



ELSEVIER

Contents lists available at SciVerse ScienceDirect

## Preventive Medicine

journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/ypmed](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/ypmed)

Q2 1 Comparison of health outcomes among affiliated and lay disaster volunteers enrolled  
2 in the World Trade Center Health Registry

Q1 3 Indira Debchoudhury<sup>a,\*</sup>, Alice E. Welch<sup>a</sup>, Monique A. Fairclough<sup>a</sup>, James E. Cone<sup>a</sup>, Robert M. Brackbill<sup>a</sup>,  
4 Steven D. Stellman<sup>a,b</sup>, Mark R. Farfel<sup>a</sup>

5 <sup>a</sup> New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, World Trade Center Health Registry, 2 Gotham Center, 42–09 28th Street, 7th Floor, Queens, NY 11101, USA

6 <sup>b</sup> Department of Epidemiology, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University, New York, NY, USA

## ARTICLE INFO

8 Available online xxxx

## Keywords:

9 Volunteers  
10 Affiliated Volunteers  
11 Lay Volunteers  
12 Rescue and Recovery  
13 September 11th  
14 Disaster  
15 Mental Health  
16 Physical Health  
17 World Trade Center

## ABSTRACT

18 *Background:* Volunteers (non-professional rescue/recovery workers) are universally present at man-made 25  
19 and natural disasters and share experiences and exposures with victims. Little is known of their disaster- 26  
20 related health outcomes. 27

21 *Methods:* We studied 4974 adult volunteers who completed the World Trade Center Health Registry 2006– 28  
22 2007 survey to examine associations between volunteer type (affiliated vs. lay) and probable posttraumatic 29  
23 stress disorder (PTSD); new or worsening respiratory symptoms; post-9/11 first diagnosis of anxiety disorder, 30  
24 depression, and/or PTSD; and asthma or reactive airway dysfunction syndrome (RADS). Affiliated volun- 31  
25 teers reported membership in a recognized organization. Lay volunteers reported no organizational 32  
26 affiliation and occupations unrelated to rescue/recovery work. Adjusted odds ratios (OR<sub>adj</sub>) were calculated 33  
27 using multinomial regression. 34

28 *Results:* Lay volunteers were more likely than affiliated volunteers to have been present in lower Manhattan, 35  
29 experience the dust cloud, horrific events and injury on 9/11 and subsequently to report unmet healthcare 36  
30 needs. They had greater odds of early post-9/11 mental health diagnosis (OR<sub>adj</sub> 1.6; 95% CI: 1.4–2.0) and asth- 37  
31 ma/RADS (1.8; 1.2–2.7), chronic PTSD (2.2; 1.7–2.8), late-onset PTSD (1.9; 1.5–2.5), and new or worsening 38  
32 lower respiratory symptoms (2.0; 1.8–2.4). 39

33 *Conclusions:* Lay volunteers' poorer health outcomes reflect earlier, more intense exposure to and lack of pro- 40  
34 tection from physical and psychological hazards. There is a need to limit volunteers' exposures during and 41  
35 after disasters, as well as to provide timely screening and health care post-disaster. 42

43 © 2011 Published by Elsevier Inc. 43

## Introduction

44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49 Volunteers are a universal feature of man-made and natural disasters serving as one of the main sources of outside support in post-  
50 disaster recovery work (Thormar, et al., 2010). In the last decade, vol-  
51 unteers have played a key role in recovery and relief efforts after the  
52 oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico (2010), the Haitian earthquake (2010),  
53 Hurricane Katrina (2005), the London transit bombings (2005), and  
54 the Indian Ocean earthquake and tsunami (2004). Volunteer partici-  
55 pation is often necessary and unavoidable due to the magnitude and  
56 impact of such events (Thormar, et al., 2010).  
57

58 On September 11, 2001, two airplanes crashed into the Twin  
59 Towers of the World Trade Center (WTC), causing their collapse  
60 and extensive damage to numerous other buildings. Approximately  
61 2800 people lost their lives (Farfel, et al., 2008). Subsequent recov-  
62 ery and relief efforts included paid and volunteer professional res-  
63 cue/recovery workers (RRW) (fire, police or other emergency  
64 personnel), volunteers affiliated with relief organizations and  
65 lay volunteers (i.e., not affiliated with a recognized response organi-  
66 zation) (American Red Cross, 2002, Steffen and Fothergill, 2009,  
67 Tierney, et al., 2001). The WTC disaster exposed an estimated  
68 409,000 individuals to potentially hazardous chemicals, environ-  
69 mental toxins and psychological stressors that are risk factors for  
70 asthma and PTSD (Landrigan, et al., 2004, Murphy, et al., 2007). A  
71 recent review found that all WTC disaster workers including volun-  
72 teers faced an increased risk of mental health sequelae as a conse-  
73 quence of their intense disaster exposures (Bills, et al., 2008).  
74 Findings from the 2003–04 WTC Health Registry (Registry) survey  
75 demonstrate that RRW in occupations less prepared for the type of  
76 work performed at WTC sites were more likely to develop PTSD  
77 (Perrin, et al., 2007).

