

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
¶
1
2
3
4
5
6
7

NYC TAXI AND
LIMOUSINE COMMISSION

THURSDAY, JANUARY 19, 2012
COMMENCING AT 9:21 A.M.

MEETING AGENDA:

PUBLIC HEARING, STENOGRAPHIC
COMMISSION ACTION TRANSCRIPT OF
STAFF PRESENTATION PROCEEDINGS

- - - - -

B E F O R E:

DAVID YASSKY, CHAIRMAN

COMMISSIONERS:

- MEERA JOSHI, ESQ.
- NORA CONSTANCE MARINO - Absent
- LAUVIENSKA POLANCO - absent
- EDWARD GONZALES
- IRIS WEINSHALL
- ELIAS AROUT
- FRANK CARONE
- MARK GJONAJ
- LASHANN DEARCY

Job No. NJ34335

A P P E A R A N C E S:

NEW YORK CITY TAXI AND LIMOUSINE COMMISSION
BY: Allan J. Fromberg
33 Beaver Street
New York, New York 10004
(212) 676-1013

8 PRESENTATION:
9 VINCENT SAPONE
10 AMOS TAMAN
11 BILL LINDAUER
12 BHAINAVI DESAI
13 MOHAN SINGH
14 OSMAN EHOWDHURY
15 BERESFORD SIMMONS

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

25
¶ 1

Taxi and Limousine Hearing

3

2 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Good morning,
3 Commissioners. We move that we vote to go
4 into executive session to discuss pending
5 litigation and possible litigation matters.
6 All in favor say aye.

7 (The Board says aye.)

8 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: We will now recess for
9 executive session and return in approximately
10 an hour. Thank you.

11 (Executive Session at 9:18 a.m.)

12 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Good morning.
13 Welcome. We will call the meeting to order.
14 Before we begin, we will just begin with a
15 very brief report on some TLC news and what we

16 have been up to here.

17 First of all, and this is really for the
18 licensees that are out here, as you all know,
19 we had three offices, as you know, and the
20 Long Island City office has been closed since
21 the last week of December, since the week
22 before Christmas, since last week of December
23 because of a flood, not on all floors, but the
24 floor directly above the floor the TLC
25 occupies.

¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

4

2 The Long Island City building someone
3 broke in a water feed pipe and caused such
4 extensive damage to our two floors we have
5 been out of that space.

6 I want to, first of all, commend the TLC
7 staff lead by Deputy Commissioner Freud and
8 Assistant Commissioner Nick Venezia and
9 Jeff Grundfeld and also Ray Scanlon of
10 Woodside and Gary Weiss that heads the
11 licensing division, that's the operation of
12 Long Island City, within a day-and-a-half, we
13 had established a makeshift licensing center
14 in Woodside and we moved all the hearings that
15 usually take place on Long Island City here to
16 Beaver Street.

17 Commissioners the reason we had our
18 pre-meeting on the 22nd floor rather than the
19 big conference room down the hall is if you go
20 look there you will see that has been
21 converted to an eight person office. Every
22 available conference room we have computers

23 and phones were put in and, again, Jeff, the
24 CEO, his team did a superb job so we could
25 resume functioning within 48 hours of being
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

5

2 displaced; and even though many people are
3 cramped, and I will say to the licensees in
4 the industry I know that the conditions at
5 Long Island City, waiting at Woodside at the
6 licensing counter are subpar and I don't want
7 to say they are not.

8 People have had to sometimes queue up
9 out into the cold. We rearranged it so they
10 can be inside but they are not. It is not a
11 facility built for that.

12 Nonetheless, everybody has really
13 stepped up and pitched in and I want to thank
14 our staff that has done that and I want to
15 thank our licensees for their patience and
16 understanding.

17 The landlord at Long Island City has
18 been working and it is ongoing. They have had
19 a tear out, dry wall on pretty much every
20 wall, at least some of it, and tear out most
21 of the flooring and replace it.

22 I don't want to put a date to it because
23 with construction, you can't count on it.

24 What I will say is that as soon as we possibly
25 can and as soon as it is safe for our
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

6

2 employees and licensee guests to be there, we
3 will reoccupy the Long Island space and resume
4 normal operation there.

