PUBLIC HEARING

FRANCHISE AND CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE

2 Lafayette Street
New York, New York 10007

Monday, April 10, 2017
2:30 p.m.

APPEARANCES:

Mayor:  Peter Hatch
Office of the Mayor:  Benjamin Furnas
Corporation Counsel:  Isabel Galis-Menendez
Office of Management and Budget:  Yvonne Quintian
Comptroller:  Susie Sohn
Manhattan Borough President:  James Caras
Brooklyn Borough President:  Tonya Cantlo-Cockfield
Bronx Borough President:  Tom Luciania
Queens Borough President:  Angelina Martinez-Rubio
Staten Island Borough President:  Lashay Young
Clerk:  Stephanie Ruiz

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.
139 MAMARONECK AVENUE
MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543
(212) 95-DEPOS (953-3767) or (914) 381-2061
FACSIMILE:  (914) 722-0816
Email: stenokath@verizon.net
Proceedings

MR. HATCH: Good afternoon. The public hearing will now come to order.

Will the clerk please call the role?

MS. RUIZ: Mayor.

MR. HATCH: Here.

MS. RUIZ: Office of the Mayor.

MR. FURNAS: Here.

MS. RUIZ: Comptroller.

MS. SOHN: Here.

MS. RUIZ: Corporation Counsel.

MS. GALIS-MENENDEZ: Here.

MS. RUIZ: Office of Management and Budget.

MS. QUINTIAN: Here.

MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of the Bronx.

MR. LUCIANIA: Here.

MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of Brooklyn.

MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: Here.

MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of Manhattan.

MR. CARAS: Here.

MS. RUIZ: President, Borough of
Proceedings

Queens.

MS. MARTINEZ-RUBIO:  Here.

MS. RUIZ:  President, Borough of Staten Island.

MS. YOUNG:  Here.

MR. HATCH:  Welcome to this public hearing of the Franchise and Concession and Review Committee.

The hearing being conducted today has been publicly advertised in accordance with New York City Charter and Concession Rules of City of New York.

We want to be sure that anyone desiring to be heard has the opportunity to do so. All persons wishing to speak must fill out a request slip, which may be obtained from the Clerk. Each speaker will be allotted approximately three minutes. When you testify, please state your name and affiliation, if any.

You may also submit written testimony to the Clerk, which will be made part of the record. Any written submissions must be made to the Clerk before the close of
Proceedings
the public hearing.
Will the Clerk please call the first calendar item.

MS. RUIZ: New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item No. 1: In the matter of the intent to award as a concession for the operation, renovation and maintenance of a full service marina at Mill Basin, Brooklyn, New York, for a 12-year term to Mill Basin Marina Co., LLC.

MR. HATCH: Does anyone wish to testify?

(No response.)

MR. HATCH: If not, will the Clerk please call the second calendar item.

MS. RUIZ: New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item No. 2: In the matter of intent to award as a concession for the renovation, operation and maintenance of a parking lot at Orchard Beach, Pelham Bay Park, Bronx for a potential 15-year term to Parking Services Plus, Inc.
Proceedings

MR. HATCH: Does anyone wish to testify?

(No response.)

MR. HATCH: Will the Clerk please call the third calendar item.

MS. RUIZ: New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item No. 3: In the matter of the intent to award as a concession for the operation and maintenance of a ferry service at Gangway Six in The Battery, Manhattan for a potential six-year term to New York Trans Harbor LLC d/b/a New York Water Taxi.

MR. HATCH: Does anyone wish to testify?

(No response.)

MR. HATCH: Will the Clerk please call the fourth calendar item.

MS. RUIZ: New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item No. 4: In the matter of the intent to award as a concession for the renovation, operation and maintenance of an outdoor
recreation facility located at 215 Schmidts Lane, Staten Island for a potential 15-year term to New York Carousel Entertainment LLC.

