

00001

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

NYC TAXI AND LIMOUSINE COMMISSION  
MEETING  
40 RECTOR STREET, 5TH FLOOR  
NEW YORK, NEW YORK  
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 11, 2007  
9:30 A.M.

00002

1 P R E S E N T:

2 MATTHEW W. DAUS, Commissioner and Chairperson

3 ELIAS AROUT, Commissioner

4 NOACH DEAR, Commissioner

5 HARRY GIANNOULIS, Commissioner

6 EDWARD GONZALES, Commissioner

7 JEFFREY KAY, Commissioner

8 LAUVIENSKA POLANCO, Commissioner

9 HOWARD VARGAS, Commissioner

10 IRIS WEINSHALL, Commissioner

11 CHARLES FRASER, General Counsel

12 -----

13 Also Present:

14 Andy

15 Peter Shenkman

16 Mike Cecere

17 Gabriel Ciccone

18 William Decandido

19 Joe Giannetto

20 Tom Hayden

21 Bart Jesser

22 Michael Levine

23 Mel Peffers

24 David Pollock

25 Georgia Radway

00003

1 Jason Rosenzweig

2 Vincent Sapone

3 Kate Sinding

4

5

\* \* \*

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

00004

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Good morning, everyone. I'd like to proceed to Item One on the agenda, the Chairman's report.

As many of you know, there is a work action taking place with Access-A-Ride. Three of the fourteen companies contracted with the MTA are on strike. We have been working with OEM and the MTA to lend a helping hand.

Service has been diminished, but there is capacity, from what I understand, so that regular riders with serious medical issues are taking priority and the MTA appears to be able to handle that, based on what they told us.

Affected riders can call the MTA Para-Transit Hotline at 877-337-2017 for information. People can also call 311 for information about our industries.

Also, a heads up to the vehicle for hire industry, in particular, that you may be getting increased phone calls for service for people who are disabled and for folks who usually use Access-A-Ride. My understanding is that the way the system works, they all take your license

00005

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 car service or black car or limousine, for that  
3 matter. They will actually pay whatever they need  
4 to pay and will get reimbursed through the MTA.

5 The MTA will be disseminating  
6 information about that but, some of you may be  
7 getting an influx of calls. We ask that you, of  
8 course, help out the city at this time.

9 The medallion sale is proceeding. We  
10 have been closing on some medallions so far. We  
11 already have two accessible taxis from the November  
12 auction that have hit the road.

13 We have six closing scheduled for later  
14 this week. We've scheduled three so far and we're  
15 moving along.

16 We hope that within the next couple of  
17 months to be as expeditious as possible to get  
18 these vehicles out there.

19 On the taxicab technology customer  
20 service project, I'd like to give a brief update on  
21 that. We're now at 52 percent compliance. Cabs  
22 are equipped with -- 52 percent of the cabs that  
23 are out there serving the people are equipped with  
24 the technology systems.

25 We have an issue with one of our

00006

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 vendors. Taxi Technology has filed for bankruptcy.  
3 I think I mentioned this at the last Commission  
4 meeting. We have little bit of information about  
5 it. The status quo will be maintained by the  
6 Bankruptcy Court, I believe there is a stay.

7 I can't get into too many of the legal  
8 details, as I've been advised by counsel not to.  
9 However, there are 2,245 affected medallion owners.  
10 We'll be in touch with you at some point.

11 What I mean by "status quo" is, we will  
12 not be taking enforcement action against you.  
13 We'll be giving you enough time to comply. We have  
14 given you to the next inspection cycle, February 1,  
15 2008, through April 30, 2008, to comply.

16 We are not issuing summonses. If any  
17 medallion owners are interested in doing anything,  
18 I would strongly encourage them to retain and be  
19 advised by their own counsel, or call our own  
20 general counsel, Chuck Fraser, who is working  
21 closely with the Law Department on it.

22 There are some various motions that are  
23 pending, and as we get information about this we  
24 will let you know. To respond to Commissioner  
25 Weinshall's question, we are going above and beyond

00007

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 in terms of giving you some extra time to comply.

3 We realize it's a frustrating  
4 situation. These people did the right thing by  
5 signing up on time, so we're going to do everything  
6 we can to make it easy for you.

7 On a more disturbing note, I have to  
8 say, I personally had a couple of bad experiences,  
9 as well as some other colleagues of mine. I've  
10 been getting letters as well with the taxi  
11 technology systems.

12 First of all, it's been brought to my  
13 attention that there are drivers out there saying  
14 the equipment is broken and is not working, when in  
15 fact it is working.

16 I had a particular disturbing  
17 experience when I tried to pay by credit card and  
18 was told by the driver that I pressed cash. I  
19 said, "No, I didn't press cash." They were able to  
20 manipulate the front by pressing the cash.

21 Thankfully, one of the vendors was able  
22 to correct that problem. Now, it appears that the  
23 modus operandi of the drivers is to engage in a  
24 form of objection by just not telling passengers  
25 that it is working, or refusing to accept credit

00008

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 card payment.

3 I think that's outrageous, given all  
4 this commission has done; and we are going to take  
5 strong prosecutorial action against each and every  
6 one of these drivers. People have already filed  
7 through on one complaint. We encourage any  
8 passengers with this issue to call us and to follow  
9 up, also.

10 We're also going to be conducting  
11 enforcement. The reason I bring it up now is, I  
12 see there are several medallion fleet owners in the  
13 audience and a lot of medallion owners.

14 I would ask you to assist us, that  
15 whatever it takes, that you talk to your drivers,  
16 disseminate information to them and make sure that  
17 they don't do this.

18 It's just plain wrong; a deal is a  
19 deal. We went through this. Whether it's work  
20 actions or debates, it's just breaking the law and  
21 it's not going to be tolerated.

22 It's bad business, too. Think about  
23 it. You have all these people looking to use  
24 credit cards and they're being told, "No, it's not  
25 working."



00009

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Can you imagine if somebody was doing  
3 that in a store? It just doesn't happen that way  
4 or work that way. It's bad for the industry, it's  
5 bad for its image; and I can tell you it's an issue  
6 that, unless we address it, is not going to go  
7 away. It's going to give the industry and all of  
8 you a black eye.

9 So, I would hope that you would help  
10 us. I'm going to make sure we have our people out  
11 there in the next couple of weeks. The passengers  
12 -- the letters are pouring in. Please help us out  
13 on this.

14 We're going to get back on our schedule  
15 of the second Thursday of every month. We  
16 apologize for the last two months we're off kilter.  
17 Our next scheduled meeting will be Thursday,  
18 January 10, 2008.

19 At that time, I believe we are  
20 considering the medallion transfer rules; and also,  
21 we hope to have a prototype of our new commuter van  
22 stickers.

23 A quick update, because there isn't much  
24 we have to report on the accessible dispatch  
25 program; but we did promise that we'd give a

00010

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 monthly update.

3 We have on the 311 dispatch system,  
4 we've completed our internal draft of our contract,  
5 and we're going to be getting Law Department  
6 approval and signing within the next couple of  
7 weeks.

8 It's very extensive, and that's the  
9 main progress that we've made, nailing down the  
10 contractual provisions. At the January meeting,  
11 we'll hopefully have a more thorough update and  
12 more to report on it.

13 Last, but certainly not least, a  
14 personal moment to first of all, mazel tov and  
15 congratulations to our Commissioner Noach Dear,  
16 our Brooklyn representative on his election to the  
17 Civil Court of the City of New York.

18 (Applause.)

19 I want to take a few moments to thank  
20 you for your service.

21 I can probably say with certainty that  
22 we probably disagree more than we agree on most  
23 things; but you brought a real balance to the  
24 Commission. You brought a lot of good ideas, made  
25 a lot of good points where, at times, if we didn't

00011

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 listen to you, things would possibly have gone down  
3 the wrong road.

4 You brought an enthusiasm that I think  
5 we've never really seen here. You've done a  
6 tremendous job of not only taking this job  
7 seriously in bringing all of your experience and  
8 many years in the Council to transportation  
9 regulation; but we are certainly going to miss you.

10 I want to personally congratulate you.  
11 All my colleagues, I think, feel the same way. We  
12 didn't agree on everything. Sometimes we did, but  
13 for the most part, you've done a fantastic job here  
14 and we'll really, really miss your debate on the  
15 issues and your enthusiasm for this position, and  
16 we want to wish you the best.

17 I have a small token of our  
18 appreciation. I want to present you with a plaque  
19 for our appreciation of six years of dedicated  
20 service. Commissioners don't usually stay on for  
21 that long. For all you have done for our agency  
22 and we hope to honor you again in the future. For  
23 today, thank you.

24 (Indicating.)

25 (Applause.)

00012

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Commissioner Dear has the floor.

3 CMSR. DEAR: Thank you, Matt. This is a  
4 difficult time in a sense, because you're going  
5 from one place to another. In this case, it is a  
6 good place for me and I hope for the City of New  
7 York, as well.

8 I want to thank you, first of all,  
9 personally, Matt, because I've watched you when I  
10 was in the City Council. You moved on to become  
11 the Chairman and I've watched you grow. I'm amazed  
12 at what you have accomplished over these years and  
13 what you have done and brought to this commission.

14 I enjoyed our relationship. I want to  
15 disagree with you in that I think we agreed more  
16 than we disagreed, because if you go back to the  
17 record and see, I probably voted 9 out of 10 times  
18 with you.

19 And maybe the other 9 times we  
20 disagreed at the beginning, but you came along to  
21 my way and we agreed together.

22 (Laughter.)

23 I'm grateful for that, and also to your  
24 staff and assistants who probably call me more  
25 often than do my children. That's not really true,

00013

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 but they're always on top of things and there when  
3 needed.

4 To my fellow commissioners, what can I  
5 say?

6 Howard, you're a baby compared to my  
7 tenure here. I welcomed our relationship and  
8 enjoyed it. One thing I thought about before, what  
9 I would say about you and each individually. And I  
10 thought about you, Howard, the particulars, what  
11 can I learn from you for my next step?

12 One thing as I'm sitting there thinking  
13 about it, I can sit on my chair as a judge and  
14 follow Howard. Listen, and when you have to say  
15 something. Say it and do it.

16 So I appreciate that lesson that I can  
17 learn from you and the input. Also your knowledge  
18 the law and everything. It is helpful to me.  
19 Thank you very much. I'll miss you and I don't  
20 know what I'll do if you come before me. I'll have  
21 to make that decision then. I learned from judge  
22 school that it's your own personal decision if you  
23 have to recuse yourself. You're always welcome to  
24 talk to me.

25 Ed, I know you also recently -- I

00014

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 watched you, your knowledge of finance and  
3 everything else you've brought to this commission.  
4 You've done a tremendous job. I think it is  
5 something that was good for this commission,  
6 because it allows somebody, which I don't think we  
7 ever had, a commissioner who knew the whole world  
8 of finance.

9 Thank you for your advice and counsel  
10 and your input into the commission.

11 Jeff, who's a recent member who I  
12 enjoyed -- we hooked up to each other right away.  
13 It's something I enjoy and I respect you, and I  
14 think the Mayor's very fortunate to have someone  
15 like you in your position. I watched many people  
16 prior to you in these positions who weren't as good  
17 and talented as you, so I think the Mayor is  
18 fortunate to have someone like you, and I wish you  
19 a lot of luck.

20 And to Elias, who I look up to and  
21 respect because he's the Commission. I remember  
22 standing here pleading my case as a Councilman to  
23 speak before this Commission prior to -- another  
24 chairperson was there.

25 I watched how you interacted and I

00015

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 respected you. Staten Island is lucky to have  
3 someone like you who's an advocate and who really  
4 cares about the issues. Go for it on the liveries.  
5 Don't give up on anything with the liveries.  
6 Protect them, because they're a vital part of our  
7 history here and in this setting.

8 To Chuck, who is the second counsel we  
9 had, I admire you for your honesty. We fought with  
10 each other. I am right on my decision about our  
11 Appellate term we served, but we agree to disagree  
12 and I respect you for standing on the issues and I  
13 thank you for your counsel, for helping me out  
14 during this time.

15 To Iris, what can I say? Iris was put  
16 on this commission -- that's my theory -- because  
17 of me. I was here. Iris didn't want -- I respect  
18 you, Iris. I have a history with you back when I  
19 was with the City.

20 I had to change seats because of Iris.  
21 They kept me here and they kept -- on each side --  
22 and it still didn't work.

23 Iris, thank you so much for your  
24 friendship, for everything you have done for me  
25 over the years, not only on the Commission but also

00016

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 at DOT. I look forward -- I know I have a personal  
3 relationship with everybody; I know there's no  
4 business relationship we could have. I have to  
5 learn to conduct myself as a judge, but I continue  
6 because I admire you and I'm sure in a new  
7 administration I could see Iris coming back as  
8 something important for this City, because I know  
9 you're not going away from this City.

