at 6:32 PM.*

Explained the new order for tonight. Welcomed four new members and reminded them they could vote on items.

***Business Session***

**Preservation Committee, K Karpen and Michele Parker, Co-Chairpersons**

**Resolution Re:**

1. **12 West 72<sup>nd</sup> Street, Apt 27B, 28B & 29B** (Central Park West – Columbus Avenue.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to install two new masonry openings at the 28th floor on the building's East Façade for new French doors to existing terrace and two new masonry openings at the 29th floor on the building's East Façade for new double hung windows.

Michelle: This is part of a master plan that the whole building has agreed to. Cannot see it from street level.

Ken: Was there an abstention and why?

There was one abstention and it may have had something to do with a posting issue.

Audrey voted yes by voice over phone

Polly voted yes by voice over phone

Mark is yes

Doug is yes

Andrew is yes

VOTE: 37-0-2

**Parks & Environment Committee, Elizabeth Caputo and Klari Neuwelt, Co-Chairpersons**

**Resolutions Re:**

2. **Central Park.** Conservatory Garden, 5th Avenue between East 104<sup>th</sup>-106<sup>th</sup> Streets. This is an in-kind restoration of the garden's infrastructure, paving, fence and masonry. Limited regrading will be completed on an as-needed basis in compliance with ADA requirements.

Klari: Both of these resolutions were unanimous at Committee. We are invited to look at every project in Central Park. We joined a number of other CBs that looked at this and approved it.

Robert: This is great work. Surprised that there wasn't the option of sharing the staircase with a ramp because there's an aesthetic charm to the stairs. Wouldn't this be wide enough?

Klari: We didn't discuss this at committee. There's another area that will not be ADA accessible.

Page: There will be a public meeting and these two projects are going before the Landmarks Commission on Friday and then to the Public Design Commission. That will be advisory. Can we support this at all three venues?

Klari: Our resolution includes the notion of appropriateness. We heard this at Parks rather than LPC, but we did include the language of appropriateness. It will be good for all hearings.

We will bundle this resolution with the next one.

3. **Central Park.** Dairy Access Path, mid-park, near 65<sup>th</sup> Street. Addition of a ramp and regarding the path to the Dairy Visitor Center to achieve accessibility.

Scott R: Why replace the hex pavers?

Klari: The original material was brick, so the decision has been made to restore it to that state. The hex block pavers were put in 20-30 years ago. This is restoration to the historic condition.

VOTE (bundled 2/3): 42-0-0-0

Audrey: Yes by Voice

Polly voted yes by voice over phone

Madge: Hand raised on screen

Mark: Yes by voice

Doug: Yes by Voice

Andrew: Yes by Voice

Rich: Yes by Voice

Shelley: Hand raised on screen

Josh Cohen: Hand raised on screen

#### **Health and Human Services Committee, Catherine DeLazzero and Sheldon Fine, Co-Chairpersons**

##### **Resolution Re:**

4. Providing for the Most Vulnerable New Yorkers in the COVID-19 Crisis.

Shelley: At the time of this meeting, the Mayor was considering establishing 600 rooms for people who could benefit from being isolated. We have the model in our own community of Euclid hall being evacuated to hotel rooms (⅓ of residents have returned). Resolution supports that plan, but insists that it meet certain demands - have nurses on premises available at all times and provide three meals a day. Passed committee unanimously.

Audrey: Yes by Voice

Polly voted yes by voice over phone

Madge: Hand raised on screen

Mark: Yes by voice

Doug: Yes by Voice

Andrew: Yes by Voice

Rich: Yes by Voice

Shelley: Hand raised on screen

Peter Samtom: Hand raised on screen

Blanche: Yes by Voice

VOTE: 44-0-0-0

*New Business*

***Approval of minutes from the March full board meeting***

***Approval of minutes from the April full board meeting***

Two typographical corrections. With those changes, motion to approve:

VOTE: 41-0-3-0

Mark: Yes by voice

Doug: Yes by Voice

Andrew: Yes by Voice

Rich: Yes by Voice

Shelley: Hand raised on screen

Peter: Hand raised on screen

Michele: Hand raised on screen

Polly voted yes by voice over phone

***Chair's Report***

*Mark N. Diller*

Welcome new members:

Erana Stenant: not in attendance

Courtney Clark Metakis: Interested in Transportation and YEL, Communications Task Force

Beverly Donohue: Interested in YEL and background in city budgeting, task force on elderly

Rosa Arenas: Interested in Transportation and YEL

Request for leave of absence for Jeanette Rausch. Obligated to take a vote on this. This is related to a personal tragedy.

VOTE: Unanimous voice vote

Congrats to BCI for a timely and informative panel. Congrats to Andrew Rigie for being appointed to Governor's panel on reopening.

Food Insecurity: Shout out to Children's Aid - Amy is facilitating food distribution.

Polly: NYCHA resident leaders have been working together since December 2019 - meeting every month at Goddard Riverside to bring up rate of Census response within public housing community. With COVID, we switched gears. Very proud of all resident leaders.

Shelly: Grab and Go programs at Schools. City expanded to provide Halal and Kosher meals, but didn't include UWS. But there should be a program on the UWS within a week. We need volunteers to pick up the meals because a large number of people are stay-at-home.

***Community Session***

*We welcome all members of our community (residents, businesses, CBOs) who would like to speak on issues of interest to them. Members of the community are granted two minutes for remarks, and we will also accept a written copy for the record.*

*Madelyn Innocent*

Thank you to Linda Rosenthal and Gale Brewer for always being there for NYCHA. NYCHA is in crisis and we are getting a lot of misinformation in NYCHA. No help for our residents. We are overwhelmed.

*Dan Cohen*

Parks - new restrooms will go forward. \$76,000 grant - planted over two dozen trees and tree guards in neighborhood. Presidential Primary is back on - a judge has overruled the decision to cancel this.

*Winn Armstrong*

Park West Village - Proposal for a better lead bill which will reduce the amount of toxins that one is allowed. Standards recommended by Earth Justice, endorsed by Ninth Circuit Court. Legislation was passed by Senate in last session, but was not taken up by Assembly, so it's now in both chambers this session. A7635; S5615

*Lisa Orman*

As we start to emerge from this PAUSE, we have lots of choices to make. The old normal didn't support healthy outcomes for many in our population. We can put our heads in the sand and yearn for a return to old normal - people will be afraid of public transit and won't feel safe taking it; Or we can plan for a new normal - build out a system of bike lanes and pedestrian-only spaces where people can safely navigate the city without getting into a car. Build a city that supports our climate goals, health goals and safety goals. Pick-up/delivery zones, bike lanes, etc. Bus-only lanes on every avenue. Create a dynamic, healthy neighborhood for all.

*Peter Arndtsen*

Major concern about discontinuance of organics program - more rats on the street. A number of possible open streets up in our area. Concerned about vehicles. In the past two weeks the speeds of vehicles have increased and lack of concern by drivers. Hotel and shelter on West 107th street and concerned that they are not doing what's necessary to protect tenants.

*Morrissey Perfetti*

Co-op owner and resident of 102 West 85th Street - concerned over Motorino's request to increase seating capacity. There have been issues since they opened. Still soot that collects on my counter-top, rugs, etc.

*Sharon Pope-Marshall, Bike New York*

Will not be teaching biking skills the same way in 2020. We will have videos on our website. Significant uptick in the number of bike riders in the city and we want to reach them.

*Reports by Elected Officials*

*State Senator Robert Jackson*

Happy to be here and listen to the issues in the community. We have two working groups working on COVID issues to pass legislation before June: Housing and Revenue. Session is supposed to end around June 2nd because everyone is up for reelection. We will be working past that time and then will have to come back in session sometime during the summer or early fall to deal with matters having to do with the budget.