\* Corresponding author at: New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, World Trade Center Health Registry, 2 Gotham Center, 42–09 28th Street, 7th Floor, Queens, NY 11101, USA. Tel.: +1 347 396 2857; fax: +1 212 788 4127.

E-mail addresses: [idebchou@health.nyc.gov](mailto:idebchou@health.nyc.gov) (I. Debchoudhury),  
[awelch1@health.nyc.gov](mailto:awelch1@health.nyc.gov) (A.E. Welch), [mfairclo@health.nyc.gov](mailto:mfairclo@health.nyc.gov) (M.A. Fairclough),  
[jccone@health.nyc.gov](mailto:jccone@health.nyc.gov) (J.E. Cone), [rbrackbi@health.nyc.gov](mailto:rbrackbi@health.nyc.gov) (R.M. Brackbill),  
[sstellma@health.nyc.gov](mailto:sstellma@health.nyc.gov) (S.D. Stellman), [mfarfel@health.nyc.gov](mailto:mfarfel@health.nyc.gov) (M.R. Farfel).

To build upon previous Registry findings by expanding the range of post-disaster outcomes, Registry data were used to compare mental and physical health outcomes and health care utilization among affiliated and lay volunteers. We hypothesized lay volunteers would be more likely than affiliated volunteers to experience long-term adverse mental and physical health outcomes due to earlier arrival at WTC sites and more intense exposure to a multitude of hazards, as well as a lack of training, prior disaster experience, or insufficient post-disaster support. We also predicted they would be more likely to report unmet health care needs and less utilization of post-9/11 monitoring and treatment programs.

## Methods

The Registry, created in 2002 by the NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (NYCDOHMH) in collaboration with the Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry, prospectively follows 71,437 individuals highly exposed to the WTC disaster and belonging to one or more eligibility groups: RRW and volunteers, lower Manhattan residents, area workers, passers-by, and school children and staff. The protocol was approved by the institutional review boards of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and NYCDOHMH.

List-identified enrollees were recruited from lists of potentially eligible individuals from governmental agencies, organizations, and employers. Self-identified enrollees contacted the Registry via phone or pre-registered on a website. The 2003–04 Wave 1 survey (W1) included 68,802 adults (Farfel, et al., 2008). The 2006–07 Wave 2 (W2) survey updated the health status of 46,322 of the original adult enrollees (68% response rate) (Brackbill, et al., 2009). Registry methods are described in detail elsewhere (Brackbill, et al., 2009, Farfel, et al., 2008, Perrin, et al., 2007).

The present analysis focuses on 4974 enrollees who completed W1 and W2 surveys, were aged 18 years or older on 9/11, and reported volunteering in rescue/recovery activities between 09/11/01 and 06/30/02. Enrollees identifying as professional RRW, whether paid or unpaid for their services, were not considered volunteers for this analysis. Volunteer status was categorized as affiliated or lay based on the W1 question, “What organization did you work for at the WTC site?” Affiliated volunteers reported membership in recognized organizations (e.g., American Red Cross). Lay volunteers reported no organizational affiliation and occupations unrelated to rescue and recovery work. Lay volunteers included members of church groups or community organizations and individuals present in the area immediately following the attack. The W2 response rates for affiliated and lay volunteers were 67.7% and 67.8% respectively. From 9/11/01 to 9/14/01 lower Manhattan south of 14th street was considered a restricted zone, open only to credentialed emergency management and rescue personnel (Lorber, et al., 2007). Lay volunteers may have subsequently joined a professional organization to continue volunteering. After October 2001, only Ground Zero was restricted (Lorber, et al., 2007). School staff who worked as volunteers were excluded due to small numbers.

We included as categorical variables: recruitment source (list- vs. self-identified), gender, eligibility category (worker-only vs. multiple eligibility groups), age group, race/ethnicity, education, 2002 household income, employment status, New York City residency, and state of residence on 9/11.