10 To Lubby, who's taught me a few things  
11 in the last few months she's been on the  
12 Commission, I was able to, when I got my legal  
13 counsel now, I looked and said, is she like Lubby?  
14 I respect you for your hard work and dedication and  
15 for the work you do and your legal scholarship and  
16 for everything you have contributed here and to me  
17 personally, when we talked about different issues  
18 outside the TLC.

19 What can I say about Harry? I know one  
20 thing, if I would have had your smarts, I probably  
21 wouldn't be here. I would be elected to another  
22 office by now.

23 Harry, you are unbelievable. You are  
24 respected you are the Commission, as well. You're  
25 here a while, a long time, and I wish you a long



00017

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 tenure, even longer tenure. You speak out on the  
3 issues, you're smart as a whip and you really know  
4 the issues, you understand everything else.

5 I want to thank you for giving me  
6 insight of how to conduct ourselves out there, and  
7 be out there and what to do to make sure things  
8 happen. Thank you Harry, and good luck.

9 To the people out there in the  
10 audience, to the thousands of drivers out there,  
11 who I admire and love and I have been always been  
12 considered the driver's person on the TLC. I'm  
13 proud of that and I like the hard working men and  
14 women that are out there. To the organizations out  
15 there, Metropolitan, from the president and down,  
16 to the Nadow [sic], president and on. Taxi Safety  
17 Committee; Lonto [sic]; to Lonto I can make Uncle  
18 Vinnie, because he's become part of the family. To  
19 the Black Car Association, to the Livery  
20 Association, to the individuals, the vendors, to  
21 everybody out there. You have been fantastic.

22 I have never seen such a group of  
23 people that have been so good to me. I have heard  
24 from you. We developed relationships. Many became  
25 personal relationships with me and my family. You

00018

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 came to my daughters' weddings and everything else.

3 It makes me feel good that there are  
4 people out there that will remain friends, and I  
5 really appreciate that.

6 I also want to mention Deputy  
7 Commissioner Sorkin, who when we came on board  
8 here, we would learn to disagree, but we had a real  
9 professional relationship, where we were able to  
10 talk to each other, have input, and understand.

11 You have brought lot of new things to  
12 the agency. We have changed things around and  
13 tried new things, a lot to your credit. I wish you  
14 good luck and continued luck for the agency.

15 I see Ira Gold here. If I start, I  
16 could name the entire agency. But the entire TLC  
17 staff has been wonderful to me; Gary and the Chief  
18 of Enforcement, who I go back to with other  
19 agencies; who's wonderful and I wish her a lot of  
20 luck.

21 God bless you all. You can always  
22 visit me. I hope -- if you're not lawyers, not  
23 adversaries -- and please let's stay in touch on a  
24 personal level.

25 Thank you very much and happy holidays

00019

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 to everybody

3 (Applause.)

4 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: There is nothing I

5 can add to that. Congratulations.

6 Any questions on the report?

7 I'd like to proceed to Item Two on the

8 agenda, the adoption of the minutes of the

9 November 13, 2007 Commission meeting.

10 Any changes, corrections or

11 modifications to the minutes?

12 MR. AROUT: Motion to accept.

13 MS. POLANCO: Second.

14 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: All in favor say aye?

15 (A chorus of "ayes.")

16 Item Three, Base licensing applications

17 review. We have a staff member from Licensing.

18 MS. RADWAY: Good morning. I'm Georgia

19 Steele Radway [sic].

20 Licensing would like to present before

21 the Commission 23 bases with a recommendation for

22 approval.

23 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Do we have a motion

24 to accept the base applications?

25 CMSR. DEAR: Motion.

00020

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 CMSR. KAY: Second.

3 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: All in favor say

4 "Aye."

5 (A chorus of "Ayes.")

6 MS. RADWAY: There are six bases that  
7 Licensing is recommending for denial with a request  
8 that the Commission grant an additional 30 days so  
9 that they may present the outstanding items.

10 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Any questions?

11 These are folks that have not done what  
12 they need to do with their application. If we make  
13 a motion, the motion will be that we will give an  
14 additional 30 days, and if they don't comply and do  
15 the paperwork by then, they will be denied.

16 Do I have a motion?

17 CMSR. AROUT: Motion.

18 CMSR. DEAR: Second.

19 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: All in favor say

20 "Aye."

21 (A chorus of "Ayes.")

22 Motion passes. Thank you very much,

23 Georgia.

24 FYI, Commissioner Gonzales has taken a  
25 very strong interest in helping us spend some extra

00021

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 time on reforming the system. I know we had some  
3 reforms that we were going to be taking up in 2008  
4 that have been discussed by staff. We are going to  
5 be having a meeting to discuss some of his ideas  
6 about administrative suspension, so I want to thank  
7 you for your insight; and we will be doing that in  
8 the next couple of weeks.

9 I'd like to now go to Item Four on the  
10 agenda, Proposed Rules for Public Hearing, and  
11 Minimum Miles Per Gallon Requirements for Taxicabs.

12 I'd like to say, first of all, thanks  
13 to the staff for all the work that they've done  
14 over the last year or two on hybrids. This goes  
15 back to presentations and research we have been  
16 doing since 2005.

17 Thanks to the Mayor and Deputy Mayor  
18 Dan Doctoroff, who unfortunately will be leaving  
19 us. He's been a fantastic person to work with and  
20 we'll miss him. For those of you who didn't know  
21 that, Dan Doctoroff has been the supervisor of our  
22 agency for the last year and a half or so.

23 Basically, what I told the Deputy Mayor  
24 -- he's leaving to become president of Bloomberg  
25 LP, which he is very excited about. Certainly, we

00022

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 have done more in this year, thanks to Dan, quite  
3 frankly, than I think the Commission has ever done  
4 in its history. There are more things that have  
5 happened and more projects started and completed,  
6 really because of Dan and Dan's drive and vision.  
7 He's really brought great ideas and I'm going to  
8 miss him tremendously.  
9 I know Jeff will, too. Jeff reports to Dan and is  
10 the point person on many different city agencies.  
11 So he's leaving us, but thanks to Dan and Rick and  
12 the whole team, and Jeff, who put together Plan  
13 NYC.

14 This hearing is an outgrowth, and  
15 these rules are an outgrowth of the Plan NYC Plan.  
16 The Mayor had announced that it was publicly out  
17 there for many, many months now. We do have a  
18 process for considering these rules as you know.  
19 Under the Administrative Procedure Act, we have to  
20 hold a public hearing and have debate, and that's  
21 what we're doing today.

22 I want to make it really clear because  
23 I think that maybe there's some confusion about  
24 this. We had, and I had committed a while back,  
25 and before I turn it over to Chuck I want reiterate

00023

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 that commitment that, for both the fleet owners and  
3 the environmentalists, quite frankly, that this is  
4 a changing industry. As you can see, the  
5 automobile manufacturing market has really gone  
6 towards hybrids in a large way. We also realize  
7 and recognize that cleaner fuels are a thing that's  
8 developing as we speak.

9 Just as we sit here today and a year or  
10 two years ago, who could have envisioned how things  
11 would go with the price of gas and hybrid  
12 development? Who knows where we're going to be in  
13 another year or two with years? We want to make  
14 sure it's done right.

15 Whether we vote on, or what we do today,  
16 I want to make it clear from the outset that it's  
17 my intention; and I will ask the staff make a  
18 presentation one way or another on everything that  
19 been going on with the program by no later than  
20 June of 2009, including what other technologies are  
21 out there; whether the hybrids, if they're  
22 performing as well as they are now, in another year  
23 or so from now.

24 I want to make sure we make that  
25 presentation in 2009 ahead of time. We're

00024

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 committed to doing that one way or another.

3 Whatever happens with these rules, to make sure  
4 that if there are problems, they're addressed. If  
5 there are vehicles that aren't available, that we  
6 make sure they are available.

7 Most importantly, if there are new  
8 technologies available and different paths that we  
9 want to go down, that we are ready to address them  
10 at that time. I'm talking about another project we  
11 started for the Deputy Mayor, which is the Taxi of  
12 Tomorrow.

13 We've hired Ricardo, and we can't let  
14 that whole project get lost in the mix. Quite  
15 frankly, it's very much tied into what we are doing  
16 here today. The Taxi of Tomorrow Project is  
17 looking to develop a utopian cab of the future  
18 that's cleaner, greener, accessible, smaller on the  
19 outside, big on the inside, plenty of room, one  
20 that's affordable for the industry, one that's  
21 durable, that will hold up on that road, one that  
22 looks good, that looks iconic, that fits into the  
23 landscape of the city, the urban landscape. This  
24 is the goal.

25 To say that the work we're doing,



00025

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Ricardo and the Advisory Committee, made up of many  
3 industry members is not related would be  
4 ridiculous. They are related. A lot of the  
5 outgrowth of that whole project may bring to bear  
6 on these rules down the road.

7 I just want to put that date in stone,  
8 June of 2009, on or around that time. I and the  
9 staff will be making a presentation to the  
10 commissioners on the status of whatever program is  
11 in place and the new technologies.

12 Now on that's on the record, I'll turn  
13 it over to Chuck. He's going to talk about the  
14 comments we received at the public hearing.

15 MR. FRASER: This proposed rule would  
16 require that taxicabs under the accessible taxicabs  
17 that are put into service beginning October 1, 2008  
18 must have a minimum rating of 25 miles per gallon  
19 in city driving; and beginning on October 1, 2009  
20 must have a minimum rating of 30 miles per gallon  
21 in city driving.

22 In order to enable taxicabs to satisfy  
23 that standard, taxicabs will be permitted to meet  
24 the smaller vehicle specifications currently in  
25 place for hybrid electric vehicles.

00026

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 The proposed rule also permits the use  
3 of CFG powered taxicabs, if such vehicles are  
4 originally manufactured vehicles.

5 In light of the recent advances in the  
6 design of vehicle partitions, the new higher mileage  
7 taxicabs put into service pursuant to this proposed  
8 rule would not be exempt from the partition  
9 requirements.

10 In addition, the proposed rule would  
11 eliminate the exemption from petition requirements  
12 for hybrid electric taxicabs. The proposed rule  
13 was published for comment on October 22, 2007. The  
14 three written comments were received, copies of  
15 which have been distributed to the commissioners.

16 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you, Chuck.

17 Is Council Member Yassky still here?

18 Could you join us? You wish to speak  
19 today? We'll put you at the head of the pack  
20 because you were there with us and the Mayor, and  
21 you preregistered, I believe.

22 I want to thank you. Even when we had  
23 some issues and concerns, you were the one who  
24 really kept the environmental train chugging along.  
25 And really, as per the Mayor, are responsible for

00027

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 helping us get where we are today on this  
3 initiative. I want to thank you personally and  
4 welcome you as our first speaker on these rules.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Thank you,  
6 Commissioner, and members of the Commission. I  
7 appreciate your saying that. I can't tell you how  
8 much I admire the leadership of this Commission on  
9 this critically important issue.

10 As you well know, you are now national  
11 leaders for pushing an environmental agenda forward  
12 in a smart, sensible way that I believe will work  
13 very well for the industry you regulate; and I  
14 think you should take enormous pride in what you're  
15 accomplishing, what you have and are accomplishing  
16 today.

17 I'm here simply to urge you to adopt  
18 the rules before you. I urge you to do that now,  
19 and as proposed, every day that goes by is a day  
20 the owners will buy the cabs under the current  
21 rules and put more gas guzzlers on the street.

22 As soon as you do this, you will see,  
23 when they take effect, a change immediately to  
24 taxis that are doing everything we want them to do  
25 for the passengers of New York City and the

00028

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 visitors and the tourists; but also contribute --  
3 not solve the problem then and there -- but  
4 contribute in a meaningful way to cleaning the air  
5 and dealing with our carbon crisis. You will have  
6 taken that step.

7 While I'm here I would suggest that  
8 once you have adopted this, I do believe in the  
9 future there are a couple of things to look at.  
10 One is, as I understand it, the rules that have  
11 been proposed would not permit compressed natural  
12 gas powered vehicles in the same way as hybrids.

13 I think there are logical impediments  
14 to an owner that would choose to go the CNG route.  
15 But if an owner wants to take those -- figure out a  
16 way to deal with those impediments, the regulations  
17 in my view ought to permit it. So I would urge the  
18 Commission to go back later at some point and  
19 revisit that issue.

20 Certainly, not to delay what you are  
21 doing today. I think it is so significant.

22 I also want to bring to your attention  
23 the concern that I have heard about vehicle owners  
24 whose cars now will go past a third year having  
25 difficulty -- the way the current rules work, if a

00029

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 vehicle fails an inspection and they won't be able  
3 to cure it, the vehicle will have to go out of  
4 service.