*Councilmember Mark Levine:*

What's next in our battle against COVID? We're making real progress in reducing the rate of infection. So when can we start reopening? Even considering our progress, we know from other places around the world that if we start reopening now we risk a rebound. We need to build something really big: a massive system of testing, contact tracing, isolating and quarantining. This would allow people out in the public to feel pretty confident that there's no one contagious. Ensure that people who are isolating will have access to food, medicine, etc. Offer people hotel rooms where they can isolate from their families. Public Health Corps. Also a source of meaningful employment.

*State Senator Brad Hoylman:*

10-17 billion deficit. Revenue raising is going to be crucial at the state level at this time. So many of our constituents are facing unemployment, having to homeschool and facing eviction all at the same time. New bills: Tenant Safe Harbor Act - current moratorium only lasts until June 18th and landlords could move to evict tenants on June 19th. We need to give tenants an additional amount of time to get back on their feet and start paying rent. Under this legislation, no one's non-payment of rent could be grounds for eviction. Want to make sure that the most healthy individuals pay  
Legislation that would mandate that subway remains 24/7

*Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal:*

Hundreds of constituent issues. Unemployment: loophole in the law, which allows the Department of Labor to withhold unemployment benefits if a person owes a forfeit penalty. They're doing that now to people who have nothing but their unemployment benefits. Introduced a bill that would allow the Department of Labor to put the forfeiture toll at the end of this crisis.

Rent Guidelines Board is recommending increase in rent, even though people can't pay their rent now. This is a crisis that has been kicked down the road to June when the moratorium gets lifted. We need a plan.

Construction: 200 Amsterdam got more permits because their work is considered an emergency.

*Councilmember Helen Rosenthal:*

City Council evaluating West 96th Street. Doing my best to lower AMI levels and adding more affordable units. Working to add Kosher meals to the grab and go meals.

Opening up streets: One rule is that you cannot open a street that has a bus route. Portions of West End Avenue that might work. But the City is asking the community to figure out a way to maintain reasonable use. Reaching out to community groups to see if they can help.

Housing Clinic with Just Fix - free online tools for tenants.

City's Budget Negotiating Team: fighting against draconian cuts. Don't believe in passing an austerity budget. Now is not the time to just balance our budget with cuts. We have to continue to invest in our workforce and infrastructure.

State Senator Jose Serrano, Jr.

This disease is ravaging our city, especially communities of color. Racial and ethnic health disparities. Our public health policy needs to address these issues - we are vulnerable to situations like this in the future if we don't shore up our public health policy. Worried about small business and cultural and arts institutions. The arts are going to be our way out of this economic downturn.

*Borough President Gale Brewer:*

Food for seniors. Platform so that senior centers can see which seniors are getting food from the city and who else needs food. Fresh Direct has been donating services. Been giving out masks to senior centers. West 96th Street - AMI has to come down, needs to be more affordable. If I had my way, 100% of the development would be at a low AMI. Some of it is city-owned land, so that's why we have negotiating power. Contact tracing is the biggest issue.

*Assemblymember Richard Gottfried:*

Chair State Health Committee. Pressing state health department to come forward with data on the number of COVID cases and deaths, especially for each nursing home. We will be holding public hearings related to the epidemic. Pressing for legislature to reconvene in remote session, and meet in person in summer/fall when we're able. Epidemic has highlighted flaws in many aspects of our system/economy/etc. We must learn from this.

*Reports by Elected Officials' Representatives (One-minute remarks)*

*Mike Stinson, Comptroller Scott Stringer's Office*

Analysis of 2021 Exec Budget - city's over-reliance on reserves and one-time savings. Fed government should pass need-based budget relief. City agencies should identify more recurring savings. More than 900,000 New Yorkers will lose their jobs by the end of the second quarter in June - 1/5 New York workers.

*Hannah Weinerman, Congressman Nadler's Office*

PPP program has a lot lacking, but if you have specific cases or questions feel free to contact office. 212-367-7350. Working on next stimulus package. Want to support small businesses by removing 75/25% rule for PPP that prohibits using more than 25% for non-[payroll costs, given how expensive rent is in places like NYC. Business Interruption Insurance to cover pandemics. Funding for USPS, MTA, etc. Stronger oversight of stimulus funds. Rental and Housing assistance.

## STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Mark Diller, Chair

May 19, 2020 6:30 PM

*Meeting began at 6:33 PM.*

1. Welcome New Members
2. Recap of new agenda and voting procedures during online Full Board meetings
  - Mark: Do we want to continue to have the business session before the public session for the June Full Board meeting?
  - Klari: I am all for having the business section first. However, the joint resolution from the Parks & Environment and Transportation committees is likely to take some time.
  - Christian: I am in favor of doing the business session first again.
  - Roberta: I think we should do the business session first.
  - Sara: I would like to do the business session first, but it would be nice if we had an expected time for the business session to end at so that we don't make the public wait too long
  - Louisa: I'm for the business session first, I think it worked very well last month.
  - Elizabeth: I agree on the business session first. I think we can divide the public session between electeds/their representatives and the actual public. We need to give pointers to electeds so they don't talk for too long about political issues. They can send digital/email newsletters and updates as well.
  - Mark: I sent a two page memo to elected officials last month about this and will follow up again this month.
  - Barbara: I agree that we should have the business session first. At the end of a long meeting the last resolutions normally get short shrift.
  - Shelly: During the business session, the public can speak to specific items on the agenda. If we put some time limits on agenda items, we can have a more efficient meeting. I think the business section should go first.
  - Jay: I agree with doing the business session first. I also agree with Elizabeth that we need to limit the time allotted to public officials.
  - Rich: I think the reason that we're all unanimous about this is that electeds have abused their privilege to speak. We can make conditions for certain electeds who want to speak before the business session for 1-2 minutes. I think there are creative solutions that can preserve some of the benefits while keeping the business session first.
  - Steven: I agree with everyone. There's no perfect agenda, but this agenda puts our priorities in better order.
  - Doug: I agree that the business session should go first with some exceptions. If officers from our Precincts or electeds are pressed for time we can allow them to go first.
  - Cindy: I agree, but in response to Richard's point about certain members of the public being more worthy to go before the business session than others, I don't think that's necessarily fair.
  - Mark: We will stick with the business session first for another month. I propose that the business session starts at 6:30 and that comments from the general public are expected to begin

at 7:30. If you want to provide any input on topics for the sheet I send to elected officials, please email me.

- Mark: How did voting procedures last month work for the secretaries in terms of keeping track of the votes? Do we want to revert back to roll call?
  - Julian: The roll call was more accurate than the hand-counting, which didn't match up with attendance. I would prefer roll call votes, though these might be difficult if we have a lot of resolutions. Both are easy for us as secretaries to do, so I defer to what you all think.
  - Christian: With a long list of agenda items we can do a roll call vote at the end of the meeting and with a short list of items we can do a vote after each.
  - Mark: How about we do a roll call after each committee's resolutions?
  - Klari: Of the resolutions that came out of the Transportation and P&E meeting, there was a mix of opposition
  - Mark: This is not a bundle. You'll be called on once after each committee presents their resolutions and asked to share your votes for each of them.
  - Seema: I'm fine with the idea of grouping voting by committee, but I've noticed on other Zoom calls the ability to poll the members that we could potentially use.
  - Mark: Unfortunately that feature doesn't work with this set-up. It polls attendees, which are our public, instead of panelists, which are the Board members.
  - Rich: I think there is a polling capability for both panelists and attendees, we'd just have to filter out any attendees that voted.
  - Mark: We can try that for one committee's vote next meeting, but I don't want secretaries to have to parse whether or not someone who cast a vote is entitled to vote in the middle of the meeting. One of our obligations is to announce whether a resolution passed during the meeting, which an ambiguity of who is allowed to vote could interfere with. We'll give the polling method one try and then do a roll call after each committee for the rest.
  - Susan: I'm more in favor of resolution by resolution roll call. It's the most appropriate way to let the community know what we're doing. Transportation is the only committee that has more than one resolution, so it doesn't seem like a problem to have just one more roll call.
  - Jay: My instinct tells me that when you take a roll call, you start out by knowing the number of eligible voters. If we subtract the number of Nos, Abstentions, and Ineligibles from this list, then we can assume the number of Yeses and save time.
  - Mark: I see how this would work, but I'm worried about the assumption of Yes votes.
  - Ken: I think the reason the roll call didn't work in April was because it was at the end of the meeting.
  - Mark: We'll have the business session first, we'll try one poll based off of Rich's idea, and then my thinking is we'll do one roll call per committee with a separate roll call for the Transportation committee resolutions which might attract more attention.
3. Reminder re- looking ahead to formulate Committee agendas. Thanks to Committee Co-chairs for timely May agendas
- Mark: Thank you to committee chairs, the public has noticed, it would be great if we could keep this up.