Please be advised that at the request of the agency, this item will be held over to the May 8, 2017 FCRC public hearing, which will takes place on the 14th floor auditorium of 2 Lafayette Street, Manhattan, at 2:30 p.m.

Any change to this schedule which will result in a public hearing being scheduled prior to the May 8th FCRC public hearing will be noticed in the City Record and in newspapers as required by Section 371 of the New York City Charter.

MR. HATCH: Although this item has been held over, we will take testimony from anyone wishing to testify.

(No response.)

MR. HATCH: Well if no one else wishes to speak, that concludes today's hearing.

We ask the Reporter to make the
Proceedings

entire Public Hearing Agenda, which was
made publicly available and distributed at
this hearing, part of the final record of
the proceeding.

The hearing is now closed. Thank
you.

(Time noted: 2:34 p.m.)
CERTIFICATE

STATE OF NEW YORK       )
                        ) ss.:
COUNTY OF QUEENS       )

I, NICOLE ELLIS, a Notary Public for and within the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the within-entitled matter, and that the within transcript is a true record of such proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or by marriage and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 13th day of April 2017.

_________________________
NICOLE ELLIS

NIcole Ellis

Nicole Ellis
COUNTY (1) 8:4

D

d/b/a (1) 5:14
day (1) 8:16
Department (4) 4:5,18 5:7,21
desiring (1) 3:15
distributed (1) 7:3

E

E (2) 8:1,11
ELLIS (2) 8:6,19
Email (1) 1:25
Entertainment (1) 6:5
entire (1) 7:2
entitled (1) 8:9

F

F (1) 8:1
facility (1) 6:2
FACSIMILE (1) 1:24
FCRC (2) 6:8,14
ferry (1) 5:11
fill (1) 3:17
final (1) 7:4
first (1) 4:3
floor (1) 6:9
fourth (1) 5:20
Franchise (2) 1:3 3:8
full (1) 4:9
Furnas (2) 1:10 2:8
further (1) 8:11

G

Galis-Menendez (2) 1:11 2:12
Gangway (1) 5:12
Good (1) 2:2

H

hand (1) 8:16
Harbor (1) 5:14
Hatch (12) 1:9 2:2 6:3 7:7 4:13,16
5:2,5,16,19 6:18,22
heard (1) 3:15
hearing (12) 1:2 2:3 3:8,10 4:2 6:8
6:13,15,24 7:2,2,4,6
held (2) 6:7,19
hereunto (1) 8:15

I

intent (4) 4:7,20 5:9,23
interested (1) 8:13
Isabel (1) 1:11
Island (3) 1:18 3:5 6:3
item (10) 4:4,6,17,19 5:6,8,20,22
6:7,18

J

James (1) 1:14

K

L

Lafayette (2) 1:4 6:10
Lane (1) 6:3
Lashay (1) 1:18
LLC (3) 4:12 5:14 6:5
located (1) 6:2
lot (1) 4:22
Luciania (2) 1:16 2:18

M

maintenance (4) 4:9,22 5:11,25
MAMARONECK (2) 1:23,23
Management (2) 1:12 2:13
Manhattan (4) 1:14 2:23 5:12 6:11
marina (2) 4:10,12
marriage (1) 8:13
Martinez-Rubio (2) 1:17 3:3
matter (6) 4:7,20 5:9,23 8:9,14
Mayor (4) 1:9,10 2:5,7
Mill (2) 4:10,11
minutes (1) 3:20
Monday (1) 1:6

N

name (1) 3:21
New (16) 1:5,5,23 3:12,13 4:5,11
4:18 5:7,13,14,21 6:4,17 8:3,7
newspapers (1) 6:16
NICOLE (2) 8:6,19
Notary (1) 8:6
noted (1) 7:8
noticed (1) 6:15

O

obtained (1) 3:18
Office (4) 1:10,12 2:7,13
operation (4) 4:8,22 5:10,25
opportunity (1) 3:15
Orchard (1) 4:23
order (1) 2:3
outcome (1) 8:14
outdoor (1) 5:25