5 I think that the time this issue was  
6 first discussed, the -- it seems to me what is fair  
7 is to allow, if there are going be cleaner  
8 vehicles, to allow them to stay on the road a  
9 little bit longer. That makes it work for the  
10 industry, as well.

11 I also recommend you go back and  
12 revisit that, as well. Again, I'm here today to  
13 commend the Commission for what it is doing, what  
14 it has done, and to urge you to adopt the  
15 regulation before you.

16 Thank you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. We  
18 received your letters and will schedule a follow-up  
19 meeting to discuss those issues. There's a fair  
20 point to be made there, and we want to go over it  
21 first.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: I look forward  
23 it.

24 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you.  
25 Michael Seilback of the American Lung

00030

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Association of New York State is the first  
3 scheduled speaker.

4 The Next scheduled speaker is Kate  
5 Sinding, National Resources Defense Council.

6 (Indicating.)

7 MS. SINDING: Good morning,  
8 Commissioners. I'm Kate Sinding and I'm a senior  
9 attorney with the Natural Resources Defense  
10 Council, which is a national nonprofit organization  
11 that's worked for more than 30 years on reducing  
12 air and global warming pollution, emissions from  
13 vehicles in New York City and throughout the  
14 region, as well as on a wide variety of environment  
15 and public health matters.

16 Our organization has more than 1.2  
17 million members and activists nationally, with over  
18 30,000 supporters in New York City alone.

19 I'm pleased to be here today to provide  
20 our strong support for the TLC's proposed rules  
21 governing minimum miles per gallon standards for  
22 taxicabs.

23 By requiring that all new taxis meet  
24 minimum standards of 25 MPG starting in  
25 October 2008, and 30 MPG in 2009, with the result

00031

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 that all taxis will achieve at least 30 MPGs by  
3 October 2012, these rules will put New York State  
4 well on the road to having the cleanest fleet of  
5 any major city in the world.

6 The introduction of increasing numbers  
7 of high efficiency vehicles into the New York City  
8 yellow cab fleet over the next five years will reap  
9 significant environmental and other benefits for  
10 City residents and taxi drivers.

11 First, the new MPG standards will  
12 significantly improve New York City's air quality.  
13 Each year, approximately 1.2 million tons of  
14 criteria pollutant are emitted from motor vehicles  
15 in New York, significantly contributing to the  
16 City's air quality, ranked as the third worst in  
17 the nation since 2004.

18 The high efficiency vehicles will  
19 significantly reduce those emissions. Likewise,  
20 the new mileage standards will reduce global  
21 warming emissions.

22 A few relevant facts. The Ford Escape  
23 hybrid emits one-third less CO2 than the Crown  
24 Victoria, and the US EPA has rated the Escape  
25 hybrid 8 out of 10 for greenhouse emissions,

00032

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 compared to the Crown Victoria, 5 out of the 10.

3 If the entire fleet was convert to  
4 hybrids today, it's estimated that New York's CO2  
5 emissions could be reduced by more than 215,000  
6 tons per year.

7 Third, the new standards will help to  
8 reduce our dependence on oil.

9 And finally, the high fuel efficiency  
10 associated with these mileage standards will reap  
11 benefits for taxi drivers and owners. I believe  
12 TLC estimates that the average taxi drives about  
13 40,000 miles a year.

14 With average gasoline prices in the  
15 City now about \$3.40 a gallon, and assuming, as is  
16 the case today, that these high efficiency vehicles  
17 are about twice as fuel efficient when operated as  
18 the Crown Victoria, converting to hybrids today  
19 would save the average driver over \$4,500 a year in  
20 operating costs.

21 In closing, I would like to strongly  
22 commend the Commission and urge it to adopt the  
23 proposed rules today, and then to move on to the  
24 next step of addressing the black car fleet.

25 I thank you for the opportunity to



00033

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 testify today.

3 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you.

4 The next speaker is Vincent Sapone,  
5 from Lomto.

6 MR. SAPONE: Good morning Mr. Chairman,  
7 Commissioners. Thank you for giving this  
8 opportunity to speak. I would like to wish  
9 everybody a healthy New Year and a good holiday.

10 You know what? After I leave here  
11 there are going to be some people who aren't going  
12 to like what I have to say. I have to say it, and  
13 I want this whole room to be aware.

14 My father drove in 1932 and I started  
15 in 1966 and we have -- he is deceased now -- we  
16 have 65, close to 70 years experience driving in  
17 the field; so I do know something about taxicab  
18 business.

19 Before I read this agenda here that I  
20 made up -- spent days working on it -- I have to  
21 say there some people here for clean air and so am  
22 I, no question about.

23 I think they have their heads in the  
24 sand. There are thousands upon thousands of  
25 liveries, gypsies, roaming the street with 10-year,

00034

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 5-year old cars that's polluting everything. It  
3 seems like only the taxis pollute the city and only  
4 the taxi drivers will save the world.

5 They're constantly at airports, they're  
6 at hotels, that a cab can't even get there, and  
7 very, very little is being done about it. Only the  
8 cab drivers are polluting the air, nobody else.

9 We will save the world for everybody.  
10 But remember, I believe in going green. But give  
11 me a break. Everybody else should go green also,  
12 not just cab drivers. It's not right.

13 Going green, let's take the Highlander.  
14 The Highlander doesn't meet your specs. But you  
15 know what? I have a few members that spent an  
16 extra \$10,000 that bought it, and the customers  
17 love it. There's more leg room, more shoulder  
18 room, much more trunk room.

19 By you guys demanding us going really  
20 small, we are going to be losing business at  
21 airports. That's 25 percent of our business. They  
22 would jump into liveries and gypsies at the first  
23 choice they get when they got three people plus  
24 luggage. Mark my words, that will happen.

25 I'm sorry for being a little rough; but

00035

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 you know what? It is not right. We should wait to  
3 2009. Maybe by then a proper taxi will come out  
4 that meets the standards, okay, and is roomy enough  
5 for passengers.

6 And also, I'm on the committee for the  
7 Taxi of the Future. We are working hard with the  
8 TLC members who are on that project. I believe  
9 something will come out of that. I suggest  
10 skipping the 25 in 2008 and going right to 2009.

11 I don't see any problem with that. We  
12 will work with you. We want to go green. You got  
13 to give some consideration, okay?

14 I don't care what anybody says here.  
15 "Oh, there's plenty of room in the Prius." That's  
16 nonsense. You can't get three people in there my  
17 size. Baloney. It's very tight and very  
18 uncomfortable.

19 We're work on a taxi of the future.  
20 Let's give it the best shot we could and come up  
21 with the best cab possible for this industry, and  
22 let's keep it green.

23 You know what? Anyway, you all got  
24 this in front of you. Kindly read it. Listen,  
25 let's not always beat up on cab drivers. You guys

00036

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 are commissioners. You guys are supposed to  
3 protect the public as well as cab drivers.

4 I don't know what's going on here.  
5 Everybody says, "What about people with heart  
6 problems?"

7 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Sum up, please.

8 MR. SAPONE: Only cab drivers. You're  
9 going to destroy these people. Not the liveries  
10 and nobody else. It's not fair what you are doing.

11 Have a nice day.

12 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you.

13 (Applause.)

14 The next speaker is Joe Giannetto from

15 MBT.

16 MR. GIANNETTO: Good morning.

17 Commissioners.

18 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: As a point of order  
19 for all the speakers, there's a lot of people; so as the  
20 buzzer goes off, try to sum up the best you can.

21 MR. GIANNETTO: Commissioner, in the  
22 interest of time, if I could ask 60 additional  
23 seconds I could probably incorporate two registered  
24 speakers to save time.

25 For the record, I'm Joseph Giannetto,

00037

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Director of Business Development for the  
3 Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade, which  
4 currently represents 28 taxi fleets with over 3200  
5 taxicabs.

6 I'd like to start by simply quoting  
7 from Mayor Bloomberg's Plan NYC which was published  
8 this April. It says, "The dominant taxi vehicle  
9 today achieves only 10 to 15 miles per gallon.  
10 More fuel efficient vehicles are used in limited  
11 numbers today, including hybrid electric vehicles.

12 "These vehicles are in the first years  
13 of use, and questions regarding their durability as  
14 24-hour, 7-day a week vehicles have yet to be fully  
15 answered. We will aim to double the efficiency of  
16 new taxis by 2012."

17 "Achieving these stated goals," the  
18 plan goes on to say will require aggressive work on  
19 the part of the TLC to push the auto industry and  
20 the TLC toward answering these questions and  
21 ensuring that vehicles used as taxicabs meet the  
22 highest safety, service and sustainability standard  
23 of New Yorkers. This plan could result in the  
24 entire fleet being converted to more fuel efficient  
25 vehicles within 8 to 10 years."

00038

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 One month later, on May 22, the Mayor  
3 announced the new accelerated plan, requiring all  
4 new taxicabs to be fuel efficient, 25 miles per  
5 gallon, by October 2008, and 30 miles per gallon in  
6 2009, five years earlier than what was stated in  
7 the original plan."

8 Remember what the plan said regarding  
9 hybrid vehicles. These vehicles are in the first  
10 years of use, and questions regarding their  
11 durability as taxis have yet to be fully answered.

12 Certainly, these questions weren't  
13 answered in the four weeks between the Mayor's two  
14 announcements, and they still remain unanswered.

15 Before I go on, I want to make it clear  
16 that MTB fully supports the Mayor's Plan NYC goals  
17 of fuel efficiency of taxis.

18 And we fully support and are proud to  
19 be participants in the visionary city sponsored  
20 effort to find the taxicab of tomorrow. The Mayor  
21 and this TLC deserves a tremendous amount of credit  
22 for having done what was thought to be impossible;  
23 getting the auto industry interested in actually  
24 building a New York City taxicab.

25 What we can't understand, however, is

00039

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 why the city will paint over every detail to create  
3 the ideal taxicab, yet be so cavalier about what we  
4 do between now and the arrival of the taxicab of  
5 tomorrow.

6 Again, while we support the goals of  
7 Plan NYC, we strongly object to this accelerated  
8 implementation schedule which will force us to buy  
9 unused vehicles as early as 10 months from now,  
10 which haven't been fully tested for taxi use or are  
11 inconsistent with safe and reliable fleet  
12 operations.

13 In fact, significant safety questions  
14 have been raised about the currently configured  
15 hybrid taxis, based on initial experience on the  
16 road, accidents involving these vehicles, feedback  
17 from dealers, mechanics and taxicab operators.

18 It should be noted that MTB operates  
19 well over 100 hybrids today. The truth is, we  
20 don't know much at all about the safety or  
21 durability of these hybrid taxis, and that's  
22 exactly the point.

23 A New York taxi is on the road more  
24 frequently than perhaps any other vehicle in the  
25 world; and demands more attention to safety and

00040

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 durability than simply meeting the minimum federal  
3 requirements of a passenger car.

4 Let's be clear about what we are doing  
5 here. If these rules are passed as written, we'll  
6 be forcing the early retirement of a proven five  
7 star crash rated, five star rollover rated, stretch  
8 Crown Victoria, a purpose built fleet vehicle, for  
9 a mishmash of passenger cars that include the Ford  
10 Escape, that has a three star rollover rating, and  
11 none of which have completed a full taxi cycle, and  
12 none of which have been proven to withstand the  
13 rigors of New York City taxi use.

14 The proposed rules ignore longstanding  
15 TLC requirements and specifications for heavy duty  
16 fleet vehicles; and interior cabin space  
17 requirements which ensure comfort and ease in  
18 ingress and egress for all passengers.

19 You'll be replacing a safe and  
20 comfortable car, one which was mandated by this TLC  
21 not more than six years ago in response to  
22 overwhelming number passenger complaints about  
23 inadequate leg room in the smaller vehicles, for  
24 ones that many passengers find unbearably  
25 constraining.



00041

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 The bottom line, with these rules, I  
3 think safety concerns are being compromised. And  
4 that's not acceptable when millions of taxi riders  
5 and thousands of taxi drivers rely on the city to  
6 make these determinations for them.

7 In conclusion, we support Plan NYC and  
8 the goal of a more fuel efficient taxi. However,  
9 much more work needs to be done. Questions of  
10 vehicle durability, occupant safety, and passenger  
11 preferences have yet to be fully answered.

12 The Mayor had this right the first  
13 time. Let's answer these questions. Let's wait  
14 for Ricardo's findings which we'll start to see in  
15 April or May. Let's wait for more progress on the  
16 rapidly moving efforts by auto makers to produce a  
17 safe and comfortable green taxi, some of which may  
18 be out by 2009; and let's cut out this arbitrary  
19 October 2008 mandate.

20 In fact, we've gone as far to endorse  
21 the second part of these accelerated goals, which  
22 is 30 miles per gallon in October, 2009, provided  
23 that this Commission is able to assess eligible  
24 taxis prior to that time.