#### 4. Timely submission of resolutions and minutes

- Mark: Please get them (resolutions and minutes) to Penny the Wednesday of the week before Full Board.
- Madelyn: I had a call with Danny O'Donnell where he shared that they will be doing free testing for both the live COVID-19 virus and antibodies for NYCHA residents at 96th and Amsterdam. It will be important to let people know about this.
- Mark: I asked Gabriel Lowenstein to share the flyer (which they believe they'll have by tomorrow) with us, and we will share in our email.
- Christian: All City MDs are testing sites. This new testing site might be the CVS.

#### 5. Review of June Full Board Agenda

- Planning for the public session
- Resolutions that may require meeting management strategies
  - Mark: We've already heard that the joint Transportation and P&E resolution might be controversial, and I welcome additional thoughts.
  - Barbara: The agenda for the Full Board meeting was put on the CB7 website a few hours ago and seems to be missing that resolution.
  - Mark: I sent an email with the updated title and resolution content to all Board members earlier today and it will be updated on the website tomorrow.
  - K: Preservation is going to have one resolution.
  - Klari: Last night, Elizabeth and I at our committee had a very good discussion on the suspension of composting and on social distancing in our parks. We don't have a resolution on either of those topics, but if you find it appropriate we'd like to give a very brief report at Full Board.
  - Elizabeth: We had a good conversation with DSNY on composting. I can send updates in an email or answer questions now.
  - Klari: The discussion last night included many community members with concerns about social distancing in our parks. Several dog owners were arguing that it was unreasonable to keep dog runs closed. There were also concerns about runners on paths. There were also concerns that the efforts of police and rangers in handing out masks and enforcing social distancing were lacking in success.

#### 6. District Needs Statement

- Discussion of role of Adding Covid-19 issues and responses in DNS
  - Mark: Our work on the DNS and Budget Priorities is even more important now. I urge every committee to give thoughts this month and take action next month as to what these should say.
- Strategies for outreach to public/outside sources of data, information and issues

#### 7. New business

- Mark: An issue that was suggested for our Board to take action on was outdoor seating for restaurants when they reopen. I'm going to call on Andrew to start the conversation on this.
- Andrew: The issue at hand is how we support restaurants in the immediate crisis and in mid/long terms recovery. We still don't know the specifics of how reopening is going to work,

but if there is reduced capacity reopening indoors, then we'll need to replace that lost revenue with outdoor seating. I recently co-wrote an article with Council Speaker Johnson on this. Some ideas include closing streets, using pedestrian plazas, using parking lots, etc. Basically finding ways for restaurants to set up and continue in this new normal and also add back some liveliness to our streets. I'm a firm believer that there needs to be community input and we need to try to make this work for as many people as possible. We would love to have feedback from our community about where these setups can take place and how we can do this in an orderly way given all the different considerations.

- Mark: All of the people I have spoken to have shared that operating at 25-50% capacity won't be enough for restaurants to break even, is this true Andrew?
- Andrew: Yes, of the 500+ restaurants we surveyed, the majority said they needed at least 70% capacity to break even.
- Linda: Our discussion at BCI last week included discussion of how we can use streets and side streets to help restaurants. We're going to try to work with various regulatory agencies (DCA, DOB, DOT) to have this discussion.
- Mark: It has been suggested to me that we take action on this at the June Full Board and not the July Full Board. At the minimum we need to inform the public and include regulatory agencies and potentially restaurateurs in this discussion. Is it crucial that we have this resolution at the June Full Board?
- Linda: I think we can do it and pull a group together to have a discussion beforehand.
- Andrew: The earliest restaurants could start re-opening is July 15th, so this is imperative - the sooner the better. We need to have a system and criteria in place before restaurants start re-opening. One other thing I didn't mention is that not only will this be helpful to businesses, but I've read that being in outdoor open-air spaces is healthier than being in indoor enclosed areas.
- Mark: I anticipate if we are to have this meeting and pass a resolution, we would not have a discussion of block by block specifics, but rather a more general support of the idea and how it relates to transportation, etc. If we come up with a resolution that states that we're in favor of this and give time for the agencies to put it in place, we should pass this at the June meeting.
- Christian: We need some of the regulatory agencies to be present so we know what is possible.
- Doug: I think this is a great idea and that we want to support businesses to the extent that it's practical. Some concerns include businesses pulling out a window to provide to-go service for small businesses and how this works with the LPC and laws.
- Andrew: There are a lot of different and creative options for usages of street space (street seats, kiosks, sliding doors, etc.)
- Barbara: I support this. Whereas I think Amsterdam and Broadway would be easier to take some space, I think we should think in advance about what happens on Columbus Avenue which has a lot of restaurants and a bus lane on one side and a bike lane on the other.
- Andrew: We're working with a lot of different architects to come up with ideas to deal with this. Everyone is going to have to compromise with this issue however.

- Sara: I strongly support this. I think it's important that we do this before the June Full Board, and that even if we can't get all the regulatory agencies there beforehand, we should still vote on this and continue the discussion afterward.
- Jay: I agree that we need to do this at the June meeting. I ask other people waiting to speak to save specific suggestions for the meeting before the June Full Board (or for the Full Board meeting itself) rather than continue that discussion now.
- Louisa: You should have city planning there, as well as someone from Corey Johnson's office. You need both of these for these changes to be implemented fast enough.
- Mark: We should speak to this in our resolution and get an expert from City Planning to attend. The absence of such a person might not affect the outcome, but it could affect the contents of a resolution calling on them to do certain actions.
- Rich: One comment to Andrew: since the article you co-wrote with Speaker Johnson is paywalled, could you send it to the Board?
- Andrew: Yes.
- Mark: Does Thursday, May the 28th work for a meeting about this?
- Linda: Tuesday, Wednesday, or Thursday of that week should work. Let's get the representatives from 3-4 agencies and set this up.
- Mark: If we can't get City Planning to join us, maybe we can get our liaison from the Borough President's office.
- Shelly: Thursday night is a Jewish holiday.
- Mark: We'll do Wednesday the 27th then.
- Howard: Can we do this as an additional Steering committee meeting because it involves all committees.
- Mark: This will fall under BCI unless I get a confirmation that we'll have a quorum of the Steering committee from committee chairs by tomorrow at noon.
- Linda: This is a BCI issue, and you can come and vote as a non-committee member, but we can't have too many cooks in the kitchen.
- Mark: Can you send a poll to BCI to make sure you have a quorum for this meeting? That is our number one priority.
- Christian: Yes, we'll send an email.
- Page: We have a Land Use committee meeting tomorrow, and we can start drafting a resolution then to prepare for the 27th.
- Mark: We need to give notice to the public and agencies, so you can start thinking of ideas but hold off on a resolution until the meeting on the 27th.
- Rich: I'm thinking that it should be a joint meeting because any use of sidewalks and streets is a Transportation committee issue.
- Mark: The most important aspect of this is to get it onto the June agenda, which involved quorum and consensus. In order to be efficient, this is how I'm approaching it.
- Louisa: Come to the joint Housing and Land Use committee meeting tomorrow night. We will hear from the Regional Plan Association about Restoring the Promise of NYC's Public Housing, and we'll discuss 2551 Broadway, which will include voluntary Inclusionary Housing.

