



March 1, 2018

**VIA CERTIFIED MAIL**  
**RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED**

Arthur Z. Schwartz  
Advocates for Justice  
225 Broadway, Suite 1902  
New York, NY 10007

Dear Mr. Schwartz,

I write in response to your February 14, 2018 letter to Commissioner Trottenberg regarding the joint mitigation plan created by the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) and the New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) to address the closure of the L train between Eighth Avenue in Manhattan and Bedford Avenue in Brooklyn, scheduled to begin in April 2019.

As you are aware, in October 2012, Hurricane Sandy devastated New York City -- leaving 43 New Yorkers dead, 2 million people without power, flooding in 17% of the city affecting some 90,000 buildings, and \$19 billion in damages to the City alone. Five years after the storm, the repair of the Canarsie Tunnel, which had been inundated by salt water, marks one of the final major capital reconstruction projects arising from that terrible storm. The MTA's repair project is a formidable challenge: 275,000 commuters will be directly affected each day and hundreds of thousands more will be indirectly affected -- including residents of your neighborhood.

MTA and DOT have worked closely with the affected communities in over 70 stakeholder meetings to create what we believe is the best possible mitigation plan, backed by extensive analysis and planning. As you may be aware, we recently released the detailed traffic analysis that undergirds that plan, which includes the choices behind our menu of temporary alternative transportation options. That analysis is available at <http://web.mta.info/sandy/resources.html>.

DOT and our partner agencies are complying with all applicable environmental review requirements for this project. MTA is seeking funding for the project from the Federal Transit Administration (FTA), which will work closely with the MTA and NYC agencies to assure that

Arthur Z. Schwartz  
Advocates for Justice  
March 1, 2018  
Page 2

the project complies with all environmental requirements pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA). As part of that collaboration, the MTA and DOT, as well as other NYC agencies, are performing modeling, studies, and analyses to the satisfaction of the FTA -- in order to assure that the project meets all legal requirements and to reduce any and all inconveniences the project could cause. Additionally, before the L train shutdown had even been scheduled, DOT and MTA/New York City Transit (NYCT) had planned to convert the M14 bus in your neighborhood to a Select Bus Service (SBS) route complete with bus priority and pedestrian safety enhancements -- joining five other Manhattan crosstown bus lines that have been converted to SBS routes in the last decade. This, and other SBS projects, are a SEQRA Type II action.

Please rest assured that we are closely evaluating the feedback we received at the open houses this winter to help refine the final designs. DOT and MTA will continue to engage the community, review and evaluate our mitigation plans prior to and during the L train shutdown. If DOT decides to consider making any of the temporary measures permanent, we would of course conduct further evaluation and community engagement.

The MTA's closure of the Canarsie Tunnel and the L Train in Manhattan next year will create very real challenges, which our two agencies are doing everything in our power to minimize. We remain confident that New Yorkers recognize the enormity of the challenge we face and will join together in a spirit of shared sacrifice to make the 15-month closure move along as quickly and easily as possible. We are also confident that working together will be more productive than approaching this in an adversarial manner, which will be costly and create more inconveniences for New Yorkers.

Sincerely,



Eric Beaton  
Deputy Commissioner,  
Transportation Planning and Management

C: Hon. Ronnie Hakim, MTA  
Hon. Gale Brewer  
Hon. Corey Johnson  
Hon. Carlina Rivera  
Hon. Brad Hoylman  
Manhattan Community Boards 2, 3, 4, and 6