25 So we're simply asking that this

00042

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Commission get back to a thoughtful approach of  
3 reaching our environmental goals, one that plays  
4 safety above all else.

5 Thank you, Mr. Chairperson.

6 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. In the  
7 interest of administrative efficiency for this  
8 hearing, I'll ask staff to hold all comments to the  
9 end. I'll have Mr. Shenkman come up and he's  
10 taking notes of all the concerns being raised, and  
11 he'll address them at the end of the meeting.  
12 Peter? Thank you.

13 The next speaker is Gabriel Ciccone,  
14 from Fuelpup.com.

15 MR. CICCONE: Good morning. My name is  
16 Gabriel Ciccone, CEO of Fuelpup.com. Fuelpup.com  
17 is a clean technology company that develops and  
18 manufactures hybrid retrofit kits by integrating  
19 our patented electrical power assistance to  
20 existing motor vehicles.

21 An electric motor is attached to the  
22 vehicle's existing drive shaft, and a controller is  
23 installed to control the motor. The motor kit  
24 utilizes the existing vehicle battery on auxiliary  
25 battery for even greater fuel economy.

00043

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Fuelpup's unique patented design  
3 enables light truck passenger vehicles and fleet  
4 vehicles to be converted to hybrid electric gas at  
5 a realistic and affordable price.

6 The results are greatly increased fuel  
7 economy while reducing emissions and allowing  
8 vehicles to operate at lower costs.

9 Fuelpup's simple and economical  
10 installation on existing vehicles would not  
11 interfere with the vehicle's normal operation and  
12 warranty, while providing the vehicle with a  
13 seamless transition to electric propulsion to gas.  
14 The vehicle's computer automatically adjusts the  
15 vehicle's speed and engages the transmission  
16 accordingly.

17 You don't have to give up the luxury  
18 and reliability of the Crown Victoria for advanced  
19 hybrid technology. Our hybrid kit is integrated  
20 into the existing car's drive shaft, transforming  
21 it into a hybrid vehicle.

22 Why purchase a costly fleet of hybrid  
23 taxis, when you can convert the existing fleet at  
24 nominal cost, with a price of only \$1300 per  
25 vehicle.

00044

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Many fear the reliability of these new  
3 hybrid cars. Fuelpup would not impede on the  
4 performance of the Crown Victoria. If there's a  
5 failure, the car can disengage the electrical  
6 assist and perform under normal operation functions  
7 until repairs can be made.

8 As an added bonus, if the car's  
9 gasoline engine malfunctions, Fuelpup will let the  
10 vehicle drive for several miles without the engine  
11 running in order to get to a service center and  
12 avoid traffic jams.

13 Fuelpup will alleviate fuel consumption  
14 by 25 percent or more, while reducing emissions  
15 into our environment, using cost effective and  
16 realistic approach.

17 Fuelpup.com is a practical, cost  
18 effective solution that can be implemented in  
19 months and not years.

20 To quote Al Gore yesterday, "We have  
21 the ability to solve this crisis and avoid the  
22 worst consequences if we act boldly, decisively and  
23 quickly."

24 I believe Fuelpup is a solution right  
25 now.

00045

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. Just to  
3 make you aware, we do have rules and a process for  
4 reviewing pilot program requests. This would be  
5 something appropriate for you to look at. If you  
6 call my office, Carolyn Rinaldi will send you a  
7 copy of the rules, the petitions, and we'll take a  
8 look at your technology.

9 MR. CICCONE: We just got issued a  
10 patent in September of this year. We saw the  
11 newspaper article.

12 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: We do have a separate  
13 petitioning procedure, so if you contact us we will  
14 basically give you the information that you need to  
15 make an application to us, for us to authorize  
16 potentially testing of your equipment in the cabs.

17 MR. CICCONE: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: You have to submit it  
19 to my office. They'll give you what you need.

20 The next speaker is Tom Hayden from  
21 Metro King Motors.

22 MR. HAYDEN: Good morning, all.

23 This statement by Metro King Motors  
24 will provide a brief status of the alternative  
25 vehicle choice given in today's proposed rule.

00046

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 That is, an accessible taxicab, as defined in  
3 Section 3-03.2 of the TLC rules.

4 In 2003, the New York City Taxi and  
5 Limousine Commission and the New York State Energy  
6 Research and Development Authority signed a  
7 memorandum of understanding that a New York future  
8 taxi initiative be inaugurated to promote the  
9 development of improved taxis and for-hire vehicles  
10 that incorporate both wheelchair accessibility and  
11 advanced power trains.

12 Metro King Motors accepted this  
13 challenge and will shortly complete our first  
14 production run of a taxi that is wheelchair  
15 accessible and that provides improved fuel economy  
16 over the current Ford Crown Victoria.

17 The Metro King taxi is a purpose built  
18 vehicle that uses a full frame chassis for  
19 durability; a separate driver's compartment; and a  
20 passenger compartment that comfortably seats up to  
21 five.

22 We are sensitive to introducing  
23 complexities in short time frames, so our vehicle  
24 is constructed in a traditional manner and can be  
25 repaired with parts and assemblies that are

00047

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 currently available from local dealers, auto parts  
3 stores or recycled parts suppliers.

4 The wheelchair accessibility is  
5 provided by a two car ramp that enters through a  
6 side door and is stowed under the floor when not in  
7 use. It therefore does not take up any interior  
8 volume from the passengers. The wheelchair and its  
9 passenger are secured with the restraining system.

10 The inline 5-cylinder engine is  
11 inherently more fuel efficient than the five liter  
12 V8. Furthermore, Metro King is commercializing an  
13 idle-stop technology that we will market as hybrid  
14 on demand.

15 This feature automatically stops and  
16 restarts the engine during prolonged idle periods;  
17 and in vehicle testing by the New York Department  
18 of Environmental Conservation at the request of  
19 NYSERTA [sic], it demonstrated a 20 percent  
20 decrease in fuel consumption over the New York City  
21 taxi driving cycle.

22 Metro King is also looking forward to  
23 incorporating an auxiliary electric starter  
24 generator that would further reduce emissions and  
25 improve fuel economy.

00048

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Metro King Motors LLC is a final stage  
3 manufacturer, registered with the National Highway  
4 Traffic and Safety Administration; and we've  
5 designed the vehicle to comply with all applicable  
6 federal motor vehicle safety standards and  
7 Environmental Protection Agency performance  
8 requirements.

9 We have the full support of General  
10 Motors for parts and distribution, as well as the  
11 original GM warranty. Metro King now has an  
12 assembly facility in Poughkeepsie, New York, where  
13 we can take advantage of the skills, manufacturing  
14 labor pool, the local economic development  
15 activities, and become a New York automotive  
16 manufacturer with New York employees.

17 We're ready to take orders and fully  
18 intend to provide New York a viable, practical  
19 durable, acceptable taxicab. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. The same  
21 goes for your company. I think David Klahr is here  
22 also. He's the person you might want to see about  
23 the pilot program.

24 MR. HAYDEN: I have paper copy.

25 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you.



00049

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 The next speaker is Mel Peffers from  
3 the Environmental Defense Fund. I have three  
4 speakers from Environmental Defense; Mel Peffers,  
5 Ramon Cruz, or Eddie Burgess.

6 MS. PEFFERS: Roman Cruz is not here;  
7 but Eddie Burgess is.

8 My name is Mel Peffers, from the  
9 Environmental Defense Fund. I want to thank the  
10 Commission, as well as a few other thank yous;  
11 Bloomberg and Doctoroff for being real leaders in  
12 this initiative to green our city. I'd also like  
13 to thank David Yassky, as well as the Green Cabs  
14 initiative and Taxis for Tomorrow. I want to  
15 support all the efforts of the people working on  
16 that.

17 A little bit about who I am. I'm Mel  
18 Peffers. I'm with the Environmental Defense Fund,  
19 a non-profit. And our tag line is finding ways  
20 that work. We have over half a million members and  
21 a little about our organization.

22 We really try to find solutions that  
23 make the best sense, economically, socially and for  
24 our health; not only for the earth, but for our  
25 personal public health. I'm not a lawyer, so

00050

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 everybody can calm down a little. I want to say we  
3 had smart lawyers who have looked at this and it's  
4 a smart thing to do. We need to take a leadership  
5 role here in New York City.

6 I'm not an economist and this makes  
7 smart sense, economically. Fuel prices are going  
8 up. The way you set these standards is smart to  
9 bring up new technology and new advancements and  
10 these sorts of advances towards fuel efficiencies.

11 We're technology and fuel neutral. We  
12 want to make sure that the end result at the  
13 tailpipe is really what's driving our decisions.

14 I am, however, a health scientist. I  
15 have gotten my health degree from the Harvard  
16 School of Public Health. To speak from the heart  
17 on this, a little rebuttal is, most of us in the  
18 environmental world get this reputation as being  
19 very idealistic. Our non-profit is definitely  
20 about finding ways that work.

21 I don't have my head in the sand, but  
22 I'm choking on the fumes of the tailpipes  
23 everywhere. I would agree that we need to look at  
24 all fleets, but I know the TLC Commission  
25 specifically here works on the taxi and livery

00051

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 service.

3 I want to show my commitment to  
4 cleaning up the fumes from all the other sectors;  
5 the airlines, the diesel trucks. I'm definitely  
6 behind cleaning up all of those.

7 My head is, however, stuck in choking  
8 on the fumes from these tailpipes. I worked with  
9 my alma mata to show when you're this close, within  
10 500 feet of heavy traffic, your lungs aren't  
11 developing right. You can't breathe well; you have  
12 asthma attacks; you have heart attacks; it's  
13 causing cancer.

14 Over 90 percent of our air cancer risk  
15 in Manhattan is driven by mobile transportation  
16 sources; and we can clean it up, and taxis can be  
17 part of the solution. It's not the full solution,  
18 but it's part of the solution.

19 I want to call for the Commission to  
20 adopt the rules. We need better standards. We  
21 can't wait 20 years to get new, improved fuel  
22 efficiency. We've seen the lag on the federal  
23 side.

24 We really need the city to be a leader;  
25 not only for health, but also for climate. Over

00052

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 200,000 tons of CO2 is generated by taxis. We need  
3 a leader. We need a commitment. We can't wait.  
4 We don't want to be Beijing or New Delhi. We need  
5 to go beyond and get black cars and other livery  
6 services, and I dedicate and devote my service to  
7 cleaning up other fleets like diesel trucks, et  
8 cetera.

9 We support these efforts across the  
10 board and we need to change the garden and transit  
11 taxis to be not only beautiful on the outside.  
12 They're great works of art. I go up to Columbus  
13 Circle to see them. They're quite beautiful.

14 I also want that to be a symbol that  
15 they're green taxis, as well; not just beautiful  
16 taxis on the outside, but beautiful on the inside.  
17 So I urge the Commission to adopt the rules.

18 Thank you so much for this opportunity.

19 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you very much.

20 The next speaker is Bob Muldoon of the  
21 Sierra Club.

22 MR. JESSER: I'll speak on behalf of the  
23 Sierra Club. I'm Bart Jesser [sic].

24 Good morning. I'm Chair of the  
25 Transportation Committee for the State Chapter of

00053

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 the Sierra Club, speaking on behalf of the City  
3 Chapter of the Sierra Club.

4 We support the proposed rules for fuel  
5 efficiency for taxicabs. Sierra Club is the oldest  
6 and largest grassroots environmental organization  
7 in the country, with over 750,000 members  
8 nationwide, and over 50,000 members in New York  
9 City.

10 We were an early advocate of hybrid  
11 taxicabs, and for several years we have worked with  
12 other environmental groups across the city to  
13 advocate for clean, efficient taxicabs.

14 We applaud Mayor Bloomberg for showing  
15 leadership and pursuing an aggressive policy to  
16 implement fuel economy standards for the 13,000  
17 yellow taxis. We urgently need this leadership,  
18 especially in New York City, being on the front  
19 line of the climate change issue.

20 We urge the Commission to adopt the  
21 proposed regulations because of the many benefits  
22 they offer, including reducing pollution and  
23 greenhouse gas emissions, saving cabbies and riders  
24 money, and helping to reduce dependence on foreign  
25 oil.

00054

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 We have met the industry and reached  
3 out to thousands of cabbies at the airports and  
4 found that hybrids have received good reception  
5 from many in the industry.

6 We urge the TLC to continue its efforts  
7 to address any remaining concerns cabbies have  
8 about security; and continue their efforts to  
9 educate the taxi industry on hybrid vehicles.

10 We have two concerns to raise with the  
11 Commission. First, we urge the Commission to allow  
12 green labels on taxicabs to return, until at least  
13 50 percent of the fleet is converted to these fuel  
14 efficient vehicles.

15 Highly visible green taxi signage is an  
16 important component of this effort. They tell the  
17 public on a daily basis that the City is converting  
18 the taxi fleet to a clean and more fuel efficient  
19 fleet.