We assessed exposures and experiences previously shown to be associated with increased risk of adverse mental and physical health outcomes. Presence on 9/11 was defined as meeting at least one of the following criteria: being south of Chambers Street between the first plane's impact and noon, being caught in the dust cloud, witnessing horrific events, sustaining an injury, or beginning work on the pile (the construction/restricted zone composed of rubble and remains from the collapse) on 9/11. Dust cloud exposure was classified as intense, some, or none (Brackbill, et al., 2009). Witnessing horrific

events was assessed as having seen at least one of the following: an airplane hitting the WTC, people falling or jumping from the Towers, buildings collapsing, people running from a cloud or smoke, and people injured or killed. Injuries sustained on 9/11 included burns, cuts/abrasions/puncture wounds, sprain/strain, fractured/dislocated bones and head injury. Bereavement was defined as knowing anyone who lost his/her life on 9/11. Timing of volunteer work was classified by the first date enrollees worked at any WTC site and time spent at all sites combined. Because 9/11-related experiences were highly correlated with volunteer status, they were not controlled for in the data analyses.

A self-reported professional post-9/11 mental health diagnosis of depression, posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD), and/or anxiety disorder for the first time after 9/11/01 was classified as early if diagnosed prior to 12/31/03 and late if diagnosed between 01/01/04 and 12/31/07. Date of diagnosis reflects time of presentation for care, not disease onset. Probable PTSD was defined as a score of 44 or greater on the stressor-specific PTSD Checklist-Civilian Version and categorized into four groups: chronic (W1+ (present at W1), W2+ (present at W2)), late onset (W1– (absent at W1), W2+), resolved (W1+, W2– (absent at W2)) or no PTSD (W1–, W2–) (American Psychiatric Association, 1994, Blanchard, et al., 1996, Dobie, et al., 2002, Koenen, et al., 2003, Perrin, et al., 2007, Ruggiero, et al., 2003).

New or worsening lower respiratory symptoms (LRS) since 9/11 were defined as having at least one of these symptoms at W1: wheezing, shortness of breath and/or persistent cough. Early post-9/11 asthma was defined as asthma or reactive airway dysfunction syndrome (RADS) diagnosed between 9/11/01 and 12/31/03 and late if diagnosed between 01/01/04 and 12/31/07.

Enrollees were asked at W2 if they had any unmet health care needs. Those answering affirmatively were asked if they were unable to get care for a problem related to 9/11. All were asked whether they had received any services from a list of established post-disaster medical monitoring and treatment programs.

Analyses were conducted using SAS Version 9.1 (SAS, 2005). Bivariate analyses tested differences between affiliated and lay volunteers using chi-square. Multinomial logistic analyses were performed for four outcomes: post-9/11 mental health diagnosis (early, late vs. no post-9/11), probable PTSD (chronic, late onset, resolved vs. no PTSD), new or worsening respiratory symptoms since 9/11, and post-9/11 asthma/RADS (early, late vs. none). Volunteer status (with affiliated volunteers as the reference group) was the primary predictor variable for all models. Crude and adjusted odds ratios and 95% confidence intervals (CI) are reported. Adjustment variables were recruitment source, gender, age on 9/11, race/ethnicity, and education.

## Results

Volunteer groups differed significantly on all sociodemographic characteristics except education (Table 1). Affiliated volunteers were predominately list-identified, female, members of only one eligibility group, ages 45–64 years and non-Hispanic white. Most reported a 2002 household income of \$25,000–49,999. Lay volunteers were predominantly self-identified, male, members of more than one eligibility group, ages 25–44, and non-Hispanic white. Most reported a 2002 household income of \$75,000–149,999. Lay volunteers were more likely to have known someone who lost their life on 9/11 and to have lived in NYC or New York State (NYS) on 9/11.

Lay volunteers had a wider range of exposures and experiences than affiliated volunteers (Table 2). A substantially greater proportion of lay volunteers were present on 9/11 (77.3% vs. 25.7%), thereby at greater risk for acute exposures, such as: intense dust cloud exposure, witnessing horrific events and sustaining an injury on 9/11 than affiliated volunteers. Most lay volunteers began work on 9/11 (29.7%) and worked seven days or less (74.1%). Almost half (48.7%) of affiliated

**Table 1**  
Demographic characteristics of volunteers enrolled in the World Trade Center Health Registry, 2003–04, 2006–07. N = 4974.