P

p.m (3) 1:6 6:11 7:8
Park (1) 4:23
parking (2) 4:22,24
Parks (4) 4:6,19 5:8,22
part (2) 3:23 7:4
parties (1) 8:12
Pelham (1) 4:23
persons (1) 3:16
### Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing

**April 10, 2017**

| Peter (1) 1:9 | STENO-KATH (1) 1:22 |
| place (1) 6:9 | stenokath@verizon.net (1) 1:25 |
| please (7) 2:4 3:20 4:3,17 5:5,19 | Stephanie (1) 1:19 |
| 6:6 | Street (2) 1:4 6:10 |
| Plus (1) 4:25 | submissions (1) 3:24 |
| potential (3) 4:24 5:13 6:4 | submit (1) 3:22 |
| President (10) 1:14,15,16,17,18 | sure (1) 3:14 |
| 2:16,19,22,25 3:4 | Susie (1) 1:13 |
| prior (1) 6:14 | 
| proceedings (8) 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 | T (2) 8:1,1 |
| 7:1 8:10 | take (1) 6:19 |
| public (9) 1:2 2:3 3:7 4:2 6:8,13,14 | takes (1) 6:9 |
| 7:2 8:6 | Taxi (1) 5:15 |
| publicly (2) 3:11 7:3 | term (4) 4:11,24 5:13 6:4 |
| 
| Queens (3) 1:17 3:2 8:4 | testify (5) 3:20 4:14 5:3,17 6:20 |
| Quintian (2) 1:12 2:15 | testimony (2) 3:22 6:19 |
| R (1) 8:1 | Thank (1) 7:6 |
| record (4) 3:24 6:15 7:4 8:10 | third (1) 5:6 |
| recreation (5) 4:6,19 5:8,22 6:2 | three (1) 3:19 |
| related (1) 8:11 | Time (1) 7:8 |
| renovation (3) 4:9,21 5:24 | today (1) 3:10 |
| reported (1) 8:8 | today's (1) 6:23 |
| Reporter (1) 6:25 | Tom (1) 1:16 |
| REPORTING (1) 1:22 | Tonya (1) 1:15 |
| request (2) 3:17 6:6 | Trans (1) 5:14 |
| required (1) 6:16 | transcript (1) 8:9 |
| response (4) 4:15 5:4,18 6:21 | true (1) 8:10 |
| result (1) 6:13 | 
| Review (2) 1:3 3:9 | U (1) 5:23 |
| role (1) 2:4 | V (1) 6 |
| Ruiz (15) 1:19 2:5,7,9,11,13,16,19 | W (1) 7 |
| Rules (1) 3:13 | Water (1) 5:14 |
| S (1) 6:12 | way (1) 8:13 |
| schedule (1) 6:12 | Welcome (1) 3:7 |
| scheduled (1) 6:14 | WHEREOF (1) 8:15 |
| Schmidts (1) 6:3 | wish (3) 4:13 5:2,16 |
| second (1) 4:17 | wishes (1) 6:23 |
| Section (1) 6:17 | wishing (2) 3:16 6:20 |
| service (2) 4:10 5:11 | within- (1) 8:8 |
| Services (2) 1:22 4:25 | WITNESS (1) 8:15 |
| set (1) 8:15 | written (2) 3:22,24 |
| Six (1) 5:12 | 
| six-year (1) 5:13 | X (2) 1:2,4 |
| slip (1) 3:17 | Y (1) 4:23 |
| Sohn (2) 1:13 2:10 | York (16) 1:5,5,23 3:12,13 4:5,11 |
| speak (2) 3:16 6:23 | 4:18 5:7,13,14,21 6:4,17 8:3,7 |
| speaker (1) 3:18 | Young (2) 1:18 3:6 |
| ss (1) 8:3 | Yvonne (1) 1:12 |
| state (3) 3:20 8:3,7 | Z (1) 6:12 |
| Staten (3) 1:18 3:5 6:3 |
NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 1: IN THE MATTER of the intent to award as a concession for the operation, renovation and maintenance of a full service marina at Mill Basin, Brooklyn, New York, for a twelve (12) year term, to Mill Basin Marina Co., LLC. Compensation to the City will be as follows: for each operating year of the license, Mill Basin Marina Co., LLC shall pay the City a fee consisting of the higher of a minimum annual fee (Year 1: $158,655; Year 2: $166,588; Year 3: $174,917; Year 4: $183,663; Year 5: $192,846; Year 6: $202,489; Year 7: $212,613; Year 8: $223,224; Year 9: $234,406; Year 10: $246,126; Year 11: $258,432; Year 12: $271,354) vs. 35% of Gross Receipts up to and including $690,000 and 20% of Gross Receipts greater than $690,000.