20 In turn, it's an educational tool that  
21 shows the public that standard vehicles can be fuel  
22 efficient. Finally, highly visible green labels  
23 allows the public to participate in this program by  
24 providing clean alternatives in airports and on  
25 street.

00055

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 We urge the TLC staff to begin planning  
3 similar programs for black car fleets. These black  
4 car fleets are equivalent in size and numbers of  
5 miles driven. They should meet similar fuel  
6 efficiency requirements.

7 Otherwise, we are saying that  
8 businesses and other users are given a pass on a  
9 problem we all have to be part in solving. A  
10 similar requirement needs to be considered for car  
11 service cars.

12 Thank you for moving forward with this  
13 program. We applaud the leadership you and the  
14 Mayor are showing with this effort, and we urgently  
15 need to address the problems associated with global  
16 warming.

17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you.

19 The next speaker is Ed Burgess,  
20 Environmental Defense Fund. By the way, green  
21 stickers are happening. They're on the website  
22 already. We had a delay with the contracting  
23 process.

24 MR. JESSER: One thing concerning that.  
25 The stickers, as far as I understand, are small

00056

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 stickers inside the vehicle.

3 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Outside.

4 MR. JESSER: If there was something  
5 prominent, signage on the vehicles, so somebody on  
6 the street can actually see a green taxi at the  
7 airport and maybe selectively pursue those taxis,  
8 to show what you are doing being significant. My  
9 understanding is the signage proposed is not that.

10 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: It's a fair point.  
11 Why don't you check out the website and we will  
12 meet afterwards and go over it.

13 Eddie Burgess?

14 MR. BURGESS: I'm Eddie Burgess. I'm a  
15 research fellow in environmental defense. I'm here  
16 to also express my support for adopting today's  
17 rules being proposed to increase the fuel  
18 efficiency of taxicabs.

19 I want to stress that it is critically  
20 important that we take this step now and we use the  
21 technologies that are available today. The longer  
22 we wait the harder it will be to rectify the  
23 changes that are going on in climate change, and  
24 New York City is vulnerable to things like sea  
25 level rising.



00057

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 The science shows that if we wait just  
3 two years in reducing carbon emissions, we're going  
4 to have to double our efforts to decrease the  
5 emissions. The sooner we get started today the  
6 less cost in the future. That's something to keep  
7 in mind for people while we're waiting for the new  
8 technology.

9 It's going to be a lot easier the  
10 sooner we get started. I encourage the Taxi and  
11 Limousine Commission to continue this process, and  
12 I'm very encouraged to participate with the taxi of  
13 tomorrow. I think it's great.

14 Once again, just waiting to develop new  
15 technology is not enough. You have set standards  
16 now so we can bring those technologies in line to  
17 what we need to achieve in terms of emissions and  
18 reductions.

19 To give a little historical reference,  
20 I was only two years old the last time the federal  
21 government made changes to fuel efficiency  
22 standards. I'm not as old as many people here, but  
23 -- it's really quite atrocious how long it's taken  
24 to improve standards.

25 We need to set the example. New York

00058

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 City has a wonderful role to take. It's very  
3 visible. People come from all over the world,  
4 government leaders; and there's a huge opportunity  
5 for us to serve as the leader, to educate people  
6 who come into the city and see what we are doing  
7 and be able to take those lessons back home.

8 I hope that today's rules get passed  
9 and that we don't ignore this great benefit, not  
10 only -- we can't ignore the safety and we also  
11 can't ignore the health concerns for our children  
12 and for future climate change. Those are important  
13 safety concerns, as well.

14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. The next  
16 speaker is Josh Nachowitz from the League of  
17 Conservation Voters.

18 MR. GIANNOULIS: I want to comment on  
19 one thing. The speaker before this gentleman said  
20 something silly. I'm committed to vote against  
21 green stickers on cars because of his comments.

22 The notion that somebody would  
23 encourage somebody to not take a vehicle that's  
24 already on the street, and some poor driver who  
25 showed up in a fleet and happened to get a

00059

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 non-hybrid vehicle really does go to the point why  
3 some people think some folks in the environmental  
4 movement are not exactly focussed in reality.

5 That's the stupidest thing I ever heard  
6 in my life. It's outrageous that somebody would  
7 propose that as the reason to put -- it makes no  
8 sense. The vehicle is on the street. Not taking  
9 it is not going to take it off the street. It's  
10 just ridiculous and if we do stickers, I'll vote  
11 for a very small one.

12 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Duly noted.

13 (Applause.)

14 I think we already voted on them. The  
15 City Council passed a law.

16 Mr. Nachowitz? Not here?

17 William Decandido, Tadger  
18 International.

19 MR. DECANDIDO: Good morning Mr.  
20 Chairman, members of the Commission. Thank you for  
21 having me today and giving me the opportunity to  
22 speak.

23 I'm Bill Decandido. I' from Tadger  
24 International, and this morning I'll be very brief  
25 to introduce a product that saves fuel and also

00060

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 reduces emissions. It's called the Tadger and it  
3 attaches on to the fuel line.

4 (Indicating.)

5 It saves about 3 to 5 percent in fuel  
6 consumption and saves about 20 percent in  
7 emissions.

8 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Mr. Decandido, do you  
9 have comments specifically about whether we should  
10 pass or not pass the MPG rules? If you are here to  
11 talk about your product it sounds great, but we  
12 have a separate process about that.

13 MR. DECANDIDO: I realize that. I just  
14 found out about the meeting, and since this is a  
15 solution, I thought that everybody involved should  
16 be aware of. I just found out about the pilot  
17 project that we have to go through. We will be  
18 participating.

19 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Does voting for or  
20 against these rules have an impact on your product?

21 MR. DECANDIDO: Not necessarily. I  
22 think it gives the decision makers the option to  
23 phase into things, so that we can satisfy some of  
24 the interests that we have heard from the  
25 environmentalists, and also from the owners and

00061

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 drivers.

3 As this item costs only \$200, there are  
4 no moving parts. It's easy to install. And I'm  
5 not here to tell anybody about rules. Rules are  
6 good, but you need real results. I think that this  
7 is a real result now that can be implemented.

8 Thank you for your time.

9 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Nothing we pass  
10 here, quite frankly, impairs your ability to  
11 partake in that process. We're always looking for  
12 new technology and there's a process to deviate  
13 from our rules to test new things.

14 David Klahr will meet with you and get  
15 your information, in the back.

16 Next, Mike Cecere, Clean Energy.

17 MR. CECERE: I'm Mike Cecere, Clean  
18 Energy.

19 First, thanks to the Commission for  
20 allowing me the opportunity to speak. Clean Energy  
21 is the largest supplier of compressed and liquified  
22 natural gas in the country. We have over 180  
23 stations across the country. In 2008, we're  
24 building another 50 stations.

25 We fuel 1500 taxicabs daily. With that

00062

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 said, Mayor Bloomberg and the TLC's efforts to  
3 realize a green taxi fleet are critical to the  
4 quality of life for everyone that lives, works and  
5 travels in New York City.

6 The Mayor's 2030 sustainability plan  
7 demonstrates the City's tremendous commitment to  
8 both reducing air pollution and greenhouse gas  
9 emissions from the city's stationary and mobile  
10 sources.

11 We support the Mayor and TLC's policy  
12 to allow gasoline hybrid vehicles to reduce the  
13 City's carbon footprint. Natural gas taxis should  
14 also continue to play a major role in reducing the  
15 carbon footprint in New York City.

16 The proposed rules should include  
17 compressed natural gas vehicles, and such vehicles  
18 that are built by a car certified small volume  
19 manufacturer and meets the carb [sic] superlow  
20 emissions certification.

21 In addition to this change, a CMG  
22 vehicle should not be subjected to the proposed  
23 mile per gallon requirements, since natural gas  
24 vehicles use natural gas, the cleanest fuel  
25 currently available for a taxi in New York City.

00063

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 While a gasoline hybrid vehicle carbon  
3 footprint is based on the vehicle's mile per gallon  
4 rating, natural gas vehicles do not use gasoline, a  
5 petroleum based fuel. It is critical for New York  
6 City to continue to support natural gas vehicles  
7 which reduce greenhouse gases 30 percent, compared  
8 to gasoline vehicles, and are comparable to  
9 gasoline hybrid technology.

10 Natural gas costs up to 70 cents per  
11 gallon less than a gallon of gasoline.

12 It is a domestic fuel which reduces New  
13 York City's dependence on foreign oil 100 percent.

14 Natural gas vehicles also provide a  
15 bridge or pathway to the hydrogen highway, which we  
16 all want to get to.

17 Natural gas also provides the  
18 opportunity to look at natural gas hybrids in the  
19 future. Natural gas is a renewable, sustainable  
20 domestic fuel that fits into the City's 2030 plan.

21 The societal benefits of natural gas  
22 includes improved public health, reduce greenhouse  
23 gases, reduce criteria air pollutants and air  
24 toxins, reduce dependency on foreign oil, potential  
25 reduction in fuel costs, improve image, first

00064

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 impression, improve airport community relations and  
3 demonstrates a continued New York City leadership  
4 on global warming, air quality and petroleum  
5 displacement.

6 By adopting the changes, the Mayor and  
7 TLC will demonstrate national leadership in  
8 reducing greenhouse gases, toxins, air pollution  
9 and foreign oil dependency.

10 With the adoption of these changes, the  
11 Mayor's Administration and the City of New York  
12 could potentially reduce a significant amount of  
13 tons of greenhouse gases, smog forming, nitrogen  
14 oxides, toxins, particulate matter, and displace a  
15 meaningful amount of foreign oil consumption.

16 Clearly, with the adoption of these  
17 changes, the Mayor will demonstrate unprecedented  
18 national leadership in global warming and air  
19 pollution and energy independence. All we ask for  
20 is fuel diversity in dealing with this plan,  
21 natural gas.

22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. The next  
24 speaker is Jason Rosenzweig.

25 MR. ROSENZWEIG: Good morning. I'm



00065

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Jason Rosenzweig from Linden Maintenance Corp. A  
3 fleet in Flushing, Queens.

4 We've been operating double shift  
5 taxicabs since 1944, and we currently operate 152  
6 cars. I'm second generation, growing up in the  
7 taxi business, and have been working in the garage  
8 for almost 20 years.

9 I began my career at the age of 9,  
10 changing tires on Saturdays. I remember going to  
11 work with my father at 5:00 in the morning. Now my  
12 children that I take with me at 5:00 in the morning  
13 ask, "Why do you have to go in so early?" I tell  
14 them the same thing my father taught me: "It's the  
15 taxi business."

16 We operate a full service fleet garage,  
17 employ 50 people, from dispatchers to gas men,  
18 mechanics and body shop workers, office personnel  
19 and management; all to provide the best service and  
20 support to our hard working drivers.

21 We are committed to providing them well  
22 maintained and safe vehicles and services to make  
23 their jobs as easy and efficient as possible.

24 We're open 24 hours day, 7 days a week,  
25 365 days a year. We are primarily a double shift

00066

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 operation and have over 400 drivers who work with  
3 us, ranging from new drivers who received their  
4 hack licenses last week, to drivers who have been  
5 with us for over 40 years. It is for these drivers  
6 and for the riding public that they serve, why I'm  
7 here today.

8 I applaud the Mayor's initiatives and  
9 I'm in favor of a cleaner and greener New York. In  
10 addition, I agree that we should be looking for  
11 more fuel efficient vehicles to help us accomplish  
12 this goal. However, we cannot jeopardize the  
13 drivers or the public safety in the process.

14 I currently operate all stretch Crown  
15 Victoria taxicabs, a proven workhorse that has  
16 served this industry for decades, as well as  
17 provided the comfort of a limousine to the riding  
18 public.

19 I must say, after 300,000 miles on New  
20 York City streets, it is one of the safest and  
21 reliable vehicles I have ever operated. No other  
22 vehicle comes close to this car in durability,  
23 safety and comfort. Your own Safety and Emissions  
24 can attest to the structural rigidity and integrity  
25 of the Crown Victoria.

00067

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 That being said, I'm not here to save  
3 the Crown Victoria. I'm here to make sure the  
4 potential replacement to this vehicle is equally  
5 durable and safe. To that end, I have actually  
6 purchased and have been running an Escape hybrid  
7 for the last six months. I decided to test this  
8 vehicle myself to see if it meets the demands of a  
9 double shifted taxicab.

10 At this point in my case, as well as  
11 for all the hybrids in the city today, it's too  
12 early to tell.

13 I'd like to see these vehicles with  
14 200,000 miles on them, two summers, two winters.  
15 Let's see what the batteries look like after a hot  
16 summer. Let's see them after they have a couple of  
17 accidents, which unfortunately happens; and let's  
18 see how they hold up. Let's look at the chassis  
19 and the suspension and let's see what these  
20 vehicles look like.