5 In the meantime, again, I thank

6 everybody for their patience in that
7 connection. I want to say particularly to
8 drivers and people who interact regularly with
9 drivers, we more than usual are encouraging
10 people to renew their licenses by mail. Of
11 course, people or on line. People have the
12 opportunity to renew in person and you can
13 come and do that at woodside. But given the
14 limitations of that space, we really urge
15 people as strongly as possible, renew your
16 license on line or through the mail. Your
17 wait will be lower and by not being there, you
18 won't cause other people to wait so long
19 because we don't have as many transaction
20 counters as we ordinarily do.

21 We also, of course, the Staten Island
22 facility remains open. Once again Staten
23 Island came to the rescue and we are handling
24 transactions there as well, If people prefer.

25 So you can go to Staten Island or to
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

7

2 woodside, and I'm reminding people that all
3 hearings are scheduled that typically take
4 place in Long Island City. They continue to
5 be held here in Beaver Street on this floor,
6 19th floor, with the exception of fitness
7 hearings which are being held at 40 rector
8 street in the offices.

9 If you have any question about where a
10 licensing transaction is being handled or
11 where a hearing is, please call 311 or you can
12 call our, I hesitate to put our licensing

13 number directly even though I know every
14 driver knows it already, call 311 and ask for
15 that information. Okay.

16 It probably needs no reminding to
17 anybody in this room, but on December 20th, we
18 are pleased that Governor Cuomo announced an
19 agreement on five borough taxi plan that
20 accomplishes really pretty much all of what we
21 set out to do a year ago. What Mayor
22 Bloomberg proposed that in the 2012 state
23 industry address. We will be able for the
24 first time be able to taxis to pick up outside
25 of Manhattan center business district, and we
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

8

2 will be making huge strides on the issue of
3 wheelchair accessibility, which you know is a
4 long time project of this commission. That
5 the bill was signed into law, we expect it to
6 be amended further, really within the next
7 week, to permit the sale of an additional
8 2,000 wheelchair accessible medallions, which
9 will be I think a ground breaking step forward
10 for the city on the issue of wheelchair
11 accessibility.

12 Finally, last but not least, I just want
13 to know for the first time ever, there are
14 50,000 licensed taxi drivers. Our 50,000
15 drivers, Mr. Muhammad Arief of Brooklyn,
16 deserves special recognition.

17 In truth, there are a lot of ways to
18 look at this. In some cases it is a sign of
19 the overall economy that continues to struggle
20 and not be as healthy as we would all like,

21 but it is also a sign of the vitality of this
22 remarkable industry, and the entrepreneurs
23 large and small that continue to make it one
24 of the great success stories of the city As an
25 industry, in addition to serving 600,000
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

9

2 people a day. So that is our chairman's
3 report.

4 We have minutes to adopt. The minutes of
5 the December 15 meeting are before you,
6 commissioners. I move that we adopt them as
7 written. All in favor say aye.

8 (The Board says aye.)

9 MR. CHAIRMAN: opposed? No. Minutes of
10 the December 15, 2011 meeting are adopted.
11 Director Chris Tormey is here. We have just,
12 I believe, one new base and one relocated
13 base.

14 >> MR. TORMEY: Christopher Tormey Director
15 of Licensing at TLC. Licensing has one
16 base for approval this month, Corona and we
17 have a relocation.

18 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Commissioners, I move
19 that we accept the licensing recommendation on
20 these two bases. All in favor say aye.

21 (The Board says aye.)

22 MR. CHAIRMAN: Opposed? No. Thank you,
23 Chris. We have one item for commission action
24 and one item for public hearing today.

25 For commission action we have the FHV
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

10

2 stretch modification rule. We have,

3 commissioners, the public hearing on this in
4 November And there is no further public
5 hearing required.

6 If there are comments on this, I would
7 entertain that at this point, otherwise, I
8 will move to a vote. I will note
9 commissioners that we did address the
10 insurance issues that were raised at that
11 hearing, and I believe that we are ready to
12 move forward with this.

13 >> MR. AROUT: Motion to Approve.

14 MR. CHAIRMAN: Second.

15 >> MS. WEINSHALL: Second.