	Affiliated volunteers (n = 3702)	Lay volunteers (n = 1272)	P-value
	n (%)	n (%)	
<b>Recruitment source</b>			
List	2344 (63.3)	268 (21.1)	<0.0001
Self	1358 (36.7)	1004 (78.9)	
<b>Gender</b>			
Male	1728 (46.7)	869 (68.3)	<0.0001
Female	1974 (53.3)	403 (31.7)	
<b>Eligibility category<sup>a</sup></b>			
Workers only	3190 (86.2)	633 (49.8)	<0.0001
Multiple eligibility	512 (13.8)	639 (50.2)	
<b>Age group (years) on 9/11</b>			
18–24	279 (7.6)	86 (6.8)	<0.0001
25–44	1482 (40.2)	758 (59.7)	
45–64	1640 (44.5)	397 (31.3)	
65+	287 (7.8)	28 (2.2)	
<b>Race/ethnicity</b>			
White (non-Hispanic)	3185 (86.0)	972 (76.4)	<0.0001
Black or African American (non-Hispanic)	106 (2.9)	63 (5.0)	
Hispanic or Latino (any race)	231 (6.2)	141 (11.1)	
Asian	68 (1.8)	51 (4.0)	
Other	112 (3.0)	45 (3.5)	
<b>Education</b>			
Less than 11th Grade	69 (1.9)	33 (2.6)	N.S. <sup>b</sup>
Grade 12 or GED (high school graduate)	555 (15.1)	212 (16.8)	
Some college	879 (23.9)	309 (24.5)	
College graduate	1208 (32.8)	408 (32.3)	
Postgraduate degree	974 (26.4)	301 (23.8)	
<b>Household income in 2002 (before taxes)</b>			
<\$25,000	494 (14.9)	165 (14.4)	<0.0001
\$25,000 to <\$50,000	969 (29.2)	222 (19.4)	
\$50,000 to <\$75,000	746 (22.5)	231 (20.2)	
\$75,000 to <\$150,000	863 (26.0)	384 (33.5)	
\$150,000 +	244 (7.4)	143 (12.5)	
<b>Employment status on 9/11</b>			
Employed	2941 (79.7)	1136 (89.7)	<0.0001
<b>New York City residents on 9/11</b>			
Yes	1043 (28.2)	809 (63.6)	<0.0001
<b>State lived in on 9/11</b>			
New York	1393 (37.6)	987 (77.6)	<0.0001
New Jersey	216 (5.8)	153 (12.0)	
Pennsylvania	177 (4.8)	14 (1.1)	
California	197 (5.3)	9 (0.7)	
Connecticut	71 (1.9)	22 (1.7)	
Other	1648 (44.5)	87 (6.8)	

<sup>a</sup> Volunteers were classified as a worker only (rescue/recovery worker) or multiple eligibility (residents, area workers, non-office workers passers-by).  
<sup>b</sup> N.S equals not significant.

volunteers arrived between 9/18/2001 and 12/31/2001, and the majority worked more than seven days (54.0%).

Compared to affiliated volunteers, lay volunteers were significantly more likely to have received a post-9/11 mental health diagnosis (30.9% vs. 18.6%), have probable PTSD at W1 or W2 (34.0% vs. 13.3%), and report new or worsening LRS since 9/11 (63.5% vs. 34.9%) as well as post 9/11 asthma/RADS (8.5% vs. 4.3%) (Table 3). Table 4.1 shows the crude and adjusted odds ratios for mental health outcomes. The odds of having an early post-9/11 mental health diagnosis was 1.6 times (95% CI: 1.4–2.0) greater among lay than affiliated volunteers. Lay volunteers were 2.2 times (95% CI: 1.7–2.8) more likely to have chronic probable PTSD, 1.9 times (95% CI: 1.5–2.5) more likely to have late-onset probable PTSD and 1.8 times (95% CI: 1.2–2.6) more likely to have resolved probable PTSD than affiliated volunteers. Table 4.2 shows the crude and adjusted odds ratios for physical

**Table 2**  
Exposures and experiences of volunteers enrolled in the World Trade Center Health Registry, 2003–04, 2006–07. N = 4974.