21 Furthermore, the interior passenger  
22 compartment of the current hybrids is significantly  
23 smaller than the Crown Victoria. Space for the  
24 driver is a cocoon-like space. The passenger  
25 comfort level is reduced dramatically. With the

00068

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 partition in the L-shape that it's currently in,  
3 the passenger compartment as well as the driver  
4 area becomes a death trap in a collision.

5 With all these unanswered questions,  
6 how can we put into service small, unproven  
7 passenger cars that have simply been painted yellow  
8 and retrofitted to be a taxicab?

9 Instead, we need to wait to conduct a  
10 procedure evaluation of these vehicles. Their  
11 durability and safety cannot be fully determined  
12 until they have been through a full, 3-year taxicab  
13 cycle.

14 We all want a cleaner environment, but  
15 we cannot sacrifice passenger and driver safety to  
16 achieve it. We need to be patient, conduct proper  
17 testing, and then decide if these vehicles are  
18 suitable to be taxicabs.

19 Thank you.

20 (Applause.)

21 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: The next speaker is  
22 Michael Levine.

23 MR. LEVINE: I'm Michael Levine,  
24 president of Ronart Leasing Taxi Garage. We  
25 operate 330 cabs in New York City and I've got a

00069

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 couple of companies in Chicago and operate another  
3 2500 cabs out there. I probably move more people  
4 in taxicabs than anybody in the country, right now.

5 We operate 17 different types of  
6 vehicles that I've accounted for between our two  
7 fleets, and we've probably operated 30 or more  
8 different types of vehicles in the past 15 years,  
9 testing vehicles, trying this and that.

10 My whole speech is out the window.  
11 It's not necessary. We're all here for the same  
12 reason. All the environmental people are here  
13 saying breathing is good, not breathing is bad. We  
14 get it.

15 We're also saying traveling, taking  
16 people from one place to another is good; not being  
17 able to take them is bad. You guys know that.  
18 Here we have a room. The drivers understand that  
19 fuel efficiency is good. We understand that fuel  
20 efficiency is good as operators. Everybody here  
21 understands that breathing is good, and you guys  
22 understand it all.

23 This is the first time we're all on the  
24 same page. Let's do it right. We are here, let's  
25 get this thing passed. We know we're going forward

00070

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 in the right direction.

3 Iris, you and I have sat down before  
4 and said it's a good idea. If we did that  
5 five years ago and we tried to put all that stuff  
6 in the back of taxicabs we came up with, it  
7 wouldn't have worked; the technology wasn't there.

8 It may be there now, it may not be  
9 there now. Jason put it best. It's either going  
10 to perform on a specific cab or it's not.

11 So we have manufacturers here, we have  
12 fuel people, we have industry people, we have  
13 everybody. Let's go forward with this and say  
14 okay. We're looking for October and shooting for  
15 25.

16 But you know what? If 23 or 22 is what  
17 we get to by October, that's still pretty good  
18 improvement. So, let's be flexible going forward,  
19 test our vehicles out. The City has testing  
20 equipment they are currently using. They can help  
21 us test. We'll test whatever you want to try.

22 There are vehicles out there now that  
23 get 25 miles per gallon right now and costs  
24 \$14,000. If you don't think I would love to put  
25 them on the road, you are crazy. That's what I'm

00071

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 in the business to do; move people, make money.  
3 \$14,000 is better than \$24,000 any day. The  
4 problem is, the car is small.

5 We'll help you guys. We just ask that  
6 you're flexible along the way and work with us, so  
7 that we don't say, "Okay, 25 is a goal. We didn't  
8 make 25, we'll do 25 anyway, and that's the way it  
9 is going to be." We should all work together and  
10 it will all work.

11 One other thing I need to say is, we've  
12 been testing a lot of vehicles and one thing that  
13 helps is the camera system. If you put a new  
14 vehicle on the road and there's only one, two, ten  
15 of them out there, you don't want to have to  
16 develop a whole new partition system for that  
17 vehicle.

18 Especially the smaller vehicles. You  
19 don't want to try putting people in the back with a  
20 partition in the vehicle they're not used to. If  
21 we could get cameras in some of these vehicles and  
22 change that regulation as well, that would be  
23 helpful.

24 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you, Mr.  
25 Levine.

00072

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 The next speaker is Bill Lindauer.

3 MR. LINDAUER: Thank you. Of course we  
4 are for a Green New York; but I feel that we are  
5 rushing things, and rushing things may be rash.

6 I hate to say that I agree with many of  
7 the fleet owners, but driver safety is top priority  
8 and these vehicles are unproven, safety-wise and  
9 durability-wise.

10 Another thing. We all know Osmond...  
11 the diamond cabbie. Diogenes couldn't find a more  
12 honest man. He tried the hybrid and he is being  
13 charged extra money for driving a hybrid. Of  
14 course the TLC does nothing about this infraction  
15 of the rules. Drivers should not have to pay more  
16 for a hybrid.

17 Also, in the statement of purpose of  
18 rules, you say it will raise the value of the  
19 medallion. I'm not sure how it is supposed to do  
20 that.

21 I think the driver's interest must be  
22 protected; safety; they should not be charged more  
23 for driving a hybrid. They're saving money on  
24 gasoline, so they have to give it back to the  
25 owners?



00073

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 We are paying enough for gas now. The  
3 GPS is stealing money from drivers' pockets. Many  
4 drivers are paying for the GPS, despite the  
5 Chairman's lie that drivers won't have to pay for  
6 it.

7 I'd like to correct the opening  
8 comments, "A deal is a deal." There was no deal  
9 about credit card or the GPS.

10 This came out in September 28th, court.  
11 Richard Berman, there was no deal. The City  
12 Corporation Counsel said there was an agreement  
13 among the commissioners. That's hardly anybody in  
14 the taxi industry and certainly not the drivers.

15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Next speaker is  
17 Jeffrey Chernik.

18 MR. CHERNIK: I don't need to speak.

19 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Next speaker is  
20 Victor Chufalo [sic].

21 MR. CHUFALO: Good morning everyone. My  
22 name is Victor Chufalo. I operate Anne Service  
23 Corporation. We're a New York City yellow cab  
24 fleet consisting of 70 vehicles. We have been at  
25 the same location and operated by the same family

00074

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 since 1923. In 1990 I ran the first CFG Caprice.  
3 It was an after market adaptation that never really  
4 worked properly.

5 In addition, there were only two  
6 fueling sites with limited hours; and when  
7 available, the ambient temperature effect of how  
8 much fuel the tank would take -- Team Systems, a  
9 fellow fleet operator, spend millions installing a  
10 CMG station on his property, only to have the TLC  
11 scrap the program.

12 Some time later, rear seat air  
13 conditioning was mandated, again, with no  
14 authorized vehicle coming off the assembly line  
15 that had this optional feature. The resulting  
16 jerry-rigged contraption was a PVC pipe with holes  
17 punched in it, and the cool air conduit was a  
18 corrugated vacuum cleaner hose attached to a vent  
19 in the dash.

20 Can anybody here every forgot the  
21 talking taxi? What all these failed projects have  
22 in common, is that we as the end users were forced  
23 to pay for an adaptor project or concept that had  
24 no infrastructure in place to support it.

25 I raise these issues not to be critical

00075

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 of the proposal before us, but ask that we not rush  
3 to mandate vehicles that have no proven track  
4 record as viable New York City taxis.

5 Maybe one or all of them can work.

6 Maybe none of them. But mandating their use now is  
7 short sighted. We have an obligation to support  
8 the Mayor's plan. You have an obligation to  
9 activate rules that allow us to operate vehicles  
10 that function as safe, comfortable, economically  
11 viable taxis. Failure here will be more resonant  
12 than not delivering sufficient cool air to the  
13 passenger in the rear seat.

14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you, sir. The  
16 last speaker is David Pollock.

17 MR. POLLOCK: For the record, I'm David  
18 Pollock, Committee for Taxi Safety.

19 You have the committee's rules.

20 Although I did want to speak frankly and go off  
21 track from the written rules, it would be nice if  
22 the Commissioners present in the building would  
23 listen to everybody's comment before they vote on  
24 something.

25 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: We do. It's a long

00076

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 meeting. Everybody, including myself are human. We  
3 have to go to the bathroom, we have things we need  
4 to do. They will be back in.

5 MR. POLLOCK: Is anybody against clean  
6 air? Of course not. Is anybody for global  
7 warming? Of course not. Everybody wants the  
8 utopian condition in our environment and everybody  
9 wants the utopian taxicab.

10 Eliminating the Crown Victoria brings  
11 up a question. Is there enough availability for  
12 the Ford Escape, which basically seems to be the  
13 only car that spent enough time on the road, that  
14 meets the 25 MPG requirements, to see exactly what  
15 makes it tick on city streets. The problem we have  
16 is -- there is really two problems.

17 One, in the event there aren't enough  
18 Ford Escape hybrids available, we will not have the  
19 option of the roomy Sienna or a Crown Victoria.  
20 You will say, "Pick one or the other of the six or  
21 seven cars."

22 Without enough time for those six or  
23 seven cars to be proven street-worthy as a taxi,  
24 the dove drivers, which we represent about 2213  
25 members, 2200 medallion owners and 5,000 drivers.

00077

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Those drivers may be forced to buy a vehicle that  
3 may not hold up as good or better than the existing  
4 vehicles, like the Crown Victoria.

5 Without a pilot project or enough time  
6 to test the vehicles, it doesn't seem logical or  
7 sensible to do away with the other vehicles that  
8 are required.

9 There is an increased cost, as I stated  
10 before; but why would we be forced to buy a vehicle  
11 we don't want? Let's say we decide we want the  
12 Ford Escape hybrid? That's the vehicle we are  
13 going to buy? But you can't get any, so you have  
14 to buy a different one. That's why it's a little  
15 premature.

16 I have too attended the focus groups,  
17 and the Committee for Taxi Safety is one of the  
18 members for the Taxi of Tomorrow, which is going to  
19 be the way we view the London taxi today, it'll be  
20 the New York Taxi. It'll satisfy  
21 environmentalists, it'll satisfy the disabled  
22 community, it'll satisfy the passengers, satisfy  
23 the owners, satisfy the drivers.

24 According to the TLC's scheduling,  
25 October, 2009, that car is supposed to come off the

00078

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 line and be available to purchase.

3 If we can purchase that utopian vehicle  
4 just a year later, why do we have to possibly have  
5 cars shoved down our throats that haven't been  
6 tested before that time?

7 Thank you.

8 (Applause.)

9 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Is there anybody else  
10 who hasn't been heard and wishes to speak?

11 That concludes our public hearing.

12 Peter, if you could join us at the  
13 microphone?

14 CMSR. SHENKMAN: Good morning everyone.

15 I think that what I've heard is really something  
16 the TLC has heard for the past two years. We put  
17 the first round of hybrids on the road two years  
18 and a month ago. We have got three or four of  
19 those vehicles with well over 200,000 miles, and  
20 over 20 of them in excess of 150,000 miles.

21 I don't think there is any question.

22 Yes, these were all Escapes with this kind of  
23 milage. But the one thing that all of the hybrids  
24 on the road share today is technology, and that's  
25 all Toyota's technology.

00079

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 So as far as durability goes, I don't  
3 think anybody will question the durability of a  
4 Toyota. A Ford is using it. Even Nissan is using  
5 it.

6 The other thing I heard a lot about is  
7 safety; safety of the driver, safety of the  
8 passenger. The division I run starts with the word  
9 "safety." It's a huge concern of ours. But I  
10 don't think a vehicle with six airbags on the road  
11 -- yes, it does have a higher rollover than a  
12 sedan, but it's an inherently safer vehicle.

13 The drivers are reporting that they're  
14 more comfortable in almost all of the hybrids, and  
15 our initial data proves that accidents are much  
16 less likely to occur with the hybrids. Granted,  
17 the numbers are skewed by the number of vehicles on  
18 the road.

19 We've heard about availability. I've  
20 spent the past three months on the phone in meeting  
21 with the manufacturers that supply these vehicles.  
22 We're not a great universe in numbers. We're only  
23 about 2800 to 3,000 vehicles a year, industry-wide.

24 As we find out with the Taxi of  
25 Tomorrow, that doesn't get anyone excited; and all

00080

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 manufacturers have indicated a willingness to  
3 supply vehicles and the ability to do so.

4 For example, the Ford Escape, they're  
5 targeted to manufacture 22,000 of those for next  
6 year and they're really only being sold in New  
7 York, New Jersey, California and Vermont. So Ford  
8 Fleet has assured me that there would be enough to  
9 supply the entire industry, should that case occur.

10 It should also be noted that the Crown  
11 Victoria is the last car or last vehicle  
12 manufactured in this country whose gas tank is not  
13 enclosed in the crush zone. It's a 1979 designed  
14 car that is safe in the way for a tank; but we have  
15 had some issues, as anyone who reads newspaper or  
16 owns one knows.