- Klari: I believe the meeting should be a Steering committee meeting because it includes Land Use, Parks & Environment, Transportation, and Preservation issues.
- Mark: If I don't get confirmation that we'll have a quorum of Steering committee from committee chairs by tomorrow at noon then this will remain a BCI meeting. It doesn't matter where this resolution comes from, but rather what we say when we vote at Full Board.
- Rich: I'm testing a new voting software. If you received an email, please respond to it and we can see how it works.

*Meeting was adjourned at 7:56 PM*

## Business & Consumer Issues Committee Minutes

Linda Alexander and Christian Cordova, Co-Chairpersons

Wednesday May 13, 2020

Business & Consumer Issues Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met via the Videoconferencing application Zoom. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm by Co-Chairperson Christian Cordova.

**Committee Members Present:** Linda Alexander, Christian Cordova, Barbara Adler, Joshua Cohen, Doug Kleiman, Seema Reddy, Madelyn Innocent

**Non-Committee Members Present:** Mark Diller, Beverly Donahue, Courtney Metakis, Michele Parker

**Committee Members Absent:** Paul Fischer, Andrew Rigie

The following matters were discussed:

### **New Unenclosed Sidewalk Café:**

1. **359 Columbus Avenue** (West 77th Street.) New application #2380-2020-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 8th Hill, Inc., d/b/a 8th Hill Restaurant, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 18 tables and 54 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Semi Seyzoglu, President; Phone: 347-659-5670; email: semi.feyzioglus8thhill@nyc.com

- The applicant said that there is an ADA ramp now in front of his restaurant, so he is losing two seats shown in his plan.
- The café will have 18 tables and 54 seats, the same size as the previous tenant.
- If city guidelines call for 6-feet of distancing, applicant will remove every other table or do whatever is required to meet the new guidelines.

CB7 Comments:

- The committee had no objections to the application, and offered to help them any way we could.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

Committee VOTE: 6-0-1-0

Non-Committee VOTE: 4-0-0-0

New Business:

1. Jeremy Wladis, head of The Restaurant Group (Harvest Kitchen, Good Enough to Eat, etc.) asked if the Committee would support closing Columbus Avenue to traffic at night or on weekends so that outdoor cafes could set up. He realizes Columbus is a truck route and bus route. The discussion by the committee involved utilizing space on the sidewalk that might become available, or possibly setting up on the side streets. Mark suggested giving all small businesses the opportunity to have merchandise outside, which requires involving regulatory agencies.
2. Doug Kleiman raised the issue that other businesses considered non-essential are beginning to ask if they can open with the same distancing or better now required by food markets. He also raised the

issue of insurance companies not paying policy claims of small business owners that they should be responsible for.

3. Future Agenda Item: For the next BCI agenda, the Committee will arrange to meet with representatives from state and city regulatory agencies overseeing different aspects of retail and restaurants, such as DCA, DOT and DOB, to discuss ways to help businesses once the city re-opens. Suggestions included exploring the possibility of extending footprints of sidewalk cafes to accommodate social distancing, using side streets for additional tables, and possibly allowing retailers to display items in front of their shops during the 2020 summer season.

The meeting ended at 7:28pm.

## **PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**

**Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Caputo, Co-Chairpersons**

Monday, May 18th, 2020, 6:30PM

*Committee Members present: Co-Chairs Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Caputo, Susan Schwartz, Doug McGowan, Natasha Kazmi, Ken Coughlin, Cindy Cardinal. Committee members absent: none. Non-Committee Board members present: CB 7 Chair Mark Diller, Erana Stennett, Courtney Metakis, Sara Lind, Doug Kleiman, Paul Fischer, Barbara Adler.*

*The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by the co-chairs.*

### **1. Suspension of NYC Curbside Compost, E-Waste Collection given COVID-19 Budget Cuts.**

Co-chair Elizabeth Caputo introduced the suspension of the NYC curbside composting program as a topic raised by committee member Cindy Cardinal last month and one that many community organizations have raised as a concern and about which Gale Brewer has proposed legislation with City Council members. Elizabeth introduced DSNY representatives Marissa Yanni, Community Coordinator, DSNY, and Andrew Hoyles, Senior Program Coordinator, Organics Outreach at DSNY. Matt Genrich, NYC DPR, was also introduced.

*Co-chair Elizabeth Caputo* introduced the DSNY representatives and asked that they address questions forwarded to them in advance concerning composting and rats and vermin.

Andrew Hoyles started by explaining that alternate side parking will be in effect this week and suspended the end of next week. E-waste pickup has been cancelled. Recycling and litter baskets are still being picked up. Andrew Hoyles said that Manhattan had an enrollment program for curbside composting. He had worked on the rollout. The goal was to “make compost not trash” and the department was rocked by the pandemic and the state of emergency. The economic impact on DSNY of reduced revenue to the city led to cuts being made and organics was one of those cuts. The program has been suspended for a year. It is planned to resume in FY 2022 in July of 2021. CB7 is in a high-performance area of the city. Due to social distancing, DSNY requested that food scrap drop-off sites suspend collection. At this time the collections cannot resume.

Advance questions had included alternative ways to compost. Andrew Hoyles said there are private sector options and alternatives. Gardens could be an option. – green spaces are closed to the public and only open to garden members so only the members can compost. There are micro haulers that compost for a fee at a site they have access to. He cannot recommend any of them but two that service our area are vokashi.com and commongroundcompost.com. There are larger waste haulers for larger buildings but they have contracts in place. You can also make your own compost at home – there is a web page on the DSNY site on how to continue to compost if you have the space and they will guide you if you want to have a worm bin.

Regarding the rat and vermin problem, the brown bins designated for curbside compost have latching lids and rodent proofing. You should keep your brown bin for when curbside composting restarts and report increased rodents to 311. You can purchase more secure latching bins to rodent-proof garbage. Do not put brown bin out because it can be accidentally discarded.

Cost citywide of the composting program: \$21 M including drop-off program, which is now being diverted to emergency efforts. All recycling staff have been activated to support emergency feeding efforts. The community compost subsidy of \$3.5M to train people to compost is under suspension. There has been a \$3 M

reduction in education staff that did site programs for GROWN NYC. According to FY2019 data, 154 tons a day of organics was collected. CB7 alone had over 3 tons of organic waste collected per day, or a 27% diversion rate which is higher than the city average. Andrew Hoyles said he cannot say the program would come back earlier than next summer. There is talk of a City Council bill but he doesn't know what the result will be. The message from DSNY/city government is that the program resumes June 30, 2021.

*Borough President Community Liaison for CB7 April Adams* says she is there to listen and they are looking at different partnerships and ways to continue composting.

*Community Q&A:*

*Q1: Peter Arndtsen, Columbus Amsterdam BID:* concerned because of effort to get the program going and now to restart programs – wishes targeted areas in garages were doing concentrated collections. LES has had difficulty with their site – how do they anticipate reopening?

*A1: Andrew Hoyles, DSNY:* all staff were redeployed on emergency response – they will take a deep look at parks that needed support and how outreach was working and how to model good support. The urgency was other issues like climate and rodents, now it is only COVID19 and once we can focus on other issues we can start from scratch and give help and support in doing so.

*A1: April Adams:* BP Gale Brewer believes organics collection is an essential service and has had a lot of correspondence about this. She is sponsoring two bills with City Council members Reynoso and Powers. They want three sites in each community district and recycling for inorganics. Block associations have been sending petitions to DSNY.

*Q2: Joyce Bialik:* regarding sites in districts -- where are they located -- are any being used already?

*A2: DSNY Andrew Hoyles:* as they are pushing forward, they will work with community and CB7 to identify best locations

*Q3: Kara Kelly:* Rodent problem on 69<sup>th</sup> Street – saved compost bins – 4 on the block. It worked to contain the rodents. They are thinking about using a private hauler next year – compost bins are important in keeping the rodent population down. There are more rats on the street already. What to do to get more participation when the program is back online?

*A3: DSNY Andrew Hoyles:* “Make compost not trash” effort is what they were in the middle of doing – asks that Kara email him.