	Affiliated volunteers (n = 3702)	Lay volunteers (n = 1272)	P-value
	n (%)	n (%)	
<b>Present on 9/11</b>			
Yes	952 (25.7)	983 (77.3)	<0.0001
No	2750 (74.3)	289 (22.7)	
<b>Caught in dust cloud that resulted from the collapse of the Towers on 9/11<sup>a</sup></b>			
Intense	259 (28.1)	397 (42.3)	<0.0001
Some	159 (17.3)	156 (16.6)	
None	503 (54.6)	386 (41.1)	
<b>Witnessed horrific events<sup>a</sup></b>			
5 horrific events witnessed	122 (13.0)	166 (17.2)	<0.0001 <sup>b</sup>
4 horrific events witnessed	123 (13.1)	171 (17.7)	
3 horrific events witnessed	156 (16.6)	183 (19.0)	
2 horrific events witnessed	173 (18.4)	182 (18.9)	
1 horrific event witnessed	230 (24.5)	175 (18.1)	
0 horrific events witnessed	135 (14.4)	88 (9.1)	
<b>Type of horrific events witnessed<sup>a,c</sup></b>			
Airplane hitting WTC	351 (36.9)	410 (41.7)	0.0294
People falling or jumping from the WTC	305 (32.2)	386 (39.6)	0.0008
Building collapsing	584 (61.4)	660 (67.1)	0.0085
People running away from a cloud or smoke	535 (56.3)	645 (65.7)	<0.0001
People injured or killed	406 (42.9)	551 (56.7)	<0.0001
<b>Sustained any injury on 9/11<sup>a</sup></b>			
Yes	160 (16.8)	247 (25.1)	<0.0001
No	792 (83.2)	736 (74.9)	
<b>Bereavement due to 9/11</b>			
Bereaved	1070 (29.5)	777 (61.9)	<0.0001
<b>Worked on the pile at the WTC site</b>			
Yes	439 (11.9)	442 (34.8)	<0.0001
No	3257 (88.1)	829 (65.2)	
<b>First day of volunteer work</b>			
September 11, 2001	162 (4.8)	360 (29.7)	<0.0001 <sup>b</sup>
September 12, 2001	196 (5.8)	300 (24.7)	
September 13–17, 2001	396 (11.6)	350 (28.8)	
September 18–December 31, 2001	1657 (48.7)	173 (14.3)	
January 1, 2002–June 30, 2002	995 (29.2)	31 (2.6)	
<b>Number of days worked at any WTC site<sup>d</sup></b>			
1–7	792 (46.0)	524 (74.1)	<0.0001
8–30	650 (37.7)	118 (16.7)	
31–90	190 (11.0)	39 (5.5)	
>90	91 (5.3)	26 (3.7)	

<sup>a</sup> Captured via Cochran–Armitage Trend Test.  
<sup>b</sup> Restricted to enrollees who were present on 9/11.  
<sup>c</sup> Not mutually exclusive.  
<sup>d</sup> Worked on the pile; Staten Island, or barge.

health outcomes. Lay volunteers were 2.0 times more likely (95% CI 1.8–2.4) to report new or worsening LRS. The odds of early post-9/11 asthma/RADS were 1.8 times (95% CI: 1.2–2.7) greater among lay volunteers.

**Discussion**

After 9/11, thousands of people converged on the area to volunteer for recovery and relief efforts. Experiences after the disaster had a substantial impact on their long-term mental and physical health. Lay volunteers had a higher prevalence of adverse mental and physical health conditions than affiliated volunteers and both groups had a higher prevalence than the general population (Brackbill, et al., 2009). Lay volunteers were more likely to belong to more than one eligibility group and to be NYC residents. It seems evident that most were in the area because they lived or worked nearby on the morning of 9/11. Most affiliated volunteers enrolled in the Registry were non-NYC residents, thus arriving later due to travel restrictions.

**Table 3**

Mental and physical health outcomes among World Trade Center Health Registry volunteer groups 2003–04, 2006–07. N = 4,974.

	Affiliated volunteers (n = 3,702)	Lay volunteers (n = 1,272)	P-value
	n (%)	n (%)	
Post-9/11 mental health diagnoses			
None	2868 (79.2)	807 (65.5)	<0.0001
Early <sup>a</sup>	465 (12.8)	299 (24.3)	
Late <sup>b</sup>	209 (5.8)	81 (6.6)	
Probable posttraumatic stress disorder			
None	3086 (86.7)	791 (66.0)	<0.0001
Chronic (W1+, W2+)	192 (5.4)	189 (15.8)	
Late onset (W1-, W2+)	205 (5.8)	166 (13.8)	
Resolved (W1+, W2-)	75 (2.1)	53 (4.4)	
New or worsening lower respiratory symptoms since 9/11 since 9/11			
Yes	1275 (34.9)	797 (63.5)	<0.0001
Post-9/11 asthma/RADS <sup>c</sup>			
None	2946 (95.7)	945 (91.5)	<0.0001
Early <sup>a</sup>	64 (2.1)	53 (5.1)	
Late <sup>b</sup>	69 (2.2)	35 (3.4)	

<sup>a</sup> Diagnosed between 09/11/01 and 12/31/03.

<sup>b</sup> Diagnosed between 01/01/04 and 12/31/07.

<sup>c</sup> RADS—reactive airway dysfunction syndrome.

Previous studies have identified factors associated with increased risk of post-disaster depression, PTSD, and anxiety: witnessing horrific events, lack of preparation or training, sustaining an injury, personal identification or relationship with victims and losing a loved one (Brackbill, et al., 2009, Perrin, et al., 2007, Thormar, et al., 2010). Our findings indicate that lay volunteers were more likely to have experienced these factors than affiliated volunteers, thereby increasing their risk for post-disaster mental health conditions.