16 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Opposed? No. The
17 stretch modification rule is now adopted. The
18 public hearing we will not be voting today on
19 this but we will hold a public hearing on a
20 rule regarding taxi receipt after this. Meera
21 will explain that briefly and we have several
22 people signed up to speak.

23 >> MS. JOSHI: Before the commission
24 today are three proposed rules relating to
25 taxi cab receipts. The first proposed rule
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

11

2 would permit specified types of advertising on
3 the backs of taxi cab receipts. advertising on
4 taxi cab receipts is prohibited under current
5 rule.

6 The second proposed rule clarifies an
7 existing rule on the proposed rule, the driver
8 must offer a passenger his or her receipt.
9 Current rules require every passenger receives
10 a receipt, And the third proposal addresses

11 items that must be listed on the passenger
12 receipt.

13 The additional items are trip number,
14 tolls, surcharges, trips paid by credit card
15 or debit card, if applicable, The last four
16 digits of the credit card and the driver's HAC
17 license.

18 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: The first speaker is
19 Vincent sapone and then I see Bill Lindauer
20 from the New York taxi city alliance. It
21 doesn't say so here but I assume you are
22 representing the league of taxi owners.
23 Mr. sapone.

24 Mr. Sapone: Thank you, Mr. chairman. I
25 would like to wish everyone a healthy new
‡ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

12

2 year, better happy. You can't always be happy
3 but you can try to be healthy. I have one
4 question.

5 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Visa versa.

6 >> MR. SAPONE: This advertisement on the
7 back of the receipt, who gets the revenue? I
8 mean, I don't expect a big boom. Who gets the
9 money for the advertisement?

10 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: The vendors who
11 provide that service, they are verifone and
12 creative mobile technologies are, as you know,
13 currently in each and every taxi cab. The
14 revenue would go to those companies.

15 >> MR. SAPONE: Oh. If I own my own
16 Medallion and I buy my own receipts and in the
17 back of the receipt it said via buy a pet at

18 Joe's pet shop, okay, that advertisement
19 doesn't go to the driver? To the owner? The
20 guy who brought the receipts?

21 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. Of course, the
22 medallion owner will be free to negotiate
23 whatever terms he or she wishes and is able to
24 with those credit card processing vendors, But
25 they are the ones that will be in the position
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

13

2 to sell the advertising in the first place.

3 And, commissioners, I see there is a
4 representative from verifone signed up to
5 speak and I think some of the questions will
6 be directed to them.

7 MR. SAPONE: I was wondering if you
8 combine the receipt without the advertisement,
9 in case, you know the driver he's paying for
10 the receipt. I don't want to repeat myself,
11 he buys the receipts and owns his own
12 medallion and someone is using free
13 advertisement from his receipt and his
14 business should be compensated something.

15 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: That's a good question
16 you raise and commissioners --

17 MR. SAPONE: I'm not blaming you. Don't
18 get me wrong. The whole world is in trouble
19 besides us.

20 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: I think that is a good
21 question that you raised that we should
22 address between now and next month when we
23 vote to look at it.

24 >> MR. SAPONE: Have a good day.

25 MR. CHAIRMAN: Bill Lindauer, New York

2 Taxi Alliance, followed by Duane Dear, or
3 Deane, I apologize, representing Verifone.

4 MR. LINDAUER: This is the most
5 brilliant idea for advertisement since they
6 put ads by urinals. This is what the world has
7 been dying for.

8 MR. CHAIRMAN: We are looking at the
9 back of your eyeglass lenses as another
10 possible opportunity.

11 MR. LINDAUER: But I charge too much.

12 But you have only two vendors. It is
13 like a monopoly. I know Ron Sherman,
14 Metropolitan taxi board of trade and CMT needs
15 a few more bucks like we need greater U.S.
16 debt. If money buys happiness, he should be
17 deliriously happy, but I'm worried about the
18 drivers.

19 Do they have to buy special receipt
20 paper? Do we have to get a new meter? Why
21 doesn't the driver get a bit of this action,
22 right? And how much income do you expect the
23 people to make from this advertising?

24 Drivers lose everything. They lose five
25 percent on the credit card. Many times we

2 don't get tips on the credit card. Don't
3 think we make 18 percent on the credit cards.
4 The MTA 15 percent tax out of our tips. We
5 pay the five percent also on tolls and tips
6 and now we lose 4.77 each, shit, For a stupid
7 sales tax to New York City state and another

8 five bucks a day.