*Q4: Daniel Atha, Upper West Side Neighborhood Naturalists:* Happy UWS participation is so good. His group promotes composting and wants it to resume asap. Wants it to transfer to lower income communities – maybe in bigger parks and could produce composting in parks to reduce having to transfer from one neighborhood to another. He supports Reynoso proposal.

*Board Q&A:*

*Q1: Committee member Cindy Cardinal:* What is effect of reduced amounts of garbage in our community, as the media have reported?

*A1: DSNY Marissa Gianni:* We have seen influx in residential garbage and they have not heard that there has been a reduction. There have been fewer litter basket pickups. Co-Chair Klari Neuwelt noted that the NY Times reported that the weight of the garbage collected was less.

*Q2: Committee member Ken Coughlin:* It is interesting what is considered indispensable. What percent is picked up from farmers' markets – is that about the cost or social distancing?



A2: *DSNY Andrew Hoyles*: Funding was reallocated to emergency feeding response and staff are engaged in feeding. \$3.5M – processing; \$6M total. Parks are a separate agency from DSNY. *Geoff Martin, Riverside Park*: Composting twigs etc in park – he will find out about whether there is interest at Parks. It has come up before and is not up to him. Ken added that in Central Park, southwest of the Conservancy Gardens there are woodchips and wondered if compost could go there. He asked for further clarification about the amount of organic waste collected per day – was it average per day or actual amounts each day it was picked up? Andrew Hoyles will get back to us with numbers. Chair Mark Diller asked if it was in Mayor’s management report.

*DSNY Andrew Hoyles* noted that organic waste collection was suspended May 4. He reiterated the websites <https://vokashi.com> and <http://commongroundcompost.com> and noted that this was his third or fourth community meeting on this issue (indicating there is widespread interest) and that different parts of the city use different microhaulers, which use bikes.

*Co-chair Klari Neuwelt* noted there would not be a resolution tonight but we can connect people to DSNY representatives and leverage our social media and the CB7 website. She asked that they stay in touch with us. Committee member Ken Coughlin asked about a resolution supporting the Reynoso bill, but *Co-chair Neuwelt* noted the committee hasn’t seen the bill, but said we will stay on top of it and she thanked the board member who raised the issue.

## **2. Discussion of social distancing in our parks.**

*Co-chair Klari Neuwelt* introduced *Caroline Greenleaf* of Central Park Conservancy, *Geoff Martin* of Riverside Park, *Matt Genrich* of NYC DPR (other than Riverside and Central Parks) to present and answer questions about this topic.

*Geoff Martin* stated that pursuant to the mandates from the Mayor and Governor they have their bases covered – they are cleaning and disinfecting vehicles. They can only do so much regarding the general public, such as handing out masks and educating the public on how to stay safe. *Matt Genrich* stated that PEP officers are out and that we must rally together and although masks are not pleasant this is about everyone. *Caroline Greenleaf* echoed what was said and added that NYPD has been doing a great job in Central Park. Police have been on scooters, on foot, monitoring Sheep Meadow – they closed entry to Sheep Meadow one hour on Saturday until the crowd thinned. Central Park is honoring social distancing – the park is very popular and they have a bolstered team out for a ten hour period roving the park and reminding people about social distancing. They are asking runners to please put masks on although it is a challenge. There has been interaction between maskless runners and others with masks and they are asking everyone to WEAR A MASK IN THE PARK.

### *Community Q&A:*

*Q1: Modechai Levovitz*: as a dog owner, wants to say the lawns are crowded, the dog parks are closed, it is hard to shelter in place with a crazy dog. Dogs are unleashed and it makes no sense that the dog runs are closed.

*A1: Geoff Martin*: people gather in the dogs runs – closure order came from top officials and is city-wide from the Governor and Mayor. Similar to the courts in the parks – it was announced at the top. *Caroline Greenleaf*: Dogs can be off leash in Central Park before 9 am. They do not have dog runs. She hopes they will reopen dog runs.

*Q2: David Lipsky:* He's concerned about runners and bicyclers – sweat and breath. Riverside Park's narrow lanes are problematic. The most enforcement is on flats over railroad tracks. Need signage and enforcement/presence at entrances.

*A2: Klari Neuwelt:* Questions whether there are any people who don't know what to do. Most comply – why will signs help? We don't have better ideas – people know and are selfishly not complying. Police cannot chase runners or bikers.

*Q3: Lisa Orman:* Runners think they don't need masks. At reservoir, cars and vans are still there. It is a hotspot for overcrowding. Hudson River Greenway overcrowding – bikes.

*A3: Caroline Greenway:* There is crowding on Bridle Path. Conservancy doesn't park there. NYPD needs a place to park—you can reach out to NYPD. Parks vehicles have leaf on the side, the Conservancy has their logo. *Geoff Martin:* Requiring bikes to go from Greenway onto RSD would not be a popular mandate. He wears a mask when riding and encourages people to do so. Maybe there should be signs to slow people; it is hard to enforce bike speed. There are signs with pointing arrows on various fences etc showing a 6' distance to remind people.

*Q4: Carly Masucci:* More signs could help re masks. Without dog run she needs to walk her one year old dog for 3 hours a day to give it sufficient exercise and she is 5 months pregnant. She says should have a right to go to a contained area with masks and social distancing to exercise pet rather than a crowded path. People are making their own dog runs – strange dogs are off leash. Don't need to have human interaction in dog run. Closing dog runs only makes other areas less safe.

*Q5: Dean Vogel:* Would like to see explorations of of contained space for dogs to be off leash. Perhaps south of 79<sup>th</sup> street? Water for dogs is needed – no water fountains are on. Is there a plan to turn fountains on?

*A5: Co-chair Klari Neuwelt:* Some comfort stations are open, and we appreciate that – maybe can get water in there. *Geoff Martin:* It is up to senior officials to turn on fountains – contamination issues exists and it is a risky proposition. He is making a note – maybe there is a way to outfit hydrants for dogs while not encouraging people to drink.

*Q6: Christian Cooper:* Board member with NYC Audubon – a side effect of the epidemic of unleashed dogs is the effect on birds and people – North Woods, Strawberry Fields, the Rambles are all experiencing unleashed dogs. You can't have dogs off leash through plantings. It has gotten ugly between birders and unleashed dog walkers. Enforcement on Strawberry Fields – some think it's a dog run. The Rambles – areas where people let dogs loose. Some people violate the rules and some are not aware. Should flag the enforcement piece for the Conservancy and Parks.

*A6: Caroline Greenleaf* asked for information from him. *Matt Genrich* said he will take this information back to Parks enforcement and Parks rangers. *Committee member Doug McGowan* stated that unleashed dogs are related to the comments of our neighbors without dog runs.

*Q7: Sam Gedymin:* Would be able to gather volunteers to wipe benches and maintain and sanitize dog parks. His business is Far Fetched Pets. [Farfetchedpets@gmail.com](mailto:Farfetchedpets@gmail.com)

*A7:* He will talk off line with CB7 Chair Mark Diller. He was directed to Geoff Miller and Riverside Park Conservancy – once the runs open again. No group for 72<sup>nd</sup> Street run.

*Q8: Ira Gershenhorn:* Issue with a Prius in bike lane and there is much confusion and crowding in Riverside.

A8: *Geoff Miller*: here is a noticeable number of cyclists on the Rosenthal bypass from 83<sup>rd</sup> to 91<sup>st</sup> along river. Discussion of a police vehicle almost hitting cyclist. In answer to question of whether PEP officers are doing anything to enforce no cyclists in the bypass, Geoff said yes, and he knows because he sees the reports. He points out that a summons can lead to an arrestable offense and then having to bring an offender to the precinct, thus taking the PEP officer away from the park.