Lay volunteers present in lower Manhattan on 9/11 may have had more exposure to respirable particulate matter and other substances associated with asthma and other respiratory outcomes, especially those working on the pile (Thomas, et al., 2008). Lay volunteers belonging to multiple eligibility groups were potentially subject to more 9/11-related exposures than other RRW such as dust contaminated homes or work places that have been associated with increased risk for LRS and asthma/RADS (Brackbill, et al., 2009, Herbert, et al., 2006, Lin, et al., 2005).

**Table 4.1**

Multinomial odds ratios for mental health outcomes among lay volunteers compared to affiliated volunteers.

	Odds ratio (95% CI) <sup>a</sup>				
	Early post-9/11 mental health diagnosis <sup>b</sup>	Late post-9/11 mental health diagnosis <sup>b</sup>	Chronic probable PTSD <sup>c</sup>	Late-onset probable PTSD	Resolved PTSD <sup>c</sup>
Model 1 (unadjusted)					
Lay volunteers	2.3 (1.9–2.7)	1.4 (1.1–1.8)	4.4 (3.3–6.0)	3.4 (2.5–4.5)	3.7 (2.3–6.0)
Affiliated volunteers	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Model 2 (adjusted <sup>d</sup> )					
Lay volunteers	1.6 (1.4–2.0)	1.1 (0.8–1.5)	2.2 (1.7–2.8)	1.9 (1.5–2.5)	1.7 (1.2–2.6)
Affiliated volunteers	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	

<sup>a</sup> Captured via multinomial regression.

<sup>b</sup> Compared to no post-911 mental health diagnosis.

<sup>c</sup> Compared to no PTSD.

<sup>d</sup> Adjusted for recruitment source; gender; age on 9/11, race/ethnicity and education.

**Table 4.2**

Multinomial odds ratios for physical health outcomes among lay volunteers compared to affiliated volunteers.

	Odds ratio (95% CI) <sup>a</sup>	
	New or Worsening LRS <sup>b</sup> since 9/11 <sup>c</sup>	Post-9/11 asthma/RADS <sup>d, e</sup>
Model 1 (unadjusted)		
Lay volunteers	3.3 (2.8–3.7)	2.6 (1.8–3.7)
Affiliated volunteers	1.00	1.00
Model 2 (adjusted <sup>f</sup> )		
Lay volunteers	2.0 (1.8–2.4)	1.8 (1.2–2.7)
Affiliated volunteers	1.00	1.00

<sup>a</sup> Captured via multinomial regression.

<sup>e</sup> LRS—lower respiratory symptoms.

<sup>b</sup> Compared to no new or worsening LRS since 9/11.

<sup>d</sup> Compared to no post-9/11 asthma/RADS.

<sup>f</sup> RADS—reactive airway dysfunction syndrome.

<sup>f</sup> Adjusted for recruitment source; gender; age on 9/11, race/ethnicity and education.

Both volunteer groups reported unmet health care needs at W2, with the majority attempting to seek health care for a 9/11-related problem, but low utilization of post-9/11 medical monitoring and treatment programs. The frequency of reporting unmet health care needs was greater in lay volunteers (29.8% vs. 16.1%, p<0.0001). Of those reporting unmet needs, a greater proportion of lay volunteers were unable to get care for a perceived 9/11-related problem (lay 70.0% vs. affiliated 42.7%). Less than 10% all volunteers (8.7%) reported receiving services from a post-9/11 medical monitoring or treatment program and utilization of programs was lower among affiliated than lay volunteers (7.0% vs. 13.9%).

At the time of W2, awareness of these programs was low and some volunteers may have been unclear about program eligibility. The post-9/11 health care programs for RRW have strict eligibility criteria regarding duration of work at the disaster sites, which not all volunteers met. Many volunteers may have lacked documentation for acceptance into a program. During W2, most 9/11 medical monitoring and treatment programs were located in New York/New Jersey, while most affiliated volunteers (56.5%) lived outside of the area. Project Liberty, NYS's primary post-9/11 crisis counseling program, provided services only to NYS residents (Donahue, et al., 2006). In 2002, due to the unique circumstances of 9/11, Congress authorized \$25 million for Workers' Compensation benefits for WTC volunteers who otherwise would have been ineligible for benefits. As such, a portion of volunteers' post-9/11 medical related needs may have been met by the NYS Workers' Compensation System. As of September 2009, over 1000 WTC volunteers had received benefits (New York State Workers' Compensation Board, 2009). Enrollment for WTC-related NYS Workers' Compensation ended 09/10/10.