9 We are losing 10 percent, not to mention
10 that gasoline is doubled what it was in 2004
11 when we last got our father hike. We need a
12 huge fare hike because we are dying. We are
13 one of the lowest earning industry in New York
14 City and I blame the city for this because
15 they set the rules. They set up the system.

16 I mean, cleaners who are going out on
17 strikes, clean office building they are going
18 out on strike but they were making \$47,000 a
19 year. The average cab driver makes maybe 25,
20 30 working seven days a week. This is
21 unconscionable.

22 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: I understand the
23 correction that you are drawing. Still I
24 would ask speakers to stay on topic of the
25 advertising receipt rule, But thank you,
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

16

2 Mr. Lindauer. And I'm sorry, is this Deane or
3 Dear? Mr. Deane from Verifone followed by
4 Bhainavi Desai representing New York Taxi
5 Alliance.

6 >> MR. DEANE: Duane Deane and I'm
7 hearing representing Verifone Incorporated and
8 Solutions in support of the proposed rule.

9 As one of two TPEP vendors Verifone and
10 its media company, Verifone Media Solutions,
11 we support the idea of permitting advertising
12 on the back of the meter receipts as it will
13 promote new opportunity for the system and
14 further help reduce costs for owners.

15 We agree with the limitations of the

16 rule that permit the ads on the receipts only
17 if the ads or sponsorships comply with the
18 current standards of the TPEP contracts and
19 that the ads or sponsorships do not reduce the
20 readability of the taxi meter receipt.

21 As a leader in the industry, Verifone
22 would not want to implement anything that
23 would reduce the quality of the service to the
24 passenger and to the industry as a whole.

25 Once again, thank you for the
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

17

2 opportunity to speak And we urge the passage
3 of the rule as drafted.

4 MR. CHAIRMAN: I have a couple of
5 questions.

6 Can you tell us a little bit about the
7 economics of this? That's the question that
8 has been raised.

9 First of all, what type of revenue do
10 you anticipate from this particular
11 advertising initiative?

12 MR. DEANE: Very good question. Right
13 now we don't have the answer for you. I'm
14 willing to look into that.

15 MR. CHAIRMAN: You don't have a sense of
16 what the rates will be at all?

17 >> MR. DEANE: No. Right now what we
18 would have is two-fold. The paper savings for
19 the owner, being the sponsorship, would pay
20 for the receipt paper Or they can currently
21 purchase the paper as they currently do.

22 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: In other markets do

23 you have some sense of what the rate would be?

24 No guesses as to the revenue to verifone?

25 >> MR. DEANE: At this point in time, I
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

18

2 do not, but I can look into it for you and get
3 back to you an answer.

4 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Can you tell us about
5 the on screen advertising? What's the revenue
6 from that, would you say, Per taxi?

7 >> MR. DEANE: For that I would like to
8 see if I can Defer that question to Amos
9 taman.

10 MR. TAMAN: Good morning. my name is
11 Amos taman, new vice-president of verifone.
12 Maybe I can help with you some of the answers
13 here.

14 So we don't have an exact estimate for
15 the potential revenues from the paper
16 receipts. We estimate, the idea is to have
17 another advertiser to sponsor the paper costs.

18 Just to give you a rough idea, we spend
19 about a half million dollar annually on the
20 paper receipts. So I think if we get our way,
21 it is something that we will earn about half
22 million dollars if we manage to get enough
23 sponsorship to pay for all the papers. The
24 gentlemen, you don't have to go to the paper.

25 You can continue buying the traditional paper
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

19

2 receipts.

3 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: And commissioner
4 DeArcy.

5 >> MS. DEARCY: Your colleague made a

6 comment that the advertising on the back of
7 the receipts would reduce, and I'm quoting
8 from him costs for owners. I'm not
9 understanding exactly how the advertising
10 would serve to reduce costs for owners if the
11 advertising dollars would go to you?