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 2: IN THE MATTER of the intent to award as a concession for the renovation, operation and maintenance of a parking lot at Orchard Beach, Pelham Bay Park, Bronx ("Licensed Premises"), for a potential fifteen (15) year term, to Parking Services Plus, Inc. Compensation to the City will be as follows: for each operating year, Parking Services Plus, Inc. shall pay to the City license fees consisting of the greater of a guaranteed minimum annual fee versus a percentage of gross receipts (Year 1: $165,000.00 vs. 15%; Year 2: $165,000.00 vs. 15%; Year 3: $165,000.00 vs. 15%; Year 4: $165,000.00 vs. 15%; Year 5: $165,000.00 vs. 15%; Year 6: $735,000.00 vs. 68%; Year 7: $771,750.00 vs. 68%; Year 8: $810,337.50 vs. 68%; Year 9: $850,854.38 vs. 68%; Year 10: $893,397.09 vs. 68%; Year 11: $938,066.95 vs. 68%; Year 12: $984,970.30 vs. 68%; Year 13: $1,034,218.81 vs. 68%; Year 14: $1,085,929.75 vs. 68%; Year 15: $1,140,226.24 vs. 68%).
NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 3: IN THE MATTER of the intent to award as a concession for the operation and maintenance of a ferry service at Gangway Six in The Battery, Manhattan (“Licensed Premises”), for a potential six (6) year term, to New York Trans Harbor LLC d/b/a New York Water Taxi. Compensation to the City will be as follows: for each operating year, New York Trans Harbor LLC d/b/a New York Water Taxi shall pay to the City license fees consisting of the greater of a guaranteed minimum annual fee versus a percentage of gross receipts (Year 1: $125,000.00 vs. 10%; Year 2: $132,500.00 vs. 10%; Year 3: $140,450.00 vs. 10%; Year 4: $148,877.00 vs. 10%; Year 5: 157,809.62 vs. 10%; Year 6: $167,278.19 vs. 10%).

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 4: IN THE MATTER of the intent to award as a concession for the renovation, operation and maintenance of an outdoor recreation facility located at 215 Schmidts Lane, Staten Island (“Licensed Premises”), for a potential fifteen (15) year term, to NY Carousel Entertainment, LLC. Compensation to the City will be as follows: for each operating year, NY Carousel Entertainment, LLC shall pay to the City license fees consisting of the greater of a guaranteed minimum annual fee versus a percentage of gross receipts (Year 1: $51,950.00 vs. 12%; Year 2: $56,106.00 vs. 12%; Year 3: $60,594.00 vs. 12%; Year 4: $65,442.00 vs. 12%; Year 5: $70,677.00 vs. 12%; Year 6: $75,625.00 vs. 12%; Year 7: $80,919.00 vs. 12%; Year 8: $86,583.00 vs. 12%; Year 9: $92,644.00 vs. 12%; Year 10: $98,202.00 vs. 12%; Year 11: $104,094.00 vs. 12%; Year 12: $110,340.00 vs. 12%; Year 13: $115,857.00 vs. 12%; Year 14: $121,650.00 vs. 12%; Year 15: $127,732.00 vs. 12%).