One study limitation is selection bias. Despite efforts to include all eligible rescue/recovery volunteers, volunteers in the Registry may not be representative of all volunteers. Self-identified enrollees were more likely to report probable PTSD, new or worsening LRS, and newly diagnosed asthma than list-identified enrollees (Brackbill, et al., 2009, Farfel, et al., 2008). However, the prevalence of both PTSD and LRS was still two-fold higher among list-identified lay volunteers compared to list-identified affiliated volunteers (data not shown). Self-reported data collected up to five to six years after the disaster may be subject to recall bias. Volunteers with greater exposure to the disaster may have been more likely to recall and connect their symptoms to the disaster than volunteers with lesser exposure. Due to the lack of detailed documentation of actual tasks performed and duration of time worked by volunteers who did not perform work on the pile, we were unable to examine the full range of activities performed by all volunteers. Finally, there is a potential misclassification

of volunteer type. As previously mentioned, many lay volunteers had to join a professional organization in order to continue volunteering. It is possible that not all individuals self-identifying as affiliated volunteers had the level of pre-disaster experience and/or training ordinarily provided by those organizations. This may have resulted in a differential misclassification error, which could have led to an underestimation of the differences between volunteer groups.

## 306 Conclusions

307 Man-made and natural disasters often require rapid deployment of  
308 large scale rescue, recovery and cleanup efforts. Disaster relief organiza-  
309 tions, even if well prepared, could not have responded instantaneously  
310 to a disaster of 9/11's magnitude because of logistic limitations. Urgent  
311 post-disaster needs for rescue, recovery, and cleanup are often filled by  
312 individuals who volunteer spontaneously, and it is likely that volun-  
313 teers will continue to play an integral role in these efforts, despite expo-  
314 sure to potential health hazards.

315 Protecting disaster responders should be a major public health  
316 priority. Many cities and states have extensive disaster management  
317 plans, but few are equipped for long-term health surveillance on  
318 the scale of 9/11. The experience of both professional and volunteer  
319 responders to 9/11 indicates a need for the provision of site-specific  
320 training, regardless of prior disaster experience, to limit exposure  
321 to specific hazards and familiarize volunteers with safe operating  
322 procedures.

323 When exposure to toxic substances is suspected, agencies charged  
324 with monitoring long-term health of professional responders should  
325 extend this function to volunteers. For illnesses with long latency pe-  
326 riods, monitoring activities should follow a cohort design, by estab-  
327 lishing and maintaining a roster containing: names, contact  
328 information, baseline health screening, tasks performed, and timing  
329 and duration of work. An example is the database of clean-up workers  
330 and volunteers created after the 2010 oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico.  
331 These activities should be followed up with regular assessments of  
332 mental and physical health and health care needs, including a mech-  
333 anism for making appropriate referrals to care. Rosters of volunteers  
334 will provide an avenue for outreach and education promoting aware-  
335 ness of post-disaster services such as monitoring and treatment pro-  
336 grams and Workers' Compensation benefits. Inevitably, monitoring  
337 and treatment costs will emerge as potential obstacles to maintaining  
338 such programs. The data presented in this study represent a first step  
339 in determining the magnitude of existing needs.

## 340 Conflict of interest statement

341 There is none to declare.

## 342 Acknowledgments

343 We would like to thank Dr. Carey Maslow; Dr. JieHui Li; and Daniel  
344 Wallingford for their technical assistance. We would also like to thank

the enrollees in the World Trade Center Health Registry for their par- 345  
ticipation in our surveys. 346