12 >> MR. TAMAN: I will rephrase. It will
13 reduce the cost of the paper or eliminate it
14 Depending on who's buying the paper. If the
15 owner is buying paper it is eliminating the
16 cost of the paper for the owner and the driver
17 it is going to eliminate the cost for the
18 driver, Whoever buys the paper today. Today
19 somebody has to spend the money to buy the
20 paper receipts. Hopefully we get enough
21 sponsorship on the back of the paper to
22 eliminate that costs, whatever the cost is.

23 >> A SPEAKER: A dollar 50 a roll.

24 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Pardon? I'm a little
25 ignorant about this. Who today does buy the
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

20

2 paper?

3 >> MR. TAMAN: Drivers and owners. It is
4 mixed, depending on the relationship the
5 owners have with the drivers. In some cases,
6 the drivers and the fleet owner.

7 MR. CHAIRMAN: And do you anticipate
8 charging the sponsors a fee over and above
9 providing the paper or just simply providing
10 the paper?

11 MR. TAMAN: In an ideal world, Yes. I
12 don't know. It is not done anywhere in the

13 country yet.

14 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Who will be the kind
15 of marketer to sell advertising?

16 >> MR. TAMAN: Verifone Media Solutions.

17 MR. CHAIRMAN: You would not do that
18 just for some to provide paper because that
19 can't benefit you. Presumably you would
20 invest in that marketing only if there is some
21 revenue that goes along with that. I'm just
22 guessing here.

23 >> MR. TAMAN: Well, the need to have
24 revenues come along with that.

25 Now, for us, obviously sponsoring the
♀ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

21

2 paper it is a win/win for the industry and
3 probably for us as well. We don't have
4 figures. I don't have figures. Rough figures
5 the industry spends for the owning of the
6 paper, it is a about half million dollars. I
7 think we were passing the rules. it will
8 reduce the consumption of paper because a lot
9 of the passengers do not take the receipts
10 with them. So I think you will have probably
11 30 or 40 percent reduction in paper receipts
12 to begin with.

13 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Would owners and
14 drivers be able to sell advertising directly
15 to verifone?

16 MR. TAMAN: It is preprinted paper and
17 you have to buy it in large quantity for any
18 sponsor to deal with that.

19 >> MS. DEARCY: So I think, if I'm
20 following kind of the triangle of questions

21 and answers, the financial benefit from
22 anything above and beyond the cost of the
23 paper would go to your company and the cost
24 savings to the owners would be measured by the
25 dollar 50 they save per role on the paper but
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

22

2 everything else would go to your company.

3 >> MR. TAMAN: The only thing, yes, the
4 intention is to reduce the paper costs.
5 Everything is negotiable between us and our
6 customers.

7 MS. DEARCY: I'm sorry. Just to go
8 back, is the answer to my question yes?

9 >> MR. TAMAN: The one thing we know for
10 sure our intention is, first of all, to reduce
11 the cost of the paper for the sponsor paper.
12 In other words, neither the owner or the
13 driver would have to pay for IT. anything over
14 and above that, if there is any profit, it is
15 tied to our relation between us and our
16 customers.

17 MS. DEARCY: in terms of the relationship
18 with the drivers.

19 >> MR. TAMAN: Voice drivers and the
20 owners.

21 MS. DEARCY: Thank you.

22 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Because the overall
23 economics picture is I think part of the
24 rationale here.

25 Can you tell us just about the TV
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

23

2 advertising? Give us some sense of that.

3 What revenue comes in from the TV ad,
4 just to give us --
5 >> MR. TAMAN: To be honest, I don't have
6 the figures in front of me. We do report
7 monthly to the TLC.

8 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: You could provide that
9 to us?

10 >> MR. TAMAN: In most cases, it is with
11 the owners as you are familiar with and it is
12 varied based on our existing contract and
13 negotiation with each client.

14 >> MR. GONZALES: I have a question.
15 The roll that you are referring from the
16 receipt, how many receipts from a roll?

17 >> MR. TAMAN: I don't know exactly. It
18 is consuming, the average driver consumes
19 about two or three paper rolls a week. So
20 give and take, the gentleman mentioned a
21 dollar-fifty, they are probably spending five
22 dollars a week on paper.

23 >> MS. DEARCY: Commissioner?