#### Committee Q&A

Q1: *Natasha Kazmi*: wanted to make a few points (1) enforcement: people are being unnecessarily blasè (2) Central Park above 86<sup>th</sup> Street is more civilized re social distancing. Maybe ambassadors, rangers can direct people further north by indicating there is more space north of 86<sup>th</sup> Street. (3) parking issue at the reservoir – parking area near north meadow near handball courts – divert cars to that area (4) unleashed dogs – she lives near AMNH – people are using the lawns at the museum as private dog runs (5) sanitizing dog runs – could use the Link NYC screens

Q2: *Courtney Metakis*: dog parks -- playgrounds are closed which means her kids go to play in the park behind Lincoln Center (Damrosch Park) – dogs are unleashed there, which is problematic. Need to separate kids and dogs

A2: *Matt Genrich*: Parks enforcement is aware and is doing spot checks

Q3: *Doug McGowan*: Echoes Courtney's comments. Thanks Parks leadership. We need to come together as a community. He has two daughters under 6 and a wife and a dog. Wants to know why some decisions were made – some things open others closed. Should consider impact of having less space (dog runs and playgrounds closed) on social distance. Who to petition about some decisions made on social distancing? Interior of running track closed or appears closed and that could be open space.

A3: *CB 7 Chair Mark Diller*: track is open and interior fenced off – but there is almost always someone in there. *Matt Genrich*: go to DOT – request streets be open. Co-Chair Klari Neuwelt: West 75<sup>th</sup> Street and a stretch of WEA open as well.

Q4: *Ken Coughlin*: Recommends 87<sup>th</sup> to 96<sup>th</sup> Street on WEA – something between a park and a street – saw tennis players there. Masks on runners and cyclists are lower on the hierarchy of concerns. Co-Chair Klari Neuwelt disagreed.

Q5: *Susan Schwartz*: Why is it so hard to enforce laws re dogs; have NYPD enforce social distancing (it often goes badly)

A5: *Geoff Miller*: full on enforcement means arresting and going to precinct; mandates are from senior parks officials

Q6: *Cindy Cardinal*: Dog leash and mask wearing issues are similar – people know what the rules are and don't think rules apply to them. We should all be following the rules to protect each other.

Co-chair Klari Neuwelt noted that the committee is reluctant to try to micromanage parks. One thread of the discussion regarding dogs off leash and unmasked residents is that education and distributing masks is not satisfactory in achieving the aims of social distancing and protection. Our overall message would be that concern. People do not care what the rules are – they are so focused on maximizing their ability to exercise and not get sick. Co-chair Elizabeth Caputo added it just takes one person – whatever we can do to push – we need

to focus on making sure they know CB7 has this as a priority and that it is critically important now. She agrees everyone needs to follow the rules and wear masks to protect each other. CB7 Chair Mark Diller thanked the parks people for taking back our concerns and build momentum – we need to cajole, coerce, require people to do the right thing and we need to continue the conversation. Runners and cyclists with masks under their chins are unwilling to follow the rules.

### **3. Update on committee discussions**

a. Co-chair Klari Neuwelt noted that signaling in Central Park came up at our joint meeting with the Transportation Committee this month. At our next meeting, joint with Transportation, we are putting a discussion about signaling on the drives on our agenda.

b. Co-Chair Klari Neuwelt also stated that there is concern about the former Tavern on the Green parking lot will be used for private vehicles. It is currently accommodating the private vehicles of Central Park Conservancy staff but it needs to be converted to parklike uses and not parking for workers.

c. CB7 Chair Mark Diller noted that the Conservancy Garden and Dairy projects that this committee reviewed at our last meeting went to LPC which gave them some suggestions for better ways to do things -- there was no public comment. The Public Design Commission favorably received the projects and they will be approved soon.

d. Susan Schwartz inquired about the suffragette statue. It was approved but the foundry is not operating. The funding is secure and it will be happening – it is only a matter of logistics.

### **4. Future agenda items**

a. Signaling on Central Park drives

b. Off leash dogs situation – Susan will craft proposed agenda item – not specific to Coronavirus. Address issue at the Rambles and Strawberry Field.

### **5. New business.**

Co-chair Elizabeth Caputo raised the issue of enforcement by NYPD disproportionate with people of color and that this is critically important we need to ask these questions—is it happening in parks? Co-chair Klari Neuwelt agrees. Are there statistics for how true this is in CB7? Overall impression is that no one is getting summonses. Chris Cooper was assaulted – aggression between parks users.

*The meeting was adjourned at 8:56 p.m.*

## YOUTH, EDUCATION & LIBRARIES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Steven Brown and Blanche Lawton, Co-Chairpersons

Thursday, May 21, 2020, 6:30 PM via Zoom

*Meeting began at 6:31 PM.*

1. Discussion of current issues concerning the NYC Department of Education, including the fiscal year 2021.
  - Helen Rosenthal (Councilmember, District 6): We've been able to distribute food and help connect people with domestic violence shelters. I've been working hard through the Committee on women to get the administration to put some muscle into addressing domestic violence. We're thinking about what the budget is going to look like when at least 10% of our revenue has gone away. Because this is a revenue problem, I believe we have to have a revenue solution, and that it would be shortsighted to take a wack at programs that serve the most vulnerable. I do think we should have some cuts, but we're not going to get to the \$10 billion needed with cuts. I don't think we should be using as much of the reserves as the Mayor proposes. Every time someone makes money off of a stoke deal, why aren't they paying taxes? I think we should think outside the box - I think we should be taxing professional services the way that we tax goods when we go to the supermarket. This is the definition of a crisis. I think we have to borrow, it's not a choice thing. I think we should package it very differently than what happened in the 70s. We're in this situation because, in 10 weeks, \$10 billion in revenue has gone away. The only option if we do not take loans is more severe cuts, adding to unemployment in the city: the last thing that we want to do. The SYEP costs only \$123 million, and this is money that youth take back to their families. We should be spending capital money in order to get people back to work. We're at the point where almost a million New York City residents have filed for unemployment. On the education front, I'm hearing that the Mayor is determined to open up the schools in September if he gets the go-ahead from health officials. Unless there's a vaccine or a cure, I don't know how we put our children in harm's way.
  - Kim Watkins (President, CEC3): Whatever Fair Student Funding (FSF) hit we take as a school system will directly impact our schools. Not everything is in there, but a lot is (salaries, supplies, etc.). We know that part of the cuts suggested by the Mayor included \$100 million funding cuts to FSF. I've been looking with other advocacy groups into ways we can put this money back into the budget. Federal stimulus money may still be in play, however, which would benefit New York City. State revenue is unlikely to come.
  - Helen: Exactly. I don't understand why the advocacy work isn't focused on the governor.
  - Kim: It's interesting to hear the state legislators talk about this process as if they don't have control. There is a bill we were talking about with the Alliance for Quality Education which is a tax for certain high incomes which would raise revenue (\$7378). For parents in District 3, we're faced with a confusing point in time, because there really is no way to tackle this issue at this point in time. For PTAs which have paid into the DOE to pay for teaching assistants, those employees were furloughed, and that money has not given back to PTAs, who would use it to plan for next year. For now, the DOE is not budging on sending that money back to PTAs. In terms of plans for the Fall, we're all still waiting to hear what the plans might look like. There's