17 They are subject to annual recalls,  
18 and usually they are very serious recalls. There  
19 are two out there on the Crown Victorias. It  
20 should also be noted that Arizona has banned all  
21 purchases of Crown Victorias for the safety of  
22 their police officers.

23 The police have launched a lawsuit, and  
24 so has Corpus Christi, Texas, over the alleged  
25 safety concerns with the Crown Victoria.



00081

1                   NYC TLC - 12/11/07  
2                   CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Any questions?  
3                   CMSR. POLANCO: I became that in San  
4 Francisco, don't they use hybrid vehicles?  
5                   CMSR. SHENKMAN: They started before we  
6 did.  
7                   CMSR. POLANCO: Do you know how they are  
8 doing out there, in terms of reliability et cetera?  
9                   CMSR. SHENKMAN: They have a factory  
10 defect, and about 45000 miles. Twelve of their  
11 water pumps failed. Ford addressed that issue  
12 immediately and it's never been an issue on any of  
13 the four or five hundred Escape hybrids in New York  
14 City. The vehicles -- there's about half a dozen  
15 of them approaching 300,000 miles in San Francisco  
16 with lower maintenance costs.  
17                   CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Any other comments or  
18 questions?  
19                   Thank you, Peter.  
20                   CMSR. SHENKMAN: You are welcome.  
21                   CMSR. POLANCO: Can I ask another  
22 question? What are the vehicles of today that meet  
23 the 25 miles per gallon, as opposed to 30 miles per  
24 gallon?  
25                   CMSR. SHENKMAN: Currently, the Escape

00082

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 will meet both. The Ultima hybrid will meet both.  
3 The Highlander is on the edge. I'm not sure if it  
4 meets the 30. The Camry hybrid, the Prius, they'll  
5 all meet the 25 and the 30.

6 CMSR. POLANCO: For 2008, out of I think  
7 nine hybrids available out there, how many of them  
8 meet the requirement for 2008?

9 CMSR. SHENKMAN: For 2008, all of them.  
10 It's when you get into 30 that it becomes gray.  
11 There are a couple where there's only one of each  
12 vehicle, and those have not been sufficiently  
13 tested. Those are individually owned, lightly  
14 driven vehicles.

15 CMSR. POLANCO: For the 2009  
16 requirement, in terms of the nine hybrid vehicles,  
17 how many will meet --

18 CMSR. SHENKMAN: As of today, you'd have  
19 the Escape, the Camry, the Ultima and the Prius  
20 and possibly the Highlander; fewer or five.

21 CMSR. POLANCO: Three or four of the  
22 nine?

23 CMSR. SHENKMAN: Definitely four.

24 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Any other questions?  
25 Commissioner Dear?

00083

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 CMSR. KAY: No more questions.

3 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you, Peter.

4 CMSR. KAY: This is an interesting  
5 meeting. This is an interesting topic. Give me a  
6 minute to say something about myself.

7 I think that over the last ten years  
8 that I've been working with a lot of you out here,  
9 that I've been nothing but fair; and when we make  
10 our decisions, we try to look at real issues. If  
11 you want to debate real issues, we should debate  
12 real issues.

13 I've always felt and I continue to feel  
14 that, whether we debated here in this public forum  
15 or in my office, with anything I do. I bring this  
16 up now because I think some people will appreciate  
17 what I'm about to say, and some people will be  
18 upset about what I'm about to say.

19 The first thing is, I listen really  
20 hard to all of you, not just today, but in the  
21 past. I think there are some very good valid  
22 points. One thing I want to point out is, I don't  
23 think that the Mayor and what we are proposing now  
24 is to pick on yellow cabs.

25 I think the Mayor has laid out an

00084

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 agenda to address climate change and greenhouse  
3 gases, not just in the yellow taxi world and not  
4 just in liveries and black cars which we should  
5 look to improve, and I look forward to that -- but  
6 throughout, whether it be buildings, regular  
7 traffic congestion other issues. I look forwards  
8 to working with that.

9 The second point that I think I've  
10 heard, which I have staked my reputation on, is the  
11 Taxi of Tomorrow.

12 One of the things that we said we  
13 wanted to do, especially moving to the world of  
14 cleaner vehicles, accessible vehicles, comfortable  
15 vehicles, safety vehicles, was to work together to  
16 come up with what the next taxi vehicle would be.

17 That is why I worked very hard with all  
18 of you here and out there to put together that  
19 advisory board to help TLC move that process  
20 forward.

21 That process, hopefully, everyone comes  
22 together and finds that right car that's right for  
23 everyone. The process is underway. I look forward  
24 to continuing to work with you. That's why Matt,  
25 at the beginning of this process, mentioned that in

00085

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 May of 2009, or June of 2009, that he's asked for a  
3 status update; so before the 30 miles per gallon  
4 kicks in, we look if there's new alternative fuels  
5 or if there's a new car around the corner that we  
6 all agree we're going to do, we'll address it then.

7 We're also listening to some of the  
8 fleet owners here. I think there's a real reason  
9 too that we should always double and triple check  
10 things.

11 All the information that we've been  
12 provided by the TLC, by outside resources, shows  
13 that we are doing the right and responsible thing;  
14 which is why I want to urge the rules to go  
15 forward.

16 That being said, I want to mandate and  
17 make sure I read it into the record, that in May of  
18 2008, just as we're going to do in June of 2009,  
19 that TLC, beginning in May of 2008, if we need to,  
20 come and brief the commission if there are any  
21 other issues. If all of a sudden new safety  
22 information drops out of the sky about problems  
23 with the vehicles, we should know about it. If  
24 there's anything else going on, that we should know  
25 about that.

00086

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 I would ask and put into the record  
3 that in May of 2008, that we revisit these  
4 conversations to make sure that nothing has  
5 changed.

6 With that said, I don't believe  
7 anything was provided, factual data today, to show  
8 we should not move forward.

9 I'm also very happy and I'm pleased to  
10 hear support for the Mayor's Plan NYC; partially  
11 because I support it, and also because I wrote some  
12 of it, with some other people here in the audience.

13 I was also happy to hear that we had  
14 the opportunity to hear the Mayor's announcement  
15 just four weeks later which accelerated these  
16 things.

17 But to say that the Mayor's  
18 announcement, and to say these proposed rules  
19 jeopardize passenger safety is not only insulting,  
20 it's irresponsible. This Commission approved these  
21 cars to be on the road, approved them to be on the  
22 road now because they are safe, because they are  
23 clean and they have comfort levels, and they work.

24 Is it true they've been around for  
25 decades like the Crown Victoria? No.

00087

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 We're not asking this Commission to  
3 approve a new car and put something on the road  
4 that should not be on the road. We have done that  
5 already.

6 The fact of the matter is -- and no one  
7 has mentioned this -- Ford has announced, as far as  
8 I know, the Crown Victoria, they are no longer  
9 going to make within the next two years. This car  
10 is dead. It gets 12 miles per gallon and is based  
11 on a model from 1979.

12 I want to work with everyone here to  
13 get that next car. I really, really do. I urge  
14 you guys today and everyone here, this is the  
15 responsible thing to do. We're not jeopardizing  
16 anyone's safety. We're not telling anyone to put a  
17 car on the road that we've not already approved.

18 We're looking to take one car off the  
19 road. So be it. It's the icon car as of now and  
20 the majority this week. We're asking to take it  
21 off the road one year early. I commit that we  
22 should all work together with everyone, whether  
23 environmental groups, drivers, passengers, owners,  
24 fleets, to get that next car.

25 I'm not suggesting we have 15, 16 types

00088

1                                   NYC TLC - 12/11/07  
2 of hybrids here or there. We should get to one  
3 car. This is an important and responsible step  
4 that we need to do now. I look forward to this  
5 vote and moving this thing forward, and continuing  
6 to work with you with guys, and everyone here in  
7 good faith to talk about the real issues that  
8 concern you, the real issues that make the industry  
9 work and to move forward and get that next car.

10                               So I urge the Commission members to  
11 vote for these rules. I also request and ask that  
12 the TLC provide us updates in May of 2008, to make  
13 sure, Number 1, that dealers can provide those  
14 vehicles.

15                               I've been assured by TLC -- I think  
16 Peter just mentioned that we can do that -- but  
17 let's double check. I want to make sure there are  
18 no new alternative vehicles that should be added to  
19 these rules. I don't think for now we should, but  
20 let's double check.

21                               CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Done.

22                               CMSR. KAY: I want to make sure there's  
23 no new safety information that comes out. At this  
24 point I haven't seen anything, no data that shows  
25 that these vehicles are unsafe. If they are



00089

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 unsafe, forget these rules. If there are vehicles  
3 on the road that are unsafe, we should have taken  
4 them off the road six months or a year ago and  
5 never have put them on the road at all.

6 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you,  
7 commissioner Kay. Very well put. Let the record  
8 reflect I think it's a great idea to do the  
9 additional review in May, 2008 on the dealership  
10 issues and the availability of the cars.

11 To clarify, the June 2009 review will  
12 be more encompassing. It will look at safety  
13 issues, it will look at performance, it will look  
14 at durability and how beneficial it is to the  
15 environment, as well.

16 CMSR. DEAR: I'm just as compassionate  
17 as you are, Jeff. I've been six years on the  
18 Commission and ten years in the City Council. I  
19 have watched all kinds of arguments come forward:  
20 Safety, compatibility, all kinds of things that  
21 they wanted to change.

22 "This must happen, if it doesn't happen  
23 now, we have to vote on it now, it's going to be  
24 the worst thing to ever happen to the industry."

25 I've watched things like the talking

00090

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 taxi. I've watched all kinds of things. I saw on  
3 steps of City Hall, a change, because there was the  
4 Chevy Malibu, a drop shorter than the Crown  
5 Victoria. We brought the car to City Hall.

6 Then the previous Mayor came down the  
7 steps, looked at the car and said, "No good. I  
8 want the Crown Victoria."

9 We brought the Crown Victoria. That  
10 was indoctrinated because we got to give safety, we  
11 have to give comfort to the drivers.

12 I understand now there's a memo  
13 circulating in major companies saying, "Now that we  
14 have taxi with the new technology with credit  
15 cards, we're no longer going to reimburse you for  
16 your car in cash, petty cash, go that way."

17 The only reason why, is that only three  
18 people can get into the back seat with their  
19 laptops and everything else now. They're going to  
20 the airport and want to put something in the trunk.  
21 Now, they're going to take three different taxis.  
22 That's never going to happen.

23 We have to understand something. This  
24 is an industry -- and also, like I told you in  
25 private, as well, and many commissioners know this

00091

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 -- this is an industry, and that's why you hear the  
3 yellow is -- they always get picked on. They're an  
4 easy target, whatever you want.

5 They only represent a small piece of  
6 the entire jurisdiction of the TLC; the liveries,  
7 the junk livery cars that are out there, the  
8 illegals that out there that look like they came  
9 from Baghdad, that's how bad these cars are.

10 We did nothing about them, and this  
11 goes on and on and on. The compassion that I have  
12 is for people, hard working people -- the problem  
13 is, also, we look at this industry, the yellow  
14 industry, and we look at it and it's only the big  
15 fleets.

16 That's only representing 3,000 or 4,000  
17 of the industry. The others are hard working.  
18 They're all hard working. Either they're drivers  
19 or hard working owners of this fleet. They go out  
20 and buy, you saw at the last auctions, these  
21 individuals are paying all kinds of money, hocking  
22 everything. It's not rich people buying it.  
23 They're doing everything they can to buy these  
24 cars.

25 What I'm asking you -- and I guess this

00092

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 is my last speech for the TLC -- is that, have  
3 compassion, before we jump, ram down the throats,  
4 with all kinds of suggestions and things because  
5 it's whatever reasons there are for why we are  
6 doing it -- let's listen to them. They are  
7 reasonable people. They come back with  
8 suggestions.

9 I know the technology, when we first  
10 proposed it, they weren't for it. They are  
11 absolutely. Everybody is happy with it. You'll  
12 always find a group of people not liking  
13 everything.

14 Overall, there are people, it's  
15 important to be inclusive. I learned in my years  
16 as a legislator to be inclusive, and talk to  
17 people. Reasonable people can learn to agree, and  
18 if we have to disagree, we go to court.

19 I appreciate that we came up with some  
20 sort of compromise. I'm not going to be here to be  
21 able to enforce it. I'm sure you'll carry it on.  
22 Understanding is not only that we are talking about  
23 a new mandate to review; but also what's the past,  
24 to see what's the future.