24 MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, please.

25 >> MS. DEARCY: Am I correct to assume
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

24

2 that the rules regarding the content of
3 advertising that we address with respect to
4 the roof top advertising and certain
5 objectionable advertising would apply equally
6 to the paper advertising that may or may not
7 be approved for use in the taxi cabs?

8 We had a hearing some months back about
9 the roof top advertising, objectionable
10 advertising.

11 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: That is a good
12 question and I don't think that is explicitly
13 addressed in this rule. So in the proposed
14 rule that we are having a hearing on, I think
15 we should figure out to handle that. Very
16 good.

17 >> MR. TAMAN: Thank you very much.

18 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Commissioner Chhabra
19 points out to me the proposed rule would limit
20 advertising on these, on the receipts to the
21 comment of advertising to any advertisement
22 permitted under the TPEP contract, which does
23 have some content standards in it.

24 Having said that, we handle that issue
25 in a slightly different way with respect to
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

25

2 the roof top and i think that is worth
3 thinking through which approach is better.
4 Definitely. Thank you, commissioners, And
5 thank you Amos and Mr. Deane.

6 We have about three more people who have
7 signed up to speak all from, Bhainavi is next
8 and three additional, All representing the
9 taxi workers alliance. If there is kind of
10 overlapping testimony, feel free to
11 consolidate.

12 MS. DESAI: Good morning. I don't even
13 know where to begin. We all know drivers get
14 nicked and dined in this industry but this
15 is ridiculous.

16 You mean to tell me we are expected to
17 pay this because it is going to save people a

18 dollar or a dollar-fifty on a roll. These are
19 the same companies that are charging five
20 percent on every transaction.

21 I understand their argument would be
22 they charge up to three, whatever the contract
23 allows and the garages and the brokers charge
24 the additional for maximum of 5 percent on
25 every credit card transaction which adds up to
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

26

2 thousands of dollars in loses for drivers.
3 On that issue, they have nothing creative to
4 offer and yet they are going to tell us that
5 basically one company is going to get an
6 exclusive right, an exclusive market to be
7 able to produce these receipts, which everyone
8 is going to have to go in and buy, and we
9 should be doing this just so we save a dollar
10 or a dollar 50 a week. This is absolutely
11 ridiculous.

12 All of this absolutely comes down to
13 money, Not just about the revenue as to who
14 should get the share, but also who is going to
15 have to pay for the costs.

16 It is not always clear that the owners
17 pay for it, And the majority of the cases, it
18 is the drivers that bear the costs, especially
19 if mid shift you end up having to go in and
20 get another paper roll.

21 You are not going to go back to the
22 garage to get that, and if we are going to
23 have to buy a specific type of a receipt that
24 is only going to be sold at particular
25 locations by one exclusive company, that is

2 going to actually, that is going to increase
3 the costs And so surprise, surprise.
4 Something that is supposed to save on the
5 expense, all of a sudden that very expense is
6 now going to go up. This is a scam. This
7 really needs to be addressed in a way where if
8 you are going to generate revenue, which this
9 work force desperately needs, We haven't had a
10 raise now in seven-and-a-half years. the rates
11 are sky high. We all know that garages and
12 agents are overcharging on everything that
13 bill outlines.

14 Drivers has been losing thousands of
15 dollars in income. We do. We have a desperate
16 need to generate real revenue that will be
17 fairly shared in this industry. To generate
18 revenue simply for two companies, maybe even
19 just one of them, I don't even know, That are
20 not even under regulation, like the rest of
21 us, this is preposterous. It seems such
22 favoritism for the TLC to pass a rule like
23 this. I hope you strongly consider IT.

24 If you go this route, only go this route
25 if the revenue will go to the hard working men
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

2 and women, the drivers who don't get a penny
3 from any other revenue we generate whether on
4 the rooftop or the TV screens on the back. It
5 is drivers lead money, gas money. It is their
6 customer services. It is their hard earned
7 labor. They should get a share of the revenue,

8 not a bunch of vendors that came in on

9 exclusive contracts. Thank you.

10 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Mr. Singh,

11 Mohan Singh, and followed by Osman Ehowdhury.

12 Final person signed up is Beresford Simmons.

13 Again, I would invite folks to testify

14 together, if you message is identical or

15 almost entirely identical.