## References 347

- American Psychiatric Association, 1994. Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders. Washington, DC. 348  
American Red Cross, 2002. September 11, 2001: Unprecedented Events, Unprecedent- 349  
ed Response. American Red Cross. 350  
Bills, C.B., Levy, N.A., Sharma, V., Charney, D.S., Herbert, R., Moline, J., Katz, C.L., 2008. 351  
Mental health of workers and volunteers responding to events of 9/11: review of 352  
the literature. *Mt. Sinai J. Med.* 75, 115–127. 353  
Blanchard, E.B., Jones-Alexander, J., Buckley, T.C., Forneris, C.A., 1996. Psychometric 354  
properties of the PTSD checklist (PCL). *Behav. Res. Ther.* 34, 669–673. 355  
Brackbill, R.M., Hadler, J.L., DiGrande, L., Ekenga, C.C., Farfel, M.R., Friedman, S., Perl- 356  
man, S.E., Stellman, S.D., Walker, D.J., Wu, D., Yu, S., Thorpe, L.E., 2009. Asthma 357  
and posttraumatic stress symptoms 5 to 6 years following exposure to the World 358  
Trade Center terrorist attack. *JAMA* 302, 502–516. 359  
Dobie, D.J., Kivlahan, D.R., Maynard, C., Bush, K.R., McFall, M., Epler, A.J., Bradley, K.A., 360  
2002. Screening for post-traumatic stress disorder in female Veteran's Affairs pa- 361  
tients: validation of the PTSD checklist. *Gen. Hosp. Psychiatry* 24, 367–374. 362  
Donahue, S.A., Lanzara, C.B., Felton, C.J., Essock, S.M., Carpinello, S., 2006. Project Liber- 363  
ty: New York's crisis counseling program created in the aftermath of September 11, 364  
2001. *Psychiatr. Serv.* 57, 1253–1258. 365  
Farfel, M., DiGrande, L., Brackbill, R., Prann, A., Cone, J., Friedman, S., Walker, D., 366  
Pezeshki, G., Thomas, P., Galea, S., Williamson, D., Frieden, T., Thorpe, L., 2008. An 367  
overview of 9/11 experiences and respiratory and mental health conditions 368  
among World Trade Center Health Registry enrollees. *J. Urban Health* 85, 880–909. 369  
Herbert, R., Moline, J., Skloot, G., Metzger, K., Baron, S., Luft, B., Markowitz, S., Udasin, I., Har- 370  
rison, D., Stein, D., Todd, A., Enright, P., Stellman, J.M., Landrigan, P.J., Levin, S.M., 2006. 371  
The World Trade Center disaster and the health of workers: five-year assessment of a 372  
unique medical screening program. *Environ. Health Perspect.* 114, 1853–1858. 373  
Koenen, K., Stellman, J.M., Stellman, S.D., Sommer, J.F., 2003. Risk factors for course of 374  
posttraumatic stress disorder among Vietnam veterans: a 14-year follow-up of 375  
American Legionnaires. *J. Consult. Clin. Psychol.* 71, 980–986. 376  
Landrigan, P.J., Lioy, P.J., Thurston, G., Berkowitz, G., Chen, L.C., Chillrud, S.N., Gavett, 377  
S.H., Georgopoulos, P.G., Geyh, A.S., Levin, S., Perera, F., Rappaport, S.M., Small, C., 378  
2004. Health and environmental consequences of the world trade center disaster. 379  
*Environ. Health Perspect.* 112, 731–739. 380  
Lin, S., Reibman, J., Bowers, J.A., Hwang, S.A., 2005. Upper respiratory symptoms and 381  
other health effects among residents living near the World Trade Center site 382  
after September 11, 2001. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* 162, 499–507. 383  
Lorber, M., Gibb, H., Grant, L., Pinto, J., Pleil, J., Cleverly, D., 2007. Assessment of inhalation 384  
exposures and potential health risks to the general population that resulted 385  
from the collapse of the World Trade Center towers. *Risk Anal.* 27, 1203–1221. 386  
Murphy, J., Brackbill, R.M., Thalji, L., Dolan, M., Pulliam, P., Walker, D.J., 2007. Measuring 387  
and maximizing coverage in the World Trade Center Health Registry. *Stat. Med.* 26, 388  
1688–1701. 389  
New York State Workers' Compensation Board, 2009. World Trade Center Cases in the 390  
New York Workers' Compensation System. New York State. 391  
Perrin, M.A., DiGrande, L., Wheeler, K., Thorpe, L., Farfel, M., Brackbill, R., 2007. Differ- 392  
ences in PTSD prevalence and associated risk factors among World Trade Center 393  
disaster rescue and recovery workers. *Am. J. Psychiatry* 164, 1385–1394. 394  
Ruggiero, K.J., Ben, K.D., Scotti, J.R., et al., 2003. Psychometric properties of the PTSD 395  
checklist—civilian version. *J. Trauma. Stress* 16, 495–502. 396  
SAS, 2005. Statistical Analysis System, Cary, NC. 397  
Steffen, S.L., Fothergill, A., 2009. 9/11 volunteerism: a pathway to personal healing and 398  
community engagement. *Soc. Sci. J.* 46, 29–46. 399  
Thomas, P.A., Brackbill, R., Thalji, L., 2008. Respiratory and other health effects reported 400  
in children exposed to the World Trade Center disaster of September 11, 2001. *En- 401  
viron. Health Perspect.* 402  
Thormar, S.B., Gersons, B.P., Juen, B., Marschang, A., Djakababa, M.N., Olf, M., 2010. The 403  
mental health impact of volunteering in a disaster setting: a review. *J. Nerv. Ment. 404  
Dis.* 198, 529–538. 405  
Tierney, K., Lindell, M.K., Perry, R.W., 2001. Facing the unexpected: disaster prepared- 406  
ness and response in the United States. Joseph Henry Press, Washington, DC. 407  
408