25 I understand from speaking to people in

00093

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 the industry and what's interesting -- the day the  
3 Mayor announced a few months ago, this new  
4 environmental thing in City Hall, May or June -- I  
5 pulled him on the side and said to him, "Everybody  
6 is talking about a new car but nobody is doing it.  
7 Mr. Mayor besides being the mayor of the City of  
8 New York, you have the power, because you've been  
9 in business -- call the CEO of GM, call the CEO of  
10 Ford and have a conversation."

11 It's not only that. The fleets, a few  
12 cars are not making a difference to them in their  
13 business. It's the whole mindset. Why aren't we  
14 talking about a better mileage for cars? Why  
15 aren't we talking about alternative fuels? People  
16 are talking about these things. That sounds  
17 interesting. You know what? That's what we should  
18 be pushing for.

19 I went to a car dealer in my old  
20 district I used to represent. Every block had at  
21 least three SUVs and minivans and everything else.  
22 Can you imagine, all these cars turn to green  
23 instead of having the old gas guzzlers and  
24 everything else?

25 This is what we should be encouraging,

00094

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 not only picking on the yellow people. Let's look  
3 at it as a global thing for entire city. I know we  
4 can push forward, because Ford is talking about  
5 coming out with another car to replace -- something  
6 they're doing in Europe, whatever they're calling  
7 it.

8 If, in May, Ford is really serious  
9 about it, I can assure you that then that could be  
10 the future car that we could support.

11 Not only that, because I understand  
12 now, because I've been bugging a company in Chicago  
13 that's supposedly coming out with a new car, an  
14 announcement. I guarantee you, as soon as they  
15 have made that announcement, every major car  
16 dealer, every major car owner and manufacturer is  
17 going to see that this is serious.

18 Please, on the backs of the people hard  
19 working people, let's not do things that hurt them.  
20 We want to work together. We always talk about  
21 comfort, safety.

22 Even a small guy like me getting into a  
23 small cars is not going to be pleasant. We're  
24 going to get a lot of complaints over the next few  
25 months. Have an open eye, seriously take a look at

00095

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 it, if there is anybody else coming out with a  
3 vehicle, let's jump at it. If we have to wait  
4 six months for that, let's wait so we have a real  
5 good transition.

6 Thanks for listening and thanks also  
7 for the consideration.

8 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Thank you. Any  
9 comments?

10 CMSR. VARGAS: I certainly do applaud  
11 the Mayor's efforts in changing a lot of  
12 environmental things in this city, from clean air,  
13 from smoking in bars, a lot of things. I live in  
14 this city, I'm raising children in this city and  
15 I'm very proud of a lot of the things the Mayor is  
16 doing.

17 Although I have some reservations about  
18 this rule, this proposed rule, and I think we might  
19 be exceeding our authority as it relates to Local  
20 Law 53, that says we're supposed to develop a  
21 significant increase in the number of clean air and  
22 accessible vehicles in the city.

23 Although I think we're going above that  
24 authority from the Council, I certainly agree we  
25 have to do something. Although I think 25 miles

00096

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 per gallon by next year is a little onerous on many  
3 of the individuals who own the vehicles, that have  
4 to now go and buy new ones. We heard folks from  
5 the industry indicate that they certainly want to  
6 do something.

7 October of next year is a little fast.  
8 One of the things I would like to see is deferring  
9 this a little bit, or, maybe lowering it to the  
10 first and not from 25 to 20.

11 If that's not feasible, one of the  
12 other issues I have is what happens come next year,  
13 the retirement cycle, when vehicles are either not  
14 there or can't be put on the road? Individuals are  
15 going to have to come to us as a Commission to  
16 petition that they cannot put the vehicles on the  
17 road. Is that something internal staff gets to  
18 decide?

19 Unlike individuals to come back to us  
20 and discuss, what have you done, and if the  
21 authority is there, we give the extension of a  
22 certain amount of time.

23 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: That's a fair point  
24 and we have the authority to do that and have in  
25 the past. We have review sessions scheduled for



00097

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 that very purpose. Of course the Commission at any  
3 time could make reasonable choices and vote on  
4 things.

5 CMSR. DEAR: What's important to hear  
6 was not the same people coming back from the  
7 industry -- you saw the industry people, Jason,  
8 others who really care and really work hard.

9 I'm urging you as commissioners, each  
10 and every one. I did it with Deputy Commissioner  
11 Sorkin.

12 I did my thing in the City Council. I  
13 do it here, also. I visit garages, wherever, talk  
14 to cab drivers and talk to them. I want to urge my  
15 colleagues to take advantage, on your own, to go  
16 the fleets. You'd be surprised what goes on.

17 I went to one place where he employees  
18 the same drivers for 20 years. Unbelievable. They  
19 love working for him and work hard. I urge you to  
20 go out to really see how people working hard and  
21 really try to make a difference and want to make a  
22 difference for the City of New York.

23 Thank you.

24 CMSR. VARGAS: A mandated May hearing,  
25 seven months from now --

00098

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 CMSR. GIANNOULIS: A staff presentation  
3 and discussion. Are you proposing a public  
4 hearing? How long will the first significant prior  
5 round of hybrid vehicles been on the road by that  
6 day? The ones we already did. How long?

7 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: Some had 100,00, or  
8 200,000 miles on them.

9 CMSR. GIANNOULIS: If we are looking at  
10 seven months from now, a hearing to get an update,  
11 what real difference in our own cars on the road  
12 will that make?

13 THE SPEAKER: The cars on the road are  
14 older cars. Right now there's 41 2006 Ford  
15 Escapes on the road. Those we'll keep the biggest  
16 eye on. Of those vehicles, about 20 of them have  
17 100,000 miles and 14 of those have 150,000 miles; 2  
18 of them have over 200,000 miles.

19 In another six months, that all goes up  
20 by -- depending on the vehicle -- between 20 and  
21 40,000 miles. We see numbers in the 150 and  
22 250,000 range for a significant portion of those  
23 vehicles.

24 For the 2007, there are 183 of those  
25 vehicles. We'll probably see that 150 will have

00099

1                           NYC TLC - 12/11/07  
2    over 150,000 and some over 200,000 miles by May.  
3                           CMSR. GIANNOULIS:  The ones --  
4                           THE SPEAKER:  On the road since 7/06.  
5                           CHAIRPERSON DAUS:  Any other questions  
6    or comments or concerns?  
7                           CMSR. WEINSHALL:  For the Escapes on the  
8    road, are they privately owned or owned by the  
9    fleets?  
10                          THE SPEAKER:  Peter knows better.  Some  
11    were set to be owned from the auction in April.  
12                          CMSR. WEINSHALL:  Andy, how many  
13    Escapes are on the road?  
14                          ANDY:  There 41 from 2006, 183 from  
15    2007, and 175 from 2008.  
16                          CMSR. WEINSHALL:  What's that total?  
17                          ANDY:  It's got to be just over 400.  
18                          CMSR. WEINSHALL:  What percentage are  
19    owned by individuals and what percentage by fleets?  
20                          ANDY:  I don't know exactly, but we  
21    could find out.  
22                          CMSR. SHENKMAN:  Over 200 of those are  
23    fleet owned.  
24                          CHAIRPERSON DAUS:  Actually, to clarify  
25    for the record:  We have some clarity on the public

00100

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 hearing issue.

3 I think we're the most transparent  
4 we've ever been; the Administration, as well. I  
5 think we will have a staff presentation and public  
6 hearing on the calendar for May of 2008; and the  
7 same for June 2009, a presentation.

8 CMSR. POLANCO: I was reviewing the 2005  
9 presentation of hybrid vehicles, and there were  
10 some incentives provided to owners. I don't know  
11 if there's something in the City Council and maybe  
12 some incentives for putting it out in 2008, having  
13 them purchase a vehicle by 2008.

14 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: There is an incentive  
15 in place, a retirement extension. Council Member  
16 Yassky brought that up earlier. He had raised an  
17 interesting proposed tweaking to that rule, which  
18 we voted on here. The Council passed it and we'll  
19 take a look at that.

20 In my view, the best incentive is the  
21 money you'll save drivers. It's not just the green  
22 initiative for the environment. Green means money  
23 in the pocket for the drivers.

24 If you look at the data that we've  
25 supplied you, you can see that all of the vehicles

00101

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 for the most part save drivers anywhere between 6,  
3 7 -- with respect to the Prius, close to \$10,000 in  
4 gas each year.

5 Over the life of the vehicle, that's  
6 tens of thousands of dollars. Everything ends up  
7 paying for itself. This is money in the driver's  
8 pocket. I know some of the commissioners have  
9 raised concerns.

10 I think what's being proposed with the  
11 review processes and the public hearings and the  
12 fact that this commission hasn't hesitated to look  
13 at issues, to make sure we're on the right track  
14 over the past several years. I think those  
15 concerns, in my opinion, are being addressed.

16 I think some of the concerns in the  
17 public testimony fly into the fact of the actual  
18 data we have from Commissioner Shenkman.

19 I'm very pleased with the hybrids,  
20 personally. If you remember, when we started  
21 talking about hybrids, I said we need to make sure  
22 and are careful there's more leg room. Some people  
23 beat me up for it. Other people beat me up for it.

24 But I saw the green light and, quite  
25 frankly, I think when you look at the big picture

00102

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 and at the data, it is 85 percent pass rate on the  
3 first inspection. That's unheard of on the  
4 Commission.

5 The performance of the Crown Victoria  
6 on the first inspections is way below that, and the  
7 average passenger rate for inspections has been in  
8 the 50 to 60 percent for years.

9 I personally have seen enough data to  
10 vote for this; not just because the Mayor thinks  
11 it's a great idea, but because it's the right thing  
12 to do.

13 I listen to my colleagues and I think  
14 it's reasonable for the industry. I think we've  
15 always been reasonable. It's a staggered approach  
16 to implementing these rules. It's not something  
17 you will have to take off the road immediately. We  
18 were very careful to do that. I think it's  
19 reasonable.

20 I make a motion to adopt these rules as  
21 they are.

22 CMSR. AROUT: I look forward to working  
23 with every one of you. I second that motion.

24 CMSR. GIANNOULIS: Is there an amendment  
25 on the floor?

00103

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: We have a second.

3 All in favor.

4 CMSR. VARGAS: Mr. Chairman, I'm going  
5 to explain I'm also going to be voting for this,  
6 and there will be a May public hearing dealing with  
7 this issue, and certainly we'll hear more from the  
8 industry as it relates to availability and safety  
9 factors, and if at that time we need to adjust the  
10 schedule, we'll adjust it accordingly.

11 CMSR. DEAR: I hope you take the lead  
12 while I'm gone.

13 CMSR. GIANNOULIS: We will miss you,  
14 Noach.

15 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: One more  
16 commissioner.

17 CMSR. VARGAS: I'm thoroughly impressed  
18 with the level of detail that led to this vote and  
19 I had conversations with Matt in particular, and  
20 the responsiveness on issues was met extremely  
21 quickly; and the level of the detail. I'd like to  
22 reiterate this was a very impressive, well thought  
23 out initiative.

24 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: All thanks to the  
25 staff on that. They did a tremendous job.

00104

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 Some closing comments, because this has  
3 been a very well attended spirited debate that we  
4 have had at this meeting, and this is the  
5 culmination of a very significant proposal.

6 When you talk about the environment and  
7 carbon footprints and some of the terminology is in  
8 that vein; I have never in my eleven years working  
9 for this agency been prouder than I am today to be  
10 a member of this Commission.

11 I feel that what we accomplished today  
12 is the most significant thing that we've ever done.  
13 It's not only a big for the TLC; I think it's a  
14 giant thing for the environment. Not only are  
15 drivers going to save money, but I think it's the  
16 most progressive policy we have ever done.

17 This has international repercussions.  
18 Right now the Mayor is in China, Indonesia. He's  
19 going all over the world. All of the cities --  
20 someone mentioned San Francisco -- look to us for  
21 guidance and advice. As a result of this action,  
22 we are going to be the world leader in hybrids and  
23 green.

24 Can you imagine if every city around  
25 the world did what we did today? Global warming



00105

1 NYC TLC - 12/11/07

2 would come to an end.

3 Quite frankly, let's all have a happy  
4 holiday. Let's all realize that this is a process  
5 that's ongoing and fluid, and I thank you all.

6 Motion to adjourn?

7 CMSR. GIANNOULIS: Second.

8 CHAIRPERSON DAUS: All in favor?

9 (A chorus of "ayes.")

10 (Time noted: 11:40 a.m.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Jeffrey Shapiro, a  
Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public, within and  
for the State of New York, do hereby certify that I  
reported the proceedings in the within-entitled  
matter, on Tuesday, December 11, 2007, at the  
offices of the NYC TAXI AND LIMOUSINE COMMISSION,  
40 Rector Street, New York, New York, and that this  
is an accurate transcription of these proceedings.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have  
hereunto set my hand this \_\_\_\_ day of  
\_\_\_\_\_, 2007.

JEFFREY SHAPIRO