16 MR. SINGH: Good morning, I am Mohan

17 Singh. I'm the DOV driver. The thing is that

18 I am working 12 hours and my age is 56. All

19 things we have to face nobody knows. We have

20 to pay everything, Even the rolls that we buy

21 we have to pay from our pockets. Nobody but

22 us.

23 Another thing is wherever we go, if we

24 take any person to Brooklyn if we have to lose

25 the fair. Another thing is, again, of 20

¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

29

2 years, except my father or my parent, what can

3 I do? Nothing. And if we call the police,

4 the police come late and everything is clear.

5 We lose in every place.

6 Now the brokers checking everything.

7 They are taking every money which they can

8 collect. The thing is that they couldn't care

9 for us. We are humans. We had kids also.

10 They go to school. they want education. Where

11 we will go? You have to think it over.

12 What you are passing should be shared

13 with everyone and everyone should get the

14 share, Not only those people, those who have a

15 house. We are small people. We cannot raise

16 our voices but we can tell you that please
17 take care of this.

18 MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Mr. Ehowdhury
19 and Mr. Simmons are the final two.

20 MR. EHOWDHURY: Good morning, everybody.
21 Happy new year. Everybody year happy new year
22 but last year every new year coming to new
23 rules to the driver Suffering. That's
24 happiest not for the driver, Suffer and
25 victimize. We want to go back to different
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

30

2 things. We want to GPS Scam. We use the hand
3 held credit card. No problem.

4 Now hand held now GPS, They are charging
5 five person. Before the debit, the sponsors
6 said they can use it. The bill needs to go
7 driver Because the charging five person.
8 Nothing any benefit. Not only for the --
9 sometime people using credit card and
10 automatically the charge. We don't concentrate
11 on the deduct amounts. They don't know
12 anything about that. How can I lose the debit
13 money? We think why my money was to go to
14 other problem. My money giving them, my
15 credit account. We give them an educate
16 machines debit handling this. We don't need
17 them. I want to contact them. We don't want
18 anything from them.

19 My money I can count it. I finish my
20 work, Twelve hour shift and 15 hours. I go to
21 make a line. Every debit person arguing.
22 They don't see the proper way. That is not

23 something the driver suffering.

24 And another thing I hear this when the

25 weather, the bill recent credit. Hack
¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

31

2 license, They have the hack license number.

3 When they log into the system, The logging in

4 the hack license number they have it there.

5 The GPS has it. One pick up the passenger and

6 where do to drop. They have the record.

7 New thing for driver to put in hack

8 license. The time is wasted. Even sometime

9 what happens the credit card things, We have

10 two or three credit card. Not one and the

11 other credit card You are using. Only five

12 person. They don't pay any tips. What's

13 happening? We are losing our income? Thank

14 you.

15 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: Beresford Simmons.

16 MR. SIMMONS: I forfeit. Everything he
17 said.

18 >> MR. CHAIRMAN: I think that was an

19 enlightening public hearing. Commissioners,

20 we will consider the comments. I will have

21 the staff digest that. We will report back to

22 you about our proposed responses and changes

23 to that. We will discuss it, of course, as we

24 always do, and then we will see if it is ready

25 to bring back to the agenda.

¶ 1 Taxi and Limousine Hearing

32

2 So thank you. With that, a motion to

3 adjourn the hearing.

4 >> MR. GONZALES: Second.

5 MR. CHAIRMAN: All in favor say aye?

6 (The Board says aye.)

7 MR. CHAIRMAN: Opposed? The hearing is

8 adjourned at 11:00 o'clock.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

†

33

2 C E R T I F I C A T E

3

4 I, MICHAEL WILLIAMS, a Notary Public and

5 CART Reporter of the State of New York, do

6 hereby certify that the foregoing is a true

7 and accurate transcript of the testimony as

8 taken stenographically by and before me at the

9 time, place and on the date hereinbefore set

10 forth.

11 I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither a

12 relative nor employee nor attorney nor counsel

13 of any of the parties to this action, and that

14 I am neither a relative nor employee of such

15 attorney or counsel, and that I am not

16 financially interested in the action.

17

18

19

20

21

22

MICHAEL WILLIAMS

23

24

25

†