- only one parent from CEC3 on the City task force to address education re-opening, as well as at the state level. As far as engagement rates and devices, we're doing well (in the 90th percentiles) across District 3. For the most part, we've seen a lot of positive feedback coming out of families. The grading policy is what it is. What we're trying to get to know is conversations with the DOE about admissions policies and other policies for the following year.
- Steven: My concerns are along with the Mark Treyger letter about where are these cuts coming from. I was just curious about your thoughts about the letter itself. I'm very passionate that there should be administrative cuts, and that cuts to students should come last.
  - Helen: Yes, and that's standard practice. We're expecting the administration to do that.
  - Steven: The administration has grown quite a bit over the past 3 years, and I think that that was fine, but when it comes to cuts, they should be first.
  - Helen: If you have any ideas, send them our way.
  - Steven: I have a whole list to share with you, and I think there's a tremendous amount to be done. I think it's going to come down to you and people like you to say that's not enough.
  - Kim: The PEP met last night, and another tech contract was approved last night for \$1.8 million for the company that is managing remote learning. I find this frustrating because we've already contracted with Zoom, Microsoft Teams, Adobe Connect, etc. The bloated and gradual increase of centralized costs does get to a breaking point. This is a problem with Mayoral control; there are volunteer parents and mayoral appointees (the PEP) that get to decide how we spend our budget. We need to fight that structure as a long term project.
  - Steven: I agree 100%, I do think we have to be smart about it. I personally know over half a dozen parents who aren't planning on coming back to NYC after the pandemic, which wouldn't be good for a diminishing tax base.
  - Helen: I agree with you that we should be concerned about the loss of the middle class and the loss of our tax base. If we want people to stay in the city, we have to have a good public school system.
  - Blanche: You mentioned that the big concern and emphasis is revenue and borrowing. From whom would we borrow?
  - Helen: There are options: you go to the market, you go to the pension fund, you go to the Federal government. What I would push for is cold hard cash from the Federal government - there's no getting around it. You could almost set it up like the PPE, as long as the government is going it's forgiven.
  - Blanche: How would one float a bond and is that even a possibility?
  - Helen: The last time our city went to the market we had an A1 rating. Fundamentally we need the money from the Federal government.
  - Blanche: I thought I heard that there is a plan for the summer for certain grades to continue remote learning.
  - Kim: The proposal as I understand it is to vastly increase the number of spots for summer school.
  - Blanche: Has there been much discussion about the reliance of remote learning on parents?

- Kim: I feel it myself in my own home with an elementary school student. The population in NYC that is disproportionately affected by these challenges is black and brown families, families in temporary housing, and homeless children. On top of the health crisis, there's so much that makes it really all over the map, which is one of the reasons why it's important for us to stay focused on the whole child and what's important.
- Mark: A concern that I have is the uncertainty about when folks are going to be able to send their children to school and after school. I don't understand how you can re-open the economy and terminate the unemployment benefits of families who have children at home and nowhere to send the children. The other question I'm wrestling with is how are we handling the transition to middle school/high school if there is remote learning next year. Are we doing anything to try to onboard children to the new environment that will be the source of their remote learning?
- Kim: Middle school Principals have been working closely with parents to be present for them by reaching out and being open regarding any questions they may have. If you have a child that's moving from one building to another, we're in this retracted time where we're figuring everything out. Middle schools will have to do a little extra work but I'm sure they're capable of that. As far as your first question, the problem is we don't know what the fall is going to be like. I know that there are many families considering leaving the system, which could cause it to contract. Maybe public schooling morphs into something that fits the needs of people in some better way. Maybe there's an opportunity for the schoolday to match what parents really need.
- Julian: Thank you Helen and Kim. As a student in remote learning who has also participated in SYEP, one of my biggest worries is the budget cuts to SYEP this summer. I appreciate the advocacy work you've done on that and I hope that SYEP can continue, as it is a source of additional income for many students and their families as well as a source of experience that's very important.
- Helen: I've heard that there is a chance SYEP will be happening remotely. What I heard the DYCD commissioner imply is that if it's remote then there has to be a stipend for the summer, so we'll see how that goes.
- Julian: Got it, thank you. The other big student concern I've heard a lot about grades, specifically the grading system for next year. This year's changed grading policy is pretty equitable and was done with some consultation with students, which is great. Next year, even if we do go back to schools, it's not going to be the same, and the concept of grading rests on the assumption that all students have equal access to education. If that still isn't the case next year, we're going to need a different grading system and one that balances accurately reflecting students' progress with understanding where they're coming from.
- Kim: These are all good points, and there is no solution right now. We'll have to see as we go along.
- Ira: I have two different thoughts. There are ways that we can fill in on the education side, but I'm not so sure about the youth side. If there's one thing that we can do as a Community Board it's to talk about the allocation of city dollars. The siege of Leningrad was 800 days, and we're only 100 days into this, and may well be 800 days before we have a grasp on this. As the Chancellor said, the odds of re-opening schools in September are 50-50. There's a real cost on

education that comes with distant learning, and we have to find some way to bridge that, and I don't know how. The last part of my concern is that we're going to end up with latchkey children because at some point children are going to have to go out of the house. We're going to have to see schools in terms of the educational system and the childcare system. I'm looking for ideas, and I think we all need to look for ideas.

- Lolita: Thank you for this opportunity. I'm concerned about the funding going forward for students with disabilities. They're going to need specialized equipment, how is the city going forward with that?
- Helen: You're exactly right. All I've heard from the city is that they're working on it whenever it comes to special education. I'm putting it on the pile of things that are so disheartening about this administration's response to COVID-19.
- Kim: To add, our understanding is that if a child has an IEP, the DOE is to convert them to a remote learning plan that is parallel to the services they had before that IEP. There are obviously nuances to providing various types of therapy to students remotely. What's really disheartening is that our city has no plans to deal with disruptions to school. We do have a special education committee at CEC3 that is working on that, and we'll definitely keep you updated.
- Helen: I think there's also a difference with what's happening in our district and what's happening in the rest of the city. What I've heard is that in District 3, parents of students with IEPs are somewhat satisfied, although in other districts this might not be the case.
- Lolita: What are the legal ramifications of hiring high school students as tracers under the city's program?
- Helen: We posed that to the commissioner of DYCP as a component of SYEP. You do have to take a four-hour class to become a contact tracer, but I'm pretty sure the qualifications are that you have to have a bachelor's degree and three years of working experience. It's a fairly sophisticated operation, it's not as straightforward as one might think.
- Doug: I am a parent of 2, 3, and 6 (one entering kindergarten this summer). As a new parent, I wanted to piggyback on Mark's comment/question on the transitioning between schools. There's an entire population of us starting school for the first time. What's being done for this population that's about to send our 6-year-olds into school? Are we at the point where we're contemplating a kindergarten program online?
- Helen: If you look at the 7 points that need to happen before we can reopen the city, I think they're really good guide points and really important to protect us. No leader wants to put their population in harm's way. Every parent has their own parents about sending their kid off to kindergarten, but there is a universal feeling about it. You're really lucky to live on the Upper West Side. One idea for you may be to reach out to the Parent Association now and ask them if they're thinking about Zoom playgroups or opportunities for the kids to get to know each other.
- Doug: Is it really being contemplated that we're going to send an entirely new population of kids into kindergarten/pre-k via Zoom?
- Helen: Why would it be different for any other population? I think this is the reality of living in New York City. I think that the health and safety of the children come first, especially when there's a strain of the virus affecting little ones.



- Doug: I think that the unique population of individuals who are entering the program need to be a part of the conversation as well.
- Helen: Let's talk offline, I really want to hear from you.
- Kim: I recommend Doug also reach out to the CEC and Superintendent's office to get a sense of the shifting options that are being discussed. The structure is very unusual in New York because of Mayoral control.
- Natasha: Thank you Helen and Kim. The point about people leaving the city and making the decision to come back based on taxes is really and is a very sticky decision. I know that you're very mindful of that but I wanted to echo that as well. Going back to Ira's point about social-emotional learning - maybe just opening up the playgrounds at schools for the children at that school for certain hours at a time could be something to be considered.
- Courtney: I want to thank you for addressing SYEP. Going back to Doug, I also have an incoming kindergarten student, and I'm also wondering how we're going to do this. This last question is something I don't know if either of you can answer, but we keep on hearing this fear of over-reliance that we can continue doing distance learning next year and the fear that, behind the scenes, there isn't the type of innovative and creative thinking that we need. I really want to encourage that creative, innovative thinking would be lovely and that having access to those ideas would help reassure a lot of us.
- Helen: What are people suggesting?
- Courtney: I've heard everything from people suggesting the time moving of school to how can we form relationships outside of the classroom, etc. What else are we going to do that is not this? I think just knowing those conversations are happening would be helpful.
- Helen: If you think that there are groups of individuals that have ideas like this, I'd be happy to help get the Chancellor to do a town hall in our district and hear ideas from people.
- Kim: I completely agree. Some of the things I've heard on social media are about if this might involve more active time, etc... It's an opportunity to rethink how the education system churns out students from K-12 and the way we map out the day for students.
- Helen: I think the Superintendent and Principals are also thinking about this. I think if you check in with the Parent Association, you'll hear what they're talking about.
- Courtney: I think some of this is the lack of communication that's going on.
- Bev: I want to get back to some of the budget options that Helen was discussing earlier on. Has anyone talked about reinstituting the financial control board and going back to options used in the 70s that aren't backed by the federal government and driven by faith in New York's credit?
- Helen: I've brought this up at meetings, and the Mayor's team and Comptroller have assured me that they're looking into it. I think that this is different from the 70s crisis in two ways: we're not here because of profligate spending, and we should honor the fact that not all of the people are white men who work on Wall Street, and I hope that we are evolved from those sets of characters. I think this is a revenue problem, not an expense problem, and I think our city has evolved beyond a very narrow-minded assumption about what real life is.

- Bev: The other big chunk of salvation back in the 70s was labor. Do you have some sense of dialogue with labor around deferring some costs in the same way that helped the city out all those years ago?
- Helen: I think labor is not at the table with the same depth of understanding about the crisis. It's a mix: some of them get it and some don't. They're worried about their pensioners. I don't disagree with you, you've got too many people who are trying to fix this crisis who are running for office. If we don't have some real collaboration with the unions, then what are we doing.
- Bev: My recollection of the state education budget is that there's this huge chunk of old armless money that localities that do not apply for state aid get anyways, which is something to look into.
- Helen: That's great, I definitely want to learn more from you. Thank you.
- Lawrence Lee (public): I'm really concerned about the central administration about DOE and what they're planning and not planning.
- Helen: Just to give you a sense, they are planning, and they are talking about things. I think we have a great Superintendent and great Principals who are talking about this. I think if the Chancellor or one of his reps were willing to come to our community and help facilitate an exchange of ideas on this, then I would love to facilitate that. This is a vast public education system, and there are so many families where the parents don't speak English, or students are more involved in household duties. I think it would be great to have a conversation with the Chancellor but there are other districts with completely different experiences.
- Lawrence Lee (public): It's been widely reported that the Mayor has at times ignored the advice of his senior staff, including the closure of the school system. I'm concerned if the Mayor is truly keeping all options open.
- Helen: I share your concern. I was furious at the hearing on Friday when we spoke about the contact tracing program being under the control of the Health and Hospitals Corporation. You don't do that. It's outrageous and nonsensical and it reflects a serious blind spot.
- Lucas Liu (public): Some things I noted: One of the other importance of SYEP is preventing contact with police, so funding the SYEP program is a way of saving costs. In the next 9 months, a lot of jobs or going to lost because of movement, and enrollment in schools is going to drop, which is a longer-term concern. A lot of parents have left the city, and if we don't give them a reason to come back, they're going to find somewhere else to enroll their kids. The last numbers to us about grab & go was 450,000 meals a day, which includes family members and other adults. This is significantly less than the number of students who get meals on a given day. We have 1.1 million students, and I imagine that pre-remote learning, the number of students getting remote learning was higher.
- Helen: There are lots of different ways that people are getting food right now, grab and go is only one of them.
- Lucas: I know that more food pantries have opened up in the last two months?
- Helen: One thing to keep in mind is the DOE doesn't report on meals, but on bags of food, and each bag contains two meals (breakfast and lunch). Food insecurity in the city is dramatic, and the city is doing everything it can to push out food in any way possible.

- Steven: As we wrap up this section, do we want to make a statement in the form of a resolution? Maybe we could make some general statement about our concern and include a re-emphasis that the DOE look at their budget first, following the sentiment of the Mark Treyger letter.
  - Mark: I agree, and I would reflect this back to Helen. You also mentioned the possibility of borrowing. If we do go the route that Steven is proposing, maybe we would include in this resolution a call of support for what Helen is proposing.
  - Helen: I think this is a great idea. I think it's also fair to say, especially coming from YEL/CB7, that you understand that it has to be a package of things, not just all cuts, and that you're asking the Governor not to cut school aid. The sooner you can say that to him, the better. I'm not calling for a millionaires tax - I think there are more thoughtful ways to go.
  - Blanche: Are you talking about 1 or 2 different resolutions? One is revenue, and one is school budget.
  - Steven: I think we're thinking of only one. I thinking is that this would be a macro, big picture commentary on where we're at.
  - Mark: What I'm hearing is a resolution whose main tenets are cutting the central administrative and external contracts first, calling on the governor to maintain funding streams and increase revenue, and letting the city borrow in a responsible way.
  - Blanche: Helen, is issuing a bond a possibility?
  - Helen: I defer to Bev.
  - Bev: I can take a crack at taking a look at something in an advocacy system.
  - Mark: We can work at this.
  - Bev: I think that admin cuts are as much an overworked go-to place as anything. There are parts of admin that should not be cut, and that's an important thing that should be said too.
  - Steven: Nobody expects it to goes to zero, but clearly there are some areas that need to be trimmed.
  - Steven: I think we have the framework to trust Mark and we can take a vote now.
  - VOTE: committee members: 6-0-0-0, non-committee board members: 4-0-0-0
  - Steven: Thank you Helen and Kim for coming and speaking.
2. DoE budget and the grading policies applicable to the 2019-20 academic year including the period of remote learning.
    - See the discussion above.
  3. Discussion of the proposed elimination of the Summer Youth Employment Program in the fiscal year 2021 budget.
    - See the discussion above.
  4. New Business.
    - Steven: Do we need to be thinking about DNS and Budget Priorities?
    - Mark: Not now, but definitely in June. I've asked Helen to come to our Steering committee in June to guide our thinking around our DNS and Budget priorities so that we prioritize what our district needs without being tone-deaf. We can use this time to reach out beyond or own members to ensure our budget priorities are realistic.

- Helen: It would be incredibly powerful if you really pushed yourself to think outside the box in terms of what do we need to do to get families to stay, and how do you want to see the city lay the groundwork for our recovery.
- Mark: We want to have a finite and realistic set of requests, and we want to include in every section of our DNS the lessons learned since March that inform both how we want to re-open and re-imagine our world and how we do this next time.
- Natasha: Mark, will there be any public outreach for this June Steering committee.
- Mark: Yes, I want everyone to be reaching out to their numbers. My biggest goal going into this year, even before COVID-19 was gathering into our DNS and our Budget Priorities not just our thoughts, but also those of who we serve.
- Steven: When do we need to have this done by specifically?
- Mark: The usual target is August/September, but I've received submissions as late as November 14th. This is urgent, but don't burn down the house.

5. Ideas for future agendas.

- Steven: We don't really have an agenda for next month, so I'm open to any ideas, specifically speakers. I think that topics could be changing as frequently as a week before the meeting. If people have suggestions on a couple of speakers they could access.
- Doug: It would be great to have the Chancellor or their representative come to this committee to have an opportunity to speak to the community and answer questions.
- Steven: We likely won't be able to get the Chancellor to come. Mark, does anybody come to mind to you?
- Mark: Marisol Rosales would be a good person to invite, she's the Executive Superintendent for Manhattan. If you want to invite the Chancellor, it would be probably necessary to co-host the event with the CEC.
- Steven: I would like to send an invite to someone in DOE whether they accept or not. It would also be nice to hear from the teacher/UFT side of things and hear their perspective on what's going on.
- Blanche: Concerns about SYEP have come up a few times tonight. We could reach out to our contact at DYCD to talk about SYEP.
- Mark: I don't know if that's for next month - we might want to wait for the budget, and have it at our June or July meeting to inform our DNS.
- Blanche: We had our uniformed agencies scheduled for April and we could potentially call them to discuss youth issues.
- Steven: Let's think about that and have some general topics in mind for our June meeting with a couple of speakers. I liked the flow of our meeting today, if we're all comfortable with that, let's get 2 speakers for the next meeting.
- Steven: Thank you to our new members who joined us today, we hope you join the committee.
- Natasha: Happy Eid to all!

*The meeting was adjourned at 9:11 PM.*